

WOMEN TOCD FACTS VERSUS FABRICATIONS

Dr. Paul Kalluveettil CMI, Dr. Sophy Rose CMC,
Dr. Maria Anto CMC, Mareena CMC

CMC Publications
Aluva, Kerala, India – 683 106
2013

WOMEN TOCD: FACTS VERSUS FABRICATIONS

By

Dr. Paul Kalluveetil CMI

Dr. Sophy Rose CMC

Dr. Maria Anto CMC

Mareena CMC

Foreword

Mother Sancta CMC

Superior General

Cover Design

Gayathri Ashok

Layout

Shaija Vincent

First Published

August 2013

Printed at

Alwaye Press, Aluva

Published by

CMC Publications

Mount Carmel Generalate, Thaikkattukara,

Aluva, 683106

cmcgeneralate@gmail.com

Copies

1500

Price

Rs. 490/-

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|---------------|
| FOREWORD..... | xxvii |
| PREFACE..... | xxx |
| ABBREVIATIONS..... | xxxiii |
| PROLOGUE: SOME CRITICAL REMARKS ON <i>PTSS</i>.1 | |

CHAPTER ONE THE BEGINNINGS OF THE INDIGENOUS CONGREGATION FOR WOMEN

| | |
|---|-----------|
| 1.0. Introduction..... | 12 |
| 1.1. Roles of Important Personalities in the Foundation..... | 12 |
| 1.1.1. Role of Fr. Kuriakose Elias Chavara..... | 13 |
| 1.1.1.1. Zealous Yearning for a Convent..... | 13 |
| 1.1.1.1.1. Text..... | 13 |
| 1.1.1.1.2. Comments..... | 13 |
| 1.1.1.2. An Aching Heart..... | 17 |
| 1.1.1.2.1. Text..... | 17 |
| 1.1.1.2.2. Comments..... | 18 |
| 1.1.1.3. Failed Attempts..... | 19 |
| 1.1.1.3.1. Text in <i>CKC</i> | 19 |
| 1.1.1.3.2. Letter of Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli..... | 21 |
| 1.1.1.3.3. Text in <i>Alochanapusthakam</i> | 23 |
| 1.1.1.4. A Desire Fulfilled..... | 24 |
| 1.1.2. Role of Fr. Leopold..... | 25 |
| 1.1.2.1. His Role According to <i>CKC</i> | 25 |
| 1.1.2.1.1. Text One..... | 25 |
| 1.1.2.1.2. Comments..... | 26 |
| 1.1.2.1.3. Text Two..... | 27 |
| 1.1.2.2. His Role According to <i>CMM</i> | 29 |
| 1.1.2.2.1. Text..... | 29 |
| 1.1.2.2.2. A Comparative Study between <i>CKC</i> and <i>CMM</i> | 30 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| 1.1.2.2.3. A Detailed Analysis of the Texts | 35 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.1. Fr. Leopold As the ‘Spiritual Guide’ ... | 35 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.1.1. Accepting the Petition..... | 36 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.1.2. Giving Counseling | 36 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.1.3. Discerning the Vocation | 37 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.1.4. Granting Frequent Access to Sacraments | 38 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.2. Consulting with the Missionaries | 38 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.3. Praying to the Lord..... | 39 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.4. Consulting with Fr. Chavara | 39 |
| 1.1.2.2.3.5. Approaching the Ecclesiastical Authority | 40 |
| 1.1.3. Roles of Widow Eliswa and Anna | 41 |
| 1.1.3.1. Their Life Situation..... | 41 |
| 1.1.3.1.1. Text One..... | 42 |
| 1.1.3.1.2. Text Two | 42 |
| 1.1.3.2. Their Stay at Home | 46 |
| 1.1.3.2.1. Texts..... | 46 |
| 1.1.3.2.2. Comments | 47 |
| 1.1.3.3. Entrusting Themselves to Fr. Leopold..... | 49 |
| 1.1.3.3.1. Text One – From <i>CKC</i> | 49 |
| 1.1.3.3.2. Comments | 50 |
| 1.1.3.3.3. Text Two – From <i>CMM</i> | 51 |
| 1.1.3.3.4. Comments | 51 |
| 1.1.3.3.5. CTC Writings on the way of Disclosing Inner Inspiration to Fr. Leopold | 52 |
| 1.1.3.3.5.1. Texts | 52 |
| 1.1.3.3.5.2. Comments..... | 54 |
| 1.2. Conclusion | 55 |

**CHAPTER TWO
TOWARDS THE CANONICAL ERECTION
OF WOMEN TOCD**

| | |
|---|-----------|
| 2.0. Introduction..... | 58 |
| 2.1. A Humble Beginning..... | 58 |
| 2.1.1. Role of Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli..... | 58 |
| 2.1.1.1. Texts..... | 58 |
| 2.1.1.2. Comments..... | 59 |
| 2.1.2. The Issue Concerning the Constitution..... | 60 |
| 2.1.2.1. Texts..... | 60 |
| 2.1.2.2. Comments..... | 61 |
| 2.1.3. Construction of <i>Panambumadam</i>..... | 62 |
| 2.1.3.1. The Land of <i>Panambumadam</i> | 62 |
| 2.1.3.1.1. Texts..... | 62 |
| 2.1.3.1.2. Comments | 64 |
| 2.1.3.2. God's Providential Hand..... | 65 |
| 2.1.3.2.1. Texts..... | 65 |
| 2.1.3.2.2. Comments | 67 |
| 2.1.3.3. Furnishing the <i>Panambumadam</i> | 68 |
| 2.1.3.3.1. Texts..... | 68 |
| 2.1.3.3.2. Comments | 71 |
| 2.1.3.4. Regarding the So called <i>Documentum</i> <i>Erectionis</i> | 72 |
| 2.1.3.4.1. Texts..... | 73 |
| 2.1.3.4.2. Comments | 74 |
| 2.1.4. Thresia as the Third Member..... | 74 |
| 2.1.4.1. Chronicles About the Coming of Sr. Thresia | 75 |
| 2.1.4.1.1. Texts..... | 75 |
| 2.1.4.1.2. Comments | 76 |
| 2.1.4.2. The Issue of Stay of Thresia..... | 76 |
| 2.1.4.2.1. Texts..... | 77 |
| 2.1.4.2.2. Comments | 78 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| 2.1.5. Ceremonies of the Erection of <i>Panambumadam</i>. | 79 |
| 2.1.5.1. Texts..... | 79 |
| 2.1.5.2. Comments..... | 81 |
| 2.1.6. Clara as the 4th Member..... | 82 |
| 2.1.6.1. <i>CKC</i> Text one..... | 82 |
| 2.1.6.2. <i>CKC</i> Text Two..... | 83 |
| 2.1.6.3. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 85 |
| 2.1.6.4. Comments..... | 85 |
| 2.2. Construction of the New Convent | 89 |
| 2.2.1. A Prophetic Utterance..... | 89 |
| 2.2.1.1. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 89 |
| 2.2.1.2. Text in <i>CKC</i> | 89 |
| 2.2.1.3. Comments..... | 90 |
| 2.2.2. A Hard Life..... | 91 |
| 2.2.2.1. Texts in <i>CMM</i> | 91 |
| 2.2.2.2. Text in <i>CKC</i> | 92 |
| 2.2.3. A Firm Decision..... | 92 |
| 2.2.3.1. Text One | 92 |
| 2.2.3.2. Text Two..... | 93 |
| 2.2.3.3. Comments..... | 93 |
| 2.2.4. The Construction Process..... | 94 |
| 2.2.4.1. Land of the New Convent..... | 94 |
| 2.2.4.1.1. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 95 |
| 2.2.4.1.2. Comments | 95 |
| 2.2.4.1.3. <i>CKC</i> Text One..... | 96 |
| 2.2.4.1.4. <i>CKC</i> Text Two..... | 96 |
| 2.2.4.1.5. Comments | 96 |
| 2.2.4.1.6. Text in the Account Book of Koonammavu Convent | 98 |
| 2.2.4.1.7. Comments | 100 |
| 2.2.4.2. Collecting Alms..... | 100 |
| 2.2.4.2.1. <i>Pidiary</i> | 100 |
| 2.2.4.2.1.1. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 100 |
| 2.2.4.2.1.2. Text in <i>Alochanapusthakam</i> | 102 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 2.2.4.2.1.3. Text in the Chronicle of <i>Parappuram</i> | 102 |
| 2.2.4.2.1.4. Comments..... | 103 |
| 2.2.4.2.2. Donations from Parishes | 104 |
| 2.2.4.2.2.1. Chart One (<i>CMM II</i>)..... | 104 |
| 2.2.4.2.2.2. Chart Two (<i>CKC</i>)..... | 104 |
| 2.2.4.2.2.3. Chart Three (<i>Alochanapusthakam</i>) ... | 105 |
| 2.2.4.2.2.4. Comments..... | 106 |
| 2.2.4.3. The Construction Process..... | 107 |
| 2.2.4.3.1. Laying the Foundation | 107 |
| 2.2.4.3.1.1. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 107 |
| 2.2.4.3.1.2. Texts in <i>CKC</i> | 108 |
| 2.2.4.3.1.3. Comments..... | 109 |
| 2.2.4.3.2. A more Comprehensive Plan | 109 |
| 2.2.4.3.3. Miracles of Providence | 111 |
| 2.2.4.3.3.1. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 111 |
| 2.2.4.3.3.2. Text in <i>CKC</i> | 111 |
| 2.2.4.3.3.3. Text of Fr. Porukkara | 113 |
| 2.2.4.3.3.4. Comments..... | 113 |
| 2.2.4.4. New Facilities..... | 115 |
| 2.2.4.4.1. Material Facilities | 116 |
| 2.2.4.4.1.1. According to <i>CKC</i> Text..... | 116 |
| 2.2.4.4.1.2. Comments..... | 118 |
| 2.2.4.4.2. Spiritual Facilities | 119 |
| 2.2.4.4.2.1. Text..... | 119 |
| 2.2.4.4.2.2. Comments..... | 120 |
| 2.2.4.5. A Prudent Delay | 121 |
| 2.2.4.5.1. Text..... | 121 |
| 2.2.4.5.2. Comments | 122 |
| 2.2.4.6. In the New Home..... | 123 |
| 2.2.4.6.1. Text in <i>CKC1</i> | 123 |
| 2.2.4.6.2. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 124 |
| 2.2.4.6.3. Text in Parappuram..... | 125 |
| 2.2.4.6.4. Comments | 125 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 2.2.4.7. Canonical Vestition and Blessing of the New Convent..... | 126 |
| 2.2.4.7.1. Canonical Vestition..... | 126 |
| 2.2.4.7.1.1. <i>CKC</i> Text one..... | 126 |
| 2.2.4.7.1.2. <i>CKC</i> Text Two..... | 127 |
| 2.2.4.7.1.3. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 128 |
| 2.2.4.7.1.4. Comments..... | 128 |
| 2.2.4.7.2. Blessing of the New Convent..... | 129 |
| 2.2.4.7.2.1. Text in <i>CKC</i> | 129 |
| 2.2.4.7.2.2. Text in <i>CMM</i> | 130 |
| 2.2.4.7.2.3. Comments..... | 130 |
| 2.2.4.8. Profession of the First Members..... | 131 |
| 2.2.4.8.1. <i>CKC</i> Text One..... | 133 |
| 2.2.4.8.2. <i>CKC</i> Text Two..... | 133 |
| 2.2.4.8.3. <i>CKC</i> Text Three..... | 134 |
| 2.2.4.8.4. <i>CKC</i> Text Four..... | 135 |
| 2.2.4.9. A Grateful Reflection of Praise..... | 138 |
| 2.2.4.9.1. Heartbeats of a New Simeon..... | 138 |
| 2.2.4.9.1.1. Text..... | 138 |
| 2.2.4.9.1.2. Comments..... | 139 |
| 2.2.4.9.2. Words of Fr. Leopold..... | 140 |
| 2.2.4.9.2.1. Text..... | 140 |
| 2.2.4.9.2.2. Comments..... | 140 |
| 2.2.4.9.3. Words of Archbishop Bernardine..... | 141 |
| 2.2.4.9.3.1. Text..... | 141 |
| 2.2.4.9.3.2. Comments..... | 142 |
| 2.2.4.9.4. Words in <i>Alochanapusthakam</i> | 142 |
| 2.2.4.9.4.1. Texts..... | 142 |
| 2.2.4.9.4.2. Comments..... | 143 |
| 2.2.4.9.5. The Words of Fr. Parappuram..... | 144 |
| 2.2.4.9.5.1. Text..... | 144 |
| 2.2.4.9.5.2. Comments..... | 144 |
| 2.2.4.9.6. The Words of Sr. Anna the Chronicler | 145 |
| 2.2.4.9.6.1. Text One..... | 145 |

| | |
|-----------------------------|------------|
| 2.2.4.9.6.2. Comments..... | 146 |
| 2.2.4.9.6.3. Text Two | 146 |
| 2.2.4.9.6.4. Comments..... | 147 |
| 2.3. Conclusion..... | 148 |

CHAPTER THREE

TOWARDS THE FORMATION AND EVOLUTION OF THE LIFESTYLE OF THE EARLY MEMBERS

| | |
|--|------------|
| 3.0. Introduction..... | 150 |
| 3.1. The Inspiration and Rationale Behind the Foundation 150 | |
| 3.1.1. Inspiration..... | 150 |
| 3.1.1.1. ‘Initiator’ According to Fr. Leopold..... | 151 |
| 3.1.1.1.1. Text One – <i>Diary</i> of Fr. Leopold..... | 151 |
| 3.1.1.1.2. Comments | 152 |
| 3.1.1.1.3. Text Two – <i>Short Biography</i> | 156 |
| 3.1.1.1.4. Comments | 156 |
| 3.1.1.2. ‘Initiator’ According to Fr. Kuriakose Elisha Porukkara..... | 157 |
| 3.1.1.2.1. Text | 157 |
| 3.1.1.2.2. Comments..... | 158 |
| 3.1.2. Rationale..... | 159 |
| 3.1.2.1. Texts | 159 |
| 3.1.2.2. Comments | 162 |
| 3.2. Two Comrades as the Formators of Religious Life.163 | |
| 3.2.1. Spiritual Guides..... | 164 |
| 3.2.1.1. Confession and Holy Communion..... | 164 |
| 3.2.1.1.1. Text One..... | 164 |
| 3.2.1.1.2. Text Two | 164 |
| 3.2.1.2. Renouncing the Worldly Outlook..... | 166 |
| 3.2.1.2.1. Text One..... | 166 |
| 3.2.1.2.2. Text Two | 166 |
| 3.2.1.3. Contemplative Milieu of Life | 167 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 3.2.1.3.1. Text One..... | 167 |
| 3.2.1.3.2. Text Two..... | 169 |
| 3.2.1.4. Cultivating Love for Holy Family and Saints.. | 171 |
| 3.2.1.4.1. Text One..... | 171 |
| 3.2.1.4.2. Text Two..... | 172 |
| 3.2.1.4.3. Text Three..... | 172 |
| 3.2.1.4.4. Text Four..... | 173 |
| 3.2.1.5. Practicing Evangelical Virtues | 174 |
| 3.2.1.5.1. On Obedience..... | 174 |
| 3.2.1.5.1.1. Text One..... | 174 |
| 3.2.1.5.1.2. Text Two..... | 175 |
| 3.2.1.5.1.3. Text Three..... | 176 |
| 3.2.1.5.2. On Humility..... | 177 |
| 3.2.1.5.2.1. Text one..... | 177 |
| 3.2.1.5.2.2. Text Two..... | 177 |
| 3.2.1.5.3. On Charity..... | 178 |
| 3.2.1.5.3.1. Text One..... | 178 |
| 3.2.1.5.3.2. Text Two..... | 178 |
| 3.2.1.6. Practising Vows..... | 179 |
| 3.2.1.6.1. Text..... | 179 |
| 3.2.1.6.2. Comments..... | 180 |
| 3.2.1.7. Rules and Regulations..... | 181 |
| 3.2.1.7.1. Text One..... | 181 |
| 3.2.1.7.2. Text Two..... | 181 |
| 3.2.1.7.3. Text Three..... | 182 |
| 3.2.2. Procurators of Temporalities..... | 183 |
| 3.2.2.1. Text One..... | 183 |
| 3.2.2.2. Text Two..... | 183 |
| 3.2.3. Receiving and Rejecting the Members..... | 184 |
| 3.2.3.1. Text One..... | 184 |
| 3.2.3.2. Text Two..... | 185 |
| 3.2.3.3. Text Three..... | 186 |
| 3.2.3.4. Text Four..... | 186 |
| 3.2.3.5. Text Five..... | 187 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 3.2.3.6. Text Six..... | 189 |
| 3.2.3.7. Text Seven | 190 |
| 3.2.3.8. Text Eight | 191 |
| 3.2.3.9. Text Nine | 191 |
| 3.3. Fr. Leopold as the ‘Formator’ | 193 |
| 3.3.1. Paternal/Maternal Figure..... | 193 |
| 3.3.2. A Spiritual Guide..... | 196 |
| 3.3.2.1. One who Inculcated Communion and Communication with God | 196 |
| 3.3.2.1.1. Cultivating Love for Jesus the Spouse..... | 197 |
| 3.3.2.1.2. Becoming a Being of Trust | 197 |
| 3.3.2.1.3. Becoming a Being of Gratitude and Cheerfulness | 198 |
| 3.3.2.2. The Provider of Dynamics to Foster the Vertical Fellowship | 200 |
| 3.3.2.2.1. How to Live Vowed Life | 201 |
| 3.3.2.2.1.1. Obedience..... | 201 |
| 3.3.2.2.1.1.1. On Keeping Constitutions and Regulations | 201 |
| 3.3.2.2.1.1.2. On Obeying the Legitimate Authority | 202 |
| 3.3.2.2.1.2. Chastity..... | 204 |
| 3.3.2.2.1.3. Poverty..... | 205 |
| 3.3.2.2.2. How to Grow in Silence and Solitude..... | 208 |
| 3.3.2.2.3. How to Practice Humility and Fidelity | 209 |
| 3.3.2.2.4. How to Cultivate Renunciation and Penance..... | 211 |
| 3.3.2.3. One who Inculcated Communion and Communication with the Community | 214 |
| 3.3.2.3.1. How to Cultivate Mutual Love and Respect | 214 |
| 3.3.2.3.2. How to Practice Magnanimity | 216 |
| 3.3.2.3.3. How to Become an ‘Evangelizer’ | 216 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 3.3.3. Canonical Superior..... | 218 |
| 3.3.3.1. Disciplining Acts | 219 |
| 3.3.3.2. Selecting the Candidates..... | 219 |
| 3.3.3.3. Presiding over Vestition/Profession Ceremonies | 220 |
| 3.3.3.4. Presiding over Elections | 220 |
| 3.3.4. Procurator of Temporalities..... | 220 |
| 3.3.5. A Witnessing Figure..... | 220 |
| 3.4. Fr. Chavara as the Formator | 221 |
| 3.4.1. A Paternal/Maternal Figure..... | 221 |
| 3.4.1.1. Texts from Letters..... | 221 |
| 3.4.1.1.1. Addressing the Sisters..... | 222 |
| 3.4.1.1.2. Content of the Letters..... | 222 |
| 3.4.1.1.2.1. A Father Concerned with the Spiritual Welfare | 222 |
| 3.4.1.1.2.2. One who Integrates the Spiritual with the Physical | 223 |
| 3.4.1.1.2.3. One who Keeps Constant Contact..... | 223 |
| 3.4.1.1.2.4. One who Shares the Minute Details .. | 224 |
| 3.4.1.2. Texts from <i>CKC</i> | 225 |
| 3.4.1.2.1. Celestial/Terrestrial Dimension of Affection..... | 225 |
| 3.4.1.2.2. An Intimacy during Illness..... | 226 |
| 3.4.1.2.3. Grateful and Affectionate Daughters | 228 |
| 3.4.2. The Spiritual Guide..... | 230 |
| 3.4.2.1. One who Inculcated Communion and Communication with God | 230 |
| 3.4.2.1.1. Becoming A Spousal Being | 231 |
| 3.4.2.1.1.1. Text One – <i>Letter VII/12</i> | 231 |
| 3.4.2.1.1.2. Comments on Text One..... | 233 |
| 3.4.2.1.1.3. Other Texts | 236 |
| 3.4.2.1.1.4. Comments on other Texts..... | 237 |
| 3.4.2.1.2. Becoming a Being of Contemplation..... | 239 |
| 3.4.2.1.2.1. Text one – <i>Letter VII/6</i> | 239 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 3.4.2.1.2.2. Comments..... | 239 |
| 3.4.2.1.2.3. Text Two – <i>Letter VII/8</i> | 243 |
| 3.4.2.1.2.4. Comments..... | 244 |
| 3.4.2.1.3. To become an Integrated and Integral being | 247 |
| 3.4.2.1.4. Becoming a Liturgical Being | 249 |
| 3.4.2.1.5. Becoming a being of Trust..... | 254 |
| 3.4.2.1.5.1. Text One (<i>Letter, VII/10</i>) | 254 |
| 3.4.2.1.5.2. Text Two (<i>Letter VII/11</i>) | 255 |
| 3.4.2.1.5.3. Text Three (<i>Letter VII/5</i>) | 256 |
| 3.4.2.1.6. Becoming A Vowed Being | 256 |
| 3.4.2.1.6.1. <i>Agathituam</i> | 257 |
| 3.4.2.1.6.2. <i>Manavattithuam</i> | 258 |
| 3.4.2.1.6.3. <i>Cholvily</i> | 259 |
| 3.4.2.1.7. Becoming a Religious Being..... | 262 |
| 3.4.2.2. One who Inculcated Communion and Communication with the Fellow Beings ... | 263 |
| 3.4.2.2.1. Becoming Ecclesial Beings..... | 263 |
| 3.4.2.2.2. Becoming Altruistic Beings..... | 267 |
| 3.4.3. The Procurator of Temporalities..... | 269 |
| 3.4.3.1. Texts | 269 |
| 3.4.3.2. Comments | 271 |
| 3.4.4. A Witnessing Figure..... | 272 |
| 3.4.4.1. Texts | 272 |
| 3.4.4.2. Comments | 275 |
| 3.4.4.3. Comments of the Chronicler..... | 277 |
| 3.5. Role of the first Members..... | 278 |
| 3.5.1. Role of Mother Eliswa..... | 279 |
| 3.5.1.1. The beginning - A Summary | 279 |
| 3.5.1.2. Mother Eliswa in <i>CKC</i> | 280 |
| 3.5.1.2.1. A Sickly Person..... | 280 |
| 3.5.1.2.1.1. Texts | 280 |
| 3.5.1.2.1.2. Comments..... | 282 |
| 3.5.1.2.2. In <i>Panambumadam</i> | 283 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 3.5.1.2.2.1. Text One: <i>CKC I</i> , 13..... | 283 |
| 3.5.1.2.2.2. Text Two: <i>CKC I</i> , 14..... | 283 |
| 3.5.1.2.2.3. Text Three: <i>CKC I</i> , 15..... | 283 |
| 3.5.1.2.2.4. Text Four: <i>CKC I</i> , 16-17; 18-19; 31-32..... | 284 |
| 3.5.1.2.2.5. Text Five: <i>CKC I</i> , 24..... | 284 |
| 3.5.1.2.2.6. Text Six: <i>CKC I</i> , 30..... | 284 |
| 3.5.1.2.2.7. Text Seven: <i>CKC I</i> , 36..... | 285 |
| 3.5.1.2.2.8. Text Eight: <i>CKC I</i> , 39..... | 285 |
| 3.5.1.2.3. In the New Convent..... | 285 |
| 3.5.1.2.4. Concluding Remarks on <i>CKC</i> Texts..... | 291 |
| 3.5.1.3. Mother Eliswa in CTC Writings..... | 292 |
| 3.5.1.3.1. The So-called Writings of Mother Eliswa..... | 292 |
| 3.5.1.3.1.1. Introduction..... | 292 |
| 3.5.1.3.1.2. Our Findings..... | 292 |
| 3.5.1.3.2. CTC Writings on Mother Eliswa..... | 304 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.1. Life Histories..... | 304 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2. CTC Charism Series..... | 305 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2.1. Regarding Charism Series 1..... | 305 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2.2. Regarding Charism Series 2..... | 306 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2.3. Regarding Charism Series 3..... | 310 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2.4. Regarding Charism Series 4..... | 311 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2.5. Regarding Charism Series 5..... | 313 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2.6. Regarding Charism Series 6..... | 314 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2.7. Regarding Charism Series 7..... | 314 |
| 3.5.1.3.2.2.8. Regarding Charism Series 8..... | 314 |
| 3.5.1.3.3. A Concluding Remark..... | 314 |
| 3.5.2. Role of Sr. Anna..... | 315 |
| 3.5.2.1. Sr. Anna in the Initial stage..... | 316 |
| 3.5.2.1.1. Texts..... | 316 |
| 3.5.2.1.2. Comments..... | 317 |
| 3.5.2.2. Her Life in the Convent..... | 317 |
| 3.5.2.2.1. Texts..... | 317 |
| 3.5.2.2.2. Comments..... | 318 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 3.5.2.3. Her Personal Reflections in the Chronicles | 318 |
| 3.5.2.3.1. Text One: <i>CKC I</i> , 45-46..... | 319 |
| 3.5.2.3.2. Text Two: <i>CKC I</i> , 49..... | 320 |
| 3.5.2.3.3. Text Three: <i>CKC I</i> , 52..... | 321 |
| 3.5.2.3.4. Text Four: <i>CKC I</i> , 80 | 322 |
| 3.5.2.3.5. Text Five: <i>CKC I</i> , 84..... | 323 |
| 3.5.2.3.6. Text Six: <i>CKC I</i> , 129-130 | 323 |
| 3.5.2.3.7. Text Seven: <i>CKC I</i> , 175 | 324 |
| 3.5.2.3.8. Text Eight: <i>CKC I</i> , 184 | 325 |
| 3.5.2.3.9. Text Nine: <i>CKC II</i> , 3..... | 326 |
| 3.5.2.3.10. Text Ten: <i>CKC II</i> , 5 | 327 |
| 3.5.2.3.11. Text Eleven: <i>CKC II</i> , 22 | 328 |
| 3.5.2.4. About her Sickness and Death..... | 329 |
| 3.5.3. Role of Sr. Thresia..... | 331 |
| 3.5.3.1. Texts in <i>CKC</i> | 331 |
| 3.5.3.2. Comments | 334 |
| 3.5.4. Role of Sr. Clara..... | 336 |
| 3.5.4.1. Texts | 336 |
| 3.5.4.2. Comments | 338 |
| 3.6. Conclusion..... | 339 |

EXCURSUS
FOUNDER/FOUNDERS/FOUNDRESS?
SOME CRITICAL REFLECTIONS

| | |
|---|------------|
| Ex.0. Introduction | 340 |
| Ex.1. Founder According to the Official Teachings..... | 340 |
| Ex.1.1. Teachings of <i>Vatican Council II</i>. | 340 |
| Ex.1.2. Post Vatican Teachings..... | 340 |
| Ex.1.3. Founder According to Theologians..... | 341 |
| Ex.2. Charism According to Church Teaching | 342 |
| Ex.3. Founder/Founders/Foundress of Women TOCD. 343 | |
| Ex.3.1. The Position of CTC..... | 343 |
| Ex.3.1.1. CTC Symposium on Charism..... | 343 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Ex.3.1.2. The Position of Sr. Suzy in <i>SGME</i> | 345 |
| Ex.3.1.3. An objective Evaluation concerning the founder..... | 347 |
| Ex.3.1.4. Mother Eliswa as Foundress?..... | 348 |
| Ex.3.2. Fr. Leopold as Founder?..... | 351 |
| Ex.3.2.1. The First Impression..... | 351 |
| Ex.3.2.2. Analysis of the Facts and Texts..... | 352 |
| Ex.3.2.2.1. Texts on the Foundations..... | 352 |
| Ex.3.2.2.2. Texts on Community Life..... | 356 |
| Ex.3.2.3. The Question of Founder..... | 357 |
| Ex.3.2.4. Some Divergent Views..... | 359 |
| Ex.3.3. Fr. Chavara as Founder?..... | 361 |
| Ex.3.3.1. A Man with Divine Wish..... | 362 |
| Ex.3.3.2. A Man with a ‘Heart’..... | 362 |
| Ex.3.3.3. For the Fulfillment of the Dream..... | 362 |
| Ex.3.3.4. A Prophetic Personality | 363 |
| Ex.3.3.5. In Pursuit of Goal..... | 363 |
| Ex.3.3.6. A Being of Praise..... | 364 |
| Ex.3.3.7. One with a Paternal/Maternal Heart..... | 364 |
| Ex.3.3.8. A Spiritual Guide..... | 365 |
| Ex. 3.3.9. Fr. Chavara’s Role in the Eyes of the Contemporaries..... | 366 |
| Ex.3.3.9.1. Fr. Leopold..... | 367 |
| Ex.3.3.9.2. Fr. Kuriakose Elisha Porukkara..... | 368 |
| Ex.3.3.9.3. CKC II,23..... | 369 |
| Ex.3.3.10. The Decree of Pope John Paul II..... | 370 |
| Ex.3.4. Conclusion..... | 371 |

CHAPTER FOUR

THE GROWTH OF THE COMMUNITY TILL THE DIVISION: A BRIEF SKETCH

| | |
|---|------------|
| 4.0. Introduction..... | 373 |
| 4.1. A Community of <i>Koinonia</i>..... | 373 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 4.1.1. Text One | 373 |
| 4.1.2. Comments | 374 |
| 4.1.3. Text Two | 374 |
| 4.1.4. Comments | 375 |
| 4.2. A Community with a Mission | 376 |
| 4.2.1. Making of Rosary & Scapulars (1866) | 377 |
| 4.2.1.1. Text One | 377 |
| 4.2.1.2. Text Two..... | 377 |
| 4.2.1.3. Text Three..... | 377 |
| 4.2.1.4. Text Four | 378 |
| 4.2.1.5. Comments | 378 |
| 4.2.2. Boarding Facilities (1868) | 378 |
| 4.2.2.1. Text One | 378 |
| 4.2.2.2. Text Two..... | 379 |
| 4.2.2.3. Comments | 379 |
| 4.2.3. Establishment of the School (1872) | 380 |
| 4.2.3.1. Text One | 380 |
| 4.2.3.2. Text Two..... | 381 |
| 4.2.3.3. Comments | 381 |
| 4.2.4. Orphanage Services (1880) | 381 |
| 4.2.4.1. Text One | 381 |
| 4.2.4.2. Text Two..... | 382 |
| 4.2.4.3. Text Three..... | 382 |
| 4.2.4.4. Comments | 383 |
| 4.3. Details of Election till the Division in 1890 | 383 |
| 4.3.1. The Advice Before the First Election in 1869 ... | 383 |
| 4.3.1.1. Text One | 383 |
| 4.3.1.2. Text Two..... | 384 |
| 4.3.1.3. Comments | 386 |
| 4.3.2. An Overall Picture of the Election | 386 |
| 4.3.3. Persons Held Positions Repeatedly | 388 |
| 4.3.3.1. Sr. Eliswa of Holy Mary | 389 |
| 4.3.3.2. Sr. Thresia of Jesus | 389 |
| 4.3.3.3. Sr. Catherine of Jesus | 390 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 4.3.3.4. Sr. Mariam of Jesus | 391 |
| 4.4. Details of Members from 1866 to 1890..... | 391 |
| 4.5. Conclusion..... | 393 |

CHAPTER FIVE
THE DIVISION OF WOMEN TOCD IN 1890:
DOCUMENTARY FACTS

| | |
|---|------------|
| 5.0. Introduction..... | 394 |
| 5.1. Immediate Context of the Division..... | 395 |
| 5.1.1. CKC II, 142-143..... | 397 |
| 5.1.2. Main Arguments | 399 |
| 5.1.3. Comments | 400 |
| 5.2. Ponzona – Document Regarding the Verdict | |
| Over the Convent | 400 |
| 5.2.1. Contents of Ponzona of March 1890 | 400 |
| 5.2.2. Important Letters | 403 |
| 5.2.2.1. Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 28 th | |
| November 1888 | 403 |
| 5.2.2.1.1. Original Letter..... | 403 |
| 5.2.2.1.2. Main Arguments | 405 |
| 5.2.2.1.3. Comments | 406 |
| 5.2.2.2. Letter of Msgr. Medlycott dated 27 th | |
| January 1889 | 407 |
| 5.2.2.2.1. Original Letter..... | 407 |
| 5.2.2.2.2. Main Arguments | 410 |
| 5.2.2.2.3. Comments | 411 |
| 5.2.2.3. Petitions by Some of the Syrians | 413 |
| 5.2.2.3.1. Original Letter..... | 413 |
| 5.2.2.3.2. Main Arguments | 415 |
| 5.2.2.3.3. Comments | 415 |
| 5.2.2.3.4. Annexed Document to the Petition | 417 |
| 5.2.2.3.4.1. Original Document | 417 |
| 5.2.2.3.4.2. Main Arguments..... | 420 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 5.2.2.3.4.3. Comments..... | 421 |
| 5.2.2.4. Letter of Sr. Catherine of Jesus the Superior of Koonammavu Convent dated 8 th March, 1889 | 421 |
| 5.2.2.4.1. Original Letter..... | 421 |
| 5.2.2.4.2. Main Arguments | 425 |
| 5.2.2.4.3. Comments | 427 |
| 5.2.2.5. Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 15 th March 1889 | 427 |
| 5.2.2.5.1. Original Letter..... | 427 |
| 5.2.2.5.2. Main Arguments | 431 |
| 5.2.2.5.3. Comments | 431 |
| 5.2.2.6. Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 2 nd April 1889 | 435 |
| 5.2.2.6.1. Original Letter..... | 435 |
| 5.2.2.6.2. Main Arguments | 439 |
| 5.2.2.6.3. Comments | 441 |
| 5.2.2.7. Letter of Msgr. Medlycott dated 12 th April 1889 | 442 |
| 5.2.2.7.1. Original Document..... | 443 |
| 5.2.2.7.2. Main Arguments | 446 |
| 5.2.2.7.3. Comments..... | 447 |
| 5.2.2.8. Letter of Fr. Emmanuel Nidhiry dated on 23 rd August 1889..... | 448 |
| 5.2.2.8.1. Original Letter..... | 449 |
| 5.2.2.8.2. The Main Content of the Letter..... | 460 |
| 5.2.2.8.2.1. The Arguments of the Latins..... | 460 |
| 5.2.2.8.2.2. The Arguments of the Syrians..... | 461 |
| 5.2.2.8.2.3. Evaluation of Nidhiry | 462 |
| 5.2.2.8.3. Comments | 466 |
| 5.2.2.9. Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti..... | 471 |
| 5.2.2.9.1. Original Document..... | 471 |
| 5.2.2.9.2. Main Points | 479 |
| 5.2.2.9.3. Comments | 482 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 5.2.2.10. The Report and Suggestions of Consultant of the Propaganda Fide Rev. Fr. Gabriele Guarcino | 484 |
| 5.2.2.10.1. The Original Document | 485 |
| 5.2.2.10.2. Main Points | 522 |
| 5.2.2.10.3. Comments | 528 |
| 5.2.2.11. The Decision of the Propaganda Fide..... | 531 |
| 5.2.2.11.1. The Letter of Card. Giovanni Simeoni dated 18 th April 1890..... | 532 |
| 5.2.2.11.2. Main Points | 533 |
| 5.2.2.11.3. Comments | 534 |
| 5.2.2.12. A Concluding Remark | 535 |
| 5.3. The Aftermath of the Decision of the Propaganda Fide..... | 536 |
| 5.3.1. Information of the Decision to the Sisters at Koonammavu by Msgr. Medlycott on 21st May 1890 | 536 |
| 5.3.1.1. Original Letter | 536 |
| 5.3.1.2. Main Points | 538 |
| 5.3.1.3. Comments | 539 |
| 5.3.2. Reactions of the Latin People after the Decision of the Propaganda Fide | 539 |
| 5.3.2.1. The Account of <i>CKC</i> II, 143-144 | 540 |
| 5.3.2.1.1. Text | 540 |
| 5.3.2.1.2. Main Points | 542 |
| 5.3.2.1.3. Comments | 543 |
| 5.3.2.2. Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Superior of the Convent dated June 6 th 1890..... | 543 |
| 5.3.2.2.1. Original Letter..... | 543 |
| 5.3.2.2.2. Main points | 544 |
| 5.3.2.2.3. Comments | 544 |
| 5.3.2.3. Letter of Fr. Hillarius the Syrian Vicar of Parur to the Sisters at Koonammavu Convent dated 11 th June 1890..... | 545 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 5.3.2.3.1. Original Letter..... | 546 |
| 5.3.2.3.2. Main Points | 547 |
| 5.3.2.3.3. Comments | 547 |
| 5.3.2.4. Letter of Fr. Philip the Vicar General of Msgr. Mellano dated 29 th June 1890..... | 548 |
| 5.3.2.4.1. Original Letter..... | 548 |
| 5.3.2.4.2. Main Points | 551 |
| 5.3.2.4.3. Comments | 554 |
| 5.3.3. Regarding the Transfer of Latin Sisters to Verapoly | 556 |
| 5.3.3.1. Letter of Latin Sisters to Fr. Philip dated on 7 th June 1890 | 556 |
| 5.3.3.1.1. Original Letter | 556 |
| 5.3.3.1.2. Main Points | 558 |
| 5.3.3.1.3. Comments..... | 559 |
| 5.3.3.2. Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Prefect of the Propaganda Fide Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni dated 14 th June 1890 | 561 |
| 5.3.3.2.1. Original Letter..... | 561 |
| 5.3.3.2.2. Main Points | 568 |
| 5.3.3.2.3. Comments | 569 |
| 5.3.3.3. Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti to the Prefect, Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni dated 30 th June 1890 | 570 |
| 5.3.3.3.1. Original Letter..... | 571 |
| 5.3.3.3.2. Main Points | 576 |
| 5.3.3.3.3. Comments | 579 |
| 5.3.3.4. Letter of the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti to the Prefect of the Sacred Congregation of the Propagation of Faith dated on 6 th July 1890..... | 580 |
| 5.3.3.4.1. Original Letter | 581 |
| 5.3.3.4.2. Main Points | 584 |
| 5.3.3.4.3. Comments..... | 585 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 5.3.3.5. Letter of Fr. John Menacherry to the sisters of the Koonammavu Convent on 30 th August 1890..... | 586 |
| 5.3.3.5.1. Original Lette | 586 |
| 5.3.3.5.2. Main Points | 587 |
| 5.3.3.5.3. Comments | 587 |
| 5.3.3.6. Contract Made by Msgr. Mellano & Msgr. Medlycott dated 15 th September 1890 | 588 |
| 5.3.3.6.1. Original Document..... | 588 |
| 5.3.3.6.2. Main Points | 589 |
| 5.3.3.6.3. Comments | 590 |
| 5.3.3.7. Canonical Approval for Manjummel Contract by the Apostolic Delegate on 20 th September 1890..... | 590 |
| 5.3.3.7.1. Original Document..... | 590 |
| 5.3.3.7.2. Main Points | 591 |
| 5.3.3.7.3. Comments | 592 |
| 5.3.3.8. The Departure of the Latin Sisters..... | 592 |
| 5.3.3.8.1. Description in <i>CKC</i> II | 592 |
| 5.3.3.8.1.1. Original document..... | 592 |
| 5.3.3.8.1.2. Main Points..... | 593 |
| 5.3.3.8.1.3. Comments..... | 593 |
| 5.3.3.8.2. Letter of the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti to Cardinal Prefect Simeoni of the Propaganda Fide dated on 21 st September 1890..... | 594 |
| 5.3.3.8.2.1. Original Letter | 594 |
| 5.3.3.8.2.2. Main Points..... | 602 |
| 5.3.3.8.2.3. Comments..... | 605 |
| 5.3.3.8.3. Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti dated 29 th September 1890 | 606 |
| 5.3.3.8.3.1. Original Letter | 606 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 5.3.3.8.3.2. Main Points..... | 607 |
| 5.3.3.8.3.3. Comments..... | 608 |
| 5.3.4. Disappearing of the Children from the Orphanage..... | 608 |
| 5.3.4.1. Observations in <i>CKC II</i> | 609 |
| 5.3.4.1.1. Original Document..... | 609 |
| 5.3.4.1.2. Main Points | 610 |
| 5.3.4.1.3. Comments | 611 |
| 5.3.4.2. First two Letters of Msgr. Mellano to Msgr. Aiuti Regarding the Children of Orphanage..... | 611 |
| 5.3.4.2.1. First Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 27 th September 1890 | 612 |
| 5.3.4.2.1.1. Original Letter | 612 |
| 5.3.4.2.1.2. Main Points..... | 616 |
| 5.3.4.2.1.3. Comments..... | 618 |
| 5.3.4.2.2. Second Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti dated 9 th October 1890 | 624 |
| 5.3.4.2.2.1. Original Letter | 624 |
| 5.3.4.2.2.2. Main Points..... | 627 |
| 5.3.4.2.2.3. Comments..... | 628 |
| 5.3.4.3. Reply of Msgr. Aiuti to Msgr. Mellano Regarding the Orphans dated on 17 th October 1890 | 631 |
| 5.3.4.3.1. Original document..... | 632 |
| 5.3.4.3.2. Main Points | 634 |
| 5.3.4.3.3. Comments | 635 |
| 5.3.4.4. Third Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Apostolic Delegate dated 18 th October 1890 expressing the desire to accept the Orphans | 635 |
| 5.3.4.4.1. Original Letter..... | 635 |
| 5.3.4.4.2. Main Points | 636 |
| 5.3.4.4.3. Comments | 637 |
| 5.3.4.5. Fourth Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the | |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Apostolic Delegate dated 24 th of October 1890. | 637 |
| 5.3.4.5.1. Original Letter..... | 637 |
| 5.3.4.5.2. Main Points | 640 |
| 5.3.4.5.3. Comments | 641 |
| 5.3.4.6. Letter of the Apostolic Delegate to the Prefect of the Propaganda Fide Cardinal Simeoni dated 30 th October 1890..... | 642 |
| 5.3.4.6.1. Original Letter..... | 643 |
| 5.3.4.6.2. Main Points | 654 |
| 5.3.4.6.3. Comments | 658 |
| 5.3.4.7. Reply of Cardinal Simeoni through his Secretary to the Apostolic Delegate dated November 26, 1890..... | 660 |
| 5.3.4.7.1. Original Letter..... | 661 |
| 5.3.4.7.2. Main Points | 662 |
| 5.3.4.7.3. Comments | 662 |
| 5.3.5. Dispute over the Properties (Especially over the dowry of Sr. Anna) | 662 |
| 5.3.5.1. Letter of Sr. Catherine to Msgr. Medlycott | 662 |
| 5.3.5.1.1. Original Letter..... | 663 |
| 5.3.5.1.2. Main Points | 664 |
| 5.3.5.1.3. Comments | 665 |
| 5.3.5.2. Letter of Latin Sisters to Msgr. Medlycott dated on 5 th December, 1890 Requesting Permission to Examine Account Book | 666 |
| 5.3.5.2.1. Original Letter..... | 666 |
| 5.3.5.2.2. Main Points | 667 |
| 5.3.5.2.3. Comments | 668 |
| 5.3.5.3. First Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to the Superior of Koonammavu Convent dated on December 20, 1890 | 670 |
| 5.3.5.3.1. Original Document..... | 670 |
| 5.3.5.3.2. Main Points | 672 |
| 5.3.5.3.3. Comments | 672 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 5.3.5.4. Second Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to Sr. Catherine the superior of Koonammavu Convent dated December 31, 1890..... | 672 |
| 5.3.5.4.1. Original Letter..... | 673 |
| 5.3.5.4.2. Main Points | 674 |
| 5.3.5.4.3. Comments | 675 |
| 5.3.5.5. Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to Archbishop Mellano dated 2 nd January 1891 | 675 |
| 5.3.5.5.1. Original Document..... | 675 |
| 5.3.5.5.2. Main Points | 676 |
| 5.3.5.5.3. Comments..... | 677 |
| 5.3.5.6. Third Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to the Superior of Koonammavu Convent dated 3 rd January 1891..... | 678 |
| 5.3.5.6.1. Original Letter..... | 678 |
| 5.3.5.6.2. Main Points | 678 |
| 5.3.5.6.3. Comments | 679 |
| 5.3.5.7. Letter of Sr. Catherine to Msgr. Medlycott, written in January 1891..... | 679 |
| 5.3.5.7.1. Original Document..... | 679 |
| 5.3.5.7.2. Main Points | 681 |
| 5.3.5.7.3. Comments | 682 |
| 5.3.5.8. Letters of Msgr. Medlycott (dated 20 th January 1891) and Sr. Catherine (dated 26 th January 1891)..... | 682 |
| 5.3.5.8.1. Original Document I – Letter of Sr. Catherine..... | 683 |
| 5.3.5.8.1.1. Main Points..... | 686 |
| 5.3.5.8.1.2. Comments..... | 688 |
| 5.3.5.8.2. Original Document II – Letter of Msgr. Medlycott | 689 |
| 5.3.5.8.2.1. Main Points..... | 690 |
| 5.3.5.8.2.2. Comments..... | 691 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 5.3.5.9. The <i>CKC</i> Account dated On 22 nd January, 1891 on the Stay of Latin Sisters at Koonammavu (<i>CKC</i> II, 147) | 691 |
| 5.3.5.9.1. Original Text | 691 |
| 5.3.5.9.2. Comments | 691 |
| 5.3.5.10. The Order of Msgr. Medlycott over the issue of Patrimony dated 18 th October, 1891 | 692 |
| 5.3.5.10.1. Main Points | 695 |
| 5.3.5.10.2. Comments | 696 |
| 5.3.5.10.3. <i>Vajrajubilee Smarakam</i> Regarding the Settlement of the Issue of Patrimony | 697 |
| 5.4. Concluding Remarks | 697 |
| GENERAL CONCLUSION..... | 700 |
| EPILOGUE: RECORDS OF CORDIAL CONTACTS | 707 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | 716 |

FOREWORD

History is the accurate, precise and true record of past events. In the absence of such attributes, the history may turn to be a legend. It is the duty of the historians to delve into the original sources, collect data, subject them to external and internal scrutiny and validation, analyze them, make inference from them impartially and present the findings before the world. The book titled **‘Women TOCD Facts versus Fabrications’** represents such an authentic attempt to investigate on and to reveal the true history behind the foundation of the first indigenous Congregation for women in 1866 at Koonammavu, Kerala.

The institution of the first indigenous convent in Kerala, Women TOCD was a remarkable incident in the spiritual as well as the social history of Kerala, due to its potential to bring out significant changes in those realms. The situation that prevailed in Kerala till the second half of the 19th century is described by Bl. Chavara as ‘the secular clergy were blessed with priesthood along with celibate life. Pitiabie was the situation of women folk in Kerala. They were forced to lead a family life, even though many of them wanted to embrace a consecrated life of chastity and prayer.’ This was a heartache for Bl. Chavara. He yearned for starting a religious convent for women ever since the establishment of the first indigenous monastery for men in 1831. His first two attempts became futile for one or the other reasons. His third attempt with very Rev. Fr. Leopold Beccaro OCD became fruition in 1866.

The book **‘Women TOCD Facts versus Fabrications’** presents a truthful analysis of the historical documents regarding the establishment and early religious life of Women TOCD written before the bifurcation of it into Syrian and Latin in 1890. Prominent among them are the Chronicles of

Mannanam Monastery written by Bl. Chavara and Chronicles of Koonammavu convent written by Bl. Chavara and Sr. Anna and others. The other documents are *Diary* of Parappuram Varkey, *Alochanapusthakam*, *Kanakkupusthakam* of Koonammavu convent till 1890, *Letters* written by Bl. Chavara etc. They portrait a clear picture of the origin and initial stages of women TOCD, till it was divided into two independent congregations based on Rites. The original picture of the beginners was that of a heavenly community, zealous to love God and brethren with one heart and soul. They lived in unity, prayed and praised God together, ate and worked together in the fullness of joy of God's children. It was the realization of the long cherished dream of Bl. Chavara and of Kerala Catholic community.

The recent developments and claims regarding the founder/foundress of TOCD for women and the giver of its lifestyle give rise to some confusion in the panorama of religious in India and around the world. This turbulence seems to be reflected more in Kerala. We welcome the dispute as it opens a chance to turn once more to the original sources written before the division of TOCD, analyze them vigorously, make inference from them scientifically and to find out impartial truths. Now we present them before the readers and objective scholars for their scrutiny through this significant work.

This work is a united attempt of Rev. Dr. Paul Kalluveetil CMI, Dr. (Sr.) Sophy Rose CMC, Dr. (Sr.) Maria Anto CMC and Sr. Mareena CMC to radiate the inner thirst and spirit of founding fathers and the early members of Women TOCD to the new generation with the fragrance of historical truthfulness. They have taken sincere effort, to be true to the historical documents and not to jump into judgments and inferences out of its limits, so that it may serve

as a valid and reliable account to the lovers of history. Throughout this work, they have kept a research mind to reveal the actual happenings on the basis of documents written on those days. Their efforts deserve special note of admiration and I congratulate them wholeheartedly.

Hope this will be an authentic record regarding the brave and pious hearts and hands behind the erection of the first indigenous Congregation for women in Kerala. I recommend this book for the study and meditation of all our sisters and all those who respect history. May I invite the readers to imitate the zeal and spirit which guided the saintly founders and the first members. Let this beacon lead us through the ways of radical and revived consecrated life.

Sr. Sancta CMC
Superior General

PREFACE

Now we are happy to publish the second volume promised in our study *An Unscientific Scientific Work! A Critical Appraisal of Dr. Sr. Sucey Kinattungal's Work Servant of God Mother Eliswa, the Foundress of TOCD (CTC & CMC) for Women*. We acknowledge that it is the fruit of a very laborious, strenuous and continuous work. We thank the Almighty that he had provided us a chance to undertake a research of the original documents, delved deeply into them and to analyze them objectively as far as possible. It has helped us to get a clear picture of the origins and the initial stages of the WOMEN TOCD, THE FIRST INDIGENOUS RELIGIOUS CONGREGATION FOR WOMEN, till it was divided into two independent Congregations based on Latin and Syrian Rites. Unfortunately, there played human and unchristian elements at the period of division of which neither Msgr. Bernardine, nor Fr. Leopold Beccaro nor Fr. Kuriakose Elias Chavara nor the first four pioneer sisters dreamt at the initial stage. In their zeal to love God and brethren with one heart and soul, these earlier members led the life of heaven on earth, prayed and praised God together, ate together, worked together in joy and gladness irrespective of Rite's differences. This was a wonderful, revolutionary and blessed beginning in the history of the Catholic Church in Kerala.

Recent developments concentrating on the issue of founder/foundress, we think, have not originated from heaven. It has created ill feelings, aspersions and bitter rivalries. Thank God, it has helped us to study the original sources and evaluate the part played by Msgr. Bernardine, Fr. Leopold, Fr. Chavara, mother Eliswa, and the other three sisters at the foundation and evolution of the first indigenous women religious community in Kerala. Every one of them played their part ascribed to them by God in the growth of the Congregation.

The original sources written mainly before the division of Women TOCD in 1890 are used in this study. Among these the most referred sources are Chronicles of Mannanam Monastery by Fr. Chavara and Chronicles of Koonammavu convent by Fr. Chavara and Sr. Anna, one of the first members of Women TOCD. Our citations of Chronicles, both of Mannanam monastery and Koonammavu convent are from the original Malayalam texts, since the English versions are defective. We have tried to render them as literally as possible, so that the readers could get the true sense of the texts. As far as the chapter on division is concerned, our aim is to disclose the documentary facts. Hence, we made use of all the available correspondences. One may find sometimes inaccuracies in our literal translation of the Italian letters. Two reasons could be adduced for it: our non-adeptness of the Italian language and its style and expressions of the 19th century that are not very familiar for the modern audience.

The prologue of this study provides certain comments on Sr. Sucey's Malayalam book *Pradhama Taddesiya Sanyasinisamooham Stapaka* ('The Foundress of the First Indigenous Women Religious Congregation'). Chapter one is devoted to the analysis of the contemporary texts concerning the beginning of the indigenous Congregation for women. Chapter two of this study deals with the events of its canonical erection. Chapter three occupies the important position of this work. It tries to bring out how the formation and evolution of the lifestyle of the first members have developed, the rationale for the foundation and the contribution of Frs. Leopold and Chavara as well as the first four members of this religious community. As an *Excursus* some critical reflections are offered on the issue of founder/founders/foundress. Chapter four offers a very brief sketch of the growth of the community till the division.

Chapter five tries to critically analyze the documents concerning the issues of division and properties. In the general conclusion we sum up the main insights of the study. This work ends with a positive note on the cordial contacts that developed between the Latin and Syrian sisters after few years of their separation.

We present before the public the result of our study. Let impartial readers and objective scholars evaluate this work. We express our sincere gratitude for all those who have helped us by opening up the Archives, bringing into our notice pertinent documents and providing us valuable suggestions. Hope this study may serve for the greater glory of God and engender inner peace and more understanding among those who love the truth. We join our Lord in praying, “Our Father in heaven, hallowed be your name, your kingdom come, your will be done on earth as it is in heaven” (Mt. 6: 9-10).

15th August 2013
Assumption of Mary, the Mother of God

Dr. Paul Kalluveetil, CMI
Dr. Sophy Rose, CMC
Dr. Maria Anto, CMC
Mareena, CMC
Mount Carmel Generalate
Thaikkattukara P.O
Aluva, Kerala, India
cmcgeneralate@gmail.com

ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|-------|--|
| ACMCG | Archives of CMC Generalate, Aluva |
| AMC | Ascent of Mount Carmel |
| ASJMM | Archives of St. Joseph's Monastery, Mannanam |
| AUSW | <i>An Unscientific Scientific Work! (A Critical Appraisal of Dr. Sr. Sucey Kinattingal's Work Servant of God Mother Eliswa, the Foundress of TOCD (CTC & CMC) for Women)</i> |
| AVP | Archives of Vimala Province, Ernakulam |
| C | Colloquies (Work of Fr. Chavara) |
| CD | <i>Christus Dominus</i> (II Vatican Councils' Decree on Bishops) |
| CKC | Chronicles of Koonammavu Convent (Vols. I & II) |
| CMC | Congregation of Mother of Carmel |
| CMI | Carmelites of Mary Immaculate |
| CMM | Chronicles of Mannanam Monastery (Vol. I & II) |
| CS | Compunction of the Soul (Work of Fr. Chavara) |
| CTC | Congregation of Teresian Carmelites |
| CWC | Complete Works of Chavara |
| ET | <i>Evangelica Testificatio</i> (Apostolic Exhortation of Paul VI) |
| Ex. | Excursus |

| | |
|-------|--|
| Ep. | Epilogue |
| FN | Footnote/Footnotes |
| IL | <i>Instrumentum Laboris</i> (Working Document on the Synod of Bishops on Consecrated Life). |
| LG | <i>Lumen Gentium</i> (Vatican Council Second's Constitution on the Church) |
| Mal. | Malayalam |
| MR | <i>Mutuae Relationes</i> (Mutual Relations between Bishops and Religious, Directives from SCRIS) |
| Msgr. | Monsignor |
| OCD | <i>Ordinis Carmelitarum Discalceatorum</i> |
| Pr. | Prologue |
| PTSS | <i>Pradhama Thadhesiya Sannyasinisamuham Sthapaka</i> (Booklet by Sr. Dr. Sucey Kinattungal CTC) |
| SC | <i>Sacrosantum Concilium</i> (II Vatican Council's Constitution on Liturgy) |
| SCRIS | Sacred Congregation for Religious and Secular Institutes |
| SGME | Servant of God Mother Eliswa (Book by Sr. Dr. Sucey Kinattungal CTC) |
| TOCD | <i>Tertius Ordo Carmelitarum Discalceatorum</i> |
| WFF | Women TOCD Facts versus Fabrications (Title of the present book) |

PROLOGUE

SOME CRITICAL REMARKS ON *PTSS*

Pr. 0. Introduction

Just before the release of our study, *An Unscientific Scientific Work! A Critical Appraisal of Dr. Sr. Sucey Kinattungal's Work Servant of God Mother Eliswa, the Foundress of TOCD (CTC & CMC) for Women*¹, Sr. Sucey has published another book entitled *Pradhama Thadhesiya Sannyasinisamuham Sthapaka (The Foundress of the First Indigenous Women Religious Congregation)*² which was a reactionary response to the booklet of Fr. Thomas Panthaplackal, *Chavarayachanum Thadhesia Sannyasa Sabhakalum (Fr. Chavara and Indigenous Religious Congregations)*.³ If Sr. Sucey would have read our critical appraisal on many of her assertions and absolute statements in her thesis, she would not have repeated them in the second booklet.⁴

Before coming to the proper theme of the second volume namely *Women TOCD Facts versus Fabrications*,⁵ we would like to point out the main wrong affirmations of the author and other contributors of *PTSS*, inviting the attention of the readers to consult our first volume *AUSW* in which the details are given.

¹Hereafter the book will be abbreviated as *AUSW*.

²Henceforth the book will be cited as *PTSS*.

³This booklet was written by Fr. Panthaplackal in which he expresses his convictions and opinions basing on the original sources.

⁴This is all equally applicable to some of the statements of Dr. Antony George Pattaparampil in 'Appendix 3' of *PTSS*, 91-93.

⁵Henceforward the book will be abbreviated as *WFF*. Even though in the first volume the second book has entitled as *Women TOCD Facts and Fictions*, we have changed the title as *Women TOCD Facts versus Fabrications*.

Pr. 1. Regarding Fr. Chavara

- Pr.1.1. On the assertion of Sr. Sucey that even when Fr. Leopold was in Italy in 1869, Fr. Chavara did not have any authority over the convent (*PTSS*, 41), see, *AUSW*, 98-103.
- Pr.1.2. On Sr. Sucey's statement that CMC had 'adopted' Fr. Chavara as the founder of their Congregation and it must be thought seriously that on what basis they had later added his name as the founder in books published later (*PTSS*, 42, 64) see our study in *WFF*, Excursus, No. Ex. 3.3. 'Fr. Chavara as Founder?'
- Pr.1.3. On Sr. Sucey's claim, the Chronicles witness that it was Fr. Chavara who had helped the sisters and supervised the works at the convent compound (*PTSS*, 41), cf. *AUSW*, 105-106.
- Pr.1.4. On Sr. Sucey's argument, when analysed historically the role of Fr. Chavara, it is clear as day light that he cannot be called as the founder or co-founder and the right position that can be given to him is one of the well-wishers of Women TOCD (*PTSS* 62, 75, 79-80), see *AUSW*, 95-110. For further details see *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.4. 'Fr. Chavara as the Formator.' And also Excursus, No. Ex.3.3. 'Fr. Chavara as Founder?'
- Pr.1.5. On corroborating the accusation that a new history was made in which, Fr. Chavara was elevated as the founder for which Sr. Sucey quotes from the book of Fr. Mathias Mundaden (*PTSS*, 42-43, also 61), See our comments in *AUSW*, 112-113).
- Pr.1.6. On the allegation that Fr. Chavara as the founder of CMC which was added to history after a century in the light of his canonical process and thus it appeared

in the decree of Pope (*PTSS*, 44) see again *WFF*, Excursus, No. Ex.3.3. ‘Fr. Chavara as Founder?’ especially No. Ex. 3.3.9. ‘Fr. Chavara’s Role in the Eyes of the Contemporaries.’

- Pr.1.7. On Sr. Sucey’s affirmation that it is only twice that Fr. Chavara had come into the convent in 1870 and even at the second time he was carried in the chair (*PTSS*, 41), the truth is that Fr. Chavara had come at least 14 times. It was not at the second time that he was carried. For details see *AUSW*, 106-109. Perhaps Sr. Sucey was referring to the second time of the *last* three comings of Fr. Chavara of which the chronicler gives a detailed account.⁶
- Pr.1.8. On the remarks of Sr. Sucey: “the criticism of CMI is baseless and they failed to point out mistakes specifically, instead they say *a few erroneous judgements (indeed there are many)*” (*PTSS*, 79). For the full text of the response to the *Extract* see *AUSW* 19-24. For a detailed exposition of the mistakes see *AUSW*, 95-105.
- Pr.1.9. On Sr. Sucey’s accusation regarding the obituary of Fr. Chavara by Fr. Leopold in his *diary* (‘with much difficulty he has founded the convent for women’) that only these lines are seen as written in between the lines (*PTSS*, 70-71), cf. *AUSW*, 15, 148 and also see our study in *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.1.1.1. ‘Initiator According to Fr. Leopold.’ So too, Excursus, No. Ex.3.3.9.1. ‘Fr. Leopold.’

⁶*CKC* II, 10. It is notable the statement from *CKC*: എന്നാൽ നമ്മുടെ ഈ പിതാവ് കടശി മൂന്നുശം ഇവിടെ വന്നതിന്റെ വർത്തമാനം തിരിച്ചെഴുതാൻ ന്യായമായിരിക്കുന്നു. ഒന്നാം ഉഴം [first time] *CKC* II, 10; രണ്ടാം ഉഴം [second time] *CKC* II, 12; മൂന്നാം ഉഴം [third time] *CKC* II, 16.

Pr.2. Regarding Mother Eliswa

- Pr.2.1. Regarding the claims that in 1862 mother Eliswa approached Fr. Leopold, he learned the charism and lifestyle of her and recognized and affirmed it as that of Carmelite and then in 1864 he informed the Vicar Apostolic and got his approval (*PTSS*, 40) cf. *AUSW*, 58-59; 94-95. See also *WFF*, Excursus, No. Ex.3.1.4. 'Mother Eliswa as Foundress?'
- Pr.2.2. On the assertion that there are enough proofs to affirm the truth that mother Eliswa is the foundress of women TOCD (*PTSS*, 45, 55, 74-75) see *WFF*, Chapter I, No.1.1.3.3. 'Entrusting themselves to Fr. Leopold' and Excursus No. Ex.3.1. 'The Position of CTC.'
- Pr.2.3. Sr. Sucey adduces the argument that the Chronicles of TOCD Vol. III, which was written down on 1913 at the death of mother Eliswa (1913) clearly states that mother Eliswa is the foundress (*PTSS*, 75). Unfortunately that Chronicles is not a contemporary document as far as the foundation is concerned. And that was written after the establishment of the convent for the Latin sisters at Verapoly. Hence that cannot carry much weight. About the issue that mother Eliswa as the foundress see *WFF*, Excursus No. Ex.3.1. 'The Position of CTC.'
- Pr.2.4. On the statement that Women TOCD before division has only one history and one foundress and the Syrian wing cannot claim a separate history from that of Latin (*PTSS*, 77) see *WFF* Chapter I, No.1.1.1. 'Role of Fr. Kuriakose Elias Chavara.'
- Pr.2.5. On the assertion that all the contemporaries had held that mother Eliswa was the foundress of the TOCD Congregation for women, see *AUSW*, pages 85-95. Also cf. *WFF*, Excursus No. 3.1.4. 'Mother Eliswa as Foundress?'

Pr.3. Regarding the Property of Anna

- Pr.3.1. On the assertion of Sr. Sucey that there are no manuscript documents which state that the debts on the property of Sr. Anna was paid with the help of Koonammavu monastery (*PTSS*, 64) see *WFF*, Chapter I, No. 1.1.3.1. 'Their Life Situation'; Chapter II, No. 2.1.3.1. 'The Land of *panambumadam*.'
- Pr.3.2. On Sr. Anna and Sr. Eliswa's patrimony amounted to 14000 francs (*PTSS* 70), Sr. Sucey did not cite any documents and we also could not find any document. The document concerning the tax of the convent Rs. 120 paid by Chavara of which Sr. Sucey could not find any historical evidence. But actually there are two letters of Fr. Chavara addressed to Fr. Kuriakose Elias Porukara⁷ and Fr. Chavara Ouseph.⁸

Pr.4. Regarding Sr. Clara

- Pr.4.1. On Sr. Sucey's using of the name of Sr. Clara as Achamma (*PTSS*, 65) see *AUSW*, FN 20 on page 92.
- Pr.4.2. The accusation of Sr. Sucey, on the deleting of the list of things brought by Sr. Clara (*PTSS*, 65), see *AUSW*, 132-137.

Pr.5. Regarding the New Convent

- Pr.5.1. Sr. Sucey repeats in *PTSS* 54 and 66 her assertions of Fr. Thomas Guyomer's contribution of the plots of land in *SGME*, 137, 181 and 184 which we have questioned in *AUSW*, 119-121. Now she writes in *PTSS* 66: "Many manuscripts' copies witness that mother Eliswa's uncle bought in cash one more land along with the two plots that he already had and gave

⁷ *Kathukal*, V/5.

⁸ *Kathukal*, V/17.

to his nieces. Salvador Vareed Thannikkode, Fr. Joseph T.O.C.D who has written the *life history of mother Thresia*, Fr. Leonard T.O.C.D, Bro. Leopold O.C.D etc. witness this fact. Archbishop Mellano also gives the details of these plots.” However, in her FN Sucey refers only to Msgr. Mellano and Bro. Leopold. For further details, confer *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.1. ‘Land of the New Convent.’

Pr. 5.2. Sr. Sucey makes Msgr. Bernardine as the originator of the idea of the *pidiyary* endeavour, *PTSS*, 81 in which she refers to pages 212-215 of *SGME*. The reference is indeed wrong. Actually, she speaks of the issue of *pidiyary* on page 241 ff of *SGME*. A study of the documents makes clear that the idea of *pidiyary* has not originated from Msgr. Baccinelli. See details in *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.2.1. ‘*Pidiyary*.’

Pr.5.3. Sr. Sucey finds it strange that Fr. Chavara collected Rs. 8000/- only from the Syrian Churches for the construction of the convent. Similarly, she questions the need for collecting Rs. 8000/- when the total amount spent for the construction of the convent was only Rs. 4500/- (*PTSS*, 68, 69, 73, 74). On the groundless affirmation of the contribution of Archbishop Bernardine (*PTSS*, 74) see the comment in *AUSW*, 122-123. For the facts which will militate against Sr. Sucey’s assertions on *PTSS* 64-71 see our detailed study in *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.2.2. ‘Donations from Parishes’ and No. 2.2.4.3.3. ‘Miracles of Providence.’

Pr. 5.4. The assertion of Sr. Sucey that the Chronicles of the convent only deals with the day-to-day happenings and does not contain the list of financial contributors (*PTSS*, 73-74) is wrong. A full list of benefactors is provided in *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.2.2. ‘Donations from Parishes.’

Pr. 5.5. On Sr. Sucey's questioning the relevance of writing the letter for alms to Muttuchira and Kaduthuruthy parishes already when the construction of the convent was almost finished (*PTSS*, 64), see *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.3.3. 'Miracles of Providence' and for the pertinent part of that letter see, Chapter V, FN: 4.

Pr.6. Regarding the Report of Msgr. Baccinelli

Pr.6.1. Sr. Sucey denies that the *Relazione* (Report of the Vicariate) of Msgr. Baccinelli in 1867 was dealing with Syrian Christians of the Malabar Church (*PTSS*, 72). The citation given in 150-151 of *AUSW* will prove that Sr. Sucey is wrong.

Pr.6.2. On the translation of the report of Msgr. Bernardine given by Sr. Sucey on page 72 of *PTSS* is not accurate. The literal translation is "they are entrusted to the missionary along with the Prior of the Tertiary." For the original text and explanation see, *AUSW*, 150-151.

Pr.7. Regarding Division of Women TOCD

Pr.7.1. On Sr. Sucey's claim of the objectivity of the reports of Archbishop Mellano to Rome (*PTSS*, 56-58), see our observations in *AUSW*, 60-61. Also see in *WFF*, Chapter V, our comments to the letters of Msgr. Mellano and No. 5.4. 'Concluding Remarks.'

Pr.7.2. On the position of the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti in giving the convent to the Syrians (*PTSS*, 57) see our discussion in *WFF*, Chapter V, No.5.2.2.9. 'Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti.'

Pr. 7.3. On the statement, Msgr. Aiuti said that even though there are no enough reasons to give this convent and property to the Syrian Rite, by all means that should be given to them (*PTSS*, 58), see *WFF*, Chapter V, No. 5.2.2.9. 'Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti.'

- Pr.7.4. On the argument of Sr. Sucey about the active involvement of the issue of Rites at the very beginning period of women TOCD on *PTSS* 84, is against the history. It is sad to note that she is speaking not about the initial stages. We also agree that the history of later times was very much influenced by it.
- Pr.7.5. On the assertion that Propaganda Fide has found out and proved that many of the reports, letters and signatures at the time of division were false creations (*PTSS*, 71), we could not find out any such documents from the part of Propaganda Fide. When the dispute came up over the patrimony of Sr. Anna, Rome entrusted Msgr. Medlycott to settle the issue. It is evident from his Order how prudently and justly he handled the situations. See for details *WFF*, Chapter V, No. 5.3.5.10. 'The Order of Msgr. Medlycott over the issue of Patrimony dated 18th October, 1891.'⁹
- Pr.7. 6. Dr. Francis Pereparambil OCD, professor of Church history makes the following assertion in *PTSS* of Sr. Sucey: Humanly thinking, the convent which was built in the property of those poor Latin sisters was seized from them in a cruel way. In this process, the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur and the Apostolic Visitor Andrea Aiuti who had taken the further steps to chase them away from there were not the only culprits. How can we qualify the act of those who misguided these people who knew nothing about this country, its Regulations and the differences of Rites and thus misled Rome and thus stood against the spirit of

⁹ It is worth to read all the letters that Msgr. Medlycott wrote to the superior of Koonammavu convent as well as to Msgr. Mellano in this regard. Those letters can be seen in *WFF*, Chapter V, No. 5.3.5. 'Dispute over the Properties (Especially over the Dowry of Sr. Anna).'

religious life?”¹⁰ Regarding the land of the convent building, see *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.1. ‘Land of the New Convent.’ Concerning the accusation that Syrians had taken illegally the convent and its property, see the documents and comments in *WFF*, Chapter V.

Pr.8. Regarding the Founders of CMI

Pr.8.1. On the repeated remarks of Sr. Sucey on the founding fathers of CMI Congregation, see *AUSW*, 112-113.¹¹ We do not want to enter into a detailed discussion about it because of two facts.

- It does not directly concern the thesis of Sr. Sucey about mother Eliswa as the foundress of Women TOCD.
- A detailed exposition of the argument will take so many pages of the second volume *WFF*, which may not be interesting to the readers on the history of Women TOCD.

Pr.9. Regarding Sr. Sucey’s thesis *SGME*

Pr.9.1. On Sr. Sucey’s opinion that the words such as *possible*, *perhaps* should not have a place in the authentic history (*PTSS*, 46), cf. *AUSW*, 50-51. It is also noteworthy one of the statements of Prof. Normann

¹⁰“ആ പാവപ്പെട്ട ലത്തീൻ സന്യാസിനികളുടെ സ്വത്തിൽ പണികഴിപ്പിച്ച മംഗളമാണെന്നായി ചിന്തിച്ചാൽ ഏറ്റവും ക്രൂരമായി അവരിൽ നിന്ന് പിടിച്ചെടുക്കുകയും അവരെ അവിടെ നിന്ന് ആട്ടിയോടിക്കുന്നതിന് മുൻകൈയെടുക്കുകയും ചെയ്ത തൃശൂർ വികാർ അപ്പസ്തോലികയും അപ്പസ്തോലിക് വിസിറ്റർ അന്ത്രയ അയ്യത്തിയും മാത്രമല്ല തെറ്റുകാർ. ഈ നാടിനെ കുറിച്ചും നാട്ടുനടപ്പിനെ കുറിച്ചും റീത്തുവ്യത്യാസങ്ങളെ കുറിച്ചും അജ്ഞരായിരുന്ന അവരെ തെറ്റിദ്ധരിപ്പിച്ചും അതുവഴി റോമിനെ വഴിതെറ്റിച്ചും, സന്യാസചൈതന്യത്തിന് അപവാദങ്ങളായവരുടെ പ്രവർത്തികളെ എങ്ങനെ വിശേഷിപ്പിക്കാനാകും?” (*PTSS*, 104).

¹¹Also Dr. Francis Pereparambil questions, the status of Fr. Chavara as the founder in *PTSS*, 102.

Tanner the moderator in his letter to us dated on 4th January 2010: “At the end of the examination, I as Director of the thesis and the other examiner recommended the award of the doctorate, provided the candidate moderated the over-strong language in the thesis” (*AUSW*, 18).

Pr.9.2. On the so called appreciation of the thesis by Dr. Normann Tanner (*PTSS*, 47-48) one also has to take into account another impression he has communicated to us in his reply to the letter dated on 4th April 2011: “of the chapters in the dissertation, only chapter 2, the least controversial, was included in the published abstract (*Estratto*) of the thesis” and “but how Sr. Sucey subsequently publishes her thesis is not within our control” (*AUSW*, 25, see also 19).

Pr.9.3. On the so called appreciation of Dr. Joseph Xavier, the reader of the dissertation (*PTSS*, 48) one should not forget his reservations communicated to us in his reply to our letter dated on 17th April 2011: “She has not asked my permission to put my name on the cover page. Also you know that in an evaluation of a thesis we are supposed to give positive as well as critical comments. If she has chosen selectively some comments from the evaluation of the thesis, it is up to her” (*AUSW*, 28).

Pr.10. Some other Facts

Pr.10.1. On the repeated accusation of manipulating the pages of the Chronicles (*PTSS* 80-82) see *AUSW* 132-139. In addition, the statement in *CKC* I, 81: “It is a practice to set apart the patrimony of the candidates at the time of vestition. Since it is the duty of the superiors, it seems that they must have done it

according to the order,”¹² approves our arguments in *AUSW*, 137-138.

Pr.10.2. On the Puthenpally building (*PTSS*, 62) see our reflection in *WFF* Chapter 1, No. 1.1.1.3. ‘Failed Attempts.’

Pr.10.3. Sr. Sucey asserts that at the beginning, the TOCD women community was not a women branch of CMI. It is an unnecessary assertion (*PTSS*, 73, 74). To prove the invalidity of Sr. Sucey’s statement, the appointment of Fr. Leopold as the Provincial Delegate by the Archbishop Bernardine Baccinelli is enough. There thus we read: “to conduct the monasteries established in Malayalam and the nuns of that Order (Congregation)” (*CKC* I, 200). See also *CKC* I, 102, 152. For further details see *AUSW*, 160-163. Ample evidence for it can also be seen in *WFF*.

Pr.11. Conclusion

The unscientific nature of many of Sr. Sucey’s arguments in *PTSS* which are merely a repetition from her doctoral thesis *SGME*, are already pointed out in our first Vol. *AUSW*. Here we wanted to invite the attention of the readers to some of them. Our comments do not have an exhaustive nature, since we would like to focus our attention on the proper theme of the second volume *WFF* which is already promised to the scholarly world.

¹²The original text is: “എന്നാൽ ഉടുക്കുപൊൾ സ്ത്രീധനമായ പത്രമൊന്നി വെക്കുന്നത് കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാത്തിൽ ചട്ടമാകയാൽ ആയതും തലവന്മാരുടെ അന്വേഷണമാകയാൽ ആയതും വെണ്ടിയ ക്രമം പോലെ ചെയ്തിരിക്കും എന്നും തോന്നുന്നു.”

CHAPTER ONE

THE BEGINNINGS OF THE INDIGENOUS CONGREGATION FOR WOMEN

1.0. Introduction

The method of approach in this study is historico-analytical. The contemporary documents in which there are mentions of the foundation are investigated more or less in chronological order. The study first cites the historical documents both in its original languages and in English. Then some comments are made. The first document seems to be the *Chronicles of Mannanam Monastery*.¹ Here the attempt is to bring up the spiritual orientation which played a major role in realizing the dream for a Congregation.

1.1. Roles of Important Personalities in the Foundation

This title deals with the persons who played a major role in the foundation of Women TOCD more or less in the chronological sequence such as Fr. Kuriakose Elias Chavara, one of the founding fathers and the first Prior of Men TOCD (CMI), Fr. Leopold Beccaro the Provincial Delegate, Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli the then Vicar Apostolic of Verapoly and mother Eliswa Vakayil the first member of Women TOCD.²

¹ The documents are presented according to the main themes in paragraphs so that the readers can follow the comments easily. (Henceforth the *Chronicles of Mannanam Monastery* will be referred as *CMM* with volume number).

²On the so-called role played by Fr. Thomas Guyomar, the maternal uncle of mother Eliswa, see the comments in *AUSW*, 119-121 and further remarks in this volume Chapter II, title No. 2.2.4.1. 'The Land of the New Convent.'

1.1.1. Role of Fr. Kuriakose Elias Chavara

Fr. Chavara, one of the founding fathers, the first professed member and the first Prior of the TOCD Congregation for men and who received the profession of other members as he states in *CMM* I, 81-82 [56-57]³, was actively involved in the foundation of the Women TOCD.

1.1.1.1. Zealous Yearning for a Convent

1.1.1.1.1. Text

In the Chronicles, thus it is stated:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| ഇതാ ഇപ്പോൾ ഏറിയകാലം മുതലായി അപേക്ഷിച്ചു വന്നിരുന്നതും നടക്കാതെ കിടന്നതുമായ ഒരു കാര്യം ആയ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠം എന്നുള്ള കാര്യം ദൈവം ഈ കാലത്തിൽ നടത്തുവാൻ തിരുമനസായിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നു തോന്നുന്നു (<i>CMM</i> II, 72 [124]). | It seems that God has willed to accomplish now, the matter of a convent for nuns which was prayed for a long time and still was not possible. |

1.1.1.1.2. Comments

This statement helps us to enter into the very heart of Fr. Chavara who desirously desired⁴ for having a consecrated community of women in Kerala. He was not merely desiring but persistently knocking at the door of the Lord and asking incessantly supplicating for the fulfillment of his desire (cf.

³The original manuscript of *CMM* is kept in two volumes. The first one includes the details from the beginning of *Dharsana Bhavanam* at Mannanam (1831) till the first profession in 1855 whereas the second volume speaks of the events from 1855 to 1870. The cited page numbers are from the original manuscript. For an easy reference the page numbers from the published Chronicles [3rd Edition 2000] are given in brackets.

⁴ A Semitic idiom – *msambaru sabres* cf. Ps. 40:1.

Mt. 7:7 – “Knock and the door will be opened for you”).⁵ In addition, Fr. Chavara would have been seeking the ways for the fulfillment of his dream. Thus, two factors are stressed in his statement, his intense desire and uninterrupted prayer for a women religious community. These two elements should serve as the basis of every spiritual movement. The founders of religious Congregations are gifted with these two fundamental gifts, earnest desire and incessant prayer. They are the authentic traits, which should be consuming the heart of a genuine founder. In this sense, Fr. Chavara has a very important role in the foundation of the first indigenous Congregation for women in Kerala. We do not have any documents which explicitly state about these two inner yearnings in the case of Fr. Leopold and mother Eliswa. In the *Chronicles of Koonammavu Convent*⁶, it is said that Fr. Leopold consulted the Lord:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ആ ദൈഹം ദൈവത്തോടും അപേക്ഷി ക്കയാൽ സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ തന്നെ ഒരു വഴി ആ ദൈഹത്തിന്റെ ഹൃദയത്തിൽ തോന്നി ച്ചു... (CKC I, 4).</p> | <p>He prayed to God and God Himself showed a way in his heart...</p> |

⁵His words while referring to the earnest desire of the other founding fathers of Men TOCD and that of Msgr. Maurelius Stabilini concerning the need for a Men Congregation is equally applicable here. “In accordance with the sayings of our Lord, ‘where two or three are gathered in my name, there am I in the midst of them’ and ‘ask and you shall receive’ ... so too like the parched land after a rain becomes delighted ... who seek the face of the Lord...” (.....എന്റെ നാമത്തിൽ യിരുപെരു മുവരു കൂടപ്പെട്ടുയെന്നയിവിടെ നിങ്ങളുടെയിടയിൽ ഞാനെന്നും ചോദിച്ചിൻ നിങ്ങൾക്കു കിട്ടപ്പെടും എന്നിങ്ങനെയുള്ള നമ്മുടെ കർത്താവിന്റെ അരുളപ്പാടിനു തക്കതിൻവണ്ണം ... ദാഹിക്കപ്പെട്ട ഭൂമി മഴ വരുഷത്താൽ തെളിയുംവണ്ണവും... തെളിഞ്ഞ തമ്പുരാന്റെ മുഖമവേഷിക്കുന്നവരും....: CMM I, 19 [3]).

⁶Hereafter, the *Chronicles* will be referred as CKC with volume Number.

It took place only after mother Eliswa opened her heart to Fr. Leopold, revealing that she wanted to remain in the state of widowhood and entrusting herself and her daughter in the hands of the Missionary:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഞങ്ങൾ ഇരുവർക്കും ഈ കന്നി സുഖത്തോടെ അതായത് വൈധവ്യം എന്ന കന്നിത്വത്തിൽ ഏലിശായും ബ്രഹ്മശാരിതം എന്ന തികയപ്പെട്ട കന്നിസുഖത്തിൽ അന്നയും മരണത്തോളം ജീവിപ്പാൻ നിശ്ചയിച്ചിരിക്കയാൽ ഞങ്ങളെയിരുവരെയും അച്ചനെ ഏല്പിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നും ഏലിശാ മുപ്പച്ചനെ ബോധിപ്പിച്ചിരിക്കയാൽ ആ ദൈഹവും ആ അപെക്ഷ കൈക്കൊണ്ട്...(CKC I, 3).</p> | <p>Eliswa informed Mooppachan ‘both of us decided to live a life of chastity till death’ – Eliswa, chastity according to that of a widow and Anna the perfect chastity of virginity – and ‘entrust both of us completely to you.’ So he on his part accepted their request...</p> |

Thus, the idea of a convent for them came to the mind of Fr. Leopold only after this event, while Fr. Chavara was for a long time earnestly desiring and zealously praying for the realization of a religious community for women in Kerala.

The expression ‘for a long time’ (ഏറിയകാലം മുതലായി) demands explication. It does not denote a short duration, but a wide period. For example, see his expression, “in this Land of Malayalam, where the true Christian religion was in practice right from a *long time*, there had not been existed monasteries and convents...” (ഏറിയനാൾ മുനിനാലെ സത്യവേദം നടന്നു വരുന്ന ഈ മലയാളത്തിൽ കൊവേന്തകളും കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടാകാതെയും...).⁷ He gives equal importance to both men and women Congregations. It may indicate that Fr. Chavara was nourishing this yearning from the very beginning of the foundation of men Congregation at

⁷CKC 1, 1. The seed of Christianity was sowed in the land of Malayalam from the time of Apostle Thomas in India (AD 52).

Mannanam in 1831 and even perhaps at the celebration of his first Holy Mass on 29th November 1829, which he offered for the special intention of the actualization of the desire for a men Congregation in Kerala.⁸ Can Archbishop Bernardine, Fr. Leopold and mother Eliswa make such a claim?

Fr. Chavara in his humility states in a very modest way how God came down to hearken his prayer and to fulfill his earnest desire: “It seems that God has willed to accomplish now, the matter of a convent for nuns” (കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠം എന്നുള്ള കാര്യം ദൈവം ഈ കാലത്തിൽ നടത്തുവാൻ തിരുമനസായിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നു തോന്നുന്നു).⁹ This statement discloses the authentic attitude of a saintly person who confesses how God was most willing to realize the yearning of his own.

Fr. Leopold in his *Short Biography of Chavara* written in 1871 also refers to the earnest desire of Fr. Chavara for starting a convent for women:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| മലയാളത്തിലെ പെൺപെതങ്ങൾക്കു ഒരു പുണ്യ സങ്കേതവും വേദകാര്യങ്ങളെ പഠിക്കുന്നതിനും നല്ല ക്രിസ്ത്യാനി പൈതങ്ങളായിട്ടു വളരുന്നതിനും ഒരു കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠം ഉണ്ടാക്കണമെന്ന് എത്രയും ആഗ്രഹമായി... ¹⁰ | He was so longed to establish for the girls of Malayalam an abode of virtues and a convent for learning religious matters and growing as good Christian children.... |

He was not merely yearning for a women Congregation but was trying his best to fulfill his desire: ‘to establish’ (ഉണ്ടാക്കണമെന്ന്). Thus Fr. Chavara was not merely an onlooker in the process of foundation. But the one who took

⁸ Cf. *CMM* I, 65 [25].

⁹ *CMM* II, 72 [124].

¹⁰ Leopold Beccaro, *Short Biography of Chavara*, 1871, reprinted in *Compunction of the Soul* (Mannanam, Published by the Postulator, 1959), XVII.

active steps for the realization of that dream. Fr. Leopold continues to give stress on the ardent efforts of Fr. Chavara in establishing the convent. The missionary says that it is impossible to do justice to describe in few words his strenuous endeavors:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ആയതിന് സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ തമ്പുരാൻ തിരുമനസ്സായപ്പോൾ അതിനെ നിറവെറ്റുന്നതിന്നു എത്രയൊ പ്രയത്നം ചെയ്തുവെന്നു ഈ ചുരുങ്ങിയ വിവരണത്തിന് അടങ്ങുന്ന കാര്യമല്ല.¹¹</p> | <p>It cannot be explained in this short description the efforts that he had taken to fulfill that (establishment of the convent), when God willed for that.</p> |

1.1.1.2. An Aching Heart

1.1.1.2.1. Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ഏറിയനാൾ മുൻപിനാലെ സത്യവേദം നടന്നു വരുന്ന ഈ മലയാളത്തിൽ കൊവേന്തകളും കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടാകാതെയും ഈ പുണ്യങ്ങളുടെ കേൾവിയല്ലാതെ ഒരു നല്ല പുണ്യ കണ്ടു പഠിത്തവും കൂടാതെയും ആൺ വർഗ്ഗക്കാർക്ക് പട്ടസുഖം എന്നതി നാൽ കന്നിസുഖക്കാരാകുന്നു എന്നല്ലാതെ സ്ത്രീ വർഗ്ഗത്തിന് വിവാഹം കൈക്കൊണ്ട് സംസാരികൾ ആക എന്നല്ലാതെ കന്നിത്വം കാത്തിരിപ്പാൻ മനസ്സുള്ളവരുണ്ടായാലും ആയതിന് ഒരു പോംവഴിയും നൂവാഹം</p> | <p>In this Land of Malayalam, where the true Christian religion was in practice right from a long time, there had not been existed monasteries and convents; without the hearing of these virtues, there was no living examples of it; men, who had the privilege of priesthood, lived a chaste life. However, for women even though they desired to</p> |

¹¹*Ibid.* Parappuram Varkey in his *Diary* refers to the words of Fr. Leopold who shared with certain diocesan clergy after the funeral of Fr. Chavara about the vital role played by the deceased in establishing the women Congregation: “Fr. Leopold also shared their feelings and extolled the good things the deceased had done. He specially recollected that it was because of him [Fr. Chavara] that the convent was established there.” (Varkey Parappuram, *Chronicles of Koonammavu Monastery* [also called *Diary of Varkey Parappuram*] [Manuscript], 1424 (CMC Archives, Mount Carmel Generalate, Aluva). Here after this Archives will be abbreviated as ACMCG.

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>കൂടാതെ ഈ ദുഃഖത്തിൽത്തന്നെ ദീർഘകാലമായി നടന്നു വരികയിൽ.... (CKC I, 1).</p> | <p>lead a chaste life, there was no way and possibility for it except accepting marriage and live as lay people</p> |
|---|--|

1.1.1.2.2. Comments

Although the land of Kerala was blessed by a Christian community from early days, there did not exist, monasteries and convents, which would have rendered the Christians heroic witness and living models of Christian perfection. The faithful as well as priests only have heard about such virtuous life in other countries. The secular clergy were blessed with priesthood along with celibate life. Pitiableness was the situation of the women folk in Kerala. All were forced to lead a family life, even though many of them wanted to embrace a consecrated life of chastity and prayer. Fr. Chavara looked at this situation as wretched, miserable and sorrowful. It seems that the noble soul was giving articulation to his heartfelt and inner grief since he could not immediately find a way to solve the problem. His craving for a convent is also evident in phrases like:

- a. “There had not been existed monasteries and convents” (കൊവെന്തുകളും കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടാകാതെയും).
- b. “Even though there were people who desired to lead a chaste life” (കന്നിത്വം കാത്തിരിപ്പാൻ മനസ്സുള്ളവരുണ്ടായാലും).

As far as the second phrase is concerned – “Even though there were people who desired to lead a chaste life” – he feels intense pain at the non-realization of the desires of the heart of many women to consecrate themselves as virgins for Christ.

1.1.1.3. Failed Attempts

According to some sources, there was an attempt of constructing a convent at Alangadu in 1859 for the first time.¹² Concerning the building of the convent at Puthenpally, we have three documents, namely *CKC*, Letter of Msgr. Bernardine and *Alochanapusthakam*.

1.1.1.3.1. Text in *CKC*

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>...ദൈവകൃപയാൽ മെലെഴുതിയ ഈ ദെഹം തന്നെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മഠം ഉണ്ടാക്കണമെന്നും നിശ്ചയിച്ച് 1860-ൽ വരാപ്പുഴെ പുത്തൻ പള്ളിയുടെ കുരിശിനു കിഴക്കു പുറത്തുള്ള പറമ്പിൽ ഇതിനടി സ്ഥാനവും ഇട്ട ഏറിയ ദ്രവ്യം ചിലവു ചെയ്ത 5 3/4 കൊൽ പൊക്കത്തിൽ നാലുവശവും മതിൽ കെട്ടി പൊക്കി വരികയിൽ ബാവെലിൽ നിന്നു ശുദ്ധ സിംഹാസനത്തിലെ കല്പനക്ക് വിരോധ</p> | <p>By the grace of God, the above-mentioned Vicar Apostolic himself deciding to establish a convent for women, in 1860 in the land to the east of the cross of Puthenpally church at Verapoly, the foundation was laid and spending much amount a compound wall of height 5 3/4 kol was being constructed all around. At that time, a Syrian bishop from Babel came against the command</p> |

¹²“Both priests and people were happy and satisfied about it. The land for it was thought of in different places. The place at Alangadu where the Kunnel church is being situated was also thought of. At that time, the Vicar Apostolic of Trichnappilly V. Rev. Msgr. Cannus reached in Verapoly. When it was consulted with him, he suggested that without being very far away, it should be near to this place.” (...ആയതിന്മേൽ പട്ടക്കാർക്കും ജനങ്ങൾക്കും പൊതുവെ സന്തോഷവും തൃപ്തിയുമായിരുന്നു. ഇതിനുള്ള ഇടത്തെ സംബന്ധിച്ച് പലയിടത്ത് ആലോചിച്ചുനോക്കി. ആലങ്ങാട് കുന്നേൽ പള്ളി ഇരിക്കുന്ന സ്ഥലവും നോക്കിക്കണ്ടു. ഇങ്ങനെയിരിക്കയിൽ തൃശ്ശിനാപ്പള്ളി വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കായ അതിപ്രബലൻ കാന്യസ് മെത്രാന്മാൻ വരാപ്പുഴ വരുന്നതിന് ഇടയായി. ടി. വിഷയത്തെക്കുറിച്ച് അദ്ദേഹമായിട്ട് ആലോചിച്ചപ്പോൾ കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മഠസ്ഥാപനം അധികം ദുരന്താകണ്ട ഇതിന് ഒട്ടു സമീപമുള്ള ഒരു സ്ഥലത്ത് വേണ്ടിയതാണ് എന്നാലോചന കൊടുത്തു) Varkey Parappuram, *Chronicles*, 656-657.

However, it did not materialize. It seems that the main obstacle was the distance either from Koonammavu since Fr. Parappuram was writing his *Chronicles* from Koonammavu monastery or it can be from Verapoly because the bishop was talking about it while he was at Verapoly. From both of these places it was very difficult to meet the spiritual needs of the sisters in the proposed site.

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>മായി സുറിയാനി മെത്രാൻ വരികയും അപ്പൊൾ സുറിയാനി പള്ളിക്കാർ മിക്കതും പൊലെ ഇതിൽ ഉൾപ്പെടുകയും ഈ കലക്കം നിമിത്തം വീണ്ടും ഈ കാര്യം മുടങ്ങി വീഴുകയും ദൈവ കൃപയാൽ ആ വഴക്കുകൾ തീർന്നുവന്നപ്പോൾ നല്ല പട്ടക്കാരില്ലായ്മകയാലുള്ള ആത്മനാശം കണ്ട് കന്യാസ്ത്രീമരം ആയതു മാറ്റി സെമിനാരി എന്ന് നിശ്ചയിച്ചു അപ്രകാരം പഠിത്തശാല ആക്കിയതിനാൽ ഞങ്ങൾക്കുണ്ടായിരുന്ന ശരണവും കെട്ടു മുൻപിലത്തെ പോലെയുള്ള ദുഃഖാവസ്ഥയിൽ ജീവിച്ചു വരുമ്പോൾ... (CKK I, 1-2).</p> | <p>of the Holy See and most of the Syrian churches fell into it. Because of the turmoil created, the construction of the convent was stopped once again and by God's grace when the strife was ceased seeing the destruction of souls for want of good priests, the decision was taken to change the convent into a seminary; thus it was made a study house. Therefore, we have lost every hope and were constrained to live in the former state of grief.</p> |
|---|---|

Concerning the second attempt to build a convent at Puthenppally, based on the above-mentioned text, the following points deserve our attention.

1. Archbishop Bernardine decided¹³ to construct a convent. He laid the foundations, spent a lot of money and built surrounding walls.
2. At that juncture, he could not proceed because of the Roccas Schism that seems to tear the Malabar Church asunder. This experience convinced the ecclesiastical authorities the urgent need for giving a proper pastoral training for the priestly candidates. Hence, the plan for the convent was converted into seminary.
3. Fr. Chavara thus interprets this situation: “We have lost every hope and were constrained to live in the former state of grief” (ഞങ്ങൾക്കുണ്ടായിരുന്ന ശരണവും കെട്ടു മുൻപിലത്തെപ്പോലെയുള്ള ദുഃഖാവസ്ഥയിൽ ജീവിച്ചുവരുമ്പോൾ...).

¹³Here the term ‘decided’ is notable. As the ecclesiastical authority, he had to make the decision.

Bernardine) was actively involved in the attempt to found the religious community for women. Both of them have lost every hope.¹⁴ He was forced to return to the former grievous and pathetic state. Fr. Chavara tried to hide his personal and intimate feeling of desperation under the term *we*. This means, the starting of a convent was a matter most dear to his heart. It remained a thing that escapes realization until then. “The matter that of the convent, which was not realized” (നടക്കാതെ കിടന്നതുമായ ഒരു കാര്യം ആയ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠം എന്നുള്ള കാര്യം...)¹⁵ Do not these words come out of a heart of a person who had identified himself with the success of realizing the plan for the religious life for women in Kerala?

1.1.1.3.2. Letter of Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>...Gia in fatti si sono gettate le fondazione di questo monastero per terziari carmelitane incaricate dell’educazione di queste povere bambine Indiane... mentre i quatro conventi per i Terziari sono gia alquanto avenzanti, e questo delle Terziare e appena cominciato, ...tante giovinette ...volgono lo sguardo a queste fondazione, ..., ma ne io, ne loro sappiamo quanto</p> | <p>...Already has laid the foundation of this convent for the Third Order of Carmelites (women) for taking care of the education of this poor Indian girls...while the four convents for the Tertiary (men) are already somewhat advanced, and of women Tertiary which just started...many youngsters ...long to see this foundation, ..., but neither I, nor they do not know when will it take place....The only consolation</p> |

¹⁴Malayalam word ശരണം (*sharanam*) is stronger than hope. It may indicate trust, confidence and enthusiasm.

¹⁵Also, Fr. Chavara writes about it: “Again, while there was no other way to realize it.” (...വീണ്ടും ഇത് നടപ്പാൽ യാതൊരു വഴിയുംയില്ലാതിരിക്കയിൽ...): *CMM* II, 73 [124].

| | |
|---|---|
| cio potra avvenire. ...qui a loro resta solo per consolarle la speranza che la compassione di coloro a qui ricorro, faccia crescere questo unico monastero iniziato, disposto a contenerne 33, in onore dei 33 anni che visse tra noi il nostro Salvatore Gesu... ¹⁶ | rests for them is the hope that the compassion of those to whom we approach will make to grow this already started unique monastery, intended to accommodate 33 members, in honour of the 33 years that our Saviour Jesus lived among us... |
|---|---|

Even though there is no explicit mentioning of the place at Puthenppally, from the context it is clear that he was mentioning about the attempt at Puthenppally. The date of the letter – 29th June 1860 – also supports this argument. In the letter, Msgr. Baccinelli refers to the already established monasteries of the Men TOCD and then comes the explanation regarding the convent under construction. In both these cases, he does not mention about the persons who took initiatives in the establishment of those monasteries and convent. Nevertheless, from the aforementioned words of Fr. Chavara in *CKC* we can perceive his involvement in this endeavour.¹⁷ So too, if there is no close relationship between the attempt at Puthenppally and the realization at Koonammavu, why did Fr. Chavara give an account of the Puthenppally event before mentioning the establishment of *panambumadam* in the chronicles of Koonammavu convent?

¹⁶Bernardine Baccinelli, *Letter to the Superiors of Men and Women OCD* in Rome, 29th June 1860, 3-4. Its copy is kept in CMC Archives, Aluva.

¹⁷It is evident from the letters sent by the Syrians to the Propaganda Fide during the time of the division of the convent at Koonammavu in 1890. See for details Chapter V, No. 5.2.2.3.

1.1.1.3.3. Text in *Alochanapusthakam*¹⁸

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>...ഈ ദിവസങ്ങളിൽത്തന്നെ ഈ മലയാളത്തിൽ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠം ഇല്ലായ്കയാൽ ആയതുംകൂടെ നടത്തണമെന്നും പെ.പെ.ബ. മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താ അച്ചനും ശേഷം പിതാക്കളും ആഗ്രഹിച്ചു ആയതിനു പണി തുടങ്ങി നടന്നു വരുമ്പോൾ നല്ല പട്ടക്കാരുടെ ദിഷ്ടതി അതിലും വലുതായി കാണുകകൊണ്ട് ആയത് സെമിനാരിയാക്കേണ്ടുന്നതിനായിട്ട് നിശ്ചയിച്ചതിനാൽ ഈ അപേക്ഷ ദീർഘമായിട്ടും....¹⁹</p> | <p>....During these days itself, since there was no convent for nuns in this Malayalam, V. Rev. Vicar Apostolic and other fathers desired to start that too. However, while its works were being going on, thinking that the need for good priests was more important than a convent, decided to make it a seminary. Therefore, this petition (desire) was prolonged...</p> |

According to *Alochanapusthakam*, this has been written on 3rd *Kumbam* (February) 1866 as an introduction to the narration of the establishment of the convent at Koonammavu. The phrase “Archbishop and rest of the fathers” (മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താ അച്ചനും ശേഷം പിതാക്കളും) recalls our special attention. Who are this “rest of the fathers”? In *Alochanapusthakam* the term ‘father(s)’ (പിതാക്കൾ) includes Fr. Chavara and others. See for example:

- a. “For these sisters, fathers and brethren bought donations from different people...” (ഈ സഹോദരികൾക്കുവേണ്ടി പിതാക്കളും കുടപ്പിറപ്പുകളും²⁰ പലരിൽ

¹⁸The content of this manuscript, *Alochanapusthakam*, is the counsels that took place in Mannanam monastery from 1864 to 1871 and other special events of that time. Its copy is kept in both CMI Archives, Kakkanad and CMC Archives, Aluva.

¹⁹*Alochanapusthakam*, 95.

²⁰ The term *Koodappirappikal* (siblings) in *Alochanapusthakam* are none other than the fathers of Men TOCD.

നിന്നും ധർമ്മം വാങ്ങിച്ച്...).²¹ Both the Chronicles CMM & CKC give detailed account that it was Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara who took the pain mainly to collect these donations.

- b. “The disciple of the deceased father and our second prior V. Rev. Fr. Kuriakose Elisha” (കാലം ചെയ്ത ഈ പിതാവിന്റെ ശിഷ്യനും നമ്മുടെ രണ്ടാം പ്രിയോരുമായ ഐ. ബി. കുര്യാക്കോസ് ഏലീശാച്ചന്റേ).²² Here it is clear that the term ‘father’ is referred to Fr. Chavara.

Thus, no one can deny the involvement of Fr. Chavara in the attempt at Puthenpally. One has to keep in mind that this attempt at Puthenpally took place in 1859 and at that time Fr. Leopold as a deacon had not yet arrived in Kerala. So too the phrase “this prayer prolonged...” (ഈ അപേക്ഷ ദീർഘമായിട്ടും) is noteworthy.

1.1.1.4. A Desire Fulfilled

The divine providence brought into fruition this long cherished yearning of Fr. Chavara through the instrumentality of Fr. Leopold. This Italian Missionary came to India as a sub deacon at the age of 22 in December 1859;²³ within a year, he was ordained and made the parish priest of Koonammavu church as well as the Provincial Delegate. He intimately loved Fr. Chavara.²⁴

²¹Alochanapusthakam, 97.

²²Alochanapusthakam, 66.

²³There existed a big difference of age 32 between the Indian Religious and Moopachan.

²⁴Thus he recorded in his diary at the day of the demise of Fr. Chavara: *che lo amavo quanto me stesso* (“How I loved him as I have loved myself”). Leopold, *Diary* vol. 3, 25, ACMCG.

1.1.2. Role of Fr. Leopold

This long cherished aspiration of Fr. Chavara, as said above, came into fruition with the help of Fr. Leopold who intimately loved Fr. Chavara.²⁵

1.1.2.1. His Role According to CKC

1.1.2.1.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ഇപ്പോൾ ഞങ്ങൾക്കു ദലഗാദായിരിക്കുന്ന എത്രയും പെ. ബ. ലെയോപ്പോൾദ് മരിയ ദെ സം ജൂസെ എന്ന മുപ്പച്ചൻ ചെയ്ത വെലയാലും സഹായത്താലും ഇതിനിടയായി. ഇതിനെ വിചാരിക്കുംപൊൾ സർവേശ്വരൻ ഈ സന്യാസിമാങ്ങളും കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാങ്ങളും നടത്തുവാനായിട്ടു തന്നെ ഈ ദൈവത്തെ യാത്രയാക്കി എന്ന് വിചാരിപ്പാൻ ഇടയുണ്ട്. അതെന്തെന്നാൽ ഇതിന്നു മുമ്പിൽ ഈ മലയാളത്തിലും മറ്റും മിഷനറിമാരായി വന്ന മുപ്പച്ചന്മാരൊക്കെയും കുർബ്ബാനപട്ടം ഏറ്റതിന്റെ ശേഷം അത്രെ എരൊപ്പായിൽ നിന്ന് വരുന്നത്. എന്നാൽ ഈ ദൈവം അഞ്ചാം പട്ടം ഏറ്റശേഷം തന്നെ 1859 ധനു മാസത്തിൽ ഈ മലയാളത്തിൽ വന്നു.²⁶</p> | <p>... Our present Delegate V. Rev. Leopold Maria of St. Joseph Moopachan's assistance and work brought this into existence. When we think about it, the Almighty has sent of this person solely for the purpose of running these monasteries and convents, because all other <i>Moopachanmar</i> who came to this Malayalam (Kerala) as Missionaries started from Europe only after their ordination. However, this person (Leopold) came to this Malayalam in the month of December 1859 after receiving</p> |

²⁵The love between the Italian Missionary and the Indian Religious may be compared to the love between Jonathan, the Prince and David, a shepherded boy (cf. 1Sam. 18: 3; He loved him as himself).

²⁶Ignatius Gonzales, chief editor *Jeevanatham* in his presentation (*അവതാരിക*) to the book *Pradhama Taddesiya Sanyasini Samooham Stapaka* of Sr. Dr. Sucy Kinattungal CTC, states that Fr. Chavara has committed a mistake in saying that ...ഇതിന്നു മുമ്പിൽ ഈ മലയാളത്തിലും മറ്റും മിഷനറിമാരായി വന്ന മുപ്പച്ചന്മാരൊക്കെയും കുർബ്ബാനപട്ടം ഏറ്റതിന്റെ ശേഷം അത്രെ എരൊപ്പായിൽ നിന്ന് വരുന്നത്. എന്നാൽ ഈ ദൈവം അഞ്ചാം പട്ടം ഏറ്റശേഷം തന്നെ 1859 ധനു മാസത്തിൽ ഈ മലയാളത്തിൽ വന്നു. (“... all other *Moopachanmar* who came to this Malayalam (Kerala) as

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>എന്നാൽ ഒട്ടും തന്നെ വരാപ്പുഴ താമസിക്കാതെ ഈ കുനമ്മാവു കൊമ്പെന്തയിൽ വന്ന് പാർത്ത് നാലഞ്ചുമാസത്തിനകം മലയാം പെച്ചും പഠിച്ച് കൊമ്പെന്ത കൾക്ക് ഒക്കെയ്ക്കും ദെലഗാറ്റും പുത്തൻസന്യാസികളുടെ ഗുരുവും എന്ന സ്ഥാനത്തിൽ പെബ. മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചൻ കല്പിച്ച അക്കാര്യങ്ങൾ ഒക്കെയും ജാഗ്രതയോടുകൂടെ നടത്തിവരികയിൽ.... (CKC I, 2-3).</p> | <p>sub-diaconate itself. Nevertheless, without staying at all at Varapuzha, he came and lived in the monastery at Koonammavu; learned Malayalam language within 4 or 5 months; and while he was carrying out all the entrusted duties by the Archbishop such as the Provincial Delegate of monasteries, the master of the novices...</p> |
|--|--|

1.1.2.1.2. Comments

The chronicler puts this text, after mentioning the disappointment and lose of hope at the failure of materializing the dream for a convent at Puthenpally.²⁷ Now Fr. Chavara attributes to Fr. Leopold a decisive role in the realization of the dream for a convent. The terminology needs a rigorous interpretation. It was because of the ‘work and help’ of Mooppachan, this took place (erection of the convent). When we consider this it is possible to think that the Almighty has sent (യാത്രയാക്കി) this person in order to *run* these monasteries and convents. Strictly speaking, here Fr. Chavara does not present Fr. Leopold as the founder. Mooppachan has done two things: he *worked* (വെല) and *helped* (സഹായം) for its realization. The Almighty has entrusted him with the role to

Missionaries started from Europe only after their ordination. But this person (Leopold) came to this Malayalam in the month of December 1859 after receiving sub-diaconate itself”). Gonzales points out that Arnos a Jesuit *padhiri* reached Cochin on 1701 November as a seminarian, completed his ecclesiastical studies, and was ordained in 1707. About his evaluation, the following observation can be made. The Jesuits were called then *padhiri* (fathers) while OCD fathers were known as Moopachanmar. In the context, Fr. Chavara was speaking only about *Moopachanmar* and not about *padhirimar*. Hence the statement of the Blessed remains valid.

²⁷ See above No. 1.1.1.3.1. ‘Text in CKC.’

run (നടത്തുവാനായിട്ടുതന്നെ) both men and women religious houses. The chronicler does not *affirm* these facts. However, he merely says *it is possible to think* (വിചാരിപ്പാൻ ഇടയുണ്ട്).

1.1.2.1.3. Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ഞങ്ങളുടെ ഒന്നാമത്തെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി അമ്മയായ ഏലീശാ എന്ന വൈതവിയും അവളുടെ ഏകമകളായ അന്ന എന്ന സഹോദരിയും ഈ കുനമ്മാവ് എടവകയിൽ ചെർന്നു വടക്കൻ എന്ന് സാമാന്യം വിളിച്ചുവരുന്ന വാകയിൽ എന്ന വീട്ടിൽ പാർത്തുവരികയിൽ, പെ.ബ. മുപ്പച്ചനോട് കൂവസാരിച്ചു വന്നതുമല്ലാതെയും ഞങ്ങളിരുവർക്കും ഈ കന്നിസുഖത്തോടെ അതായത് വൈധവം എന്ന കന്നിത്വത്തിൽ ഏലീശായും ബ്രഹ്മശാരിതം എന്നതികയപ്പെട്ട കന്നിസുഖത്തിൽ അന്നയും മരണത്തോളം ജീവിപ്പാൻ നിശ്ചയിച്ചിരിക്കയാൽ ഞങ്ങൾയിരുവരെയും അച്ചനെ ഏല്പിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നും ഏലീശാ മുപ്പച്ചനെ ബോധിപ്പിക്കയാൽ ആദെഹവും ആ അപേക്ഷ കൈക്കൊണ്ടു വേണ്ടിയ ഗുണദോഷങ്ങളും സൽബുദ്ധികളും ചൊല്ലിക്കൊടുക്കുകയും ചെയ്കയും ഇവരുടെ ആഗ്രഹവും അപേക്ഷയും പട്ടാങ്ങയുള്ളതുതന്നെയോ? ആയതല്ലംകിൽ സ്ത്രീകൾക്കടുത്ത എളക്കബുദ്ധിയാൽ തൊന്നി അപേക്ഷിച്ചതോ? എന്നും നിശ്ചയമായി അറിവാൻ തക്കവണ്ണം പലപ്പഴും പലപ്രകാരേണയും മുപ്പച്ചൻ പരീക്ഷിക്കയും അന്നെപരീക്ഷിക്കയും ചെയ്കയും കൂവസാരക്കാരുടെ കടത്തിനും മുറയ്ക്കും തക്കവണ്ണം ആഴ്ചവട്ടത്തിൽ ഒന്നും രണ്ടും കൂർബ്ബാന കൈക്കൊള്ളുവാനും അനുവദിച്ചും നടത്തിവരികയും ഈ കാര്യം നല്ലതൊ എന്നും എങ്ങനെ ഇതിന്നു ഉത്തരിക്കെണ്ടു</p> | <p>Our first mother superior, Eliswa the widow and her only daughter Anna, being the members of Koonammavu parish, were living in Vakayil house commonly known as Vadakken; Eliswa and her daughter Anna were used to make confession to Mooppachan and Eliswa informed Mooppachan ‘ both of us decided to live a life of chastity till death’ – Eliswa, chastity according to that of a widow and Anna the perfect chastity of virginity - and ‘entrust both of us completely to you father.’ Therefore, he on his part accepted their request and directed them giving instructions and corrections. He tested them often in various ways to see whether their desire was genuine or from the wavering nature of women. With the authority and terms of the confessor, he led them by giving permission to receive holy communion once or twice in a week. Is this idea a good one? How to give a reply for it? By what means their chaste life is to be preserved? When asking about</p> |

എന്നും ഏതുപ്രകാരം യിവരുടെ അപേക്ഷയായ കന്നിസുഖം രക്ഷിക്കണമെന്നും എന്നും മറ്റു മുപ്പച്ചന്മാരോടും ഗുണദോഷിക്ക യും അവരും നല്ലത് എന്ന് സാക്ഷിക്കയും ചെയ്ത് വരികയിൽ ആ ദേഹം ദൈവത്തോടും അപേക്ഷിക്കയാൽ സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ തന്നെ ഒരുവഴി ആ ദൈഹത്തിന്റെ ഹൃദയത്തിൽ തോന്നിച്ചു. അതായത്, മേലെഴുതിയവരുടെ ആയിട്ട് ഏതാനും നിലം, പുരയിടങ്ങളും ആയതിനോടുകൂടി ഏതാനും കടങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടെങ്കിലും ആ വക ഒക്കെയും അന്നായുടെ എളയപ്പൻ ആയ നമ്മുടെ പ്രൊക്കുറോരുതൊമ്മൻ എന്നയാൾ അന്വേഷിച്ച് ഇവരുടെ ചിലവും നടത്തി വരികയാൽ അയാൾ ദീനക്കാരനാകയാലും കടങ്ങൾക്ക് അധിക പലിശയാകയാലും ഒടുക്കം എല്ലാം തീർന്ന് കടം ശേഷിപ്പാനും ഇടവരും എന്ന അവസ്ഥയിൽ ആകയാലും ഇപ്പോൾ ആയവനിൽ ഇത് വേർതിരിച്ച് ആ വക പരമ്പിൽ ചെറുതായി ഒരു സ്ഥലം ഉണ്ടാക്കി ആയതിൽ ഇവരെ രണ്ടുപേരെയും കൂടി പാർപ്പിച്ചാൽ അവരുടെ ആത്മ കാര്യങ്ങൾ വെടിപ്പായിട്ടു നടക്കുന്നതുമല്ലാതെ പെൺ പൈതങ്ങളെ നമസ്കാരം മുതലായ പുണ്യങ്ങളും കുസ്തുര മുതലായ കൈവേലകളും പഠിപ്പിക്ക എന്നുള്ള ഒരു വേലയിൽ ഇവരെ ഏർപ്പെടുത്താമെന്നും നിശ്ചയിച്ചു 65-ാം കാലം കന്നി മാസം ഒരു ദിവസത്തിൽ കൊവേതകളുടെ ഒന്നാം പ്രിയോരായ പെ.ബ. കുരിയാക്കോസ് ഏലിയാ എന്നദേഹത്തിനോടും ഈ കാർയ്യം പെ.ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ പറഞ്ഞാറെ ആദേഹത്തിനും ഏറ്റം സന്തോഷവും തെളിവും ആയി. എന്നാൽ കഴിയുന്ന വേലയിതിനു ചെയ്യാമെന്നും ഉത്തരിക്കയാലും മുപ്പച്ചന്റെ ഹൃദയം തെളിഞ്ഞു (CKC I, 3-5).

this to other missionaries, they said it was good. When they said that it is good, he prayed to God to show him the way. Eventually God Himself put an idea into his mind. These women had some land and paddy fields as their own. Some loan had been drawn on the security of this property. Anna's uncle (father's younger brother) Thomman managed them and provided for their living. Thomman was also the procurator of the monastery. He was a sickly person. The interest on the loan was mounting up and reaching a point when they would not only lose the land but also run into debt. So it was decided to take this property from him and to make a small house in it. Then both of them could be made to live there, so that they could besides living a smooth and peaceful spiritual life, be engaged in the work of teaching young girls prayers and other virtuous practices, and handicrafts like needlework etc. One day in September 1865, Mooppachan told about it to V. Rev. Fr. Kuriakose Elias Chavara, the first Prior of the monasteries. He was very much pleased with it and promised to do all he could for it. So Mooppachan became very happy and confident at heart.

The comment on *Text Two* will be given in No. 1.1.2.2.2 A *Comparative Study between CKC and CMM*.²⁸

1.1.2.2. His Role According to CMM

1.1.2.2.1. Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>ഈ 1865-ൽ നമ്മുടെ ദൈവാലയത്തായ പെ.ബ. ലെയാപ്പോൾദ് മര്യ മുപ്പച്ചൻ ഒരു ദിവസം 4 മണിക്ക് എന്തെ വിളിച്ച് പുറത്ത് നടപ്പാനായിട്ട് നമ്മുടെ കുന്മാവ് കൊവേന്തയുടെ പടികടന്ന് വടക്കോട്ടു തിരിഞ്ഞുനടന്ന് ആ ചെറിയ നശിച്ച പെക്കൊയി വരേ നടന്നുകൊണ്ട് പറഞ്ഞതായിത്: ഇവിടെ ഒരു വധവധു 14 പ്രായമുള്ള ഒരു മകളുമുണ്ട്. ആ പെൺപൈതലിന്റെ അപ്പന്റെ പകുതിയ്ക്കുള്ള വസ്തുക്കളുമുണ്ട്. അവൾക്ക് കെട്ടിപ്പാൻ മനസ്സുമില്ല. ആയതുകൊണ്ട് ഈ അമ്മയെയും മകളെയും കൂടെ അവരു പാർത്തുവരുന്ന തറവാട്ടിൽ നിന്നും മാറ്റി അവരുടെ പറമ്പുകളിൽ ഒന്നിൽ തന്നെ ഒരു സ്ഥലമുണ്ടാക്കിയിവരേ രണ്ടുപേരെയും കൂടെ അതിൽ പാർപ്പിച്ച് മറ്റുള്ള പെൺപൈതലങ്ങളെ നല്ല പഠനമായ പുണ്യ</p> | <p>One evening in 1865 our Delegate V. Rev. Leopold Maria Moopachan, took me for a walk; we went out of the gate of our monastery at Koonammavu and were walking northwards. As we approached the small crumbling mound, he told me: here there is a widow and her 14-year-old daughter and have half of the properties of her father. The girl does not want to get married. Therefore, the mother and the daughter can be shifted from their existing house and made to settle down in another house constructed in one of their</p> |

²⁸The readers should not forget that this part of the chronicles was written by Fr. Chavara himself, although he speaks in the name of sisters using “Our first mother Superior” (ഞങ്ങളുടെ ഒന്നാമത്തെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി അമ്മയായ). Another fact deserves our attention. The details concerning the foundation of the Women TOCD were recorded in *CMM* in 1865 itself, while *CKC* was written down only in 1866, after the establishment of the bamboo mat convent. Although the same person was the chronicler, the facts mentioned in *CKC* were penned from his recollections after a few months. Thus, more historical importance has to be given to *CMM*. This should be taken into consideration when we evaluate both the documents. In case of actual discrepancies, the problem should be solved in the light of *CMM* the contemporary document.

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>ങ്ങളും കൈവേലകളും പഠിപ്പിക്കുന്ന ഒരു പ്രകാരം കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കടുത്ത വേലയിൽ ഇവ രെ ആക്കി നടത്തിയാൽ കൊള്ളാമൊ? എന്തുതോന്നുന്നു. ‘ആയത് എത്രയും നല്ലത് എന്ന് തോന്നുന്നു എന്ന് ഞാനും ഉത്തരിച്ചു.’ എന്നാൽ ഇതിനു തുടങ്ങുമ്പോൾ അവരുടെ അവകാശികളായ മറ്റവർക്ക് തെളികയില്ല എന്നും മറ്റും പല വിഘ്നങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടാകുമായിരിക്കും എന്ന് കൽപിച്ചു... (CMM II, 73 [124-125]).</p> | <p>own properties and engage them in the works proper to nuns; i.e., teaching other girls the practice of virtues and training them in some handicrafts Is it all right? What do you feel, asked. It seems to be a good idea, I answered. However, when begins for it, their relatives would not be pleased with it and may create obstructions, (he) said...</p> |
|---|---|

1.1.2.2.2. A Comparative Study between CKC and CMM

- The first 16 pages and pages 200-201 of CKC, which record the beginnings of the Women TOCD and the whole CMM are written by Fr. Chavara.
- Concerning the former document, we have the following evidences about his authorship. These pages are written in the same blue ink and handwriting.
 - a. On the first page of CKC there is a note written by pencil which reads thus: ഇതിൽ ഒന്നാം ഭാഗം ക. ദി. മൂ സ. പ്രി. ആ. കുര്യാക്കോസച്ചന്റെ കൈപ്പട ശേഷം ലത്തീൻ അന്നയുടെയും ശേഷം സഹോദരികളുടെ യുമാണ്. സാക്ഷി (ഒപ്പ്). (“In it, first part, the handwriting of Fr. Kuriakose Elia the Prior of the TOCD, then that of Latin Sr. Anna and other part that of sisters. Witness [signature]”).
 - b. On the right side of the margin of page 3 is thus written: ഒന്നാം പ്രിയൊർ ജനറൽ കുര്യാക്കോസ് ഏലി യാസച്ചന്റെ സ്വന്തം കൈപ്പട (“the own handwriting of Fr. Kuriakose Elias the first Prior General”).

- On page 200, there is the signature of Fr. Chavara in Syriac. The first part of page 201 has the same handwriting.²⁹
- Although pages 1-16 are written by Fr. Chavara, he uses the style as if one of the sisters was recording the events.

An objective evaluation of these two texts should take into account certain facts. The apparent discrepancies in *CKC* and *CMM* have to be evaluated. According to *CMM*, there is no mention of the decision of widow Eliswa to *lead a chaste life*.

- *CMM* only refers to the desire of Anna not to get married. In *CKC* widow Eliswa explicitly says their desire to lead a chaste life until death.
- According to *CKC*, Fr. Leopold had first consulted other missionary fathers, prayed and the Lord inspired him what to do. However, *CMM* does not mention anything about the consultation with missionaries before he opened his heart to Fr. Chavara. The *CMM* states that only after the discussion with Fr. Chavara, Fr. Leopold pondered over the issue and prayed to the Lord. When he wrote *CKC* in the name of the sisters, he gave more importance to the person of the Provincial Delegate, the immediate superior of the convent. In his humility, Fr. Chavara wanted to assume only a secondary role.³⁰

²⁹Cf. *AUSW*, 101-102.

³⁰It is significant to note his addressing of himself like: ‘കുറയപ്പെട്ടവൻ’ (humble): “ബഹുമാനപ്പെട്ട ഞങ്ങളുടെ പള്ളിപ്പുറത്തെ പാലയ്ക്കൽ തോമായെന്ന പേരു വിളിക്കപ്പെട്ട മൽപാനച്ചനോടു കൂടെ പഠിച്ചതിൽ ഒരുത്തൻ കുറയപ്പെട്ടവൻ ചാവറ കുര്യാക്കോസ് കത്തനാർ എഴുതിയത്” (written by Fr. Kuriakose Elias Chavara, a *humble* one who is studied under Rev. Fr. Thomas Palackal, our Malpan) (*CMM* I, 15 [1]); ‘ഭോഷൻ’

- One thing deserves our attention in studying the text in *CKC*. Fr. Leopold did not speak about starting a religious community of canonical status. Rather he only intimated the missionaries about the desire of the widow and her daughter and asked them what to do in order to protect their chaste life. His confreres subscribed to his idea. *നല്ലത് എന്ന് സാക്ഷിക്കയും ചെയ്തു* ('said it was good'). But they did not involve themselves as such in its accomplishment nor contributed to its evolution by their own ideas. Only after such a consultation, prayerful reflection and making a plan Fr. Leopold spoke about it to Fr. Chavara the first Prior of the monasteries of men religious in Kerala.
- The reaction of Fr. Chavara when he heard about the plan of Fr. Leopold: "it was much pleasing to him and he was brightened" (*അദ്ദേഹത്തിനു ഏറ്റം സന്തോഷവും തെളിവു ആയി*). It means that Fr. Chavara felt great joy and his countenance was brightened.

One may wonder why Fr. Chavara has exhibited such a great delight at this news, while the other missionaries are said to have merely consented to the suggestion of Fr. Leopold. It is very logical to interpret such a great joy in the light of our observations in No. 1.1.1.1. *A Zealous Yearning for a Convent*. It implied that Fr. Chavara was still burning with the zealous

(fool): *ഭോഷനായ* എനിക്കു രണ്ടും സന്തോഷം – ഒരുപോലെ തോന്നിയിരുന്നു (for me, a *fool*, both were happy and felt as alike (*CMM I*, 71 [31]); 'വകതിരിവില്ലാത്തവൻ' (senseless): *അയാൾ കൂദാശയും മറ്റും അറിയുന്നവനാകുന്നു എന്ന എന്റെ ഈ വകതിരിവില്ലാത്ത ഉത്തരം കേട്ടപ്പോൾ* (when [bishop] heard my *senseless* answer that he knows the administration of the sacraments...) *CMM I*, 70 [30]) etc.

desire for a religious institute for women. We can compare it with the joy of the Magi in Mt. 2: 10: “when they saw the star, they were overjoyed.” Then, promptly he volunteered himself to do what was necessary for realizing the plan. എന്നാൽ കഴിയുന്ന വെലയിതിന് ചെയ്യാമെന്നും ഉത്തരിക്കയാലും മുപ്പച്ചന്റെ ഹൃദയം തെളിഞ്ഞു. He was very much pleased with it and promised to do his best for the realization of the idea. So Mooppachan became very happy and confident. The reason for the happiness and confidence of Mooppachan seems that he might have some doubts at heart namely if he goes ahead with the idea of foundation, a widow and her daughter as its members, can it become a success? Will the Vicar Apostolic give permission for that? The past experience of Msgr. Bernardine to begin a monastery for the Latin men religious in 1857 at Koonammavu was a failure.³¹ In addition, that fact would have discouraged him to get involved in a new venture.

³¹CMM thus speaks about this failure: “On 15th August 1857, when Rev. Fr. Prior went to preach the sermon for the feast at Pallippuram (he was informed) that even though by the order of V. Rev. Bishop, Koonammavu has been made as monastery for the Latin priests and Clerics, except one, all others left due to their own reason. Since V. Rev. Bishop is sad about it, (he) said that, if the place is appropriate for the Monastery in accordance with your Rule, permission is granted you to establish as your own monastery ... From that time onwards Koonammavu became our monastery...” (57-ാംകാലം ചിങ്ങമാസം 15-ാംനു ബ. പ്രിയോർ പള്ളിപ്പുറത്ത പെരുന്നാൾ പഠാർത്ഥയ്ക്കു പൊയപ്പോൾ പെ. ബ. മെത്രാപ്പാലന്റെ കല്പനപ്രകാരം കുനമ്മാവുകൾ കൊവേന്തയായി നിയമിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നുവെന്നും ആയതിൽ ഉത്തീൻ പട്ടക്കാരെയും ഒക്ടറിമാരെയും തെരഞ്ഞെടുത്ത് അവർക്കായിട്ട് തുടങ്ങിയാറെ ഇനി ഒരാൾ അല്ലാതെ ശേഷമുള്ളവർ ഒരോ മുടക്കാൽ പൊയിരിക്കയാൽ പെ. ബ. അച്ചന്റേ മനസ്സുകൊടായിരിക്കുകൊണ്ട് നിങ്ങൾക്കുള്ള റെഗുലയിൽ കൊവേന്തയ്ക്കു തക്ക സ്ഥലം തരപ്പെടുമെങ്കിൽ വേർവിട്ട് കൊവേന്ത സ്ഥാപിച്ചാൻ അനുവദിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നുവെന്നും കല്പിച്ചിരിക്കുവണ്ണം നിങ്ങൾക്കായി തന്നിരിക്കുകൊണ്ടു ... അന്നു മുതൽ

Only because the Hierarch sought then the help of Fr. Chavara and because of his efforts that monastery could survive and flourish. Fr. Leopold who knew this would have inspired to consult Fr. Chavara and to get his wholehearted co-operation. Only because of the support of this outstanding leader of the Syrians can this plan be accomplished. In addition, it would have been easier to get Syrian women as members of this new Congregation. Such thoughts would have made him happy and confidence.

- According to *CMM*, it was to Fr. Chavara his best friend that Fr. Leopold *first* opened his heart. "...what do you feel? Is it alright to engage them in the work nuns do..." (...കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കടുത്ത വെലയിൽ ഇവരെ ആക്കി നടത്തിയാൽ കൊള്ളാമൊ? എന്തുതോന്നുന്നു).³²

Immediately Fr. Chavara thus responded, "that is the best thing (ആയത് എത്രയും നല്ലത്). This very positive response seems to have sprung up from the depths of his heart, which was cherishing for a long time such an idea.

- Although both persons felt extreme happiness, still Fr. Chavara did not forget the practical difficulties. The

കുനമ്മാവു നമ്മുടെ കൊവേന്തയായി എല്ലാ ക്രമത്തോടും ... അധികം വെടി പ്പോടും അടക്കത്തോടും ഭക്തിയോടും നടന്നുവരുന്നു) (*CMM* II, 12 [82-83]).

³²The phrase കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കടുത്ത വെല (work nuns do) does not seem to mean founding a canonical religious community. Fr. Leopold himself attributes Fr. Chavara a great desire to have a religious convent (Ref. *Short Biography of Chavara*, written by Fr. Leopold). In his *Diary* on the day of death of Fr. Chavara, Fr. Leopold speaks that Fr. Chavara has founded with great fatigue monastery for the women religious (Ref. *Diary* of Fr. Leopold). For further details, see *Excursus Founder/Founders/foundress: Some critical Reflections* No. Ex.3.2.3).

reason why he raised the reservation: “when begins for it, their relatives would not be pleased with it and may create obstructions, [he] said” (ഇതിനു തുടങ്ങുമ്പോൾ അവരുടെ അവകാശികളായ മറ്റവർക്ക് തെളികയില്ല എന്നും മറ്റും പല വിഷയങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടാകുമായിരിക്കും എന്നും കൽപ്പിച്ചു...), was this, he was well versed in the traditions about handling of the patrimony in Kerala.³³

An intimate analysis of *CKC* and *CMM* may give further enlightenment about the roles of Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara.³⁴

1.1.2.2.3. A Detailed Analysis of the Texts

1.1.2.2.3.1. Fr. Leopold As the ‘Spiritual Guide’

The first one with whom mother Eliswa came into contact was Fr. Leopold who as the Provincial Delegate was serving as the parish priest of Koonammavu church. There is nothing extraordinary in such an encounter, since parish priest is supposed to be the shepherd of the faithful of the locality

³³Some may feel uneasy about the occurrence of the verb കല്പിച്ചു, which they understand as ‘commanded’. A close study of the verb *Kalpikkuka* (കല്പിക്കുക) may dispel such a doubt. According to *Sabda Sagaram* (A Malayalam-Malayalam Dictionary) Vol. II, the primary sense of *Kalpikkuka* is to think (വിചാരിക്കുക) and to consider (കരുതുക), and not to command (കല്പിക്കുക), although the substantive *kalpana* (കല്പന) primarily means to command, and to order (P. 1089). For a comprehensive sense of the verb *Kalpikkuka* (കല്പിക്കുക) the list of its secondary meanings are given below. (2) do, make; 3) decide; 4) entrust; 5) judge, suggest; 6) command; 7) give permission; 8) officially told; 9) imagine). Fr. Chavara himself makes use of the verb *kalppikkuka* in different senses. For example, it is used for *giving permission* (*CKC* I, 35); for asking (*CKC* I, 162, 163, 165, 176), telling (*CKC* I, 163).

³⁴The role of mother Eliswa will be studied under No. 1.1.3. ‘Roles of Widow Eliswa and Anna.’

who used to open their hearts and share with him their anxieties and worries. Once mother Eliswa came to him and told him about their desire (of her and her daughter Anna) to lead a chaste life unto death.³⁵ They did not know how to execute it. Hence they entrusted themselves into the hands of their confessor, Fr. Leopold.

1.1.2.2.3.1.1. Accepting the Petition

Text:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| ...മരണത്തോളം ജീവിപ്പാൻ നിശ്ചയിച്ചിരിക്കയാൽ ഞങ്ങൾയിരുവരെയും അച്ചനെ ഏല്പിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നും ഏലീശാ മുപ്പച്ചനെ ബോധിപ്പിക്കയാൽ ആ ദെഹവും ആ അപേക്ഷ കൈക്കൊണ്ടു... (CKC I, 3) | Eliswa informed Moopachan, ‘both of us decided to live a life of chastity till death’ ... we ‘entrust both of us to you.’ He accepted that request. |

Comment:

Fr. Leopold who was a man of God would have found God’s hand in the desire of the widow and her daughter to lead a chaste life. That may be the reason that he accepted their desire and agreed to help them. ‘How could safeguard it’ – that became his immediate thought and concern.

1.1.2.2.3.1.2. Giving Counseling

Text in CKC:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| ...വേണ്ടിയ ഗുണദോഷങ്ങളും സൽബുദ്ധികളും ചൊല്ലി കൊടുക്കുകയും ചെയ്കയും... (CKC I, 3). | ...(He) gave them the required advices and counsels... |

³⁵There is then no foundation in the contemporary documents that mother Eliswa first approached Kochuvareed the father of Bro. Leopold who then informed Mooppachan etc. For further details see below No. 1.1.3.3.5. ‘CTC Writings on the Way of Disclosing Inner Inspiration to Fr. Leopold.’

Text in CMM:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|-----------------------------------|
| പലപ്രകാരത്തിലും അവരെ തിരിഞ്ഞു പരീക്ഷിക്കുകയും (CMM II, 73 [125]). | Testing them in different ways... |

Comment:

It is not clear that what advice he has given. But the document says that ...Giving them the required advices and counsels...(വേണ്ടിയ ഗുണദോഷങ്ങളും സൽബുദ്ധികളും ചൊല്ലിക്കൊടുക്കുകയും).

1.1.2.2.3.1.3. Discerning the Vocation

Text in CKC:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| ഇവരുടെ ആഗ്രഹവും അപേക്ഷയും പട്ടാങ്ങയുള്ളതു തന്നെയോ? ആയ തല്ലെങ്കിൽ സ്ത്രീകൾക്കടുത്ത എളക്ക ബുദ്ധിയാൽ തൊന്നി അപേക്ഷിച്ചതോ? എന്നും നിശ്ചയമായി അറിവാൻ തക്കവണ്ണം പലപ്പഴും പലപ്രകാരണയും മുപ്പച്ചൻ പരീക്ഷിക്കുകയും അന്വേഷിക്കുകയും ചെയ്കയും ... (CKC I, 3). | Their desire and request, are they genuine? Or, are they come from the wavering nature of women? In order to know it clearly, Mooppachan-tested and enquired many times in different ways. |

Text in CMM:

| Original | Translation |
|---|--------------------------------------|
| അവരുടെ നന്മനസ്സും ധൈര്യവും കണ്ട്... (CMM II, 73 [125]). | Seeing their goodwill and courage... |

Comment:

Fr. Leopold did not give an immediate reply. Rather, he took time to test them. As a member of an established Religious Order, he knew the process of discerning the vocation of candidates. Accordingly, he tried his best to find

out the genuine and objective nature of their desire. He knew well the nature of pious women (*bhaktha sthreekal*) of that time who sometimes would be led by mere sentiments and psychological inclinations. Finally, he got convinced.

1.1.2.2.3.1.4. Granting Frequent Access to Sacraments

Text:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>...കുന്ദസാരക്കാരുടെ കടത്തിനും മുറയ്ക്കും തക്കവണ്ണം ആഴ്ച വട്ടത്തിൽ ഒന്നും രണ്ടും കുർബ്ബാന കൈക്കൊള്ളുവാനും അനുവദിച്ചും നടത്തിവരികയും... (CKC I, 4).</p> | <p>As with the authority and terms of the confessor, (he) led them by giving permission to receive Holy Communion once or twice in a week...</p> |

Comments:

As he was convinced of their earnestness, he granted them permission to receive sacraments frequently. So that being spiritually fortified they could persevere in their decision.

1.1.2.2.3.2. Consulting with the Missionaries

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഈ കാര്യം നല്ലതോ എന്നും എങ്ങനെ ഇതിന്നു ഉത്തരമുണ്ടു എന്നും ഏതുപ്രകാരം യിവരുടെ അപേക്ഷയായ കന്നിസുഖം രക്ഷിക്കേണ്ടു എന്നും മറ്റു മുപ്പച്ചന്മാരോടും ഗുണദോഷിക്കയും അവരും നല്ലത് എന്ന് സാക്ഷിക്കയും ചെയ്തു വരികയിൽ... (CKC I, 4)</p> | <p>Is this idea a good one? How to give a reply for it? By what means their chaste life is to be preserved? When asking about this to other missionaries, they said ‘it is good.’</p> |

Comments:

It is a sign of his openness, in incorporating others in the process of discerning vocation. However, the missionaries simply said that ‘it is good.’ They did not say anything more than that.

1.1.2.2.3.3. Praying to the Lord

Text in *CKC*:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| ആ ദേഹം ദൈവത്തോടും അപേക്ഷിക്കയാൽ സർവ്വേശ്വരൻതന്നെ ഒരുവഴി ആ ദേഹത്തിന്റെ ഹൃദയത്തിൽ തോന്നിച്ചു. (<i>CKC</i> I, 4). | ...He prayed to God to show him the way. Eventually God Himself put an idea into his heart. |

Text in *CMM* :

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| എന്നാൽ അദ്ദേഹം ദൈവത്തോടും അപേക്ഷിക്കുകയും.... (<i>CMM</i> II, 73 [125]) | However, he prayed also to the Lord... |

Comments:

Since the other Missionaries did not get actively involved in the affair, Fr. Leopold turned to God the ultimate director of souls and entrusted himself into the divine hands. Then as Fr. Chavara puts it, the Lord Almighty himself brought an idea into his mind. He decided to separate the land which was administered by Thomman, the uncle of Anna and settle them there.³⁶

1.1.2.2.3.4. Consulting with Fr. Chavara

Text in *CKC*:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| 65-ാം കാലം കന്നിമാസം ഒരു ദിവസത്തിൽ കൊവേന്തകളുടെ ഒന്നാം പ്രിയോരായ പെ.ബ. കുരിയാക്കോസ് ഏലിയാ എന്ന ദേഹത്തിനോടും ഈ കാര്യം പെ.ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ പറഞ്ഞാറെ... (<i>CKC</i> I, 5). | One day in September 1865, Mooppachan told about it to V. Rev. Fr. Kuriakose Elias Chavara, the first prior of the monasteries... |

³⁶For further details, see *WFF* No. 2.1.2.1. 'The Land of Panambumadam.'

Text in CMM:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ഈ 1865-ൽ നമ്മുടെ ദൈവാലയത്തായ പെ.ബ. ലെവോപ്പോൾട്ട് മര്യ മുപ്പച്ചൻ ഒരു ദിവസം 4 മണിക്ക് എന്നെ വിളിച്ച് പുറത്ത് നടപ്പാനായിട്ട് ...പറഞ്ഞതായിട്ട്... ഒരു പ്രകാരം കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കു ടുത്ത വെലയിൽ ഇവരെ ആക്കി നടത്തിയാൽ കൊള്ളാമൊ? എന്തു തോന്നുന്നു. 'ആയത് എത്രയും നല്ലത് എന്നു തോന്നുന്നു എന്നു ഞാനും ഉത്തരിച്ചു'. എന്നാൽ ഇതിനു തുടങ്ങുമ്പോൾ അവരുടെ അവകാശികളായ മറ്റവർക്ക് തെളികയില്ല എന്നും മറ്റും പല വിഘ്നങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടാകുമായിരിക്കും എന്നും കൽപിച്ചു... (CMM II, 73 [124-125]).</p> | <p>One day at four o'clock in the evening in 1865 our Delegate V. Rev. Leopold Maria Moopachan, took me for a walk; ... he told me... engage them in the work nuns do... Is it all right? What do you feel? It seems to be a good idea, I answered. But when begins for it, their relatives would not be pleased with it and may create obstructions, (he) said...</p> |

Comments:

Fr. Chavara positively responded and offered his full co-operation for the realization of the project.³⁷ At this Fr. Leopold felt very happy and took the next step.

1.1.2.2.3.5. Approaching the Ecclesiastical Authority

Text in CKC:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ഈ വിവരം ഒക്കെയും പെ. ബ. മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചനെ ബൊധിപ്പിച്ചാറെ, 5 കൊൽ പൊക്കമുള്ള മതിലിനകത്ത് പാർപ്പിക്കണം എന്ന് നിശ്ചയിച്ച മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചൻ പനമ്പു കൊണ്ടുള്ള പുരയിൽ പാർപ്പിക്കുന്നതിന് ഒരു തടവും കല്പിക്കാതെ നല്ലത് എന്നും... (CKC 1, 5)</p> | <p>When the Archbishop was informed of all these, he who had formerly wanted to make them live within 5 col (about 13 feet) high walls, now allowed them to live in a house made with bamboo mat without any objection...</p> |

³⁷ For details see WFF, Chapter II, No. 2.1.2. 'Construction of Panambu Madam.'

Text in *CMM*:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>...പെ. ബ. മെത്രാപ്പൊലീത്താച്ച നൊട് അറിയിച്ചാറെ ആ ദെഹത്തിനും സന്തോഷമായി കർമ്മലീത്താ മൂന്നാം സഭക്കാ രായിട്ട് സ്ഥാപിക്കാമെന്നും കൽ പിച്ച്... (<i>CMM</i> II, 74 [125]).</p> | <p>When it was informed to V. Rev. Archbishop, he was very happy and said that it can be started as the Third Order of Carmelites.</p> |

Comments:

Both *CMM* and *CKC* do not speak explicitly who did inform all these matters to Msgr. Bernardine. Two possibilities are there: either Fr. Leopold alone or along with Fr. Chavara. Since the details of the meeting with the Archbishop are given in both of the chronicles, the second option is having more chance. The Archbishop from his part approved the whole plan.³⁸

1.1.3. Roles of Widow Eliswa and Anna

1.1.3.1. Their Life Situation

We get a glimpse of the life led by the widow and her daughter when they approached Fr. Leopold, from both *CKC* and the letter of Fr. Chavara written to Fr. Porukkara on 1866 March 13th expressing his apprehension about receiving a girl of a rich family to the community which has embraced a lifestyle of simplicity and poverty. Since the first members, Eliswa and Anna were formerly leading a life of poverty and hard labour, this new lifestyle was not difficult but welcoming for them.

³⁸For the details see *WFF*, Chapter 2, No. 2.1.1. 'Role of Bernardine Baccinelli.'

1.1.3.1.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>മേലെഴുതിയവരുടെ ആയിട്ട് ഏതാനും നിലം, പുരയിടങ്ങളും ആയതിനോടുകൂടി ഏതാനും കടങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടെങ്കിലും ആ വക ഒക്കെയും അന്നായുടെ എളയപ്പൻ ആയ നമ്മുടെ പ്രൊക്കുറോരു തൊമ്മൻ എന്നയാൾ അന്വേഷിച്ച് യിവരുടെ ചിലവും നടത്തി വരികയാൽ അയാൾ ദീനക്കാരനാകയാലും കടങ്ങൾക്ക് അധിക പലിശയാകയാലും ഒടുക്കം എല്ലാം തീർന്ന കടം ശേഷിപ്പാനും ഇടവരും എന്ന അവസ്ഥയിൽ ആകയാലും... (CKC I, 4)</p> | <p>These women had some land and paddy fields as their own. Some loan had been drawn on the security of this property. Anna's uncle (father's younger brother) Thomman who was also our procurator managed them and provided for their living. He was a sickly person. The interest on the loan was mounting up and reaching a point when they would not only lose the land but also run into debt...</p> |

Comments

From this text, it is very clear that though they had some property, the problems they faced were the debt and the lack of money for their sustenance. They were taken care by the sick and unhealthy Thomman, the brother in-law of widow Eliswa who was working as the procurator of the monastery of Men TOCD. From the statement of the chronicler: “the interest on the loan was mounting up and reaching a point when they would not only lose the land but also run into debt” we can infer how pitiful was their situation.

1.1.3.1.2. Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഈ പാവപ്പെട്ട അമ്മക്കും അവളുടെ മകളുടെ എന്നു പറഞ്ഞ കയർ പിരിച്ചും പാനെയ്തും നെല്ലുകുത്തിയും നനച്ചും പിഴിഞ്ഞുടുത്തും കാടിയും തവിടും തിന്നും</p> | <p>This poor mother and her daughter were living by making coir, weaving mats, grinding rice, eating bran of rice and drinking rice water, wearing even wet</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>വട്ടിപ്പുറത്തു കിടന്നുറങ്ങിയും ജീവിച്ചുവന്നത്. ഇപ്പഴം അപ്രകാരം പോലെ ഓലകൊണ്ടും പനമ്പുകൊണ്ടും കുത്തിമറച്ചിട്ടുള്ള മഞ്ഞും പനിക്കും തടവില്ലാത്ത പുരയിൽ പാർത്തും....³⁹</p> | <p>clothes, sleeping on some temporary cots made with bamboo. Now also is in the same condition; living in a house thatched with bamboos and coconut leaves and thus not protected well from sun and rain...</p> |
|---|--|

Comments:

Mother Eliswa is called poor mother (*pavappetta amma*) which can be taken in the literal meaning or as a designation for a pious woman. The text seems to be referring to the wretched situation of her life. Both the mother and her daughter were finding their sustenance by hard work such as choir making, mat weaving and grinding rice. Even then, they had to eat bran of rice and to drink *kanji* water. They did not seem to have had many cloths; hence, they had to wear wet cloths. They had no proper bed to sleep. Indeed, they were very poor.

At the first reading, this statement seems to be contradicting with the words of Fr. Leopold in *CMM* that Anna enjoyed the possession of the half of the property of her deceased father (cf. *CMM* I, 73 [124]). However, a closer analysis of the documents will ascertain the following facts.

- **Due over the Land:** The property of Anna had a debt over it. How much is the due is not mentioned explicitly in the chronicles. ‘Some debts are there’ (ഏതാനും കടങ്ങളും ഉണ്ട്). However the expression, ‘since the interest for the debts is more and being in the state that everything may be lost at the end and only the debt will

³⁹ *Chavarayachante Kathukal* (Mal.), V/3 (Chavara Central Secretariat, Chavara Hills, Kakkanad, 2011. For a detailed note of this *Kathukal*, see *WFF*, Chapter III, FN 56.

be remained’ (കടങ്ങൾക്ക് അധിക പലിശയാകയാലും ഒടുക്കം എല്ലാംതീർന്ന് കടം ശേഷിപ്പാനും ഇടവരും എന്ന അവസ്ഥയിൽ ആകയാലും), gives the impression that the due was not a small amount. According to the chronicler, if the interest and the debt are not paid on time at the end the land will be lost and the debt will be remained.

- **Lack of Money:** The procurator Thomman had the good will to do the entrusted duty. ‘Even though Thomman had the good will, he did not have money’ (തൊമ്മൻ എന്നവൻ നൽമനസ്സുണ്ടെങ്കിലും കയ്യിൽ പണം ഇല്ലായ്കയാലും... [CKC I, 6]). The lack of money was one of the main problems to establish the Bamboo mat convent even though the permission was got from the Vicar Apostolic. In *CMM* II 75 [125-126) thus Fr. Chavara laments: ‘since there was no money to provide, the work has prolonged’ (...എങ്കിലും പണം എടുപ്പാൻ കൈയിൽ പാടില്ലായ്കയാൽ ദീർഘമായി കിടന്നു). The phrase ദീർഘമായി കിടന്നു is also notable here. How long this duration was, we do not know. However, the chronicles give some indications to understand this period. That is after the consultation with Fr. Chavara, the Vicar Apostolic was informed, the Rule was received and it was in the process of translation. Meanwhile Mooppachan asked the relatives of Anna to construct a small house for them. According to *CKC* the consultation with Fr. Chavara took place in 1865 *Kanni* (around September). But the construction of Bamboo mat Convent started only in 1866 *Makaram* (around January). ‘In the month of January of 1866 when the feast of the wedding of our Mother of Carmel and our Father St. Joseph was approaching, the work of this small bamboo mat convent was begun’ (...നമ്മുടെ അമ്മ

കർമ്മങ്ങൾ ദൈവമാതാവിന്റെയും പിതാവായ ശു. മാർ യൗസേപ്പിന്റെയും വിവാഹം തിരുനാൾ സമീപിച്ച 1866 മകരത്തിൽ ഈ ചെറിയ പനമ്പുരത്തിന് വെല തുടങ്ങി [CKC I, 6]. Again in *CMM II*, 75 [126] we read, ‘in the beginning of the year 1866, a person donated Rs.10 out of a debt he was paid back through the monastery. With that and Rs. 8/- got from some other source, work on the house was begun.’ (1866-ാം കാലത്തിന്റെ തുടക്കം ഒരാൾക്കു ഉത്തരിപ്പിന്നായി ഏതാനും രൂപാ വന്നിരുന്നത് കൊടുത്തപ്പൊൾ അവൻ ഇതിന്നു ധർമ്മമായിട്ട് 10 രൂപാ തരികയും മറ്റു വഴി 8 ഇങ്ങനെ ഇതുകൊണ്ട് തുടങ്ങി...).⁴⁰

⁴⁰Facts being so how can Msgr. Mellano writes to Rome that they had the property worth of Franc 14000. Msgr. Mellano seems to conveniently connive at the enormous amount of debt that the property had. So too, Sr. Sucey in *SGME* claims that mother Eliswa had a cash deposit of Rs. 2000/- (cf. *SGME*, 138). However, she fails to cite any documents to prove her claim. Instead, in FN she thus writes: “according to the current money value it would be millions of Rupees.” In the Manuscript of Bro. Leopold, *Rev. Sr. Thresia Vaippisseryude Charithram (The History of Rev. Sr. Thresia Vaippissery)*, we thus read: *അവളുടെ [എലീശായുടെ] കൈവശം നാണയമായി രണ്ടായിരം (Rs. 2000) ഉറപ്പികയും ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നു* (Also in her hand as coin there were 2000 rupees) (page 121 also 125).

As far as *Sr. Thresia Vaippisseryude Charithram* is concerned, the following fact has come to our notice. In the CMC Archives, we have a manuscript copy in which the name of Rev. Fr. Leonard OCD, Carmelite Monastery, and Manjummel is written down in the first page. However, on second page that is entitled as *Index*, Bro. Leopold is mentioned as the author of the history of Sr. Thresia. An authentic historian can conclude that this biography was written down only after 1940 since the Souvenir *Varapuzha Kanyakamadam Oru Charithra Samgraham*, which was published in connection with the golden Jubilee of that convent in 1940 is quoted down on many pages (just to give few examples, see pages 125, 127, 147, 159, 160, 169, 184, 188, 190, 191-192).

Sr. Sucey in *SGME* pages 114-117 depending on the works of present authors (Prescilla, *Mother Eliswa* 25, 28; *Sr. Anna*, 6; *Sr. Thresia*, 10-24; Gracious, *Saga of the Foundation of CTC*, 33; *Manuscript of Bro.*

1.1.3.2. Their Stay at Home

Both in *CKC* and *CMM*, there are few texts which rightly point out that mother Eliswa and her daughter Anna were staying at their own house until their entry into *panambumadam*. Some of the texts are cited below.

1.1.3.2.1. Texts

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| ... ഏലീശാ എന്ന വൈതവിയും അവളുടെ ഏകമകളായ അന്ന എന്ന സഹോദരിയും ഈ കുന്തമ്മാവ് എടവകയിൽ ചെർന്നു വടക്കൻ എന്ന സാമാന്യം വിളിച്ചുവരുന്ന വാകയിൽ എന്ന വീട്ടിൽ പാർത്തുവരികയിൽ... <i>CKC</i> I, 3). | Eliswa the widow and her only daughter Anna, being the members of Koonammavu parish, were living in Vakayil house commonly known as Vadakken... |

Again on page 8 while speaking the arrival of Sr. Thresia at Koonammavu the following explanations are given:

Leopold, 8; Cornelius Elenjikkal, *Kerala Sabha Charitra Samkshepam*, 64 etc.) holds that this kind of austere lifestyle was willingly opted by the widow and her daughter, and even her younger sister Thresia. We do not know how these authors got such information. Surprisingly neither Sr. Prescilla nor Sr. Gracious refer to the sources on which they depended for such information. How can Sr. Sucey in such a scientific work as a doctoral dissertation quote these authors who do not give references to the primary sources? We would like to draw attention to our comments made on the works of Sr. Prescilla (cf. *AUSW*, 59) which can be compared to a novel like narration. Nowhere in their accounts the authors refer to the hard work the widow and her daughter were compelled to do in order to earn their daily bread by coir making, mat weaving and grinding rice. So too the assertion of these authors that Thresia the sister of Eliswa joined in their austere community stands against the documentary facts. (See for further details *WFF*, Chapter II, No 2.1.4.2 ‘the Issue of Stay of Thresia.’ As far as the writings of Bro. Leopold, who was not a contemporary of the events, are concerned, see the comments in *AUSW*, 61-64.

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| 10-ാം തീയതി ശനിയാഴ്ച തന്നെ ... സഹോദരി ത്രെസ്യയെയും കുട്ടി ക്കൊണ്ട് അപ്പനും അമ്മയും മറ്റു ചില കുടപ്പിറപ്പുകളും കൂടെ വന്നു സഹോദരി അന്നായുടെ അപ്പന്റെ വീട്ടിൽ ഇവരോടുകൂടി താമസിച്ചു... (CKC I, 8). | On 10 th , Saturday itself, ...father and mother along with other children (<i>koodappirappukal</i>) brought Thresia and stayed at the house of the father of Sr. Anna along with them. |

In *CMM*, when Fr. Leopold consulted with Fr. Chavara regarding the widow and her daughter, thus it is written:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| ഈ അമ്മയെയും മകളെയും കൂടെ അവരു പാർത്തു വരുന്ന തറവാട്ടിൽ നിന്നും മാറ്റി അവരുടെ പറമ്പുകളിൽ ഒന്നിൽതന്നെ ഒരു സ്ഥലമുണ്ടാക്കിയിവരെ രണ്ടുപേരെയും കൂടെ അതിൽ പാർപ്പിച്ച് ... (<i>CMM</i> II, 73 [124]). | This mother and the daughter can be shifted from their existing house and made to settle down in another house constructed in one of their own properties... |

1.1.3.2.2. Comments

In all these three texts, the chronicler Fr. Chavara highlights that mother Eliswa and Sr. Anna were staying in their ancestral family called Vakayil house. The second text affirms that even on 10th of February 1866, both mother and daughter were in their proper house. It is noteworthy the words of the chronicler: “On 10th, Saturday itself, ...father and mother along with other children (*koodappirappukal*) brought Thresia and stayed at the house of the father of Sr. Anna along with them.” In other words, phrases like, ‘while living in the house called Vakayil’, ‘stayed at the house of the father of Sr. Anna’, ‘being shifted from their ancestral house in which they were living’, put in evidence that the mother and the daughter were staying in their own house called Vakayil till 13th February 1866 on the day of the entrance to *panambumadam*.

Some of the books originated much later in the CTC circle bring up the issue of life at *kalappura*⁴¹ of mother Eliswa, her daughter Anna and her sister Thresia. According to them, after the death of her husband Eliswa longed for a life of solitude and silence and shifted her stay from their ancestral house to a small shed and from there to *kalappura*. A close analysis of these books as shown in the chart below will disclose their baseless arguments.

| Author's Name | Book's Name | Year | Stay at Home/shed | Theme: Stay at Kalappura |
|------------------------|--|------------|--|--|
| (No Author) | <i>Varapuzha Kanya - kamadom Oru Charithra Sam-graham</i> (Mal.) | 1940 | After the death of her husband, Eliswa and her daughter Anna led a pious life in their Vakayil house itself (page, 3). | No mention of stay at <i>Kalappura</i> in 1940. |
| Bro. Leopold | <i>Rev. Sr. Thresia Vaippisseryude Charitram</i> (Manuscript Mal.) | After 1940 | They led a pious life in their own house (Pages 110-111) | No mention of <i>Kalappura</i> |
| Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC | <i>Mother Eliswa</i> (Mal.) | 1990 | Leaving away all worldly pleasures Eliswa led a life of detachment and stayed in her Vakayil house (page 28). | In 1990 too the <i>Kalappura</i> case is not appeared. |
| Sr. Pulcheria CTC | <i>Theresian Karmelita Sabha Innuvare</i> (Mal.) | 1999 | Eliswa stayed at the Vakayil house and led a pious life (page 7-8) | Here also there is no mention of <i>Kalappura</i> . |
| Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC | <i>C.T.C Sabhayude Stapanu Charitram</i> (Mal.) | 2004 | Due to the constant request of Eliswa, her relatives made a shed near by the mansion and she led a solitary life there (page, 7) | Eliswa was not satisfied with the solitary life in the shed; therefore as per the suggestion of Fr. George Vakayil, she started to stay at <i>Kalappura</i> longing for more silence and solitude (page, 8). |

⁴¹Shed used for keeping the grains.

The stay at *Kalappura* as the table shows is a special contribution of Sr. Prescilla CTC. It is noteworthy that when she wrote the book *Mother Eliswa* in 1990, Eliswa was staying at her house only. We do not know what prompted Sr. Prescilla to add the story of *Kalappura* in 2004. According to her by the suggestion of *punya slokanaya* (saintly) Fr. George Vakayil, Eliswa started to stay at *Kalappura*. *150th Jubilee Smaranika of Koonammavu Parish* has given the life sketch of *Punnyacharithanaya* (saintly) Rev. Fr. George Vakayil as follows: he was born on 9th September 1883, ordained on 21st December 1912, First Mass 30th December, 1912 and died on 4th November, 1931. If he was born only in 1883, how could he give suggestion to Eliswa in 1862 (?) as claims by Sr. Prescilla? However, the other book of Sr. Prescilla, which claimed as the foundation history of CTC, did not give any reference to her ‘new’ proposition.

1.1.3.3. Entrusting Themselves to Fr. Leopold

1.1.3.3.1. Text One – From *CKC*

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ഞങ്ങളുടെ ഒന്നാമത്തെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി അമ്മയായ ഏലീശ്വര എന്ന വൈതവിയും അവളുടെ ഏകമകളായ അന്ന എന്ന സഹോദരിയും ഈ കുനമ്മാവ് എടവകയിൽ ചെർന്ന് വടക്കൻ എന്ന് സാമാന്യം വിളിച്ചുവരുന്ന വകയിൽ എന്ന വീട്ടിൽ പാർത്തുവരികയിൽ പെ.ബ. മുപ്പച്ചനോട് കുമ്പസാരിച്ചു വന്നതുമല്ലാതെയും ഞങ്ങളിരുവർക്കും ഈ കന്നിസുഖത്തോടെ അതായത് വൈദവം എന്ന കന്നിത്വത്തിൽ ഏലീശ്വരയും ബ്രഹ്മശാരിതം എന്ന തികയപ്പെട്ട കന്നിസുഖത്തിൽ അന്നയും മരണത്തോളം ജീവിപ്പാൻ നിശ്ചയിച്ചിരിക്കയാൽ ഞങ്ങൾയിരുവരെയും അച്ചനെ ഏല്പിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നും ഏലീശ്വര മുപ്പച്ചനെ ബോധിപ്പിക്കയാൽ... (<i>CKC</i> I, 3-6).</p> | <p>Our first mother superior, Eliswa the widow and her only daughter Anna, being the members of Koonammavu parish, were living in Vakayil house commonly known as Vadakken; Eliswa and her daughter Anna were used to make confession to Mooppachan and Eliswa informed Mooppachan ‘both of us decided to live a life of chastity till death’ – Eliswa, chastity according to that of a widow and Anna the perfect chastity of virginity - and ‘entrust both of us to you father.’</p> |

1.1.3.3.2. Comments

- The explanation of ‘the grace of celibate life’ (കന്നിസുഖം) – Eliswa, chastity according to that of a widow and Anna the perfect chastity of virginity’ (വൈധവം എന്ന കന്നിത്വത്തിൽ ഏലീശായും ബ്രഹ്മശാരിത്വം എന്ന തികയപ്പെട്ട കന്നിസുഖത്തിൽ അന്നയും) – cannot come from Eliswa. It discloses the ideas of Fr. Chavara, the writer of the chronicles who makes distinction between the widow status and the virgin status.
- In the text Fr. Leopold speaks only about the possibility of arranging in a more orderly way the spiritual affairs of the mother and the daughter, ‘besides living a smooth and peaceful spiritual life’ (ആത്മകാര്യങ്ങൾ വെടിപ്പായി നടക്കുന്നതുമല്ലാതെ).
- Both the mother and the daughter have decided to lead a chaste life unto death. This pinpoints the active role played by mother Eliswa and Anna. It was their firm decision, which would have resulted from reflection.⁴² God would have inspired them in taking such a decision.
- Still both of them did not know how to proceed in realizing their earnest desire for a chaste life. All they could do was to depend upon Fr. Leopold. Thus they entrusted themselves into his hands, thinking that God will inspire their confessor and vicar of the parish to find out a way.
- They would not have thought about founding a religious Congregation with its ends and means.⁴³

⁴²Of course the document does not say anything about it.

⁴³ Cf. AUSW, 86-87.

1.1.3.3.3. Text Two – From *CMM*

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>...ഇവിടെ ഒരു വിധവയും 14 പ്രായമുള്ള ഒരു മകളുമുണ്ട്. ആ പെൺപൈതലിന്റെ അപ്പന്റെ പകുതിക്കുള്ള വസ്തുക്കളുമുണ്ട്. അവൾക്ക് കെട്ടിപ്പാൻ മനസ്സുമില്ല. ആയതുകൊണ്ട് ഈ അമ്മയെയും മകളെയും കൂടെ അവരു പാർത്തുവരുന്ന തറവാട്ടിൽ നിന്നും മാറ്റി അവരുടെ പറമ്പുകളിൽ ഒന്നിൽ തന്നെ ഒരു സ്ഥലമുണ്ടാക്കിയിവരെ രണ്ടുപെരെയും കൂടെ അതിൽ പാർപ്പിച്ച് മറ്റുള്ള പെൺപൈതങ്ങളെ നല്ല പഠനമായ പുണ്യങ്ങളും കൈവെലകളും പഠിപ്പിക്കുന്ന ഒരു പ്രകാരം കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കടുത്തവെലയിൽ ഇവരെ ആക്കി നടത്തിയാൽ ... (<i>CMM</i> II, 73 [124]).</p> | <p>...Here there is a widow and her 14 year old daughter and has half of the properties of her father. The girl does not want to get married. Therefore, the mother and the daughter can be shifted from their ancestral home and made to settle down in another house constructed in one of their own properties and engage them in the works proper to nuns; i.e., teaching other girls the practice of virtues and training them in some handicrafts. Is it all right? What do you feel, asked.</p> |

1.1.3.3.4. Comments

- In *CMM*, Fr. Leopold did not utter a word about the desire of Eliswa and her daughter to lead a chaste life until death. The Missionary only spoke about the unwillingness of Anna to get married.
- It was then the idea of Fr. Leopold to take them from their ancestral home and settle them in a particular compound of their own land.
- Fr. Leopold mentions to get engaged Eliswa and Anna in the work proper to nuns (കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കടുത്ത വെലയിൽ) for the benefit of the girls to lead a virtuous life and learn the handicrafts. It seems that his main concern was to find a way to safeguard the chaste life of both the mother and her daughter.

- The phrase ‘the girl does not want to get married’ discloses that the decision of Eliswa to lead a chaste life was influenced by the unwillingness of Anna to get married. Hence, we have to attribute to Anna a significant role in the development of the religious community although she remains silent in the chronicles that she herself has penned from pages 17 onwards. This attests to the humility and nobility of this pious daughter of mother Eliswa. However, Fr. Chavara in both *CKC* and *CMM* explicitly has pointed out certain qualities she had exhibited: “Anna had more intelligence, prudence and courage than others; she could learn everything quickly.”⁴⁴

1.1.3.3.5. CTC Writings on the way of Disclosing Inner Inspiration to Fr. Leopold

According to the original sources, facts being as mentioned above, the secondary literatures from CTC sisters, underline different ways of disclosing the inner inspiration of mother Eliswa to Fr. Leopold.

1.1.3.3.5.1. Texts

The table below discloses the views in five books that deal with the history of the Congregation.

| Author's Name | Book's Name | Year | Way of disclosing to Fr. Leopold |
|---------------|--|------|--|
| (No Author) | <i>Varapuzha Kanyakadam Oru Charithra Samgraham</i> (Mal.) | 1940 | After sometimes, they expressed to Fr. Leopold, the desire that were cherished in their hearts to embrace religious life (Page, 3-4) |

⁴⁴*CMM* II, 77 [127]. In *CKC* Anna was taught how to give the key to the clock (*CKC* I, 13). cf. *AUSW*, 92-93.

| | | | |
|-------------------------------|---|-------------------|---|
| <p>Bro. Leopold OCD</p> | <p><i>Rev. Sr. Thresia Vaippisseryude Charitram</i> (Manuscript Mal.) ⁴⁵</p> | <p>After 1940</p> | <p>Then Eliswa told to Fr. Louis TOCD 'I immediately went to the school and met Vattaparambil Joseph Kunjuvareed Ashan (teacher) who was then doing both the work of the Sacristan and that of the school which were on the shoulder of the paternal uncle, Vattaparambil Lorance Pylonna and requested him to call Kochumooppachan to the confessional. Ashan went and informed. Kochumooppachan came to the confessional and I went and said my matter. He was only started to learn Malayalam. However, he understood well what I said and I understood the advice that he had given for that. I started to experience peace.' This event had happened in 1862... (Page, 118-119).</p> |
| <p>Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC</p> | <p><i>Mother Eliswa</i> (Mal.)</p> | <p>1990</p> | <p>An evening while Eliswa was praying in the parish church, she heard as someone said to her, 'call <i>kochumooppachan</i> and tell him your matter'. Immediately she called Mooppachan to the confessional through Vattaparambil Joseph Kunjuvareed master. She said everything frankly (Page, 29-30).</p> |
| <p>Sr. Pulcheria CTC</p> | <p><i>Theresian Karmelita Sabha Innuvare</i> (Mal.)</p> | <p>1999</p> | <p>An evening of 1862, Eliswa felt some disturbances and she went to the parish church for prayer. While she was praying, she felt as someone tells to her, 'call <i>Kochumooppachan</i> and inform him your matter.' She shared this experience with her brother Fr. Louis and demanded him to make the arrangements for a meeting with Fr. Leopold (Page, 8-9).</p> |

⁴⁵ See above FN 39 for the details of this manuscript.

| | | | |
|------------------------------|---|------|--|
| Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC | CTC <i>Sabhayude Stapana Charitram</i> (Mal.) ⁴⁶ | 2004 | While Eliswa was praying in the parish church, she heard as someone thus said to her, ‘call kochumoppachan and tell him your matter.’ (This is stated by Fr. Louis, the brother of Eliswa). She chose Mooppachan as her confessor and spiritual guide. Even though he only started to learn Malayalam, he understood well what she told him (Page, 9). |
|------------------------------|---|------|--|

1.1.3.3.5.2. Comments

In these five texts, the so-called experience sharing with Fr. Leopold is explained in different ways. That itself is a proof that the authors themselves are not sure of the event. As the table shows according to the CTC text of 1940, *Varapuzha Kanyakamadom Oru Charithra Samgraham* (Mal.), mother Eliswa and Sr. Anna expressed their desire to embrace religious life (?) to Fr. Leopold.⁴⁷ It seems that after 1940, in the *History of Thresia Vaippissery*, Bro. Leopold OCD, under

⁴⁶These are only few examples. Other books are also there with the same literature. See for example, in the book *Mother Eliswa Foundress and Mystic*, edited by Dr. Sr. Gracious CTC we thus reads: “In Kalapura house, Koonammavu, which was included in Anna’s patrimony, where Eliswa, Anna and Thresia lived a life of silence, solitude and contemplation becoming to the ascetics. It is a very strong testimony to prove that even before entering the religious life, all these three women dedicated themselves without being taught or instructed by any other outward agencies. In one of the rooms of that house we could see the marks of which divided the room into three cells, where these three women used to spend their free time completely immersed in prayer and silence. They lived in this house till 13th February 1866, the day on which they left for *panambumadam*” (page, 50). What type of reply shall we give for such explanation!

⁴⁷ See above No. 1.1.3.3. ‘Entrusting Themselves to Fr. Leopold’, on the original texts *CKC* and *CMM* about the words of mother Eliswa to Fr. Leopold.

the label of ‘Eliswa told to Fr. Louis’ formulated a process for the meeting with the Missionary. The writers like Sr. Prescilla and Sr. Pulcheria made either some additions or omissions here and there and prepared their own stories. For example, according to Sr. Prescilla, mother Eliswa had a special experience in front of the Blessed Sacrament, heard a voice, and called Mooppachan to the confessional through Vattaparambil Joseph Kunjuvareed Master. But, Sr. Pulcheria wrote that mother Elisha approached Fr. Leopold through the arrangements made by her brother Fr. Louis, not through Vattaparambil Kunjuvareed as Sr. Prescilla claims. One should not forget the fact that in 1866 Louis was in Koonammavu seminary (monastery) as a brother. Regarding him thus says *CKC I*, 8:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>...ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി ഏലീശായുടെയും സഹോദരി ത്രെസ്യായുടെയും അപ്പൻ അമ്മ ഒന്നായിരിക്കയാലും യിവരുടെ കൂടെപ്പിറപ്പ് ജൂവിസ് എന്ന ഒരു പൈതൽ കൂനമ്മാവു കൊവെന്തയിൽ ഉണ്ടായി രുന്നതിനാലും...</p> | <p>Since the parents of superior Eliswa and sister Thresia were same and their brother, Louis (young one) was in the monastery...</p> |

The term *പൈതൽ* (young one) is notable here. It is not very easy to believe that mother Eliswa shared her experience with the young Louis who was a candidate and not a priest. In her book, *CTC Sabhayude Sthapana Charitram* (2004), Sr. Prescilla also claims that it was her brother Louis who testified that Eliswa heard a voice telling her to call Kochumooppachan and tell him her matters. One cannot deny *a priori* such experience. However, none of the writers give authentic sources of such information.

1.2. Conclusion

We have assessed the roles played by Fr. Chavara, Fr. Leopold and widow Eliswa with her daughter Anna. The study has pointed out that Fr. Chavara was long ago

cherishing in his heart a yearning for a women religious community in Kerala. His heart was raised in prayer for the fulfillment of such a dream. Thus, we find in him the two necessary elements involved in every spiritual movement, namely ardent desire and incessant prayer. At the thought that Kerala was blessed by a Christian community from early days did not have monasteries and convents that could provide living witnesses to Jesus Christ, ached his heart. He was very sad at the failed attempts made in Alengadu and Puthenpally for starting convents.

Now God, who always comes to the help of His devotees, sent Fr. Leopold to fulfill the desire of the heart of His beloved son. Mooppachan who was serving as a parish priest of Koonammavu church came in contact with widow Eliswa and her daughter who disclosed to him their determination to lead a chaste life and entrusted themselves into the hands of their pastor. Fr. Leopold tested the genuineness of such a desire. Being convinced he sought the advice of other missionary priests how to protect the chaste life of his spiritual daughters. Although the other missionaries subscribed to the desire of these two parishioners of Koonammavu, they did not come forward with any concrete suggestions. Fr. Leopold was praying hard for getting the divine enlightenment and as if he were guided by the Holy Spirit, once approached his bosom friend Fr. Chavara asking his opinion about his plan to engage the widow Eliswa and her daughter in the works proper to nuns, such as teaching the girls the practice of virtues and training them in some handicrafts.

A very important truth is underlined in Fr. Leopold's consultation with Fr. Chavara. This Indian religious was an outstanding leader of the Syrians who exerted great influence among the faithful. The Archbishop who had earlier failed in his attempt to start a men religious community for the Latins

at Koonammavu would not have been very cooperative, if Mooppachan alone would have come forward with his plan. The hierarch had already known Fr. Chavara's abilities and influences and he himself entrusted to Fr. Chavara the survival of the Koonammavu monastery. The Archbishop himself could witness the wonderful growth of this monastery. Thus, he will be willing to give the necessary permission since Fr. Leopold had the active support of the Indian religious. Fr. Chavara was thrilled at this news and promptly volunteered to do everything in realizing this plan. Both of them took further steps after getting the permission of the ecclesiastical authority.

In order to evaluate the role played by widow Eliswa and her daughter we need to take into account the letter of Fr. Chavara written to Fr. Porukkara. According to it, Eliswa and Anna were in a dire situation finding it difficult to meet the both ends of life.⁴⁸ They wanted to lead a chaste life unto death. Not knowing how to proceed to realize it they entrusted themselves to the hands of their confessor and parish priest.

⁴⁸This information contradicts the claim of Sr. Sucey and others that Eliswa and Anna, who could enjoy a rich and very comfortable life, had purposely embraced a life of utter misery. For further references, see our comments in No. 1.1.3.1.

CHAPTER TWO

TOWARDS THE CANONICAL ERECTION OF WOMEN TOCD

2.0. Introduction

After focusing the spiritual orientation which played a major role in realizing Women TOCD, the attempt of the present chapter is to delve into the sources concerning the materialization of the *panambumadam* as well as the construction of the new convent and its blessing together with the vestition of the first four members. The chapter winds up with the profession of the four pioneers and the grateful reflection of praises.

2.1. A Humble Beginning

2.1.1. Role of Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli

Fr. Leopold, the Provincial Delegate, approached Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli, the ecclesiastical authority about starting a convent for the sisters.

2.1.1.1. Texts

In *CMM*:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>...പെ. ബ. മെത്രാപ്പൊലീത്താച്ച നൊട് അറിയിച്ചാറെ ആ ദെഹത്തിനും സന്തോഷമായി കർമ്മലീത്താ മൂന്നാം സഭക്കാ രായിട്ട് സ്ഥാപിക്കാമെന്നും കൽ പിച്ച് ആയതിനുള്ള ക്രമപുസ്ത കവും കൊടുത്ത് മലയാം പെച്ചിൽ പകർത്തുവാൻ കൽപി ച്ചു. ആയത് പൊരുൾ പെടുത്തി യപ്പോൾ സംസാരിക്കുകായ മൂന്നാം സഭക്കാരുടെ ക്രമം ആയിരുന്നു. ആ ക്രമപ്രകാരം ആ അന്തസ്തക്കാരെയും ചെർ ത്ത് ആയതും സ്ഥാപിപ്പാൻ കല്പിക്കയും വീണ്ടുംയിവരുടെ</p> | <p>.... When the Archbishop was informed, he was also very happy and said that it can be started as the Third Order of Carmelites. And he gave the rule ordering to translate it into Malayalam. When the rule was translated, it is understood that it was the rule for the Lay Fraternity of that Order. On being told about it the Archbishop asked to start that also. Again, he gave the Rules</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>ക്രമപുസ്തകവും കൊടുത്ത് ആയതും മലയാളത്തിൽ ആക്കി... (CMM II, 74 [125]).</p> | <p>for them (sisters) and it was translated into Malayalam....</p> |
|---|--|

In CKC:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ഈ വിവരം ഒക്കെയും പെ. ബ. മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചനെ ബൊധിപ്പിച്ചാറെ, 5 കോൽ പൊക്കമുള്ള മതിലിനകത്ത് പാർപ്പിക്കണം എന്ന് നിശ്ചയിച്ച മെത്രാന്മാർ പനമ്പു കൊണ്ടുള്ള പുരയിൽ പാർപ്പിക്കുന്നതിന് ഒരു തടവും കല്പിക്കാതെ നല്ലത് എന്നും ആയതിനുള്ള ക്രമപുസ്തകം തരാമെന്നും ആയത് മലയാളത്തിൽ പകർത്തി ചെയ്യണമെന്നും കല്പിച്ച് പുസ്തകം കൊടുക്കുകയും മുപ്പച്ചൻ മലയാളം പെച്ചിൽ പൊതുൾ തിരിച്ചപ്പൊൾ ആയത് സംസാരിക്കുകയും ചെയ്തപ്പോൾ കർമ്മലീത്താ മൂന്നാം സഭക്കാരുടെ ക്രമം ആയിരുന്നതിനാൽ അപ്രകാരമുള്ള ക്രമം നടത്തുവാനും കല്പിച്ച് ഇതു കാരണത്താൽ ആയതിനെ നടത്തുവാനും ദൈവം തിരുമനസായി... വീണ്ടും ബൊധിപ്പിച്ച് നമുക്കുള്ള റെഗുള പുസ്തകം വാങ്ങിച്ച് പകർത്തി (CKC I, 5-6).</p> | <p>When the Archbishop was informed of all these, he who had formerly wanted to make them live within 5 kol high walls, now allowed them to live in a house made with bamboo mats without any objection (he) said ‘it is a fine idea’ and (that he) will give the rule which should be translated into Malayalam and he gave it. When Mooppachan translated it, (he) found that the rule was that of the Secular Third Order Carmelites. Hence asked to start that Order.... Again asked (to the Bishop) and obtained the <i>Regola</i> for us and translated.</p> |

2.1.1.2. Comments

According to *CMM*, Msgr. Bernardine was well pleased with the news. Since the attempt of this ecclesiastical authority to establish a religious community at Puthenppally had failed, he was very much disheartened about the possibility of starting a new convent for religious women. Now Fr. Leopold is approaching him with the active support and involvement of Fr. Chavara¹ who had been proved

¹See our comment in *WFF*, Chapter One, No. 1.1.2.2.2. A *Comparative Study between CKC and CMM*.

himself to be an able spiritual guide and administrator. This fact seems to have influenced in Msgr. Bernardine's approval for starting a new religious community for women. Indeed, he was well pleased. He agreed to make the new community as the branch of the Carmelite Third Order and provided them its rule in order to be translated.

CKC mentions some new elements in the response of the Ecclesiastical Authority. The one, who formerly had demanded that the sisters should be settled in a convent well built with a compound wall as high as 13 feet, now did not object to make them settle in a house of bamboo mat (*panambumadam*).

Both *CMM* and *CKC* mention a providential happening. The document was indeed the rule for the lay Carmelite Third Order! When it was brought into the attention of Msgr. Bernardine, he took it as grace to start the lay Carmelite Third Order for those who keep the Carmelite rule while living with their families. Then he gave the Carmelite *Regola* in order to be translated. However, in *CTC* writings we come across different views concerning the issue of the constitution.

2.1.2. The Issue Concerning the Constitution

2.1.2.1. Texts

| Author's Name | Book's Name | Year | Theme: Constitution |
|--------------------------|--|------|---------------------|
| (No Author is mentioned) | <i>Varapuzha Kanyakamadom Oru Charithra Samgraham</i> (Mal.) | 1940 | No mention of it |

| | | | |
|------------------------|--|------------|--|
| Bro. Leopold | <i>Rev. Sr. Thresia Vaippisseryude Charitram</i> (Manuscript Mal.) | After 1940 | Fr. Leopold wrote to Europe and brought the constitution of the sisters of the convent at Genova and modified it according to the situations of this place. That was signed by Archbishop Bernardine as the founder and given to these women. Moreover, from that convent it was needed for these new members different advices and suggestions. According to the circumstances all these were given and made clear to them by Fr. Leopold (Page 116). |
| Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC | <i>Mother Eliswa</i> (Mal.) | 1990 | From the convent of the Carmelite 2 nd Order of Genova in Italy, Msgr. Bernardine brought their constitution, modified that according to the situations of this place, signed it, and entrusted that to Fr. Leopold. The first members are trained according to this constitution. The novice master was Fr. Leopold. At times, the superior of Genova convent gave the practical instructions (Page, 35). |
| Sr. Pulcheria CTC | <i>Theresian Karmalitha Sabha Innuvare</i> (Mal.) | 1999 | Fr. Leopold taught these sisters about the regulations of life, the rules need to be obeyed and the way to live in the presence of God always etc. Later, he brought the constitution from the convent of Genova in Italy and modified it according to the situations of this land and gave to them (Page,13). |
| Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC | <i>C.T.C Sabhayude Shapana Charitram</i> (Mal.) | 2004 | Msgr. Bernardine brought the constitution for them from the convent of Genova in Italy and modified it according to the situations of this land, translated in Malayalam and entrusted to Fr. Leopold (Page, 13). |

2.1.2.2. Comments

As the table makes it clear, the first document *Varapuzha Kanyakamadom Oru Charithra Samgraham* is silent about the constitution. As per Bro. Leopold and Sr. Pulcheria, Fr. Leopold brought the constitution from Genova and he modified it and gave to the sisters. But according to Sr. Prescilla, Msgr. Bernardine brought the constitution from Genova and he himself modified it and translated and

entrusted to Fr. Leopold. If one evaluates these views according to the original documents cited above, it is evident that Msgr. Bernardine gave the rule to Fr. Leopold and told him to translate. There is no evidence in the above mentioned documents that the rule was brought from Genova. The Chronicles only say that the rule that gave first was that of the lay people and when it was informed to the Archbishop, he gave the rule that of the sisters. Closing eyes to these original sources how can one make stories as he/she wishes? It is interesting to note down the additional story of Sr. Prescilla that the Superior of the convent at Genova gave practical advices to the sisters at Koonammavu in due course. The reader should not forget that it happened in the second half of the 19th century.

These authors do not speak anything about the contributions made by mother Eliswa in the formation and the evolution of the lifestyle of the early members. Not only that Bro. Leopold was brave enough to make Msgr. Bernardine as the founder of women TOCD.

2.1.3. Construction of *Panambumadam*

2.1.3.1. The Land of *Panambumadam*

2.1.3.1.1. Texts

In *CMM*:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>... ഇവിടെ ഒരു വിധവയും 14 പ്രായമുള്ള ഒരു മകളുമുണ്ട്. ആ പെൺപൈതലിന്റെ അപ്പന്റെ പകുതിക്കുള്ള വസ്തുക്കളുമുണ്ട്... ഈ അമ്മയെയും മകളെയും കൂടെ അവരു പാർത്തുവരുന്ന തറവാട്ടിൽ നിന്നും മാറ്റി അവരുടെ പറമ്പുകളിൽ ഒന്നിൽതന്നെ ഒരു സ്ഥലമുണ്ടാക്കിയിവരെ രണ്ടുപെരെയും കൂടെ അതിൽ പാർപ്പിച്ചു... അങ്ങനെയിതി</p> | <p>...Here there is a widow and her 14-year-old daughter and has half of the properties of her father.... The mother and the daughter can be shifted from their ancestors' house and made to settle down in another house constructed in one of their own properties.... Being so,</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>ക്കയിൽ ഇവരുടെ വസ്തുവും ഇവരെയും വിചാരിച്ചുവന്ന ഈ പെൺ പൈതലിന്റെ എളയപ്പൻ വരിയ്ക്കതൊമ്മൻ എന്നവനെ മുപ്പച്ചൻ വരുത്തി തിരക്കിയപ്പൊൾ കണ്ട ആ കടങ്ങളാക്കെയും ഇവിടെ നിന്നും തീർത്തു കൊള്ളാമെന്നും അവർക്ക് ഒരു ചെറിയ പുര ഉണ്ടാക്കണമെന്നും ആയതിന് നീ തന്നെ ചെയ്യിക്കണമെന്നും പറഞ്ഞതിനാൽ അവനും അപ്രകാരം അവന്റെ കെട്ടിയവളും ഏറ്റം ഭക്തിക്കാരായിരിക്കയാൽ ഇതിന്നു നൽകനസ്സുവച്ചുസാഹിച്ചു. എങ്കിലും പണം എടുപ്പാൻ കൈയിൽ പാടില്ലായ്കയാൽ ദീർഘമായി കിടന്നു (CMM II, 73-75 [124-126]).</p> | <p>Mooppachan brought and inquired (about it), the paternal uncle of the girl, Varika Thomman, who was taking care of both the mother and her daughter and their properties; and said that all the debts will be cleared from here and asked to build for them a small house by himself. He and his wife, being very pious people, tried for it with great interest, but as they had no money with them, it was prolonged.</p> |
|---|--|

In CKC:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>...മേലെഴുതിയവരുടെ ആയിട്ട് ഏതാനും നിലം പുരയിടങ്ങളും ആയതിനോടുകൂടി ഏതാനും കടങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടെങ്കിലും ആ വക ഒക്കെയും അന്നായുടെ എളയപ്പൻ ആയ നമ്മുടെ പ്രൊക്കുറാറ്റർ തൊമ്മൻ എന്നയാൾ അന്വേഷിച്ച യിവരുടെ ചിലവും നടത്തി വരികയാൽ അയാൾ ദീനക്കാരനാകയാലും കടങ്ങൾക്ക് അധിക പലിശയാകായാലും ഒടുക്കം എല്ലാം തീർന്ന് കടം ശേഷിപ്പാനും ഇടവരും എന്ന അവസ്ഥയിൽ ആകയാലും ഇപ്പൊൾ ആയവനിൽ നിന്ന് ഇത് വെർ തിരിച്ച് ആ വക പറമ്പിൽ ചെറുതായി ഒരു സ്ഥലം ഉണ്ടാക്കി ആയതിൽ ഇവരെ രണ്ടുപേരെയും കൂടി പാർപ്പിച്ചാൽ... അതിനകത്ത് മേലെഴുതിയ തൊമ്മനോടു മുപ്പച്ചൻ കല്പിച്ച ഒരു സ്ഥലം ചെറുതായിട്ട് ഉണ്ടാക്കുവാനും ആയതിന് സഹോദരി അന്നായുടെ വലുപ്പന്മാരായ പൈലി, പാപ്പു ഇങ്ങനെയുള്ളവരും കൂടി ഉത്സാഹിക്കണമെന്നും</p> | <p>The above mentioned (mother and daughter) had as their own some land and paddy fields; although there were some loan on the property, Anna's uncle and our Procurator, Thomman was looking after the properties and providing for their living. As he was sick and the interest on the loan was mounting up and at the end possibility was there to lose the properties, remaining only debts, it was decided to separate this property from him and to make a small house in one of those lands and if both of them would be made to live there.... Meanwhile Mooppachan requested the above-mentioned Thomman to make a small house and for that, he also asked Pailee and Pappu, the elder uncles of Anna to take interest in it.</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>കല്പിക്കയും മുപ്പച്ചൻതന്നെ ചുറ്റിനടന്ന് ഒരു സ്ഥലം കണ്ട് ബോധിച്ച് എന്നാൽ ആ സ്ഥലത്തിൽ നിന്നും പള്ളിയിൽ വരുന്നതിന് ഏറിയ ചുറ്റുവഴിയും കൊട്ടുവള്ളി മുതലായ സ്ഥലങ്ങളിൽ നിന്നും വരുന്ന ആളുകളുടെ നടപ്പും ആകയാൽ ചുരുക്കുള്ളതും വെടിപ്പുള്ളതും ആയ പുത്തൻ വഴിയിടണം എന്നും നിശ്ചയിച്ച് ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ കാവ്യനായിരുന്ന മുതലാളിയെ വരുത്തി പറഞ്ഞ് അയാളുടെ പറമ്പിനകത്തുകൂടെ വഴിയിട്ടു കൊൾവാൻ അനുവാദം വാങ്ങിക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു. എന്നാലും ഇതൊക്കെയും നടത്തുവാൻ തൊമ്മൻ എന്നവൻ നൽമനസ്സുണ്ടെങ്കിലും കയ്യിൽ പണം ഇല്ലായ്കയാലും മേലെഴുതിയ മറ്റുവർക്ക് തെളിഞ്ഞ മനസ്സില്ലായ്കയാൽസഹായിക്കയില്ലെന്നു തന്നെയല്ല മനസ്സായി നടക്കുന്ന തൊമ്മനെ കൂടെ പരിഹസിക്കയും ചെയ്തുവരികയാലും നടപ്പുകേടായി കിടക്കയിൽ ... (CKC I, 4-6).</p> | <p>Mooppachan himself walked around the land, searched, and found a suitable place for the construction. However, from there to the church the way was long and winding. Besides, it was also the pathway of the people who were coming from villages of Kottuvally etc. Therefore, in order to make a short and cleaned pathway, Mooppachan got permission from the owner of a nearby property to make the path to the church along his land. Even though, Thomman had the goodwill to do all these, he had no money and others mentioned above, would not have the goodwill; therefore, not only, not help but also teased Thomman who was willing to do it, consequently the work was fall flatted...</p> |
|--|--|

2.1.3.1.2. Comments

We have already dealt with the questions raised by Sr. Sucey in her thesis concerning the property of Anna in *AUSW* page 116-121. Now we restrict ourselves to make certain comments on cited texts from *CKC* and *CMM*.

CKC and *CMM* state clearly that *panambumadam* was built on the property set aside for Anna. It was Fr. Leopold who started the process. He called Thomman the uncle of Anna (her father’s brother) who was looking after the land and asked him to get the help of the elder uncles of Anna in constructing the building. Fr. Leopold searched and found a proper place for it and got permission from the owner of a nearby property to make a path along his land. But the building construction did not proceed as expected, since

Thomman had no money with him and other uncles did not co-operate at all, but even tried to discourage Thomman.

CMM adds a further detail. Fr. Leopold promised Thomman that the debts on the property will be paid from Koonammavu Monastery (*ഇവിടെ നിന്നും* - from here).² Even then, the building construction did not proceed as expected because of the reasons cited in *CKC*.

2.1.3.2. God’s Providential Hand

2.1.3.2.1. Texts

Text One:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>1866-ാം കാലത്തിന്റെ തുടക്കം ഒരാൾക്കു ഉത്തരിപ്പിനായി ഏതാനും രൂപാ വന്നിരുന്നത് കൊടുത്തപ്പൊൾ അവൻ ഇതിന്നു ധർമ്മമായിട്ട് 10 രൂപാ തരികയും മറ്റു വഴി 8 ഇങ്ങനെ ഇതുകൊണ്ട് തുടങ്ങി. പനമ്പും തെങ്ങുംകൊണ്ട് മൂന്നു മുറിയും ഒന്ന് ഊട്ടു മുറിയും ഒന്ന് പ്രാർത്ഥന സ്ഥലവും ഇങ്ങനെ തിരിച്ചുണ്ടാക്കി... ഇതിനിടയിൽ ചിലയാളുകളെ നാട്ടു മര്യാദയിലുള്ള പലിശലാഭം ഇതിനെ തിരക്കുവാനായിട്ട് കല്പന പ്രകാരം കൂടിയതിൽ ആലപ്പുഴ എലഞ്ഞിക്കൽ മത്തായി 25 ഞായർക്കൽ മാളിയക്കൽ 15,</p> | <p>In the beginning of the year 1866, a person given as donation Rs.10/- out of an amount which is given to him as <i>uttarippu</i> (<i>ഉത്തരിപ്പ്</i>). With that and Rs. 8/- got from some other source, work on the house was begun. With bamboo mat and coconut tree, three rooms, a prayer hall and a dining room were made separately.... In the meantime, as it was asked a meeting of money lenders was held in order to inquire about the charging of the rate of interest. In this</p> |

²The words of Fr. Leopold implied that the fathers of the Koonammavu monastery were involved in the construction of *panambumadam*. They were willing to pay the debts. In the Account book regarding the debt over the patrimony of Sr. Anna, thus written: *സ. അന്ന അവകാശം വക വസ്തു മം വകയ്ക്ക് എഴുതി ഒഴിഞ്ഞതിന്നു കരം പിഴ പീസും മുൻ ഈ വസ്തുപ്രമാണിച്ചുണ്ടായിരുന്ന പല വക കടം ഉത്തരിപ്പിന്നും ആയി ചിലവു രൂപ 400* (Page 1). “In order to hand over to the convent the property that was in the name of Anna, the tax fee and the expense for clearing the debts over that property was Rs. 400/-”

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>ഇങ്ങനെ ഏതാനും വകയും അർത്ഥംകൽ ചെത്തിയിൽ പുത്തൻ പുരയ്ക്കൽ വസുധൻ എന്ന ഒരു ഭക്തിക്കാരൻ ലാസർ എന്നവന്റെ അനുജൻ എന്ന ഇവരുടെ നൽമനസ്സാൽ 300 രൂപയും ഈ പുണ്യശുദ്ധ: കുർബ്ബാനയുടെ ആരാധനയ്ക്കായി വന്നപ്പൊൾ കൊണ്ടുവന്നു. ഇതൊക്കെയും കൊണ്ട് പട്ടാങ്ങയായ അഗതിത്വം പൊലെ ഒരു സ്ഥലമുണ്ടാക്കി (CMM II, 75 [126]).</p> | <p>context, Mathew Elanjickal of Alleppey donated Rs. 25/- and Maliakal of Njarakal gave Rs. 15/-. Thus got some amount and Lazar the brother of a pious person, Chethiyil Puthenpurackal Vasyan of Arthunkal had the good will to bring Rs. 300/- when they came for the adoration of the Blessed Sacrament. With all these, a place proper for the truly penniless persons was made.</p> |
|--|--|

Text Two

CKC:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>ദൈവകൃപയാൽ ഈ സ്വരം ചിലരു കെട്ടും ചിലരൊട് പെ.ബി.മുപ്പച്ചനും പ്രിയോരച്ചനും പറഞ്ഞും ഇങ്ങനെ ഏതാനും ധർമ്മം കിട്ടുകയും ചെയ്തു. ഇതിനാൽ തൊമ്മന്റെ ഉത്സാഹത്താൽ നമ്മുടെ അമ്മകർമ്മെൽ ദൈവമാതാവിന്റെയും പിതാവായ ശു. മാർ യൗസേപ്പിന്റെയും വിവാഹം തിരുനാൾ സമീപിച്ച 1866 മകരത്തിൽ ഈ ചെറിയ പനമ്പുരം ത്തിന് വെല തുടങ്ങി. പുത്തനായിട്ടുള്ള വഴിയും വെട്ടി തെങ്ങും പനമ്പുരം കൊണ്ട് ഒരു സ്ഥലം 3 മുറിയും 1 പ്രാർത്ഥന സ്ഥലവും ഒരു ഊട്ടുമുറിയും ആയിട്ടും പുറവെലിയും അടക്ക വെലിയും തീർപ്പിക്കയും ആ പറമ്പിൽ പാർത്തിരുന്ന അപ്പുരാ എന്നയാൾ വെച്ചിരുന്ന ഒരു ചെറിയ പുരയുണ്ടായിരുന്നതിനെ 6 രൂപ കൊടുത്ത് വാങ്ങിച്ച്</p> | <p>By God's providence and grace, some had heard of it and to some others both Mooppachan and Priorachan told about it and thus got some donations. Therefore, through the strenuous efforts of Thomman, in the month of January of 1866 when the feast of the wedding of our Mother of Carmel and our Father St. Joseph was approaching, the work of this humble bamboo mat convent was begun. A new pathway was made. With the stem of coconut tree and bamboo, a small house was built. Three rooms for members, one prayer room, and one for refectory were made. An external fence around the compound and another one to demarcate the enclosure were also made. In addition, later a small room for kitchen was bought. The little house made by Avarah, who lived in the compound was bought</p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>കുസീഞ്ഞായിട്ട് ആസ്ഥമാക്കി... എങ്കിലും മുപ്പച്ചനും പ്രിയൊരച്ചനും പല ദിവസവും വരികയും പണി അന്വേഷിക്കുകയും പ്ര. തൊമ്മൻ അല്ലാതെ മറ്റാരും ഉത്സാഹിക്കായ്കയാകയാൽ കുറ്റപ്പെടുത്തുകയും ഇങ്ങനെയുള്ള കുറ്റപ്പാടാൽ ചിലരു വരികയും നൊക്കുകയും ചെയ്യും (CKC I. 6-7).</p> | <p>for six rupees and converted into a kitchen.... However, Mooppachan and Priorachan came there on several days and inquired about the work. On finding that only the procurator Thomman was taking the interest, he rebuked them. So, some of them too came and looked into the work.</p> |
|---|---|

2.1.3.2.2. Comments

By God’s providence and grace (ദൈവകൃപയാൽ) the news for starting a convent was spread out. Both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara took initiative³ and collected alms with which the construction of the *pananbumadam* started on 1866 *Makaram*.⁴

CMM gives more details about the alms received from different people. The work on *pananbumadam* started from the alms Rs. 10/- + 8/-. The further contributions by Alappuzha Elanjikkal Mathai Rs. 25/-, Maliekkal of Njarackal Rs. 15/-, The brother of Lazer Arthumnkal Chethiyil Puthenpurackal Vasyan Rs. 300/-.

³The mention of the name of Fr. Chavara together with Fr. Leopold is indeed important. He was actively involved before the construction of the convent. As witness both *CMM* and *CKC* he himself took initiative in collecting alms. In this light it is unfortunate to reduce the role of Fr. Chavara that of a helper (cf. *SGME*, 184-185), administrator (*SGME*, 240) and overseer (*SGME*, 240). See our comments in *AUSW*, 98, 103, 105-106).

⁴In *CKC* Fr. Chavara connects the date with the feast of marriage between God’s Mother of Carmel and Father St. Joseph.’ It seems that this mention points to the charism of devotion to Mary and Joseph. Also it is not wrong to assume the part played by Fr. Chavara in cultivating this charism. Otherwise it would not have been mentioned.

Both *CKC* and *CMM* give details about the facilities provided in the *panambumadam*. Three rooms for members, one prayer room, and one for refectory were built with the stem of bamboo and coconut tree (*പനമ്പും തെങ്ങും*). Moreover, later a small room for kitchen was bought for Rs. 6/-. Thus Fr. Chavara calls the convent: “A place proper for the truly penniless persons” (*പട്ടാങ്ങയായ അഗതിത്വം പൊലെ ഒരു സ്ഥലം*).⁵

2.1.3.3. Furnishing the *Panambumadam*

2.1.3.3.1. Texts

Text One:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>കുറേം 13 ചൊവ്വാഴ്ച അഞ്ചു മണി വെളുത്ത ഉടൻ പ്രി. ദല: മുപ്പനും കൂടെ വെണ്ടിയതൊക്കെയും തൽക്കാലമായിട്ട് നമ്മുടെ പുതുസന്യാസികളുടെ നൊവിസ്യോത്തിൽ ഇരുന്ന ഉണർത്തു മണിയും കൊന്തക്കുരു, കൊടിൽ, കമ്പി, കത്രിക, സൂചി, നൂൽ, കനുവെത്തി, മഷി കുപ്പി, തുവൽ, കടലാസ്, ആണി, ചുറ്റിയൽ, വിളക്ക് ഉന്തരണ, പസ്കികൾ, മരക്കുരിശുകൾ, ഹന്നാൻവെള്ളം, പണുങ്ങാൻ കൊപ്പ, മണ്ണുതംപെര, കൈൽ, കാർപ്പ, കറിക്കെത്തി, മൺകരകം, കൂശ, ശേഷവും കൊണ്ടു പോയി. ഞങ്ങൾ തന്നെ ആസ്ഥമാക്കി ചമെച്ചു. മൂന്നു മുറിയിലും കട്ടിലും, പായും പുതപ്പും, ചെറിയ മേശ, വംകും ഒക്കെയും ആസ്ഥമാക്കി കഴിഞ്ഞപ്പൊൾ ... (<i>CMM II, 75-76 [126]</i>).</p> | <p>Tuesday, 13th February, early in the morning at 5 o'clock both Prior and Mooppachan together, taking what is necessary from our novitiate – rising bell, rosary-beads, nippers, thin wire, scissors, needle, thread, a pen knife, inkpot, quill, paper, nails, hammer, lantern, framed pictures, wooden crosses, holy water, porcelain cups and tumblers, ladle, fork, knife, pitcher and goblet and other things....We ourselves placed everything in order. A cot, mat, blanket and a small table were put in each of the three rooms. When thus arranged every thing....</p> |

⁵This designation for the convent thus given by Fr. Chavara, in which he could find the realization of his cherished dream for the habitation of God’s poor. The term *അഗതിത്വം* (agathithuam) which is pregnant with biblical insights defies translation. Does not this fact shed light to the vital role played by Fr. Chavara in the foundation of women TOCD?

Text Two:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>13-ാം നു ചൊവ്വാഴ്ച അഞ്ചു മണി വെളിപ്പിനുതന്നെ ബ. മുപ്പച്ചനും പ്രിയൊരച്ചനും കൂടി ഈ പനമ്പുമാത്തിൽ വന്ന് ആയതിൽ ഞങ്ങൾ വച്ചിരുന്ന വസ്തുക്കൾ സൂക്ഷിച്ചു കിടന്നിരുന്ന ആളുകളെ അച്ചന്മാരുതന്നെ വിളിച്ചുണർത്തികൊണ്ടു വസ്തുക്കൾ എന്തല്ലാമെന്നും എത്രയൊ നുണുക്കുമായ കാര്യങ്ങളും ബ. മുപ്പച്ചന്റെ ബോധത്തിൽവെച്ച് അന്വേഷിച്ചു എന്നും എല്ലാം എഴുതികാണിപ്പാൻ പാടില്ല. ഏതാനുമൊക്കെ കാണിക്കുന്നു. കൊട്ടും ഉണർത്തും ഉള്ള ഒരു നാഴികമണിയും നമസ്കാരം ധ്യാനം, തീൻ, വെല, ഉണർച്ച യിങ്ങനെയുള്ള നെരത്തിൽ കൊട്ടുവാൻ ഉള്ള തവളെത്ത എന്നുപറയുന്ന മരമണിയും. മുറികളിൽ ഹനാൻ വെള്ളം എപ്പഴും ഉണ്ടാകുവാനും മുറിയിൽ കടക്കുമ്പോഴും മുറിയിൽനിന്നു പുറപ്പെടുമ്പോഴും എപ്പഴും തൊട്ട് നെറിമെൽ പിരട്ടി കുരിശു വരപ്പാനായിട്ട് എല്ലാമുറികളിലും മററും ഈ വെള്ളം വൈപ്പാൻ ഒരൊ പാത്രവും ആയത് എത്തുംപൊൾ (തീരുമ്പോൾ) ഒക്കെയും പള്ളിയിൽനിന്നു വരുത്തുവാനായിട്ട് വെള്ളനിറമുള്ള ഒരു ബൊത്തലും (കുപ്പി) അതിൽ നിറച്ച ഹനാൻ വെള്ളവും ഒരൊ മുറിയിൽ ഒരൊ മരംകൊണ്ടുള്ള കുരിശും മററും പസ്കിരുപങ്ങളും പ്രാർത്ഥനാമുറിയിൽ കർത്താവിന്റെയും ദൈവമാതാവിന്റെയും മാർ യൌസെപ്പിതാവിന്റെയും പസ്കിരുപങ്ങളും, പുറത്തെ പടിക്കൽ തറക്കുന്ന പലകയും അടക്കപ്പടിപ്പുരയിൽ തറച്ചിരിക്കുന്ന പലകയും ഒരൊ</p> | <p>On 13th Tuesday early in the morning at 5 o'clock itself Rev. Mooppachan and Priorachan came to the bamboo mat house and woke up the men who were sleeping there, guarding the things we had kept there. Then they went around seeing to all the things needed in the house. What minute things Mooppachan had kept in mind and had accomplished, cannot all be written here. Yet we list a few things: a clock that strikes the hours and sounds the alarm, a wooden clapper to announce the time for prayer, meditation, food, work, rising etc., a vessel of holy water was placed in the rooms in order that there would be always holy water in the rooms, to make the sign of the cross with it on the foreheads, whenever one entered or left the rooms, a white bottle to bring the holy water from the church to fill the vessels when the water got over was also kept there filled with holy water. There was a wooden-cross kept in each room and some framed pictures. In the prayer room were framed pictures of Christ, our Mother Mary and Joseph. The wooden board to be fixed at the outer gate and the wooden board, which was fixed at the gate, house of the enclosure. A small table and a bench were there in</p> |

മുറിയിൽ ഒരൊ ചെറിയ മേശയും ചെറിയ വംകും (ബഞ്ച്) ഉട്ടുമുറിയിൽ ഇരിപ്പാനും തിമ്മാനും നീളമുള്ള വംകും മേശയും തിമ്മാനുമുള്ള പട്ടുങ്ങാണികളും (പിഞ്ഞാണം) കഞ്ഞി മൊര എടുപ്പാനുള്ള വലു കൊപ്പകളും ഉപ്പും കുറികളും എടുപ്പാനുള്ള ചെറിയ കൊപ്പകളും വെള്ളം കുടിപ്പാനുള്ള മൺതംപ്ലേറ്റുകളും (ഗ്ലാസ്) കയിൽ (തവി) കാപ്പുകളും മുഖം കഴുകുന്നതിനും മററും കുശുകളും (കുജ) (കക്കൂസ പീലാത്ത) ഇതിന്റെ വാതുക്കൽ കൊണ്ടുപോയി വൈപ്പാനുള്ള അടയാള പലകളും അവിടെ പെരുമാറുവാനുള്ള മൺകരകങ്ങളും ഒരൊ മുറിയിൽ ഒരൊ വെദൊപദേശം, ചരിത്രജ്ഞാ നൊപദേശം, ദിവ്യമാതൃക, ജീവിതക്രമം യിങ്ങനെയുള്ള പുസ്തകങ്ങളും എഴുതുവാൻ മഷിയും കുപ്പിയും തുവലുകളും അതിനെ ചെത്തുവാൻ ചെറിയ കനുവെത്തിയും (കത്തി) കടലാസു വരൊപ്പാൻ കൊലും ചുംബും (പെൻസിൽ) കുസ്തുരവെല ചെയ്യാനുള്ള തിന്ന, ഒരു പെട്ടി സുശികളും ഉണ്ടുനൂൽ. പാസ്തനൂൽ. പട്ടു നൂൽ മഞ്ഞനൂൽ റൊശി നൂൽ കറുപ്പുപട്ടുനൂൽ കത്രികകളും പിച്ചാത്തിയും നാരായവും കൊന്ത കെട്ട്, മുളളരിഞ്ഞാണം കെട്ട് ചെയ്യാനുള്ളതിന് കമ്പികളും കൊടിൽ മുറിവിളക്. ആകമാനമായി രാത്രിയിൽ നില്പാൻ ഉന്തരണവിളക്കു (റാന്തൽ വിളക്) കത്തിപ്പാൻ മെഴുകു റൊളും പ്രാർത്ഥനമുറിയിൽ രണ്ടു കത്തി സാളും (തിരിക്കാൽ) മെഴുതിരിയും കുറിക്ക് വെട്ടുവാൻ വലു പിച്ചാത്തിയും സൊപ്പു (തോട്ടം) ഞാക്കുവാൻ വെണ്ടി, റൊസപ്പു, പനീർപ്പു, മുല്ലപ്പു, ഗൊങ്ങാണിപ്പു, കർദ നാൾപ്പു, മക്കിപ്പു, ഭംഗപ്പാടുപ്പു,

every room. In the refectory to sit and eat there were a long bench and table and porcelain plates to take food, big bowls to take *kanji* and buttermilk, small bowls for salt and curries, earthenware tumblers to drink water, spoons and forks, basins to wash our faces etc. were arranged. Privy, stools, the signboards to be kept at their entrance, earthen karakams to be used there, were also kept. In each room, there were books such as Catechism, Historical Advices of wisdom, sacred model and rules for a holy life. Ink, ink-bottles and quills to write, a small knife to sharpen the quills, a scale and pencil to draw lines on paper, for sewing a box of needles, ball thread, card thread, silk thread, yellow and violet colour thread, black silk thread, pairs of scissors, pen knife, stylus, wire and pliers to make rosary and penitential girdles. Bedroom lamps, a lantern to be used in common in the night, wax rolls to light lamps. Two candle – stands and candles in the prayer room. A kitchen knife was there to cut the vegetables. In order to make a garden young plants of rose, jasmine, Konkani, makhiflowers, passion flowers, Four o'clock flower, bishop's button, etc. and a small spade to plant them in flower pots or elsewhere. There was a long thick strand of thread

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>നാലുമണിപു, വാടാമല്ലിപു ഇങ്ങനെയുള്ള പൂ തൈകൾ പൂചട്ടിയിലും മററും അതിനെ നടുവാൻ ചെറിയ തൂമ്പായും വിളക്കിലിടുവാൻ പിണ്ടിനൂലും പല ദിഷ്ടതികൾക്കായി പഴതുണികളും വെണ്ടിയതിനെ എഴുതി കൊടുത്തയപ്പാനും വരുത്തുവാനുമായിട്ട് രണ്ടു താക്കോലുള്ള ഒരു ചെറിയ പെട്ടകവും അതിൽ ഒരു താക്കോൽ മുപ്പച്ചന്റെ മുറിയിൽ വച്ച് ഒന്ന് ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി സൂക്ഷിപ്പാനും ദിഷ്ടതിയാക്കുന്നത് എഴുതി അതിൽ വച്ചു പൂട്ടി താക്കോൽ എടുത്തു കൊൾവാനായിട്ട് ഒന്ന് പെട്ടിയുടെ മീതെ കെട്ടിയിരുന്ന കൊച്ചുപെട്ടിയും വെന്തിഞ്ഞ കുത്തുവാൻ ദർശനചീല രൂപചീലകളും ശേഷവും ഇങ്ങനെയുള്ളതൊക്കെയും കൊണ്ടുവന്നതുമല്ലാതെ അവരുടെ കൈകൾ കൊണ്ടുതന്നെ ഞങ്ങൾ വരുന്നതിനു മുൻപിൽ ഇതൊക്കെയും ക്രമപ്പെടുത്തി ഞങ്ങളിൽ ഓരോരുത്തർക്കായി നിയമിച്ച മുറികളിൽ കട്ടിലും പായും വിരിച്ച് ഒരൊ കുറുത്ത നിറമുള്ള പുതപ്പുകളും കട്ടിലുമെന്തെ വിരിച്ചും എല്ലാവർക്കും കൂടെയുള്ള വെല വസ്തുക്കളായ ആകമാന വസ്തുക്കളും ജ്ഞാനവായന മേശവായനക്കുള്ള പുസ്തകങ്ങളും ഇങ്ങനെയുള്ളതൊക്കെയും ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയുടെ മുറിയിലും വച്ച് 9 മണി ആയപ്പോൾ ഇതൊക്കെയും ക്രമപ്പെടുത്തി ഞങ്ങൾക്കു ആളയക്കയും ചെയ്തു (CKC I, 10-12).</p> | <p>to make wicks for the lamps. Pieces of old cloth that may be useful for some purpose or other. In order to write and inform whatever in need of and to get it there was a chest with two keys. One key has to be kept in Moopachan's room and the other to be kept by the Superior. In addition, whenever they needed something, it was to be written and placed in the chest, locked and the key removed and kept by them. There was a small box kept tied up, on top of the first box. There were brown cloth and cloth imprinted with the image of Mary and other things necessary to make scapulars. They had not only brought all these things but also arranged them with their own hands before we arrived. In the rooms apportioned for each one, there was a cot with a mat spread out on it and covered with a black sheet. The things to be used in common by all for common work and the common books for spiritual reading and refectory reading and all such other things were kept in the Superior's room. After having finished all these arrangements by 9 o'clock, they sent someone to call us.</p> |
|--|---|

2.1.3.3.2. Comments

Fr. Leopold together with Fr. Chavara looked into the minute details of the things needed for the new convent. They

prepared them and brought from Kochi the cloth needed for the religious habit.

They have found out an unmarried servant named Eliswa of 26 years old who was the neighbour of Eliswa and Anna and the relative of the father of Anna. On Monday 12th of February, Mooppachan heard the confession of Eliswa, Anna and Thresia as well as the helper Eliswa. On 13th Tuesday early in the morning at 5 o'clock both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara came to the *panambumadam* and they themselves arranged all things. *CMM* mentions that a number of utensils and other things were brought from the Koonammavu novitiate. This fact illustrates the active involvement, cooperation and help of the members of Men TOCD at the very beginning of the life in *panambumadam*.⁶

2.1.3.4. Regarding the So called *Documentum Erektionis*

In CTC writings different stories are formed as happened on 12th February 1866 contrary to the Chronicles. The table below shows some examples of them.

⁶Unfortunately we could not find the details in *CMC Chronicles (CKC)* which is cited by Sr. Suzy in *SGME* 127-128, such as the initiative taken by Msgr. Bernardine in starting the religious life in *panambumadam*: “it was the idea of Archbishop Bernardine, one of the members of the first Order of Carmelites, planned to send them to a bamboo mat convent for this initial stage of their congregation. In this way, Archbishop was following the exhortations of St. Teresa of Avila concerning the great religious counsel of poverty. It would appear that, Archbishop wished to check the ability of the sisters to live the vow of poverty, since they belonged to such a rich family....Once the trial period was over, Archbishop Bernardine decided to receive the sisters as members of the new religious congregation.”

2.1.3.4.1. Texts

| Author's Name | Book's Name | Year | Theme: Erection of the Convent |
|--------------------------|--|------------|--|
| (No Author is mentioned) | <i>Varapuzha Kanyakamadom Oru Charithra Samgraham</i> (Mal.) | 1940 | Since the desire of the candidates who were under the guidance of Fr. Leopold is proved as stable by the subsequent events, in 1866 January Msgr. Baccinelli officially erected the first TOCD convent in Kerala in the name of Mother Teresa. On the 13 th of next month, by giving religious habits to Eliswa, Thresia and Anna, the Latin members as well as Clara from the Syrian Rite, they were received as the members of the convent (page, 6). |
| Bro. Leopold | <i>Rev. Sr. Thresia Vaippisseryude Charitram</i> (Manuscript Mal.) | After 1940 | In 12 th February 1866, those three women came to this house. Rev. Fr. Leopold blessed that house. V. Rev. Bernardine Baccinelli of St. Teresa, according to the authority that he had received from the definitor general of OCD in 1860, officially established the TOCD for women in Kerala and received those three women as its foundation stones in 12 th February 1866 (Page 123). |
| Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC | <i>Mother Eliswa</i> (Mal.) | 1990 | Using the authority from the definitor general of the Order of Discalced Carmelites in 1860 and as the Provincial of the Discalced Carmelites in Malabar, Msgr. Bernardine on 12 th of February 1866, officially received these three women into Carmelite Congregation (Page, 36). |
| Sr. Pulcheria CTC | <i>Theresian Karmelita Sabha Innuvare</i> (Mal.) | 1999 | Fr. Leopold blessed the newly built bamboo mat convent. This holy act was taken place on 13 th February 1866. On that day itself, Msgr. Bernardine by the authority received from the Definitor general of the Order of Discalced Carmelites in 1860, officially founded the Third Order of Discalced Carmelite Congregation for the women of Kerala. By giving the decree <i>Documentum Erectionem</i> , Eliswa, Thresia and Anna were received as the official members of this Congregation (Page, 12). |
| Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC | <i>C.T.C Sabhayude Stapana Charitram</i> (Mal.) | 2004 | The work of bamboo mat convent was finished in February. On 12 th Monday, Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli officially received Eliswa, Thresia and Anna to the Carmelite Congregation. On 13 th Tuesday, after the meditation, prayer and Holy Mass in St. Philomina's church Koonammavu, through the specially prepared way came to the convent with father, mother and other relatives (Page, 12-13). |

2.1.3.4.2. Comments

According to this chart, the book *Varapuzha Kanyakamadam Oru Charithra Samgraham* points out that the official erection of the convent took place in January 1866, and the life in *pananbumadam* started in February 13th. Whereas for Bro. Leopold and Sr. Mary Prescilla, the official erection took place in 12th February 1866. However, for Sr. Pulcheria, the official erection was in 13th of February itself by giving the decree *documentum erectionem*.⁷ These different expressions themselves question the veracity of such claims. If something like that was happened, in January or February, it should have definitely mentioned in the Chronicles, both of *CKC* and *CMM*. In addition, the document might have preserved in the archives, since the early members were taught to keep up everything related to their convent for the sake of the future generation even what they felt then as unnecessary.

2.1.4. Thresia as the Third Member

During this period God's providence brought a new member to the fold who aspired to lead a chaste life.

⁷ Sr. Sucey depending on all these writings thus puts it: "Archbishop had received special authority from the General of the Discalced Carmelite Order to establish new religious congregations as the Third Order of the Discalced Carmelites. He in virtue of his office officially accepted Eliswa, Anna and Thresia into the Third Order of the Discalced Carmelite Sisters (TOCD) on Monday, February 12, 1866, by issuing the *Documentum Erectionis*" (*SGME* 128). The first volume of our study *AUSW*, 90-91 had made a critical evaluation of this statement, and hence we do not want to repeat it here.

2.1.4.1. Chronicles About the Coming of Sr. Thresia

2.1.4.1.1. Texts

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>രണ്ടു കാലം മുമ്പിൽ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി ഏലീശായുടെ കുടപ്പിറപ്പായിരുന്ന സഹോദരി ത്രെസ്യോ 16 വയസ്സായി വിവാഹം ചെയ്യുന്നതിനു പറഞ്ഞാറെ ഈശോമിശിഹായോടു കൂടെയുള്ള മണവാളത്തമല്ലാതെ ഭൂലോകവിവാഹം വേണ്ട എന്നും ഉപേക്ഷിച്ചു പാർത്തിരിക്കുന്നതിനാൽ അവളേയും ഇതിൽ ചേർക്കത്തക്കവണ്ണം മനസ്സായിരിക്കുന്ന വിവരം ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ അവളുടെ അപ്പനെയും വരുത്തി പറകയും ചെയ്തു... 10-ാം തീയതി ശനിയാഴ്ച തന്നെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി ഏലീശായുടെയും സഹോദരി ത്രെസ്യായുടെയും അപ്പൻ അമ്മ ഒന്നായിരിക്കയാലും യിവരുടെ കുടപ്പിറപ്പ് ജൂവിസ് എന്ന ഒരു പൈതൽ കുനമ്മാവു കൊവെന്തയിൽ ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നതിനാലും സഹോദരി ത്രെസ്യയെയും കുട്ടിക്കൊണ്ട് അപ്പനും അമ്മയും മറ്റു ചില കുടപ്പിറപ്പുകളും കൂടെ വന്നു സഹോദരി അന്നായുടെ അപ്പന്റെ വീട്ടിൽ ഇവരോടുകൂടി താമസിച്ചു... (CKC I, 7-8).</p> | <p>Two years before, our superior Eliswa's own sister, Sr. Thresia as she was sixteen years old, asked to be married, she refused it saying, without being the spousal relationship with Jesus did not want an earthly marriage and thus she was living. Mooppachan called her father and informed him that it is willed to take her also in in the convent.... On 10th Saturday itself since the parents of superior Eliswa and sister Thresia were same and their brother Louis (young one) was in the monastery, father and mother along with other children (<i>koodappirappukal</i>) brought Thresia and stayed at the house of the father of Sr. Anna.</p> |

In the margin of the text, a further detail has been added:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ത്രെസ്യ എന്ന പെൺ മുപ്പച്ചൻ എസ്കൊള അന്വേഷണത്തിനായിട്ട് കരുത്തടത്ത് ചെന്നപ്പൊൾ ഒരാൾ കുമ്പസാരിച്ചു... ഈ പെണ്ണത്രെ അവളുടെ ഹൃദയ അപേക്ഷ... (CKC I, 7).</p> | <p>The girl called Thresia, when Mooppachan went to Karuthedath for school matters a person made her confession... This same girl, her heart's request...</p> |

2.1.4.1.2. Comments

Thresia was 16 years of old and did not want to get married. She insisted that she wanted to accept Christ as her only Bridegroom.

Fr. Leopold met her during his journey to Karuthedeth for the cause of a school. Thresia made her confession to him and disclosed the desire of her heart to Moopachan. Then Fr. Leopold agreed to take her as a member of the proposed religious community and sought the permission of her father. Accordingly, the parents came to Koonammavu with Thresia in the company of their children. They allowed Thresia to live with Eliswa and Anna in the house of the father of Anna. This took place on Saturday, 10th February 1866. It is worth notable that *panambumadam* was blessed on 13th February 1866. Thus, the above-mentioned stay of Thresia along with Eliswa and Anna prolonged only three days before becoming a member of the *panambumadam*.

2.1.4.2. The Issue of Stay of Thresia

Just opposite to the views of the *Chronicles*, most of the CTC books bring up the story of the so called stay of Sr. Thresia along with mother Eliswa and Anna either at *kalappura* or at home itself in Koonammavu before 13th February 1866.

2.1.4.2.1.Texts

Five texts have been mentioned in the chart below.

| Author's Name | Book's Name | Year | Regarding the Stay of Sr. Thresia Along with Eliswa and Anna |
|--------------------------|--|------------|--|
| (No Author is mentioned) | <i>Varapuzha Kanyakadam Oru Charithra Samgraham</i> (Mal.) | 1940 | After the death of her husband, the change that took place in Eliswa and the pious life that she followed thereafter were matter for deep thought for Thresia. Even though she could not believe in the beginning, those changes in her elder sister, at the end, Thresia understood the reality and she came to Koonammavu to follow the pious life of her sister. By the passage of time, she started to live with her elder sister. After some time, the life of these sisters along with the sister's daughter Anna attained the lifestyle of that in a convent (Page, 3). |
| Bro. Leopold | <i>Rev. Sr. Thresia Vaippisseryude Charitram</i> (Manuscript Mal.) | After 1940 | At last, either due to the constant request of Eliswa or due to the mediation of Fr. Guyomar, their uncle and the secretary of the Archbishop, somehow, Thresia got permission to stay at the house of her elder sister. This was their second step to the great things that God was intending to make do with these souls. By the arrival of Thresia, there was a new spirit of piety (<i>daivabhakthi</i>) (Page 111) |
| Sr. Mary Precilla CTC | <i>Mother Eliswa</i> (Mal.) | 1990 | Attracted to the pious lifestyle of Eliswa and Anna, Thresia wished to live with them. With the help of Fr. Thomas Guyomar, their uncle and the secretary of Msgr. Bernardine, she got permission from her parents and thus Thresia also started to live with Eliswa. By the arrival of Thresia a new spirit was filled in that house (Page, 8) |
| Sr. Pulcheria CTC | <i>Theresian Karmelitha Sabha Innuvare</i> (Mal.) | 1999 | Once, Thresia happened to go to the house of Eliswa and stayed there for two days. She experienced heavenly peace and joy there. She conveyed to her parents about her wish to live there. But they refused it. At last, with the intercession of Fr. Thomas Guyomar, their uncle, and the request of Eliswa, she got the permission from her parents to stay there (page, 8). |

| | | | |
|------------------------------|--|------|---|
| Sr. Mary Prescilla CTC | CTC <i>Sabhayude Sthapana Charitram</i> (Mal.) | 2004 | The calm and peace that were shining in the God oriented life of her elder sister and her daughter attracted Sr. Thresia also. When Thresia was 12 years old, itself she felt disinterest in married life. She came and started to live in the <i>kalappura</i> . The lifestyle that began in the leadership of Eliswa successfully moved forward. With the arrival of Thresia, a new spirit is emerged in this community of three members (Page, 8). |
|------------------------------|--|------|---|

2.1.4.2.2. Comments

All these texts claim that Thresia was attracted by the lifestyle of Eliswa and Anna and came to Koonammavu to stay with them.⁸ However, according to *CKC*, even after joining the *panambumadam* community, Thresia had homesickness and could not take food:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>സഹോദരി ത്രേസ്യ ഇന്നലെ ഏറെ ഏതും തിന്നില്ലെന്നും അമ്മയെ കാണാതെയും ഈ പ്രായത്തിനകത്ത് അമ്മയുടെ ചാറെ നിന്ന് ഒരുദിവസവും മാറിയിട്ടില്ലായ്കയാലും കുറെ ക്ലേശം പോലെയുണ്ട്. അപ്പോൾ സഹോദരി ത്രേസ്യ തന്നെ പറയട്ടെ, ഇപ്പോൾ എങ്ങനെ എന്നും ചോദിച്ചതിന് അമ്മയെ ഓർക്കുമ്പോൾ ക്ലേശം വരും. നീക്കി കളയുന്നുണ്ട് പിന്നെയും വരും...(CKC I, 13).</p> | <p>Sister Thresia had eaten almost nothing yesterday and that she had some difficulty since she had never kept herself away from her mother, not even for a single day. Then it was asked, ‘Let sister Thresia herself say, how she feels now’, she said, ‘when think about the mother, feels some difficulty, then try to set it aside, but comes again...’</p> |

Readers should not forget that these were the very words of Thresia herself and mother Eliswa, her elder sister with whom she was staying for months and years according to CTC writings. Eliswa herself claims that it was for the first time that Thresia was staying away from her mother. Therefore,

⁸Similar assertions also seen in the book of Dr. Sr. Gracious CTC ed., *Mother Eliswa Person, Vision and Spirituality, The Foundress of CTC*, Teresian Carmel Publications, Edappally, 2004, 27.

she could not eat well. In addition, when asked to Thresia she confessed the same. “When I think of my mother I feel some difficulty. But I am trying to set it aside.” Mooppachan consoled her saying that these feelings are normal; he too had such homesickness for the first three months at monastery etc. In the light of such facts one may wonder about the veracity of the statements of above mentioned books such as Eliswa, Anna and Thresia gave form to a community life of devotion, prayer and silence, staying at home/*kalappura*. The Chronicles also attest that it was on 10th February 1866 that Thresia arrived at Koonammavu.⁹

2.1.5. Ceremonies of the Erection of *Panambumadam*

2.1.5.1. Texts

Text One:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>...ഒക്കെയും ആസ്ഥമാക്കി കഴിഞ്ഞപ്പൊൾ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയും 2 കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളും, ഒന്ന് സഹായക്കാരത്തിയും ഇവരു പള്ളിയിൽ ശുദ്ധ:കുർബ്ബാനയും കൈക്കൊണ്ട് ആസ്ഥമായി നില്ക്കയിൽ മുൻ പറഞ്ഞിരുന്ന വണ്ണം ആളയച്ചു. അപ്പൊൾ ഇവരുടെ മാംസസംബന്ധക്കാരായ സ്ത്രീജനങ്ങളൊടു കൂടെ പള്ളിയിൽ നിന്നും പുറപ്പെട്ട് ഇവർക്കു നടന്ന് പള്ളിയിൽ വരുവാനായിട്ട് പുത്തനായിട്ടുണ്ടാക്കിയ വഴിയിൽ കൂടെ നടന്നു. ഒരു കൂട്ടമായിട്ട് ഇനി കാണാൻ പാടില്ല. എന്നതിനാലുള്ള സങ്കടക്കാരും പലർ ഇങ്ങനെ വന്ന് അടക്കവെലിക്കകത്ത് സ്ത്രീജനങ്ങൾ എല്ലാം കടന്നു. ഇവർ പ്രാർത്ഥനസ്ഥലത്തെ പൂക്കുകുമ്പിട്ടു കുറെ നമസ്കരിച്ചു</p> | <p>...When all was ready, someone was sent as informed earlier to call the mother Superior, the two sisters and the helper who were waiting in the church after receiving Holy Communion. Then accompanied by women who were their blood relatives, started from the church, walking through the new road that was made for them to come to the church. Some were grieved by the thought that they would not be freely seen again. They had all entered the fenced compound. Then they (three) knelt down in the prayer hall and prayed for some time. After that Mooppachan, wearing</p> |

⁹ CKC I, 8.

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>ശേഷം മുപ്പച്ചൻ സൂർപ്പെലിസും ഉററയും ഇട്ടിരുന്ന് മരണത്തൊളം ഈ മാത്തിൽ പാർത്ത് കന്യാവ്രതം അഗതിത്വം ചൊൽവിളി എന്ന ഈ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പും കാർത്തു ജീവിപ്പാൻ മനസ്സാകുന്നോ? എന്നുള്ളതിനെ ചൊദിച്ചശേഷം ക്രമം പൊലെ ചെറിയ സ്കപ്പുളാരും കൊടുത്തു തെദെവും ഞാൻ സുറിയാനിയിലും അച്ചൻ ഉത്തീനിലും പാടിയശേഷം ഇരുന്നുകുറെ ഗുണദൊഷങ്ങളും പറഞ്ഞും വച്ചശേഷം സ്ത്രീജനങ്ങളെ പറഞ്ഞയച്ചും വച്ച് മണിക്കുചരക് കൊടുക്കുന്നതും മറ്റും കാണിച്ചു കൊടുത്തു. എന്നാൽ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മയുടെ മകൾ സഹൊദരി അന്നാ ശേഷം ഒക്കയിലും ബുദ്ധിയും വിവെകവും ധൈര്യവും ഉള്ളതാകയും ഇതൊക്കെയും വേഗത്തിൽ പഠിക്കുന്നു. 11 മണിക്കകത്ത് എല്ലാം കഴിച്ച് ഞങ്ങൾ പൊന്നു. (CMM II, 76-77 [126-127]).</p> | <p>surplice and stole came in and calling them one by one asked them whether they were willing to live in this convent until death keeping the vows of virginity, poverty and obedience, he proceeded according to the prescribed form and ended by giving them each the small scapular. After singing the <i>Te Deum</i>, I (Priorachan) in Syriac and father (Moopachan), in Latin, sat down and gave some good advices. Then the other women were sent off and showed them how to string the beads etc. Sr. Anna, the daughter of the superior, being more intelligent, prudent and courageous than others, was learning the things very quickly. By 11 o'clock, we finished everything and returned.</p> |
|--|--|

Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>....ആൾ വന്ന ഉടനെ ഞങ്ങൾ മുവരും സഹായക്കാരത്തിയും ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി ഏലീശായുടെയും സഹൊദരി ത്രെസ്യായുടെയും അമ്മയും സഹൊദരി അന്നയുടെ എളയപ്പൻ #ല്യപ്പന്മാരുടെ കെട്ടിയവളുമാരും മറ്റും ചാർച്ചക്കാരും സ്നേഹമുള്ളവരുമായ പല സ്ത്രീജനങ്ങളൊടുകൂടെ പുത്തനായിട്ടുള്ള വഴിയെ ഞങ്ങൾക്കുള്ള പുത്തൻ ഉടുപ്പൊടുകൂടെ പള്ളിയിൽനിന്നു പുറപ്പെട്ടപ്പോൾ പലരും പുറപ്പെട്ടു എങ്കിലും പുറത്തുള്ള പടിക്കകത്തു പുരുഷന്മാർക്കു കടന്നാൽ 3 മാസത്തെ പള്ളി പ്രയ</p> | <p>...As soon as the person arrived we three and the helper started, accompanied by the father and mother of superior Eliswa and Sr. Thresia, the wives of the uncles of Sr. Anna and other relatives and many women friends. We walked through the new pathway with our new clothes. Many started with us from the church; but not all entered in, seeing the written board that 'if men enter inside the gate, would be given public</p> |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>ശ്രീതന്ത്രം എന്നു എഴുതി തറച്ചിരിക്കയാൽ ആരും കടന്നില്ല. തങ്ങളും അനുവദിച്ചിരുന്ന ആളുകളോടുകൂടെ വന്ന് മുൻപിൽ തന്നെ പ്രാർത്ഥനമുറിയിൽ കടന്നു രൂപത്തുകൽ തങ്ങൾ മുട്ടുകുത്തി കുറെ അപേക്ഷിച്ചശേഷം മുപ്പച്ചൻ സൂർപ്പളെസും ഊറാരയും ഇട്ട പ്രിയൊരച്ചനുമായിട്ട് പ്രാർത്ഥന മുറിയിൽ വന്നു അപേക്ഷിച്ച് കുപ്പായം മുത്തിയശേഷം ചൊല്ലുവാനുള്ളതും ചൊല്ലി ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി തുടങ്ങി മൂന്നു പേർക്കും റൊയിശ നിറമുള്ള ചെറിയ സ്കപ്പുളാരിയും ഉടുപ്പിച്ച് ഹനാൻ വെള്ളവും തളിച്ച ശേഷം മുപ്പച്ചൻയിരുന്ന് കുറെ ഗുണദോഷങ്ങളും പറഞ്ഞ ശേഷം വന്നവരെ ഒക്കെയും പറഞ്ഞയച്ച് വീണ്ടും അല്പമായിട്ട് താമസിച്ച് ഒരൊ ക്രമങ്ങളും മറ്റും പറയുകയും സഹൊദരി അന്നയെക്കൊണ്ട് നാഴിക മണിക്ക് ശരടുകൊടുപ്പിച്ചും മറ്റും കാട്ടിതന്ന് അന്ന് പൊകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC I, 7-8; 12-13).</p> | <p>Church penance for three months.’ We, along with those who were permitted, first entered the prayer room, knelt before the Lord, and prayed for some time and after that Mooppachan wearing the surplice and stole along with Priorachan came to the prayer room. Soon we prayed and kissed his scapular. Father said the prayers that were to be said and starting with the superior three of us were clothed with a small brown scapular and sprinkled holy water on us. After this Mooppachan sat down and gave us many instructions. Then sent back, the people who came. Again stayed back and said about our rules and other things. Sr. Anna was shown to wind and set the string of the hour clock and went back that day.</p> |
|--|---|

2.1.5.2. Comments

According to both *CMM* and *CKC* Fr. Leopold, the Provincial Delegate officiated the ceremonies of erection of *panambumadam* along with Fr. Chavara. According to *CMM*, the celebrant began the ceremony by asking the question: ‘do you will to live in this convent until death keeping the vows of virginity, poverty and obedience?’). *മരണത്തൊളം ഈ മഠത്തിൽ പാർത്ത് കന്യാവ്രതം, അഗതിത്വം, ചൊൽവിളി എന്ന ഈ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം കാർത്തു ജീവിപ്പാൻ മനസ്സാകുന്നോ?* As the candidates affirmed their willingness, Fr. Leopold gave them the scapular and Fr. Chavara sang the *Te-Deum* in Syriac (*lak alaha*) and Fr. Leopold in Latin. There followed exhortations by Fr. Leopold according to *CKC* and in *CMM* the name of

the adviser is not mentioned. Then sisters were instructed how to keep the rules and regulations.¹⁰

2.1.6. Clara as the 4th Member

2.1.6.1. CKC Text one

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>11-ാം തീയതി തന്നെ പ്രിയോ രച്ചൻ അറിവിച്ചിരുന്നതിനാൽ സഹോദരി ക്ലാര ഇതായത് സുറിയാനിക്കാരായ വൈക്കത്തു പള്ളി എടവകയിൽ പുത്തനങ്ങാടിയിൽ കൊച്ചുവർക്കി വൈദ്യൻ എന്നയാളാൽ പിറക്കപ്പെട്ട ഏലീശാ എന്ന് പേരുമിട്ട 14 വയസ്സിൽ വിവാഹം കഴിച്ച് പത്ത് വത്സരം ഭർത്താവോടുകൂടെ ജീവിച്ചശേഷം 24-ാം വയസ്സിൽ ഭർത്താവു മരിച്ച് 13 വത്സരം വൈധവത്തിൽ ആങ്ങള ഇസഹാക്ക് വൈദ്യൻ എന്നയാളോടുകൂടെ സ്വന്തവീട്ടിൽ പാർത്ത് പള്ളി സമീപമാകയാൽ നിയ്യവുമായുള്ള കുർബ്ബാനകളും അടുകെയുള്ള കുമ്പസാരം കുർബ്ബാന എന്ന കൂദാശകൾ കൈക്കൊണ്ടും പാട്ടുപോലെയുള്ള ധ്യാനനമസ്കാരങ്ങളും കഴിച്ചു വന്നിരുന്ന വിവരം പ്രിയോരച്ചൻ അറിഞ്ഞിരുന്നതിനാൽ ഈ അന്തസ്സിൽ ചേരുവാൻ മനസ്സുണ്ടെങ്കിൽ വരണമെന്നും ആ പള്ളിയുടെ വിഗാരി അച്ചൻ വഴിയായി അറിവിച്ചിരുന്നതിനാൽ അപ്രകാരം വരുന്നതിന് നിശ്ചയിച്ച വർത്തമാനം മറ്റു കൂടുപിറപ്പുകളും സംബന്ധക്കാരും അറിഞ്ഞ് പല മുടക്കുകളും തടവു</p> | <p>On 11th itself, as Priorachan had informed, Sr. Clara, that is, the daughter of a Syrian Catholic called Puthenangady Kochu Varkey Vaidhyan who belonged to the parish of Vaikom and her name was Eliswa; She was given in marriage at the age of 14 and after living 10 years with her husband, at the age of 24 her husband died and for 13 years as widow, she lived with her brother in her own house. As the church was nearby, she used to attend Holy Mass, received the Sacraments of Confession and Communion frequently, and was leading a life of prayer and meditation according to her knowledge and understanding. Since Priorachan knew this, he informed her through the parish priest of Vaikom, that if she would desire to embrace this new state of life, to come. When others heard about her decision to come so, her own people and her relatives said many</p> |

¹⁰In citing the ceremonies from CKC Sr. Suzy has not done full justice to the original document. She has added with it her own interpretations (cf. SGME, 129-131).

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>കളും പറഞ്ഞെങ്കിലും ആയത് ഒന്നും എടുക്കാതെ ധൈര്യപ്പെട്ടതിനാൽ എളയപ്പൻ ആയിരിക്കുന്ന പുത്ത. ഇടുപ്പ് എന്നയാളും മെലെഴുതിയ വിഗ്രഹി അച്ചനും കൂടെ സഹായമായി. വെണ്ടുതൊക്കെയും കൊണ്ടുവന്നു എങ്കിലും ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ ഒരിക്കലും കണ്ടറിവില്ലായ്കയാൽ ഒന്നുരണ്ടു കുറികുമ്പസാരക്കൂട്ടിൽ വന്നു ചോദിച്ചു പറഞ്ഞ അറിഞ്ഞതല്ലാതെ ഇപ്പൊൾ നിശ്ചയിച്ചു പറവാൻ പാടില്ലായ്കയാൽ പുറത്ത് ഒരു വീട്ടിൽ താമസിപ്പാൻ കല്പിച്ചു. ഇതിനാൽ കുറെ സങ്കടവും യിളക്കവും തൊന്നി എങ്കിലും ചൊൽ വിളിയിൽ ഉറച്ചു പാർത്തു (CKC I, 8-9).</p> | <p>objections and hindrances, she did not heed them but dared, she came with her younger paternal uncle Puthenangady Ittoop and the parish priest as help bringing all the necessary things. However, since Rev. Mooppachan had never seen and known her before, besides being without interviewed her once or twice at the confessional, he could not make a decision immediately. Therefore, he asked her to stay in a house outside. This caused much sorrow and disturbance. Yet held firmly on to obedience.</p> |
|---|---|

2.1.6.2. CKC Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>14-ാം തിയതി ബുധനാഴ്ചതന്നെ മുപ്പച്ചൻ മെലെഴുതിയിരിക്കുന്ന സഹോദരി ഏലീശായെ വീണ്ടും കുമ്പസാരക്കൂട്ടിൽ വിളിച്ച് കുമ്പസാരവും പരീക്ഷയും കഴിച്ച് ശു. കുർബാനയും കൊടുത്തശേഷം ..നിങ്ങൾക്കു ഒരു സഹോദരികൂടെ വന്നിരിക്കുന്നു ആയതിനെ കൈക്കൊൾവാൻ നിങ്ങൾക്കു മനസ്സുണ്ടോ ഇനി നിങ്ങളുടെ കാര്യം നിങ്ങൾ തന്നെ പറയണം. മറ്റു സഹോദരികൾ ഉണ്ടാകണമെന്നും നിങ്ങൾക്കാഗ്രഹമുണ്ടോ എന്നും ചോദിച്ചതിന് ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മ ഉത്തരിച്ചതായത്. ഇപ്പൊൾതന്നെ സഹോദരി ത്രെസ്യായും അന്നായും കൂടെ നമുക്കു ഒരു കൂടെപ്പിറപ്പുകൂടെ ഇന്നു വരുമായിരിക്കും എന്നും മുപ്പച്ചൻ കല്പിച്ചിരുന്നുവല്ലോ. ആയതു കണ്ടില്ലല്ലോ എന്നും പറഞ്ഞുകൊണ്ടിരുന്നു. ഞങ്ങൾക്ക് ഒരു കൂടെപ്പിറപ്പുകൂടെ ഉണ്ടാകു</p> | <p>On 14th Wednesday itself, Mooppachan called the above-mentioned sister Eliswa to the confessional and again heard her confession and examined her and gave her Holy Communion. ... “One more sister has come for you. Are you willing to receive her? Now you yourself have to speak about matters concerning you. Do you desire to have more sisters?” To this question, the superior replied: “Just now Sr. Anna and Sr. Thresia were saying that Mooppachan had said that one more sister would be coming today, but has not yet come. We are very happy to have one</p> |

നന്നു അത്രയും സന്തോഷമല്ലോ എന്നും പറഞ്ഞതിനെ ഉടൻ പ്രിയൊരച്ചനൊടും പറഞ്ഞു അവരെ വിളിപ്പിച്ചു. ഉടൻ സഹൊദരിയും മെൽ എഴുതിയ എളയപ്പനും പെട്ടി പാ മുതലായത് എടുത്തും കൊണ്ട് ഒരാളും ആയിട്ടു പുറവെലി കടന്നുവന്ന് അടക്കവെലിയുടെ പടിക്ക് പുറത്ത് എളയപ്പൻ നിന്നുകൊണ്ട് സഹൊദരിയെയും കൊപ്പും അകത്തോട്ട് ആക്കിയശേഷം വന്ന് മുപ്പച്ചന്റെ കുപ്പായം മുത്തി മുട്ടുകുത്തി നിന്നപ്പൊൾ ഇവർക്ക് ശുശ്രൂഷ, ചെയ്തുകൊണ്ട് മരിപ്പൊളും യിവിടെ പാർപ്പാൻ മനസുണ്ടോ എന്നും ചൊദിച്ചതിന് മനസായിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നും ഉത്തരിച്ചാറെ അപ്രകാരം മനസാകുന്നുവെങ്കിൽ ഈ പാവപ്പെട്ട എന്നെക്കൂടെ നിങ്ങളുടെ വേലക്കാരത്തി ആയിട്ടു കൈകൊള്ളണമെന്ന് ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയുടെ മുൻപിൽ മുട്ടുകുത്തി അപേക്ഷിക്ക എന്നു പറഞ്ഞവുടൻ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയും മറ്റു സഹൊദരികളും ഇരിക്കുന്നയിടത്തു ചെന്ന് ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയുടെ മുൻപിൽ മുട്ടുകുത്തി അപേക്ഷിച്ചപ്പൊൾ ഞങ്ങൾ പാവപ്പെട്ടവരും പിച്കാരും ആകുന്നു ഞങ്ങളിൽ ഒന്നു പോലെ കൂടപ്പിറപ്പിനെയും കൈകൊൾവാനും ദൈവം തരുന്ന ഭിക്ഷ നാം കൈക്കൊണ്ടു പാർപ്പാൻ നൽകുന്നതായിരിക്കുന്നുവെന്നും ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയും ഉത്തരിച്ച ശേഷം മുപ്പച്ചന്റെ മുനീൽ മുട്ടുകുത്തിച്ചു സകാപ്പുളാരിയും കൊടുത്ത് കൂട്ടുന്നതിന്നു തുടങ്ങിയപ്പൊൾ പെർ എന്തെന്നും ചൊദിച്ചു ഏലീശാ എന്നും കെട്ടാറെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയുടെയും സഹായക്കാരത്തിയുടെയും രണ്ട് പെർ ഇതുതന്നെ ആകയാൽ ആയത് മാറ്റിക്കൂറ എന്നു പെരുംയിട്ട് ത്രെസ്യം പുണ്യവാളത്തി അമ്മയുടെ മൂന്നാം സഭ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളുടെ കൂട്ടത്തിൽ ചെർക്കയും ചെയ്തു.

more sister.” At once, asked Priorachan and called her. Immediately the sister, with her above-mentioned uncle and another man who was carrying her box, mat etc. came passing through the outer gate, reaching the enclosure gate, her uncle waited outside sending the sister and her things in. She came, knelt down and kissed Moopachan’s scapular. When she was asked, “Are you willing to live here and serve these sisters till your death”? She replied that she was willing. If so, said Moopachan, ‘kneel before the superior and request her to receive this poor me as your servant.’ Immediately she got up and went to where the superior and other sisters were sitting. She knelt before the superior and made the request to her. Then the superior said; ‘we are poor beggars. We are willing to accept you sister as one among us and we are quite willing to live together on the alms God deigns to give us.’ After this, she was directed to kneel before Moopachan. When started to give the scapular, he asked her ‘what is your name?’ Hearing that it was Eliswa, which was the name of both the superior and the helper, he changed her name as Clara and received her into the third order of the

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>അപ്പോൾ മൂന്നു മുറിയും 3 കട്ടിലും മറ്റും മാത്രം ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നതിനാൽ, സഹൊദരി അന്നാ പാർത്തിരുന്ന മുറിയും കട്ടിലും സഹൊദരി ക്ലാരയുടെ പെരുമാറ്റത്തിനായിട്ട് നിയമിച്ചു. സ. അന്നാ ശ്രേ. അമ്മയുടെ മുറിയിൽ കൂടെ താമസിപ്പാനും. സ. ക്ലാര കൊണ്ടുവന്ന വസ്തുക്കളും മറ്റും ആകമാനമായിട്ട് ഒന്നായിട്ട് പെരുമാറണമെന്നും എന്റെ തന്റെ അയാളുടെത് എന്നു പറയാതെ വചനത്തിൽക്കൂടയും ഉപവിയും ആകമാനവും അറിവാൻ വേണ്ടി ഞാൻ പെരുമാറുന്ന മുറി ഞാൻ പെരുമാറുന്ന പൊതപ്പ്. സ. അന്ന പെരുമാറുന്ന തുണി യിങ്ങനെ വചനത്തിലും പ്രവൃത്തിയിലും ആയിരിക്കണമെന്നും കല്പിച്ചു (CKC I, 14-15).</p> | <p>sisters of St. Theresa. Then there were only three rooms, three cots etc. Sr. Anna's room, cot etc. were given for the use of sr. Clara. And asked Sr. Anna to stay with the superior in her room and to use the things that Sr. Clara was brought in common. In order to show their charity and commonness even in words, they were commanded not to say 'mine' 'yours' 'hers' etc. instead they were to say, 'the room I use' 'the cloth Sr. Anna uses' 'the bed sheet I use' etc. and that it should really be so in word and deed.</p> |
|--|---|

2.1.6.3. Text in CMM

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>അപ്പോൾ എന്റെ അറിയിപ്പിൻ പ്രകാരം വൈക്കത്തെ പുത്തനങ്ങാടിയിൽ വൈദ്യന്റെ മകൾ ഏലീശ എന്ന 27 വയസ്സുള്ള വിധവയും അവളുടെ എളയപ്പനുമായിട്ട് വന്നു. പെ: ബ: മുപ്പച്ചൻ പരീക്ഷകഴിച്ചു കൊള്ളാമെന്നും തൊന്നിയതിനാൽ 14ന് ബുധനാഴ്ച ആയതും കൂടി സഹൊദരി ക്ലാര എന്ന പെരും കൊടുത്തു... (CMM II, 77 [127]).</p> | <p>Then according to my intimation, the daughter of Puthenangady Vaidyan from Vaikom, a widow of 27¹¹ years old, came with her uncle. After V. Rev. Mooppachan tested and approved her, on 14th Wednesday she was accepted and given the name Clara....</p> |

2.1.6.4. Comments

We have already studied in detail the issue of Eliswa Puthenangady in *AUSW*, 92-93; 103-104 under the titles *Eliswa as 'Foundress'?* and *Concerning the Reception of Sr.*

¹¹There is a printing mistake here. Her age is not 27 but 39 according to *CKC I*, 203.

Clara. Hence, we do not repeat here the comments made there.¹² Rather we focus our attention on certain other facts.

Eliswa Puthenangady was a widow for 13 years. She lived with her brother in her family and led a spiritual life. Daily she attended the Holy Mass, frequently went for confession and received the Holy Communion. Further, she spent her life in prayer and meditation.

Fr. Chavara knew these facts. She may be a candidate waiting for the establishment of a religious community. Hence, he invited her to join the planned new religious community. As her brother and relatives heard that news, they tried their best to prevent her from becoming a religious. However, she courageously faced the challenges and came to Koonammavu to meet Fr. Chavara on 11th February 1866 along with the younger brother of her Father and the parish priest. Fr. Chavara's initiative to take Syrian women can be thus interpreted. The planned religious community was not meant exclusively for Latins. The fact that Fr. Chavara could take the decision to invite a new member Eliswa Puthenangady to join the community seems to indicate his active role in the foundation. To put it in other way, if mother Eliswa, Sr. Anna and Sr. Thresia were brought to the *panambumadam* through the instrumentality of Fr. Leopold, Sr. Clara was inspired to this state of life by Fr. Chavara. Just informing through the parish priest was enough for her to reach at Koonammavu indicates the closeness of the relationship that Fr. Chavara had not only with that Puthenangady family but also with the candidate Eliswa Puthenangady.

At the decision of the Provincial Delegate not to receive her immediately together with the three others into the

¹²There we have pointed out how Sr. Sucey has purposefully distorted the facts.

community,¹³ Eliswa Puthenangady felt sad and lightly hesitated since she was ardently and impatiently yearning for embracing the consecrated life all at once.¹⁴ Some may take the reaction of Eliswa: trouble or disturbance (യിളക്കവും) in a negative sense. But Fr. Chavara was honest to write the facts as it had happened then. It sheds light to his honesty and sincerity.

Still she accepted in obedience the decision (എംകിലും ചൊൽവിളിയിൽ ഉറച്ചു പാർത്തു). Fr. Leopold seems to have been testing the goodwill of Eliswa Puthenangady although he had made up his mind to accept her.¹⁵

Both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara came to the convent on 14th Wednesday at 4 pm. The Provincial Delegate had already asked Eliswa Puthenangady to be present there and asked Fr. Chavara to call her¹⁶ who had come along with her uncle with all the necessary things. She came and knelt before the Provincial Delegate who asked her whether she was willing to live there until death by serving the sisters. As Eliswa expressed her willingness, he asked Eliswa Puthenangady to approach and kneel before the mother

¹³For the probable reason for not admitting this candidate immediately see *AUSW*, 103.

¹⁴It is noteworthy that the chronicler (Fr. Chavara) was not hiding what had occurred then.

¹⁵*CKC* seems to imply that Fr. Leopold had informed the three sisters probably on 13th February that a new member will be joining their community. On 14th sisters Anna and Thresia were speaking that the new member had not yet come as said by Fr. Leopold (ഇപ്പോൾതന്നെ സഹോദരി ത്രെസ്യായും അന്നായും കൂടെ നമുക്കു ഒരു കൂടെപ്പിറപ്പുകൂടെ ഇന്നു വരുമായിരിക്കും എന്നും മുപ്പച്ചൻ കല്പിച്ചിരുന്നുവല്ലോ. ആയതു കണ്ടില്ലല്ലോ എന്നും പറഞ്ഞു കൊണ്ടിരുന്നു...) (*CKC I*, 14).

¹⁶See Sr. Sucy's comment on it (*SGME*, 189) and our comment in (*AUSW* 104).

superior and beg to receive her as their maidservant. The new candidate did it.¹⁷ Then mother superior said: we are poor people and beggars, we are ready to accept you as one of us (കുടുംബിനപ്പുറം – siblings) and allow you to live here by receiving the alms, which God provides. It seems that Fr. Leopold was making a final test to be confirmed about the genuineness of her call to lead a life of humility and the depth of her willingness to submit herself to a religious superior who was younger than she was.¹⁸ Hence the act of kneeling down does not need to be interpreted as part of the vestition ceremony,¹⁹ as well as the evidence of the position of mother Eliswa as the foundress as interpreted by Sr. Sucey and others.²⁰

Then the candidate knelt before the Provincial Delegate who vested her with the scapular and changed her name to Clara.²¹ The *CMM* has the following concluding sentence on the account on Clara: “Thus it began with four members and a servant” (ഇങ്ങനെ നാലുപേരും സഹായ ക്കാരത്തെയും ആയി തുടങ്ങി) (*CMM* II, 77 [127]). Can we interpret this statement thus: according to the thinking of Fr. Chavara, the religious life at *panambumadam* began with four members. By including the name of Sr. Clara in the list of the first members, it seems that Fr. Chavara indicates, a religious community is beyond family affairs; and it consists of persons called by God irrespective of Rites, languages and cultures.

¹⁷For the probable meaning of the gesture of kneeling down before mother Eliswa, see the comments in *AUSW*, 92-93.

¹⁸Mother Eliswa was then 35 years of old and Eliswa Puthenagady was of 39 years old. See FN 21 in page 92 of *AUSW*.

¹⁹*CKC* I, 66-67 gives a full account of the rituals of the profession ceremony of Sr. Mariam in which the novice is not said to have knelt before the mother superior Eliswa.

²⁰See for details *AUSW*, 92-93.

²¹We do not know why Sr. Sucey had omitted the date of joining of Sr. Clara, namely 14th February.

Therefore, in a strict sense one can say that by the arrival of Sr. Clara, the community at Koonammavu got more religious nature.

2.2. Construction of the New Convent

2.2.1. A Prophetic Utterance

2.2.1.1. Text in CMM

Although the life in the *panambumadam* started in a humble way, Fr. Chavara had a prophetic foresight on the future growth.

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| ഇനി തമ്പുരാൻ നിറവെറ്റും എന്ന് ശരണം. എന്നാൽ ഈ കെട്ടിയ ഓലയും പനമ്പും മാറാതെ തന്നെ പുത്തൻ മഠം ദൈവം നിറവെറ്റിതരും എന്നും എത്യശ്ചയാൽ പറഞ്ഞു അന്നു... (CMM II, 77 [127]). | Now on God will fulfill all. That is the hope. However, startlingly said that before the time come to change this bamboo mat and palm leaves, God will provide a new convent... |

2.2.1.2. Text in CKC

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| ഇതാ സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ തമ്പുരാൻ തന്റെ പ്രിയമണവാട്ടിയായ നമ്മുടെ അമ്മയുടെ അപേക്ഷയാൽ മാനുഷരുടെ സ്വന്തവംശത്തിൽ നിന്ന് മീതെയുള്ള ചെമ്പ്ലിപ്പാൻ ഈ അമ്മയുടെ മക്കളെന്ന ഒരു പെരുമാത്രം നമ്മുടെ മേൽ വിളിച്ചതിനാലുള്ള സ്നേഹത്തെ സ്പഷ്ടമായിട്ട് കാട്ടുവാനും നാമും നമ്മുടെ പിൻ വരുന്നവരും ലോകാവസാനം വരെ തന്റെ മേൽ നന്ദി കാട്ടി സ്തുതിപ്പാനുള്ളതിന്നു നമ്മെ അധികമധികമായിട്ട് കടപ്പെടുത്തുവാനായിട്ട് താൻ ചെയ്തു എന്ന അത്ഭുത വർത്തമാനത്തെ വായനക്കാരായ സഹോദരികൾ സൂക്ഷിച്ചു വായിപ്പാൻ എന്നാൽ ഇത് എഴുത്തുകാ | Here is a wonder that God Almighty has worked in answer to the prayer of His beloved spouse, our dear mother St. Teresa. This structure, which was otherwise beyond human capacity, has been made possible out of his great love for us, just because we are called her children. This is written in order that we and those coming after us may be greatly obliged to gratefully glorify God for this favour till the end of the world. May God enlighten the minds |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>രത്തിയായ എന്റെ വശക്കെടാൽ പ്രകാശിപ്പാൻ വശമില്ലാത്തതിനെ തങ്ങളുടെ വായനയിൽ സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ നിങ്ങളുടെ ബൊധത്തിൽ തെളിയിക്കട്ടെ. ഇതായത് മുൻ എഴുതിയിരിക്കും വണ്ണം 1866 കുംഭം 13 നു പനമ്പു മുറിയിൽ ശു. അമ്മയുടെ സ്കപ്പുളാരും തന്ന് ഞങ്ങളെ പാർപ്പിച്ചപ്പൊൾ ഈ പനമ്പും ഓലയും മാറിക്കെട്ടുവാൻയിടവരാതെ ഉറപ്പായിട്ടുള്ള ഒരു മഠം സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ ഉണ്ടാക്കി തരും എന്ന് ഒരു സന്തോഷവാക്കു പൊലെ നമ്മുടെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠന്മാരായ പെ.ബ. ദലഗാത്തച്ചനും പ്രിയൊരച്ചനും പറഞ്ഞതിനെ ഞങ്ങളും കെട്ടും എങ്കിലും ഈ പുഴുക്കളായ ഞങ്ങളുടെ അയോഗ്യതയിതിനിടവരുത്തുമൊ എന്നു നിരൂപിച്ചു എങ്കിലും മാനുഷരുടെ യോഗ്യതകൊണ്ടല്ലല്ലോ ദൈവം മാനുഷർക്ക് മനോഗുണം ചെയ്യുന്നത് പിന്നെയോ തന്റെ അറുതിയില്ലാത്ത സ്നേഹവും ഉദാരഗുണവും കൊണ്ടത്രെ എന്ന് നമ്മെ പകലിനെക്കായിലും വെളിച്ചമായി കാണിപ്പാനായിട്ട് യിതാ അപ്രകാരംതന്നെ ഒട്ടും ഒരും കൂടാതെ നിറവെറ്റിയിരിക്കുന്നു (CKC I, 45-46).</p> | <p>of the readers and make clear to them, what I, as an incapable writer, am unable to present adequately. That is, as written earlier, on 13th of February 1866, when we were given the brown scapular of Mary, our mother and started to stay in the bamboo mat house, our superiors very Rev. Fr. Delegate and Priorachan said as words of good wishes that ‘God will give a strongly built convent before it is time to re-thatch and renew the bamboo mat and palm leaves’. We too heard these words, but thought as unworthy worms that our limitations will not allow it to take place. However, in order to make us clear brighter than the day light that God does good to man not by counting on man’s merits but only out of His boundless love and generosity, God has done so without any change.</p> |
|---|---|

2.2.1.3. Comments

CMM recalls that Fr. Chavara had utter confidence in the Lord who is capable to do wonders. Hence he entrusted himself into the divine hands, after finishing the construction of the *panambumadam*. He was well aware of the scarcity of convenience of the convent which was made of palm leaf and bamboo mat. Fr. Chavara had a foresight that the Sovereign Lord will provide them a new convent. “God will give a strongly built convent before it is time to re-thatch and renew the bamboo mat and palm leaves.” Priorachan made this prophetic utterance on the first day itself of the blessing of the

panambumadam on 13th February 1866: ‘startlingly said that day’ (എത്യശ്ചയാൽ പറഞ്ഞു അന്നു).

Fr. Chavara’s trust about constructing a new convent had a heroic dimension. He was dreaming about it when he was finding very difficult to meet the day-to-day expenses of the convent. According to *CKC*, the prophetic utterance concerning a strongly built new convent was made by both Fr. Leopold and Priorachan.

2.2.2. A Hard Life

2.2.2.1. Texts in *CMM*

Text One:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| എന്നാൽ ഈ തുടങ്ങിയിരിക്കുന്ന വെല ഇതായത്: കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മഠവും അതിൽ മനസ്സായവരെ ചെർത്തുനടത്തുവാനും വകയില്ലാതെ വിചാരിച്ചു വരികയിൽ... (<i>CMM</i> II, 80 [129]). | But this work that has been started, that is: the convent and to make enter into it those who wish, seems difficult to proceed due to lack of money... |

Comments: There was no money. Priorachan had to worry how to provide the day-to-day sustenance for the sisters. In addition, he did not know how he could admit new candidates at such a pathetic situation. The words in the text make clear the wretched situation of the life of the sisters.

Text Two:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| ഇവരുടെ ഇപ്പൊൾ ഉള്ള കിടപ്പുവലിയ വിമ്മിഷ്ടത്തിന്റെതാകയാലും ഇതായത് പച്ച മുളയും പച്ച പനമ്പും വെള്ളത്തിലിടാത്തതെങ്ങും കൊണ്ടും ചമച്ചിരിക്കയാൽ ചിതലിന്റെ ഉപദ്രവവും കണികാരം കുത്തി പൊടിഞ്ഞു വീഴുകയും ആയതിനാൽ... (<i>CMM</i> II, 81 [130]). | Now their staying (in <i>panambumadam</i>) is that of great difficulty; that is, since it (the roof) was made by undried bamboo and <i>panambu</i> (bamboo mat) and coconut logs without putting into water, (it is) attacked by termites and eaten by moths.... |

Comments: Here Fr. Chavara gives concrete instances of the difficulties which the sisters had to bear in their life in *panambumadam*. They could hardly sleep during night because of the unbearable discomforts. In addition, they had to face the attack of termites since the roof was made by undried bamboo and *panambu* (പച്ച മുളയും പച്ച പനമ്പും) and coconut logs without putting in the water (വെള്ളത്തിലിടാത്ത

തെളി

2.2.2.2. Text in CKC

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>...മഴപെയിമ്പൊഴൊക്കെയും എല്ലാ മുറിയും ശൊർന്ന നനയും... (CKC I, 30).</p> <p>...ഒരു ദിവസം... ഞങ്ങളുടെ അടക്ക വെലിക്കകത്ത് പാമ്പിഴത്തിരിക്കുന്ന അടയാളംകണ്ടു ... പിന്നെയും പലപ്പോഴും അടക്ക വെലിക്കകത്ത പാമ്പിഴത്ത അടയാളം കാണുകയും ചെയ്തു... (CKC I, 16-17).</p> | <p>When it is rainy, the water will come leaking through the roof and the room will get wet....</p> <p>One day... we saw the trailing mark of a snake in our compound wall.... Again, in many times, we saw the trailing marks of snake in the compound wall...</p> |

Comments: As the text makes it clear, “the rain water will come leaking through the roof and the room will get wet.” On page 16-17, the chronicler narrates the incident of seeing a snake in the convent. Often snakes were seen inside the boundary fence of the convent.

2.2.3. A Firm Decision

All these facts pained the hearts of both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara. Therefore, they wanted to construct by all means a new convent with all the necessary facilities for the sisters.

2.2.3.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠക്കാര്യം കൊണ്ട് വിലപിടിച്ച കന്യാവ്രതമെന്ന പൂഷ്പം പനമ്പിൽ നട്ടിരിക്കുന്ന</p> | <p>Regarding the affairs of the convent - since the most precious flower of the vow of</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>തിനാൽ ആ മഠം വേണ്ടുന്ന പ്രകാരം പണി ചെയ്ത് നിറവേറ്റണമെന്ന് നമ്മുടെ ദെലഗാത്ത് ലെയോപ്പോൾദുച്ചനും ബ. പ്രിയോർച്ചനും എത്രയും വലിയ ജാഗ്രതയോടെ ഉത്സാഹിക്കുകയും... (Alochanapusthakam, 130).</p> | <p>chastity is planted in bamboo mat, our Delegate Fr. Leopold and Rev. Priorachan vigilantly and enthusiastically worked to finish the construction of that convent ...</p> |
|---|--|

2.2.3.2. Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ഈ ദിവസങ്ങളിൽ കഴിഞ്ഞ വലു നോയമ്പിന്റെ തുടക്കത്തിൽ പനമ്പുകൊണ്ടു വീടുണ്ടാക്കി കണ്ണൂരിൽ സ്ഥാപിച്ച കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കു ശീമരാജ്യത്തിലെപ്പോലെ മഠം പണി ചെയ്യിക്കണമെന്ന് ഞങ്ങളുടെ ദെലഗാർച്ചനും പ്രിയോർച്ചനും വിശേഷ മനസ്സുണ്ടായി... (Alochanapusthakam, 139).</p> | <p>On these days, for the sisters who were put to stay in panambumadam with much difficulties in last great Lent, our Fr. Delegate and Priorachan wished in their good will to construct a convent as in foreign countries.</p> |

2.2.3.3. Comments

The above-mentioned texts attribute the initiative for the new convent both to Fr. Leopold and Priorachan (vigilantly and enthusiastically worked; wished in their good will). However, according to Sr. Sucey, it was Archbishop Bernardine who “decided to construct a solid and secure convent for the newly founded congregation and entrusted this responsibility to Fr. Leopold.”²² Unfortunately, we could not find any document, which could corroborate her argument.

Alochanapusthakam refers only to the Archbishop’s involvement in building a very well furnished (ഒക്കെയിലും

²²SGME, 134.

വിശേഷമായി) monastery for the Latin men religious at Manjummel.²³

2.2.4. The Construction Process

2.2.4.1. Land of the New Convent

By referring to certain documents both in *SGME* and in *PTSS* Sr. Sucey holds that Fr. Guyomar the uncle of mother Eliswa has donated the plots for the new convent. We have raised objections in *AUSW*, 119-121 about the documents cited by her.²⁴

We would like to summarize some of them. Sr. Anna a close relative of Fr. Guyomar does not even mention his name in the Chronicles written by her. The name of Fr. Guyomar does not appear in the list of benefactors mentioned in *CKC*. Let us now study the content of the three original documents

²³“But the great Father, Archbishop and Rev. Philip Mooppachan were with much fervor desiring to build the monastery at Manjummel for the Latins and were conducting the works...” (എന്നാൽ വലിയപിതാവും മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചനും പെ.ബ. പീലിപ്പോസ് മുപ്പച്ചനും എത്രയും ഏറ്റിക്കപ്പെട്ട താൽപര്യത്തോടെ മഞ്ഞുമ്മൽ ലത്തീൻകാർക്കായി ഒക്കെയിലും വിശേഷമായി കൊവേന്തപ്പണി ചെയ്യിക്കുന്നതിനായി ആഗ്രഹിച്ചു കൊണ്ട് ആയതിന്റെ പണി നടത്തിവരികയും....) *Alochanapusthakam*, 131.

²⁴In *PTSS*, 54 and 66 Sr. Sucey cites the names of Salvador Vareed Thannikottu, Joseph TOCD, Bro. Leopold. Regarding Salvador Vareed Thannikottu, see our comments in *AUSW* page 171 under the title *Poem, A Historical Document?* On the historical irrelevance of the manuscripts of Bro. Leopold, cf. *AUSW*, 61-64 titled as *Manuscripts of Bro Leopold*. We agree that Fr. Joseph TOCD was more close than Bro. Leopold. (He was born, in 1851; joined in the seminary in 1869 May; became member of Manjummel monastery on 26th April 1874; was ordained on 28th October 1874: Ref. *Memorial of 150th Anniversary of Koonammavu Parish* page 155.). But we could not find any document which attests that Fr. Guyomer has contributed the land for the new convent.

which are cited in *AUSW*, namely *CMM* II, 84-85 [132], *CKC* I, 20 and *CKC* I, 44.

2.2.4.1.1. Text in *CMM*

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>എന്നാൽ നമ്മുടെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ പനമ്പിനകത്തു കിടക്കയാൽ പല സൗഖ്യക്കെടുകളും വരുന്നതിനാൽ വേഗത്തിൽ ഉറപ്പായിട്ട് ഒരു സ്ഥലമുണ്ടാക്കുവാൻ ബ: മുപ്പച്ചൻ താല്പര്യപ്പെട്ടു. എന്നതിൽ നമ്മുടെ കുനമ്മാവു കൊവേത വകയായിട്ട് സമീപിച്ച ഒരു പറമ്പുണ്ടായിരുന്നതിനൊടു കൂടെ മറ്റു രണ്ടു പറമ്പും കൂടെ ചെർത്താൽ നല്ലതെന്നും വെച്ച അതിന്റെ ഉടയക്കാരെട് ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ ചൊദിച്ചതിനാൽ അവരു സമ്മതിച്ചു എങ്കിലും അവർക്കു പാർപ്പാൻ മറ്റു സ്ഥലം അന്വേഷിച്ചു കൊടുത്തു. ഇതു രണ്ടും മൂറ പ്രകാരം കണ്ടതിൽ അധികം സൌശീന്യവും വിലയായും കൊടുത്ത് വാങ്ങിച്ച് മൂന്നും കൂടി ഒന്നായി ചെർത്ത... (<i>CMM</i> II, 84-85 [132]).</p> | <p>Since our sisters live in bamboo mat (house), suffer from various kinds of illness. Hence, Fr. Delegate ardently desired to make soon a strong (house) for them. Thinking that, it is good if (we) add two plots adjacent to the land owned by and closed to the Koonammavu monastery, Mooppachan asked their owners; and they agreed, but (we) bought and gave another place for them to stay. As both of these (plots) were seen suitable, the bigger portion of the cost was given free and the rest of it we paid in cash and bought the land. (We) put together these three plots...</p> |

2.2.4.1.2. Comments

Fr. Chavara attributes to Mooppachan the initiative in taking the interest to build a new convent as soon as possible. One plot of the land belonged to Koonammavu monastery.²⁵ Two nearby plots that belonged to other people were bought.²⁶ Although we agree with Sr. Sucey that it is not

²⁵This fact puts into lime light the active involvement and contribution of the fathers of TOCD men Congregation.

²⁶Sr. Sucey mentions to a fourth plot bought by the patrimony of the founding members by referring to the manuscript of Bro. Leopold (cf. *SGME*, 181). In fact in his manuscript, he speaks of 5 plots (cf. *History of*

explicitly said who had contributed the money to purchase the two plots,²⁷ it is illogical to hold that Fr. Guyomar purchased them for the new convent, since his name does not appear at all in the quoted text (*CMM*, II, 84-85 [132]). His name never appears in the documents related to the matters concerning the convent.

2.2.4.1.3. CKC Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| പുത്തൻമഠം തീർപ്പാനായിട്ട് ഏതാനും ധർമ്മങ്ങൾ കൊണ്ടുവന്നു പണിവാൻ മറ്റു സ്ഥലവും വാങ്ങിച്ചു തുടങ്ങി (<i>CKC I</i> , 20). | To build the new convent, there brought some alms; new land was bought and thus started the work. |

2.2.4.1.4. CKC Text Two

Msgr. Bernardine visited the site of the new convent which was being constructed and thus exclaimed:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| തമ്പുരാൻ ഇത് നിറവേറ്റുവാൻ തിരുമനസ്സായിരിക്കുന്നു എന്ന് ഇതാ ഒരു അടയാളമായിരിക്കുന്നു എന്ന് പറഞ്ഞു എന്നും ഞങ്ങളോട് പറകയും ചെയ്തു...പള്ളിയുടെ ഇത്ര അടുക്കൽ ഇത്ര വലു പരമ്പ കിട്ടുവാനും ഈ പണി ഒക്കെയും നിറവേറ്റുവാനും ഇടവനത്ത് തമ്പുരാന്റെ ഒരു അതിശയം തന്നെ... (<i>CKC I</i> , 44). | It (dismissal of Francisca) is a sign that God has willed to accomplish this.... It is only God's miracle, that (we could) get such a big compound so close to the parish church and that (we were) able to put up this building. |

2.2.4.1.5. Comments

The fact that ‘another plot was purchased’ demands our attention. It means that the so-called benefactor Fr. Guyomar did not freely give the land.

Thresia, 130). We have already questioned the validity of citing from the manuscript of Bro. Leopold (cf. *AUSW*, 61).

²⁷*PTSS*, 54.

When Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara informed Msgr. Bernardine the incident of the dismissal of the candidate Francisca from the convent, he found in it the sign of God’s willingness to have a new convent. One may take it as a prophetic utterance. Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara reported these words of the Archbishop to the sisters. The Archbishop finds a divine miracle in having got a big compound so close to the parish church. From his words, one can deduce the following facts.

- *Panambumadam* was not situated as close to the parish church as the new convent.²⁸
- Further it questions the implication that the new convent was very close to *panambumadam* as said in *History of Thresia* (Manuscript) where we thus read:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>പനമ്പുമാത്തിലെ ജീവിതം മേലധികാരികൾക്കു തൃപ്തികരമാകത്തക്കവിധം ആദ്യത്തെ മൂന്നുവനിതകളും നയിച്ചിരുന്നു. എന്നാൽ ഈ ഭവനം (പനമ്പുമാം) സന്യസിനി ജീവിതത്തിനു ഭദ്രത മതിയാകയില്ലെന്നു അധികാരികളും ആ മൂന്നു വനിതകളും കണ്ടിരുന്നു. അതിനാൽ കല്ലുകൊണ്ടു ഭദ്രതയുള്ളൊരു കെട്ടിടം ഉണ്ടാക്കുവാൻ നിശ്ചയിച്ചു. പ്രസ്തുത വനിതകൾ വസിച്ചിരുന്ന പനമ്പുമാത്തിനു അടുത്തുണ്ടായിരുന്ന ഏളിച്ചുവാപ്പുപുരയിടം ഈ വനിതകൾ വിലയ്ക്കു വാങ്ങി.... (<i>Thresia Vaippisseriyude Charitram</i>, 129-130)</p> | <p>The three women led their life in <i>panambumadam</i>, in such a way that it pleased the authorities. However, both the superiors and those three women realized that this house (<i>panambumadam</i>) was not sufficient for the safety of religious life. Therefore, it was decided to construct a strong building with stones. These women bought the <i>thalichuva parambu</i> which was near to the <i>panambumadam</i> where they lived.</p> |

²⁸See also *CKC I*, 6 and our comments in No. 2.1.3.1.2.

The biased way of presenting the matters is evident here. For example, see the expression of the so-called historian Bro. Leopold: “The three women led their life in *panambumadam*, in such a way that it pleased the authorities.” Again, he says, “both the superiors and those three women realized that this house (*panambumadam*) was not sufficient for the safety of religious life.” The question now: why did the fourth woman set aside here? Was it not being a Syrian, she was avoided consciously?

- Also it opposes the assertion of Bro. Leopold in *Thresia Vaippisseriyude Charitram* that the way to *panambumadam* was attached to the new building and built a new gate:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>കൂനമ്മാവു പള്ളിയിലേയ്ക്കു പോകുവാനുള്ള വഴി പനമ്പുരം ത്തിലായിരിക്കെ ശരിപ്പെടുത്തിട്ടുണ്ടായിരുന്നു. ആ വഴി പുതിയ കെട്ടിടത്തിലേയ്ക്ക് യോജിപ്പിച്ചു. പുതിയ പടിവാതിലും വെച്ചു. (<i>Thresia Vaippisseriyude Charitram</i>, 130-131)</p> | <p>The way to go to Koonammavu church was made when they were in <i>panambumadam</i>. That path was joined to the new building and made a new gateway for it.</p> |

2.2.4.1.6. Text in the Account Book of Koonammavu Convent

In the Archives of CMC Vimala province, two Account books are there under the title *Kanakkupusthakam* Vol. I (1866-1868) & *Kanakkupusthakam* vol. II (1868-1875). The main content of both books are the daily income and expenditure of the convent at Koonammavu from 1866 to 1875. *Kanakkupusthakam* vol. II is having another title *pathramony sambandhicha kanakkukal* (Accounts Regarding the patrimony). The first seven pages of this volume are

dedicated to note down the patrimony that each candidate has brought to the convent. The list starts from Sr. Anna and follows Sr. Clara, Sr. Mariam, Sr. Cathrina of St. Ann, Sr. Thresia (Ernakulam) etc.²⁹ After this list, in the first page itself, there is a note in the hand of Fr. Chavara, regarding the land of the new convent. It reads thus:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>മം പണിതിരിക്കുന്നതിൽ ഉൾപ്പെട്ടിരിക്കുന്ന ചെലാടൻ വക പറമ്പിന് കുനമ്മാവു കൊവെന്ത വകയിൽ നിന്ന് 11900 പുത്തൻ പധിയാൻ വക കടക്കി പറമ്പിന് 200 പുത്തനും വെലിക്കകെത്തുൾപ്പെട്ടിരിക്കുന്ന തളിച്ചുവ പറമ്പും വട്ടപറമ്പും അതിനിടയിലുള്ള കണ്ടങ്ങളും കൂടി 12900 പുത്തനും ഇങ്ങനെ 25900 വിലകൊടുത്ത് പെ.ബ. ദെലഗാത്തച്ചന്റെ പെർ വച്ച് കൊവെന്ത വകയായി എഴുതി വച്ചിരുന്നതാകയാൽ ആ വക വസ്തുവിന് പകരം വസ്തു തന്നെ കൊടുപ്പാനായിട്ട് കൊട്ടു വള്ളിൽ ദെശത്ത് കൃഷ്ണൻ പറമ്പിൽ വെങ്കപ്പൻ ജെന്നാർദ്ദ നൻ എന്ന കൊങ്കിണി വക പറമ്പും നിലവും എഴുതിവാങ്ങിച്ച് കൊവെന്തക്ക് പകരം കൊടുത്തു... (Ref. <i>Patramony Sambandhicha Kanakkukal</i>, page 1-2)</p> | <p>In the land called Cheladan which is included in the construction of the convent, from the monastery at Koonammavu 11900 puthen and the land of Kadakki belonging to padhiyan 200 puthen, for the lands which come inside the fence namely Thalichuva parambu, Vatta-parambu and the fields in between them 12900 puthen. Since it was written and kept in the name of V. Rev. Fr. Delegate for the monastery, paying 25900 amount, in order to re-give property itself for those lands, the lands and fields from a Kongnini called Vengappan Genardhanan from Krishnanparambil, in Kottuvally desom, were bought and gave to the monastery.</p> |

²⁹It is noteworthy that neither mother Eliswa's nor Sr. Thresia's name has appeared in the list.

2.2.4.1.7. Comments

Fr. Chavara in 1868 itself had noted in the account book of the Koonammavu convent that the land for the new convent was taken from the monastery at Koonammavu.³⁰ How the sisters paid it back that also noted down. As far as the amounts given are concerned, we are not that much sure, since they are given in old script. However, the important fact is that Koonammavu monastery had given the plot for the new convent and the monastery had a specific role in its construction.

2.2.4.2. Collecting Alms

2.2.4.2.1. *Pidiyary*

The arrangement of collecting *pidiyary* of every house was indeed a radical and simple way of making the people participate in the construction of the new convent. Every new venture undertaken by Fr. Chavara was realized with the wholehearted cooperation of the people of God. Original texts read thus.

2.2.4.2.1.1. Text in *CMM*

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>...തെക്കും വടക്കുമുള്ള പ്രധാന പെട്ടവരെകൂടി പലിശമുതലായ കാര്യങ്ങൾ ചൊദിച്ചു വന്നയിടയിൽ പുളിങ്കുന്നുകാരൻ തോപ്പിൽ ഇട്ടികുരുവിള മുതൽ പെരുകുടി പിടിയരി എന്ന ഒരു ധർമ്മം എടുത്താൽ ഈ പുണ്യ കാര്യങ്ങൾ ഒക്കെയും നടക്കും</p> | <p>.. A meeting of the bigwigs from the North and South was summoned and there Thopil Itti-Kuruvila and a few others brought forward the idea that if (we) collect <i>pidiyary</i> (“the hand full of rice”) all this</p> |

³⁰It is also notable that none of these names of the lands appears in the list of the properties given as the patrimony of Sr. Anna (cf. *AUSW*, 116-117).

മെന്നും ആയതിനാൽ പെ: ബ: അച്ചൻ പള്ളികൾ ഒക്കെയും ഇതിന് ഒരു ക്രമവും കല്പിച്ചു നടത്തണമെന്നും ഒരപെക്ഷ അവർ എഴുതിയുണ്ടാക്കി വരാപ്പുഴ കൊണ്ടു പോയി പെ:ബ: മെത്രാപ്പൊലീത്താച്ചന്റെ പക്കൽ കൊടുത്തു. പെ:ബ: അച്ചൻ ആയതു കണ്ടാറെ വെണ്ടും വണ്ണം തെളിഞ്ഞത് ആയതിനുള്ള ക്രമവും പരസ്യവും ഉണ്ടാക്കുവാൻ നമ്മുടെ പെ:ബ: ദലഗാത്താച്ചനെ ഏല്പിച്ച പ്രകാരം ആ ക്രമമുണ്ടാക്കി ഇതായത് ഉണ്ണിമിശിഹായുടെ ധർമ്മസഭ എന്നും ഇതിന് ഓരൊരുത്തരുവീടുകളിൽ ഒരു പാത്രം വെച്ചു 'ഉണ്ണിമിശിഹായെ ഞങ്ങളെ അനുഗ്രഹിക്ക' എന്ന സുകൃതജപവും 'ഉണ്ണിമിശിഹായുടെ നിക്ഷേപം' എന്ന എഴുത്തും അച്ചടിച്ച് ആ പാത്രത്തെ പറ്റിക്കയും ഓരൊ നെരം ഓരൊ പിടിയരി അതിൽ ഇട്ട് ഈ സുകൃതജപം ചെയ്യുമ്പോൾ 20 ദിവസത്തെ ദോഷം പൊറുതിയും കല്പിച്ചു ഇതിന് ഓരൊയിടങ്ങളിൽ പ്രധാന പ്രക്കുദൊരന്മാരും ഇടവകകളിൽ കരകൾക്കു തക്കവണ്ണം രണ്ടും നാലാറു സുബപ്രാക്കുദൊരന്മാരും ഇവർ നിശ്ചയിക്കപ്പെട്ട പ്രക്കുദൊരന്മാരുടെ പക്കൽ ഏല്പിക്കയും അവർ ആയതിന്റെ വിവരകണക്കൊടു കൂടെ ആണ്ടിൽ മൂന്നു തവണ വരാപ്പുഴ എത്തിക്കയും ഇങ്ങനെ ഒക്കെയും ചട്ടംകെട്ടി തുടങ്ങിയിരിക്കുന്നു (CMM II, 80-81 [129-130]).

holy purpose can be done. Therefore, V. Rev. Father (bishop) must institute a system for this in all churches and they wrote down a request, took it to Verapoly, and gave to the Archbishop. The Archbishop was very much pleased at this and instructed Fr. Delegate to formulate the order and draft a circular about it to be sent to the churches and it was done. That is, for the Charitable Association of infant Jesus; for this in every house a box should be kept with the label "deposit for infant Jesus". In each time (of cooking rice), a hand full rice should be put away in it, reciting the ejaculation, "infant Jesus bless us." For this, 20 days indulgence was promised and in every places there would have chief procurators and in each parish according to the area two or four-six sub procurators; they should collect the rice and hand it over to the chief procurator in their place who should send it to Verapoly thrice a year together with a statement of accounts. Thus arranged everything and started to function.

2.2.4.2.1.2. Text in Alochanapusthakam

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഈ സഹോദരികൾക്കുവേണ്ടി പിതാക്കളും കുടപ്പിറപ്പുകളും പലരിൽ നിന്നും ധർമ്മം വാങ്ങിച്ച് ഈ തോട്ടത്തിന്റെ വേല നടത്തി വരുന്നതും അല്ലാതെ ഇതിനും മറ്റു ധർമ്മകാര്യങ്ങൾക്കും വേണ്ടി എല്ലാ ഇടവകകളിലും പിടിയരി എടുത്ത് മുതൽ കൂട്ടുന്നതിനായിട്ട് പത്തേന്തിയും അടിപ്പിച്ച് പ്രൊക്കുദോരന്മാരെയും നിയമിച്ചു. പാത്രങ്ങളിൽ പതിപ്പാനും അരിയിടുമ്പോൾ ചൊല്ലാനുമുള്ള സുകൃതജപവും ഉണ്ണിമിശിഹായുടെ നിക്ഷേപം, ഉണ്ണിമിശിഹായേ ഞങ്ങളുടെ മേൽ അനുഗ്രഹിക്കണമെന്നുള്ള കടലാസ് ഏറിയ ആയിരം ഇവിടെനിന്നു അടിപ്പിച്ച് യാത്രയാക്കിയും ഇരിക്കുന്നു. എന്നാൽ പിടിയരി എന്നുള്ള ഈ സൂത്രം ബ.ആ. ഗീവർഗ്ഗീസ് യൗസേപ്പച്ചനിൽ നിന്നത്രേ പുറപ്പെട്ടത്...(106-107).</p> | <p>For these sisters, fathers and siblings (<i>koodappirappukal</i>) carry out the work of this land (convent) by collecting alms from different people. Without that, for this and for all other charitable services, in order to collect money through <i>pidiary</i> patent was prepared and appointed procurators in all parishes. More than thousand copies of both the label to be pasted on the container (vessel) and the ejaculation to be recited when put the rice, were printing and sending from here. However, the method (system) of <i>pidiary</i> had come from V. Rev. Fr. Gheevarghese Ouseph.</p> |

2.2.4.2.1.3. Text in the Chronicle of Parappuram

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>പിടിയരി എന്നും പറയുന്നതിനെ ആദ്യമായി ദിവ്യ. ശ്രീ. തോപ്പിൽ ഗീവർഗ്ഗീസ് അച്ചനാണ് കണ്ടെത്തിയത്. ഇദ്ദേഹം പുളിംകുന്നിൽ ആയിരിക്കയിൽ പൊതുവായ ധർമ്മകാര്യങ്ങളുടെ നടത്തിപ്പിന് വല്ലവക ഉണ്ടാക്കുവാൻ എന്താണ് എളുപ്പവഴി എന്ന് ആലോചിക്കയിൽ എല്ലാ വീടുകളിലും ദിവസം രണ്ടോ മൂന്നോ പ്രാവശ്യത്തിൽ കുറയാതെ അരിവെച്ച് ചിലവുണ്ടല്ലോ. ഈ കാര്യത്തിനായി അരി എടുക്കുകയിൽ അതിൽനിന്ന് ഒരു പിടി അരിയെടുത്ത് വേറൊരു പാത്രത്തിൽ വച്ചുസൂക്ഷിച്ച് ഒരു വാരം തികയുമ്പോൾ ആയതിനെ തന്റെ പക്കൽ കൊണ്ടുവന്ന്</p> | <p>The idea of ‘a handful of rice’ is firstly put forward by Rev. Fr. Thoppil Geevarghese. When he was in Pulinkunnu, he thought fervently for an easy way to collect fund for the common charitable works. Then he found out that in all families minimum twice or thrice they cook rice. Each time, when the rice is taken for cooking if they keep aside a handful of rice in a separate vessel, and bring to him</p> |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>ഏല്പിക്കുന്ന പക്ഷം താൻ വിചാരിക്കുന്ന ധർമ്മകാര്യങ്ങൾ നടത്താൻ അതുകൊണ്ട് വളരെ എളുപ്പമാകും എന്നുകണ്ട് ഈ വിവരം ആ ഇടവകയിൽപ്പെട്ട ജനങ്ങളെ മനസ്സിലാക്കി. അവർക്കോ എന്നാൽ പ്രഥമദൃഷ്ടിക്ക് ഇതൊരു വലിയ കാര്യമെന്നു തോന്നിയില്ല. ആയതിനാൽ അദ്ദേഹത്തിന്റെ ആഗ്രഹംപോലെ എളുപ്പത്തിൽ സമ്മതിച്ചു. സ്ത്രീജനങ്ങളേയും ഇതിനായി ജാഗ്രതപ്പെടുത്തി. അവരും അതിന്മേൽ സന്തോഷിച്ച് ഈ കാര്യം നിറവേറുന്നതിൽ പ്രസ്തുത തോപ്പിലച്ചൻ ആലോചിക്കുന്ന ധർമ്മ കാര്യങ്ങൾ നടത്താൻ വളരെ എളുപ്പമായി വന്നു. പുളിംകുന്ന് ആശ്രമവും ദേവാലയവും പണിചെയ്തതിൽ ഈ വരവിൽനിന്ന് വളരെ സഹായം സിദ്ധിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ട് (പാറപ്പുറം വർക്കിച്ചന്റെ ഡയറി, 1182-1185).</p> | <p>after a week, it would be easy to carry out the charitable works. Therefore, he intimated this to the parishners of that parish and at the first impression, they saw it as a simple thing and soon agreed with his desire. The women were alerted to do this and they happily approved that. Therefore, it became easy to accomplish all the charity works initiated by Fr. Thoppil Geevarghese. For the construction of Pulinkunnu monastery and church, much help had been obtained from this income.</p> |
|--|---|

2.2.4.2.1.4. Comments

According to *CMM*, the idea of *pidiary* came from the laymen Thopil Ittikkurula of Pulinkunnu and others. They approached the Archbishop to get authorization for collecting *pidiary* from the catholic families of the Vicariate and he subscribed to their petition. However, *Alochanapusthakam* attributes the initiative of *pidiary* method (*sutram*) to Thoppil Fr. Gheevarghees Ousappachan. Fr. Parappuram in his *Diary* (pages 1182-1185) supports it.³¹ At this juncture it is interesting to note that both Fr. Thoppil Gheevarghese and

³¹All these texts discredit the position of Sr. Suc. In the light of these documents we wonder how she can hold that Archbishop Bernardine was the initiator of the *pidiary* method. It seems that she purposefully avoids the document *CMM* II, 80-81(129) and refers only to the *Pastoral letter of Msgr. Mellano* (cf. *SGME*, 81, FN; 223) as if Fr. Chavara and his companions had no role at all in it. See also, *Prologue, Some critical Remarks on PTSS*, 1.5.2.

the lay man Thoppil Ittikuruvilla were from the maternal family of Fr. Chavara. Nobody can refute the active role played by Chavara in executing the *pidiary* process.

2.2.4.2.2. Donations from Parishes

Because of the long details concerning the donations in *CMM II*, 82-84 [130-132]; *CKC I*, 47-48; *Alochanapusthakam*, 104-105, 130-131, 139-140; and *Diary of Fr. Parappuram*, 1186-1187, we desist from citing the text fully. We give below in a chart form the contributions mentioned in *CMM*, *CKC* and *Alochanapusthakam*.

2.2.4.2.2.1. Chart One (*CMM II*)

| Page No. | Name of the Parish | Rite | Amount Paid |
|--------------|--------------------------|--------|-------------|
| 82-83 [131] | Kallurkkadu | Syrian | 100 |
| 84 [131-132] | Arthunkal | Latin | 500 |
| 84 [132] | Muttam | Syrian | 340 |
| 84 [132] | Pulinkkunnu | Syrian | 160 |
| 84 [132] | Vattikujnanna (a person) | | 100 |

2.2.4.2.2.2. Chart Two (*CKC*)³²

| Page No. | Name of the Parish | Rite | Amount Paid |
|----------|---|--------|-------------|
| 48 | Marsleeva Palli (Alleppy) ³³ | Syrian | 200+100 |
| 48 | Kadutturuthi & Muttuchira | Syrian | 600 |

³²In this light the position of Sr. Suci that the Chronicles of the convent does not contain the list of anyone who has financially contributed cannot be held. For the names and other details of the contributors for the construction of *panambumadam*: see above No. 2.1.3.2. *God's Providential Hand*.

³³ Alms collected by Gheevarghese.

2.2.4.2.2.3. Chart Three (Alochanapusthakam)³⁴

| Page No. | Name of the Parish | Rite | Amount Paid |
|----------|--------------------|----------------|---------------------|
| 105 | Kallurkkadu | Syrian | 100 |
| 105 | Muttam & Arthungal | Syrian & Latin | No amount mentioned |

Further *Alochanapusthakam* states:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഞായ്ക്കൽ വികാരി കല്ലൂത്ര കുഞ്ചേരിയ കത്തനാരച്ചൻ വഴി യായിട്ട് ചോദിപ്പിക്കയും ഏറെ കൊടുത്തവർ 55 രൂപയും ഇങ്ങനെ പലവിധത്തിൽ പിരിയുകയും ജനങ്ങളിൽ നിന്നും പള്ളി കളിൽനിന്നും വാങ്ങിക്കുന്നതിനായിട്ട് അപേക്ഷക്കടലാസുകൾ യാത്രയാക്കുകയും ഇങ്ങനെ യുള്ള ഉസാഹവും... (<i>Alochanapusthakam</i> 130-131).</p> | <p>Made asking through the parish priest of Njarackal Fr. Kalluthra kunjeria, there were people who gave more as 55 rupees, like this in many ways made collections and prepared and sent petition forms to take the collection from parishes and people. The enthusiasm like this...</p> |

Parappuram gives a casual reference:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>...അവരിൽ ഒരാൾ ഞായ്ക്കൽ പള്ളി ഇടവകക്കാർൻ വടക്കെത്തല കുഞ്ചേരിയ, ആലപ്പുഴ പള്ളി ഇടവകക്കാർൻ എലഞ്ഞിക്കൽ ഔസേപ്പ്, പുണിത്തൂറ പള്ളി ഇടവകക്കാർൻ നെല്ലിപ്പിഴ ഇട്ടീര, ഉലത്ത് പുത്തൻ പള്ളി ഇടവകക്കാർൻ കാപ്പിൽ ഉണ്ണിച്ചെരിയ ഇവർ എല്ലാവരും കുനമ്മാവിൽ ഹാജരായി... (തിരിച്ചു) പോകുന്നതിനു മുൻ കുനമ്മാവ് കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മാത്തിനു വേണ്ടി കുറെ പണ സഹായവും ചെയ്തു (<i>Parappuram</i>, 1186-1187).</p> | <p>...among them one was Vadakkethala Kunjeria, the parishner of Njarackal, others, Elanjickal Ouseph from Alapuzha parish, Nellippizha Itteera, the parishner of Poonithura, Kappil Unnicheria from lalath Puthenpally...all of these people gathered in Koonammavu and before their return , they provided some financial help for Koonammavu convent.</p> |

³⁴These names are already cited in the first chart.

2.2.4.2.2.4. Comments

It is noteworthy that all the parishes except one (Arthunkal which was a Latin church) belonged to the Syrian Rite – a fact that invalidate Sr. Sucy’s charge that the Syrians falsely claim that the convent was constructed with the money collected by Fr. Chavara from the Syrian churches.³⁵ One may not forget the great sacrifices, which Fr. Chavara underwent in the process of collecting the donations. At *Cheranalloor* he was severely afflicted by rheumatic fever (വാത പനി) which made him unconscious for two days. He came back to Koonammavu as a sick and exhausted person, with swollen legs. Still this did not deter him from his firm determination to continue to collect donations for the construction of the new convent.³⁶ In addition, one has to remember with gratitude the active involvement of TOCD Syrian fathers, who went to different parish churches and collected money. Just to mention few names: Chandiyachan, Scaria Apremachan, Yacho Mariamachan, Kalathilachan,³⁷ and Thattassery Achan.³⁸ The words of *Alochanapusthakam* may be quoted as a conclusion about collecting alms:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| ...ശരണത്തിന് ഇടയില്ലാതിരിക്കുമ്പോൾ ശരണപ്പെട്ടുകൊണ്ട് പെ. ബ. മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചിരിൽ നിന്നും പിടിയരി മുതലായ വകയിൽനിന്നും യാതൊന്നും കൂടാതെ വിചാരിച്ചാൽ വലിയ | When there was no hope at all, still they hoped against hope. Without anything from the V. Rev. Archbishop and from the item of <i>pidiyary</i> , in a miraculous way, so to say, |

³⁵cf. *SGME*, 82.

³⁶cf. *Alochanapusthakam* 130-131.

³⁷*CMM* II, 81-84 [130-132].

³⁸*Alochanapusthakam*, 131. Such instances of the active involvement of TOCD Syrian fathers refute Sr. Sucy’s claim that they did not have any role in the affairs of the convent. See further *AUSW*, 160-163.

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>പ്രത്യക്ഷമായിരിക്കുന്നു (അതുകൂടാ) എന്നുള്ള പ്രകാരത്തിൽ പള്ളിയിൽനിന്നും ജനങ്ങളിൽ നിന്നും പുത്തൻ വർത്തമാനം പോലെ പട്ടക്കാരിൽ നിന്നുമായിട്ട് ഏറെക്കുറെ എണ്ണായിരം ചിലാനം രൂപവരെയും ഏറിയതും എഴുത്തുവഴിയായി പിരിച്ച് ചുരുങ്ങിയ ദിവസം കൊണ്ട് വിശേഷമാതൃകയായി മറവും തീർത്ത... (Alochanapusthakam, 139).</p> | <p>from the local churches, from the faithful and in a manner unheard of (as a new news) from the parish priests, obtained about Rs. 8000/- most of which were collected through letters. Thus within a short span of time, the convent was built in a fine model...³⁹</p> |
|--|---|

The document looks at the completion of the construction of the new convent as a big miracle (വലിയ പ്രത്യക്ഷമായിരിക്കുന്നു).⁴⁰

2.2.4.3. The Construction Process

2.2.4.3.1. Laying the Foundation

2.2.4.3.1.1. Text in CMM

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>1866 മിഥുനം 23 നു ശനിയാഴ്ച 7 മണി കഴിഞ്ഞ് പ്രിയൊരച്ചനും മുപ്പച്ചനും ഒരു തുണ്ടു കടലാസ്സിൽ ഒരൊർമ്മയും കയ്യാളിപ്പു കുറിച്ച ആ കടലാസിനകത്ത് ശു. കർമ്മെൽ</p> | <p>On Saturday 23rd June 1866 after 7 o'clock, Priorachan and Mooppachan(went to the site), writing in a paper a</p> |

³⁹ Both *Alochanapusthakam*, 139 (“Without anything from the V. Rev. Archbishop and from the item like *pidiyary*”) and *CMM* II, 81 [130] (എംകിലും ഇത് വരുന്നതിന്നു താമസവും വന്നാലും ഇപ്പൊൾ സെമിനാരി മുതലായ പരോപകാരത്തിനടുത്ത പല വെലയും പെ: ബ: അച്ചൻ തുടങ്ങിയിരിക്കാലും എല്ലാത്തിന്നും വക വെണ്ടിയതാകയാലും...: “But it would take time for the collections (of *pidiyary*) to come and funds were needed now for the seminary and other beneficial activities undertaken by the Archbishop”), seem to state that the amount collected from *pidiyary* was not used for the construction of the new convent. In the light of this detail it is difficult to subscribe to the statement of Sr. Sucey that *pidiyary* “was one of the financial sources for the construction of St. Teresa’s convent at Koonammavu” *SGME*, 82.

⁴⁰ Also Fr. Porukkara calls it ‘a wonder.’ See the text below in No. 2.2.4.3.3.3. ‘Text of Fr. Porukkara’.

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>മാതാവിന്റെയും യൗസേപ്പു പുണ്യ വാളന്റെയും അമ്മത്രേസ്യായുടെയും മൂന്നു കാശുരുപവും വെച്ചു പൊതിഞ്ഞ് ഒരു കല്ലിന്മേൽ മുപ്പച്ചൻ തന്നെ കൊലചെര എടുത്ത് കുമ്മായത്തിൽ ഈ രൂപങ്ങൾ പതിച്ചു വെച്ച് അതിന് മീതെ ഒരു കല്ലും വെച്ചു. ആദൈഹത്തിന്റെ കയ്യാൽ തന്നെ. ഇത: വടക്കെ പുറ ചുമരും പടിഞ്ഞാറെ പുറത്ത് ചുമരും കൂടെ കൂടുന്ന വടക്കെ മൂലയിൽ അത്രേ അന്നു തന്നെ അടി സ്ഥാനം 5000 കല്ലുവരെ പണിതു നില നിർപ്പാക്കി (CMM II, 85 [132]).</p> | <p>prayer and offering and in that covered three medals – Our Lady of Mount Carmel, St. Joseph and Mother Teresa –and Mooppachan himself pasted mortar on a stone with shovel and kept the medals over that and put a stone on that. This was kept at the North corner where North and West walls were joined. That day itself, foundation leveled up to 5000 stones ...</p> |
|--|--|

2.2.4.3.1.2. Texts in CKC

Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>1866-ാം കാലം മിയുന്ന മാസം 28-നു പെ. പെ. ബ. മുപ്പച്ചനും പ്രിയോരച്ചനും കൂടെ പുത്തൻ മഠത്തിന് ഒന്നാംകല്ലു വെക്കുന്നതിന് പൊയപ്പോൾ മാതാവിന്റെയും ശുദ്ധ യൗസേപ്പു പുണ്യപിതാവിന്റെയും അമ്മത്രേസ്യോ പുണ്യവാളത്തിയുടെയും 3 കാശുരുപവും ഒന്ന് കടലാസിൽ 'ഈ മഠം അമ്മത്രേസ്യോ പുണ്യവാളത്തിക്ക് കാഴ്ചവെച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു. നിങ്ങൾ തന്നെ സഹായിക്കുന്നില്ലാ എങ്കിൽ എന്നാൽ സാധിക്കുന്നതല്ല' എന്നും എഴുതി ഇതിൽ കാശുരുപം പൊതിഞ്ഞ് തങ്ങളുടെ പിതാവായ മുപ്പച്ചൻ തന്നെ കൊലാരി എടുത്ത് കുമ്മായം വെച്ച് ഇതിൽ മീതെ കാശുരുപവും വെച്ച് അതിന്റെ മീതെ ഒന്നാം കല്ലുവെച്ച് പണി തുടങ്ങുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC I, 24-25).</p> | <p>On 28th June 1866, when our V. V. Rev. Fr. Mooppachan and Priorachan went to lay the foundation stone for the new convent, they took three medals of Bl. Virgin Mary, St. Joseph and that of St. Mother Teresa. Then on a piece of paper he wrote, 'this convent is dedicated to St. Mother Teresa. If you are not helping, I can do nothing.' The three medals were folded up in this paper and our Fr. Mooppachan himself took the shovel and put the mortar on the ground and placed the medals on it and placed the first stone over that and thus started the construction.</p> |

Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>... ഇങ്ങനെ കിട്ടിയ ധർമ്മം കൊണ്ട് മിഥുനം 13 ന് ശനിയാഴ്ച മാത്തിന് അടിസ്ഥാനം വെയ്ക്കയും അപ്പൊൾ ചെറുതായിട്ടും ഒരുനിലയായിട്ടും മതിയെന്നും വെച്ച് കനം കുറച്ച് അടിസ്ഥാനമിടുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC I, 46).</p> | <p>With the alms thus got on Saturday, 13th of June, the foundation was laid for the convent. Then thinking that a small and single storey (building) was enough, a thin foundation was made.</p> |

2.2.4.3.1.3. Comments

The names of Priorachan and Mooppachan are mentioned in both *CMM* and *CKC* in laying the foundation. Mooppachan laid the foundation stone. The medals of Mother of Carmel, St. Joseph and St. Teresa of Avila were pasted on the foundation stone. These medals were covered with a paper in which there was a petition for intercession addressed to Mother of Carmel, St. Joseph and St. Teresa, saying that unless they help, the construction of the convent cannot be completed. Also it was written down that the new convent was dedicated to St. Teresa of Avila. These words attest to the unflinching faith and trust of Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara in the patrons of Carmel. They entrusted the construction of the convent in the hands of these heavenly Mothers and Father. Thus the beginning of the new community was firmly anchored in the spiritual milieu.

2.2.4.3.2. A more Comprehensive Plan

Although Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara had thought to construct the convent as a single storied building and accordingly laid the foundation, God was not satisfied with such a simple plan (Ref. *CKC* I, 46). He wanted to provide to His dear children a more spacious two storied building which will be necessary for the future. As *CKC* I, 47 puts it:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>ഇങ്ങനെ കന്നിമാസം 8-നു ശു: മാതാവിന്റെ പിറവിത്തിരുന്നാൾ കഴിഞ്ഞതിന്റെ ശേഷം അച്ചുമാർ നിരൂപിച്ച് ചൊതിക്കുന്ന വഴിയൊക്കെയും ദൈവം തെളുവിച്ച് നടത്തുന്നതിനെ കണ്ട് വീണ്ടും മം രണ്ടു നിലയായിട്ട് പണിയണമെന്നും: എടുക്കത്താത്തും എസ്കൊളയും ഒറ്റ കല്ലായി കെട്ടി അടച്ചുകൊള്ളാമെന്നും നിരൂപിച്ച് മന്ത്രിന്റെ അടിസ്ഥാനത്തിനുള്ള തെക്കു വടക്കുള്ള തായ പടിഞ്ഞാറെതും കിഴക്കെ തുമായ രണ്ടു ചുമരിന്റെ അടിസ്ഥാനത്തൊടു ചെർത്ത് മാന്തിക്കുഴിച്ച് വീതികൂട്ടി രണ്ടു നിലയായി പണിവാൻ തക്ക ഉറപ്പുള്ള താക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു. പിന്നെയും നമ്മുടെ ദലഗാത്തച്ചന്റെ മനസ്സിനടക്കം വരായ്കയാൽ വീണ്ടും എസ്കൊളയും എടുക്കത്താത്തും പണിവാൻ നിശ്ചയിച്ചിട്ട് അടിസ്ഥാനത്തിനു റപ്പൊപൊരാ എന്നും വച്ച് പുറമെ ചില തൂണുകൾ കൂടി ചെർത്ത് മൂന്നും കൂടി ഒന്നായിട്ടു തന്നെ പണി തുടങ്ങുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC I, 47).</p> | <p>Since God was blessing all the ways the fathers sought, after 8th September the feast of the nativity of Mary, again it was decided that the convent will be constructed as two storied building and both <i>educandath</i> and school will be built and covered as one stone. Therefore along with the foundation of the convent in the eastern and western walls that ran North South, again dug up and enlarged the width and thus it made strong to build a two storied building. Again our Fr. Delegate was not quite satisfied and felt that the foundation laid for the school and the boarding was not strong enough, he made them erect some pillars, out side of the foundation wall and thus started the work of all the three buildings together as one single unit.</p> |

Both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara firmly believed that God would be willing to provide whatever they ask. They had the first hand experience of it. Hence they decided to construct a two storied building with boarding (*educandath*) and school attached to it. The affectionate heart of Fr. Leopold was thinking about the minute details of the construction and he wanted to make the foundation more strong by erecting some more pillars.⁴¹

⁴¹So the statement of Sr. Sucey that it was the decision of the Archbishop to make the foundation more strong and construct a two storied building (*SGME*, 138) does not have any ‘foundation.’

2.2.4.3.3. Miracles of Providence

Both Fr. Chavara and Fr. Leopold clearly could find the providing divine hands during the process of construction. Also Fr. Porukkara, the successor of Fr. Chavara has attested to this wonderful deed of God.

2.2.4.3.3.1. Text in CMM

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഇതൊക്കെയും ഒരു കാശുമില്ലാതെ അഗതികളായ ഞങ്ങളെ അധികവെലയും ചെയ്യാതെ 8000 രൂപാ വരെ ധർമ്മത്തരുവിച്ചും ആയതു തെളിവുള്ള ധർമ്മമായി തരുവിച്ച് നിറവെറിയ തുമല്ലാതെ ഇതിൽ 100 രൂപാ ശുദ്ധമുള്ള ദ്രവ്യമല്ലെന്നും നമ്മുടെ മുപ്പച്ചന്റെ ഹൃദയസാക്ഷി പറകയാൽ പെ:പെ:ബ: അച്ചനോട് അനുവാദം വാങ്ങിച്ച് ഈ 100 രൂപായും ധർമ്മമായി വിച്ചുകാർക്ക് കൊടുത്തല്ലാതെ ഈ പണിയിൽ ചെർത്തില്ല. ഈ വണ്ണം ശുദ്ധമുള്ള നിയോഗത്തോടും സൂക്ഷ്മത്തോടും കൂടെ നമ്മുടെ ദലഗാത്തച്ചൻ നിറവെറി ... (CMM II, 91-92 [136]).</p> | <p>For us, the poor destitutes without a single penny all this was made possible without much hard work and about Rs. 8000/- was given as alms and that too, was given as untainted donations. But out of this Rs.100/- which, Mooppachan felt as stained money, was given to beggars with the permission of the Archbishop, without adding to this work. Thus with pure intention and keen attention, in our Fr. Delegate's interest everything was completed.</p> |

2.2.4.3.3.2. Text in CKC

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>...ഇങ്ങനെ കന്നിമാസം മുതൽ കല്പണി തുടങ്ങി. ഒന്നു രണ്ടു കുറി മുൻപിന്നായിട്ടു പണം കൊവേതയിൽ നിന്നും മറ്റും വായിപ എടുത്തു ചില പണി നടത്തി എന്നാറെ പെ:ബെ: മുപ്പച്ചന്റെ മനസ്സാക്ഷി കുറ്റപ്പെടുത്തുകയാൽ ദൈവം തരുമെങ്കിൽ പണിയാം പണം</p> | <p>Thus from September onwards, the masonry started. Once or twice loans were taken from the monastery and some works were done. But since V. Rev. Mooppachan felt guilty in his conscience, it was decided that 'if God gives the money (we) shall</p> |

എത്തുമ്പോൾ (തീരുമ്പോൾ) നിറുത്താം എന്നും നിശ്ചയിച്ച് അപ്രകാരം തുടങ്ങി എന്നാറെയും അച്ചന്മാരുടെ നാവായ് സാക്ഷിച്ചതിൻ വണ്ണം പലപ്പഴം പണം എത്തി യിനിനാളെ പണിയണ്ട പണി നിറുത്തണം എന്നു നിരൂപിക്കുമ്പോൾ ഒരു വക വരികയും ചെയ്യും ഇങ്ങനെ പലപ്പൊഴും നടക്കയും അപ്രകാരം ഈ വലു പണിക്ക് മരം വാങ്ങിപ്പാൻ ഒന്നായിട്ട് ഒരു വലു ചിലവുണ്ടല്ലോ എന്നും നിരൂപിച്ചിരിക്കയിൽ കഴിഞ്ഞ യാണ്ടുവരെ കണ്ടിട്: 8, 9 രൂപയായിട്ട് വിറ്റുവന്ന അകിൽത്തടി 3 1/2 രൂപയ്ക്ക് തന്നുകൊള്ളാമെന്ന് ഒരാൾ വന്ന് ഉടമ്പടി ചെയ്കയും ഈ വണ്ണം ഒക്കെയും ദൈവ കൃപയാൽ നടന്നു വരികയാൽ ഇങ്ങനെ ഒരിക്കൽ വന്നപണം ഒക്കെയും ചിലവു ചെയ്തു. ഇനി എന്തു വഴി എന്ന് അച്ചന്മാരു നിരൂപിച്ചിരിക്കുമ്പോൾ ഇതാ ആലപ്പുഴ ഉള്ളതിൽ ഒക്കെയും സമ്പന്നനും മാർസ്സീവാ പള്ളി ഇടവകക്കാരിൽ അധിക ജോലി കച്ചവടം ഉള്ളവനുമായ ഗീവർഗ്ഗീസ് എന്നയാൾ ജ്ഞാനം തോന്നി ഓർശ്ശെമ്മിനു പോകണമെന്നും വച്ചു കൊവേന്തയിൽ വരികയും ചെയ്തു ഈ ആളിന് കുമ്പസാരവും മറ്റും കൊവേന്തയച്ചന്മാരു കൊടുത്തു പാർത്തിരിക്കയിൽ പെ. ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ നീ പോയി ധർമ്മം തെണ്ടണം എന്നു കൽപിച്ചാറെ സന്തോഷത്തോടു കൂടെ ഏൽക്കയും ആയതിന് പ്രിയോരച്ചൻ വേണ്ടിയ എഴുത്തുകൾ കൊടുക്കയും ഉടൻ ആയതുകൊണ്ടു പോയി ഇതാ 300 രൂപയും ഒരു വട്ടിയിൽ കെട്ടിക്കൊണ്ടു വന്നു. ഇതിൽ 100 മാത്രം അവ

continue to construct the convent and when the money will be over (we) shall stop the construction.' Then they began to do accordingly. As the fathers themselves witnessed in their own words, 'often, when (we) felt that the money is over and decided to stop the work the next day, an amount comes from somewhere. This has happened many times. Likewise, as we were thinking that to buy logs for this big construction much amount is needed, then a person offered to sell them for three and half rupees per tonne although such logs were sold the year before for Rs. 8-9/- per tonne. Like this as things were going on by God's grace, once the whole amount that came, had been spent out. Then the fathers were thinking what should be done, there came the richest man of Alappuzha called Gheevarghese who belonged to the Mar Sleeva parish church and was the great business man among the parishioners. Desiring to go to Jerusalem he came to the monastery and the fathers made him to stay there giving sacraments of confession etc. Then Rev. Mooppachan told him to go and get some donation for which he happily consented and Priorachan gave him the necessary letters and he set out immediately. He came back with 300 rupees tied up in a *vatti* (a bag made of rush mat) of which only 100 were

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>ന്റെ. 200 മറ്റുള്ളവരുടെ ധർമ്മം. ഈ വണ്ണം ഒടുക്കത്തിലും പണം മുട്ടി എന്നു കണ്ടാറെ ഏതെങ്കിലും ഒരു എഴുത്ത് അയക്കട്ടെ, കിട്ടുന്നതു കിട്ടട്ടെ എന്നും നിരൂപിച്ച് കടുത്തുരുത്തി, മുട്ടിച്ചിരയ്ക്ക് എഴുതിയാറെ പ്രത്യക്ഷം പോലെ 600 രൂപ രൊക്കമായിട്ടു പിരിച്ചു മാനാനത്തു വികാരിയച്ചൻ വശം കൊടുത്തയയ്ക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു. ഈ വണ്ണം വിശേഷ ദൈവകൃപയാലെ ആറേഴു മാസം കൊണ്ട് 7000 രൂപയിൽ താഴെ ദാനം കിട്ടി. ഇതാ പഴയ ഓല മാറാതെ പഴയതിൽ നിന്നു പുത്തനിലേയ്ക്കു ദൈവം വിളിക്കുന്നു (CKC, 47-48).⁴²</p> | <p>his own and 200 were from others. Likewise, towards the end of the work too, once it happened. Seeing that the money was over, decided to send a letter to get if possible something and the letter was sent to Kaduthuruthy and Muttuchira. As really a wonder, (they) collected 600 rupees in cash and sent it, through the Fr. Vicar of Mannanam. Like this by the special divine grace, within six or seven months an amount below Rs. 7000/- was received as donation. Thus without changing the old coconut palm leaves God was calling from the old house to the new one.</p> |
|--|---|

2.2.4.3.3. Text of Fr. Porukkara

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>..അതിന്റെ ശേഷം അത്ഭുതമേ! എട്ടുമാസത്തിന്റെ ഇടകൊണ്ടു എണ്ണായിരം രൂപ വരെയും പലവഴിയായി ധർമ്മം വരുത്തി കന്യാ സ്ത്രീമാവും അതിന്നു വേണ്ടുന്നതൊക്കെയും ഉണ്ടാക്കി അവരെ പാർപ്പിക്കയും... (Porukkara Elisha, <i>Stapakapitha-kkanmar</i>, 35).</p> | <p>After that, How wonderful! within the duration of 8 months by collecting around Rs. 8000/- as donation, constructed the convent and the things needed for that and made them to stay there.</p> |

2.2.4.3.3.4. Comments

The words of Fr. Chavara in *CMM*, ‘we the poor destitutes without a single penny’ invites our special attention. He uses first person plural ‘we’ as if the whole affair was

⁴²In the Chronicles of 1988 edition, both the amounts 300 and 600 were given wrongly and here we have given the correct amounts as per the original text.

concerned with himself⁴³ as well as others. The merciful Lord came to their assistance so that they could collect Rs. 8000/-⁴⁴ without much labour.

The convent was built with pure intention and keen attention. This becomes evident from excluding Rs. 100/- collected as donation. Fr. Leopold thought that the amount was stained money, hence cannot be used by the holy purpose of construction of the new convent. It was given as alms to beggars.

According to *CKC* the construction was begun with the money borrowed from Koonammavu monastery.⁴⁵ As Fr. Leopold did not want to further tax the TOCD fathers, he entrusted himself into the divine hands. He thus decided, 'if God provides the money we shall continue to construct the convent and when the money will be over we shall stop the construction.' There were times when not even a single penny remained in their hands. As they were thinking then to stop the construction the next day, God miraculously was sending somebody with the money. This happened many times. As

⁴³Sr. Suzy would not have reduced Fr. Chavara to the role of a mere administrator, overseer (*SGME*, 240) if she would have reflected on this phrase. See our comments in *AUSW*, 98, 103, 105-106.

⁴⁴In the light of this attestation, Sr. Suzy's reservation concerning Fr. Chavara collecting Rs. 8000/- for the construction (*PTSS* 68, 69) has no valid ground. Further, we could not find any document which says that the total amount spent for the construction was only Rs. 4500/-. See our negative remarks on the so called contribution of Archbishop Bernardine in *AUSW* 122-123.

⁴⁵This fact also attest to the active involvement of the TOCD fathers at the initial stage of the women religious community. Thus it refutes the statement of Sr. Suzy that the TOCD men religious have no role in the affairs of religious sisters. In *SGME*, 219 she writes thus: "The 'sons of Chavara' had no involvement in the convent until the division of the Vicariate."

they had to buy many logs together for the big constructions and had not the amount pay for them there occurred a special divine intervention. A person offered to sell them for three and half rupees per tonne although such logs were sold then for the amount Rs. 8-9/- per tonne. The chronicler found in all these instances the work of ‘God’s grace’ (ദൈവ കൃപ) ‘miracle’ (പ്രത്യക്ഷം) and special ‘divine grace’ (വിശേഷ ദൈവ കൃപ).

Also Fr. Porukkara found the wonderful intervention of God in the whole process of construction. According to him, Fr. Chavara could collect within 8 months Rs. 8000/- and finished the construction.

2.2.4.4. New Facilities

CMM II, 91-92 [136] thus provide a comprehensive and concise picture of both material and spiritual facilities arranged in the new convent. It begins with a grateful acknowledgement that the Almighty Lord had done for His beloved children.

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ഇതാ 67 ാം കാലത്തിന്റെ മനൊഗുണങ്ങളിൽ ഒന്ന് സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ നമുക്ക് ചെയ്തിരിക്കുന്നു. ഇതായത്: 66 മീനത്തിൽ പനമ്പിൽ പാർപ്പിച്ച കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളെ 67 മീനം 27നു പുത്തൻ മഠത്തിൽ സമസ്തവും തീർത്ത് പ്രാർത്ഥനാ മുറിയിൽ വിയാസാഗ്ര മുതലായതും അൾത്താര പുത്തൻ കത്ത്സാൾ പൂച്ചട്ടികൾ മുതലായതും ദൊർമ്മിത്തൊരിയിൽ പസുകികളും ഊട്ടുമുറിയിൽ</p> | <p>Here is, one of the graces of the year '67 that God Almighty has done for us. That is, the nuns who, in '66 March⁴⁶ were made to stay in <i>panambu (madam)</i>, on 27th March '67 could (put) in the new convent finishing everything; in the prayer room, stations of the cross and so on; in the chapel altar, flower-vases etc.; in the dormitory picture frames; in the</p> |

⁴⁶It seems that while writing the Chronicles Fr. Chavara had made a minor mistake. The entry into *panambumadam* was not in March but in February as the writer himself had noted in *CMM II*, 75 [126].

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>തുവാല വെള്ളപാത്രങ്ങളും മുറികളിൽ കട്ടിലും പായും പുതപ്പു പുത്തൻ കൊളാമ്പി കളും കാഴ്ചമുറിയിൽ കുമ്പസാരക്കൂടും - ഗ്രാത്താ - റൊത്താ മുതലായതും പള്ളിയിൽ കടക്കാതെ പള്ളിയൊടു ചെരെ തന്നെ കുമ്പസാരവും ശു. കുർബാന കൈക്കൊൾ വാനും മറ്റുമായിട്ടുള്ള ഒരു പണി പള്ളിയിലും...</p> | <p>dining room towels, white plates; in rooms cots, mats, blankets and chamber pots; in the parlour confessional and <i>grata-rota</i> etc. In the parish church also had some works for the nuns, to make confession and to receive holy communion without entering the (main) chapel...</p> |
|--|---|

It is noteworthy that Fr. Chavara attributes that such graces (*മനൊഗുണങ്ങൾ*) had come from the hands of God Almighty. He does not make a distinction between him and the sisters. Rather he considers that everything has done by God for *us* (*നമുററു*). Does not this point to the unique part played by Fr. Chavara in the initial stages for the TOCD Community for Women?⁴⁷ Now let us briefly mention the material and spiritual facilities arranged by Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara in the new convent.

2.2.4.4.1. Material Facilities

2.2.4.4.1.1. According to CKC Text

CKC I, 52-56 and 58-59 give an elaborate description about the material facilities arranged in the new convent. We summarize here certain important things:

- On certain occasions both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara spent the whole day there and supervised the works. They used the service of about 100 workers.

⁴⁷These and other testimonies induce us to reject Sr. Sucy's designation of Fr. Chavara as overseer, administrator and a mere friend of Fr. Leopold (cf. *SGME*, 240, 176, 239).

- The following were the things which were constructed and arranged
 - A bund, A new way
 - Two fences at the end of which there made a doorframe and door with locks, so that the sisters could enter through them to the vicinity of the church.
 - *Educandath* (boarding) for the habitation of the girls with two doors to outside and to the convent, as well as a new pond for taking bath, bath rooms, toilets and another pond for drinking water and a small well built with stones and a place for a garden for which fertile soil brought from Manjummel as well as cow-dung.
 - Kitchen with two rooms and cupboards, furnaces and a place for keeping firewood, a place for washing the plates and other utensils, drainage facilities, grinding stone, big copper pots, axes, pots and utensils for cooking, sickles, knives, chisels, hammer, spades, earthen pots for drinking water etc.
 - Both sides of the refectory small wooden tables and on them folded napkins, salt bottle, drinking cup and water bottle.
 - A hut on the northern side of the kitchen with full of fire woods
 - Hen-coop (*kozhikoodu*)
 - Three toilet rooms
 - A pond to be used for different purposes as well as a washing pond, a storeroom built with stones.

- Recreation hall built on six stone pillars and furnished with benches
- A cow shed on the southern side
- In the common room, porcelain cups for the use of 14 sisters, 14 ink bottles with different colours of ink, bundles of writing feathers, pencil, different kinds of threads, packets of needles.
- Five spittoons and lamps on the walls of the rooms
- In the dormitories above and below in every room three wall pictures, wooden cross, Holy water, cot, blanket, chamber pot and broom.
- The common room with big wall pictures, a big bell, a clock, a wooden bell and a small bell etc.

2.2.4.4.1.2. Comments

One may wonder about the list of minute things furnished in the new convent. It sheds light to the paternal solicitude and foresight of both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara in the affairs of the sisters whom they considered as their beloved little children.

As we read this narration as well as the things furnished in the *panambumadam* by the own hands of Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara (അവരുടെ കൈയ്യൊഴിതന്നെ), the vivid picture of Genesis 2 will spontaneously arise in our minds. God the loving Father attended to the minute details and arranged everything before hand in the paradise; only then, he gave form to the human beings whom He brought to the well-furnished and beautiful habitation.

2.2.4.4.2. Spiritual Facilities

2.2.4.4.2.1. Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>...12 സഹോദരികളും ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മയും യിങ്ങനെ പതിമൂന്നു പേർക്ക് എന്നും ഒരു വിചാരമായതിനാൽ ഈയാളുകളുടെ പെരുമാറ്റത്തിന് വേണ്ടിയത് ഒക്കെയും മുൻകൂട്ടി അന്വേഷിച്ച് യിതായത്: ഈ ദിവസങ്ങൾക്കിടയിൽ ഒരു ദിവസം 14 വലു പിച്ഛു കുരിശുരൂപങ്ങളും വലുതും അതിൽ ചെറിയതുമായി ഏറിയ കടലാസുരൂപങ്ങൾ പ്രാർത്ഥനാമുറിയിൽ വെപ്പാൻ, 14 വിയാസാഗ്രായുടെ രൂപങ്ങളും....പ്രാർത്ഥനാമുറിയിൽ: വിയാസാഗ്ര 14 ഉം തൊണൊസിൻ: ഈശോ മറിയം യൗസെപ്പ്, അമ്മത്രേസ്യ, പിതാവു യൊഹന്നാൻ ഈ അഞ്ചും കൂടിയ വലു പസ്കിയും 4 കത്തിസാളും തുങ്ങപ്പെട്ട രൂപവും ആത്തരം പുച്ചൊടും പച്ചപു വെപ്പാൻ കുപ്പിപ്പാത്രങ്ങളും യിരുവശം വംകും നടുവിൽ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മയ്ക്കു വംകും ... യിങ്ങനെ മുറിയുടെ എല്ലാ വാതിലുകളിലും സെന്തൊസ്യായും അതിന്നു താഴെ ഒരൊപുണ്യവും എല്ലാ കതകിലും ശുദ്ധപിതാവിന്റെ രൂപങ്ങളും ഇതൊക്കെയും ഏറിയ നാൾ പാർത്തുവരുന്ന കൊവേന്തപോലെ ഒക്കെയും ചട്ടമാക്കി. ഈട്ടുമുറി വാതിലിന്റെ പുറത്ത് ഈക്കതകിൻ മീതെ തീൻ കഴിഞ്ഞുപകാരസ്മരണം കൂട്ടുന്ന വലുകുരിശും: അകത്തുകടന്നാൽ വലതുവശത്ത് വായനക്കാരത്തിക്ക് വങ്കും ഇടതു വശത്ത്: തൊളിൽ ചുമപ്പാനുള്ള വലുകുരിശു ചുമ</p> | <p>As it was thought of 12 sisters and a superior, thus 13 members, all that were necessary for them, were being planned and got ready. That is, in one of these days were brought 14 big bronze crucifixes, many big and small pictures for the chapel, the fourteen pictures of the stations of the way of the Cross; to keep in the prayer room 14 stations of the way of the cross.... Above the altar in a single big frame were the pictures of Jesus, Mary, Joseph, our mother St. Teresa and our father St. John of the Cross. On the altar, there were four candle stands, a crucifix and also flower vases of the same material. Both sides there were benches and another bench in the middle for the superior.... Thus on the door of every room was written <i>sententia</i> and below of that a virtue; on every door the picture of St. Joseph; All these were arranged in such a way as if in a monastery which was occupied already for a long time.... Above the refectory door on the outside, a big cross where the thanks giving prayer was recited after meals; Inside the refectory on the right side a bench for the reader and on the left side a big cross on the wall to be carried on the</p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>രിലും താഴെ വങ്കുംമെൽ പ്രായശ്ചിത്ത കുരിശും ചെറിയ സ്കപ്പുളാരും മുൾമുടി കയറും കല്ലും വെന്തും കടികൊലും ഇതൊക്കെയും ചെയ്യിവാനുള്ള ക്രമക്കടലാസും.... നടുവിൽ കുരിശും ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മയുടെ മേശയും വങ്കും... (CKC I, 52-53, 58, 59)</p> | <p>shoulder, below on the bench a small cross for penance, a small scapular, a crown of thorns, rope, a stone, a blind fold, a bit-stick (<i>kadikol</i>) along with the written directions to do all these....In the middle was a cross and the table and bench of the superior.</p> |
|---|---|

2.2.4.4.2.2. Comments

The text attests to the foresight of the fathers about the eventual growth of the community. Hence, they provided facilities for 13 members. We list below the important items:

- 14 big crucifixes, many big and small holy pictures, 14 stations of the way of the cross in the chapel.
- Above the altar pictures of Jesus, Mary, Joseph, St. Teresa of Avila and St. John of the Cross – all five pictures in a single big frame.
- On the altar four candle stands, a crucifix and flower vases, on both sides of the chapel benches – another bench in the middle for the superior.
- On the door of every room was written *sententia* (a holy verse from the Bible or from the saints) and below a virtue to be practiced.
- On every door the picture of St. Joseph, Above the refectory door on the outside a big cross where the thanks giving prayer was recited after meals.
- Inside the refectory on the right side a bench for the reader; on the left side a big cross to be carried on the shoulder as penance.
- On a bench small crosses for doing penance, a small scapular, a crown of thorns, rope, a stone, a blind fold

(a piece of cloth with two tails to cover the eyes), a bit-stick (*kadikol*) along with written directions as to how to do the penances.

The chronicler observes at the end of the text that everything was arranged as if the convent was established and occupied by monks already for a long time.

2.2.4.5. A Prudent Delay

Although the earlier plan was to begin the life in the new convent on the first Wednesday of Lent, the fathers as well as the Archbishop had a second thought.

2.2.4.5.1. Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ഈ പഴയ ഓല മാറാതെ പഴയ തിരികിന്നു പുത്തനിൽ ദൈവം വിളിക്കുന്നു. എന്നാൽ ഞങ്ങൾക്കു ചെറിയ സ്കപ്പുളാരും തന്നെ പനമ്പു മാത്തിൽ കെറ്റിയ ദിവസമായ നൊമ്പരിന്റെ ഒന്നാം ബുധനാഴ്ചയായ കെത്തുമാ ദിവസത്തിൽ തന്നെ പുത്തൻ മഠം തീർന്ന് കെറ്റുവാൻ വശമായി എങ്കിലും വെനലിന്റെ മുഴുവൻ തിരഞ്ഞിട്ട് കുളം കുഴിച്ചാൽ പിന്നെ വെഗത്തിൽ വറ്റുവാനും രണ്ടാമതു കുഴിപ്പാനും യിടയാകരുത് എന്നുള്ള നിരൂപണയാലും പുത്തനായിട്ട് കുഴായം തെച്ച മുറി കുഴായത്തിന്റെ ചുട്ട് നീങ്ങാതെ പാർത്താൽ ദീനം പിടി കുമ്മനും യിങ്ങനെ നമ്മുടെ പിതാക്കന്മാരായ പെ. പെ. ബ. മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചൻ മുതലായി ഉള്ള നമ്മുടെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠന്മാരുടെ താല്പര്യത്തെപ്രതിയും മത്രെ അന്നു കെറ്റാഞ്ഞത്. ... എന്നാൽ ഈ ദിവസങ്ങളോടുകൂടെ പണികൾ മിക്കയും കഴിഞ്ഞുവെങ്കിലും അല്പമായ കാര്യങ്ങൾ കൂടെ നിറവേറ്റണമെന്നുള്ള പെ. ബ. നമ്മുടെ ദൈഹാത്തച്ചന്റെ</p> | <p>Thus without changing the old coconut palm leaves God calls from the old (house) to the new (one). But the new house was complete and ready for entrance on the first Wednesday of Lent; i.e. ash Wednesday, the day on which we received the small scapular and entered the <i>panambumadam</i>. But we were not allowed to enter on that day, because of the keen interest of our fathers V. Rev. Archbishop and other Superiors, who thought that it is better to make the pond when the summer was at the hottest, so that it might not dry and necessitate a second digging to deepen it and also if the sisters begin to live in the newly white-washed room before the heat of the lime subsided they would become sick.... Even though by these</p> |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>താൽപര്യത്താലും യിതിനീടയിൽ ഞങ്ങൾക്കു സഹായക്കാരത്തിയായിരുന്ന ആളിന് വസുരി ദീനം വന്നതിനാൽ വീട്ടിൽ അയയ്ക്കയും: ഈശോമിശിഹാ ഇതിനവളെ വിളിക്കുന്നില്ല എന്നു മുപ്പച്ചൻ തൊന്നുകയാലും ഇതിനൊടുകൂടെ മറ്റൊരു സഹൊദരിയെ സഹായക്കാരത്തിയായിട്ട് മുപ്പച്ചൻ കൂട്ടി. ഇത് രണ്ടാമത്തെ ത്രെത്സയാ. ഈയാളും ഞങ്ങളോടുകൂടെ വന്നു ചെർന്നു എന്നു മാത്രം ഇപ്പോൾ പറയാം (CKC I, 48-49).</p> | <p>days, almost all works were over, due to the interest of our V. Rev. Fr. Delegate to fulfill even the minute things; meanwhile our helper was sent home as she was affected by smallpox. Since Mooppachan felt that Jesus Christ was not calling her for this work, he admitted another one as our helper. This is the second Thresia. She also came and stayed with us. Only this much can be said now.</p> |
|--|---|

2.2.4.5.2. Comments

About the shifting to the new convent the chronicler finds the divine call as she puts it: “without changing the old coconut palm leaves, God was calling us from the old house to the new.” The early members could find the divine providence in everything. The reasons for the reservation of the superiors were the following:

- It is better to make the pond when the summer was at the hottest, so that it might not dry and necessitate a second digging to deepen it.
- If the sisters begin to live in the newly whitewashed room before the heat of the lime subsided they would become sick.

As the helper (lay sister) was bed-ridden because of the smallpox, Fr. Leopold interpreted it as a sign that Jesus Christ is not calling her to enter in to the new convent.

2.2.4.6. In the New Home

2.2.4.6.1. Text in KKC

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>മീനം 25-നു നമ്മുടെ അമ്മയുടെ വചനിച്ച പെരുന്താൾ ദിവസം ഞങ്ങൾ 4 സഹായക്കാരത്തിയിങ്ങനെ 5 പെരും ശു. കുർബാന കൈക്കൊണ്ട് പനമ്പു മഠത്തിൽ പൊയി കത്തി കുടിച്ചുടൻ പെ. ബ. മുപ്പച്ചനും പ്രിയൊരച്ചനും കടശിയുഴമായിട്ട് പനമ്പു മഠത്തിൽ വന്നു... ഞങ്ങൾ കൊപ്പുകൾ ഒക്കെയും പെട്ടികളിൽ ആക്കി വെക്കണമെന്നും ചൊവ്വാഴ്ച ഇതൊക്കെയും പുത്തൻ മഠത്തിൽ കൊടുത്തയക്കണമെന്നും ബുധനാഴ്ച ഞങ്ങൾ കുർബാന കൈക്കൊണ്ട് പുത്തൻ മഠത്തിൽ ചെല്ലണമെന്നും കൽപിച്ചു. അപ്രകാരം 26-നു ചൊവ്വാഴ്ച വസ്തുക്കൾ ഒക്കെയും ചുമപ്പിച്ച് വൈകും വരെ നാലാറുപെരും ചുമന്നു. വക്കു മേശ രൂപങ്ങൾ ഒക്കെയും കൊടുത്തയച്ചു. കട്ടിലുകൾ മാത്രം വെച്ചു. അന്നു ഞങ്ങൾ തിന്നതും കിടന്നതും.</p> <p>27-നു ബുധനാഴ്ച കൽപന പ്രകാരം ഞങ്ങളുടെ കപ്പലു മുറിയിൽ കടന്ന് കുർബാനയും കണ്ട് ഞങ്ങൾ അഞ്ചു പെരും ഇതുകൂടാതെ എടക്കൊച്ചി യിടവകയിൽ നിന്ന് ഒരു വിധവ ഈ കുന്നമ്മാവുകൽ വന്ന് കാട്ടാളപ്പടിക്കൽ എന്ന വീട്ടിൽ പാർത്ത് ഭക്തിയോടു നടന്നിരുന്നു എന്ന ഒരുത്തിയെ അന്വേഷിക്കാതെ എന്നും പെരു വച്ച് സഹ. ത്രേസ്യാ പുറത്തു പൊകാതെയും പ്രർത്ഥനാമുറി ഊട്ടുമുറിയിൽ ഞങ്ങളോടു കൂടെ നിൽപാനും ഈ ആൾ മഠത്തിന്റെ ഉള്ളിൽ കടക്കാതെ കൂസീഞ്ഞയിൽ താമസിക്കയും</p> | <p>On march 25th, the feast of the Annunciation, five of us, four sisters and a helper received Holy Communion and went to the <i>panambumadam</i> and soon after taking <i>kanji</i>, V. Rev. Mooppachan and Priorachan came to the <i>panambumadam</i> for the last time.... Then we were told to pack and keep ready all things in boxes and to send them to the new convent on Tuesday and on Wednesday, receiving the holy communion, to come to the New convent. Thus, on 26th Tuesday, four – six men till evening carried away all the things. Even the benches, tables, statues and frames were all sent. Only the cots were kept back; so too, what we ate and where we slept that day remained.</p> <p>On 27th Wednesday as we were told, we entered our chapel and participated in the Holy Mass. Besides five of us, a widow from the parish of Edakochi, who had come to Koonammavu and lived a devout life with Kattalapadickal family was taken as procuratress; thus the helper Thresia without going out, could be with us in the prayer room and refectory,</p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>പുറത്ത് പ്രക്കുരദൊര മുത്തപ്പ നൊട് വാച്ചതും പൊയി പര വാനും വാങ്ങിപ്പാനും കുസീ ണ്തയിൽ അലക് വെടിപ്പ് മെഴുക് യിങ്ങനെയുള്ള വെല കളും ചെയ്ത് ഭക്തിയായി നട പ്പാനും ഉറണും ഉടുപ്പും കൊടു ക്കുന്നതല്ലാതെ ചുരുങ്ങി യ ചമ്പളവും കൊടുക്കാമെന്നും കിടപ്പായി പൊയാൽ പുറത്തു ഉള്ള വീടുകളിൽ പൊയി സുഖ മാകും വരെ പാർത്തുകൊള്ളാ മെന്നും ഉള്ള കൽപനയും അനു വാദവും ഉറപ്പിച്ചുകൊണ്ട് ഈ ആൾ പള്ളിയകത്ത് കുവസാരം കുർബാന നടത്തുവാനും കല്പിച്ച പ്രകാരം അവരും യിങ്ങനെ ഞങ്ങൾ ആറുപെരും കൂടി ശു. കുർബാനയും കൈ ക്കൊണ്ട് പള്ളിയിൽ നിന്നും പുറപ്പെട്ട പുത്തൻ പടിവാതിൽ തുറന്നു അതിലെ പുത്തനായിട്ട് വെട്ടിച്ച വഴിയിൽ കൂടെ നടന്ന് മഠത്തിന്റെ തെക്കെ മതിൽ വാതുക്കൽ കൂടി കടന്നു വടക്ക് വശത്തുള്ള വാതുക്കൽ ഞങ്ങൾ വന്നപ്പൊൾ പ്രിയൊരച്ചൻ റൊളു കത്തിക്കുന്നു. ഞങ്ങൾ കടന്ന് മുകളിൽ കരൊറി പ്രാർത്ഥനാമു റിയിൽ ചെല്ലുവാനും ഇപ്പൊള തേയ്ക്കു മാത്രം കാണാനായി അമ്പെഷക്കാരത്തിയും കരൊറു വാൻ ഞങ്ങളൊടു പറഞ്ഞു (CKC I, 55-56).</p> | <p>whereas the other one without entering inside of the convent, could stay in the kitchen and go to the procurator to tell and buy something. She was to be in the kitchen doing washing, cleaning, daubing etc. and live piously. Besides food and dress, she would be given a small amount as salary; but if got sick she had to stay outside till be cured. All these commands and permissions were given and agreed upon; she was asked to make her confession and communion in the church and she did so. Thus six of us, having received Holy Communion, started from the church, by opening the door of the new gate, walking through the newly made path. When we reached to the door on the north entering through the southern door of the convent wall, Priorachen was lighting the roll. We were told to enter up and go to the prayer room and procuratress also allowed to enter with us only for this time to see everything.</p> |
|---|---|

2.2.4.6.2. Text in CMM

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>27നു ആറു മണിക്ക് മെലെഴു തിയ നാലു കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളും മുന്യുണ്ടായ സഹായക്കാരത്തി വസുരി ദീനത്താൽ വീട്ടിൽ അയച്ചു. സർവ്വേശൻ അവൾക്കു പകരമായിട്ട് ഈ കുനമ്മാവുകരയിൽ പഴമയും വെണ്ടത്തക്കവരുമായ പഴെമ്പ</p> | <p>On 27th at 6 o'clock, the above mentioned four sisters and as the former helper was sent to home because of smallpox, instead of her Almighty had given a new young helper named Thresia – from an</p> |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>ഇളി അന്നായെന്ന തറവാട്ടുകാരത്തി ത്രെസ്യായ എന്നുള്ള പെരായ ഒരു ചെറുപ്പക്കാരത്തിയെയും എടക്കൊച്ചി എടവകക്കാരത്തിയായ മൂന്നു വർഷം മുമ്പിനാൽ ഇവിടെ വന്ന് ഭക്തിയാൽ പാർത്തുവന്ന ഒരു വയസ്സി പ്രകുരദൊര അമ്പെഷക്കാരത്തിയെയും ഇങ്ങനെ 6 പെരും ശുദ്ധ കുർബാനയും കൈക്കൊണ്ട് അവർക്കായി വച്ച പുത്തൻപടികടന്ന് പുത്തൻ വഴിയെ വരികയും... (CMM II, 92 [136]).</p> | <p>ancient and well known family of Koonammavu called Pazhamppilly and an old and pious woman who had come to Koonammavu 3 years before from Edakochi was taken as procuratress. Thus all six after receiving Holy communion, entering the new gate which was prepared for them, came through the new way....</p> |
|--|---|

2.2.4.6.3. Text in Parappuram

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>കുന്നമ്മാവ് സന്യാസ ആശ്രത്തിന്റെ സമീപം കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കായി ഒരു മാത്തിന് അടിസ്ഥാനമിട്ട് പണി ആരംഭിച്ചു എന്നു മേൽ വിവരിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ടല്ലോ. എന്നാൽ 1867 ജൂൺ മാസം 27-ാം തിയതിയൊടുകൂടി ഏതാനും കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്ക് പാർപ്പാൻ തക്കതിന് വണ്ണമുള്ള മുറികളും ഊട്ടു മുറി മുതലായതും പുറമെനിന്നുവന്നു പാർത്തു പഠിക്കുന്ന പെൺ പൈതങ്ങൾക്കു വേണ്ടിയുള്ള വിടുതി ഇസ്കൂളും ഒക്കെയും ശേലായി. ഈ ആണ്ട് ഈ മാസത്തിൽ ഈ സ്ഥലത്തിനു സമീപത്തിൽ പനമ്പുകൊണ്ട് ഉണ്ടാക്കപ്പെട്ടിരുന്ന വീട്ടിൽ പാർത്തിരുന്ന കന്യകളെ പുതിയ മാത്തിൽ കൊണ്ടുവന്നു പാർപ്പിച്ച് സന്യാസാനുഷ്ഠാനക്രമ ജീവിതം തുടങ്ങി (Parappuram 1124, 1125).</p> | <p>As explained above, nearby the Monastery at Koonammavu, the foundation was laid for a convent and started the construction. By 1867 June 27th, the rooms for the stay of the nuns, the refectory etc., the boarding school (<i>viduthi school?</i>) for the girls from outside to stay and study were got ready beautifully. In the same year and same month, the nuns who were staying in a convent made of bamboo mat in a nearby place were brought and made to live in the new convent and started to lead religious life according to the rules.</p> |

2.2.4.6.4. Comments

Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara came to the *panambumadam* on March 25th, the feast of Annunciation and asked the sisters and the helper (lay sister) who had come

back after receiving the holy communion to pack and keep ready everything. The fathers saw to it that all the important affairs of the TOCD religious community for Women should be related to the feast dates of Our Lady. It points to their deep-rooted devotion to the blessed Mother.

The fathers instructed the sisters to pack the things and sent them to the new convent and they themselves, after receiving the Holy Communion proceed to the new convent.

They took with them a laywoman Thresia who was appointed as the one who has to take care mainly the material affairs of the convent (അന്വേഷിതാ - *procuratress*). The chronicler gives the minute descriptions of their “procession” to the new convent. As they entered the new convent, they saw Fr. Chavara lighting the candlesticks. They are asked to assemble in the chapel.

In *CMM* Fr. Chavara gives more details about the event. It happened on 27th March at 6 am. Fr. Parappuram gives a general narration of it.⁴⁸

2.2.4.7. Canonical Vestition and Blessing of the New Convent

2.2.4.7.1. Canonical Vestition

2.2.4.7.1.1. *CKC* Text one

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| ശു. പിതാവിന്റെ തിരുനാളായ 19-നു അടുത്തതിനാൽ വെഗത്തിൽ ഉടപ്പ് കുത്തി ഉണ്ടാ | ... since 19 th March, the feast of our Father St. Joseph was approaching, one day we were |

⁴⁸However, in that narration Fr. Parappuram had made two mistakes: Instead of March 27th he had put the entrance into the new convent as 27th June. So too his expression that the new convent was *near* by the *panambumadam* is also questionable according to *CKC*.

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>കണെ എന്നും ഒരു ദിവസം കൽപിച്ചതിനാൽ വെണ്ടും വണ്ണം ഒക്കെയും തീർന്നില്ല എങ്കിലും 4 ഊവ, സ്കപ്പുളാര ഞങ്ങൾ കുത്തിയുണ്ടാക്കി (CKC I, 53).</p> | <p>asked to make our habits soon. Even though everything was not completed perfectly, we managed to stitch and make 4 habits and scapulars.</p> |
|--|---|

2.2.4.7.1.2. CKC Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>... അപ്രകാരം ഞങ്ങൾ കരറി പ്രാർത്ഥനാമുറിയിൽ കടന്ന് മുട്ടുകുത്തിയയുടൻ ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ സൂർപ്പെളരും സ്തൊളയും ഇട്ടു നിന്നു. പ്രിയൊരച്ചൻ വന്ന് നമ്മുടെ അൾത്താരയിലുള്ള നാലു മെഴുകുതിരികളും കത്തിച്ച ഉടൻ മുപ്പച്ചൻ എന്ത് നീ അപെക്ഷിക്കുന്നു എന്നുള്ള ക്രമപ്രകാരം ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മയൊട് ചൊദിച്ചു. കർമ്മ ലീത്താ മൂന്നാം സഭ ശേഷവും ഉത്തരിച്ചുടൻ ഊവകളും സ്കപ്പുളാരയും മുട്ടാക്കയും റുൾമാ ചെയ്ത് ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മയെ ഉടുപ്പിച്ചു. ഇതായത്: മുൻപിനാൽ: സ്തൊസാ ചൊല്ലി തലയിലെ നാടൻ നീക്കി പിന്നെ ഊവ കഴുത്തിൽയിട്ടു. സഹായക്കാ രത്തി സഹായിച്ച് ഉടുപ്പിച്ചു. പിന്നെ എടയിലുള്ള ചരട് കെട്ടിച്ചു. പിന്നെ സ്കപ്പുളാര ഓടക്കം വലു മുട്ടാക്കചീല വിടൂർത്ത് തലയിൽ ഇട്ടു. പിന്നെ മെഴുകുതിരി കത്തിച്ച് കയ്യിൽ പിടിപ്പിച്ചു. ഹന്നാൻ വെള്ളവും തളിച്ചു. പിന്നെ എഴുന്നെൽപിച്ച് ത്രോണൊ സിന്റെ നടുവിൽ മുത്തിച്ചു. പിന്നെ നടുവിൽ ആചാരവും ചെയ്ത് വന്ന് ഉടുപ്പിച്ച ദെല. അച്ചന്റെ കാക്കൽ വന്ന് മുട്ടു കുത്തി കൈമുത്തിച്ചു. ഇങ്ങനെ 2 മത അന്ന 3 മത ത്രെസുയാ; 4 ക്ലാര ഈ നാലു</p> | <p>Thus we went up to the prayer room and knelt down, soon Rev. Moopachan, wearing the surplice and stole came and stood in front of us. As soon as Priorachan came and lighted the four candles on the altar, Mooppachan asked to the superior according to the regulations, “what do you seek for?” When she replied, ‘I desire to join, the Third Order of the Carmelites...’ etc., the habits, the scapular and the head dress were blessed and the superior was clothed with them. That is, first a prayer was said and the nadan (shawl), covering the head was removed and then habit was put on the neck. Our helper Thresia assisted to wear it. Then a cord was tied as belt around the waist. After that, the scapular was given and lastly the big veil was unfolded and put on the head. Then a lighted candle was given to her and sprinkled the Holy water. Then she was made to get up and kneel at the centre of the Altar and genuflected in the middle, and then came to the Fr. Delegate who clothed her, knelt at his feet and kissed his hands. In this same way, secondly Anna,</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>പെരെയും ഉടുപ്പിച്ചുടൻ അന്വേഷക്കാരത്തിയെ കഞ്ഞിവെപ്പാൻ താഴെ അയച്ചു. ഉടൻ കുറെ ഗുണദോഷം പറഞ്ഞുകൊണ്ട്... (CKC I, 57) .</p> | <p>thirdly Thresia and fourthly Clara, all four were clothed and soon after that, the procuratress was sent down to cook rice. Immediately said an exhortation....</p> |
|---|--|

2.2.4.7.1.3. Text in CMM

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>... പുത്തൻ മഠത്തിൽ കടന്നുടൻ പെ. ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ അതിനടുത്ത ക്രമത്തോടും കൂടെ സഹായക്കാരത്തി സഹായിച്ചുകൊണ്ട് അവരെ നാലു പെരെയും ഊവ, സ്കാപ്പുളാര, തലമുടി, വെട്ടിയനാടൻ ഇതൊക്കെയും ഉടുപ്പിച്ചു... (CMM II, 92 [137]).</p> | <p>When (they) entered in to the new convent, V. Rev. Mooppachan in accordance with the regulations, clothed four of them, habit, scapular, veil, etc. with the assistance of the helper.</p> |

2.2.4.7.1.4. Comments

Since the day of vestition was approaching, the sisters were encouraged to stitch up their religious habit as early as possible. The following were the main elements of the vestition ceremony:

- As the sisters knelt down, Fr. Leopold, the Provincial Delegate (who was the canonical superior and the one who represented the Carmelite Provincial) put on Surplice and stole.
- Fr. Prior lighted the four candles on the altar.⁴⁹
- Fr. Leopold, according to the regulations asked the superior “what do you seek for?”

⁴⁹On the derogatory remark of Sr. Suicy on the role of Fr. Chavara connected with the lighting of the lamps in *SGME* 138, 240, 280 see our comments in *AUSW* 104-105.

- The superior replied: “I desire to join the Third Order of the Carmelites ...”
- Fr. Leopold blessed the habit, scapular and headdress by saying a prayer.
- The shawl covering the head was removed and the habit was put on the superior with the assistance of the helper (lay sister).
- A cord was tied as belt around the waist
- Then the scapular was given
- The big veil was unfolded and put on the head
- A lighted candle was given to the superior
- Holy water was sprinkled on her
- She was made to get up and kiss the centre of the altar
- Superior genuflected in the middle, came to the Provincial Delegate knelt at his feet and kissed his hands.
- The same ceremonies were repeated in the cases of Sr. Anna, Sr. Thresia and Sr. Clara.
- There followed an exhortation.

In *CMM*, Fr. Chavara does not add any new element to the details given in *CKC*.

2.2.4.7.2. Blessing of the New Convent

2.2.4.7.2.1. Text in *CKC*

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| ... ഉടൻ കുറെ ഗുണദോഷം പറഞ്ഞും കൊണ്ട് മഠം റൂൾമാ ചെയ്തു. പ്രാർത്ഥനാമുറി മുതൽ എല്ലാ മുറികളിലും | ...soon after giving some exhortations, the convent was blessed. Starting from the prayer |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>കടന്ന് റൂൾമായും ചെയ്ത് വെള്ളം തളിച്ചു. ആകമാനമുറിയിൽ വന്നു. മുട്ടാക്കചീലമടക്കി വച്ചുകൊള്ളുവാനും പള്ളിയിലും പുറത്തൊട്ടും പൊകുംപൊൾ മാത്രം യിതുമതിയെന്നും ഞാവ, സ്കപ്പുളാരതലമുടി എന്നെരവും നീക്കിക്കൂടാ എന്നും രാത്രിയിൽ ഉറക്കത്തിന് കട്ടിലിന്റെ ചെരൈ ചെന്ന് മുറിയിലുള്ള ചെറിയ വങ്ക കട്ടിലിന്റെ തലഭാഗത്ത് ചെർത്തവച്ച് കിടക്കയും എന്നാലും ചട്ടയ്ക്ക് പുറമെ എപ്പൊഴും ഇട്ടുനടക്കുന്ന റൊശിനിറമുള്ള സ്കപ്പുളാര ഉറക്കത്തിലും ഉഴരിക്കൂടാ എന്നും അറിഞ്ഞിരിക്കട്ടെ (CKC I, 57-58).</p> | <p>room, entered all rooms, blessed them and sprinkled holy water. At last, came to the common room and (we were) told to take off the mantle and to fold and keep it; it was enough to wear it when (we) went to the church and outside; but the habit, scapular and the veil, should never be removed. In the night, when go to sleep, take the small bench which is in the room, and keep it beside the cot near the head side (and keep them on it). However, this must be known that the rose (brown) colour scapular which is wearing over the jacket should not be taken off even while sleeping.</p> |
|---|--|

2.2.4.7.2.2. Text in CMM

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>... ഇതൊക്കെയും ഉടുപ്പിച്ച് മറവും മുറികളും റൂൾമായും ചെയ്ത് വലിയമണി, ചെറിയമണി, മരമണി ഇതൊക്കെയും കൊട്ടിക്കൊട്ടി പ്രൊക്കൂരദൊരായിട്ട് കിളവനെയും നിയമിച്ച്, സമസ്തവും കഴിച്ച് പതിനൊന്നു മണിക്കകത്ത് ഞങ്ങൾ പൊരികയും ചെയ്തു (CMM II, 92-93 [137]).</p> | <p>... after clothing all these and blessing the convent and rooms, showing how to ring the big bell, the small bell and the wooden bell and appointing an old man as procurator, finishing all these we returned by 11 o' clock.</p> |

2.2.4.7.2.3. Comments

After the exhortation, Fr. Leopold blessed⁵⁰ the convent and sprinkled every room with Holy water. He gave

⁵⁰ റൂൾമ ചെയ്ക (to bless) – A Syriac term which connotes setting apart signing, which is more biblical than mere blessing. It seems to refer to a ceremony of signing with the holy oil.

instruction that the cope (mantle) needs to be used in the chapel and when going outside. The sisters are not supposed to remove the religious habit, scapular and veil except during night sleep. Even then the small scapular with the rose colour should not be removed at all. *CMM* further mentions that the Fathers taught the sisters how to ring the big, small and wooden bells.

2.2.4.8. Profession of the First Members

Although the vestition ceremony took place on 27 March 1867, it was on 16 July 1868 that they made their canonical profession (probably after the time of the canonical novitiate). Fr. Chavara has thus recorded in *CMM*:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഇതാ 68 കർക്കടകം 16 നു നമ്മുടെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാത്തിൽ ഒന്നാമത് കുടിയവർ 4 പെരും പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു ചെയ്തു (<i>CMM</i> II, 100 [141]).</p> | <p>Those four who first joined in our convent, made their profession on 16th July.</p> |

In his *Diary* Fr. Varkey Parappuram thus recorded about the profession of the sisters:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഈ ആണ്ടായ 68 ജൂലൈ 18-ൽ (?) കുന്നമ്മാവ് ആശ്രമത്തിനു സമീപമുള്ള കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാത്തിൽ ആദ്യം കുടിയവരായ നാലു കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു ചെയ്തു. ദിവ്യ ശ്രീ. ലെയോപ്പോൾദ് മുപ്പച്ചനും ദിവ്യ ശ്രീ. പ്രിയോരച്ചനും മറ്റും ഇതിനായി ഈ മാത്തിൽ ചെന്ന് ഈ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിനടുത്ത കർമ്മങ്ങൾ ഒക്കെയും ശേലായി നിറവേറ്റി. മലയാളത്തിൽ കന്യാകാ</p> | <p>In this year 1868 July 18th⁵¹ the four sisters who were joined first in the convent near by the monastery at Koonammavu, took their profession. V. Rev. Fr. Leopold and V. Rev. Fr. Prior went to this convent and conducted all the ceremonies related to the profession with</p> |

⁵¹The copyist seems to have made a mistake in writing the date of profession. Instead of July 16th, which was the feast day of Our Lady of Mount Carmel, he has written 18th July. See, *CMM* II, 100 [141] and *CKC* I, 90.

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>മം ഉണ്ടായി അതിൽ ചേർന്ന കന്യകകൾ ആദ്യമായി ചെയ്ത പഠിപ്പിച്ച ഇതാകകൊണ്ട് അവർക്കും മറ്റുള്ളവർക്കും ഇതെ കുറിച്ച് അനൽപമായ സന്തോഷ മല്ല ഉണ്ടായത് (<i>Diary of Fr. Parappuram</i>, 1200).</p> | <p>full of decorum. Since in this Malayalam it was the first convent and it was the first profession of the members who joined in it for the first time, the happiness everyone felt was not less.</p> |
|---|--|

Even though Fr. Varkey did not give all the details of the ceremony, he says that Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara officiated at the ceremonies with full of decorum and devotion. As it was the first event of women making their profession in Kerala, everyone felt happy at it. *CKC* gives more details about the spiritual preparation conducted under the guidance of Fr. Leopold, the Provincial Delegate as well as the ‘superior of the convent’.⁵²

⁵² The fact that Fr. Leopold was called as the superior of the convent deserves special attention. The title “the superior of the convent” is repeated in *CKC* II, on pages 99-107, 12 times in the official record concerning professions. What does this designation means? It signifies that Fr. Leopold was the official superior who had canonical authority over the sisters. That was why he accepted the vows of the sisters. As we have stated earlier it was Fr. Leopold who himself officiated the ceremony of Vestition. We do not find any special canonical role to mother Eliswa during both ceremonies. This fact can be contrasted with the ceremony of the profession of the first eleven TOCD fathers on December 8th, 1855. The profession of Fr. Chavara was made before Marceline Moopachan, the Delegate of Archbishop Bernardine. Afterwards, it was before Fr. Chavara, the superior (the prior?), that the other ten fathers made their profession. Concerning the case of sisters, mother Eliswa does not play any precise role like that of Fr. Chavara. It was as the first member of the community that mother Eliswa made her vows first before Fr. Leopold, the canonical superior.

2.2.4.8.1. CKC Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>മെടമാസത്തിൽ നമ്മുടെ പിതാവായ മുപ്പച്ചൻ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മയോടു പറഞ്ഞാപ്പ് ചെയിവാറുള്ള കാര്യം പറഞ്ഞു. ഈ കാര്യം സ: അന്ന സ: ത്രെസ്യോ സ: ക്ലാര ഈ മുൻ പെരൊടും പറവാറും ഈ കാര്യത്തിന് വെണ്ടി താൽപര്യമായിട്ട് അപേക്ഷിക്കണമെന്നും അവരവരുടെ മനസ്സിൽ തൊന്നും വണ്ണം അച്ചനെ ബൊധിപ്പിക്കണമെന്നും കൽപിച്ചു (CKC I, 90).</p> | <p>In the month of April our Fr. Mooppachan told the mother superior concerning their profession. He told her to tell this matter to all three sisters, Sr. Anna, Sr. Thresia and Sr. Clara and asked to pray earnestly for it and to tell him as they feel in their minds about it.</p> |

Fr. Leopold told mother Eliswa that he was willing to allow the first four members (mother Eliswa, Sr. Anna, Sr. Thresia and Sr. Clara) to make their profession. They should prepare for it with ardent prayers and inform him about their willingness.

2.2.4.8.2. CKC Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ഇടവമാസം 11-ാംനു സ: മരിയം ത്രെസ്യായ്ക്ക് ശു. വസ്ത്രം കൊടുക്കുന്ന ദിവസത്തിൽ നമ്മുടെ പി: മുപ്പച്ചൻ വന്ന് ക്രമം പൊലെ ഉടുപ്പ് കൊടുത്ത് ശേഷം ഞങ്ങളെല്ലാവരും ഉല്ലാസമുറിയിൽ വന്നപ്പൊൾ പെ. ബ. മുപ്പച്ചൻ പറഞ്ഞു പറഞ്ഞാപ്പ് ചെയ്യുന്ന കാര്യം പെ. ബ. മെത്രോപ്പോളിത്താച്ചനെ ബൊധിപ്പിച്ചപ്പൊൾ മുൻപ് മഠത്തിൽ കൂടിയ 4 പെർക്കും ഇപ്പൊൾ പറഞ്ഞാപ്പ് ചെയിവാൻ അനുവദിച്ചു. ആയത് കർക്കടക മാസം 16-ാംനു കർമ്മലമാതാവിന്റെ തിരുനാൾ ദിവസത്തിൽ പറഞ്ഞാപ്പു ചെയ്യാമെന്നും കൽപിച്ചു (CKC I, 90).</p> | <p>May 11th on the day of the vestition of Sr. Mariam Thresia, our Fr. Mooppachan came and gave the religious habit as per the regulations and after that when all of us gathered in the recreation room, V. Rev. Mooppachan told, “when the most Rev. Archbishop was informed about the profession, he allowed to make the profession now, for the four who joined the convent first. He also said that it could be done on 16th of July on the feast day of the Mother of Carmel.</p> |

CKC 1, 90 records the precise occasion when Fr. Leopold told to the sisters about his willingness to admit them for the profession. It was on 11th May, when Sr. Mariam

Thresia was given the habit. Afterwards the sisters were gathered in the recreation room. He informed them that the Archbishop has given his consent for the profession. The date of profession was fixed on July 16th, the feast of Our Lady of Mount Carmel.

2.2.4.8.3. CKC Text Three

This text of CKC I, 201 provides the record regarding the profession of the first four members:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>68 കർക്കടകം 16 നു നമ്മുടെ അമ്മ കർമ്മല മാതാവിൻ തിരുനാളിനു പത്തുദിവസം മുൻപിൽ ഒന്നാമതു മഠത്തിൽ ചേർന്നവരെ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്യിക്കാനുള്ള സംഗതി പെ.ബ. വിഗാരി പ്രൊവിൻസ്യൽ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചനെ ബോധിപ്പിച്ച് ആ ദേഹത്തിന്റെ കൽപനപ്രകാരം മുറപോലെയുള്ള പത്തുദിവസത്തെ ധ്യാനവും കഴിച്ച് മേലെഴുതിയ ദിവസത്തിൽ ശു. കുർബാനയും കൈക്കൊണ്ട നാളിതാ 9 മണിക്ക് സ. ഏലീശായെയും സ. അന്നായെയും സ. ത്രേസ്യായെയും സ. ക്ലാരയെയും പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്യിച്ചു.</p> <p>ദെ.പ്ര.ലെ.യോപ്പോൾ മരിയ ദെസം ജൂസെ (ഒപ്പ്) (CKC I, 201).</p> | <p>Ten days before the feast of our Mother of Carmel on 16th of July '68, in accordance with the order of the Archbishop V. Rev. Vicar Provincial who was informed about it, the first four members who joined in the convent, according to the regulation the 10 days retreat was done and on the above said day, receiving the Holy Communion at 9 o'clock Sr. Eliswa, Sr. Anna, Sr. Thresia and Sr. Clara were made to take their vows.</p> <p>V. Rev. Leopold Maria of St. Joseph (sign)</p> |

According to the text, the Vicar Provincial asked the permission of the Archbishop and after getting the permission, ten days retreat was given to the first four sisters as preparation for taking vows. So too, the profession ceremony took place in the morning at 9 o'clock.

2.2.4.8.4. CKC Text Four

CKC II, 99-102 thus officially recorded the fact of taking the vows by four sisters before the canonical superior Fr. Leopold.

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>1) മലയാളത്തിലെ വരാപ്പുഴ വികാരിയാത്തിൽ കുരിശുകൽ പള്ളി ഇടവകയിൽ വൈപ്പിച്ചെരി തൊമ്മൻ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാരും എന്നവരിൽ നിന്നു 1831-ാം കാലം തുലാമാസം 3 നു പിറന്ന വൈപ്പിച്ചെരി ഏലീശ 1866-ാം കാലം കുറുമാസം 13നു കൂനമ്മാവുകൽ ത്രെസ്യോ പുണ്യവാളത്തിയുടെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാത്തിൽ അനുവാദ പ്രകാരം സഭയുടെ ഉടുപ്പുടുത്ത സ. ഏലീശ ദെ സാന്ത മരിയ എന്നു പെരു ധരിച്ച ടി. മത്തിൽ തന്നെ 1868-ാം കാലം കർക്കടക മാസം 16നു മത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠനായ പെ. ബ. ലെയൊ പൊൾദൊസ മുപ്പൻ പാദ്രി അച്ചന്റെ കയ്യിൽ പ്രാർത്ഥന സ്ഥലത്തിൽ വെച്ച എല്ലാ സഹൊദരികളുടെ മുമ്പാകെ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു ചെയ്തു.</p> | <p>1) Vaipissery Eliswa, born, on 3rd October 1831, of Vaipissery Thomman and Kathreena of the parish of Kurisungal church, in the Vicariate of Verapoly in Malayalam, was joined in the convent of St. Teresa at Koonammavu and vested in the religious habit of that Order with due permission and took her name as Sr. Eliswa of St. Maria on 13th February 1866. In the same convent on 16th July 1868, she made her profession in the presence of all the sisters in the prayer room, through V. Rev. Leopold Moopan Padri who was the Fr. superior of the convent.</p> |
| <p>എന്ന് 1868-ാം കാലം കർക്കടക മാസം 16 നു പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു ചെയ്ത സ.: പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു കൈക്കൊണ്ടു: സ. സ. സ.</p> | <p>On 16th July 1868 One who made the vow: One who received the vow: Witness Witness</p> |
| <p>2) വരാപ്പുഴ വികാരിയാത്തിൽ കൂനമ്മാവുകൽ ടി. പള്ളി ഇടവകയിൽ വാകയിൽ ദെവസ്സി ഏലീശ്യാ എന്നവരിൽ നിന്നു 1850-ാം കാലം മെടമാസം 21 നു പിറന്ന വാകയിൽ അന്ന 1866 ാം കാലം കുറുമാസം 13 നു കൂനമ്മാവുകൽ ത്രെസ്യോ പുണ്യവാളത്തിൽ</p> | <p>2) Vakayil Anna, born on 21st April 1850 of Vakayil Devassy and Eliswa of the parish of Koonammavu, in the Vicariate of Verapoly in Malayalam, was joined in the convent of St. Teresa at Koonammavu and</p> |

യുടെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാത്തിൽ അനുവാദപ്രകാരം സഭയുടെ ഉടുപ്പുടുത്ത സ. ഈശോയുടെ തിരുഹൃദയത്തിന്റെ അന്ന എന്നു പെരുയാരിച്ച ടി. മാത്തിൽ തന്നെ 1868-ാം കാലം കർക്കടകമാസം 16 നു മാത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠനായ പെ. ബ. ലെയൊപ്പൊൾദൊസ മുപ്പൻ പാദ്രി അച്ചന്റെ കയ്യിൽ പ്രാർത്ഥന സ്ഥലത്തിൽ വെച്ച് എല്ലാ സഹൊദരികളുടെ മുമ്പാകെ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു ചെയ്തു.

എന്ന് 1868-ാം കാലം കർക്കടകമാസം 16 നു

പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു ചെയ്ത സ. :

പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു കൈക്കൊണ്ട:

സ.

സ.

3) മലയാളത്തിലെ വരാപ്പുഴെ വികാരിയാത്തിൽ കുരിശുകൽ പള്ളി ഇടവകയിൽ വൈപ്പിച്ചെരി തൊമ്മൻ കന്യാസ്ത്രീ എന്നവരിൽ നിന്നു 1848-ാം കാലം എടവമാസം 8 നു പിറന്ന വൈപ്പിച്ചെരി ത്രെസ്യ 1866-ാം കാലം കുഭമാസം 13 നു കുന്ദമാവുകൽ ത്രെസ്യൊപ്പുണ്ണുവാളത്തിയുടെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാത്തിൽ അനുവാദപ്രകാരം സഭയുടെ ഉടുപ്പുടുത്ത സ. ത്രെസ്യ ദെ ഈശോ എന്നു പെരുയാരിച്ച ടി. മാത്തിൽ തന്നെ 1868-ാം കാലം കർക്കടകമാസം 16 നു കാലത്ത് 8 മണിക്ക് മാത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠനായ പെ. ബ. ശ്രേഷ്ഠ. ലെയൊപ്പൊൾദൊസ മുപ്പൻ പാദ്രി അച്ചന്റെ കയ്യിൽ പ്രാർത്ഥന സ്ഥലത്തിൽ വെച്ച് എല്ലാ സഹൊദരികളുടെ മുമ്പാകെ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു ചെയ്തു. എന്ന് 1868-ാം കാലം കർക്കടകമാസം 16 നു-

പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പിച്ചു ചെയ്ത സ.:

vested in the religious habit of that Order with due permission and took her name as Sr. Anna of Sacred Heart of Jesus on 13th February 1866. In the same convent, on 16th July 1868 she made her profession in the presence of all the sisters, in the prayer room, through V. Rev. Leopold Moopan Padri who was the Fr. superior of the convent.

On 16th July 1868

One who made the vow:

One who received the vow:

Witness

Witness

3) Vaipissery Thresia born on 8th May 1848 of Vaipissery Thomman and Kathreena of the parish of Kurisungal church, in the Vicariate of Verapoly in Malayalam, was joined in the convent of St. Teresa at Koonammavu and vested in the religious habit of that Order with due permission and took her name as Sr. Thresia of Jesus on 13th February 1866. In the same convent, on 16th July 1868, at 8 am she made her profession in the presence of all the sisters, in the prayer room through V. Rev. Leopold Moopan Padri who was the Fr. Superior of the convent.

On 16th July 1868

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം കൈക്കൊണ്ട:</p> <p>സ.</p> <p>സ.</p> <p>4) വരാപ്പുഴെ വികാരിയാത്തിൽ വൈക്കത്തു പള്ളി ഇടവകയിൽ പുത്തനങ്ങാടി വർക്കി അന്നാ എന്നവരിൽ നിന്നു 1827-ാം കാലം മിഥുനമാസം 25നു പിറന്ന പുത്ത നങ്ങാടി ഏലീശ 1866-ാം കാലം കുറുമാസം 13 നു കുനമ്മാവുകൽ ത്രെസ്യോ പുണ്യവാളത്തിയുടെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠത്തിൽ അനുവാദ പ്രകാരം സഭയുടെ ഉടുപ്പടുത്ത സ. ക്ലാർ ദെ സാന്ത മറിയം എന്നു പെരു ധരിച്ച ടി. മഠത്തിൽ തന്നെ 1868- റം കാലം കർക്കടകമാസം 16 റംനു കാലത്ത് 8 മണിക്ക് മഠത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠനായ പെ. ബ. പ്രെ. ലെയൊപ്പൊൾദൊസ മുപ്പൻ പാദ്രി അച്ചന്റെ കയ്യിൽ പ്രാർത്ഥന സ്ഥലത്തിൽ വെച്ച് എല്ലാ സഹൊദരികളുടെ മുമ്പാകെ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്തു.</p> <p>എന്ന് 1868-ാം കാലം കർക്കടക മാസം 16 നു</p> <p>പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്ത സ.:</p> <p>പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം കൈക്കൊണ്ട</p> <p>സ.</p> <p>സ.</p> | <p>One who made the vow:</p> <p>One who received the vow:</p> <p>Witness</p> <p>Witness</p> <p>4) Puthenangadi Eliswa born on 25th June 1827 of Puthenangady Varkey-Anna of the parish of Vaikom, in the Vicariate of Verapoly in Malayalam, was joined in the convent of St. Teresa at Koonammavu and vested in the religious habit of that Order with due permission and took her name as Sr. Clara of St. Maria on 13th February⁵³ 1866. In the same convent, on 16th July 1868, at 8 a.m. she made her profession in the presence of all the sisters, in the prayer room through V. Rev. Leopold Moopan Padri who was the Fr. superior of the convent.</p> <p>On 16th July 1868</p> <p>One who made the vow:</p> <p>One who received the vow:</p> <p>Witness</p> <p>Witness</p> |
|---|--|

⁵³As *CKC* I, 8-9 and 13-14 prove, even though Puthenangady Eliswa arrived at Koonammavu on 11th February 1866, she was allowed to join in *panambumadam* only on 14th February, not on 13th February as said here in the record of profession. For further detail see above No. 2.1.6. 'Clara as the Fourth Member.'

Here we see the documents regarding the profession of the sisters. The format of the recording of the profession is the same for everyone. The former part of the document provides the details about their vicariate, parish, family, parents, date of birth, date of joining as well as the new names given to the candidate. Also the date of profession, the person who accepted the profession, the place and the persons who were present to the ceremonies are mentioned.

2.2.4.9. A Grateful Reflection of Praise

At the completion of the new convent and the canonical beginning of religious life, with the ceremonies of vestition and profession, the souls of those who cherished that dream and untiringly laboured for its fulfillment, turned to the Lord Almighty with joy, gratitude and praise. All of them acknowledged that it was accomplished only because of the wonderful providence and guidance of the merciful Lord. Fr. Chavara, Archbishop Bernardine, the TOCD men author/s of *Alochanapusthakam*, Fr. Varkey Parappuram and Sr. Anna, the chronicler on behalf of the community has given vent to their inner sentiments.

2.2.4.9.1. Heartbeats of a New Simeon

2.2.4.9.1.1. Text

When a well-furnished convent was constructed in 1867, Fr. Chavara thus exclaimed:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>സർവ്വേശ്വരാ എന്നെ അധികം കടപ്പെടുത്തുവാനായിട്ട് ഇതിനെയും കാൺമാൻ ഇനിക്ക് ആയുസ്സു നീളിച്ചിട്ടു എന്നു ഞാൻ നിരൂപിക്കുന്നു. തനിക്ക് എപ്പോഴും എല്ലായ്പ്പോഴും സ്തുതി വർദ്ധിക്കട്ടെ, ആമ്മൻ (CMM II, 93 [137]).</p> | <p>Sovereign Lord, I believe that you allowed me to live so long so that I may be able to see this and feel all the more, greatly obliged to you. Greater praise be to you now and forever, Amen.</p> |

2.2.4.9.1.2. Comments

We can interpret these words in the light of Lk. 2: 29-32. There the prophet Simeon was given a promise that he will not die before seeing the Son of God with his own eyes. After receiving this grace, he thus prayed: “Now Lord, you have kept your promise, and you may let your servant go in peace. With my own eyes I have seen your salvation, which you have prepared in the presence of all peoples: a light to reveal your will to the Gentiles and bring glory to your people Israel.” Fr. Chavara also addresses God as Sovereign Lord (സർവ്വേശ്വരാ). His life span was increased in order to see this blessed sight of the foundation. He looks at the well-established community as a saving gift from the Lord of Salvation and glory for many people. Fr. Chavara thinks that he is put in great obligation (അധികം കടപ്പെടുത്തുവാനായിട്ട്) on account of it. It seems that he was thinking his sacred duty to render more praise and thanks to the Almighty God as he states: “Greater praise be to you now and forever, Amen” (തനിക്ക് എപ്പോഴും എല്ലായ്പ്പോഴും സ്തുതി വർദ്ധിക്കട്ടെ, ആമ്മേൻ). In this act of praise we can see the portrait of a saintly soul who was not only interested in having a men Congregation but also a religious community of women who can render great service for the Church of Kerala, especially for the empowerment of women.⁵⁴

⁵⁴Does not this outpouring of the soul of Fr. Chavara speak volumes and attest to his very active, dynamic and unending involvement in the process of starting religious life for women in Kerala? Who can deny that here does not vibrate the heart of a founding father? In this light the categorical denial of Sr. Sucey that Fr. Chavara had no role in the origin of religious life for women in Kerala (cf. *PTSS* 62, 75, 76, 79-80) has no validity at all.

2.2.4.9.2. Words of Fr. Leopold

2.2.4.9.2.1. Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>ഈ മഠം ഉണ്ടാക്കിയതു ഞാനുമല്ല, പ്രിയോരച്ചനുമല്ല. പിന്നെയോ തമ്പുരാൻ ഞങ്ങളെക്കൊണ്ടു ചെയ്യിപ്പിച്ചു (CKC I, 65). ഈ മഠമുണ്ടായതും ഇങ്ങനെ ഒക്കെയും നടന്നതും മുൻപിലത്തെ തലവന്റെ അവസ്ഥയും ഓർത്താൽ ഇത് ഒരു പ്രത്യക്ഷമാകുന്നു. ഈ മഠമുണ്ടായതിനെക്കുറിച്ച് ഒരിക്കലേങ്കിലും എന്റെ ഹൃദയത്തിൽ ഒരു സന്തോഷമുണ്ടായിട്ടില്ല... നിഗളത്താൽ നിറഞ്ഞ എന്റെ ഹൃദയത്തിൽ ഒരിക്കലേങ്കിലും ഈ മഠം ഞാൻ ഉണ്ടാക്കിയതാകുന്നു എന്ന ഒരു പരീക്ഷപോലും എന്റെ ഹൃദയത്തിൽ വന്നിട്ടില്ല. എല്ലാം കൊണ്ടും തമ്പുരാൻ ഇതിനെ നടത്തി വരുന്നതിനെ ഓർത്താൽ ഇനി താൻ തന്നെ ഇതിനെ നടത്തുമെന്ന് എനിക്കു നല്ല ഉറപ്പുണ്ട് (CKC I, 128).</p> | <p>Neither myself nor Piorachan who made this convent. But God has made us to do this. If it is remembered how this convent was made, things being done and the state of the former head (bishop), it is really a miracle. I have never at least once felt happy in my heart for having made this convent.... In my heart filled with pride, I never had a passing temptation that this convent was built by me. By all means God is taking care of it and I am convinced that He will protect it in the future also.</p> |

2.2.4.9.2.2. Comments

Although Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara took great pains and deeply involved in evolving the idea of a religious community for women in Kerala and making it a concrete fact Mooppachan attributes everything to the work of the Lord. They were mere instruments in the divine hands.⁵⁵ In the second part of the text, Fr. Leopold acknowledges with

⁵⁵ In this grateful acknowledgement, Fr. Leopold humbly mentions only of two names (of Fr. Chavara and himself) concerning the origins of the first indigenous community of women religious. If mother Eliswa were the inspiration behind this endeavour he would not have omitted her name.

humility the marvels that God Almighty has done for the establishment of the convent and confesses his confidence in the divine actions in the future.

2.2.4.9.3. Words of Archbishop Bernardine

2.2.4.9.3.1. Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>പെ. പെ. ബ. മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താ ചുൻ പുത്തൻ മഠം പണിയുന്നൊടത്ത് പൊയി കണ്ടു. നല്ലവണ്ണം ബൊധിച്ച് അവിടെ വാഴൂ കൊടുത്തു. ഈ കാര്യം ഇത്ര വെഗം നിറവെറിയതിൽ നിങ്ങൾക്ക് ഒരതിശയം തൊന്നുന്നില്ലേ? കഴിഞ്ഞാണ്ടിൽ ഇതുതന്നെ പണിവാൻ പണമില്ലാത്തു. ഇപ്പൊ നാലഞ്ചുമാസം കൊണ്ട് ഇതൊക്കെ നിറവെറി പള്ളിയുടെ അടുക്കൽ ഇത്ര വലുപറമ്പു കിട്ടുവാനും ഈ പണിക്കെയും നിറവെറുവാനും ഇടവന്നത് തമ്പുരാന്റെ ഒരു അതിശയം തന്നെ. ആയതുകൊണ്ട് ഈ കാര്യത്തിനുവെണ്ടി ധർമ്മം ചെയ്ത ഉപകാരികളെക്കുറിച്ച് അപെക്ഷിപ്പാൻ നിങ്ങൾക്കുമുണ്ട്. ഒരുത്തൻ നിങ്ങൾ തമ്പുരാനെ സ്നേഹിപ്പാൻ മനസ്സായിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നു കണ്ട് ഒരു വലുപറമ്പിൽ ഒരു വലു പെര കെട്ടി നിങ്ങളെ അതിൽ പാർപ്പിച്ചാൽ ആ ഉപകാരം ചെയ്ത ആളിന്റെ നെരെ നന്ദിയും സ്നേഹവും തൊന്നാതിരിക്കുമോ? ഇല്ല. അപ്പൊഴൊ നിങ്ങൾ തമ്പുരാനെ മാത്രം ഓർപ്പാനും സ്നേഹിപ്പാനും വെണ്ടി ഇത്ര അടക്കമുള്ള സ്ഥലം തന്നിരിക്കുമ്പോൾ നിങ്ങൾ തന്റെ കാര്യമല്ലാതെ വെറെ കാര്യം അന്വേഷിപ്പാൻ പൊയാൽ നിങ്ങൾ നരകത്തിൽ പൊകും (CKC I, 44).</p> | <p>V. Rev. Archbishop has visited the site of the construction of the new convent. Being satisfied, (he) gave his blessing there. ‘Don’t you feel wonder as this work has been fulfilled so quickly? Last year we did not have money to build even this (<i>panambumadam</i>). Now within four or five months so much has been built. It is only God’s miracle that we were able to get such a big compound near the church and to put up this building. Therefore, you have the (obligation) to pray for the benefactors who have donated for this purpose. If a man, knowing that you are desirous of loving God, builds a house in a big compound and makes you live in it, won’t you feel love and gratitude towards that man who did that benefit for you? Surely, you will. Then, when you are given such a modest area in order to remember and love always God alone, if you go and seek things other than God, you will go to hell’.</p> |

2.2.4.9.3.2. Comments

The Archbishop finds in the very fast completion of the new convent a wonder wrought by the Lord Almighty. In the previous year, there was no money even to construct the *panambumadam*. Now within four-five months they could purchase a big compound near to the monastery church and complete the whole work of construction. Is not this a wonder? He reminds the sisters to pray for those benefactors who had financially contributed for it.⁵⁶ How cannot they feel gratitude and love for the one who, seeing that they were willing to love the Lord, constructed a big building in a large compound and made them live there? The Lord had provided them this place most suitable for solitude and contemplation in order to constantly remember him and love him. The Archbishop concludes with a severe warning. If the sisters become engaged in other affairs which are not those of the Lord of their hearts, they will certainly be condemned to hell.

2.2.4.9.4. Words in *Alochanapusthakam*

2.2.4.9.4.1. Texts

The author/s of *Alochanapusthakam* make reflections in two places on the construction of the new convent:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>എന്നാൽ ഈ പണിനടപ്പിന്റെ അവസ്ഥ നോക്കി സൂക്ഷിക്കുമ്പോൾ രാജാക്കൾക്ക് ഏറ്റിയെ വലിയ സമ്പന്നന്മാർക്ക് അടുത്ത പൊലെ ഏറ്റിയ വേലക്കാരുകൂടി ഓരോ ദിവസം ഏറ്റിയ ചിലവ് നടത്തുന്നു. എന്നാൽ പണം ഇല്ലായ്കകൊണ്ട് മുടങ്ങുന്നതിന് ഇടയും വരുന്നില്ല. ഏതും തെങ്ങൾക്കില്ലാത്തവരെപ്പോലെ സർവ്വതും തെങ്ങൾ അടക്കിയിരിക്കുന്നുവെന്നുള്ള തിരുവചനം ഇവിടെയും</p> | <p>When we observe the process of the construction, it has been done with very many labourers day-by-day with great expenditure as if it were done by kings or great rich people. Still never, there occurred interruption in the work due to the lack of money.</p> |

⁵⁶These words of Msgr. Bernardine make clear that it is not he but others who were the contributors of the convent.

| | |
|--|--|
| തികയ്ക്കുന്നു (<i>Alochanapusthakam</i> , 140). | The holy verse that “Although we had nothing, yet we possess everything” is fulfilling here. |
|--|--|

The second text in *Alochanapusthakam* reads thus:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| ...സന്യാസമഠവും കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠവും ആയത് ഒക്കെയും സൂക്ഷിക്കുമ്പോൾ പെ. ബ. നമ്മുടെ പ്രിയൊരാളൻ പറഞ്ഞതുപോലെ തമ്പുരാൻ ഇന്ത്യയിന്മേൽ ഏറെ അനുഗ്രഹം ധാരാളമായി ചിന്തുന്നു (<i>Alochanapusthakam</i> , 170-171). | .. while looking over the monastery and convent as our V. Rev. Priorachan has said, the Lord Almighty continues to shower His abundant blessings upon India. |

2.2.4.9.4.2. Comments

In the former text, the writer was wonder-struck at seeing the process of construction, which was done with very many labourers day-by-day with great expenditure as if it were done by kings or great rich people. Never there occurred interruption in the work due to the lack of money. The writer finds here the fulfillment of the words of St. Paul in 2Cor. 6:10, although we had nothing, yet we possess everything.⁵⁷

As far as the second text is concerned, seeing the well flourishing religious communities for men and women, the author makes his own this statement made earlier by V. Rev. Priorachan: the Lord continues to shower his abundant graces

⁵⁷The text attests to the active involvement of the TOCD fathers in the whole process of the construction of the convent. In this light the negative position of Sr. Sucey on the contribution of TOCD fathers cannot have any foundation. The writer makes use of *we* in quoting the words of St. Paul. It was not only the sisters who were destitute but the fathers also themselves belong to that category. Still they consider the construction of the new convent as their own affair and confess that the Lord made them possess everything. See also above No. 2.2.4.1. ‘Land of the New Convent.’

upon India. This saying of Fr. Chavara is not recorded in *CMM*. Yet, he would have shared his inner thoughts concerning the growth of the religious communities for men and women with his con-friars. He attributes it as graces bestowed upon India itself. The writer of *Alochanapusthakam* thus gratefully raises his mind towards the merciful God.

2.2.4.9.5. The Words of Fr. Parappuram

2.2.4.9.5.1. Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>... കുനമ്മാവ് അശ്രമത്തിൽനിന്ന് ദിവ്യ ശ്രീ ലെയാപ്പോൾദ് മുപ്പച്ചനും ദിവ്യ ശ്രീ ഫ്രിയോർ കുര്യാക്കോസ് ഏലിയാസച്ചനും അവിടേക്ക് പോയി മേല്പറഞ്ഞ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളെ മേല്പറഞ്ഞ പനമ്പുമുറിയിൽനിന്ന് ഇറക്കി അവരെ പുതിയ മഠത്തിലേക്ക് കുട്ടിക്കൊണ്ടുവന്ന് അവിടെ അനുകൂലതയോടുകൂടെ പാർപ്പാൻ തക്കതിൻവണ്ണം ഉണ്ടാക്കപ്പെട്ട മേല്പറഞ്ഞ മുറികളിൽ പാർപ്പാൻ ഇടയാക്കിയും വെച്ച് അവിടെനിന്നും അവർ പുറപ്പെടുംമുമ്പേ അവരെ എല്ലാവരെയും കൂട്ടി പുതിയ മഠം ഒരാണ്ടുകൊണ്ട് പണിതീർന്നു കിട്ടാൻ തക്കവണ്ണം ദൈവം മനോഹൃദം ചെയ്തതിനെക്കൊണ്ട് അങ്ങേയ്ക്ക് നന്ദി അറിഞ്ഞ് സ്തോത്രം ചെയ്യണമെന്നും സന്യാസജീവിത ക്രമാനുഷ്ഠാനങ്ങളെല്ലാം വളരെ സൂക്ഷ്മമായി നിറവേറ്റണമെന്നും വേണ്ടിയ സൽബുദ്ധികളെല്ലാം വർക്കും... (Parappuram, 1125).</p> | <p>From Koonammavu monastery, V. Rev. Fr. Leopold Mooppachan and V. Rev. Prior Fr. Kuriakose Elias went there and brought the above-mentioned sisters from the <i>panambumadam</i> to the new convent. They were made to stay in those rooms which were made with adequate facilities. Before they were leaving from there (<i>panambumadam</i>), they were being gathered together and the fathers reminded them to praise and give thanks to the Lord for His blessings for completing the new convent within a year and gave good counsels to all for keeping the rules and regulations carefully.</p> |

2.2.4.9.5.2. Comments

Fr. Parappuram refers here to the instruction of Fr. Leopold & Fr. Chavara after the blessing of the new convent.

The sisters are asked to render praises to the Lord with hearts full of gratitude. It should induce them to put into practice all the day-to-day regulations of the religious life.

2.2.4.9.6. The Words of Sr. Anna the Chronicler

Reflecting on the wonderful providence of God in the process of the construction of the new convent, the chronicler’s heart was filled with sentiments of gratitude, love and praise. Her words overflow, which at times become an invitation to the community to join her in singing the divine praises.

2.2.4.9.6.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഇതാ സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ തമ്പുരാൻ തന്റെ പ്രിയ മണവാട്ടിയായ നമ്മുടെ അമ്മയുടെ അപേക്ഷയാൽ മാതൃഷരുടെ സ്വന്ത വംശത്തിൽ നിന്നു മീതെയുള്ള ചെമ്പിപ്പാൻ ഈ അമ്മയുടെ മക്കളെനുള്ള ഒരു പെരുമാത്രം നമ്മുടെ മേൽ വിളിച്ചതിനാലുള്ള സ്നേഹത്തെ സ്പഷ്ടമായിട്ടു കാട്ടുവാനും നാമും നമ്മുടെ പിൻ വരുന്നവരും ലോകാവസാനം വരെ തന്റെ മെൽ നന്ദി കാട്ടി സ്തുതിപ്പാനുള്ളതിനു നമ്മെ അധികമധികമായിട്ടു കടപ്പെടുത്തുവാനും താൻ ചെയ്തു എന്ന അത്ഭുത വർത്തമാനത്തെ വായനക്കാരായ സഹോദരികൾ സൂക്ഷിച്ചു വായിപ്പാൻ എന്നാൽ ഇത് എഴുത്തുകാരത്തിയായ എന്റെ വശക്കൊൽ പ്രകാശിപ്പിക്കാൻ വശമില്ലാത്തതിനെ തങ്ങളുടെ വായനയിൽ സർവ്വേശ്വരൻ നിങ്ങളുടെ ബൊധത്തിൽ തെളിയിക്കട്ടെ (CKC I, 45-46).</p> | <p>Here is the wonder that God has worked in answer to the request of His beloved spouse, our dear mother St. Teresa; God out of His great love for us, has made possible to do the things beyond human capacity, just because we are called the children of this mother. This is written in order that the sisters may read these words with attention and we and the future generations till the end of the world are bound to clearly attest to the divine love, show our gratitude and praise the Lord. However, since I, the writer, cannot because of my inability adequately give the vent in words the mighty deeds of the Lord; Almighty may Himself illumine your minds in reading and make clear to you.</p> |

2.2.4.9.6.2. Comments

The ideas expressed by Sr. Anna can be thus summarized:

- This was done by the Almighty Lord because of the intercession of Mother St. Teresa, the divine bride.
- It went beyond the human capacities. He had mercifully given us the name of the daughters of Mother St. Teresa.
- It was indeed a wonderful deed.
- We and the future generations till the end of the world are bound to clearly attest to the divine love, show our gratitude and praise the Lord.
- Sr. Anna invites the sisters to read these words with attention.
- She confesses that she could not because of her inability adequately give the vent in words the mighty deeds of the Lord.
- Sr. Anna prays that the Almighty may Himself illumine the minds of the readers so that they can appropriately respond to the wonderful graces of God.

2.2.4.9.6.3. Text Two

Again, on page 49 the chronicler writes thus:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>വായനക്കാരത്തിയായ സഹോദരിയെ, കൂടപ്പിറപ്പുകളെ ഓർപ്പിൻ. അവരു പെറ്റു വളർത്താത്ത മക്കളായ നമ്മുടെ മെൽ ഇത്ര താൽപര്യം അവർക്കുണ്ടെങ്കിൽ നമ്മെ യില്ലായ്മയിൽ നിന്ന് സൃഷ്ടിച്ചു വളർത്തി നമ്മെപ്രതി തന്റെ ചൊരയുടെ ഒടുക്കത്തെ തുളളി വരെ ചിന്തി തന്റെ പ്രാണ</p> | <p>Dear sister reader, siblings, remember; if they who had not given birth to us and nourished us have such an affection for us, what about the affection of Christ our Prime Superior who had created us out of nothing and</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>നെയ്യും ഉപെക്ഷിച്ചു നമ്മുടെ രക്ഷ നിറവെറ്റി എന്നതും പൊരാഞ്ഞു തന്നെതന്നെ തിന്മാനും കുടിപ്പാനും മായിട്ട് നമുക്കു തന്നു യിതിനൊക്കയ്ക്കും പ്രതിസമ്മാനമായിട്ടു നമ്മുടെ സ്നേഹം മാത്രം ചൊദിക്കുന്നു എന്ന നമ്മുടെ ഒന്നാം ശ്രേഷ്ഠനായ ഈശോ മിശിഹായ്ക്ക് നമ്മുടെ നെരെയുള്ള താല്പര്യം എത്രയായിരിക്കും? (CKC I, 49).</p> | <p>nourished us and redeemed us by shedding even the last drop of His blood and gave up the breath of His life and moreover had given Himself as our food and drink, towards us? As recompense for such acts, He asks us, our love only.</p> |
|--|--|

2.2.4.9.6.4. Comments

In this text, we could almost touch the zealous heart and inner soul of this pious religious. Sr. Anna seems to have recourse to the style of Elijah the prophet, the ‘founding father’ of the Carmelite Order; she appears also as zealously zealous for the Lord God Almighty (cf. I Kg. 19:10,14). The words were freely overflowing from this burning soul which escape an appropriate rendering. In using our poor vocabulary, we summarize the pertinent ideas.

- Sr. Anna invites the sister readers whom she addresses as her siblings (*koodappirappukal*) to sharpen their memory.
- Even though only the Archbishop is mentioned directly, from the context it is clear that they intent Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara. If Archbishop Bernardine, Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara who had not given birth to them and nourished them have such an affection for the sisters, what about the affection of Christ their Prime Superior towards them?
- He had created them (sisters) out of nothing and nourished them and redeemed them by shedding even the last drop of His blood and gave up the breath of His life and had given Himself as their food and drink.

As recompense for such acts, He asked them, their love only.

These words disclose the inner depth of love and gratitude of Sr. Anna's heart. She compares the superiors to mothers who had given birth to the sisters and nourished them. From these earthly facts, she looks to the heavenly realm where Christ adorns the position of the Prime Superior. He had showered his infinite love for the sisters, in the acts of creating and nourishing them shedding even the last drop of His blood, giving up His life of breathe redeeming them and becoming their bread and drink. In these words, Sr. Anna beautifully summarizes the whole Christology and Soteriology. It shows how this pious soul was inebriated by drinking from the cup of the divine mysteries.⁵⁸

To sum up, it is not only the sisters, but the fathers Leopold and Chavara and even Msgr. Bernardine, the ecclesiastical head also joins to elevate their souls to the Lord of heaven and earth in grateful praise for the grace of religious life. However, Fr. Chavara's role occupies the prime part of importance.

2.3. Conclusion

As a general conclusion to Chapter Two concerning the Canonical Erection of Women TOCD, the following facts need to be stressed. Everything had a humble beginning. God's providential hand was seen in the construction of *panambumadam*. Koonammavu became the locality from where originated a new and daring venture till unheard in the history of the Kerala Church. It started with four women

⁵⁸No objective and impartial scholar can deny here the influence of Fr. Chavara's thoughts and ideas which are outpoured in his *Letters to the Sisters*. For details see, *WFF* Chapter Three, No. 3.4. 'Fr. Chavara as the Formator.'

members. Already a long time before 1866 Fr. Chavara was yearning for the realization of it. In God's providence Fr. Leopold, the parish priest of Koonammavu church met the widow Eliswa and her daughter Anna who were aspiring to lead a devote and chaste life. He prayed and consulted his con-frairs and Fr. Chavara who rejoiced at this providential happening. Both of them immediately launched the steps for the starting of the convent which was crowned in 1866. In God's wonderful providence, they could construct a new convent with the alms of people and donations from other parishes. The foundation stone was laid on June 1866. In God's providence, a more comprehensive plan was evolved. There took place miracles of providence. On 27th March 1867, the blessing of the new convent and the ceremony of canonical vestition of the first four members took place; and 16th July 1868 these pioneers made their religious profession. All those who were involved in the beginning and evolution of religious community for women raised their thoughts to the Lord in grateful sentiments of praise.

EXCURSUS

FOUNDER/FOUNDERS/FOUNDRESS? SOME CRITICAL REFLECTIONS

Ex.0. Introduction

In this short note, we first look at the Church documents concerning the traits of the founder of a religious Congregation. Then we try to provide certain reflections on the theme of the founders/founder/foundress of the TOCD Congregation for women. Finally we look at the positions held by certain CTC members.

Ex.1. Founder According to the Official Teachings

Ex.1.1. Teachings of *Vatican Council II*

According to *Lumen Gentium* the founders are illustrious and outstanding men and women. They are the instruments under the impulse of the Spirit.¹

Ex.1.2. Post Vatican Teachings

The decree *Mutual Relations* calls a founder, a man of divine experience who possesses a special charism.²

Pope John Paul II sees in a founder an exceptional instrument of Christ for the work of salvation. He gets the inspiration to start the Congregation with its aim and forms the material and spiritual lifestyle of the members.³

According to *Instrumentum Laboris* on Consecrated life, founders highlight some aspects in the mystery of Christ,

¹ *LG*, 45, 46.

² *MR*, 11.

³ John Paul II, 'To the Major Superiors, in 1978' in *John Paul II Speaks to Religious* Vol. II, 1990.

which can be a particular period in His life or a particular aspect that He highlighted or a particular virtue that He emphasized. In forming the charism, one of these aspects has a major role to play along with the finality. Founders express it in their life clearly and definitely; then transmit it to the first community.⁴

Ex.1.3. Founder According to Theologians

E. Gambari, J. Lozano and G. Rocca, in their article “Fondatore” in *Dizionario degli Istituti di perfezione*, IV, cols. 96-101, give the following description: “There is a minimum requirement if a person is to be regarded as a founder in a formal sense: such a person should be the bearer of an original inspiration and at least in a certain measure, operative in its realization by giving a code of life or by forming the first members.” Thus, charismatic leaders who are bearers of original inspiration can be called founders.

Studying the pertinent documents, the canonist J. Nedungat thus draws the portrait of a founder: “one who sets up or inspires an initial group to live radically a life patterned on the evangelical counsels either by the actuation of an original inspiration or by helping to form that group spiritually or physically with or without a code of life”⁵

A close look at the documents shows that there is not an exact and rigid definition of a founder in them. It is purposely left vague and the documents do not determine what action/s are involved in founding a religious institute. Even the framing of the constitution does not make one a founder. The hierarchs who canonically erect a Congregation do not by that very act deserve the title of founders. One who charismatically peruses an ideal, which moulds the members

⁴*IL*, No. 17.

⁵*Charity Blossoms*, Vol. 18, December, 1997, No. 2, page 33.

and knits them together into a religious body, can be called a founder. There is no necessity that the founder of a women Congregation should be a female.

Ex.2. Charism According to Church Teaching

“The *Charism of the founders*⁶ appears as ‘an experience of the spirit’ transmitted to their followers to be lived by them, to be preserved, deepened and constantly developed in harmony with the body of Christ continually in a process of growth. ‘It is for this reason that the distinctive character of the various religious institutes is preserved and fostered by the Church.’⁷ This ‘distinctive character’ also involves a particular style of sanctification and apostolate which creates a definite tradition so that its objective elements can be easily recognized.”⁸

To pass judgment on the authenticity of a charism, the following conditions must be fulfilled:

- a. Its special origin from the spirit, distinct though not separate from personal gifts, innate or acquired, which shows itself in action and organization;
- b. A profound desire to be conformed to Christ to give witness to some aspect of His mystery;
- c. A constructive love of the Church, which shrinks from causing any discord in her;

In addition, the founder of a genuine religious institute is a man or woman whose tried virtue reveals a sincere

⁶*ET*, 11.

⁷*LG*, 44, *CD*, 33, 35, §1, §2 etc.

⁸*MR*, 11.

docility to the hierarchy and a ready response to the gift they have received from the Spirit.⁹

Ex.3. Founder/Founders/Foundress of Women TOCD

Ex.3.1. The Position of CTC

Ex.3.1.1. CTC Symposium on Charism

In the second book of the Charism Series, *Mother Eliswa foundress and Mystic* edited by Dr. Sr. Gracious CTC, has three articles, which deal with the theme of foundress. Sr. Silvinia CTC entitles her article: *Misinterpretation of Historical facts of Foundation of the Indigenous Congregation for Women: Survey and Evaluation*. In it, she attacks the position of CMC who according to the author calls Fr. Chavara and Fr. Leopold as founders, and the opinion of Dr. Sunny Maniakkunnel Luke OCD who argues that Fr. Leopold is the founder.¹⁰ Unfortunately, the article of Sr. Silvinia is very brief and does not delve deeply into the historical problems and study the original documents. In a popular way she tries to refute the positions by having recourse to modern authors like Frs. Alex Urumbickal and Augustine Mulloor. She frivolously brings an argument that on 13th February 1866, the first three members were Latins and on the next day a Syrian member was admitted. The true fact is that the canonical erection of the religious community had happened only on 27th March 1867 when all the four of them were officially vested as novices and they made their profession on 16th July 1868. We have already proved that mother Eliswa had no definite plan of a religious

⁹MR, 51.

¹⁰ Sunny Maniakkunnel, *An Ideal Missionary: A Historical Study of the Life and Activities of Fr. Leopold Beccaro OCD in Malabar/Kerala 1860-1877*, Trivandrum, Carmel International Publishing House, 2005.

Congregation when she communicated to Fr. Leopold her desire to lead a chaste life permanently.¹¹

The author in few lines rejects the position of Fr. Sunny by saying that Fr. Leopold is nowhere stated as the founder.¹² The charismatic gift in mother Eliswa, according to the author, is the best argument that she is the foundress. As we have already pointed out that, there are no original documents, which speak of the charismatic gift in mother Eliswa before she approached Fr. Leopold.¹³

The article of Sr. Georgia CTC is entitled *Mother Eliswa the Foundress: Initiatives and Qualities of the unique Pioneer*. The author in a legendary style describes the early life of mother Eliswa before her encounter with her confessor Fr. Leopold. No historical document is cited. She then cites the letter of Bro. Leopold without giving any precision or date that she heard a voice telling her to “call kochumooppachan and open your soul to him in confession.”¹⁴ We have already questioned in *AUSW*, the authenticity of the works of Bro. Leopold as historical document.¹⁵ Sr. Georgia then describes the qualities of the pioneer and absolutely applies them to mother Eliswa!

Sr. Veroni CTC writes on *the Genesis and development of CTC charism in and through mother Eliswa*. The same vein of articulation is seen also in her popular

¹¹ See for details *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.5.1.1. ‘The Beginning – A Summary.’

¹² Nobody can find fault with if one applies the argument of Sr. Silvinia that “Fr. Sunny was straining himself to press out the conclusions already in mind,” to sister herself.

¹³ See, *WFF*, Chapter 1, No. 1.1.3.1. ‘Their Life Situation.

¹⁴ Cf. *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.5.1.3.2.1.2. ‘The Way of disclosing the Inner Inspiration to Fr. Leopold.

¹⁵ *AUSW*, page 61-62.

exposition. Hence, we do not take into consideration her arguments.

Ex.3.1.2. The Position of Sr. Suicy in *SGME*

In this published edition of her dissertation, Sr. Suicy devotes chapter III, pages 166-250 to the critical study of the foundation of the TOCD Congregation. The author projects mother Eliswa as the true foundress of women TOCD. It is not easy to present the author's arguments in a systematical way. As we have repeatedly stated, Sr. Suicy has depended on secondary sources and had followed a popular style of presentation, which is not proper to a scientific work.¹⁶ Some pertinent arguments of Sr. Suicy may thus be stated.

- On 12th February 1866 Msgr. Bernardine in the *documentum erectionem* affirmed that the first three members are the foundation stones of the new religious Congregation (*SGME*, 174).

In the source referred by Sr. Suicy we could not find any such *documentum erectionem*.¹⁷ Besides, the expression 'foundation stones' can be used in different senses and thus does not necessarily mean the canonical foundation.

- Fr. Leopold called the first members 'the foundation stones and beginners.'

As we have made clear in *AUSW*, 88-90, Fr. Leopold was not addressing merely the three Latin members. Thus, the phrase cannot be understood as simply referring to the three Latin sisters. The above-mentioned comment on the phrase foundation stones is valid also here.

¹⁶*AUSW*, 59-62, 67-70.

¹⁷*AUSW*, 90. See also further explanations, *WFF*, Chapter II, No.2.1.3.4. 'Regarding the so-called *Documentum Erectionis*.'

- “The documents in the General Archives of the Discalced Carmelite Order also testify the position of the foundress, mother Eliswa.”¹⁸

The document AGOCD, “Congregation of Teresian Carmelites” cited by Sr. Sucey was of a later origin, after the division of the women TOCD. Hence, it is not proper to base the argument about the origin of the women TOCD on this later document.

- Other arguments of Sr. Sucey are taken from the opinion of the late Msgr. Mellano and Bro. Leopold TOCD.

We have repeatedly stated the unscientific nature of depending them as the proof of the foundation. Concerning the position of Archbishop Mellano, see our comments in *AUSW* 60-61. This will be further elaborated when we deal with the issue of division of the Congregation in the 5th Chapter. Also we have commented on the letter of the parishners of Koonammavu.¹⁹

- Sr. Sucey finds proofs from the writings of Fr. Chavara.

No sincere reader could interpret the words of Fr. Chavara as proof that mother Eliswa is the foundress. All the pertinent texts are cited and commented by us in *AUSW*, 64-66 as well as in *WFF*, Chapter I, Nos. 1.1.1.1., “A Zealous Yearning for a Convent’ 1.1.2.1.3. ‘Text Two’ and 1.1.2.2. ‘His Role According to *CMM*’.

- Another proof for Sr. Sucey is *CKC* document. She asserts that the new convent construction was done under the supervision of Archbishop Bernardine and Fr. Leopold.

¹⁸*SGME*, 174, FN, 29.

¹⁹*AUSW*, 64.

We have evaluated the veracity of this assertion in *AUSW*, 168-170 and in *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.1.1. 'Role of Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli.'

- According to Sr. Sucey the reception of the fourth member clearly upholds the status of mother Eliswa as the foundress.

See our study of the text and comment on it in *AUSW*, 92-93 and *WFF*, Chapter Two, No. 2.1.5. 'Clara as the Forth Member.'

- The further proofs of Sr. Sucey based on the secondary sources are not worth to be taken into consideration.

To conclude, we have very often commented on the position of Sr. Sucey that mother Eliswa is the foundress. Hence, we find delicacy in repeating them again and again. One who has a genuine historical mind will not be convinced about the arguments of Sr. Sucey for holding mother Eliswa as the foundress. Sr. Sucey finds Fr. Leopold as a mere Spiritual director and does not hold him as the founder. She devotes many pages (199-207) to refute the argument of Fr. Sunny Maniamkunnel.

Ex.3.1.3. An objective Evaluation concerning the founder

Our study of the historical documents, cited and commented in both volumes of *AUSW* & *WFF* does not allow us to uphold mother Eliswa as a foundress. Although she and her daughter had decided to lead a chaste life unto death, she had no precise idea how to realize it. The documents do not speak that she was thinking to found a religious Congregation. That was why she approached Fr. Leopold and entrusted themselves to him, giving him complete freedom to take

appropriate decision.²⁰ Moreover she had not taken any leadership in the actualization of the religious community such as the formation of the members, promotion of new vocation, establishment of the convent etc. For everything she was totally depending on Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara just like a new candidate. Thus it is clear that no canonical power was entrusted to her.

Our study of the official teachings of the Church concerning the founder had pinpointed the following main facts. A founder should have at least a charism to live a life patterned on the evangelical counsels. He/she comes forward to meet a precise need of the time prompted by a personal or ecclesial (a constructive love of the Church) charism. He/she must have a profound desire to be conformed to Christ, to give witness to some aspects of His mystery. According to *LG* founders are illustrious and outstanding persons who are prompted by the Spirit to take adventurous and heroic ventures. Pope John Paul II calls a founder as an exceptional instrument of the Spirit for the work of salvation.

Ex.3.1.4. Mother Eliswa as Foundress?

In the light of these norms, let us try to evaluate the possibility in affirming mother Eliswa as the foundress. Even if one holds that she possessed a ‘charism’ to lead a chaste life unto death, no historical document of that time speaks that she had in her mind a life patterned on the evangelical counsels. To this, one may object that Francis Assisi also had no such idea at the beginning. As a response we can say that he was firmly determined to become a living witness of the radical poverty of Christ which was a need of the time for the renewal of the Church (ecclesial aspect). Thus he had a profound desire to be conformed to Christ in practicing the

²⁰ *CKCI*, 3-6.

mystery of the poverty of the incarnate Word. Further, he was all in all and all of all in the foundation and evolution of the Franciscan Order.

Can anyone attribute such charisms to mother Eliswa? Was she motivated to practice radical chastity of Christ which was a need of that time for the renewal of Kerala Church? Was she prompted with a profound desire to be conformed to become a living witness of the mystery of the incarnate Word? Has she started a community life?²¹

If someone thinks that what prompted widow Eliswa to lead a chaste life was the insistence of her daughter to remain unmarried, could such an argument be refuted out rightly? Even if one may justify that mother Eliswa was never elected as a superior because of her sickness, one may raise up the following question: if the other sisters had considered her as the foundress, how could they desist from electing her at least for one term during the early period? Another fact seems to be little strange. The chronicler Sr. Anna, who was her daughter and the second member of the community in the chronological order, never gives any special mention to mother Eliswa even she was recording day to day minute details of the community. Would not have there reflected in her narrations the important role of mother Eliswa as

²¹CTC Congregation holds that mother Eliswa was leading a community life, in the spirit of Carmel, along with her daughter and her sister in the *Kalappura* and at the same time was very much concerned with the welfare of the marginalized and outcast for the uplift of them she wanted to dedicate her life by getting engaged in apostolate of education and social work. Unfortunately, this position cannot be proved from any contemporary historical documents as we have repeatedly pointed out. According to *CKC*, Sr. Thresia never spent a night without the company of her mother before joining the religious community on 13th February 1866. Cf. *CKC* I, 13, see also *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.5.1.3.2.1.3. 'The Issue of Stay of Sr. Thresia.'

foundress of the Congregation? Did the members of the community acknowledge the leadership and other charisms of mother Eliswa?

Has she contributed anything towards the foundation and evolution of the women TOCD? Was not everything done by Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara (and even with the support of men TOCD) with the permission of the hierarch? Can anyone cite concrete and definite instances of the charismatic and spiritual leadership of mother Eliswa during the early period? Has she played any vital and unique role in the decision making of the community in matters of administration, selection/dismissal of the candidates? Do the historical documents speak any endeavors taken by the initiative of mother Eliswa for the ecclesial, social and educational revival of the Kerala Church?²² Can anyone hold with historical certainty that she had written down admonitions and instructions for the community? Only the exhortation to the candidate Sr. Clara before admitting her into the community: “we are poor people and beggars we are ready to accept you as one of the sisters and allow you to live here by receiving the alms which God provides”.²³ Since it is cited in the contemporary document *CKC*, could be attributed to mother Eliswa with absolute certitude. The two prayers attributed to her in the book called *Prabodhanangal* cannot claim to have such a perfect certainty. In short, based on objective and authentic historical documents one cannot hold the position that mother Eliswa is the foundress of the women TOCD.

One more thing we need to add that none of the contemporaries like Archbishop Bernardine Baccinelli, Fr.

²²It was Sr. Clara who was entrusted the charge of the girls at *Educandath* by Fr. Leopold. See *WFF*, Chapter, III, No. 3.5.4. ‘Role of Sr. Clara.’

²³ See, *WFF*, No. 2.1.5. ‘Clara as the Fourth Member.’

Leopold, Fr. Chavara, Fr. Porukkara, Bp. Marceline, Fr. Philip and the chronicler Sr. Anna her own daughter have given the title foundress to mother Eliswa. Even Msgr. Mellano and Bro. Leopold²⁴ never called her as foundress but attribute the title foundresses to all the first three members collectively.

Ex.3.2. Fr. Leopold as Founder?

Ex.3.2.1. The First Impression

The position of Fr. Leopold as founder of women TOCD is more complicated as to be solved without making an elaborate and intense analysis of the documents. In the initial stage of the life in *panambumadam* he seems to have played the important role. It was he who found out mother Eliswa and Sr. Anna (Sr. Thresia also) and intimated about their desire to his confreres and consulted Fr. Chavara his friend. It was he who tested the genuineness of the vocation of the widow and her daughter and approached the hierarch for the permission to start a religious convent. It was Mooppachan who found out the site for the first convent, *panambumadam*. He tirelessly committed himself to the project and successfully collected funds together with Fr. Chavara (and men TOCD). At the entrance of the sisters to the new convent, Fr. Leopold wrote down a testament and asked the sisters to put the regulations into practice.

It was his words that became final in admitting and dismissing the candidates. He officiated in the religious ceremonies. Fr. Leopold very often visited the convent (most often in the company of Fr. Chavara), gave exhortations and took concrete decisions concerning the problems and acted as

²⁴ For him Msgr. Bernardine is the founder. Cf. *Rev. Sr. Thresiyude Charitram*, 123.

the person of authority. Even while he was absent from Koonammavu, he used to communicate with the sisters through letters.

Taking into consideration all these facts together, one may be tempted to give Fr. Leopold the role of the founder of women TOCD.²⁵

Ex.3.2.2. Analysis of the Facts and Texts

The most important thing one needs to have before the mind is that Fr. Leopold was the provincial delegate, canonical superior of both men and women TOCD as well as the parish priest of the Koonammavu Church. Thus his position was canonical and we can see that he was exercising it. It was because he was the parish priest that he came to know widow Eliswa and her daughter who used to come for confession to him. This was the immediate context of starting the convent. As the canonical superior he visited the sisters, gave them exhortations, took decisions and officiated in the religious ceremonies. He has written the *Testament* and gave to the sisters as the canonical head of the community.²⁶

Ex.3.2.2.1. Texts on the Foundations

Following are the studied documents concerning the role of Fr. Leopold, in starting the indigenous Congregation for women (Chapter I, No. 1.1.2.1.), construction of *panambumadam* where the roles of both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara are mentioned together (Chapter II, No. 2.1.2.), admitting Sr. Thresia as the third member (Chapter II, No. 2.1.3.), ceremonies of the erection of *panambumadam* (Chapter II, No. 2.1.4.), the role played by Fr. Leopold in

²⁵For example see, Sunny Maniakkunnel, *An Ideal Missionary*.

²⁶Mother Eliswa did not have the canonical title of the superior of the sisters.

admitting Sr. Clara as fourth member (Chapter II, No. 2.1.5) and the construction of the new convent (Chapter II, No. 2.2.), as well as the formative role played by Fr. Leopold as the spiritual guide, both together with Fr. Chavara (Chapter III, No. 3.2) and alone (Chapter III, No. 3.3), we do not repeat all our findings. Very few comments which may shed light in the precise role of Fr. Leopold are to be made.

- Nobody can deny the vital role played by this provincial delegate and parish priest at the initial period.
- *CKC* I, 23-35 as well as *CMM* II, 72-73 [124-125] speak about his initiatives. The first 16 pages of *CKC* texts and the whole *CMM* are written down by Fr. Chavara who was a humble soul who never tried to eulogize himself and boasts of his contributions. An objective reader will come to the conclusion that Priorachan seems to have attributed to others what he himself has done.
- Although Fr. Leopold gave counseling to mother Eliswa and Sr. Anna his penitents, discerned their vocation to lead a celibate life, *CKC* texts never mention that he thought about starting a religious community of canonical status. His consultation with his bosom friend Fr. Chavara who whole-heartedly subscribed to the idea, promised him, “I will do my best for the realization of the idea” (എന്നാൽ കഴിയുന്ന വേലയിതിനു ചെയ്യാമെന്ന്).²⁷ Having encouraged by Fr. Chavara’s words, Fr. Leopold approached the ecclesiastical authority for permission and took the steps for constructing *panambumadam* together with

²⁷ He was not simply promising his help. But he himself will do his best for its realization.

Fr. Chavara. It was very clear from the historical documents that Priorachan was actively involved in the whole process such as finding the members, collecting alms and furnishing the *pananbumadam*.

- It was Fr. Leopold who admitted Sr. Thresia as the third member to the community and conducting the ceremonies of the erection of *pananbumadam* in which Fr. Chavara was actively involved.²⁸
- Although *CMM* II, 77 [127], 80 [129] has recorded the prophetic utterance of constructing a new convent of Fr. Chavara, *CKC* I, 46 attributes it to both Fr. Leopold and Priorachan. This apparent discrepancy can be thus explained: It is natural to assume that this text of *CMM* was objective. Fr. Chavara who excelled himself in the virtue of humility even to the heroic heights would have never attributed to himself this prophetic utterance unless it was totally true.
- In the construction of the new convent both Fr. Leopold and Priorachan were actively involved, although Fr. Chavara attributes in *CMM* II, 84 [132] to Mooppachan the initiative in taking the interest to build a new convent.
- It was Fr. Chavara who realized the plan of collecting *pidiyary* and underwent great sacrifices for the collection.

²⁸ To interpret the fact that Fr. Chavara sang *Te-deum (lak alaha)* in Syriac and Fr. Leopold in Latin as an instance of their rivalry and Fr. Chavara's protests against the dominance of foreign missionary is merely an attempt to read between the lines and does not have any validity. Actually, it attests to the vital role played by Fr. Chavara who belongs to the Syro Malabar Rite. It was a typical example of their openness and spirit of communion.

- The deigns of Mooppachan and Priorachan as given in *CMM* and *CKC* in laying the foundation of the new convent, they entrusted the construction of the convent in the hands of Mother of Carmel, St. Joseph and St. Teresa of Avila.
- Both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara, entrusting themselves into the providential hand of God, decided to construct a two storied building with boarding and school attached to it. *CKC* I, 47 narrates how the provincial delegate was concerned with the minute details of the construction.
- As the donation of Rs. 100/- was considered as stained money, Fr. Leopold did not use it in the construction.
- At the economic difficulties Fr. Leopold entrusted himself into the divine hands by saying, ‘if God gives the money we shall continue to construct the convent and when the money will be over we shall stop the construction’ (ഒദയവും തരുംമെ പണം)

- The active roles played by both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara on the day of starting the life in the new convent, is recorded in *CKC*.
- It was the provincial delegate who presided on the canonical vestition of the first members of the convent and as well as who blessed the new convent. Fr. Chavara assisted him.
- According to the *Diary* of Fr. Varkey Parappuram, both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara performed the ceremony of the profession of the first members.
- On the happy conclusion of the whole process of starting a religious community of women both Fr. Chavara and Fr. Leopold, turn to the Almighty in grateful praise.

Ex.3.2.2.2. Texts on Community Life

Both *CKC* and the letters written by Fr. Leopold shed light to the role of Fr. Leopold as spiritual guide of the community. He was a paternal/maternal figure to them. He tried his best to inculcate in them the spirit of communion and communication with God as well as with the community. The spiritual guide helped the sisters to cultivate love for Jesus the Spouse and to become beings of trust, gratitude and cheerfulness. He taught them how to live a vowed life practicing obedience, chastity and poverty. Also Fr. Leopold engendered in them the love for silence and solitude, humility and fidelity, renunciation and penance, mutual love, respect as well as magnanimity. The spiritual guide also exhorted the sisters to get engaged in apostolic work, holding firmly “the hand of the divine will.” As the canonical superior, he was actively involved in disciplining acts, in selecting and dismissing the candidates as well as in presiding over the elections. Moreover, Mooppachan witnessed by his own life

how to grow into a living model of religious life. To sum up, we can say Fr. Leopold contributed very much for evolving the religious life of the women community.

Ex.3.2.3. The Question of Founder

Now we come to the delicate question of the founder of women TOCD. Once more, we would state that there is no clear cut definition in the Vatican documents concerning founder. Hence, it is not easy to include or exclude the persons who were actively involved in the initial stages of the religious community.²⁹ Let us look at the possibility of giving Fr. Leopold the title of the founder.

- According to the official teachings of the Church³⁰ a canonical superior does not automatically be called a founder.
- As we have already commented on the text from *CMM*,³¹ the original inspiration to start a religious Congregation did not come first from Fr. Leopold. He was only interested then to provide mother Eliswa and Sr. Anna who wanted to lead a celibate life, a secure dwelling. At the same time, they could serve others by helping the girls.³²
- It was with Fr. Chavara that Fr. Leopold built the convent and provided the sisters with the material and

²⁹Thus nobody can claim for 'absolute' (in the strictly philosophical sense) certainty for his/her position.

³⁰See above Ex.1.

³¹ *WFF*, Chapter I, No.1.1.2.1.2.

³² This is the strict linguistic meaning of the expression കന്യാ സ്ത്രീകൾക്കുവേണ്ടി വെച്ച (See, *WFF*, Chapter I, No. 1.1.2.1.2. and Chapter III, No. 3.1.1.1.2). One cannot exclude the possibility of interpreting the text in a wider sense.

spiritual facilities. Thus he cannot be called as the only ‘initiator’ of the first convent.

- Although Fr. Leopold in his exhortations highlighted some aspects in the mystery of Christ, one cannot make him the only author of such insights. Whatever he had highlighted in his *Testament* and exhortations can be equally valid in the case of Fr. Chavara who took the sisters to more mystical and spiritual realms of union with Christ.
- A study of the *Testament*, exhortations and letters of Fr. Leopold illustrate the following point: he had imbibed his views and ideas from the existing Christian traditions and spiritual writers like Alfonse Liguori, Francis de Sales, St. Teresa of Avila, Mariam Magdalene de Passi etc.³³
- If one attributes to Fr. Leopold a special ‘charism’, still it is not easy to find in his writings a profound desire to be conformed to Christ and to give witness to some aspects of Christ’s mystery as it is seen in the writings of Fr. Chavara. Also the ecclesial perspective such as a constructive love of the Church is not very clear in his writings and exhortations as it is seen in the letters of Fr. Chavara.
- Nowhere Fr. Leopold has claimed to be the founder of Women TOCD; rather he attributed such a status to Fr. Chavara in his personal Diary: “with extreme fatigue he has founded the monastery of the sisters” (*fondato con somme fatiche il monastero delle monache*) as well as in the *Short Biography*: “Earnestly desired to make a

³³ This is evident from his books *10 days Retreat*, *Sannyasa muzhuvan dhyanam (Full Retreat for Religious)* (Mannanam, 1949).

convent of sisters To accomplish that, much effort had been taken.”³⁴

Ex.3.2.4. Some Divergent Views

Some authors had come forward with different opinions concerning the founder. We merely refer to them without entering into elaborate discussion.

- Sunny Maniakkunnel OCD in his doctoral dissertation makes Fr. Leopold as Founder and Fr. Chavara as Cofounder (page, 279). Defective is the English translation of *CKC* I, 2 which does not correspond to the original Malayalam text, on which Maniakkunnel had depended as the primary source.³⁵ Even then Maniakkunnel admits that “the original idea as such of starting religious life in Malabar does not come from Fr. Leopold Beccaro.... Fr. Kuriakose Elias and Msgr. Baccinelli always desired (to start a convent), but they could not realize that. Fr. Leopold knew well their (Chavara and Baccinelli) idea. But the inspiration of the new foundation came from Fr. Leopold Becaro. The charism and goal was also determined by Fr. Leopold Beccaro.”³⁶

As a comment we would like to point out that Fr. Sunny does not seem to be consistent with his position. Sometimes he speaks of both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara as founders. He also admits that Fr. Chavara had been nourishing the idea of a convent long before

³⁴See our comments on these texts in *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.1.1.1.

³⁵Unfortunately the English rendering of the chronicles published by the Committee for the cause of Bl. Chavara, Mannanam is not faithful to the original Malayalam text.

³⁶*Ideal Missionary*, 279.

Fr. Leopold could think about it. A reader of his work may get the impression that the author does not bring forward a scientific presentation based on the original historical sources.³⁷

- A. Mathias Mundaden in his work *Bl. Kuriakose Elias Chavara* has devoted a chapter entitled “Foundation of the CMC, CTC Congregations” (pages, 280-344).³⁸ According to him, “it is best to say that both Fr. Leopold and Bl. Chavara are the founders of the religious community of women founded at Koonammavu in 1866. Otherwise there will be no end of problems. There is not much to be gained in distinguishing between founder and cofounder” (page, 316).

The author takes the position to hold both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara as founders because he thinks that if not there will be no end of problems. The argument that one has to accept a position in order to avoid the problem is not scientific. In analyzing the historical texts, we were lucky as we were not beset by problems.

- In a booklet entitled *Dream Fulfilled* Sr. Jossy CMC and Fr. Thomas Kochumuttom CMI (Delhi, 2005), hold that “both Fr. Chavara and Fr. Leopold can be and should be considered the cofounders” (page, 54). The

³⁷A. Mathias Mundaden CMI, *Blessed Kuriakose Elias Chavara*, Dharmaram Publications 2008, thus comments on the work of Maniakkunnel: “Bl. Chavara never says that Fr. Leopold was the founder as claimed by Maniakkunnel. What he says is that Fr. Leopold was sent by God to establish not only convents but also monasteries” (313).

³⁸This very title is misleading, instead of speaking about the foundation of the TOCD Congregation for women the author makes it as the foundation of the CMC, CTC Congregations which never existed at the time of Fr. Chavara.

authors claim that theirs is the ‘last analysis’ and seem to base their argument in the fact that both the fathers “were ‘almost always’ together in making journeys and meeting the people to collect money, doing the administrative works related to the convent, furnishing it with all the necessary things and finally blessing and establishing it. They were also almost invariably together in the frequent visit to the new community, instructing and guiding them, and caring for the sick. They also showed equal interest in teaching them arts and crafts in view of the apostolic works. Above all they loved and respected one another and as a result cooperated in many good works” (Page, 56).

As a comment, we agree that both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara were almost always together in erecting the convent, in furnishing it and providing material, moral and spiritual helps. However, this is not a scientific argument to attribute to both of them the title of cofounders.³⁹

Ex.3.3. Fr. Chavara as Founder?

First of all we would like to give in a summary form our findings in chapter I (No. 1.1.1. ‘Chavara Kuriakose Elias’); Chapter II (No. 2.1. ‘A Humble Beginning’, No. 2.2. ‘Construction of the New Convent’) and Chapter III (No. 3.1. ‘Inspiration Rationale behind the Foundation’; No. 3.2. ‘Two Comrades as the Formators of Religious Life’; No. 3.4. ‘Fr. Chavara as the Formator’).⁴⁰

³⁹ The designation cofounders could be misunderstood. One may raise the question, who is the founder.

⁴⁰ We request the readers to study carefully those texts and comments and in the light of their impression approach the present expositions.

Ex.3.3.1. A Man with Divine Wish

As *CMM* II, 72 [124] attests: “It seems that God has willed to accomplish now, the matter of a convent for nuns which was prayed for a long time and still was not possible.” God had provided Fr. Chavara two fundamental charismatic gifts proper to the founders of religious Congregations, namely earnest desire for having a religious community of sisters and constant prayer. In the *Short Biography of Fr. Chavara* written by Fr. Leopold, Mooppachan points out that Fr. Chavara possessed definite ideas concerning the aim and forms of material and spiritual lifestyle of the members of the religious community. “(He) earnestly desired to bring into existence an abode of virtues for the girls of Malayalam and a convent of sisters for learning doctrines and traditions of the Catholic religion as well as to make them grow as good Christian children. When God Almighty willed to accomplish that, to realize that what efforts he had taken, is beyond the description of this short narration.” This charism fits well with the norm of the founders stated in *MR*, 11.

Ex.3.3.2. A Man with a ‘Heart’

Priorachan thus was feeling very bad about the situation of that time when the women folk did not have any chance to embrace consecrated life (*CKC* I, 1).

Ex.3.3.3. For the Fulfillment of the Dream

The divine providence inspired Fr. Leopold to take initiative for providing a new life to widow Eliswa and her daughter Anna. He consulted Fr. Chavara who enthusiastically and whole-heartedly committed himself for the realization of the venture.⁴¹ By his own initiative, Fr.

⁴¹See for details Chapter I, No. 1.1.2.1.3.4; Chapter II, Nos. 2.1.2.2, 2.1.2.3, 2.1.4 and 2.1.5.

Chavara found out a new candidate who belongs to the Syrian rite. This fact need not be considered as unimportant. Fr. Chavara looked at the religious community as if it were his own brainchild! Can't we see here an attitude proper to a founder?

Ex.3.3.4. A Prophetic Personality

The prophet in Fr. Chavara could see into the flourishing future for the religious community even at the very beginning of life in *panambumadam* (*CMM* II, 77 [127], 80 [129]). Thus, he seems to fulfill one of the characteristics of a founder noted down in *LG*, 45-46: He was a man who was guided by the impulse of the Spirit. He had absolute confidence (this was one of the special charisms of this man of divine experience)⁴² in the providential hands of God who could work wonders.

Ex.3.3.5. In Pursuit of Goal

As the texts in *CKC* I, 48-49, *CMM* II, 80-82 [129-130], *Alochanapusthakam* Vol. III, 106-107 and *Diary of Fr. Varkey Parappuram*, 1186-1187 point out, Fr. Chavara put his heart and soul to realize his dream for a new convent. Fr. Leopold finds it impossible to give a proper articulation to the arduous and untiring efforts of his comrade: "What efforts he had taken, is beyond the description of this short narration." (*Short Biography of Fr. Chavara*). His role cannot be seen as a mere worker or agent of Mooppachan. He did everything as if he were the mastermind of the whole project – a zeal which we can see in the founders of congregations. In this blessed soul we can find a constructive love for the ecclesiastical authorities, a love which shrinks from causing any discord in the Church. This sincere docility is one of the important charisms mentioned in *MR*, 51. In everything and every time

⁴² *MR*, 11.

Fr. Chavara was in the forefront, prompted to confess the miracles of providence.⁴³ This man of God called himself: “we the poor destitute without a single penny” to whose aid the merciful Lord came at each occasion. Such a blind faith and utter confidence are seen in most of the founders of other religious Congregations. And a keen observation of the texts which mention both material and spiritual facilities provided for the convent makes clear one thing: Fr. Chavara had a more active role in most of the instances. Although Fr. Leopold as the canonical superior presided over the vestition of the sisters and the blessing of the new convent, Fr. Chavara contributed his best for the success of the ceremony.

Ex.3.3.6. A Being of Praise

Reflecting on the providential hand in the fulfillment of his cherished dream, Fr. Chavara raised his heart to God in loving gratitude and praise. He interpreted it as a happening which accomplished the purpose of his life. In other words, it gave him self-realization and God realization. This response resembles the attitude of the founders of the religious Congregations.

Ex.3.3.7. One with a Paternal/Maternal Heart

The chronicles narrate the formation process which helps the sisters to embrace mature lifestyle proper to authentic religious. Both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara were involved in that process.⁴⁴ We focus our attention only on the contributions of Fr. Chavara. He loved his spiritual daughters as a father and helped them to grow in the spirituality, especially devotion to Mother Mary. Can we not see here a portrait of a founder? The fact that he could maintain constant communion and communication with the religious community

⁴³ *CMM* II, 91-92 [136].

⁴⁴ See *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.2.

of sisters proves that Fr. Leopold accepted the authority of Fr. Chavara, and did not consider him as a secondary figure. In a spirit of freedom proper to a father, he could intimate the sisters the minute details concerning Archbishop's last days and his own illness. In the last letter written by him, he blesses in a very intimate way his 'beloved children' (and asks for their prayers.

Ex.3.3.8. A Spiritual Guide

The available documents attest how Fr. Chavara tried his best to inculcate into the lifestyle of the sisters communion and communication with God. He taught them how to become spousal beings, beings of contemplation, integrated and integral beings, liturgical beings, beings of trust, vowed beings, religious and ecclesial beings as well as altruistic beings.⁴⁵ Some of the special charisms which he especially communicated to his spiritual daughters through his letters, are worth mentioning. He blended together the spousal spirituality which is the highest degree of mystical union that helps one to abide in the love of Jesus Christ, sit before his face, walk along with him and converse with him unceasingly, and liturgical beingness. God had infused into him an in-depth biblical experiential knowledge of the meaning of vows which he designated as *agathithuam*, *manavattituam* and *cholvily*. It was this charism that he inculcated into the lifestyle of the first community. Another trait of his charism was his filial devotion to Mother Mary, which he would have imbibed right from his childhood. He knew at the same time that a consecrated person should be an altruistic being and taught the sisters that a contemplative should be an apostolic person.

⁴⁵An analysis of the texts makes clear that many of Fr. Chavara's exhortations could be called original which seems to be the overflow of his inner spiritual being. This is the main difference between the writings of Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara.

Fr. Chavara was not merely an ideologue and academician. Whatever he said or wrote did flow from his heart; he lived the sublime and celestial ideas and ideals which he communicated to the sisters. Here we may find a true portrait of a founder.

Ex. 3.3.9. Fr. Chavara's Role in the Eyes of the Contemporaries

As we have noted down both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara played very important roles in the foundation and evolution of the TOCD religious community of women.⁴⁶ Hence it is most important to study how Fr. Chavara's contemporaries evaluated his role in the foundation of the religious community. The assertion of Fr. Leopold who was the canonical superior as well as his spiritual guide, he who shared every heartbeat of that soul – I loved *him (lo)* as I (love) myself (*lo amavo quanto me stesso*)⁴⁷ has the greatest value. The notes of his *Diary* were written down on the same day of the death of Fr. Chavara; this makes it a most authentic and irrefuted source. The *short biography* was written down on the same year of the death of Fr. Chavara.⁴⁸ Once more let us look at the pertinent parts of these two documents.

⁴⁶This may be the reason why many authors who had not delved deeply into the historical documents seem to make Fr. Leopold the founding father.

⁴⁷ See *Diary of Leopold* Vol. 3, CMC Archives, Aluva, 25. The pertinent parts of his diary and the short biography are cited and commented in Chapter III, *Towards the Formation and Evolution of the lifestyle of the Early Members*, No. 3.1.1. 'Initiator According to Fr. Leopold'.

⁴⁸Any attempt to denigrate or degrade the importance of such text is, sorry to say, deplorable.

Ex. 3.3.9.1. Fr. Leopold

- *His Diary: Fondato con somme fatiche il monastero delle monache.* Our study of this text has showed that Fr. Leopold seems to hold his friend as the mastermind to start the women TOCD. We have to read together with this text the virtues attributed to Fr. Chavara: “semplicità di cuore, fede vivissima e tenerissima, ubbidienza e devotio verso il SS. Sacramento, Maria SS. e San Giuseppe.” (Simplicity of heart, lively and tender faith, obedience and devotion to the Holy Sacrament, to Holy Mary and St. Joseph). Are not these virtues which are generally attributed to the founders of the Congregations?⁴⁹
- *Short Biography of Fr. Chavara:* “Among these, specially, (he) earnestly desired to bring into existence an abode of virtues for the girls of Malayalam and a convent of sisters for learning doctrines and traditions of the Catholic religion as well as to make them grow as good Christian children. When God Almighty willed to accomplish that, to realize that what efforts he had taken, is beyond the description of this short narration. It is a fact known to all that even after the starting of the convent, he showed great fervour and interest to conduct everything in order and with virtues.”

In this text Fr. Leopold speaks clearly about the aim for which Fr. Chavara wanted to start the religious

⁴⁹Fr. Parappuram Varkey who was a contemporary has written down in the chronicle of St. Joseph Monastery Koonammavu, page, 1424-1425 that Fr. Leopold spoke to the parish priests assembled at Koonammavu a few days after the death of Fr. Chavara about the heroic virtues practiced by the deceased. He also said: “Because of he this convent happened to be founded here” (അദ്ദേഹം മുഖാന്തിരം ഈ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠം ഇവിടെ ഉണ്ടാകാൻ ഇടയായി).

community and how he tried to form the material and spiritual lifestyle of the members. These facts have to be read in the light of *MR*, 11 concerning the trait of a founder. Further Mooppachan points out some special virtues which Fr. Chavara practiced heroically: വിശേഷ എളിമയും താഴ്മയും ഏറ്റിക്കപ്പെട്ട ഉപവിയും മേൽപ്പട്ടക്കാരുടെ നേരെയുള്ള കുറവില്ലാത്ത കീഴ് വഴക്കവും ചൊല്ലുവിലിയും എല്ലാവർക്കും ബോധിച്ചിരിക്കയാൽ അയാളുടെ നേരെ മഹാ ആചാരവും പ്രിയവുമായി അയാളുടെ വചനത്തിന്മേൽ മുഴുവനാകപ്പെട്ട വിശ്വാസവുമായിരുന്നു. എന്നാൽ അദ്ദേഹത്തിന്റെ പുണ്യങ്ങളിൽ വിശേഷമായിട്ടു വിളങ്ങി പ്രകാശിച്ച പുണ്യം ശു. പള്ളിയുടെ മേലും ശു. മാർപ്പാപ്പയുടെ മേലുമുള്ള എത്രയും എരിവുള്ള വിശ്വാസവും പ്രിയവുമായിരുന്നു. Here one may find the special charism of a founder enumerated in *MR* 51: a profound desire to be conformed to Christ to give witness to some aspect of his Mystery; a constructive love of the Church which shrinks from causing any discord in her and a sincere docility to the hierarchy.

Ex. 3.3.9.2. Fr. Kuriakose Elisha Porukkara

This testimony is very important, since Fr. Porukkara was one of the early eleven fathers who made the profession on 8th December 1855 along with Fr. Chavara. He was also the successor of Fr. Chavara as the Prior of the Men TOCD. The text thus reads: പ്രത്യേകമായിട്ടു മലയാളത്തിലെ പെൺപൈതങ്ങൾക്ക് ഒരു പുണ്യസങ്കേതമായി വേദകാര്യങ്ങളെ പഠിക്കുന്നതിനും നല്ല ക്രിസ്ത്യാനി പൈതങ്ങളായിട്ടു വളരുന്നതിനും ഒരു കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠം ഉണ്ടാക്കണമെന്ന് ആഗ്രഹിച്ചു. സർവ്വശക്തനായ ദൈവത്തിൽ ശരണപ്പെട്ടുകൊണ്ട് അതിനുള്ള അടിസ്ഥാനക്കാരായിട്ട് ആസ്ഥമായിരുന്നവരെ കൈക്കൊണ്ടു തൽക്കാലം പനമ്പുകൊണ്ടു വീടുണ്ടാക്കി പാർപ്പിച്ചു. അതിന്റെ ശേഷം അദ്ഭുതമേ, എട്ടുമാസത്തിന്റെ ഇടകൊണ്ടു എണ്ണായിരം രൂപവരെയും പലവഴിയായി ധർമ്മം വരുത്തി കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠവും അതിനു വേണ്ടുന്നതൊക്കെയും ഉണ്ടാക്കി അതിൽ അവരെ പാർപ്പിക്കയും അവരുടെ അടക്കജീവിതവും പുണ്യവും കണ്ടു സന്തോഷിച്ചു

അവരെ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്യിക്കയും, കടശി ശു. കുർബാന അവരുടെ കപ്പേളയിൽ സമാപിക്കയും ചെയ്തു. യാക്കോബി താവു കടശി പുത്രനായ ബന്യാനിനെ അധികം സ്നേഹിച്ചതു പോലെ അവരെ ഏറ്റുമായി സ്നേഹിക്കയും തള്ള മക്കളെ വളർത്തുന്നതു പോലെ അവരെ വളർത്തി പരിപാലിച്ചു വരികയും ചെയ്തു വന്നിരുന്നു (Rev. *Malayalathile Ka.di.mu.Sabhayude Stapakapithakkanmar*, Mannanam, 1905, page 35). Fr. Porukkara uses almost the same terminology used by Fr. Leopold in his *Short Biography* on Fr. Chavara. He also attributes to Fr. Chavara the status of initiator. Further the author gives stress on the absolute trust of Fr. Chavara upon the Lord Almighty who worked wonders. It is said that Fr. Chavara loved his spiritual daughters with a love of Patriarch Jacob for his youngest son Benjamin and brought them up as a mother and provided them everything they needed. This language is similar to the text of Hos. 11, 3-4. Very often the same things are said about the founders of the religious Congregations. Further Fr. Porukkara points out that Priorachan excelled himself in the virtues of humility, obedience, love for God and for humans and had reached the summit of perfection. He practised them and taught others by his example, exhortations and led others in the way of virtue. These words of Fr. Chavara's contemporary may be taken as charisms proper to founders of religious Congregations.

Ex. 3.3.9.3. CKC II, 23

The chronicler has thus recorded about the heroic contribution of Fr. Chavara at the day of his death: Hearing the news of his departure all the sisters were filled with sorrow and wept loudly during the Holy Mass at the chapel. ഈ നമ്മുടെ പിതാവ് ഈ കേരള രാജ്യത്തിലുള്ള ക്രിസ്ത്യാനികളൊക്കെയ്ക്കും എത്രയും നല്ല ദീപവും കണ്ണാടിയും ആയിരുന്നതു കൂടാതെ ശു.പള്ളിയുടെ വിശ്വാസ

ഞെയും വർദ്ധിപ്പിനെയും കുറിച്ചു ശുഷ്കാന്തിയാൽ ഈ തിരുസഭയെ താങ്ങുവാൻ തക്ക തൂണു പോലെ ആയിരുന്നതിനെക്കൊണ്ടും എന്നാൽ പ്രത്യേകമായി കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാങ്ങളുടെ പുണ്യസാംഗോപാംഗത്തിന്മേലും വർദ്ധനമേലും മഹാതാൽപര്യക്കാരനും ആയിരുന്നതു കാരണത്താൽ ഞങ്ങളുടെ ഈ മഠം സ്ഥാപിക്കുന്നതിനു പുണ്യ വഴിയിൽ ഞങ്ങളെ നടത്തുന്നതിനും ചെയ്തതും ചെയ്തു വരുന്നതുമായ നന്മ ഉപകാരങ്ങളൊക്കെയും ഇന്നു ഞങ്ങൾക്കു പൊയ്പോയതിനാൽ അത്രേ. The following facts are stressed here.

- Fr. Chavara was a bright lamp and a mirror for all the Christians of Kerala.
- He was burning with the zeal concerning faith and growth of the holy Catholic Church.
- He was like a pillar which supported the Church.
- Especially he founded this convent since he was keenly interested in making the sisters practice perfect virtue and make the convent grow.
- He has done and was doing a lot of things (ഉപകാരങ്ങൾ) in order to guide the sisters in the way of virtue.

These words of the chronicler who was not only a contemporary witness to the facts but also the receiver of their benefits make very clear that it was Fr. Chavara who founded (സ്ഥാപിക്കുക) the convent.

Ex.3.3.10. The Decree of Pope John Paul II

In this decree dated on 8th February 1986 Pope thus states: *cooperante etiam Leopoldo Beccaro, piissimo viro eodemque missionario Carmelitano, congregationem mulierum religiosarum, puellarum educandarum gratia, condidit anno MDCCCLXVI.* The original document can be thus translated: “Fr. Chavara, with the help of Leopold Beccaro a Carmelite missionary founded in 1866 a religious

Congregation for women which was aimed for the education of girls.”⁵⁰

The Supreme Pontiff enumerates the important virtues practised by the blessed: the ardent love for the Church, the acquisition of perfect union with God through prayer and contemplation even during his multifarious apostolic activities, a life led by looking through eyes of faith in God and His wonderful providence, the zealous desire to attain everlasting union with God in heaven, a life led entrusting himself totally to God. Are not these virtues which are usually attributed to the holy founders of religious institutes?

Ex.3.4. Conclusion

We would like to conclude thus our study of the official and historical documents on the question of the founder of the TOCD Congregation for women. We think that an impartial and unbiased reader, who studies the documents, will not be inclined to hold mother Eliswa as the foundress of the first indigenous Congregation for women in Kerala. At a casual reading the case of Fr. Leopold, may seem to be ambivalent. We have tried to make an in depth analysis of the available documents to find out his role in the foundation of the convent and in the evolution of the lifestyle of the early members. It is very clear that Fr. Leopold, as the provincial delegate and the canonical superior played a decisive role at the official occasions. However, this fact itself cannot be cited as a proof that he was the real founder. A study of the Church teachings on founder seems to argue in favour of Fr. Chavara. His ardent desire and constant prayer for having an abode of

⁵⁰ Authors like Sr. Sucey may hold that the Supreme Pontiff was misguided by interested parties, as she had accused Archbishop Andrea Aiuti the apostolic delegate who was entrusted with the question of division. See, *SGME*, 316-368 especially page 319; Also see our comments in *AUSW*, 124-126.

virtues for the women of Kerala make him unique in this regard. Also *CMM* and *CKC* where the distinctive role played by Fr. Chavara in the foundation of the convent and the evolution of the lifestyle of the first members are unequivocally presented, corroborate this position. The most important evidence is the very testimony of Fr. Leopold itself. The contemporaries of Fr. Chavara hold the same opinion. The Supreme Pontiff John Paul II has definitively solved the question of the founder in his decree on the beatification of the Venerable Chavara Kuriakose Elias on 8th February 1986.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE GROWTH OF THE COMMUNITY TILL THE DIVISION: A BRIEF SKETCH

4.0. Introduction

This chapter is purposefully presented in a sketchy form without entering in detail in description. It is intended to serve as a link which will take us to the crucial problem of division of the community into Latin and Syrian Congregations. First, we invite the attention of the readers to the admirable characteristics which prevailed in the community before the time of division. Two texts are quoted and commented. Followed by that, the apostolic nature of this community is disclosed without much detail. Then we give in charts the names of the superiors in administration and the names of the professed members.

4.1. A Community of *Koinonia*

The below cited two texts of *CKC* demonstrate the beauty and harmony of love that irradiated in the first community. At the dismissal of Thaliyath Mariam who had sowed discord, disturbance and distrust, Sr. Anna reflects on the situation that was prevailing in the community before her arrival.

4.1.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| ഞങ്ങളിൽ ഒരാൾക്കു പനിവന്നാൽ എല്ലാവർക്കും പനി ആയിരിക്കണമെന്നും ഇങ്ങനെ ഉപവിയുടെ മേലും എളിമയുളള വേല എനിക്കുയെന്നിക്കു ചെയ്യണം എന്ന് എല്ലാവർക്കും ശുഷ്കാന്തിയായിരിക്കണം. ഇങ്ങനെ എളിമ ഉപവി ഈ രണ്ടു കാര്യത്തിന്മേൽ എല്ലായ്പ്പോഴും ഞങ്ങൾക്കു ബുദ്ധി | Our practice of love was to be such that if one of us caught fever, we were all to feel as if we all are having that fever. And in the case of humility, everyone should be saying, 'I shall do, I shall do' and volunteering to do the humble jobs. Thus we were constantly advised on practicing the two |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>ചൊല്ലിത്തന്നതിനാൽ ആദേഹത്തിന്റെ വചനത്തിൽ വണ്ണങ്ങളെ ഒരു പ്രകാരം നടന്നുവരികയും ബലക്ഷയത്താൽ നീക്കം വരുത്തിട്ടുണ്ടായിരുന്നാലും ഞങ്ങളിൽ യാതൊരുത്തിയുടെയും മനസ്സു തമ്മിൽ യാതൊരു ഭേദം കൂടാതെയും ഉപവിഷ്ണു യാതൊരു കേടു കൂടാതെയും മാംസത്തിനടുത്ത കൂടപ്പിറപ്പുകളിൽ ഈ വർഗ്ഗക്കാരുടെ അടുത്ത് ഈ നാട്ടിൽ കണ്ടിട്ടില്ലാത്തതിൽ വണ്ണമുള്ള സ്നേഹത്തോടു കൂടെ ഞങ്ങൾ പാർത്തു വന്നിരിക്കയിൽ..... (CKC I, 75)</p> | <p>virtues, love and humility; Because of his advice we were managing to live accordingly. Even if we failed through weakness, our minds were not allowed to be disturbed or alienated and we preserved our mind without any injury to our charity. We were living with great love; a love that is not seen even among own sisters or daughters of the same parents in this country.</p> |
|---|--|

4.1.2. Comments

The main ideas can be thus summarized. There reigned the spirit of the early Church in the community. Suffering of a person (like fever) was considered as the suffering of others. Everybody wanted to do zealously the deeds of charity and humility. They were putting into practice the instruction of Fr. Leopold who was insisting on humility and charity. Even when there were some failures due to human weakness, there was no discord or disharmony in the minds of the sisters. There was no violation of the virtue of charity. There existed in the community a unity, which could not be seen even among the blood relatives. They were living in such a bond of affection. This text is so explicit that it does not need any further comment.

4.1.3. Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ഈ ദിവസങ്ങളിൽ തരകന്റെ കെട്ടിയവർ നാലു ദിവസം മഠത്തിൽ വന്ന് ദീനക്കാരെ കാണുവാനും മഠം കാണുവാനുമായിട്ട്. എന്നാൽ അവർ ഇതിന്റെ അകത്തു കയറിയപ്പോൾ</p> | <p>During these days the wife of Tharakan came to the convent for four days to visit the sick and to see the convent. When she entered inside of the convent, she</p> |

അവർക്കുണ്ടായ സന്തോഷം ഇന്ന പ്രകാരമെന്നു പറഞ്ഞറിയിപ്പാൻ പാടുള്ളതല്ല. എന്നാൽ പുണ്യത്തിന്റെ സ്ഥലമായിരിക്കുന്ന ഈ മതിലിനകത്ത് ഉള്ള സന്തോഷം എത്ര വലിയത്. ഇതാ അവരുടെ നാവാൽ തന്നെ പറഞ്ഞ വചനങ്ങൾ. അതായത് എന്റെ അമ്മ എന്നെ പെറ്റതിൽ പിന്നെ ഇത്ര വലിയ സന്തോഷം ഒരു ദിവസവും എനിക്ക് ഉണ്ടായിട്ടില്ല. സന്തോഷം കൊണ്ട് എനിക്കു മിണ്ടുവാൻ പാടില്ല. ഇന്നത്തെ ശു. കുർബാന കൈക്കൊള്ളപ്പാടിൽ നിന്നു മാത്രം എനിക്കു ഭയമുണ്ടായി എന്നും മറ്റും പല സന്തോഷവാക്കുകൾ പറഞ്ഞ് 12 മണിവരെയുമിരുന്ന് ചില ഭക്തിക്കടുത്ത കുട്ടങ്ങളും മറ്റും സമ്മാനം കൊടുത്ത് ബഹു സന്തോഷത്തോടുകൂടെ മഠത്തിൽ നിന്ന് പോകുകയും ചെയ്തു. വീണ്ടും വന്ന ദിവസങ്ങളിൽ ഇതിൽ വണ്ണം തന്നെ അവർക്ക് ഇതിൽ കിടന്നു മരിക്കണമെന്നുള്ള ആഗ്രഹത്താൽ ഈ കുസീഞ്ഞയിൽ വേലക്കാരത്തിയായിട്ട് നിങ്ങൾ എന്നെ കൈക്കൊള്ളുമെങ്കിൽ എത്ര സന്തോഷത്തോടു കൂടെ ഞാൻ നിങ്ങൾക്കു ചിറ്റാഴ്ച ചെയ്തേ നെയിങ്ങനെയുള്ള ആഗ്രഹത്താൽ അവർ ഇതിൽ നിന്നു പോകുവാൻ നേരത്ത് എത്ര സങ്കടത്തോടു കൂടിയാകുന്നു പോകുന്നത് (CKC I, 183-184).

experienced an unusual joy which she could not express in words. She lacked no joys of the world. But how great was the joy that filled this place bounded by these four walls could be seen from her own words. Here are the words that came from her own mouth. “Never had I felt a single day this kind of delight after the day of my birth. I could not even speak because of joy

I was stricken by a sort of fear, only from today’s Holy Communion.” These and such are other expressions of joy and contentment, she kept pouring out while she stayed here, till noon. (We gave her) some devotional articles and other things as gift. She left the convent in great sorrow. Whenever she visited the convent later, she used to say that she loved to breathe her last lying in this convent. She even said that she would willingly become a servant in the kitchen and she would serve the sisters happily, if she was received by them. Since her desires were such, each time she visited the convent and then took leave of it, she could not do so, except with tear filled eyes.

4.1.4. Comments

The chronicler gives articulation to the sentiments of admiration which the wife of Tharakan who came to see the convent and the sick sisters. According to Sr. Anna, she could not express properly the great joy which that lady felt as soon as she entered the convent. How great would be the bliss

which the inmates would be enjoying in this abode of virtues. The wife of Tharakan expressed it thus: ‘never had I felt a single day this kind of delight after the day of my birth. I could not even speak because of joy’. That lady spent with the sisters till 12 o’clock, speaking words of joy. The sisters gave her some devotional articles and she departed with great joy from the convent. She used to visit the convent and expressed her desire to die as an inmate of the convent, asking the sisters to accept her as the cook in their kitchen. She would be ready to serve the sisters with great joy. Only with great sorrow she could leave the convent.

Here is a living testimony of an outsider about the convent life. As the wife of Tharakan, others also would be filled with great joy and delight during the time they spent with the sisters. Like that lady they could have experienced great inner peace and heavenly joy there, which they never would have felt in the secular world. Like the wife of Tharakan, each one would depart with the tears of joy and sorrow; tears of joy for the blessed minutes, tears of sadness because they had to leave that celestial abode.

4.2. A Community with a Mission

As we have already noted in chapter three the main apostolate of the convent at Koonammavu according to *CKC* I, 5 was to teach the girls prayers and other virtuous practices and also handicrafts like needle works.¹ From the very beginning itself efforts have been made to attain this aim. One has to read in this line establishment of the boarding, the school, the orphanage and making rosaries and scapulars. Here we cite certain texts that show how the fathers took interest in forming and empowering the first members of the

¹ See, Chapter III, No. 3.4.2.2.2. ‘Becoming an Altruistic Being.’

religious community in view of the future apostolate which is the horizontal aspect of its charism.

4.2.1. Making of Rosary & Scapulars (1866)

4.2.1.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| അന്ന് നാലുമണിക്ക് പെ. ബ. മുപ്പച്ചനും പ്രിയോരച്ചനും കൂടെ ഞങ്ങളുടെ മഠത്തിൽവന്നു കൊന്ത കെട്ടുന്നതും മറ്റും ഞങ്ങളെ കാണിച്ചും ചെയ്യിച്ചും കണ്ടും ... (CKC I, 13, 15). | That day at 4 o'clock in the evening V. Rev. Mooppachan and Priorachan came together to our convent...showed us how to make rosary and made us do it by ourselves... |

4.2.1.2. Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| ...വീണ്ടും ഏഴാം പക്കം വരികയും അപ്പോൾ....കൊന്ത കെട്ടുവാനുള്ള കൊന്തക്കുരുവുകളും കൊടിലും കമ്പിയും... കൊണ്ടുവന്നു തരികയും... (CKC I, 16) | Again came on the 7 th day; then...brought for us beads, tongs and metal wires for making rosaries... |

4.2.1.3. Text Three

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| ... ഇങ്ങനെ ആ യാത്രയിൽ പിതാക്കന്മാരു ഞങ്ങളെ പഠിപ്പിക്കാൻ ഒരാളെ തിരക്കിയരുന്നു. അഞ്ചങ്ങയിൽ ചെന്നപ്പോൾ ഒരു മുത്തി ചില വേലകൾ ഒക്കെയും പഠിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ട് എന്ന് അറിഞ്ഞ് ആ മുത്തിയെ വിളിപ്പിച്ച് ചോദിച്ചപ്പോൾ താൽപര്യമായിട്ടൊക്കെ പഠിപ്പിക്കാമെന്നു പറകകൊണ്ടു മാസം തോറും രണ്ടു രൂപയും ഉടുപ്പും മറ്റും കൊടുക്കാമെന്നു പറഞ്ഞു വരുത്തുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC I, 64). | ...during this journey, our fathers were looking for a person to teach us some work. When they reached at Anjuthengu, they came to know that there was a granny who had learned some works. When they called her and asked, she said that she would teach earnestly. So she was brought, promising to give her Rs. 2/- per month besides food, clothing and other expenses. |

4.2.1.4. Text Four

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>മാത്തിൽ പഠിപ്പിപ്പാൻ കൊച്ചി കാര്യ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ വന്നിരിക്കയാലും നല്ല വെന്തീത്തകൾ ഉണ്ടാക്കുവാൻ രൂപമിവിടെ കിട്ടായ്കയാൽ ഉള്ളതും അവിടെയുള്ള വലുതും കൊച്ചുമായ രൂപച്ചിലയുടെ ചെമ്പുകളും കൊടുത്തയയ്ക്കണം. ഇവിടെ ന. പ്രസ്സിൽ അടിച്ചിടുകയും ആം</p> <p>(<i>Kathukal</i>, V/12)</p> | <p>Since the nuns from Cochin have come to the convent to teach them and the pictures for making scapulars are not available here, the large and small picture clothes and coppers should be sent to here. It can be printed here in our press.</p> |

4.2.1.5. Comments

All these texts show that aiming at an integral development of women, right from the beginning rosary and scapular making were started in the convent. Both the fathers took keen interest on it and the sisters were ever ready to dedicate themselves for this cause. *CKC* refers that both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara had taken much pain to find out a lady for teaching the sisters some handicrafts in the very beginning of life in the *panambumadam*. A letter of Fr. Chavara from Koonammavu monastery to Fr. Chandy Kattakkayam of Mannanam monastery reveals the earnest interest that Fr. Chavara himself had taken in this matter. His old age and sickness were not hindrances for this mission.²

4.2.2. Boarding Facilities (1868)

4.2.2.1. Text One

About the starting of the boarding, thus speaks of *CKC* I.

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>എന്നാൽ പുത്തനാണ്ടിന്റെ രണ്ടിനു എടുക്കത്താത്തു തുടങ്ങണമെന്നും കൽപിച്ചു. ആയതിനു ഗുരുത്തിയമ്മയായിട്ട്</p> | <p>It was commanded that the boarding should begin on the 2nd day of the new year. Mooppachan asked us who would be suitable to</p> |

² For example, see *CKC* II, 12.

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>ആരു കൊള്ളാം എന്നും പല അഭിപ്രായങ്ങൾ ചോദിച്ചു എങ്കിലും സ. ക്ലാരയെ മുപ്പച്ചൻ തന്നെ നിയമിച്ചു. ആയതിനുള്ള ചുരുങ്ങിയ ക്രമങ്ങളും എഴുതിത്തന്നു. എന്നാൽ മഠത്തിൽ കൂടണമെന്നുള്ള ആഗ്രഹത്തോടെ മുമ്പിനാലെ വന്നു കണ്ടു പറഞ്ഞിരുന്ന മുട്ടത്തു ഒഴുവിൽ ത്രേസ്യ എന്ന പൈതലിനെയും കൊണ്ടു 68 മകരം 1-നു തന്നെ വന്നിരുന്നതിനാൽ അപ്പോൾത്തന്നെ ഇങ്ങോട്ടയച്ചു. എന്നാൽ എടുക്കത്താണിനും ഒരു സഹായക്കാരത്തിയും ഒരു അന്വേഷക്കാരത്തിയും വേണം എന്നു വെച്ചു തക്ക ആൾ അന്വേഷിച്ചാറെ ഒരു അന്വേഷക്കാരത്തിയെ മാത്രമേ കിട്ടിയുള്ളൂ എന്നതിനാലും പൈതലങ്ങൾ എല്ലാം വരാത്തതിനാലും ഈ അന്വേഷക്കാരത്തിയും നമ്മുടെ സഹായക്കാരത്തിയും തന്നെയിപ്പോൾ മതി എന്നും വെച്ചു 2നു തന്നെ തുടങ്ങുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC I, 84-85).</p> | <p>be the boarding mistress. At the end Mooppachan himself appointed Sr. Clara. He also wrote and gave a few rules for the boarding. But on 1st January 1868 itself, a child from Muttam by name Ozhuvil Thresia was brought. She desired to join the convent, had come earlier and had met Father and told him all about it. So she was immediately sent to us. Having decided that the boarding needed a procuratress and a helper, they were searching for suitable persons but they got only a procuratress. Moreover, all the children had not arrived. Taking both these things into consideration, they decided to manage with this procuratress and our helper and inaugurated the boarding (<i>Educandath</i>) on the 2nd itself.</p> |
|--|--|

4.2.2.2. Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>എടുക്കത്താണിലുള്ള മുറികളിൽ പൈതലങ്ങൾ തികഞ്ഞു. പിന്നെയും പൈതലങ്ങളെ കൂട്ടുന്നതിന് അപേക്ഷിക്കയാൽ വടക്കു വശത്തുള്ള സ്കോളയിലും എടുക്കത്താണിലെപ്പോലെ മുറിയുണ്ടാക്കി മകരം 31-ന് സ്കോളയിലും എടുക്കത്താണിലെപ്പോലെ പഠിതം തുടങ്ങുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC I, 111-112).</p> | <p>The rooms in the boarding were full with children and still more children were applying for admission. So in the school building on the north too, rooms were built as in the boarding. On January 31st teaching was begun in the school as in the boarding.</p> |

4.2.2.3. Comments

From these texts we get the impression that the starting of the boarding was an urgent need of the Church in Kerala. Even though the arrangements were incomplete, the Fathers were compelled to start the boarding much earlier

than they thought of. Thus the first *educandhath* in the history of women TOCD (much more in the history of Kerala Church) was started on 2nd January 1868. We have already mentioned about the appointment of Sr. Clara as the mistress for the boarding girls.³ Since the number of girls was increased day by day within one year the boarding was full and even the school building was used for this purpose on 31st January 1869.

4.2.3. Establishment of the School (1872)

4.2.3.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>1872-ാം കാലം തുലാംമാസം 14നു: എന്റെ കുഞ്ഞുങ്ങളേ ഇപ്പോൾ ഇസ്കോള തുടങ്ങുവാൻ പോകുന്നു. ആയതിന് ഈശോമിശിഹാ നിങ്ങളെ വിളിക്കുന്നു. അപ്പോഴോ ഈ വേല തുടങ്ങുന്നതിനു മുൻപിൽ ഈ രണ്ടു മൂന്നു വചനങ്ങളെ നിങ്ങൾക്കു ഞാൻ ചൊല്ലിത്തരുന്നു. ഇത് നിങ്ങളുടെ ബോധത്തിൽ എല്ലായ്പോഴും ഉണ്ടായിരിക്കണം. ന്നു. എന്നാൽ എന്റെ പ്രിയ മക്കളേ നിങ്ങൾ ഈ വേലയ്ക്കു പോകുന്നതിനു മുൻപിൽതന്നെ ദൈവതിരുമനസ്സിറിയുന്നതിനും ഈശോയുടെ തിരുവാഴ്വോടു കൂടെ പോകുന്നതിനും വേണ്ടി ഇസ്കോള തുടങ്ങുന്നതിനു മുൻപിടുകൂട്ടി മുറിയിൽ ചെന്ന് മുട്ടു കുത്തി ഈശോമിശിഹായോട് തന്റെ വെളിവ് അപേക്ഷിക്കുകയും ആയതിന്റെ ശേഷം ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയമ്മയുടെ പക്കൽ ചെന്ന് വാഴ്വ് അപേക്ഷിച്ചുകൊണ്ടും ദൈവതിരുമനസ്സിനെ കൈയിൽ പിടിച്ചു കൊണ്ടും ഇതിനു പോകയും വേണം (CKC II, 56-59).</p> | <p>On 14th October 1872: My children, now we are going to start school and Jesus Christ is calling you for it. So, before you begin to do the work, I am going to tell you these few words. You must always keep them in your mind. You must in no way forget it.... Again my dear children, before going to do this work, you must go and kneel in your room and pray to the Lord Jesus Christ, for His enlightenment in order to know the will of God, and also for His blessing that you may work in His grace. After that you must go to the mother superior and ask her for her blessing and holding the divine will firmly you must start your work.</p> |

³ See for example *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.5.4. ‘The Role of Sr. Clara.’

4.2.3.2. Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| 1872-ാം കാലം തുലാംമാസം 16 നു ഈ മഠത്തിന്റെ പുറമേയുള്ള പാഠകശാലയിൽ പഠനം തുടങ്ങുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC II, 60). | 1872 October 16 th teaching work was started in the school situated outside the convent premises. |

4.2.3.3. Comments

The first text speaks of the advice of Fr. Leopold just before the starting of the school. At the end of his advice, he demands three things from the sisters namely they had to go to the chapel and ask the blessing of the Lord, then to the room of the superior and request her blessing and at the end they must hold on to the divine will and go to the school. It is interesting to note that even today this advice of Fr. Leopold is put into practice faithfully. The phrase: “(you) must go for it holding the hand of the divine will” (*ദൈവതിരുമനസ്സിനെ കൈയിൽ പിടിച്ചു കൊണ്ടും ഇതിനു പോകയും വേണം*) invites our special attention. God had demanded this task from them and they had to do it according to His will. Even though the school building was constructed in 1867, the school was started only on 16th October, 1872.⁴

4.2.4. Orphanage Services (1880)

4.2.4.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| 1880-ാം കാലം കന്നി ആറിന് ശുദ്ധമാന യൗസേപ്പുപിതാവിന്റെ നാമത്തിൽ ഈ മഠത്തോടു ചേർന്ന അനാഥശാലയ്ക്ക് അടിസ്ഥാനമിട്ടു. എടുക്കത്തൊത്തു പൈതങ്ങളും പാഠകശാല പൈതങ്ങളും കൂടി എടുക്കത്തൊത്തു | On 6 th September 1880, the foundation for an orphanage in the name of St. Joseph was laid, adjoining to the convent. The children of <i>Educandath</i> and the children of the school together went in procession to the site. One, from |

⁴For the details of the construction of the school building, see *WFF*, Chapter Two, No. 2.2.4.3.3. ‘Miracles of Providence.’

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>പൈതങ്ങളിൽ ഒരുത്തി തുങ്ങപ്പെട്ട രൂപം പിടിച്ച പ്രദക്ഷിണമായിട്ടു ചെന്ന് പെ.ബ. പീലിപ്പോസു മുപ്പച്ചനും രണ്ട് അൾമേനി ദർശനക്കാരും കൂടി വന്ന് അടിസ്ഥാനക്കല്ലു് റൂൾമാ ചെയ്ത് പലകാശുരൂപങ്ങൾ അടിസ്ഥാനത്തിൽ വച്ചുകൊണ്ട് അടിസ്ഥാനമിട്ടു. അപ്പോൾ മാതാവിന്റെ ലുത്തിനിയ എല്ലാവരും കൂടി ചൊല്ലി. (CKC II, 117)</p> | <p><i>Educandath</i> went in front carrying a crucifix. Very reverend Philipose Mooppachan, very reverend Fr. Vicar and two lay-religious brothers from the monastery accompanied them. The foundation stone was blessed. Many medals were placed at the spot and the foundation stone was placed on it. Meanwhile the gathering recited the litany of the Blessed Virgin Mary.</p> |
|---|---|

4.2.4.2.Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>82 ധനുവം 22-ന് എ.പെ.ബ. പീലിപ്പോസു മുപ്പച്ചൻ ശുദ്ധ യൗസേപ്പുപിതാവിന്റെ അനാഥശാല റൂശുമ ചെയ്തു. (CKC II, 121)</p> | <p>On 22nd December, 1882 the St. Joseph's orphanage was blessed by very reverend Philipose Mooppachan.</p> |

4.2.4.3. Text Three

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>1883 മകരം 4-ന് ടി അനാഥശാലയുടെ മുകളിൽ വൈപ്പാനുള്ള ശുദ്ധ യൗസേപ്പുപിതാവിന്റെ രൂപം പണിതീർത്ത് ന.പെ.ബ.പീലിപ്പോസു മുപ്പച്ചനും ഒരു അൾമേനി ദർശനക്കാരനും രൂപം പണിക്കാരനും കൂടി വന്ന് എടുക്കുന്നതായ പൈതങ്ങളും അനാഥപൈതങ്ങളും കൂടെ പ്രദക്ഷിണമായി ചെന്ന് മുട്ടുകുത്തി രൂപം റൂശുമ ചെയ്ത് എടുക്കുന്നതാതിന്റെ കിഴക്കേ വശത്തുള്ള ചുമരിന്റെ മുകളിലെ മുകപ്പിൽ സ്ഥാപിക്കയും കൂടിയവരെല്ലാവരും ശുദ്ധ യൗസേപ്പുപിതാവിന്റെ കാഴ്ചവെപ്പിന്റെ ജപം ചൊല്ലുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC II, 121).</p> | <p>On 4th January 1883 the statue of St. Joseph which is to be installed on top of the Orphanage was completed. Philipose Mooppachan, a lay religious and the one who had made the statue came and they along with the children of the Orphanage and the children of <i>Educandath</i> went in a procession to the orphanage and knelt down. The statue was then blessed and enthroned in the niche prepared at the top of the front wall facing the eastern side of the <i>Educandath</i>. Meanwhile all those that had gathered there together recited the consecration to St. Joseph.</p> |

4.2.4.4. Comments

The information from the Chronicles discloses that the foundation for the orphanage was laid on 6th September, 1880 and the blessing took place on 22nd December 1882. Fr. Philip OCD had taken all the efforts for the construction and blessing of the orphanage. Chronicles also point out that the patron saint of the orphanage was St. Joseph and on 4th January 1883 a big statue of the patron saint was placed at the top of the building.⁵

In short, to attain the aim of the foundation of the convent both the fathers were enthusiastic to provide all the facilities and proper training to the sisters to make them ready to guide the girls for their integral development.⁶

4.3. Details of Election till the Division in 1890

4.3.1. The Advice Before the First Election in 1869

4.3.1.1. Text One

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ഈ മാസം 15 നു നമ്മുടെ പിതാവായ മുപ്പച്ചനും പ്രിയോരച്ചനും കൂടി ഗ്രാത്തമുറിയിൽ വന്നു ഞങ്ങളെ വിളിപ്പിച്ചു നമ്മുടെ ഈ മഠത്തിൽ ഇത്ര പ്പോഴും നടക്കാത്ത ഒരു ക്രമം ഇപ്പോൾ തുടങ്ങുവാനുള്ളതിന് ലേഗാത്തച്ചൻ ചൊല്ലിത്തന്ന</p> | <p>On the 15th of this month our Fr. Mooppachan and Priorachan came together to the convent and called us to the parlour and instructed us. Owing to my disability I am writing here very briefly the instruction given by</p> |

⁵ For further details regarding the orphanage, see next chapter No. 5.2.2. 'Important Letters.'

⁶The propagation of CTC in relation to the death centenary of mother Eliswa (2013) that it is mother Eliswa who started the boarding, the school, the orphanage and thus she stood for the empowerment of women is baseless and unwarranted.

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>ഗുണദോഷങ്ങൾ എന്റെ വശക്കേടു കൊണ്ട് ചുരുക്കമായിട്ട് ഇവിടെ എഴുതുന്നു...നമ്മുടെ മഠങ്ങളിലൊക്കെയിലും സുപ്രിയോരത്തിയമ്മയെന്നും രണ്ടാം ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയായിട്ട് ഒരാളെ നിയമിക്കുന്നത് പട്ടമാകുന്നു. ഈ മഠത്തിൽ ആളിന്റെ ചുരുക്കം കൊണ്ടു നടന്നില്ല. ഈ ദിവസങ്ങളിൽ നമ്മുടെ പിതാവായ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താ ചന്ദ്രൻ ബോധിപ്പിച്ചപ്പോൾ ഒരു മഠമാകുന്നുവെങ്കിൽ അതിന്റെ ക്രമങ്ങളൊക്കെയും നടക്കണം എന്നു കൽപിച്ചു. സുപ്രിയോരത്തിയെ തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കേണ്ടതിനു അവരിൽ വേണ്ട ലക്ഷണങ്ങൾ ഒന്നാമത് നല്ല സൗഖ്യമുള്ളവരും പ്രാർത്ഥനാമുറിയിൽ മുടക്കം കൂടാതെ പോകുന്നതിന് താൽപര്യമുള്ളവരുമായിരിക്കണം. രണ്ടാമത് റെഗുളന്റായ പ്രമാണങ്ങളെ അൽപമായിട്ടുള്ളതു കൂടെയും കാക്കുന്നതിനും നല്ല സാമർത്ഥ്യമുള്ളവരും താൽപര്യമുള്ളവരും ആയിരിക്കണം. മൂന്നാമത് നല്ല ബുദ്ധിയും വിവേകവുമുള്ളവരും ഈശോ മിശിഹായുടെ തിരുഹൃദയത്തിന്റെ അടുപ്പക്കാരായിരിക്കണം. ഏകാന്തവും മിണ്ടടക്കവും കാക്കുന്നതിന് താൽപര്യമുള്ളവരും ആയിരിക്കണം. മൂന്നാം വർഷം ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി അമ്മയെയും സുപ്രിയോരത്തി അമ്മയെയും തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കണം (CKC I, 126-127).</p> | <p>Fr. Delegate in preparation to begin a new regulation which was not in practice here till now. In all our convents, the custom is to have a mother superior and to appoint another one as assistant superior. This was not done in this convent because there were only a few members. In these days when our bishop was informed of this, he said that if it is a convent all its rules must be observed. The qualities that the sub-prioress should have: the first is that she must have good health and she must be one who has an interest in being present for prayer without fail. The second is that she must be a clever person who is interested in obeying even the smallest one of the rules of the constitution. The third is that she must be intelligent and prudent and she must be the one who has closeness in love to the Sacred Heart of Jesus. She must also be a person interested in keeping silence and solitude. Every 3rd year the mother superior and the assistant superior must be elected.</p> |
|---|--|

4.3.1.2.Text Two

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ഇന്ന ദിവസം തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കാൻ നിശ്ചയിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു എന്ന് ദൈവഗാത്താചന്ദ്രൻ അറിയിക്കുമ്പോൾ അതിന്റെ തലേ ദിവസം എല്ലാവരും ശു. കുർബാനയും</p> | <p>When the Fr. Delegate fixes the day of election and informs, on the previous day of the election all receive Holy</p> |

കൈക്കൊണ്ട് മുഴുവൻ ധ്യാനം കഴിച്ച് ഈ തിരഞ്ഞെടുപ്പു തെറ്റു വരാതെ ഇരിപ്പാൻ ഈ കാര്യത്തിനു വേണ്ടി നല്ല വണ്ണം അപേക്ഷിക്കുകയും തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കുന്ന ദിവസത്തിലും ശു. കുർബാന കൈക്കൊള്ളുകയും വേണം. തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കുമ്പോൾ ലോക വിവേകം പോലെയും നിങ്ങൾക്ക് ഇഷ്ടമുള്ളവരെയും മാത്രം തിരഞ്ഞെടുത്താൽ ആയതിനാൽ വരുന്ന നാശത്താൽ ഇങ്ങനെയുള്ളവർ ചാവു ദോഷം പിഴയ്ക്കും. ആയതു കൊണ്ടു പട്ടാങ്ങയായ ദൈവവിളിപ്പുള്ളവരെ മാത്രമേ തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കാവൂ. തിരഞ്ഞെടുപ്പാൻ അവരവരു നിശ്ചയിച്ചിരിക്കുന്ന ആ സഹോദരിയുടെ പേരെഴുതി കുറിയിട്ട് തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കണം. എന്നാൽ കുറിയിടുന്നത് എല്ലായിടത്തും പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്തവരത്രേ കുറിയിടുവാൻ ക്രമം. എന്നാൽ ഇവിടെ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്തവരു നാലുപേരു മാത്രം ഉള്ളതു കൊണ്ട് ഇപ്പോൾ ഉടുപ്പിട്ടവർക്ക് എല്ലാവർക്കും കുറിയിടാം. ഈ തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കുന്നത് പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്തവരെ മാത്രമേ തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കാവൂ. കുറി എഴുതുമ്പോൾ ആ എഴുത്ത് ശേഷം പേരുകണ്ടാൽ ഇന്നവർ എഴുതി എന്നു തിരിയാതിരിപ്പാൻ എഴുത്തിന്റെ ഭാഷ മാറ്റി എഴുതണം. കുറി എടുത്തു കഴിഞ്ഞാൽ അവിടെ വച്ചു തന്നെ കുറി കത്തിച്ചു കളയണം. കുറിയിടുന്ന ദിവസത്തിൽ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്തവരു വല്ലവരും ദീനമായി കിടക്കുന്നവരുണ്ടായിരുന്നാൽ പറഞ്ഞൊപ്പം ചെയ്തവരിൽ മുത്തവരു രണ്ടുപേരു കുറിപ്പാത്രം അവരുടെ ചാറെ കൊണ്ടു ചെന്ന് അവരെ കൊണ്ടും കുറിയിടുവിക്കണം. കുറിയിടുമ്പോൾ കുറി കാണാതെ ഇരിപ്പാൻ വേണ്ടി കണ്ണടക്കം കാത്തു കൊള്ളണം. എന്നാൽ കുറിയിട്ടു തിരഞ്ഞെടുക്കുന്നതു ഗ്രാത്ത മുറിയിൽ വച്ചാ

Communion and enter into a retreat for the whole day and pray that they may not make mistake in the election. On the day of election too all must receive Holy Communion. If you elect someone you like or according to worldly prudence you will be guilty of mortal sin because of the destruction it brings to souls. So only those who are actually chosen by God should be elected. Each one must write the name of the sister she has decided upon on the ballot paper and put it into the ballot box. One must be elected on the basis of votes. Everywhere only the professed sisters have the right to vote according to the rules. But here, there are only four professed sisters. So here, all who have already received the habit can vote. But the person elected must be a professed sister. When you write the name on the ballot paper you must write that in a different hand, such that others may not be able to recognize the person who has written it. Once the election is over, the ballot papers must be burned then and there itself. On the day of election if a professed sister is sick and bed ridden, then the two senior most professed sisters will take the ballot box to her and make her to cast her vote. When the votes are being put into the box you must keep

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>കുന്നു. അവിടെ രണ്ടു മുറിയിലും ഓരോ മേശയിട്ടു വിരിച്ച നമ്മൾ നിൽക്കുന്ന മുറിയിൽ അമ്മത്രേസ്യ പൂണ്യവാളത്തിയുടെ ഒരു രൂപവും രണ്ടു മെഴുകുതിരിയും കുറിയിടുന്ന പാത്രവും ഉണ്ടായിരിക്കണം. കുർബാന കൈക്കൊണ്ട് ഉപകാരസ്ഥരണ കഴിഞ്ഞ് ഗ്രാത്തമുറിയിൽ എല്ലാവരും കൂടി മുട്ടുകുത്തി 5 വിനാഴിക വരെ അമ്മത്രേസ്യ പൂണ്യവാളത്തിയോട് ഈ തിരഞ്ഞെടുപ്പു തെറ്റു വരാതിരിക്കാൻ സഹായമപേക്ഷിക്കണം. പിന്നെ റൂഹാദക്കൂർശാ തമ്പുരാനേ എന്ന നമസ്കാരം ചൊല്ലി ക്രമം പോലെ കുറിയിടുക. എന്നാൽ ഇതിന്റെ ക്രമം മുഴുവൻ വേറെ ക്രാസിൽ എഴുതിയിട്ടുള്ളതുകൊണ്ട് ഇവിടെ ഇനി എഴുതുന്നില്ല. (CKC I, 127-128)</p> | <p>custody of eyes so that you do not see the votes. Voting and election must be conducted in the parlour. There in both the rooms there must be a table each covered with table-cloth. In the room where we are to gather together there should be a statue of our mother St. Teresa for help that they may not make a wrong election. After this, say the prayer to the Holy Spirit and carry out the voting according to the rules. Since all the rules regarding voting has been written in another chapter it is not repeated here.</p> |
|--|--|

4.3.1.3. Comments

Both these texts speak of the matters related to the elections that had to take place in the convent every three years. The first election in the history of St. Teresa’s convent was that of sub-prioress which was held in 1869. Text one speaks of the qualities that the sub-prioress needs to have, in order to be elected to that post; whereas the second text discloses the rules and regulations regarding elections. Since both these texts speak for themselves, there is no need of further explanations. It seems that the sisters were well prepared to perform the task of election which has a major role as far as the life of the Congregation is concerned. It is notable that none of these texts give any special role to mother Eliswa.

4.3.2. An Overall Picture of the Election

The chart below gives an overall picture of the elections that took place in the convent at Koonammavu from

the first election to the post of sub-prioress in 1869 till the division of the convent in 1890.

| Source | Date | Elected Persons | Position | Rite |
|---------------|-----------------|--|---|----------------------------|
| CKC I, 130 | 1869 June 17 | Sr. Thresia of Jesus | Sub-prioress | Latin |
| CKC II, 32-33 | 1871 July 16 | Sr. Thresia of Jesus Sr. Mariam of Jesus Sr. Eliswa of Holy Mary | Superior Sub-prioress <i>Thakkolkari</i> ⁷ | Latin Syrian Latin |
| CKC II, 50-51 | 1872 May 16 | Sr. Catherine of Jesus/St. Ann ⁸ | Sub-prioress | Syrian |
| CKC II, 89 | 1874 July 16 | Sr. Thresia of Jesus Sr. Catherine of Jesus | Superior Sub-prioress ⁹ | Latin Syrian |
| CKC II, 113 | 1878 July 16 | Sr. Catherine of Jesus Sr. Mariam of Jesus Sr. Thresia Kathrina of Jesus | Superior Sub-prioress <i>Thakkolkari</i> | Syrian Syrian Syrian |
| CKC II, 118 | 1881 July 16 | Sr. Mariam of Jesus Sr. Catherine of Jesus Sr. Eliswa of Holy Mary | Superior Sub-Prioress <i>Thakkolkari</i> | Syrian Syrian Latin |
| CKC II, 124 | 1884 July 16 | Sr. Thresia of Jesus Sr. Catherine of Jesus Sr. Mariam of Jesus | Superior Sub-prioress <i>Thakkolkari</i> | Latin Syrian Syrian |
| CKC II, 135 | 1887 July 16 | Sr. Catherine of Jesus Sr. Mariam of Jesus Sr. Thresia of Jesus | Superior Sub-prioress <i>Thakkolkari</i> | Syrian Syrian Latin |
| CKC II, 149 | 1891 July 16 | Sr. Anna of Jesus Sr. Mariam Thresia of Jesus | Superior Sub-prioress ¹⁰ | Syrian Syrian |

⁷ *Thakkolkari* means keeper of the keys. In modern terminology, it is called the treasurer.

⁸It is notable from the Chronicles itself that at the time of vestition Catherine was given the name Catherine of Santa Anna and at the time of profession her name was changed as Catherine of Jesus (Ref. CKC I, 205, CKC II, 103).

⁹ The name of *Thakkolkari* is not written in the Chronicles.

¹⁰ Here also the chronicler left out the name of the *Thakkolkari*.

From the table it is clear that except in 1869¹¹ and 1872¹² all other times elections were held on 16th July, the feast day of the Mother of Carmel. So too, for the first election both the fathers Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara were present. After the death of Fr. Chavara till the departure of Fr. Leopold in 1876, the delegate and the Fr. Vicar of Men TOCD presided over the election. After 1876, it was Fr. Philip and the Fr. Vicar of TOCD who were present for the election.¹³ Basing on the chart above, if one makes a table only of the superiors of St. Teresa's convent at Koonammavu from 1866 - 1890, it will be as follows:

| SL. No. | Name | Period |
|---------|--|------------------------------------|
| 1 | Sr. Eliswa of Holy Mary (Appointed) | 1866-1871 |
| 2 | Sr. Thresia of Jesus | 1871-1874, 1874-1878, 1884-1887 |
| 3 | Sr. Catherine of Jesus | 1878-1881, 1887-1891 |
| 4. | Sr. Mariam of Jesus | 1881-1884 |

It is notable that except the period of appointed superior (of mother Eliswa), there were three turns for each Rite. In the case of Latin Rite Sr. Thresia alone had taken the responsibility while in the case of Syrian Rite both Sr. Catherine of Jesus (twice) and Sr. Mariam of Jesus (once) shared those three turns.

4.3.3. Persons Held Positions Repeatedly

In order to have an easy look we give below in chart forms the names of the persons who held some positions repeatedly in the convent from 1866 to 1890.

¹¹ Due to the sickness of the superior, mother Eliswa, the election of the sub-prioress became an urgent need.

¹² The election was held to the post of sub-prioress, since Sr. Mariam of Jesus who was in that post fell ill.

¹³ See for example *CKC II*, 33, 118-119, 124.

4.3.3.1. Sr. Eliswa of Holy Mary

| SL. No | Positions | Duration |
|--------|--------------------|-----------|
| 1 | Superior | 1866-1871 |
| 2 | <i>Thakkolkari</i> | 1871-1874 |
| 3 | <i>Thakkolkari</i> | 1881-1884 |

Comments: About 24 years of life at Koonammavu, mother Eliswa held the post of the superior only once; that too was an appointment. There is no documented evidence for that appointment except that of the references in *CKC* as ‘our first superior’ (ഞങ്ങളുടെ ഒന്നാമത്തെ ഭദ്രശാസ്ത്രി). This nominated period includes their life in *panambumadam* as postulants, as novices in the first year of the new convent and the period after profession on 16th July 1868 until 16th July 1871, when Sr. Thresia was elected as the superior. It is clear from the Chronicles that mother Eliswa was never elected as the superior but she was elected as *Thakkolkari* twice.

4.3.3.2. Sr. Thresia of Jesus

| SL. No | Positions | Duration |
|--------|--------------------|-----------|
| 1 | Sub-prioress | 1869-1871 |
| 2 | Superior | 1871-1874 |
| 3 | Superior | 1874-1878 |
| 4 | Superior | 1884-1887 |
| 5 | <i>Thakkolkari</i> | 1887-1890 |

Comments: The first election in the history of Koonammavu convent as said above was to elect a sub-prioress to help the superior and to take charge of the candidates. Sr. Thresia was elected as the sub-prioress. In the next two elections consecutively she was elected as the superior. Again in the year 1884 she was elected as the superior after an interval of

six years.¹⁴ During the last election before the division Sr. Thresia was elected to the post of the *Thakkolkari*. It is notable that, during the time of division, the post of the treasurer of the convent was held by Sr. Thresia. Not only that except twice (1878-1881, 1884-1887), the post of the treasurer was held by the Latin sisters. If so, all the accounts of money and the lease of the land etc. were accessible to them.¹⁵

4.3.3.3. Sr. Catherine of Jesus

| SL. No | Positions | Duration |
|--------|--------------|-----------|
| 1 | Sub-prioress | 1872-1874 |
| 2 | Sub-prioress | 1874-1878 |
| 3 | Superior | 1878-1881 |
| 4 | Sub-prioress | 1881-1884 |
| 5 | Sub-prioress | 1884-1887 |
| 6 | Superior | 1887-1891 |

Comments: From the above table we can see that Sr. Catherine had continued her office of responsibility either as sub-prioress or as superior consecutively for around eighteen years. She joined the convent only in 24th December 1867 and her profession was on 2nd February 1871.¹⁶ She took an important role in the formation of the novices as she was the

¹⁴ As far as the consecutive election of Sr. Thresia is concerned thus remarks Msgr. Mellano: “Sr. Thresia of Jesus was re-elected for many times because of her capacity” (Letter written to the Propaganda Fide on 28th November, 1888).

¹⁵ Then how can one justify the accusation of Msgr. Mellano and Sr. Sucey that after the division of the vicariate the Latin sisters were in ‘house arrest’, in ‘prison’ and they had no freedom, and were deprived of all the offices etc.? (cf. *SGME*, 298). So too the statement of Sr. Sucey: “the sisters of the Latin Rite were removed from their office” (*SGME*, 370), does not have any validity.

¹⁶ See below the chart of the ‘details of members,’ SL. No. 6.

sub-prioress for four turns.¹⁷ From this we can assume that she was not only an able administrator but also she was well appreciated by the other members in the community.

4.3.3.4. Sr. Mariam of Jesus

| SL. No | Positions | Duration |
|--------|--------------|-----------|
| 1 | Sub-prioress | 1871-1872 |
| 2 | Sub-prioress | 1878-1881 |
| 3 | Superior | 1881-1884 |
| 4 | Treasurer | 1884-1887 |
| 5 | Sub-prioress | 1887-1891 |

Comments: Sr. Mariam was the sub-prioress for three turns. Once she was elected as the superior and once as the treasure. As the Chronicles put in evidence, since she was sick, she could not carry out the responsibility of the sub-prioress therefore election was held again and as said above Sr. Catherine of Jesus was elected to the post of sub-prioress. As we can understand from the above tables that after 1871 none of the Latin sisters were in charge of the novices.¹⁸

4.4. Details of Members from 1866 to 1890

Even though in *CKC I*, 204, the list of the members is given, it is incomplete. We have tried to give a full list as far as possible. Still some of the details are missing since they were not available in the Chronicles.

¹⁷If so, how can one justify the statement of Sr. Sucy: “Until 1890, the formation of the sisters was in the hands of Mother Eliswa and Mother Thresia...” (*SGME*, 390).

¹⁸That is, among the 24 years of life at Koonammavu (before division), for 18 years Syrian sisters (11 years Sr. Catherine of Jesus and 7 years Sr. Mariam of Jesus) were the sub-prioresses and thus in charge of the novices. Only 2 years (1869-1871) Sr. Thresia of Jesus (Latin Rite) was sub-prioress and therefore in charge of the novices.

| SL. No | Name | Date of Birth | Parish | Rite | Date of Entering | Profession |
|--------|-------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|---------------------|------------------|------------|
| 1 | Sr. Eliswa of Holy Mary | 03-10-1831 | Kurisingal | Latin | 13-2-1866 | 16-07-1868 |
| 2 | Ar. Anna of Sacred heart | 21-04-1850 | Koonammavu | Latin | 13-2-1866 | 16-07-1868 |
| 3 | Sr. Thresia of Jesus | 08-05-1848 | Kurisingal | Latin | 13-2-1866 | 16-07-1868 |
| 4 | Sr. Clara of Holy Mary | 25-06-1827 | Vaikom | Syrian | 14-2-1866 | 16-07-1868 |
| 5 | Sr. Mariam of Eucharist | 24-03-1852 | Konthuruthy | Syrian | 08-9-1867 | 02-02-1871 |
| 6 | Sr. Kathrina of Jesus ¹⁹ | 17-06-1849 | Chakkarakadave | Syrian | 24-12-1867 | 02-02-1871 |
| 7 | Sr. Maria Thresia Rose | 02-06-1852 | Ernakulam | Syrian | 11-5-1868 | 02-02-1871 |
| 8 | Sr. Anna of St. Louis | 22-07-1853 | Chakkarakadave | Syrian | 20-5-1871 | 16-07-1875 |
| 9 | Sr. Margareetha of Jesus | 06-03-1853 | Muttom | Syrian | 28-5-1871 | 16-07-1875 |
| 10 | Sr. Agnes of Jesus | 04-08-1856 | Pulinkunnu | Syrian | 24-12-1872 | 16-07-1875 |
| 11 | Sr. Maria Therese of Jesus | 13-04-1853 | Kanjoor | Syrian | 24-12-1873 | 16-07-1875 |
| 12 | Sr. Thresia Kathrina | 02-06-1855 | Pulinkunnu | Syrian | 13-07-1874 | 16-07-1875 |
| 13 | Sr. Anastasia of St. Joseph | Not given | Chakiamury | Latin | 08-01-1881 | 23-05-1886 |
| 14 | Sr. Cicilia of St. Joseph | August 1865 | Puthenpally | Syrian | 22-04-1881 | 23-05-1886 |
| 15 | Sr. Beatrice | Not Given | Chakiamury | Latin | 08-01-1881 | 11-06-1887 |
| 16 | Pathiala Angela (Thresia) | Not Given | Varapuzha | Latin ²⁰ | 21-01-1883 | |
| 17 | Sr. Mariam Kathrina | Not Given | Chakkarakadave | Syrian | 14-12-1884 | 11-06-1887 |
| 18 | Poonoly Thresia | Not Given | Kanjoor | Syrian | 16-12-1884 | |
| 19 | Sr. Geltrud | Not Given | Vaikom | Syrian | 10-06-1885 | 11-06-1887 |

¹⁹ The name given in the list in *CKC I*, 204 is Sr. *Kathrina De Santa Anna*.

²⁰As shows the chart, the last Latin member entered in the convent was in 1883. See *CKC II*, 122. Of course, there is a reference in the Chronicles to a boarding girl called Vypissery Mariam who went to Verapoly after the division along with other sisters. See, *CKC II*, 144.

| | | | | | | |
|----|-------------------------|-----------|------------|--------|------------|------------|
| 20 | Sr. Euphrasia | Not Given | Vaikom | Syrian | 10-06-1885 | 11-06-1887 |
| 21 | Thayyil Brigit | Not Given | Mannanam | Syrian | 21-05-1886 | |
| 22 | Thekkekara Rosa | Not Given | Kattor | Syrian | 16-09-1886 | |
| 23 | Chirackal Eliswa | Not Given | Panappilly | Syrian | 15-03-1887 | |
| 24 | Punjakkunnal Thresia | Not Given | Pala | Syrian | July, 1887 | |
| 25 | Punjakkunnal Mariam | Not Given | Pala | Syrian | July, 1887 | |
| 26 | Kattakayath Anna | Not Given | Pala | Syrian | July, 1887 | |
| 27 | Naganoolil Mariam | Not Given | Pala | Syrian | July, 1887 | |

There were two lay sisters, Sr. Thresia of St. Joseph and Sr. Mariam Magdalena of St. Kuriakose; both of them had joined in December 1879 and took their profession in February 1880. And members like Mariam Magdalena and Margareetha of St. Kuriakose were sent away from the convent on 30th December 1868 and on 14th March 1874 respectively.

4.5. Conclusion

As said above this linking chapter speaks of the communion that prevailed in Koonammavu community, the special apostolate which was entrusted to that community and the steps which had been taken to carry out that mission. The given lists of both the election and the members of the community would help us to get an overall view of that community till division in 1890.

CHAPTER FIVE

THE DIVISION OF WOMEN TOCD IN 1890: DOCUMENTARY FACTS

5.0. Introduction

The event of division of TOCD women Congregation according to the Rites as Syrian and Latin in 1890 still remains a matter of discussion among the Latin and Syrian branches. Sr. Sucy in her book *SGME* makes it a topic of hot discussion in order to establish a recently originated argument that mother Eliswa one of the first four members and the first appointed superior of the Congregation as the foundress of Women TOCD on the basis of the ownership of the land in which the first temporary convent (*panambumadam*) was established. She dedicates Chapter Four (pages 251-368) of *SGME* to this event. Sr. Sucy attributes to the ecclesiastical authorities of that time some kind of responsibility of the damage done to the TOCD women Congregation, the scandal that was created among the faithful and the sufferings of the founding members. The author holds the views that the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Andrea Aiuti has recommended that the convent at Koonammavu should go to the Syrian sisters, because he was afraid of the Syrian community who may resort to any kind of revolution to achieve their goal. The Apostolic Delegate, as he was well aware of the submissive character of the Latin people made them to sacrifice their right in order to satisfy the Syrian community. Sr. Sucy further adds that Archbishop Andrea Aiuti was unaware of their false and biased claims. Thus, the Apostolic Delegate made his decision on the “strength of the protest” and has done injustice to the minority Latins. The Latin sisters “never kept count of the value of their earthly properties and they set aside everything as the capital of the convent. They exchanged temporal goods for spiritual goods....These founding members, who had opted for God, did not become

desperate.”¹ We have already questioned in *AUSW*, 124-128 the authenticity of many of her statements.² Here we are content with simply citing the historical documents which will speak for themselves. All the important correspondences are cited by the *Sacra Congregazione De Propaganda Fide per gli Affari del Rito Orientale, Ponente L'Eminentissimo e Reverentissimo Singnor Cardinale Gaetano Aloisi-Masella, Relazione con Sommario: Circa la giurisdizione sul Monastero delle Suore Terziarie Carmelitane sito in cunemao Marzo 1890.*

5.1. Immediate Context of the Division

The immediate reason for the division of women TOCD has to be evaluated within the framework of the historical background of the 19th C. Kerala Church. It is closely related to both the Syrian and Latin Church history. It can be said that the division was the result of a natural consequence of the growing consciousness of Syrian – Latin roots and peculiar characteristics of the eastern and western traditions. This long cherished dream of the Syrians was realized with the erection of the two Syrian Apostolic Vicariates at Trichur and Kottayam on 20th May 1887. The establishment of these Syrian Vicariates had naturally infuriated the Latin Church in Kerala. Also such a division would have had its impact, at least unconscious or subconscious, in the minds of Koonammavu community which consisted of Syrian and Latin sisters. The clergy both Latin and Syrian would have tried to flare up these sentiments of mutual dislike among the members of the TOCD sisters. Before citing the documents regarding the verdict of Rome over the ownership of Koonammavu convent we present the

¹*SGME*, 368.

² For example, regarding the taking possession of the convent, two Latin convents and negation of Properties etc.

account of *CKC II*, 142-143 which may serve as a background of the existing situation mainly in Koonammavu. The chronicler concentrates on the opposition of the Latin laity to the Vicar Apostolic Msgr. Medlycott to whose ecclesiastical territory Koonammavu convent belonged.³ We give the account of the Chronicles in its original Malayalam with its English version, which will shed light on the prevailing atmosphere of tension among the Latin laity.

³Sr. Suzy states that until 1887 the book of Chronicles has objectively recorded the facts without giving any consideration for the Rite problem. According to her from page 72 onwards “the style changed and matters were recorded in a biased way” (*SGME*, 299). The cited page number 72 is however wrong. Only three events of 1887 are recorded after the division of the Vicariates on 20th May 1887, namely the vestition of 4 candidates, casting the first vote for accepting for profession of 4 novices (out of which the name Sr. Angela who belonged to the Latin Rite, since her name appears in the list of the Latin sisters who departed for Verapoly) and the election (*CKC II*, 134-136, 144) in which, nobody can find any biased approach. Even the election cannot be interpreted as based on Rite division. The ‘Chapter’ was electing the sisters who were capable for the role. Thus, Sr. Thresia of Latin Rite was elected thrice as the superior. Now Sr. Catherine of the Syrian Rite who demonstrated quality for leadership was chosen for a second time. Even then, Sr. Thresia had given the important office of Treasurer (cf. *WFF*, chapter IV No. 4.3.3. ‘Persons held Positions Repeatedly’). If the Rite issue had played a role in the election, she should not have elected to such an office. The Chronicles merely records 10 events of the year 1888, which had nothing to do with the Rite problem (*CKC II*, 136-141). In the Chronicles, nothing is recorded in the year 1889. On 1890 the chronicler mentions that the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur Msgr. Medlycott has sent a letter informing the sisters that the Koonammavu convent was entrusted to his administration by Rome (*CKC II*, 141). Hence, the accusation of Sr. Suzy does not have any solid ground. Only in the writings of the Chronicles on 1890 (which is a reflected account of the various happenings of 1887-1890), one may be tempted to find a one-sided approach in favour of the Syrians.

5.1.1. CKC II, 142-143

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>1888-ൽ, കുനമ്മാവുകൽ ആഘോഷിച്ചു വന്നിരുന്ന വി. കുർബാനയുടെ തിരുനാളിനു സുറിയാനിക്കാർക്ക് ആദ്യ മെത്രാനായി അന്നു വരാപ്പുഴ കാര്യവശാൽ വന്നിരുന്ന ത്രിശൂർ വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കായ മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ടു മെത്രാനച്ചനെ കുനമ്മാവു നമ്മുടെ അച്ചന്മാർ ക്ഷണിക്കുകയും അദ്ദേഹം ക്ഷണം അനുസരിച്ച് വരാപ്പുഴ അതിരൂപതയിലെ കോ ആദിത്തോർ മർസീനോസ് മെത്രാനു മൊരുമിച്ച് ടി. കുനമ്മാവു കൊവേന്തയിൽ വരികയും ചെയ്തു. അതിനാൽ കുനമ്മാവിലെ ലത്തീൻകാരായ ജനങ്ങൾ ടി. മെത്രാനച്ചന്മാരെ പ്രസ്തുത കൊവേന്തപ്പള്ളിയിൽ കയറ്റാതിരിപ്പാൻ ലഹള കൂട്ടുകയാൽ പള്ളിയിൽ കയറാൻ സംഗതിയാകാതെ ബ. പിതാക്കന്മാർ വരാപ്പുഴയ്ക്കു മടങ്ങുകയാണുണ്ടായത്. ഇതു സംഭവിച്ചത് ടി. ആണ്ടുജൂൺ മാസത്തിലായിരുന്നു. ജനങ്ങൾ ചെയ്ത ഈ ഭയങ്കര കൃത്യത്തിനു ശിക്ഷയായി കുനമ്മാവു പള്ളിക്ക് “ഇന്തർദിക്കത്ത്” എന്ന കുറ്റം വരാപ്പുഴയിലെ ലെയോനാർദ് മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താ തിരുമനസ്സുകൊണ്ടു ചൊല്ലി. തന്നിമിത്തം പള്ളിയിൽ ദൈവകർമ്മങ്ങൾ നടത്താൻ പാടില്ലാതെ കൊവേന്തയ്ക്കടുത്തുള്ള ഒരു കപ്പലിൽ നടത്തിയിരുന്നു. ഈ സംഗതിയെപ്പറ്റി ഓരോ കലാപങ്ങളും വഴക്കുകളും ആരംഭിക്കുകയും ശക്തിപ്പെടുകയും ചെയ്കയാൽ കൊവേന്തയിലെ അച്ചന്മാർ വിവരം അത്യുന്നത ദെലഗാർ അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കായ്ക്കും പരിശുദ്ധ സിംഹാസനത്തിലേയ്ക്കും ഹർജികൾ</p> | <p>Bishop Medlycott, the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, who was the first bishop for the Syrians, had come to Verapoly in 1888 on the day of the feast of Holy Eucharist which was being celebrated every year at Koonammavu on a grand scale. So our priests at Koonammavu invited him for the feast. Hence he came along with Bishop Marcelline, the co-adjutor of Verapoly, to the monastery of Koonammavu. But the Latin people of the place started a riot in order to prevent the Bishops from entering the church of the monastery. Therefore the Bishops returned to Verapoly without entering the church. This happened in June 1888. Since the people had done such an evil act Msgr. Leonard, the Arch Bishop of Verapoly declared an ‘interdict’ on the church at Koonammavu. Therefore, the divine services could not be celebrated in the church, they were carried out in a chapel near the monastery. Based on this, several feuds and quarrels were taking place. As the disturbance began to gain strength and momentum, the priests of the monastery at Koonammavu began sending petitions to the Apostolic Delegate and to the Holy See. Thus in January 1889 His</p> |

കൊടുത്തു കൊണ്ടുവന്നു. ഇങ്ങനെ 1889 ജനുവരി മാസത്തിൽ അത്യുന്നത ദെലഗാദപ്പസ്തോലിക്ക കൊവേന്തകളെ സന്ദർശിക്കുന്നതിനായി മലയാളത്തിൽ വരികയിൽ കുനമ്മാവു കൊവേന്തയും പള്ളിയും വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാനച്ചന്റെ അധികാരത്തിലേയ്ക്കു വിട്ടു കൊടുക്കണമെന്നുണ്ടായ തിരുസിംഹാസനത്തിന്റെ തീരുമാനം ദെലഗാദപ്പസ്തോലിക്കാ മുഖാന്തിരം നമ്മുടെ ബ. അച്ചന്മാർ അറികയാൽ ടി ആണ്ട് മാർച്ചുമാസം അച്ചന്മാർ കൊവേന്ത വിട്ടു കൊടുത്തുകൊണ്ട് അമ്പഴക്കാട്ട് കൊവേന്തയിലേയ്ക്കു പോയി. ഈ കൊവേന്ത അച്ചന്മാർ വഴിയായി നമ്മുടെ ഈ മഠത്തിനു സിദ്ധിച്ചുകൊണ്ടിരുന്ന ആത്മീകവും ലൗകികവുമായ ബുദ്ധിമുട്ടുകളും സഹായ ഉപകാരങ്ങളും വർണ്ണിച്ചറിയിപ്പാൻ പ്രയാസം തന്നെ. മാത്രമല്ല, ആ കൊവേന്തയുടെ അഭിവൃദ്ധിക്കു വേണ്ടി 30 കൊല്ലത്തോളം നമ്മുടെ വന്ദ്യപിതാക്കന്മാർ അവിടെ ചെയ്തിട്ടുള്ള ബുദ്ധിമുട്ടുകളും ഓർക്കുമ്പോൾ ആരുടെ ഹൃദയമാണ് തകർന്നു പോകാത്തത്. ഇങ്ങനെ ഞങ്ങൾ വ്യസനിച്ചും യാതൊരു ആദരവും കൂടാതെയും വിരോധികളായ ക്രൂരജനങ്ങളുടെ ഇടയിൽ ഞങ്ങളെ ഇട്ടും വച്ച് പോകുന്നതിനെപ്പറ്റി ബ. അച്ചന്മാർക്കും വ്യസനമുണ്ടാകാതെയിരുന്നില്ല. മഠത്തിലെ കുമ്പസാരം കുർബാന ആദിയായ കർമ്മങ്ങൾ നടത്തിപ്പോന്നിരുന്ന അച്ചന്മാരുടെ വേർപാട് എത്രയും പെ. പെ. ബ. പിതാവ് മെത്രാനച്ചന് വളരെ മനക്ലേശം ഉണ്ടാക്കിത്തീർക്കുന്നതിന് കാരണമായി. ഇതിനാൽ മഠത്തിന്റെ കാര്യങ്ങൾ നടത്തുന്നതിന് തളിയത്തു ബ. വസില്ലിയോസ് അച്ചനേയും ആലപ്പാട്ടു ലുവർത്തോസ് അച്ചനെയും ചകൃത്ത്

eminence the Apostolic Delegate came to Malayalam to visit the Monasteries. The decision of the Holy See that the Koonammavu church and the monastery should be given to the authority of the Archbishop of Verapoly was made known to the priests in the monastery by the Apostolic Delegate himself. So our priests gave up the monastery in the month of March and went to the monastery at Ambazhakkad. The spiritual and material helps, benefits and services that the sisters of this convent had been receiving through the priests of this monastery were so much, that they cannot be described easily. Moreover, who can ever think but with a broken heart of the thirty years of difficulties endured and efforts put forward there by our fathers, for the growth and progress of the monastery? The fathers too, did feel very anxious, in leaving us here in dread and fear, in the middle of the cruel people who were against us, with no one for a support. The leaving of the priests, who were offering Holy Mass and administering the Sacraments in the convent became a cause of great mental stress for Bishop Medlycott. So he sent an order to reverend father Baselius Thaliath, Liberthus Alappatu, and Brother Fransiscos Chakiath, asking them to see to the affairs of the

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>ബ. ഫ്രാൻസിസ്കോസ് സഹോദരനെയും മഠത്തിന്റെ കിഴക്കുവശത്തുള്ള ബംഗ്ലാവിൽ താമസിക്കുന്നതിനും കുർബാന മുതലായ കർമ്മാദികൾ മുൻ പോലെ നടത്തുന്നതിനും മറ്റും ടി. ബ. അച്ചന്മാർക്കു കൽപന അയച്ചു താമസിപ്പിക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു. മാത്രമല്ല, കൊവേന്ത വക വസ്തുക്കൾ അവിടെയുണ്ടായിരുന്നതിനാൽ അവയുടെ അന്വേഷത്തിനും ഈ താമസം അത്യാവശ്യമായിരുന്നു. ഇതിനിടയ്ക്ക് ഇവിടെ താമസിച്ചിരുന്ന അച്ചന്മാരോട് ജനങ്ങൾ പല ശല്യങ്ങളും ചെയ്തിരുന്നു. എങ്കിലും ഒന്നും വകവയ്ക്കാതെ മഠത്തിലെ കാര്യങ്ങൾ നടത്തിവരികയും അവരുടെ വക അടുത്ത പറമ്പിൽ ഒരു ബംഗ്ലാവു നിശ്ചയിച്ച് ആരംഭിക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു.</p> | <p>convent and minister the Holy Sacrifice and other sacraments as before, staying in the bungalow of the convent on its eastern side. The bishop made them stay there which was also a need of theirs as they had properties there to take care of. Meanwhile, the priests who were staying in the bungalow were being tormented in many ways. Yet they carried out the affairs of the convent without paying heed to them. Moreover, they decided to make a bungalow in their land that lay next to that of the convent and started its construction.</p> |
|--|---|

5.1.2. Main Arguments

- The Latin people of the place started a riot in order to prevent the Bishops from entering the church of the monastery at the occasion of the feast of the Holy Eucharist when they came by the invitation of the TOCD fathers from Koonammavu monastery. Therefore the Bishops Medlycott and Marceline returned to Verapoly without entering the church and Msgr. Mellano declared 'Interdict' to Koonammavu church.
- The quarrels and riots increased.
- Koonammavu church and monastery were given under the jurisdiction of Msgr. Mellano
- TOCD fathers went to Ambazhakkad whereas two fathers and a brother stayed in the bungalow of the convent.

5.1.3. Comments

As we have noted above this *CKC* entry has a later reflection of the events that had taken place earlier. Also Holy See's decision to entrust the administration of the Koonammavu convent to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur Msgr. Medlycott seems to have influenced the chronicler's account. Hence, there is no wonder if sometimes the author unconsciously or subconsciously would have taken sides. This becomes evident when the chronicler narrates the events of handing over the monastery of Koonammavu to the Latins and the departure of the TOCD Syrian fathers to Ambazhakkad and the torments suffered by few fathers who were left in Koonammavu to celebrate the daily Mass and other liturgical functions in the convent.

5.2. *Ponenza* – Document Regarding the Verdict over the Convent

5.2.1. Contents of *Ponenza* of March 1890

- I. Report and evaluation (voto) of Most Rev. Fr. Gabriele de Guarcino Capuchin, the Consulter of the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of Faith on the controversy between Msgr. Mellano, the Archbishop of Verapoly and Msgr. Medlycott, the bishop of Trichur concerning the jurisdiction on the convent of the Third Order of Carmelites situated in Koonammavu.
- II. Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti, the Archbishop of Acrida, Apostolic Delegate of Oriental India to his Eminence Prefect, in which gives the report on the controversy between Msgr. Mellano, the Archbishop of Verapoly and Msgr. Medlycott the bishop of Trichur concerning the jurisdiction of the convent at Koonammavu.

- Attached Document 1: Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated on 28th November 1888 in which he reclaims the right of the convent of the Third Order of religious women in Koonammavu.
- Attached Document 2: Letter of Msgr. Medlycott, Apostolic Vicar of Trichur to Msgr. Andrea Aiuti dated 27th January 1889 in which he makes his observations on the letter sent by Msgr. Mellano to his Eminence prefect.
- Attached Document 3: Petition of certain Syrian representatives of Syro Malabar community to Msgr. Andrea Aiuti, the Apostolic Delegate in which they prove that the convent of sisters at Koonammavu belongs to the Syro Malabar community.
- Attached Document 4: Annexed document to the above mentioned petition of some Syrians on the concerned affairs of the seminary at Puthenpally.
- Attached Document 5: Circular Letter of Fr. Leopold OCD, Delegate of the Vicar Apostolic for the TOCD convent of Malabar to the clergy and people of the churches of Muttuchira & Kaduthuruthi dated 13th February 1867.
- Attached document 6: Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to Msgr. Andrea Aiuti dated 12th April 1889, in which he includes the versions and gives the summary of the four documents (C', C'', C''', C''''') claiming the convent in favour of the Syrians.
- Attached document 7: Letter of Msgr. Mellano to Archbishop Andrea Aiuti dated 15th March 1889 in which he transmits the matters he had from his Vicar General Fr. Philip on the foundation of the convent of TOCD women religious at Koonammavu.

- Attached Document 8: letter of Msgr. Mellano to Msgr. Andrea Aiuti dated 2nd April 1889 in which he answers about the content of the letter of Fr. Leopold.
- Attached Document 9: Letter of Rev. mother Catherine of Jesus, superior of St. Teresa's convent in Koonammavu, dated 8th March 1889, in which she exposes the reasons in favour of Syrians on the above mentioned monastery.
- Attached document 10: Report redacted by Fr. Emmanuel Nidhiry, Syrian Priest and Vicar General of Kottayam on the question existing between Latins and Syrians concerning the Koonammavu convent and Msgr. Levigne, the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam, approved and sent it through the Apostolic Delegate to the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda.

We follow the chronological order of the correspondences.⁴ Finally, the document on the concluding

⁴Accordingly, the first letter enclosed in the *ponenza* is that of Fr. Leopold the Provincial Delegate to the parishes of Muttuchira and Kaduthuruthi dated on 13th February 1867. In it, he was requesting for money from the churches and parishners for the construction of the convent at Koonammavu. The parishes of Muttuchira and Kaduthuruthi belong to the Syrian Rite. Hence, it is wrong to argue that the alms were collected only from the Latin parishes and the convent was meant only for the Latin sisters. Thus reads the pertinent part of the letter which might have written originally in Malayalam and its Latin translation had sent to Rome at the time of the dispute over the jurisdiction of the convent: "...During the period of this beloved Bishop, who is our father, started the work of the convent in order to spread the fragrance of virginity, the dearest flower to the Lord. As you know, from the alms of Syrian parishes, priests and people, the work as far as the roofing has been taken place. But many things are remaining to fulfill. I have heard from different ways and from different people that you will extend your good will for this matter

observation of Fr. Gabriele Guarcino, the consultant of the Holy See will be given.

5.2.2. Important Letters

5.2.2.1. Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 28th November 1888

The Archbishop of Verapoly was directly addressing Cardinal Gaetano Aloisi-Masella the prefect of the Sacred Congregation of Propagation of Faith. We give below the original letter and its translation.

5.2.2.1.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>Eminentissimo Signore, Mi credo obbligato a ricorrere a V.E. per essere illuminato sopra una questione a riguardo del Monastero delle nostre Terziarie native e per ottenerne giustizia. Questo Monastero, vicino a Cunemao, fu fondato da quattro Native, due delle quali furono le prime Superiore, ed una chiamata Suor Teresa di Gegù, per la sua capacità rieletta più volte, e da esse fondato nella propria casa cedendo anche il terreno contiguo, ma dopo fu</p> | <p>Your Eminence, I feel obligated to give to your Eminence some descriptions on the question regarding the monastery⁵ of our natives of 3rd Order for your information and for obtaining justice. This convent nearby Koonammavu has founded by 4 natives, two among them were the first superiors; and one called Sr. Thresia of Jesus, was re-elected many times because of her capacity and by themselves founded the proper house in their own land but</p> |

than other parishes and people. By this Lent, we greatly wish to bring about some four or six nuns in the convent by completing the works. Through this letter, I extend my hand for alms from the church as well as from each one of you....” (Ref. ASJMM).

⁵Even though in the original letters sometimes the term ‘monastery’ had used to denote the convent at Koonammavu, in order to avoid confusion, in our translations, main arguments and comments we will be using the term ‘convent’ as far as women TOCD is concerned and ‘monastery’ for men TOCD.

riedificato nelle vicinanze di questo primo, come luogo più conveniente.

Per dar luogo anche alle giovani di rito Soriano, che avessero la vocazione di consacrarsi a Dio in tale stato, furono e dal mio Antecessore e da me pure ricevute delle Soriane e così formarono un solo corpo ed un solo Monastero. Essendo così, non vedo ragione alcuna, per cui i nuovi Vicarii Apostolici abbiano a pretendere autorità sopra tali Terziarie, e chiamarle in altri luoghi come se fossero loro suddite.

Poco dopo la venuta di Monsig. Lavigne, Vicario Apostolico di Cottayam, aveva mandato una lettera alla superiora di questo Monastero, in cui ordinava che alcune di queste Monache dovessero partire per altro luogo, etc. senza che nulla avesse fatto sapere a me previamente, di ciò mi lamentai col Delegato Apostolico, in quale nel rispondermi si limitò a dirmi, che Monsig. Lavigne non farà nulla senza intendersi prima con me.

Da tutto l'insieme credo che da un momento all'altro ciascuno farà quel che gli viene in mente, essendo persuasi che si soffrirà tutto in silenzio, ciò va bene, ma V. E. Sa pure che la pazienza, umiltà o mitezza dell'uomo hanno un limite, e che è

little later it was re-built nearby the first one as a more convenient place. To give place also for the young ones in Syrian Rite, to lead a consecrated life in this state, my predecessor and I received the Syrians and thus being formed as a single body and one convent. Being so I do not see any reason by which the new Apostolic Vicars can take the authority over the Third Order, and call them to other places as they wish.

After the coming of Msgr. Lavigne, the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam, he has sent a letter to the superior of this convent, by which he ordered that some of these nuns must depart to other places, etc., without informing me anything in advance and when I brought it to the attention of the Apostolic Delegate, he responded me saying that 'Msgr. Lavigne, the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam will do nothing without consulting me.'

Along with all these I believe that in one or the other moment each one will do what comes to their mind, persuading that it will be suffered in silence. That is ok, but your Eminence, know that the patience, humility and meekness of man have a limit, and it is good that nobody

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>bene niuno se ne abusi. Prego per tanto V. E. a dirmi come mi abbia in questo a regolare, trattandosi ci cosa abbastanza chiara da non ammettere un nuovo <i>ius Canonicum</i>. In questo Monastero le Terziarie non sanno nè la lingua latina nè la Soriana, recitano le loro orazioni in lingua Malabarica, formano quindi un corpo sotto la mia giurisdizione, a questo Monastero è pure unita la fiorente scuola esterna e l'orfanatrofio fatto con danaro a me dato da una Signora d'Italia a questo fine, cioè per salvare le zitelle dal Gentilesimo ed educarle, e già molte furono educate e maritate; ed ora ve ne esistono (56) cinquantasei, già battezzate. Inchinandomi, Firmato + Fr. Leonardo Mellano OCD Arcivescovo di Verapoli</p> | <p>abuses that. I request to your Eminence that to tell me how I should regulate this; one thing is clear more or less that no need of putting a new <i>ius Canonicum</i> (new canon). In this convent of the Third Order, they do not know either Latin or Syrian language. They recite their prayers in Malayalam; thus form a body under my jurisdiction; to this convent is united an external school and the orphanage which is built by the money given to me by an Italian Lady with the same intention; that is to save the children from the pagans and to educate them; and many have been already educated and married; and now exist 56, already baptized. Obediently, Signature + Fr. Leonardo Mellano OCD Archbishop of Verapoly</p> |
|--|--|

5.2.2.1.2. Main Arguments

The Archbishop makes claim for the jurisdiction of the convent at Koonammavu by citing the following arguments.

- The convent was founded by the four natives.
- By themselves founded the proper house in their own land.
- A little later it was rebuilt nearby the first one.
- Among the first two, Sr. Thresia due to her capacity was re-elected many times as superior.

- Msgr. Baccinelli and Msgr. Mellano received girls of Syrian Rite to give them the possibility to lead consecrated life.
- Msgr. Lavigne the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam sent letter to the superior and thus asked some sisters to depart to some other places without informing Msgr. Mellano.
- The orphanage run by the sisters is built by the money given to Msgr. Mellano by an Italian Lady with the same intention.

5.2.2.1.3. Comments

As both *CMM* and *CKC* make it very clear, there were only three Latin sisters on the first day.⁶ On the second day, a Syrian candidate was admitted in the community by the Provincial Delegate Fr. Leopold. Nowhere it is stated that the convent was meant for the women who belong to the Latin Rite. The statement that the so-called 4 natives themselves founded the proper house is historically wrong. It was constructed by the efforts of Fr. Chavara and Fr. Leopold.⁷ Also, the words of Msgr. Mellano that the new convent was rebuilt nearby the first one are very confusing and illogical. Actually, the new convent was not nearby but away from the *panambumadam*.⁸

Regarding the statement that ‘among the first two (Latin sisters), Sr. Thresia, due to her capacity was re-elected many times (*più volte*)’, *CKC* makes it clear that only three

⁶Perhaps Archbishop Mellano may be including the servant as the fourth member of the convent.

⁷cf. *CMM* II, 72-75 [124-126]; *WFF*, Chapter II, N0. 2.1.3. ‘Construction of *Panambumadam*.’

⁸cf. *CKC* I, 6, 44; *CMM* II, 84-85 [132]; *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4. ‘The Construction Process.’

times she was elected, not many times.⁹ The comparison with mother Eliswa (among the first two, Sr. Thresia due to her capacity was re-elected many times) is also noteworthy.

Concerning the accusation that Msgr. Lavigne communicated with the sisters without Msgr. Mellano's permission, *CKC* II, 138-139 thus states: "In the month of June 1888, the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam, bishop Charles Levigne with the permission of the very Rev. Apostolic Delegate sent an order asking Sr. Clara of Holy Mary who belongs to that Vicariate to go to Mutholy without delay, taking another sister along with her in order to open a convent in Mutholy in that Vicariate."¹⁰ Thus Msgr. Mellano seems to give a twist to the facts.

It is noteworthy that Msgr. Mellano seems to take a threatening tone in his letter. ("Your Eminence should know that patience, humility and meekness of a person have a limit and it is good that nobody abuses that").

5.2.2.2. Letter of Msgr. Medlycott dated 27th January 1889

This letter was written to refute the arguments brought forward by Msgr. Mellano in his letter to the Cardinal Prefect.

5.2.2.2.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| Eccellenza Revma, Ecco quanto mi occorre osservare sulla lettera, che Monsig. Arcivescovo di | V. Rev. Excellency, When I rush to observe the letter that Msgr. Archbishop of Verapoly wrote to the |

⁹See *WFF*, Chapter IV, No. 4.3.3. 'Persons Held Positions Repeatedly.'

¹⁰For details see, *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.5.4. 'Role of Sr. Clara.'

Verapoli scrisse all' Emo Sig. Card. Prefetto il 24 Novembre 1888,

1. Monsig. Arcivescovo si limita ad osservare che il convento in questione fu fondato da quattro native di rito latino nella loro propria casa e che le medesime cedettero il terreno colla casa; ma poi aggiunge: "dopo fu riedificato nella vicinanza di questo primo come luogo più conveniente. Nella supplica dei Soriani distinta colla lettera F. mandata da me a V.E. col mio N. 34 del 13 Settembre 1888 si riferisce come il presente monastero fu fabbricato dal Priore Soriano del Convento di Cunemao con denaro raccolto dalle Chiese e dalle congregazioni Soriane, e sopra un terreno che apparteneva ai Religiosi Soriani. È ben chiaro che questi non avrebbero mai fatto ciò per un convento di rito latino. Inoltre quanto Monsig. Mellano espone non si riferisce al presente Monastero, ma allo stato delle cose, che precedette al tempo cioè in cui una piccola casa serviva di ricovero a quelle poche donne, che desideravano di abbracciare la vita religiosa.

2. Monsig. Arcivescovo non adduce argomento alcuno. Quel che dice, circa una dell' Signora

Cardinal Prefect on 24th November 1888.¹¹

1. Msgr. Archbishop limits himself observing that the convent in question was founded by 4 native Latins in their own house and in their own land. Then he adds: "after it was re-built nearby the first one as a more convenient place." In the letter I sent to your Eminence with my N. 34 of 13th September 1888 which was written by the request of distinguished Syrians, it is referred how the present convent was fabricated by the Syrian Prior of the monastery at Koonammavu with the money collected from Syrian churches and people and built on a land that belonged to the Syrian men religious. It is very clear that they have never done it for a convent in Latin Rite. Again, when Msgr. Mellano exposes, he never spoke of the present convent, but the state of the things, happened before, that is, a small house which was served for few women who desired to embrace religious life.

2. Msgr. Archbishop does not add any other argument. What he says about an Italian lady of her help to start an orphanage for women and

¹¹ In the *Ponenza* only the letter of 28th November is quoted, not that of 24th November.

italiana, che l'aiutò ad aprire un orfanotrofio per donne, che poi volle fosse convento, mostra solamente, che per ragioni generali di educazione egli ricevette l'aiuto, di cui parla. L'orfanotrofio va col convento a cui unito.

3. Col mio N. 39 del 20 Settembre 1888, mandai a V. E. La copia di una circolare del P. Leopoldo alle Chiese Soriane, la quale mostra che il denaro per fabbricare il Monastero fu raccolto dalle Chiese Soriane col mezzo degli stessi Soriani.

4. La Signora Clark, sebbene fosse di rito latino diede tuttavia i suoi beni ai Terziari Carmelitani di Cunemao ed a mezzo di questi aiutò il Monastero delle Monache.

5. Nel Giugno scorso vi erano 27 Religiose in convento, delle quali 20 erano di rito Soriano e sole 7 di rito latino. Monsig. Arcivescovo a mezzo del P. Filippo, ricusò ultimante il permesso di entrare in convento a 12 ragazze dell'età di 15 anni, quasi tutte del mio Vicariato; ma si dice che poco fa ne abbia ammesse varie di rito latino.

6. La missione di Verapoli ha un nuovo convento di religiose in Ernakulam ed una fabbrica mostuosamente grande in Verapoli destinata per un convento ed un Catecumenato. Sarebbe quindi ragionevole che i Soriani dovessero esser lasciati

perhaps to the convent shows only that for general reason of education he has received the help that is mentioned there. The orphanage goes with the convent to which it is united.

3. With my N. 39 of 20th of September 1888, I had sent to your Eminence the copy of a circular letter of Fr. Leopold to the Syrian churches, in which it is showed that the money to fabricate the convent was collected from the Syrian churches by the Syrians themselves.

4. The Lady Clark, perhaps from the Latin Rite, has given above all, all her things to the Third Order Carmelites of Koonammavu and through these must have helped the women religious.

5. In last June, there were 27 religious in the convent, among which 20 were of the Syrian Rite and only 7 of the Latin Rite. Msgr. Archbishop through Fr. Philip, closed the permission to enter the convent to 12 girls of 15 years old, almost all of them from my Vicariate. But it was said that few were admitted from the Latin Rite.

6. Verapoly mission has a new convent of religious in Ernakulam and another large one is being constructed in Verapoly, destined for a convent and a catecumenate.

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>in possesso del Monastero, che essi stessi fabbricarono ed a cui essi diedero un preponderante numero di religiose e di sussidi. Con piena fiducia nell'equità dei reclami del mio Vicariato lascio la cosa nelle sue mani e mi rassegno, Suo sempre obbediente, [Sottoscritto] +Adolfo Medlycott, Vescovo Vicario Aposto. di Trichur.</p> | <p>Therefore, it is reasonable that the Syrians should be left with the possession of the convent which is built by them and in which they are majority. With full of trust in the equity of the reclaims of my vicariate, I leave the things in your hands and I remain, Yours always obedient, Undersigned +Adolf Medlycott Bp., Apostolic Vicar of Trichur.</p> |
|---|--|

5.2.2.2.2. Main Arguments

Msgr. Medlycott's arguments can be thus summarized:

- The new convent of the sisters at Koonammavu was built by the Syrian prior of the monastery at Koonammavu with the money collected from the Syrian churches and people. It was built on a land which belonged to the TOCD fathers. Msgr. Medlycott argues that the Syrian fathers would have never given their land if it were meant for a convent of Latin Rite.
- Since the orphanage is attached to the convent it cannot have a separate existence. Thus, one cannot claim that the Latin Vicariate of Verapoly enjoys the ownership of it.
- The convent was constructed by the Syrian prior of the monastery at Koonammavu with the money collected from Syrian churches and people and built on a land that belonged to the Syrian men religious.
- Msgr. Medlycott holds that Lady Clark had given all her earnings to the Third Order Carmelites of Koonammavu (namely TOCD fathers).

- In last June (1888), there were 27 religious in the convent, among which 20 were of the Syrian Rite and only 7 of the Latin Rite. Msgr. Mellano through Fr. Philip, closed the permission to enter the convent to 12 girls of 15 years old, almost all of them from the Vicariate of Trichur. But it was said that few were admitted from the Latin Rite.
- The Verapoly mission has a new convent of religious in Ernakulam and another large one is being built in Verapoly, destined for a convent and a catechumenate. Therefore, it is reasonable that the Syrians should be left with the possession of the convent which is built by them and in which they are majority.

5.2.2.2.3. Comments

- The argument of Msgr. Medlycott is valid (as far as the money and property of the new convent; but it is not wholly correct the assertion that Fr. Chavara built it) as we have stated in our above mentioned response to Msgr. Mellano's letter.¹² However, it is wrong to assume that the convent was built only for the girls who belong to the Syrian Rite. At that time, neither Fr. Leopold nor Fr. Chavara nor his confreres were nourishing such an idea. The Rite differences did not come to their mind at all. Thus, we cannot support the positions of Msgr. Mellano and Msgr. Medlycott.

¹²Sr. Sucey has devoted 4 pages (*SGME*, 345-348) to refute the position of Msgr. Medlycott. The main argument is that Msgr. Medlycott did not know Malayalam and had blindly depended upon Syrian priests and sisters. Sr. Sucey has only Bro. Leopold to prove the falsity of the Syrian claims (*SGME*, 342), the veracity of whose opinions we had very often questioned in our *AUSW*, pages, 61-64. As it is clear from our comments that we do not subscribe to every argument put forward by Msgr. Medlycott.

- Msgr. Medlycott's argument on the financial help which Archbishop Mellano had received from an Italian lady, for building the orphanage can be canonically upheld.
- The argument that the convent was built by the Syrian prior is only partially true. Along with Fr. Chavara, Fr. Leopold also was fully involved in the construction of the new convent. So too as we have given above in a table form the list of churches, which financially contributed for the construction of the new convent, there appears the names of not only Syrian but Latin churches also.¹³
- This is not strictly correct. The lady Clark had given her possessions to Fr. Leopold and not to the TOCD fathers.¹⁴
- The statement about the number of religious in the convent at Koonammavu in June 1888 seems to be correct.¹⁵ However, we could not find any historical documents to prove that Archbishop Mellano denied permission to 12 girls of Syrian Rite to enter the convent even while he admitted girls from the Latin Rite. The fact that 6 months after the division on 24th November 1890, 23 girls were received as candidates¹⁶ may be interpreted thus: the entrance of such a big number of girls may hint that they could not do so during the previous years. Of course, this is a remote possibility.

¹³See for example, *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.2.2. 'Donations from Parishes.'

¹⁴Cf. *CKC* I, 115-116; *CKC* II, 61-62.

¹⁵See *WFF*, Chapter IV, No. 4.4. 'Details of Members from 1866 to 1890.'

¹⁶cf. *CKC* II, 146.

- Msgr. Medlycott thus argues in favour of giving the Koonammavu convent for the sisters belonging to Syrian Rite: the Latin sisters had a convent in Ernakulam and a bigger one is being built in Verapoly. The statement about the convent in Ernakulam has to be correctly understood. It belonged to a different religious community in Latin Rite. Hence, it was not the property of TOCD Latin sisters. The convent at Verapoly was not yet fully constructed at that time.

5.2.2.3. Petitions by Some of the Syrians

This is a petition sent by some representatives of Syrian community to Msgr. Andrea Aiuti.¹⁷ In the petition, first they make reference to the convent turned seminary at Puthenpally and then claim the convent in favour of the Syrians by pointing out different reasons.

5.2.2.3.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>Eccellenza Rma, In questo rispettoso foglio i sottoscritti, rappresentanti della Comunità Siro-Malabarica, osservano: Che dal documento qui annesso si rileva evidentemente come il Seminario di Puttempally fosse cominciato a fabbricarsi coll'idea, che dovesse servire da Monastero di donne del rito Soriane, come poi fosse invece convertito in Seminario, come il circuito, dentro il quale esso ora si trova, fu nella massima parte circondato di muro, rimanendo solo aperto</p> | <p>Very Reverend Excellency, In this respectful note the undersigned representatives of the Syro-Malabar community observe: That the below attached document reveals evidently how the seminary at Puthenpally had started to be constructed with the idea that it must serve as a convent for the women of the Syrian Rite and then how it in between changed as seminary; as the surroundings, in which it is seen now, covered fully by</p> |

¹⁷Although no date is mentioned in the document, it is most probable to hold that it was sent before.

in prosimità dell'attuale Seminario. Da tutto ciò i medesimi sotto scritti tirano la conseguenza che quel Monastero appartiene alla comunità Siro-Malabarica.

Essi la ragionano così:

1. Quel Monastero fu fondato dal Priore Generali dei conventi Soriani. Ora siccome egli era Soriano e siccome non v'era fino allora alcun Monastero per le Soriane, se il medesimo fabbricò un monastero non dovette certo intendere di fabbricarlo per il rito latino.

2. Il Monastero fu edificato in un terreno appartenente al convento di Cunemao. Dal che si vede chiaramente, che quel Monastero dovette esser destinato per le Monache della Comunità Soriana, di cui erano membri i religiosi di quel convento.

3. Il denaro raccolto per fabbricare tal Monastero provenne dalle Chiese Soriane e da offerte della Comunità Soriana, come lo mostrano le nostre memorie ed in particolare la celebre lettera del P. Leopoldo.

4. Dal tempo della fondazione di quel convento fino ad ora solamente Sacerdoti Soriani dissero Messa, ascoltarono le Confessioni e compierono altri officii spirituali nella Cappella del medesimo.

Dopo di che preghiamo che vengano respinti i reclami

walls, remained opened only recently of the actual seminary. All that are written down point to the fact that the convent belongs to the Syro-Malabar community.

Thus it can be argued:

1. That convent was founded by the Prior General of the Syrian monasteries. Since he was a Syrian and there was no other convent for the Syrians at that time, he never would have thought of building it for the Latin Rite.

2. The convent was built on a land belonged to the monastery at Koonammavu. From that it can be seen that the convent might be destined for the nuns of the Syrian community, in which they were religious members.

3. The money collected to construct that convent comes from Syrian churches and from the offerings of Syrian community, as it is shown both from our recollection and particularly in the letter of Fr. Leopold.

4. From the time of the construction of that convent till this time, only Syrian priests celebrated Holy Mass, heard the confessions and fulfilled other spiritual offices in the chapel of the convent.

With all these, we request your very Excellency to reject the constant re-claims put

| | |
|--|--|
| avanzati in proposito dai Latini. E coi sensi di profondo rispetto ci rassegniamo. Sembre obbedienti Servi, (Sottoscritti) Parayil Avira Kalliothoo | forward by the Latins. And with a sense of profound respect we remain, Always obedient servants, (Undersigned) Parayil Avira Kalliothoo |
|--|--|

5.2.2.3.2. Main Arguments

The Syrian representatives bring forward arguments that the convents at Puthenpally (which was not realized) and at Koonammavu, in favour of the Syrians.

- Construction at Puthenpally was meant for a Syrian convent.
- The convent at Koonammavu was founded by the Prior General of the Syrian monastery.
- Convent was built in a land belonged to the monastery at Koonammavu. Therefore, it must have been constructed for the Syrian sisters.
- Money was collected from the Syrian churches and communities as it is shown in the Letter of Fr. Leopold; it is also our recollection.
- From the time of construction until now only Syrian priests had performed spiritual ministries such as hearing confession, celebrating Holy Mass etc.

5.2.2.3.3. Comments

- The statement that the construction of the convent at Puthenpally was meant only for Syrians does not seem to be fully true; because, the convent was situated within the boundary of Verapoly Vicariate which had both the Latin and Syrian Catholics and was headed by the Latin hierarch. Hence, it is practically difficult to hold that the convent was only for the Syrian girls.

However, we should not forget another fact: Puthenpally parish belongs to the Syrian members. Also the land which was allotted for the construction belonged to that Syrian parish. Hence one cannot *a priori* exclude the possibility that the convent was meant for the Syrian members. The initiative of the Prior General of the Syrians in the construction of the convent at Puthenpally cannot be set aside. The words of Fr. Chavara in the first pages of the Chronicles of Koonammavu convent are proofs for it.¹⁸

- The argument that the Koonammavu convent was found by the Prior General of the Syrian monastery is only partially true. Both Fr. Leopold an Italian missionary who belonged to Latin Rite and Fr. Chavara the Syrian Prior General of the TOCD Congregation for men were fully involved in the construction of the convent.
- The third argument about the ownership of the land is correct. However it is wrong to argue that because of such ownership the convent was constructed only for the Syrian sisters.
- Concerning the alms collected for the construction we have already studied the original documents which indicated that the major part (hence not the total amount) of the contribution came from the Syrian parishes.¹⁹
- Concerning the liturgical celebrations of the convent, one cannot argue that they were conducted only by the Syrian fathers.

¹⁸ *CKC I*, 1-2. See for further details *WFF*, Chapter I, No. 1.1.1.3. 'Failed Attempts.'

¹⁹ See *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.2.2. 'Donations from Parishes.'

5.2.2.3.4. Annexed Document to the Petition

This document was annexed to the above mentioned petition by some of the Syrians on the affairs concerned to the seminary of Puthenpally.

5.2.2.3.4.1. Original Document

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>Gli umili supplicanti qui sottoscritti e rappresentanti dell'intera Comunità Siro-Malabarica, espongono quanto appresso sull'affare del Seminario di Puttenpally, cioè che i fatti seguenti provano chiaramente come il medesimo appartenga esclusivamente alla comunità Soriana.</p> <p>1. Il primo Istituto ivi fondato fu un monastero per donne appartenenti alla comunità Soriana. Siffatto Istituto è conosciuto anche oggi sotto il nome di Monastero di Puttenpally.</p> <p>2. Qualificando Verapoli quest'Istituto per un Seminario, ne reclama la pertinenza a favore della Comunità Latina.</p> <p>3. Dal luogo stesso, ov'esso è situato, e dalla sua Architettura si rileva chiaramente che i reclami di Verapoli sono infondati.</p> <p>4. Quanto qui la gente fabbrica edifici duraturi, li posa generalmente su terreni, sui quali essa ha diritto di proprietà. Ora il Seminario in questione è posto molto vicino al Puthenpally Soriano e sopra un territorio, la cui proprietà appartiene alla Chiesa di Puthenpally.</p> | <p>The undersigned humble servants and representatives of the entire Syro-Malabar community expose the following concerning the affairs on the Seminary at Puthenpally. That is:</p> <p>The following facts prove clearly that the seminary belongs exclusively to the Syrian Community.</p> <p>1. The first convent which was built for women belongs to Syrian community. Even today that institute is known under the name convent at Puthenpally.</p> <p>2. Like the institute at Verapoly, this seminary at Puthenpally cannot be claimed in favour of the Latin community.</p> <p>3. Both, the place of its situation and its architecture show that the claims of Verapoly have no foundation.</p> <p>4. Here when people build the strong edifice, usually they build it on their own property. The seminary in question lies near to the Syrian church at Puthenpally.</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>5. Se il medesimo fosse stato destinato ad uso del rito Latino, i Latini avrebbero potuto trovare ancora un luogo conveniente. Tutti gli edifici intesi ad uso dei Latini sono stati fabbricati ed esistono in luoghi, che sono di loro proprietà.</p> <p>6. Questo Seminario presenta un locale adattato ad albergare 150 giovani. Ora i giovani Latini, che ivi hanno fatto i loro studi a spese della Missione, non hanno mai oltrepassato il numero di 30; e perciò si può senz'altro conchiudere che questo spazioso edificio non fu costruito pei Latini.</p> <p>7. Ma si potrebbe domandare come sia stato, che questo istituto, il quale originalmente non fu che un convento, venne poi ad esser convertito in Seminario.</p> <p>8. La risposta è facile. Esso fu fabbricato allo scopo di migliorare la condizione della Comunità Soriana e di promuoverne gl'interessi.</p> <p>9. Nell'intendimento di costruire un Monastero per donne la prima cosa. Che si fece fu quella di elevare alte mura, che circondano tutt'ora quell'edificio. Mentre si stava facendo ciò, avvenne che il Vescovo Rokos diventò scismatico e conseguentemente s'arrestarono i pagamenti delle sottoscrizioni, le quali erano state raccolte tra i Soriani nell'intendimento di portare ad effetto quell'edificio, e così fu abbandonata la fabbrica del Monastero per le donne.</p> <p>10. Rokos cessò poi di essere</p> | <p>and on a land which belongs to the church at Puthenpally.</p> <p>5. If it is meant for the Latins they might have been found out another convenient place. All their buildings are laying on their own properties.</p> <p>6. This seminary can accommodate 150 youngsters. The Latins who finished their studies here for the mission, are not more than 30. From that it is clear that this is not built for them.</p> <p>7. But you can question as stated before, that this institute was not originally a convent, how then it was converted into a Seminary.</p> <p>8. The response is easy. It is constructed to improve the situation of the Syrian community.</p> <p>9. The first intention was to construct a convent for women; the big wall around the building points to it. While doing it the bishop Roccas became schismatic and reached here and consequently church became under his influence. Thus abandoned the construction of the convent for women.</p> <p>10. Roccas was ceased to be schismatic and the churches became under the jurisdiction of Verapoly; then it is thought that the ignorance of the priests was</p> |
|---|--|

scismatico e le chiese divennero soggette alla giurisdizione di Verapoli; ed essendosi allora veduto che l'ignoranza del Clero era la causa dei frequenti scismi, si pensò che l'erezione di un Seminario, nel quale i giovani Ecclesiastici potessero entrare, fosse da preferirsi a quella di Monastero per le donne. In conseguenza di che si fissò di edificare tale istituto in un luogo, nel quale i Vescovi ed i Missionarii potessero facilmente esercitare ispezione senza negligerare i loro doveri principali; e si volle pure che tale edificio esistesse in un terreno di proprietà Soriana; e così avvenne che si scelse il posto, dove quell'istituto trovasi al presente.

11. Che questo Seminario fosse nella primitiva idea destinato ad un convento è facile dedurlo anche dalle spesse ed alte mura, l'altezza delle quali fu poi diminuita, quando cioè l'istituto fu convertito in un Seminario.

12. Dai conti i quali si trovano in mano di alcuni preti Soriani, ai quali era stato affidato l'ufficio di raccogliere denaro per questo edificio, si vede furono raccolte denaro per questo edificio, si vede furono raccolte circa 1000 Rp. Dalla Comunità Soriana oltre le tasse del 5% sulle entrate delle chiese, e la grande colletta fatta a mezzo del pugno di riso, che ciascuno dei membri delle varie famiglie dovea mettere a parte.

the main cause for the frequent schisms. Therefore more than a convent, the erection of a seminary in which the young ones can enter is preferable. In consequence, they decided to build the institute in a place in which the bishops and the missionaries can easily do the inspection without any negligence; and this edifice exists on a property belonging to the Syrian community; and thus they have selected the place where the institute is existing now.

11. The first idea to build a convent for women can be understood easily from the given space and big wall, the height of which was reduced later when it was converted to a seminary.

12. Among the accounts which can be seen in the hands of some of the Syrian priests, also seen the collection of the money for this building; it is seen that about Rs. 1000/- they have collected from the Syrian community above the 5% on the entrance of the church and the big collection was done through handful rice that has to be kept by each member in the families.

13. That the construction of the seminary near to

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>13. Che la costruzione del Seminario prossimamente a Puthenpally, ed in un luogo appartenente alla Chiesa di Puthenpally, e non in uno degli altri tanti luoghi appartenenti al rito latino, ed il fatto che dal suo principio fino al momento presente fu ivi educato solamente il Clero Soriano, come anche l'Architettura e la disposizione di tutto l'edificio sono altrettante prove convineenti, che il Seminario fu proprietà dei Soriani, e che essi soli, e non altri hanno il diritto di usarle e di goderlo.</p> <p>Preghiamo pertanto che i reclami dei Soriani al possesso di quel Seminario sieno attesi.</p> <p>Coi sensi di devozione e rispetto ci sottoscriviamo</p> <p>Di V. E. Revma</p> <p>Sottoscritti Umili Servi</p> <p>Parayil Avira</p> <p>Kaliethoo</p> <p>Seguono altre firme</p> | <p>Puthenpally and in a place belonging to the church at Puthenpally and not in one of the many places belonging to the Latin Rite and the fact that from the beginning till at the present moment only the Syrian priests were educated; and also how the architecture and the disposition of the whole building prove conveniently that the seminary was the property of the Syrians and only they, nobody else have the right to make use of them. We request you that the claims of Syrians at the possession of that seminary were expected.</p> <p>With the sense of devotion and respect to your Eminence we who are undersigned</p> <p>Parayil Avira, Kaliethoo</p> <p>Follows other signatures</p> |
|--|---|

5.2.2.3.4.2. Main Arguments

- Seminary at Puthenpally belongs to the Syrians since it is built in the land of the Syrian church at Puthenpally and situated near that church. If it were meant for the Latins they would have built the convent at another convenient place.
- The first intention of the land at Puthenpally was to build a convent. Due to the Roccas schism, it was postponed and later the convent was built at Koonammavu.

From these facts, it is clear that the convent was meant for the Syrians.

5.2.2.3.4.3. Comments

- As we have pointed out in our comments on the petition of the Syrians that it may not be fully correct to argue in favour of a convent exclusively for the Syrians on the ground that it was built in the land of the Syrian church at Puthenpally.
- On the argument based on Roccas schism: Archbishop Bernardine felt the necessity to give proper formation for the future priests and decided to convert the building as seminary. Since the schism affected the Syrian Church of Kerala, it is logical to conclude that the seminary was mainly meant for the Syrians. The change of intention of the building from convent to seminary for the formation of Syrian priests give the impression that the convent was primarily for the Syrians.

5.2.2.4. Letter of Sr. Catherine of Jesus the Superior of Koonammavu Convent dated 8th March, 1889

In the letter addressed to Msgr. Andrea Aiuti, Sr. Catherine, the superior of the convent at Koonammavu explains reasons for giving the convent to the Syrians.

5.2.2.4.1. Original Letter

| Latin Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| Cunemavi ex monasterio S. Theresiae 28th March 1889 | Koonammavu From the convent of St. Teresa 28 th March 1889 |
| Clementissime Pater, Humillima et indignissima infrascripta ancilla E. V. Magno cum dolore et trepidatione, nomine omnium sororum ritu | Most kind Father, Most humble and very unworthy undersigned maid servant to your Excellency, With great pain and trepidation |

syriaci, quae sunt in hoc monasterio, quae sequuntur humillime ad benignitatem E. V. Deferre desiderat.

Fama fertur, futurum ut, quemadmodum de conventu Cunemavi, ita etiam de hoc monasterio nostro, in favorem Latinorum iudicium proferatur.

Hoc etiam qui in nos auctoritatem habent prae se ferunt. Hic rumor quam maximo dolore et consternatione prostraverit, verbis explicare non possumus.

Nam aliud nuilum habemns a

.... Quapropter ex hac miseriarum valle gementes ac flentes omni solatio et praesidio destitutae filiae ad E. V. clamamus, Eia ergo elementissime Pater, benignas aures vestras ritus imbelles ancillae E. V. ad amplitudinem vestram deferunt; quibus clare patebit hoc monasterium ad ancillas vestras ritus Syriaci pertinere.

1. Hoc monasterium nostrum constructum est pecunia collecta ex ecclesiis et fidelibus ritus nostri Syriaci, cura et studio primi Prioris Generalis Carmelitarum Tertiariorum. Ex Verapoli vel Latinis Illmo D. Archiepiscopo Verapolitano subiectis nulla pecunia impensa est.

2. Campus, in qua situm est monasterium et alii intra septa monasterii, prius pertinebat ad

in the name of all the sisters of the Syrian Rite, who are in this convent, who submit very humbly the benignity of your Excellency.

There is a rumour, it may happen, that a judgment will be brought forward in favour of Latins, just as it happened to the monastery of Koonammavu, so even about this convent of ours.

Those who are in authority over us make no secret of it. We cannot set forth in detail in words with how much pain and consternation this rumour has brought us the ground.

For instance, we have no (way) out from...Therefore from this valley of miseries sighing and weeping, being deprived of all solace and protection, we your weak maid servants of Syrian Rite beseech your grandeur.

1. This our convent was constructed by the money collected from churches and the faithful of our Syrian Rite and by the pains and zeal of the first Prior General of Carmelites of Third Order. From Verapoly or from Latin subjects even from the Archbishop of Verapoly no money was spent.

2. Compound in which the convent is situated and others inside the enclosure of the convent, previously had belonged to our fathers of Koonammavu monastery, afterwards by the money of

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>Patres nostros conventus Cunemavi; deinde pecunia patrimoniorum sororum ritus Syriaci monasterio acquisitum. Hoc ex libro patrimoniorum clarissime patet;</p> <p>3. Praeterea una vidua item ritus syriaci, oriunda ex paroecia Edapelly adhuc vivens in viciniis huius monasterii, relicta patria huc venit et Rs. 2250 fundatas in campis et agris reliquit monasteria cum hac conditione, ut quousque ipsa viveret, fructus ipsa perciperet.</p> <p>4. Sorores ritus Syriaci in hoc monasterio sunt decem et novem (19) Puellae educandae ritus item Syriaci viginti et septem (27). Sorores vero ritus Latini tantummodo septem, puella eisdem ritus una.</p> <p>5. Patrimonia sororum Syrianarum incluso etiam dictae viduae Rs. 13540 as 6 P. 2788.</p> <p>6. Pro sororibus Latinis alia duo sunt monasteria: unum Verapoli prope ecclesiam cathedralem impensis missionis aedificatum; quod nunc catechumenatum appellare malunt. At in principio et progressu constructionis proprie monasterium appellabatur, licet catechumenatus pro foeminis missionis adiectus sit. Insuper omnibus notum est unam ex</p> | <p>patrimony of the sisters of Syrian Rite was acquired. This is very clearly evident from the book of patrimonies.</p> <p>3. Besides, one widow also of the Syrian Rite, originally from the parish of Edapally, even now living in the vicinity of the convent, leaving the native place came here and left behind with the convent Rs. 2250/- funded on plains and fields with this condition that as long as she lived she would take the income.</p> <p>4. Sisters of the Syrian Rite in this convent are nineteen (19), girls undergoing education likewise of the Syrians twenty seven (27). But the sisters of the Latin Rite only seven (7). Girls of the same Rite only one.</p> <p>5. Patrimony of the Syrian sisters including also of the aforesaid widow is Rs. 13540/- as 6. p. 8. Patrimony of the Latins is Rs. 2788/-.</p> <p>6. For Latin sisters there are two other convents one in Verapoly near the cathedral church built by the expenses of the Mission which now they prefer to call it catechumenate. But in the beginning and progress of the construction it was called convent although catechumenate for women of missions was added. Moreover, it is known to all that Fr. Philip had appointed one among us as</p> |
|---|---|

nobis priorissam eiusdem monasterii destinasse P. Philippum, priusquam constructio completa fuerit. Aliud monasterium extat in Ernaculam. Nos vero aliud non habemus praeter hoc unum, patrum nostrorum labore et sudore, et pecunia nostrae comunitatis aedificatum, Monasterium vero, quod est in Muttoli, non est sufficiens etiam pro his quae nunc sunt ibi.

7. Si vero uti fama fertur, Latinis concedatur hoc monasterium, autrelinquendum aut hic manendum foret nobis cum Latinis. Si primum, non habemus aliud, quo proficiscamur. Si vero secundum, nobis, quae actualiter sumus in hoc monasterio, multas angustias, innumeros dolores tolerandum erit. Imo nulla ex Syrianiis in posterum acceptabitur in hoc monasterium, nec erit quae vellet inter Latinas recipi. Ita hoc monasterium pecunia Syrianiorum aedificatum, et bona patrimoniis nostris empta, sine ulla utilitate nostrae nationis omnia in bonum Latinorum cedent.

8. Orphanotrophium adnexum monasterio non est pecunia Verapolitanorum aedificatum, sed omnino ex gratuita et spontanea elemosina cuiusdam matronae Italiae. Eius expressa

prioress of that convent before the construction was completed. Another convent still exists in Ernaculam. We do not have any other than this one built by the labour and perspiration of our fathers and by the money of our community. But the convent which is in Mutholy is not sufficient even for those who are now there.

7. If, perhaps as the rumour goes this convent shall be granted to the Latins either we have to leave or we have to remain with the Latins. If the first, we have no place where we shall set out. But if the second, we who are in this convent, have to suffer many anxieties and innumerable pains, nay rather no one from Syrians will be accepted afterwards in this convent and there will not be anyone who would be willing to be received among the Latins.

Thus this convent built by the money of Syrians and bought by our good patrimonies will be given in favour of the Latins without any utility of our nation.

8. Orphanage annexed to the convent was not built by the money of Verapoly but completely by the gratuitous and spontaneous help of a certain Italian lady. Her clear wish was as we have heard, that the aforesaid orphanage

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>voluntatem fuisse, audivimus, ut hic aedificetur dictum orphanotrophium. Insuper per nos congratulatorias litteras eidem matronae mittendas curavit R. P. Philippus Director noster.</p> <p>Si authographum donationis vel litteras de hac re a R. P. Gerardo missas, examinet E. V. cognoscere poterit, utrum missioni an monasterio hanc eleemosiana dederit. Quas quidem litteras nos non vidimus. At sine dubio reperientur in Verapoli.</p> <p>Dignetur ergo E. V. Benigne gemitus nostros exaudire et rationes nostras examinare, et nos a periculis et angustiis, quarum timore percellimur, eripere dignetur.</p> <p>Omnem spem et confidentiam in benignitate et elementia reponendo.</p> <p>Humillima et indigna ancilla et filia benedictione Pastorali ditari cupiens.</p> <p>Catherina a Iesu priorissa monasterii S. Theresiae Cunemavi</p> | <p>should be constructed here. Besides, Fr. Philip our director took care to send letters of congratulations to the lady.</p> <p>If, your Eminence, examines the autograph of donation or letters concerning this matter sent by Rev. Fr. Gerard, will be able to understand whether she had given it to the mission or to the convent. Indeed, we have not seen those letters. Yet without doubt, they will be found in Verapoly.</p> <p>Therefore, let your Excellency kindly consider it worthy to hear our groaning and examine our reasons and be kind enough to rescue us from the dangers and the difficulties by the fear of which we are overthrown.</p> <p>Putting all hope and confidence in your benignity and clemency, Most humble and unworthy handmaid and daughter craving to be enriched by your pastoral benediction.</p> <p>Catherine of Jesus Prioress of the convent of St. Theresa, Koonammavu</p> |
|--|---|

5.2.2.4.2. Main Arguments

This letter was written down as rumours of overtaking Koonammavu convent by the Latins were spread out. Sr. Catherine of Jesus, the superior of Koonammavu convent therefore was approaching Msgr. Andrea Aiuti, the Apostolic Delegate of India, with sighs and weeping, hoping that he would kindly listen to the petitions of the sisters and take

appropriate steps towards solving the critical situation. The main arguments adduced by her are the following:

- Convent was constructed by the money collected from churches and faithful of Syrian Rite and by the pains and zeal of the first Prior General of men TOCD.
- No money was spent by the Latins (neither by Verapoly nor by Latin subjects, nor by the Archbishop of Verapoly).
- The compound of the convent was the property of men TOCD. It was procured by the patrimony of the Syrian sisters. This is evident from the book of patrimonies.
- A widow from Edappally belonging to the Syrian Rite made donations worth Rs. 2250/-
- The strength of the Syrians both in the convent and in the *Educandath* are very numerous when compared to the number of Latin sisters and girls. So too, the patrimonies of the Syrian sisters (included the above said widow) are Rs. 13540/- while the patrimonies of the Latin sisters are only Rs. 2788/-
- The Latins are already having two convents but for the Syrians have only one in Mutholy. It is not sufficient for the inhabitants of that convent.
- If the convent were to be given to the Latins, the Syrians would have only two options, either to leave Koonammavu convent (They have no place to go) or to remain there in Koonammavu convent. If they remain with the Latins, no more Syrians will be admitted later and no Syrian girl will be joining in that community pertaining to the Latin sisters.
- The Latin Archdiocese of Verapoly cannot claim that the orphanage annexed to the convent was built by their

money. It was done by the donations of an Italian Lady with the precise instruction for constructing an orphanage.

5.2.2.4.3. Comments

- Concerning the alms for the construction of the convent see our comment in *WFF* Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.2. ‘Collecting Alms.’ See also our observation on the ownership of the convent in *WFF* Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.1. ‘Land of the New Convent.’
- On the number of Latin and Syrian sisters, see *WFF* Chapter 4, No. 4.4. “Details of Memembrs from 1866 to 1890.”
- On having two convents for the Latins see, *AUSW*, No. 2.1.5.2. ‘About the Two Latin Convents’ on pages 124-126.
- On the eventuality of entrusting the Koonammavu convent to the Latin sisters, the fear expressed by mother Catherine cannot be simply rejected.

5.2.2.5. Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 15th March 1889

In this letter addressed to Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti, Msgr. Mellano forwards the information which his Vicar General Fr. Philip collected from the sisters.

5.2.2.5.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| Eccellenza Revma, Conforme mi aveva chiesto V. Ecc., di darle cioè una relazione esatta circa il Monastero delle nostre Terziarie Carmelitane Scalze di Cunemao, per maggiore precisione, come trovasi ivi questi giorni per | Very Rev. Excellency, Your Excellency has asked me to give you an exact account about our convent of the Third Order of Disalced Carmelites of Koonammavu. Willing to give you very precise information, my Vicar General |

ordine di V. Ecc. Il mio Vicario Generale Padre Filippo, ho voluto che esso stesso e dalle Monache stesse e dai loro libri prendesse le precise notizie circa la fondazione di quel Monastero, e così essere più sicuro di quello che scrivo. Ecco pertanto ciò, che mi scrive il suddetto Padre.

1. Il P. Leopoldo, Missionario Apostolico, per ordine del mio predecessore Monsig. Bernardino di f.m. nell'anno 1866 avendo quattro postulanti Latine, cioè 1. Suor Elisabeth, 2. Suor Anna, 3. Suor Teresa, 4. Una Conversa pure latina fece fabbricare una casa nel palmaro della suora Elisabetta, e così fondò il Monastero di Cunemao.
2. Non tardò molto ad aggiungersi una Soriana, chiamata Suor Chiara, ora Superiora nel nuovo convento di Muttoli.
3. Nella detta casa, essendo Priora Suor Elisabetta sopra detta e tutt'ora vivente, vi abitarono per 15 mesi, e vivono col prodotto dei loro beni, ch'erano più di quattro mila Rupie, ed un soccorso mensile, che loro dava il mio predecessore Monsig. Bernardino.
4. La detta Suor Chiara Soriana non potè aver di dote che cento Rupie.
5. Il Padre Leopoldo frattanto fece fabbricare il presente Monastero con denaro

Fr. Philip himself has taken precise information about the foundation of that convent, from the sisters themselves and from their books and thus to be more sure of what I write. Here is what the above mentioned father wrote to me.

1. Fr. Leopold, the Apostolic Missionary, by the order of my predecessor Msgr. Bernardine in the year 1866 taking four Latin Postulants; that is 1. Sr. Elizabeth, 2. Sr. Anna, 3. Sr. Teresa, 4. a convert who is also Latin, constructed a house in palmaro of Sr. Elizabeth and thus founded the convent at Koonammavu.
2. Not much later added to them a Syrian called Sr. Clara, who is now the superior in the new convent of Mutholy.
3. In the said house, being prioress the above mentioned Sr. Elizabeth who is still alive, they lived for 15 months and lived with their own goods which worth of more than Rs. 4000/- and a monthly help which is given to them by my predecessor, Msgr. Bernardine.
4. The above mentioned Syrian Sr. Clara could not have patrimony even of Rs. 100/-
5. Meanwhile Fr. Leopold constructed the present convent with the money given

somministratogli da Monsig. Bernardino, e con elemosine, che ebbe da diverse parti. Si sa con certezza, che un latino chiamato Lazzaro in una sol volta ha dato trenta (lire) sterline in oro. Il luogo, dove questo Monastero fu fabbricato consisteva in tre piccoli palmari di Latini, cioè Vattaparambil Cacchi, Vattaparambil Cunha Varido nipote di Cacchi, ed un certo Cioladembil Cunhu Varido, nepote di Cachi, ed un certo Cioladeu, i quali a modicissimo prezzo li cedetero colla casa, che vi avevano, per tale oggetto.

6. La fabbrica del Monastero costò circa quattromila Rupie 4000, come consta dai libri dello stesso; ora però il tavolato e le ripe, così dette, che sostengono le tegole del tutto sono putride.

7. È pure da notarsi, che siano i Terziarii ed altri Soriani mai ebbero che fare con questo Monastero. Tutta la direzione ed amministrazione, per ordine di Monsig. Bernardino fu nelle mani del detto P. Leopoldo, dopo lui fu il mio Vicario Generale, e pel quale qualche tempo prima, circa due anni, ho dovuto supplicare la S. C. Per poter esso continuare ad essere confessore ordinario. Considerata poi la poca salute del detto P. Filippo, ed anche per dare maggior libertà alle monache per la confessione,

by Msgr. Bernardine and with the alms from different parts. It is known with surety that one from Latin Rite called Lazar once alone gave 30 (lire) sterling in gold. The place where this convent was fabricated consisted three small lands belonged to the Latins, that is Vattaparambil Cachi, Vattaparambil Kunju Varid, and a certain Cioladembil Kunju Varid, nephew of Cacchi and a certain Cioladeu, of which in moderate prize the small house which they had for the same purpose.

6. The construction of the convent cost about Rs. 4000/- as given in the account book...

7. It is also notable that the Tertiary as well as other Syrians never had anything to do with the convent. All the directions and administration of the convent at the order of Msgr. Bernardine, was in the hands of above said Fr. Leopold and after him, was my Vicar General and about two years ago, I asked the Sacred Congregation the permission to continue this and to make him the ordinary confessor. Then considering the health of Fr. Philip, and also to give more freedom to the sisters for confession, they were allowed to make their confession to one of the

permisi che si facesse aiutare a confessare da uno dei Religiosi Terziarii di Cunamao, e da quel tempo pure data lo spirito di disunione, che infelicemente si manifestò nello Monastero.

8. Essendo così e non sognando mai che vi potesse esser questione circa questo Monastero, unito a quello vi feci fabbricare il grande Orfanotrofio per le zitelle convertite, o comprate dal Gentilesimo, ed ultimamente per liberare una sala del Monastero feci fabbricare la scuola esterna all'entrata della clausura grande assai.

9. La popolazione intorno al monastero è tutta latina, e solo dista dal convento, dove abitano i Terziarii, al più cinque minuti. Devo pure fare osservare che vi sarebbe molto a temere per parte del popolo, se mai si venisse a prendere quel che determinazione in contrario, cioè che non posso sopporre.

Nell'offerirle i miei umili rispetti, con tutta la stima e venerazione mi rassengno

Di vostra Eccellenza Revma,
(Sottoscritto)

Umilissimo e Devotissimo
Servo

+Fr. Leonardo Mellano O.C. D.
Arch. di Verapoly.

Tertiary priests of Koonammavu and from that time onwards the spirit of disunity started to manifest in the convent.

8. Being so, I never thought that there could have any question regarding the convent united, started to build the big orphanage for the converted children or brought from the gentiles and ultimately to make free a hall of the convent, constructed an external school at the entrance of the cloister.

9. The population around the convent is all Latins and there is only little distance from the monastery; only 5 minutes to the place where lives the Tertiary. I must also observe that if you think of taking any determination in contrary, you must have a feeling of fear from the part of the people.

Offering my humble respect with all veneration I remain
Your very Rev. Excellency
Undersigned

Most humble and devotional
servant

+Fr. Leonardo Mellano
O.C.D.

Archbishop of Verapoly

5.2.2.5.2. Main Arguments

- By the order of Msgr. Bernardine, Fr. Leopold took 4 Latin postulants to the convent, established in the land of Sr. Elizabeth.
- Without much delay, a Syrian woman named Sr. Clara was received as a new postulant.
- They spent 15 months in the bamboo mat convent, meeting their daily needs from the goods brought by them (which amount to Rs. 4000/-) and from the monthly allowance of Archbishop Bernardine.
- Sr. Clara brought patrimony worth of less than Rs. 100/-
- The new convent was constructed by Fr. Leopold with the money paid by Msgr. Bernardine and the alms from different parts.
- The convent was constructed in three plots of Land of Vattaparambil Cachi, Vattaparambil Kunju Varid, and a certain Cioladembil Kunju Varid who belonged to Latin Rite.
- The total amount of the money spent for the construction was Rs. 4000/-
- The Men TOCD and other Syrians played no part in the affairs concerning the convent.
- Fr. Leopold and after him Fr. Philip were in charge of the sisters. Only when Fr. Philip became sick, one of the priests from Men TOCD was allowed to hear the confessions – a fact which paved the way for disunity in the convent.

5.2.2.5.3. Comments

- Msgr. Mellano tries to establish the Latin origin of the convent by basing on the information collected by his

Vicar General. This fact itself weakens his arguments, since by that time Latin-Syrian factor was creating disunity and division among the members of the convent. One may ask the question who were the providers of the data to Fr. Philip, Latins or Syrians? The positions of both these parties were then biased; hence, they cannot be taken as objective tools. As we have pointed out earlier, the so-called fourth Latin postulant was only a helper.²⁰

- The Archbishop seems to cleverly hide the date of the entrance of Sr. Clara. She joined the community on 14th February 1866 while the other three sisters started their life at *panambumadam* only on the previous day.
- Msgr. Mellano claims that the first members lived in the bamboo mat convent 15 months. However the exact period was 13 ½ months (From February 13th 1866 to March 27th 1867).

We have already refuted the claim that Sr. Eliswa and Sr. Anna brought things worth Rs. 4000/-²¹

- On the argument that Sr. Clara has brought patrimony of less than Rs. 100/- the following texts are worth citing.

²⁰See our 'comments' in this chapter No. 5.2.2.1.3. It is interesting to note the contradiction committed by Msgr. Mellano in his former letter dated 28th November 1888 and his present one dated 15th March 1889. In the former one, he claimed that four Latin natives 'founded' the convent at Koonammavu. Now he makes Fr. Leopold the 'founder'!

²¹Anyway Msgr. Mellano does not claim that mother Eliswa had brought Rs. 2000/- in cash as Bro. Leopold TOCD and Sr. Suci CTC claim. See *SGME*, 135.

- *CKC I*, 9: “She brought whatever was needed” (വെണ്ടുന്നതൊക്കയും കൊണ്ടുവന്നു).
- *Account Book* page 1: “The income by the patrimony of Sr. Clara Rs. 100/-”) സ. ക്ലാര വക പത്രമൊന്നി വരവു രൂപ 100).
- *CKC I*, 15: “On the day of her entrance (14th February 1866), Mooppachan thus demanded the sisters: the things brought by Sr. Clara must be used in common as belonging to the community” (സ. ക്ലാര കൊണ്ടുവന്ന വസ്തുക്കളും മറ്റും ആകമാനമായിട്ട് ഒന്നായിട്ട് പെരുമാറണമെന്നും...).

From these texts, it is clear that Sr. Clara brought Rs. 100/- by cash and whatever things needed. The advice given by Mooppachan refers to this fact.

- The statement that Fr. Leopold constructed the convent with the contribution of the Archbishop and with the collected alms is false. As we have already noted in *AUSW*, 122-123, *Alochanapusthakam* explicitly states that no contribution was made by Archbishop Bernardine for the construction. Regarding the alms given by certain Lazar, see our tables in *WFF* Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.2.2. ‘Donations from Parishes.’ Unfortunately, Msgr. Mellano connives the active and arduous part played by Fr. Chavara.²²
- On the claim that the convent was constructed in the three plots of land which belong to Vattaparambil Cachi, Vattaparambil Kunjuvarid, and a certain Cioladembil Kunjuvarid (all of them belong to Latin

²²See *AUSW*, No. 2.1.2.1. ‘Belittling the Role of Fr. Chavara’ pages 95-113 and *WFF* Chapter III No. 3.1. ‘The Inspiration and Rationale Behind the foundation.’

Rite), we do not have any documentary evidence to prove it, while *CMM* explicitly mentions that the land belongs to the Men TOCD.²³

- The claim that the total money spent for the construction of the convent was Rs. 4000/- is invalidated by the documents such as *Patrimony Sambandhicha Kanakkukal 1, CKC II, 143* which record that Rs. 8000/- was spent for the construction.
- Both the documents *CKC* and *CMM* record that men TOCD and other Syrians were actively involved in the affairs of the convent on its early period.²⁴
- Msgr. Mellano makes Fr. Leopold and Fr. Philip the only persons who were in charge of the sisters. Of course as canonical superiors these two fathers had to play a vital role in the affairs of the convent. This does not mean that Fr. Chavara did not have any important and essential part during the early stages of the community.²⁵ The hierarch of that time Msgr. Bernardine was honest to admit the role of Fr. Chavara. In his report to Rome dated 20th February 1867 he thus wrote: “They (sisters) are entrusted to the Missionary along with the Prior of the Tertiary.”²⁶

²³ cf. *CMM II*, 84 [132].

²⁴ See *AUSW*, 160-163.

²⁵ See *AUSW*, 98-101, *WFF*, Chapter III, No. 3.1. ‘Inspiration and the Rationale behind the Foundation’ and No. 3.4. ‘Fr. Chavara as the Formator.’

²⁶ *Relazione Del Vicariato Apostolico di Verapoli Redata li 20 Febbraro 1867, da Mons. Bernardino Baccinelli Archivescovo di Farsaglia e Vicario Apostolico di Verapoli in risposta al Questionario (1) inviatogli dalla Propaganda (Risposte ai Quesiti riguardanti lo stato della Cristianità di Rito Siro-Malabarico, esistente nel Vicariato Apostolico di Verapoli, nelle Indie Orientali, Question No. 71, p. 17-18).*

5.2.2.6. Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 2nd April 1889

Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti received a copy of the letter of Fr. Leopold written to the Syrian churches at Kaduthuruthi and Muttuchira asking alms for the construction of the convent at Koonammavu dated 1867.²⁷ Then he wrote to Msgr. Mellano asking his opinion regarding that letter. We give in original language the Archbishop's reply to that letter.

5.2.2.6.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>Manhamey 2 April 1889</p> <p>Eccellenza Revma, Come ho già significato a V. Eccellenza nella mia precedente, ho ricevuto la venerata lettera sua dei 21 Marzo, quando mi trovava in visita della chiesa di Saude, per cui mi fu impossibile subito rispondere, ciò che faccio colla presente:</p> <p>1. Per quanto abbia faticato per avere qualche notizia della lettera del P. Leopoldo, non mi venne fatto di averne alcuna, come pure pel passato mai ho udito una sola parola sopra l'esistenza di questa lettera, quindi non ho alcun fondamento per dare giudizio di essa, e molto meno della precisione della versione in Latino.</p> <p>2. Posto anche che sia vera detta lettera, non vedo ragione alcuna, che possa avere qualche peso nella questione di</p> | <p>Manjummel 2nd April 1889</p> <p>Very Rev. Excellency, As I have already indicated to your Excellency in my previous (letter), I have received your venerable letter dated 21st March when I was in my visit of the church of South and it was impossible for me to respond immediately; Now I reply to your letter.</p> <p>1. Even though I tried to get some information about the letter of Fr. Leopold, I did not succeed. In the past, I never heard a word about the existence of this letter. Therefore, I have no base to give any judgment of that and very less of its precise version in Latin.</p> <p>2. Supposing that the letter was true, I do not see any reason for giving any weight about the question of the convent, primarily because an</p> |

²⁷ For details of this letter see above FN. No. 4.

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>quel Monastero, e primieramente perchè un Superiore Ecclesiastico chiede ai suoi sudditi elemosine ed aiuti per le istituzioni che vuol fare, e mai si è udito, che quelli che danno qualche elemosina per tale oggetto, abbiamo poi a pretendere parte o tutto di quella Istituzione, anche dato che quelli, che concorrono siano di altro rito, a meno che detta Istituzione non sia in <i>limine fundationis</i> interamente consecrata ed addetta esclusivo a quel rito. Questo principio mi pare debba ammettersi come certissimo. Posto ciò la lettera del P. Leopoldo a nulla serve per la presente questione, anche dato che sia vera l'espressione della stessa, ciò che potrà meglio giudicarsi da quanto dirò più sotto. Secondo il principio posto ne segue necessariamente, che i conventi, specialmente quello di Mannanam, benchè fabricati con elemosine pure raccolte dai Padri Latini e Soriani, come tutto il Malabar conosce, non hanno mai pensato a chiedere parte di quello. Così per tutti gli altri, specialmente pel Carmelo, convento e Chiesa, Ambalacatto, Arnatucaré e Seminari, da Verapoli si è somministrato abbondantemente, e nulla si domanda.</p> <p>3. Come, e da chi è stato fondato il Monastero di Cunemao, già l'ho con</p> | <p>ecclesiastical superior could ask his subjects the alms and helps for the institutions that he wishes to erect. However it is never heard that those who had given alms for such a project could claim for a portion or whole ownership of that institution, even if they belong to a different Rite. Not least to say that such an institution may in its foundation entirely consecrated and given exclusively to that Rite. This principle, I think we must apply with certainty. That letter of Fr. Leopold serves nothing for the present question, also given that it may be the true expression of it which could be better judged in so far as I could say the following.</p> <p>Secondly the following principle can be applied: the monasteries specially that of Mannanam, although they were constructed with the alms collected by the Latin and Syrian fathers, as the whole Malabar knows it, had never thought to request a portion of it. Thus for all the others, specially of Carmel monastery and church, Ambazhakkattu, Aranattukara and Seminaries, from Verapoly it is administered abundantly, but demands nothing.</p> <p>3. How and by whom</p> |
|--|--|

precisione e purissima verità narrato nella mia precedente, ed a quella mi riferisco, ed è quella una prova evidente, che non ammette risposta; che siansi poscia ammesse anche delle giovani Soriane, non è che una cosa accidentale, che in nulla muta la natura primitiva dell'istituto, tanto più che non si servono che della lingua malabarica in tutto.

4. Il P. Leopoldo, come è noto a tutti, gettava proposizioni grandiloque ed esagerava assai, quando voleva ottenere il suo intento, e si sa, che incensava ugualmente i Latini, quando loro lo chiedeva. E come non sarà questa lettera un'esagerazione, quando tutti sanno che mandò persone per raccogliere denari dai Latini, e si sa pure che i Latini erano più generosi dei Soriani? Ed infatti dalle investigazioni in qualche modo fatte, consta che i Latini diedero più di Rupie mille (1000). Oltre le 30 Lire sterline date di un certo Larzaro, ne ho trovati varii altri, che diedero ciascuno 190 Rp e che tutt'ora vivono e possono attestarlo, oltre di tanto altri che diedero somme minori, e tutto questo prova la suddetta esagerazione.

5. Trovo pure nel libro dei conti del mio predecessore Monsignor Bernardino, queste precise parole "Al P. Leopoldo per Cunemao e Monastero date

the convent of Koonammavu is founded, I have already narrated in my previous letter with precise and pure truth and this I refer to myself and it is an evident proof which do not demand a reply; that they have then also put the young Syrians, it is not an accidental thing which in no way changes the primitive nature of the institute, especially since they do not serve, that the language of Malabar in everything.

Fr. Leopold, as is known to all, put down big big proposals and used to exaggerate things, when he wanted to get his intention, and as you know, that incensed equally the Latins also, when he asked them. And how will it not this letter also an exaggeration, when everyone knows that he sent persons to collect money from Latins, and as you know as well that the Latins were more generous than the Syrians? And indeed from investigations made in some way, consists that the Latins gave more than Rupees one thousand. And other 30 Lire sterling given by someone called Lazar, and I found several others that gave each Rs. 190/- and who still live and can attest, in addition to all others who gave smaller amounts and all this evidence the aforementioned exaggeration.

Rupie 500, ... etc. E nel'anno stesso della lettera del detto Padre, 1867 al convento delle nostre Terziarie in Cunemao Rupie 61, 12", e cosi di tante altre.

6. Nel libro dei conti di detto Monastero di Cunemao, scritto sotto l'ispirazione del P. Leopoldo, trovasi scritto cosi. "Questo Monastero costò Rupie 4500, elemosine dei fedeli in generale, tanto Latini che Soriani, non nominando però la somma ricevuta dal detto mio predecessore."

Dopo tutto questo, mi pare poter ripetere, che detta lettera del P. Leopoldo, che voleva denaro dalle due chiese ivi nominate, non è che un modo di dire suo proprio, ma privo di fondamento e che quindi a nulla può servire in un giudizio.

7. Penso poi non essere necessario far osservare all'Eccellenza Vostra, che non sono certamente quelle piu persone, che hanno date elemosine per questa pia istituzione, che la ridomandano e non potrebbero ridomandarla, perchè data elemosina è del Signore, ma sono unicamente alcuni dei Terzarii, che da anni non si occupano di altro, e sarebbe ormai tempo, che lasciassero di perturbare il Malabar, che già lo è bastantemente, ed attendessero alla loro vocazione.

4. I find also in the book of accounts of my predecessor Msgr. Bernardine, these precise words: "to Fr. Leopold for Koonammavu and monastery gave Rs. 500/- ... etc. And in the same year of the letter of the said father, 1867 to the convent of our Tertiary sisters in Koonammavu Rs. 61/-, 12/-", and so many other.

5. In the book of accounts of the said monastery of Koonammavu, under the inspiration of Fr. Leopold, written like this. "This monastery cost Rs. 4500/-, alms of the faithful in General, more Latins than Syrians, not mentioned the sum received by my predecessor."

6. After all this, I think that it can be repeated that the said letter of Fr. Leopold, which wanted money from the two churches mentioned there in, is it not a mode of saying his own, but unfounded and therefore anything can serve in a judgment.

7. I think then it is not necessary for observing to your Excellency that certainly those persons who have given alms for this pious institution can redemand it; they cannot redemand it because they have given it for the Lord. but only some of the Tertiary Fathers, who from years did not occupy

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Insomma, se da ciò può dedursi qualche diritto, è chiaro che sarebbe per le monache che vi hanno professato, di potervi abitare, ed io non ho mai avuto il pensiero di scacciarle, se vogliono continuare ad abitarvi in pace come prima e vivere santamente, se poi quelle, che sono di rito Soriano, non vogliono restarvi, possono andarsene, ma il Monastero deve rimanere alle Fondatrici, che sono sotto la mia giurisdizione senza che alcuno possa molestarle. Colgo questa occasione per rinnovare a V. Eccellenza i miei umili rispetti, mentre con tutta la venerazione ho l'onore di rassegnarmi di Vostra Eccellenza Revma (Sottoscritto) Umilissimo e Devotissimo Servo +Fr. Leonardo Mellano O. C. D. Arcivescovo di Verapoli.</p> | <p>themselves with anything else, but all times left to disrupt Malabar. In short, if this can be inferred from any law, it is clear that it would be for the nuns who have professed, to live, and I've never had the thought to drive them away if they want to continue to live in peace as earlier and live holy lives; and if those who are in Syrian Rite do not want to stay, they can go away, but the convent must remain to the foundresses who are under my jurisdiction without anyone can chase them away. I take this opportunity to renew to your V. Excellency my humble respects, while with all the veneration I hereby resign myself To your Rev. Excellency (subscribed) Humble and Most Devotional Servant + Fr. Leonardo Mellano OCD Archbishop of Verapoli.</p> |
|--|--|

5.2.2.6.2. Main Arguments

- Msgr. Mellano holds that he is not aware of the letter of Fr. Leopold regarding the money collected from Syrian churches for the construction of the convent. Since the letter is in Latin, he expresses doubt about its originality. Even if the letter were true, the fact that Syrian churches had contributed money for the construction of the new convent, it is not a valid reason for arguing that the convent was to be given to the Syrians. A hierarch could approach any member of his

diocese, whether they are Latins or Syrians for financial help.

- Syrian monastery at Mannanam and other monasteries of that time were also constructed by alms collected from both Latin and Syrian priests. However, none of them made claim for the ownership of the monastery.
- According to Msgr. Mellano the opinion of Fr. Leopold cannot be given much weight since he used to make exaggerated and puffed up statements in order to prove his position. Is not this letter an exaggeration since everyone knows that also Latins were approached for alms? Who knows perhaps the Latins would have given more than the Syrians? According to the investigations made by the Archbishop, he claims that the Latins gave more than Rs. 1000/-. A certain Lazar, had given 30 lire sterling. Also there were many who had contributed Rs. 190/- and many others a lesser amount.
- Msgr. Mellano cites from the account book of his predecessor Archbishop Bernardine. According to him, Msgr. Bernardine gave Rs. 500/- for Koonammavu monastery and to the convent at Koonammavu Rs. 61/- and 12 paise and many other amounts.
- According to Msgr. Mellano it is stated in the account book of the convent at Koonammavu that the cost of the convent Rs. 4500/- is given by the faithful both Latin and Syrian.
- Although the convent was built by the help of the faithful, they do not make demands for its ownership. Rather it is the TOCD men who raise such a question.
- If the Syrian sisters want to leave the convent, they can do it. But the foundresses who are under the jurisdiction

of Msgr. Mellano should have the ownership of the convent.

5.2.2.6.3. Comments

- Msgr. Mellano pretended that he was not aware of the Letter of Fr. Leopold. *CKC* I, 48 explicitly mentions that Fr. Leopold wrote a letter to the parishes of Kaduthuruthi and Muttuchira asking for alms for the new convent. We can surmise that Mooppachan had done it with the permission of Msgr. Bernardine, and even he might have given a copy of the letter to that hierarch. The fact being so how could Msgr. Mellano states that he had never heard a word about the existence of that letter, since in 1867 he was present in Verapoly. Msgr. Mellano is suspicious of the authenticity of the Latin version of the letter. We do not find any difficulty to hold that the letter which was originally written in Malayalam was sent to the Apostolic Delegate with its Latin translation, since he did not know Malayalam. We agree that a bishop is free to approach any member of his diocese whether Latin or Syrian for alms.²⁸
- Concerning the evaluation of Msgr. Mellano about the character of Fr. Leopold, we would prefer not to make any comments. But it is not a strong argument to conclude that the Latins would have given more money than the Syrians. So too, his claim that the Latins had contributed more than 1000 rupees and lesser amounts, cannot be proved from the documents.

²⁸Sr. Suzy in her dissertation seems to twist the truth, claiming that Fr. Leopold, who knew Malayalam language, wrote to above mentioned ordinary people in Latin (*SGME*, 364). The fact seems to be that Fr. Leopold wrote it to the people in Malayalam and later sent its Latin version to the Holy See.

Msgr. Mellano mentions the name of Lazar as a contributor to the new convent. Actually, it was not Lazar but his younger brother had contributed Rs. 300/- however not for the construction of the new convent but for the construction of the *panambumadam*.²⁹

- We do not find any relevance for citing from the account book of Msgr. Bernardine about the contributions for the TOCD men and women, since both were the members of his diocese.
- *CKC II*, 143 states that the convent cost Rs. 8000/- and not Rs. 4500/-³⁰
- It is wrong to hold that the Syrian faithful did not make claim for the ownership of the convent. See above the document sent by the Syrian faithful to the Apostolic Delegate.³¹
- Since most of the arguments of Msgr. Mellano do not have documentary evidence and contain fabricated versions, his conclusion that the Koonammavu convent should remain under the possession of the foundresses (?) cannot be held.

5.2.2.7. Letter of Msgr. Medlycott dated 12th April 1889

This letter of Msgr. Medlycott, dated 12th April 1889, addressed to the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti, adduces counter proofs to those of Msgr. Mellano. He presents four

²⁹ See, *CMM II*, 75 [12].

³⁰ As we have already stated above, Msgr. Mellano's use of the term monastery is very confusing. Sometimes he applies it to the men religious houses and sometimes to women religious houses.

³¹ *WFF*, Chapter V, No. 5.2.2.3. 'Petitions by Some of the Syrians.'

proofs for the claim of the convent in favour of the Syrians. We give below the original document.

5.2.2.7.1. Original Document

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>Trichur, li 12 Aprile 1889 Eccellenza Revma, Le accluse versioni di documenti presentano il rimanente delle prove in favore dei Soriani per quel che concerne il Monastero delle Religiose in Cunemao. Siffati documenti sono in numero di quatro. Il N. 1. Dimostra che i Terziari Soriani di Cunemao diedero alle primitive Religiose tre pezzi di terreno del valore di 22,948 puttens equivalenti a Rp. 1,195; che questi tre pezzi furono uniti in uno solo, e che vi fu fabbricato sopra il Monastero. Susseguentemente fu anche dato alle religiose un quarto pezzo di terreno, appartenente ai Terziarii, del valore di 2000 puttens. Le dotti recate dalle religiose ammontarono a 25000 puttens, ossia a 1,302 Rp. La quel somma fu pagata ai Terziarii, e cosi le religiose ebbero in propriet  quei terreni. Gli originali di questo documenti furono stesi dal Missionario P. Leopoldo dell'ordine</p> | <p>Trichur 12th April 1889 Very Rev. Excellency, The enclosed versions of the documents present the remaining proof concerning the convent of women religious in Koonammavu, in favour of the Syrians. In fact, the documents are four in number. No. 1 demonstrates that the Men TOCD of Koonammavu had given to the primitive women religious three pieces of land worth of 22,948 puthens³² which is equivalent to Rs. 1,195/-; these three pieces were put together as one and on that constructed the convent. Consecutively, a fourth piece of land belonged to men TOCD was also given to the women religious worth of 2000 puthens. The patrimonies of the sisters were that of 25000 puthens equal to Rs. 1302/-. That full amount was paid to the Tertiary Fathers and thus the sisters possessed those lands. The originals of these documents were same by that of the</p> |

³²A type of money coin which was circulated in former days in Kochi which belongs now to the Kerala state.

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>Carmelitano.</p> <p>Il N. 2. Parla delle somme di denaro, che la suora Anna di rito Latino portò seco. Essa cedette certi beni del valore nominale di 30,000 puttens, corrispondente a Rp. 1558, ma questi beni erano gravati di un debito di Rp. 712, e quindi la parte libera si riduceva a Rp. 846; questa somma fu accettata come dote sua e di sua sorella. Altre sei religiose di rito Latino portarono al Monastero come dote la somma complessiva di Rp. 1,942, che insieme a quella della religiosa Anna e sua sorella, forma un totale di Rp. 2788.</p> <p>Di contro a questo, lo stesso documento mostra come 18 religiose del rito Soriano portarono per loro al monastero una somma di doti corrispondente al valore di Rp, 11, 296 al che bisogna aggiungere una donazione di beni del valore di Rp. 2,250 fatta da una vedova di rito Soriano, la quale però ritiene per se una parte del fruttato della medesima vita durante. Il totale del valore dei beni dati dai Soriani ammonta a Rp. 13, 546 contro Rp. 2, 788 portate dalle religiose Latine.</p> <p>I Numeri 3 e 4 sono documenti comprovantile allegazioni del Numero 1.</p> <p>Dalle cose qui sopra esposte è chiaro:</p> | <p>missionary Fr. Leopold of Carmelite Order.</p> <p>No. 2 speaks of the total money that Sr. Anna of Latin Rite has brought. She had certain property worth normally of 30000 puthens, equivalent to Rs. 1558/-, but this property had a debt of Rs. 712/- and therefore the free part reduced to Rs. 846/-; this total amount was accepted as patrimony of her and of her sister (mother?). Other 6 religious of the Latin Rite brought to the convent as patrimony a sum total of Rs. 1,942/- which together with that of Sr. Anna and her sister (?) form a total of Rs. 2788/-.</p> <p>In contrary to it, the same document shows how 18 religious of the Syrian Rite brought for them to the convent a sum of patrimony corresponding to worth of Rs. 11, 296/- to which need to add a donation of property worth of Rs. 2,250/- made by a widow of Syrian Rite; but from which she had taken a part of the fruit during her life. The total value of the property given by the Syrians comes to Rs. 13,546/- against Rs. 2,788/- brought by the Latin religious.</p> <p>No. 3 and 4 are documents which give proof to the first document.</p> <p>From the things exposed</p> |
|---|---|

1. Che i religiosi Terziarii Soriani diedero terreni loro proprii per fondare un Monastero di religiose nella loro vienezza. Questa circostanza qui nel Malabar costituisce da per se sola un argomento ineluttabile a favore dei Soriani, poichè se il Convento fosse stato destinato ad appartenere a quei del rito Latino, i Terziarii Carmelitani non avrebbero così ceduto quei terreni. Non vi è dubbio poi che il valore dei terreni fu sborsato, ma di tal contingenza non si tenne conto sul principio sendo che le religiose a quel tempo furono occupanti dei medesimi solamente come affittuarie.

2. Che se prendiamo in considerazione gl'interessi dei due riti, troviamo che, mentre i Soriani portarono al Convento Rp. 13,546, i Latini in quella vece portarono solamente Rp. 2,788. Sembra quindi chiaro che secondo l'equità il Convento appartenga ai Soriani.

La questione da risolversi dopo ciò sarebbe quella di stabilire, se le religiose latine, che sopravvivono tutt'ora, quante volte volessero lasciare quel Monastero per recarsi in un altro, avrebbero, o no, il diritto di domandare indietro le loro doti, Io credo che elleno avrebbero questo diritto. Le

above, it is clear:

1. That the Syrian Tertiary religious had given their proper land for founding a convent for women religious in their vicinity. This circumstance here in Malabar constitutes by itself only an argument inevitably at the favour of the Syrians, perhaps if the convent would have been destined to belong to the Latin Rite, the Tertiary Carmelites would not have been given their lands. No need of having any doubt that the worth of the Land was paid out, but that did not take count on the principle that the women religious at that time were occupied the land only as rent.

2. If we take in consideration the interests of these two Rites, we can see that while the Syrians brought to the convent Rs. 13546/, whereas the Latins brought only Rs. 2788/-. Therefore, it seems clear that according to equity the convent belongs to the Syrians.

The question which has to be resolved after that of stability, if the Latin religious who live till now, when they wish to leave that convent to found another one, they can have or not the right to demand their patrimony; I believe that they have that right. The patrimony then of the Latin sister, who

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>doti poi delle Monache latine, che per avventura fossero morte, secondo le regole comuni dovrebbero esser considerate come proprietà del Convento.</p> <p>Dopo queste considerazioni lascio le cose nelle mani di V. E. Aspettando la decisione della S. Sede; e coi sensi di profondo rispetto ho l'onore di rassengarmi.</p> <p>Di V. E. Revma (Sottoscritto) +Adolfo Medlycott Vescovo Vic. Apostolico di Trichur.</p> | <p>had died, according to the common rule, must be considered as the property of the convent.</p> <p>After these considerations, I leave the matter in to the hands of your Excellency, expecting the decision of the Holy See and with profound respect I take the honour of resigning myself.</p> <p>of the very Rev. Excellency Undersigned Adolf Medlycott Bishop, Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.</p> |
|--|--|

5.2.2.7.2. Main Arguments

Msgr. Medlycott presents the following arguments in favour of giving Koonammavu convent to the Syrian sisters:

- The Men TOCD of Koonammavu had given to the women religious three pieces of land worth of 22,948 puthens which is equivalent to Rs. 1,195/-. The convent was constructed on this land. Later a fourth piece of land worth of 2000 puthens which belonged to Men TOCD was given to the convent. The sisters paid to the fathers 25000 puthens equal to Rs. 1302/- from their patrimonies.
- Sr. Anna of Latin Rite brought with her a property worth of 30000 puthens, equivalent to Rs. 1558/-; but this property had a debt of Rs. 712/- and hence practically the money which belonged to Sr. Anna was merely Rs. 846/-. This amount was accepted as patrimony for her and for her sister (?). Other 6 sisters of the Latin Rite brought as patrimony a sum total of

Rs. 1942/-, which together with that of Sr. Anna and her sister come Rs. 2788/-.

However, the same document states that 18 sisters of the Syrian Rite brought a sum of patrimony corresponding to worth of Rs. 11,296/-. We had to add to this the donation of property worth of Rs. 2250/- given by a widow of Syrian Rite although she took a part of the fruit of it during her lifetime. Thus, the total value of the property brought by the Syrians comes to Rs. 13,546/- against Rs. 2,788/- brought by the Latin sisters.

The third and fourth numbers draw the following conclusions from the above mentioned facts.

- The Men TOCD would not have given their land which was in the vicinity of Koonammavu monastery to the sisters if the convent would have been destined to belong to the Latin Rite.
- Taking into consideration the huge disparity between the amount brought by Syrian and Latin sisters (Syrians – Rs. 13546/-, Latins – Rs. 2788/-), the convent has to belong to the Syrians according to the principle of equity.
- If the Latin sisters wish to leave the convent at Koonammavu to found another one belonging to the Latin Rite they can demand back their patrimony. However, the patrimony of the deceased Latin sister [Sr. Anna] according to the common rule must be considered as the property of the convent.

5.2.2.7.3. Comments

Actually Msgr. Medlycott adduces only two proofs; the subsequent 3rd and 4th points are conclusions drawn from the first two arguments.

- Concerning the contribution of the land by Men TOCD, *CMM* II, 84 [132] states that only one piece of land was provided by the fathers. The other two pieces of Land which had belonged to other people were bought.³³ Thus, the argument of Msgr. Medlycott does not refer to the whole truth.
- We think that the cited amount of the patrimony of the sisters (both Latin and Syrian) are correct. The moral theologians hold that the principle of equity demands that benefits should be taken in proportion to the investment of the money. Now in the case of the Koonammavu convent the Latin sisters have invested an amount which was very less when compared to the patrimony brought by the Syrian sisters. Hence, the Syrian sisters have more right than the Latins.
- The position of Msgr. Medlycott that the Latin sisters who leave the Koonammavu convent have the right for their patrimony is commendable.

5.2.2.8. Letter of Fr. Emmanuel Nidhiry dated on 23rd August 1889

This letter of Fr. Emmanuel Nidhiry the Vicar General of Kottayam, was sent by Msgr. Charles Lavigne, the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam to the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide. At the end of the letter, the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam has subscribed to the facts adduced in the letter in good faith. We give below the original letter and then the main arguments and comments.³⁴

³³For details, see the original text with its translation in *WFF* Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.1. 'Land of the New Convent.'

³⁴ For making the arguments more clear, we have changed the way of arranging the numbers cited in the original letter.

5.2.2.8.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>Vicariato Apostolico di Cottayam sul Monastero delle Religiose in Cunemao</p> <p>La questione esistente attualmente tra i Latini ed i Soriani circa il Monastero delle Religiose in Cunemao avendo attirata l'attenzione del pubblico, riferirò gli argomenti recati in mezzo da ambedue le parti, nel modo che segue:</p> <p>1. Argomenti recati in mezzo dai Latini.</p> <p>1.1. Il Monastero fu fondato da Monache Latine;</p> <p>1.2. Fu edificato sopra un terreno, che è bene dotale d'una monaca Latina;</p> <p>1.3. Fu trattato ed amministrato fino a questo momento come istituzione Latina;</p> <p>1.4. Varie migliaia di Rupie vennero al medesimo a titolo di dote della suora Anna, la prima Religiosa latina;</p> <p>1.5. Sebbene le monache Latine in quel Monastero sommino fra tutte solamente a otto (8), le mededesime tuttavia portarono al Convento migliaia di Rupie, parte come dote, parte come denaro privato. Le religiose, che recarono seco di più furono Anna di S. Teresa, la suora Angela, la suora Beatrice e due donne chiamate Collenporampil Maria e Teresa, procuratrici.</p> | <p>Apostolic Vicariate of Kottayam on the convent of religious in Koonammavu</p> <p>The question actually exists among the Latins and the Syrians about the convent of women religious in Koonammavu has turned the attention of the public. I will refer the arguments put forward by both the parties in the following way:</p> <p>1. Arguments brought out by the Latins:</p> <p>1.1. The convent was founded by the Latin sisters;</p> <p>1.2. It was built on a land which is the patrimony of a Latin sister;</p> <p>1.3. It was considered and administered till this moment as Latin institute;</p> <p>1.4. Thousands of Rupees had come as the patrimony of Sr. Anna, the first Latin religious;</p> <p>1.5. The Latin sisters in that convent were only 8 but they have brought to the convent thousands of rupees as part of their patrimony and as part of private [pocket] money. The sisters who brought more money with them were Sr. Anna of St. Therese, Sr. Angela, Sr. Beatrice and the two women called Kollamparambil Maria and Teresa procuratress.</p> |

1.6. Una buona donazione per opera di un certo Missionario P. Gerardo venne fatta allo stesso monastero da una nobile signora Italiana, chiamata Marchesa Ambissola. Con quel denaro fu fabbricato un appartamento nel lato meridionale del monastero, e furono comprati alcuni beni. Siffatto appartamento e siffatti beni dovrebbero appartenere alle monache Latine, perchè esse erano del rito di cui erano pure la donatrice ed il Missionario, che ricevette quella donazione. Al che s'aggiunge che, se le monache non avessero avuto la persuasione che il monastero loro apparteneva, non avrebbero mai acconsentito che si fabbricasse quell'appartamento e si comprassero pel monastero quei beni col denaro di quella donazione, la quale apparteneva certamente a loro. Dai quali fatti s'inferisce, che dunque il monastero pure loro appartiene;

1.7. Il monastero essendo situato sopra un terreno comprato a nome del Missionario P. Leopoldo, il quale lo governò per qualche tempo, un Eccellenza Mons. Arcivescovo Mellano ha tutto il diritto di farne un monastero di rito Latino;

1.8. Che per conoscere a quale Rito quel monastero

1.6. A good donation by the effort of a certain missionary Fr. Gerard, has made by an Italian noble woman called Marchesa Ambissola. With that money was built an apartment in the southern side of the convent and were bought some properties. Both these the apartment and the properties must belong to the Latin sisters since the donor and the missionary who received that donation are from that Rite. To this one may add that if the sisters were not having the conviction that the convent was not belonging to them, they would have never been thought of constructing that apartment and bought for the convent that properties with the money of that donation which were certainly belonging to them. From these facts, they infer that, the convent is also belonging to them.

1.7. The convent being situated on a land bought in the name of the missionary Fr. Leopold, which he was administering for some time, Msgr. Mellano has all right of making it a convent of Latin Rite;

1.8. For knowing to which Rite that convent belongs, there is no other best way than that of seeing what is the

appartenga, non vi è altra via migliore di quella di vedere quale sia in proposito l'opinione di S. E. Mons. Arcivescovo, che ha governato le genti di ambedue i riti. Or bene l'opinione di S. E. è favorevole ai Latini.

1.9. S. E. Mons. Arcivescovo Mellano eresse primieramente il Monastero facendo una casa coperta di Bambù sul terreno, che è bene dotata d'una suora Latina, come sopra si è detto; e poi, quando il numero delle religiose crebbe per il concorso di postulanti di rito Soriano, S. E. ingrandì l'edificio e fece il presente monastero.

2. Argomenti recati in mezzo dai Soriani.

2.1. Il monastero in questione fu fondato dal Molto Rev. P. Elias Ceeryacos, primo priore Generale dei Terziarii Carmelitani; ed i suoi cooperatori in questo lavoro furono altri membri della stessa Congregazione;

2.2. Quel monastero fu edificato col denaro raccolto dalle Chiese Soriane, cioè tra il clero e popolo di questo rito, per opera dei suddetti Terziarii aiutati dai preti secolari, dietro richieste, sia verbali, sia in iscritto inviate a questi dallo stesso Priore Generale;

2.3. Quel monastero fu edificato su terreni, che erano

opinion proposed by the Archbishop who has governed the people of both the Rites. The opinion of his Excellency is in favour to the Latins:

1.9. His Excellency Msgr. Mellano erects primarily the convent being made a house covered of Bamboo on the Land, which is the patrimony of a Latin sister as said above and then when the number of the religious increased for the concur of postulants of Syrian Rite, his Excellency enlarged the building and made the present convent.

2. Arguments put forward by the Syrians:

2.1. The convent in question was founded by the most Rev. Fr. Kuriakose Elias, first Prior General of Tertiary Carmelites; and his cooperators in this work were other members of the same Congregation;

2.2. That convent was built with the money collected from the Syrian churches, of the clergy and people of this Rite, by the work of above mentioned Tertiaries who were helped by the secular priests according to the verbal and written request sent to them by the same Prior General;

2.3. That convent was built on lands, which were the patrimonial property of Rev. Fr. Jacob John Baptist and of

beni patrimoniali del Rev. P. Giacomo Giovanni Battista e di alcuni altri Religiosi Terziarii, sebbene per alto gli stessi più tardi sieno stati ceduti al monastero medesimo prendendone in cambio la dote di alcune delle Suore Soriane:

2.4. Le cose temporali di quel monastero furono in cura del P. Priore del convento di Cunemao.

Le seguenti considerazioni aprono la via a vedere quali sieno gli argomenti più fondati, se quelli dei Latini o invece quelli dei Soriani.

A.1. La lettera del P. Leopoldo Missionario Carmelitano, data del 13 Febbraio 1867, che insieme alla sua versione latina fu mandata a S. E. Mg. Delegato Apostolico il 18 Giugno 1888, mostra che il primo argomento dei Latini è assolutamente falso.

A.2. La lettera del sullodato Priore Generale Elia Ceeryacos del 9. Dicembre 1869 mandata a Mons. Delegato Apostolico, parimenti il 18 Giugno 1888 corrobora allo stesso modo l'affermazione dell'A. 1.

B. I nomi di Maucoothathil compounds, sui quali il monastero trovasi situato e gli altri, che si ammette sieno proprietà delle suore Latine, come anche le copie dei documenti ed i brani di conti mandati al Delegato

other religious Tertiaries, little later the money was handed over to them by using the patrimony of the Syrian sisters.

2.4. The temporal goods of that convent were in the management (care) of the Fr. Prior of the Koonammavu monastery.

[Then Fr. Nidhiry evaluates the arguments of both Latins and Syrians]. Following considerations open the way to see whose arguments are basic, whether that of Latins or of Syrians.

A.1. The letter of Fr. Leopold the Carmelite Missionary dated of 13th February 1867, together with its Latin version sent to His Excellency the Apostolic Delegate on 18th June 1888, shows that the first argument of the Latins is absolutely false.

A.2. The letter of above mentioned Prior General Kuriakose Elias of 9th December 1869 which was sent to the Apostolic Delegate on the same day 18th June 1888 corroborates in the same way the affirmation of A. 1.

B. The name of Maucoothahil compounds on which the convent is situated and the others, which they considered as the property of the Latin sisters, as the copies of the documents and the pages of the accounts sent to

Apostolico, come si è detto nei paragrafi A. 1, A. 2, mostreranno chiaramente che anche il secondo argomento dei latini è falso.

C. Se le confutazioni espote nei paragrafi A. 1, A. 2, e B hanno forza, cade anche da se il terzo argomento dei Latini, e si potrà benissimo applicare al medesimo il noto adagio: *quod gratis asseritur, gratis negatur*.

D.1. La suora Anna ebbe per sua dote 3 terreni e 65 misure e mezza di terreno per coltivazione di riso, i quali sebbene sieno cresciuti alquanto di valore dopo esser stati migliorati a spese del convento, tuttavia il loro valore reale, quando furono dati alle monache, era di sole 18, 067. Puthens pari a Rupie 888. Anna 4, e pais 6. La versione dei documenti D. 1 e D. 2, qui annessa proverà la verità di quest'osservazione. Questo fatto confuta pienamente il 4 Argomento dei Latini.

D.2. Come si vede nel Documento D. La somma sborsata dalla suora Anna all'ingresso nel convento suo, di sua madre, e di sua zia fu di Rupie 888. Anna 74 e 6 pais, dalla quale secondo il convento in quel documento il Monastero era obbligato a apagare, e di fatto pagò, un debito di R. 712. Predendole dalle doti delle monache Soriane; e

the Apostolic Delegate as it is said in the paragraphs A. 1 and 2 show clearly that also the second argument of the Latins is false.

C. If the refutation expressed in paragraphs A. 1, A. 2 and B have force, also fails by itself the third argument of the Latins and you could well apply to it the saying *quod gratis asseritur, gratis negatur* ('what is freely asserted is freely negated').

D.1. Sr. Anna had for her patrimony 3 lands and 65 & 1/2 measure of land for the cultivation of Rice (paddy field), the value of which were increased after it was improved by the money of the convent, above all their real worth when it was given to the sisters was of only 18, 067 puthens equal to Rs. 888/- Ana 4 and 6 paisa. The versions of the documents D. 1 and D. 2 which are annexed here would prove the genuineness of this observation. This fact refutes fully the 4th argument of the Latins.

D.2. As you see in the document D. the total amount paid by Sr. Anna at the entrance in the convent, as of her, of her mother and of her aunt was Rs. 888/-, Ana 74 and paisa 6 by which according to the document in the convent, the convent was obliged to pay

conseguentemente la somma reale, che rimase per dote di quelle tre suore latine, fu di sole R. 176. Anna 13, e Pais 6, le quali divise in tre parti danno per ciascuna R. 58 Anna 10 e Pais 8. Questa somma non era bastante neppure per una parte delle loro spese durante il Noviziato; e perciò quelle tre suore Latine non hanno dote alcuna nel monastero; ma invece sono mantenute coi frutti delle doti delle Religiose Soriane. Ciò può esser provato dalle annesse versioni dei documenti D. 1. E D. 2, gli originali dei quali sono tutt'ora in quel Convento, come anche dai libri dei conti dello stesso Monastero.

E.1. Il totale delle Religiose di rito Latino in quell'istituto è al presente di sole 6, delle quali suor Anna di S. Teresa portò R. 700, suor Angela R. 400, suor Beatrice R 600, suor Teresa R. 72, suor Collenparambil Maria R. 70 e suor Teresa la procuratrice R. 100, e così la somma totale portata da quelle 6 monache è di sole R. 1942 e l'interesse, che può ritrarsene al 6 per cento all'anno, è di R. 116 alcune Aune e pochi Pais, che diviso in 6 persone non dà che due R. per ciascuna al mese; somma, che diminuita delle spese le quali dovranno riscontrarsi per abiti e medicine, non lascerà certo

and indeed paid a debt of Rs. 712/-; taking from the patrimonies of the Syrian sisters; and consequently the real sum of the amount which put as the patrimony of those three Latin sisters was of only Rs. 176/-, Ana 13 and paisa 6. If it is divided into three parts, each can be given Rs. 58/-, Ana. 10 and paisa 8. Such an amount was not enough for a part of their expenses during the novitiate; and therefore that three Latin sisters do not have any patrimony in the convent; but they were sustained with the fruits of the patrimony of the Syrian sisters. This can be proved by the annexed version of the Document D. 1. and D. 2. the original of which are even now in that convent, and as also from the books of accounts of the same convent.

E.1. The total number of the sisters of the Latin Rite in that institute at present is only 6, of which Sr. Anna of St. Teresa brought Rs. 700/-, Sr. Angela Rs. 400/-, Sr. Beatrice Rs. 600/-, Sr. Teresa Rs. 72/- Sr. Kollamparambil Maria Rs. 70/- and Sr. Teresa the procuratress Rs. 100/- and thus the sum total brought by that 6 sisters is of only Rs. 1942/- and 6% interest can be taken at the year, it is of Rs. 116/- and some Ana and few paisa, that being divided into 6 persons

intatte le 2 R. al mese per ciascuna; e conseguentemente la massima parte di quel che le medesime mangiano sono il frutto delle doti delle monache Soriane. La prova della verità di questa asserzione è nei documenti e conti esistenti nel monastero. Questo paragrafo E. 1. Mostra chiaramente la falsità dei cinque argomenti dei Latini. E.2. Escludendo le due Converse, il numero delle latine è di sole 6 mentre il numero delle Soriane è di circa 25; e tutto quel che ora quel monastero possiede, eccettuatane la somma suddetta di 1942 Rupie, tutto appartiene a loro, (cioè alle Soriane).

F.1. Siccome i suddetti cinque argomenti dei Latini non sono stati sufficienti a provare che il monastero loro appartiene, che anzi i medesimi sono stati ribattuti e dimostrati falsi, così anche il 6^o loro argomento, che poggiando sopra quei cinque piloni forma un castello in aria dovrebbe anch'esso cadere. Oltre di che per la stessa ragione, la donazione data al detto monastero, l'appartamento fabbricato a spese dell'Ambissola ed i beni comprati col denaro proveniente da quella donazione dovrebbero anch'essi appartenere ai Soriani, il diritto dei quali su quel Monastero è stato

cannot give Rs. 2/- for each one per month; From it if reduces the expenses that met for habits and medicine, certainly will not leave Rs. 2/- monthly for each one and consequently the maximum part of that which they were having was the fruit of the patrimony of the Syrian sisters. The proof of the truth of this assertion is in the documents and accounts that exist in the monastery. This paragraph E. 1 shows clearly the falsity of the 5th argument of the Latins.

E.2. Excluding the 2 converted, the number of the Latins is of only 6 while the number of the Syrians is of around 25 and all that the convent possesses except the above said sum of Rs. 1942/- belong to them (that is to the Syrians).

F.1. As the above said 5 arguments of the Latins are not sufficient to prove that the convent belongs to them, the other arguments are also and can be shown as false; thus their 6th argument that basing on that 5 pylons (piers) form a castle in the air, that also must be fallen. Moreover, for the same reason, the donation given to the above said monastery, the apartment built at the expense of Ambisola and the property bought with money came from that

pienamente provato da quanto si è detto dal paragrafo A. al paragrafo F.

F.2. Se i differenti istituti dovessero seguire il rito di quelli che diedero elemosine e donativi, ne vorrebbe che i collegi dei Gesuiti in Calcutta, Bombay, Trichinapoli e Mangalore, che riceverebbero sottoscrizioni e donativi da Hindus, Parsis e Musulmani, dovrebbero seguire il rito e le cerimonie di questi. Siffatto principio essendo pericoloso ed assurdo in se stesso, si vede chiaramente la falsità del 6^o argomento dei Latini.

G.1. Il fatto che alcuni beni di quel monastero furono comprati a nome di uno dei Missionari Carmelitani, chiamato P. Leopoldo, non prova che siffatto monastero appartenga ai Latini. Anche altri beni, i quali erano stati egualmente comperati a nome di quel Missionario, si è poi provato, a mezzo di dichiarazioni scritte dello stesso Missionario ed altri documenti di valore, riconoscendo S. E. Mons. Delegato Apostolico ineluttabili le prove, che i medesimi appartengono al convento di Cunemao, ossia ai Religiosi Terziarii. S. E. Mons. Mellano, dopo molta resistenza, spinto finalmente dalla decisione del Delegato Apostolico, ammise con

donation would belong to the Syrians, on which right that convents being fully proved by what is said from paragraph A to F.

F.2. If the different institutes must follow the Rite of those who had given alms and donations, the colleges of the Jesuits in Calcutta, Bombay, Trichinappilly and Mangalore, which received sanctions and donations from Hindus, Parsis and Muslims, would follow the Rite and ceremonies of those. In fact, the principle being dangerous and absurd in it, you can see clearly the falsity of the 6th argument of the Latins.

G.1. The fact that some of the properties of that convent were bought in the name of one of the Carmelite missionary called Fr. Leopold, does not prove that the convent belongs to the Latins. Also other properties, which are equally purchased in the name of that Missionary, is then proved through written statements of the same Missionary and other valuable documents which are known to his Excellency the Apostolic Delegate, inevitably are proofs that they belong to the monastery of Koonammavu, that is to the Tertiary men. His Excellency Msgr. Mellano after much resistance, finally pushed by the decision of the Apostolic

documento registrato del 5. Maggio 1889, che i medesimi appartengono ai monaci Soriani.

G.2. Se il fatto d'averlo il P. Leopoldo comprati alcuni beni per quel Monastero, e d'averlo egli governato può fare Latina un'istituzione, si avrà pure che S. E. Mons. Lavigne col governare le Chiese del Vicariato Apostolico di Cottayam le cambierà tutte in rito Latino.

H. Mons. Arcivescovo Mellano costituendo il partito opposto, in questo caso l'assioma "Nemo iudex in causa propria" è a lui ben applicato in questa vertenza. Inoltre la testimonianza data da S. E. Mons. Mellano circa la Chiesa di Tevere, testimonianza che indusse la S. Sede a decidere che quella Chiesa era Latina, è stata poi provata falsa, per la susseguente mutazione di quel Decreto in un altro che dichiara invece come quella è una Chiesa Soriana. È facile credere che colui, il quale diede una testimonianza falsa contro i Soriani per una chiesa, la quale doveva passare sotto la giurisdizione del Vescovo di Coccino, con più ragione esporrà un'altra opinione inesatta come argomento contro di loro nel caso di quel Monastero, per il quale Sua Eccellenza ha finora

Delegate, who admit with the registered document of 5th May 1889, that the same belongs to the Syrian priests.

G.2. If the fact of having Fr. Leopold bought some properties for that convent and he governed it can make it a Latin institute, you can have also his Excellency Msgr. Lavigne with governing the Church of the Apostolic Vicariate of Kottayam can change it in to Latin Rite (7th argument G 1 & 2).

H. Msgr. Mellano constituting the opposite game in this case the axiom "*Nemo iudex in causa propria*" is well applicable to him in this verdict. Moreover, the testimony given by his Excellency Msgr. Mellano about the church of Thevere, the testimony that induced the Holy See to decide that, that church was Latin, later it being proved false, for the subsequent mutation of that Decree in another one that made clear that church as Syrian. It is easy to believe those who gives a false testimony against the Syrians for a church, which would have passed under the jurisdiction of bishop of Cochin, with more reasons express another inaccurate opinion as argument against of them in case of that monastery,

combattuto. Queste ragioni faranno cadere il castello, che i Latini avevano edificato all'aria sul loro 8^o argomento.

I.1. Sua Ecc. Mons. Mellano stesso ammetterà che fu consecrato il 17 Novembre 1868, e che fino a quell'epoca era stato un semplice Missionario, e talvolta Vicario di qualcheduna delle Chiese Latine, e che fino a tanto che non fu elevato all'Episcopato, mai ebbe alcuna soprintendenza di conventi o di monasteri. Questo fatto sarà confermato da un'inchiesta alle Bolle della sua Consacrazione. Il Madras Directory, il Travancor Almanac del 1868, e le cronache ed i conti del monastero in questione proveranno che questo fu fondato un anno e otto mesi prima della Consacrazione di S. Ecc. Com'è dunque che S. Ecc. Potè fondare il cosidetto monastero colle pareti di Bambu? Questa ragione proverà che il 9^o argomento dei Latini non ha base nessuna per poter reggersi in piedi.

I.2. Inoltre un'occhiata nella cronaca dello stesso monastero proverà chiaramente che le Regole furono date fin dal 19 Marzo 1867, e conseguentemente la favola dell'edificio con pareti di bambù sembra essere il prodotto di due idee, di quella

for which his Excellency has till now battled. These reasons would make fall the castle that the Latins had built in air on their 8th argument.

I.1. His Excellency Msgr. Mellano himself admits that he was consecrated on 17th November 1868, and who till that time was a simple missionary and sometimes vicar of some of the Latin churches and who till the time of his elevation to Episcopate, never had any interest on convents or monasteries. This fact will be confirmed by an investigation of the bull of his consecration. The Madras Directory, the Travancore Almanac of 1868 and the Chronicles and the accounts of the convent in question prove that this convent was found a year and 8 months before the consecration of his Excellency. How then could his Excellency found the above said convent with the bamboo mat? This reason will prove that the 9th argument of the Latins has no any base to hold on.

I.2. Moreover, a look in the Chronicle of the same convent proves clearly that the rules were given right from 19th March 1867, and consequently the fable of the building with bamboo mat seem to be the product of two ideas, that of a temporary dwelling of the

ciò di una temporale dimora dell'ultimo Priore Generale Elia Curyacos a spese del Monastero in un terreno del tutto differente e ben distante da quello ove ora esiste il presente Monastero, e di quella del presente monastero proprio come i mitologisti fanno un mare di latte mettendo insieme le idee di latte e di Oceano.

I.3. Dato anche che sia esistito quest'edificio con pareti di Bambù qual monastero, quelli, i quali allegano di averlo costruito per le monache, potranno avere il diritto di reclamare solamente quella capanna di bambù e sui beni che a questo appartengono, e non sul monastero in parola e i suoi beni, che come si è provato sono dei Soriani. La naturale conseguenza degli argomenti sopraesposti è che dai Soriani si prova che il monastero in questione fu fondato dal defunto Priore Generale, coll'aiuto dei Terziarii Soriani e di varii preti secolari, e con denaro proveniente da collette fatte presso le chiese soriane tra il clero ed il popolo dello stesso rito, in un terreno ch'era bene patrimoniale di alcuni monaci Soriani e che le cose temporali dello stesso monastero furono amministrare dal superiore di Cunemao, e che i Soriani ebbero sempre il diritto di

Prior General Kuriakose Elias at the expense of the monastery in a land of totally different and well distant from the present monastery, and that of the present convent proper; as the mythologists used to form a sea of milk putting together the ideas of milk and ocean.

I.3. This convent which is built with bamboo mat belongs to those who constructed it for the sisters, they [the sisters] can have the right of claiming only that hut of bamboo and those properties which belong to them and not the convent as such and its goods, as have been proved, belong to the Syrians. The natural consequence of these arguments expressed above is that from the Syrians it is proved that the convent in question was found by the deceased Prior General, with the help of the Syrian Tertiary and other secular priests, and with money collected from the Syrian churches, from the clergy and people of the same Rite, in a patrimonial land of some of the Syrian priests and the temporal things of the same convent which were administered by the superior of Koonammavu and the Syrians have the right of the foundation, the property and the administration of the same

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>fondazione, la proprietà e l'amministrazione di esso monastero. Relationem istam a R. S. Nidhiry scriptam veram esse in omnibus credo, ideoque illam ex officio ad S. C. De ide mitto. Kottayam 23 Aug. 1889 (firmato) + Carolus Vic. Ap. Kott.</p> | <p>convent. This report written by R.S Nidhiry, I think, is true in everything, hence I send it ex.officio to the Sacred Congregation. Kottayam 23rd August 1889 Signed +Charles Lavigne, Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam</p> |
|--|--|

5.2.2.8.2. The Main Content of the Letter

Fr. Nidhiry first summarizes the arguments adduced by the Latins in favour of their claims for the Koonammavu convent.

5.2.2.8.2.1. The Arguments of the Latins

- The convent was founded by the Latin sisters.
- It was built on a land, which is the patrimony of a Latin sister.
- It was treated and administered till this moment as Latin institute.
- More than thousands of Rupees had come as the patrimony of Sr. Anna, the first Latin religious.
- The Latin sisters in that convent were only 8 but they have brought to the convent thousands of rupees as part of their patrimony and pocket money. Sr. Anna of St. Therese, Sr. Angela, Sr. Beatrice and the two women called Kollamparambil Maria and Teresa procuratress were brought more money.
- An Italian woman Marchesa Ambissola through Fr. Gerard made a good donation by which an apartment was built and bought some other properties. Both these

belong to the Latin sisters since the donor and the missionary who received that donation are from that Rite. So too, if the sisters were not convinced of it, they would have never thought of building that apartment and buying those properties.

- Since the land was bought in the name of Fr. Leopold, the Provincial Delegate, Msgr. Mellano has the right of making it a convent of Latin Rite.
- For determining the nature of the convent, we need to see the opinion of Msgr. Bernardine who governed the people of both the Rites. His opinion is in favour of the Latins.
- Msgr. Mellano erected first the bamboo mat convent in the land which was the patrimony of a Latin sister and when the number of the religious increased with the postulants of Syrian Rite, he enlarged the building and thus made the present convent.

5.2.2.8.2.2. The Arguments of the Syrians

The convent in question was found by Rev. Fr. Kuriakose Elias with the cooperation of other members of his Congregation.

- That convent was built with the money collected from the Syrian churches, by the Tertiary who were helped also by the secular priests in accordance with the verbal and written request to them by the same Prior General.
- That convent was built on lands, which were the patrimonial property of Rev. Fr. Jacob John Baptist and of other Tertiary religious; little later it was paid back with the patrimony of the Syrian sisters.
- The temporal goods of that convent were in the management (care) of the same Fr. Prior.

5.2.2.8.2.3. Evaluation of Nidhiry

On Arguments of the Latins:

1. The letter of Fr. Leopold the Carmelite Missionary dated 13th February 1867 which together with its Latin translation sent to the Apostolic Delegate on 18th June 1888 shows that the argument that the convent was built by Latin sisters is absolutely false.
2. The Letter of Fr. Kuriakose Elias the Prior General of men TOCD dated 9th December 1869 sent to the Apostolic Delegate also on 18th June 1888 corroborates the same former affirmation. The copies of the documents and the pages of the accounts sent to the Apostolic Delegate in the just mentioned letter show clearly that the claim of the Latins that the land *Maumkootathil* on which the convent was built is false.
3. The argument that the convent was administered till this time as Latin institution does not stand in the light of the two previous observations, according to the maxim “what is freely asserted is freely negated.”
4. If Sr. Anna would have brought as her patrimony 3 plots and 65 ½ measurement of the land for the cultivation of the rice, its value would have increased after it was improved by the money of the convent; however their real value when it was given to the sisters was only 18067 puthens equivalent to Rs. 888/-, Anas 4 and paisa 6. The following fact proves the genuineness of this observation. After paying the debt over the land of Rs. 712/- then the convent would have only Rs. 176/-, 13 Ana and 6 paisa. If we divide it into three parts each Latin sister would get Rs. 58/-, Anas 10 and paisa 8. Such an amount was not sufficient even for a part of their expenses during the novitiate period. This

argument clearly refutes the fourth argument of the Latins. Actually, the Latin sisters were sustained with the fruits of the patrimony of the Syrian sisters.

5. Concerning the fifth argument: at that moment, there were only 6 Latin sisters and the sum total of the money brought by them is only of Rs. 1942/-. And if 6% of interest could be taken at the year, it is of Rs. 116/- and some Ana and few paisa; if divided into 6 persons each one will get only Rs. 2/- per month; If the expenses for habits and medicines are reduced from it, then a sister will not get Rs. 2/- per month. Thus, it is logical to assume that the maximum part of the income for the livelihood of the sisters came from the fruit of the patrimony of the Syrian sisters. The documents and accounts which exist in the convent prove the veracity of this assertion. Thus, the fifth argument of the Latins falls flat. It is also worth to note the number of the members of the community. The cited number eight is not very correct. There were only six Latin sisters, the two others being the helpers of the convent. There were around 25 Syrian sisters. And all the properties of the convent except the above said sum of Rs. 1942/- belongs to the Syrian sisters.
6. All the cited five arguments of the Latins are not sufficient to prove that the convent belongs to them. Their other arguments are also can be shown as false. Concerning the 6th argument which is based on the above mentioned 5 pillars, there by forming a castle in the air, Fr. Nidhiry brings up a counter argument: if the different institutes must follow the Rite of those who had given alms and donations, the colleges of the Jesuits in Calcutta, Bombay, Trichinappilly and Mangalore, which had received authorization and donations from Hindus, Parsis and Muslims, would have followed the

rite and ceremonies of those different religions. This is indeed a dangerous and absurd principle. Thus the 6th argument of the Latins is absurd.

7. The fact that the properties were bought in the name of Fr. Leopold, a Latin missionary, is not a proof to claim the ownership of the convent in favour of the Latins. The same missionary had made a written statement that other properties which were purchased in his own name, they belong to the monastery of Koonammavu; that is of the Tertiary men. Also there exists other valuable documents to prove this fact. All these are made known to the Apostolic Delegate. Msgr. Aiuti accepted these documents and decided in favour of the Syrian fathers. There was no other way for Msgr. Mellano, but to yield to it although he tried his best to resist the decision.

If the fact of having Fr. Leopold bought some properties for that convent and he governed it could claim to make it a Latin institute, also his Excellency Msgr. Lavigne who was a Latin could have made the Vicariate of Kottayam, his ecclesiastical unit made into a Latin eparchy.

8. To prove the falsity of the 8th argument Fr. Nidhiry cites the maxim *Nemo iudex in causa propria* ("Nobody is judge in his own case") against Msgr. Mellano. Formerly Msgr. Mellano had appealed to the Holy See to give the ownership of the church at Thevera by fabricated arguments and Vatican made a decision in his favour. Later it was revoked after seeing the falsity of the arguments and the Holy See assigned that parish to the Syrians. Now Msgr. Mellano has come forward with inaccurate arguments against the Syrian claim of Koonammavu convent and adamantly fights for it until

now. Our argument will make fall Msgr. Mellano's castle which he had built in the air.

9. The 9th argument that Msgr. Mellano built the bamboo mat convent and later enlarged it cannot stand before historical data. Msgr. Mellano was consecrated only on 17th November 1868 (while the bamboo mat convent was built in 1866!), and till that time he was a simple missionary and sometimes served as vicar of some Latin parishes. Before he became bishop, he had never shown any interest on convents or monasteries. This fact will be confirmed by an investigation of the bull of his consecration. Fr. Nidhiry cites the contemporary documents in order to prove these facts. How could then Msgr. Mellano build the bamboo mat convent which was constructed on 13th February 1866? Thus his 9th argument does not have any weight.

On the arguments of the Syrians:

1. This convent which is built with bamboo mat belongs to those who constructed it for the sisters. The sisters can have the right of claiming only that hut of bamboo and those properties which belong to them and not the convent as such and its goods, as have been proved, belong to the Syrians.
2. The natural consequence of these arguments expressed above is that from the Syrians it is proved that the convent in question was found by the deceased Prior General, with the help of the Syrian Tertiary and other secular priests, and with money collected from the Syrian churches, from the clergy and people of the same Rite, in a patrimonial land of some of the Syrian priests and the temporal things of the same convent which were administered by the superior of Koonammavu and the

Syrians have the right of the foundation, the property and the administration of the same convent.

5.2.2.8.3. Comments

Sr. Sucey in her dissertation has devoted 12 pages, exposing the biography of Nidhiry from the birth for the purpose of tarnishing his character.³⁵ Even while she was accepting his extraordinary talents, she tries to find hidden motives like selfishness, ambition for the office of bishop and pleasing the Syrians, behind his every activity.³⁶ According to Sr. Sucey, the hierarchical authorities such as Maurin, Aliardi, Zelesky, Aiuti, Lavigne and Mellano were suspicious of his motives and affiliations. Msgr. Charles Lavigne, Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam tried at first to tolerate him and being afraid of the possible agitations by the Syrians, made him the Vicar General. We do not agree to most of Sr. Sucey's allegations against Fr. Nidhiry. We do not enter here to a detailed refutation since it is not directly concerned with our objective. Our interest is only about the report sent by Fr. Nidhiry to the Apostolic Delegate with the endorsement of Msgr. Lavigne. Of course, Fr. Nidhiry was a staunch and zealot advocate for the indigenous bishops for the Syro Malabar community. We will try to evaluate the allegations of Sr. Sucey as we make our comments on them.

- Concerning the Letter of Fr. Leopold in Malayalam to the Syrian parishes of Kaduthuruthi and Muttuchira

³⁵ *SGME*, 349-360.

³⁶ See some of her expressions: able but wicked man, two faced personality, changing the matters for his personal benefits, shrewd enough to manage things to his own advantages, having a manic desire to become bishop, a pessimistic and dangerous character, ready to become a Jacobite if he could become a bishop in that Church, instigator of all distractions and agitations, misuses his authority in many ways, friend of the intruder Mar Dionysius.

requesting for financial support see *WFF*, Chapter V, No. 5.2.2.6.3 ‘Comments’ and the twisted argument of Sr. Sucey in FN No. 28.

- Regarding the letter of Fr. Chavara we have not yet found any document validating that letter written by Fr. Chavara on 9th December 1869 and sent (most probably by others) to the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Aiuti on 18th June 1888. One cannot argue from this that there did not exist such a letter. Fr. Nidhiry quotes precise dates of writing the letter and sending it to the Apostolic Delegate. This fact seems to imply to the veracity of the document.³⁷
- The presupposition of the Latins that the convent was administered until that time as Latin institution cannot hold ground. As we have mentioned earlier neither Msgr. Bernardine nor Fr. Leopold thought about the first indigenous community of sisters as a Latin institution.
- Concerning the logical calculation of Fr. Nidhiry about Sr. Anna’s patrimony and the debts which they had at that time,³⁸ Sr. Sucey makes a wild accusation of cunningness on the part of Fr. Nidhiry without providing the precise amount of patrimony, Sr. Anna

³⁷Sr. Sucey argues against its authenticity by stating that Msgr. Aiuti wrote to the prefect of Propaganda Fide that he had never received such a letter. Let us quote the words from *Ponenza* of the Apostolic Delegate: “*Non possiedo ancora una copia della lettera del P. Curyacos Elias, ma appena la possederò mi affretterò a mandarla all’Eminenza Vostra*”. His words can be thus translated: “I have not yet got a copy of the letter of Fr. Kuriakose Elias; I will send it to your Eminence as soon as I get it”. The comment of Sr. Sucey seems to be intended to create a wrong impression in the minds of the readers.

³⁸Concerning the debt over the property, see, *WFF*, Chapter, II, No. 2.1.3.1. ‘The Land of *panambumadam*.’

has brought. The fact that Fr. Nidhiry had given very precise details about the patrimony and other things, cannot be categorically rejected. Had Fr. Nidhiry got those details from the deed bond or documents concerning the details of the land? Our present knowledge does not help us to make a conclusion. Msgr. Aiuti the Apostolic Delegate in his report to the Holy See after evaluating the arguments of both Latins and Syrians has the following comment on Nidhiry's account of patrimony of Sr. Anna. He concludes that Fr. Nidhiry's amount is made by taking into consideration the absolute value of the property, while Msgr. Medlycott has evaluated it according to its nominal value, which takes into consideration the improvement made to the land by the sisters.³⁹ The statement of Sr. Sucey that "the manuscripts in the Vimala provincial house CMC testified to the list of properties of Anna, which number more than 14 properties"⁴⁰ is not totally correct. The document of Vimala province mentions only 12 properties, (and not more than 14!)⁴¹. However, nobody can deny the fact that comparing to the Latin sisters the patrimony of the Syrians would have been much more since they were numerically more in number (Syrians – 19, Latins – 7). But Fr. Nidhiry's conclusion that the "three Latin sisters do not have any patrimony in the convent; but they were sustained with the fruits of the patrimony of the Syrian sisters" is not fully correct.⁴²

³⁹ See below No. 5.2.2.9. 'Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti.'

⁴⁰ *SGME*, 358.

⁴¹ See also *AUSW*, 117.

⁴² Sr. Sucey sees here an act of ingratitude towards the first three Latin members of the community who "had generously received the

- Nobody can find fault with the fifth argument of Fr. Nidhiry concerning the number of both Latin and Syrian sisters in the community before the division.⁴³
- Concerning the 6th argument we do not find any illogicality in the counter argument raised by Fr. Nidhiry.⁴⁴
- On the 7th argument we cannot find fault with, since Fr. Nidhiry proposes a very logical argument.
- On the 8th argument we do not have any negative comment.
- Fr. Nidhiry's refutation of the claim that Msgr. Mellano had built the bamboo mat convent is conclusive. Sr. Sucey calls it as illogical argument without adducing the reason to prove it.⁴⁵ Fr. Nidhiry upholds the truth of the arguments of the Syrians in favour of their claim over the Koonammavu convent, without making a detailed study of them. The reason may be that he, a Syrian, was

Syrian sisters to their house" (*SGME*, 358). She makes that it was because of the generosity that the Syrian sisters were received to the community. This is indeed a biased reading into the event. It was Fr. Leopold in company of Fr. Chavara both of whom never thought about the issue of Rites, whether Latin or Syrian, who decided to take the Syrian Sr. Clara. As a matter of formality Fr. Leopold asked the sisters whether they wanted to have a new member [without making mention that she was of Syrian Rite] in the community, and mother Eliswa in the name of others, who had never thought about the problem of Rite at that time, most willingly said 'yes'. See *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.1.6. 'Clara as the fourth Member.'

⁴³Sr. Sucey the vociferous critique of Fr. Nidhiry keeps mum on this argument!

⁴⁴It is strange that Sr. Sucey does not refute it. She merely refers to it. This is also true about the 7th argument of Fr. Nidhiry. Her whole exposition of the arguments of Fr. Nidhiry seems to have intended to create a negative impression of Fr. Nidhiry in the minds of a casual reader.

⁴⁵ *SGME*, 359.

fully convinced of the position of the Syrians. However, we would like to make some comments on the arguments of the Syrians.

- It is wrong to assert categorically that Koonammavu convent was established only by Fr. Chavara,⁴⁶ but with the cooperation of his confreres. Nobody can deny the vital role played by Fr. Leopold in the initial stage and the construction of *panambumadam*.⁴⁷
- It is wrong to attribute wholly to Fr. Chavara alone the initiation for collecting fund, but he indeed had a major role in it.
- We could not find in any document the name Fr. Jacob John Baptist on whose property the new convent was built. As we have already affirmed, the Tertiary fathers contributed one plot of Land on which the new convent was built.⁴⁸
- The 4th argument of the Syrians that the temporal goods were under the management of Fr. Chavara cannot be upheld. Sr. Sucey claims that although Fr. Nidhiry had tried to create an impression that he had systematically prepared the letter, it contains “a list of untrue statements and baseless claims, and is a good proof of the duplicity of Mani Nidhiry.”⁴⁹ Unfortunately, she had not proved the veracity of her position, as we have made clear in our remarks.

⁴⁶It is also notable that at that time Fr. Chavara was not addressed as Prior General.

⁴⁷For details, see *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.1.3. ‘Construction of *Panambumadam*.’

⁴⁸See *WFF*, Chapter II, No. 2.2.4.1. ‘The Land of the New Convent.’

⁴⁹*SGME*, 357.

On Fr. Nidhiry's letter, we have already noted down some of our disagreements. Now as a general comment, we would say that Fr. Nidhiry's arguments are very sharp and absolute.

5.2.2.9. Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti

After studying the above mentioned letters of Fr. Leopold (dated 13th February 1867), Msgr. Mellano (dated 28th November 1888, 15th March 1889 and 2nd April 1889), Msgr. Medlycott (dated 27th January 1889, 12th April 1889), petition of the Syrians (no date), Letter of Sr. Catherine (8th March 1889) and of Fr. Nidhiry (23rd August 1889), Msgr. Andrea Aiuti the Apostolic Delegate has submitted his report to the Cardinal prefect of the Propaganda Fide on 30th August 1889.

As an introduction, Msgr. Aiuti avows that the Cardinal had entrusted him a job which was absolutely impossible, since both the Latins and Syrians hold diametrically opposed positions; hence it was impossible even to approach them personally. Then he cites the arguments of both parties, namely Latin and Syrian bishops and people. As a concluding part, he submits his own suggestions to solve the Latin – Syrian dispute. Below we give the original document with its translation.

5.2.2.9.1. Original Document

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>... ma tosto doveti persuadermi che ciò era assolutamente impossibile. Le due parti si trovano in campi diametralmente opposti e talmente situate che non mi è stato possibile di ravvicinarle; e quindi obbedendo assai di buon grado agli ordini dell'Eminenza Vostra spedisco alla medesima</p> | <p>...You have asked me something impossible. The two parties find themselves in diametrically opposed camps and so it was not possible for me to approach them; and therefore very willingly of the orders of your Eminence, I send enclosing along with all the documents that I could</p> |

qui uniti tutti i documenti, che mi venne fatto di raccogliere in proposito unitamente al mio debole parere, affinché l'Eminenza Vostra nella sua somma sapienza e nota esperienza delle cose possa tutto esaminare ecc.

Passando ora ad esporre il mio debole parere debbo dire, che quel monastero in *limine foundationis* sembra non sia stato nè Soriano nè Latino, e che, se si volesse dire che fu qualche cosa, bisognerebbe piuttosto dire che fu Soriano. Infatti sebbene quelle quattro donne, che riunironsi nel principio sotto l'egido del P. Leopoldo coll' intenzione di esser Terziarie Carmelitane ed andarono ad abitare nella piccola casa, che una di loro possedeva, ed aveva messo a disposizione comune fossero di rito latino, le medesime tuttavia non ebbero la regola, se non il 19 Marzo 1867, cioè dopo che, per soddisfare alle numerose domande delle giovani Soriane, le quali chiedevano di venire ammesse tra le Terziarie, era stato edificato l'attuale monastero. Oltre di che, non vi fu mai decreto alcuno dell'Autorità Ecclesiastica Verapolitana che dichiarasse a qual rito dovesse il medesimo appartenere; mentre d'altra parte, compiuto ch'esso fu, vi si trasportarono le 4 latine, la Soriana, che viveva insieme

collect uniting along with my own humble opinion so that your Eminence in your wisdom and experience of the things would be able to examine everything.

Now passing to explain my humble opinion, I must say that, that convent in the light of foundation (*limine foundationis*) seems to be neither Syrian nor Latin and that if you should speak of something of it, you can say that it was Syrian. In fact, it is true, that 4 women perhaps of the Latin Rite who joined together in the beginning under the guidance of Fr. Leopold with the intention of being Tertiary Carmelites and went to live in the small house that one of them possessed and they had put at the common disposition, they did not have the *Regola*, if not the 19th March 1867; that is after that to satisfy the constant request of the young Syrians who were asking to put them in the Tertiary, was built the actual monastery. Moreover, any of the ecclesiastical authority of Verapoly, never had made any decree to make clear to which Rite the convent belongs; whereas of the other side, their competence was to carry on the 4 Latin women, the Syrian who lived together with them and they were able to admit

con loro e vi furono subito ammesse senza difficoltà le Soriane fino al numero di 19, che è l'attuale numero ivi esistente, non sommando mai le latine, più che a 6 o 8; e così pure vediamo che vi furono ammesse educande di ambo i riti senza distinzione alcuna, fino a fare arrivare il numero a 25. E poi fino al momento, in cui avvenne l'erezione dei due Vicariati e la loro divisione da Verapoli, nessuno mai pensò a fissare, se quel monastero fosse soriano ovvero latino. La lingua in cui è scritta la Regola è la Malayalam, che è pure la lingua degli atti comuni, come orazioni, benedizione di mensa etc.

Dissi, che se si volesse dire che quel monastero fu qualche cosa, bisognerebbe piuttosto dire che fu Soriano fin dal momento della sua fondazione. Infatti il medesimo fu fabbricato sotto gli auspici del P. Leopoldo, Superiore Delegato pei conventi dei Terziarii, aiutato dal P. Curiacos Elias, Superiore anch'esso dei Terziarii, da varii membri della sua Congregazione, della quale alcuni ecclesiastici raccolsero denaro principalmente tra le chiese e Congregazioni Soriane; e ciò fecero in sequito a lettera sia del P. Leopoldo medesimo, sia dello stesso Padre Curiacos Elias. Oltre di che, abbiamo che

immediatamente without any difficulty the Syrians till the number reach up to 19, which is the actual number now exists, not added the Latins more than 6 or 8; and thus we can see that they put to educate both the Rites without any distinction till to arrive the number up to 25. Then until the moment of the erection of the two vicariates and their separation from Verapoly, nobody thought to fix whether that convent is Syrian or Latin. The language in which is written their *Regola* is Malayalam, which is also the language of the community acts, like prayer, blessing at the table etc.

If you wish to say, that convent was belonging to a Rite, it would be said that it was Syrian, right from the moment of its foundation. In fact, it was built under the guidance of Fr. Leopold, Delegate Superior for the monasteries of Tertiary, helped by Fr. Kuriakose Elias, also the superior of the Tertiaries, by different members of his Congregation, of which some ecclesiastical authorities collected money principally among the Syrian churches and congregations; and for which prepared letters both by Fr. Leopold and by Fr. Kuriakose Elias. Furthermore,

il P. Leopoldo stesso facendo appello alle Chiese e Congregazioni Soriane a mezzo della nota lettera Allegato B''' diceva chiaramente, che domandava aiuto per terminare la costruzione di quell'edificio, che era stato cominciato e tirato innanzi fino a quel punto coll'aiuto di questo doveva per esser condotto a termine.

Ond'è che io penserei che la via più semplice per risolvere la questione sarebbe quella di prescindere fino ad un certo punto da quel, che si dice e si suppone da ambe le parti intorno alla prima origine e fondazione di quel monastero, e di riguardare il medesimo piuttosto tale quale ci si presenta dopo aver ricevuto la sua forma ultima per la Regola datagli da Monsig. Arcivescovo di Verapoli il 19 Marzo 1867. Ora da quell'epoca in qua esso ci si presenta come un istituto misto di Religiose Latine e Soriane con un numero preponderante di Soriane; e di più vediamo ch'esso esiste sopra un terreno, che è libera proprietà delle Religiose Soriane e si mantiene nella massima parte coi frutti dei beni dotati di queste. E vediamo altresì, che il medesimo fu edificato con denaro dei Soriani; come chiasamente dice il P. Leopoldo in quella sua lettera. E perciò sembra che con tutta verità si

we have the same Fr. Leopold making appeal to Syrian Churches and congregations through the above said letter (Attached document B''') saying clearly that he had asked help for finishing the construction of that building which was being started and till that time had taken their help, had to be finished.

So that I think the way more simple for resolving the question would be that setting aside to certain point, what is said and supposed by both the parties about the origin and foundation of that convent and to look at the same under which, it is presented after having received its final form for the *Regola* given by the Archbishop of Verapoly, 19th March 1867. From that epoch onwards, it is presented as a mixed institute of Latin and Syrian religious with a predominant number of Syrians, and in more, we can see that it was existing on a land, which was the free property of the Syrian religious and maintained its major part with the fruit of the patrimony of them. We can also see that it was built with the money of the Syrians, as clearly stated by Fr. Leopold in his letter. Therefore, it seems that with all truth you can say that it is at least from

possa dire, ch'esso almeno da quell'epoca in quà ci si presenta come, se non del tutto Soriano, almeno assai preponderantemente tale, per modo che si potrebbe asserire che non le Soriane siano state fino ad ora ospiti delle Latine, ma che invece queste lo furono delle Soriane. E quindi, siccome dopo l'erezione dei Vicariati Soriani devesi dare a quell'istituto un carattere decisamente soriano o decisamente latino, e siccome il numero delle Religiose latine è minimo comparativamente a quello delle Soriane, e prendendo pure in considerazione tante altre ragioni estrinseche, le quali militano a favore dei Soriani, converrebbe forse dichiararlo Soriano.

Tanto più che dopo tutto i Latini hanno per le religiose native del loro rito altri due grandi conventi, uno in Verapoli, che chiamano catecumenato, e l'altro in Ernakulam, mentre i soriani finora non hanno per le Religiose del loro rito, se non un monastero ben piccolo in Muttoli luogo solitario, remoto e cattivo, che si trova nel Vicariato di Kottayam, e che io stesso vidi testè all'occasione della mia visita nel Malabar. Se non si lasciasse loro il Monastero di cunemao, crederebero probabilmente di

that epoch in which it is presented as, even though not all of Syrian's, at least predominantly was of them, in a way you can assert that the Syrians till this time were not being there as guests of the Latins but the latter were of the Syrians. And therefore, since after the erection of the Syrian vicariates that institute must be given a nature decisively Syrian or decisively Latin, and since the number of the Latin Religious is comparatively minimum to that of Syrians and taking also in consideration many other extrinsic reasons, which are also in favour of the Syrians, it can perhaps declare as of Syrian.

More than that, after all, the Latins have for the native religious of their Rite, other two grand convents, one in Verapoly, which they call catechumenate and the other in Ernakulam, while the Syrians till now have none for the religious of their Rite, except a small one in Mutholy a solitary, remote and not good place which is seen in the Vicariate of Kottayam, and I myself have seen that at the time of my visit in Malabar. If you do not leave them the convent at Koonammavu, I believe, probably they have the reason of saying that Verapoly

aver ragione di dire, che Verapoli non ha fatto nulla per le loro Religiose, e che si è servito di tutti i denari e le collette fatte per monasteri a favore delle Religiose di rito Latino. I due Vicarii Apostolici in varie occasioni mi hanno fatto intendere più o meno chiaramente, che se quel monastero venisse, malgrado tutti i reclami dei Soriani, aggiudicato ai Latini, quelli sarebbero oltremodo malcontenti. Ed ultimamente sia a voce, che in iscritto mi hanno assicurato che tante il Clero Regolare, che quello Secolare, come pure i semplici laici soriani sarebbero oltremodo addolorati, se dopo aver perduto due grandi edifici, come sono quello del Seminario di Puthenpally e quello del convento dei Terziarii di Cunemao avessero, a perdere anche quello, che sta in questione; e perciò pregano instantemente che, quando anche le ragioni per aggiudicare ai Soriani l'Istituto in parola fossero per essere riputate insufficienti, la S. Sede voglia fare ogni sforzo per vedere di aggiudicarlo ai Soriani.

L'istituto, aggiudicato che fosse ai Soriani, dovrebbe naturalmente rimanere sotto la giurisdizione del Vicariato Apostolico nel quale si trova, cioè sotto la giurisdizione di

has done nothing for their religious and that they have served all the money and the collections did for the convent in favour of the religious of Latin Rite. The two Apostolic vicars in different occasions have made me understand more or less clearly, that if that convent comes in spite of all reclaims of the Syrians, judged to the Latins that will be in other way discontent. And finally both in voice and in written form they have assured me that the clergy both religious and that of secular as well as the lay Syrians would be other way in distress, if after having lost two grand buildings, as that of the Seminary at Puthenpally and that of the Tertiary at Koonammavu, to lose also this one which is in question. Therefore, they request insistently that although the reasons for judging the institute to the Syrians in words would be insufficient, the Holy See must be done each effort for judging it to the Syrians.

The institute being judged to the Syrians, must be remain naturally under the jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic in which it is situated, that is under the jurisdiction of Msgr. Medlycott; but must serve for the two vicariates, as house of

Mons. Medlycott; però dovrebbe servire ai due Vicariati, come casa di Noviziato e come luogo centrale per l'educazione delle ragazze Soriane; e, ad evitare qualsiasi possibilità di eventuale differenza d'opinioni tra i due Vicarii Apostolici, sarebbe forse bene di far menzione di questo punto nella decisione della S. Sede, quante volte questa fosse per esser nel senso indicato.

Per quel che concerne la scuola, (che a quanto io sappia non è che un gran camerone nell'entrata della clausura), e l'orfanotrofio, che sono annessi al monastero converrebbe probabilmente che seguissero la giurisdizione del convento.

Così pure le Suore Latine, le quali desiderassero di rimanere in quel monastero, potrebbero forse in via d'eccezione esservi lasciate come pure sembra si dovrebbe permettere di portare seco la loro dote a quelle, le quali desiderassero di passare nel monastero di Ernakulam; e se si credesse opportuno Latine, che fossero per avventura già morte in quel monastero, dovesse rimanere all'Istituto medesimo e che la stessa sorte dovrebbe avere la dote di quelle Suore Latine, le quali volessero continuare in quel monastero.

Avverto che il Nidhiry, quando parla della dote portata dalla Suora Anna al monastero, lo fa

Novitiate and as central place for the education of the Syrian girls; and to avoid any possibility of eventual difference of opinions between the two Apostolic Vicars, it would be good to make mention of this point in the decision of the Holy See, how many times this was for being in indicated sense.

For that which concerns the school (as I know it is not a grand *camerone* in the entrance of the cloister), and the orphanage they are annexed to the convent and probably may follow the jurisdiction of the convent.

Thus also the Latin sisters, who wish to remain in that convent, could be perhaps in way of exception can be left there and those who wish to go to the convent at Ernakulam must be allowed to take their patrimony; and the patrimony of the sister who died there, must remain to that institute and it is same with the patrimony of those Latin sisters who wish to continue in that convent.

Nidhiry, when speaks of the patrimony brought by Sr. Anna to the convent, does it according to the absolute value of estimate he refers in the document where as Msgr. Medlycott when he speaks of the same, he considers it

secondo il valore assoluto della stima a cui si riferisce il documento, e che invece Monsig. Medlycott, quando parla della medesima dote, la considera secondo il suo valor nominale, cioè secondo quel valore, che essa ebbe dopo che i terreni, sui quali era fondata, erano stati migliorati. Non possiedo ancora una copia della lettera del P. Curiacos Elias, ma appena la possederò mi affretterò a mandarla all'Eminenza Vostra.

Questo è tutto quel che a coscienzioso adempimento del mio officio mi sono creduto in dovere di esporre all'Eminenza Vostra sulla vertenza, che forma l'oggetto di questo rapporto, e mentre imploro dalla bontà della medesima la decisione che nella sua sapienza crederà bene di significarmi e delle istruzioni, con cui benignamente Le piacerà di accompagnarla, profitto volentoso di questo nuovo felice incontro per chiedere in grazia ancor una volta all'Eminenza Vostra Rma di volermi accordare l'altissimo onore di chinarmi al bacio della S. Propora, e di permettermi che mi rassegni con ogni sorta di ossequii, Dell'Eminenza Vostra Rma, Umo, Dmo e Ossmo Servo + Andrea Arcivescovo di Acrida Del. Ap. Nelle Indie Orientali

according to its nominal value, that is according to that value which it has after making the land on which it was founded, improved.

I have not yet possessed a copy of the letter of Fr. Kuriakose Elias, when I get it, soon I will send it to your Eminence.

This is all that which to fulfill consciously my office I believe that I owe to explain to your Eminence about the verdict which forms the object of this rapport and while imploring from the goodness of the same the decision in your wisdom feel as well of, signifies to me and of the instructions, with which benevolently you like to accompany it, I profit voluntarily of this new happy encounter for asking in grace once again to your V. Rev. Eminence of my wish to accord the ultimate honour of bending me to kiss the Holy *Propora*, and to allow me that I may reassign with every sort of homage, of your V. Rev. Eminence,

Humble and obedient Servant
+Andrea Archbishop of
Acrida, in Orient India

5.2.2.9.2. Main Points

1. The convent at Koonammavu in the light of foundation (*limine foundationis*) seems to be neither Syrian nor Latin.
2. Four women perhaps of Latin Rite became the members of the convent under the guidance of Fr. Leopold with the intention of being Tertiary Carmelites and lived in a small house that one of them earned as patrimony putting everything at the common disposition.
3. They did not have the *Regola* (constitution) till 19th March 1867.
4. The present convent was built to satisfy the request of many young Syrians who wanted to embrace religious life.
5. The Ecclesiastical authority of Verapoly never had made any decree to make clear to which Rite the convent belongs. The Syrian members were admitted to the convent without any difficulty till the number reaches up to 19. But the number of the Latins remained only 6 or 8. The candidates were given formation without any distinction of Rites and the total number became 25.
6. Until the time of the erection of the two vicariates and their separation from Verapoly, nobody thought of categorizing the members as Latins and Syrians.
7. If we would like to say something about the convent, one may call it a Syrian convent. It was built under the guidance of Fr. Leopold, Delegate Superior of the monasteries of the Tertiaries with the help of Fr. Kuriakose Elias, the superior of the Tertiaries and of many members of the same congregation who collected money mainly from the Syrian churches and

congregations. Both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara sent letters appealing for alms (letters are attached). Fr. Leopold clearly said that he had asked help for finishing the construction of the convent.

8. Msgr. Aiuti prefers to look at the recent history of the Koonammavu community rather than concentrating on the above mentioned disputes. He finds that both Latin and Syrian sisters formed the community built on the property of the Syrian religious and maintained mainly by the fruit of the patrimony of the Syrian sisters. Fr. Leopold clearly attests to this fact. Besides, the majority of the members are Syrians. Hence no one can say that the Syrian sisters lived there as guests of the Latins. After the erection of the Syrian ecclesiastical vicariates, the issue to whom the Koonammavu convent should belong came in to consideration. Since the Latin sisters were minority in the community which was predominantly Syrian, it is better to declare the convent as Syrian.
9. The Latins have other two grand convents, one in Verapoly, which they call catechumenate and the other in Ernakulam, while the Syrians till now have none, except a small one in Mutholy in the Vicariate of Kottayam. If the convent at Koonammavu is not given to the Syrians, they have the reason of saying that Verapoly has done nothing for *their* sisters (religious?)⁵⁰ and the whole money and the collected alms for the convent has served in favour of the sisters of Latin Rite.

⁵⁰ Is it not applicable for both men and women religious? It seems that Msgr. Aiuti includes the Syrian Tertiaries.

10. The two prelates of the Syrian Vicariates had informed Msgr. Aiuti more or less clearly that notwithstanding of the demands of the Syrians, if the convent were awarded to the Latins, they would become extremely discontent. Further the two ecclesiastical prelates had orally and written form made it certain that the religious and secular clergy as well as ordinary Syrian laity, if after having lost the two grand buildings – seminary at Puthenpally and the monastery of the Tertiary men at Koonammavu – if they lose this one too, they will be extremely pained. Therefore, the prelates insistently request that mere words of awarding the convent to Syrians is insufficient and the Holy See has to do every effort in awarding it to the Syrians.
11. If the institute was awarded to the Syrians, naturally it must come under the jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur Msgr. Medlycott, in whose territory it is situated. Moreover, it should serve for the benefit of two vicariates, as house of novitiate and as centre for the education of the Syrian girls. To avoid any possibility of eventual difference of opinions between the two Apostolic Vicars, it would be good to make mention of this point in the decision of the Holy See.
12. As far as the school and the orphanage are concerned, they are annexed to the convent and have to be in the jurisdiction of the convent.
13. The Latin sisters, who wish to remain in that convent, could in exceptional cases live there. Those who wish to go to the convent at Ernakulam must be allowed to take their patrimony. The patrimony of the sister, who died there, must remain to that institute and it is same with the patrimony of those Latin sisters who wish to continue in that convent.

14. The Apostolic Delegate says that he has not yet possessed a copy of the letter of Fr. Kuriakose Elias, when he gets it, soon he will send it to the Prefect.

5.2.2.9.3. Comments

The Apostolic Delegate's reservation that the task entrusted to him is practically impossible is correct. It is natural that his arguments would have been influenced by the reports he has received from the Syrians and Latins. However, it is wrong to assert as Sr. Sucy does that Msgr. Aiuti was prejudiced in favour of the Syrians⁵¹ and showed partiality in his decision without showing any concern towards the Latin sisters.⁵² It is simply a reading between the lines to hold that Msgr. Aiuti by fabricating the facts judged in favour of the Syrians since he was afraid of the possible violent protests, conflicts and schism.⁵³

1. We agree to the observation that the convent at Koonammavu in the light of foundation (*limine foundationis*) seems to be neither Syrian nor Latin.
2. The Apostolic Delegate, probably influenced by the letter of Msgr. Mellano wrongly puts the original number of the sisters as 4 Latins.⁵⁴
3. Also the assertion that the sisters had no *Regola* till March 19th 1867 is not correct. *CKC* I, 5-6 make clear that, before 13th February 1866, Msgr. Bernardine had given the Rule and Fr. Leopold translated it into Malayalam.

⁵¹ *SGME*, 319.

⁵² *SGME*, 316, 318.

⁵³ *SGME*, 317, 320, 322.

⁵⁴ See above, No. 5.2.2.1. 'Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 28th November 1888.'

4. Also the statement that the “present convent was built to satisfy the constant request of the young Syrians who were asking to put them in the Tertiary Carmelite Order” has no solid foundation. It seems to have originated from the observation that after 13th February 1866 no Latin sisters had entered the community for 15 years.⁵⁵
5. The deduction of Msgr. Aiuti in 5 & 6 arguments is correct.
6. On 7th argument, Msgr. Aiuti seems to come to the conclusion that the convent can be called a Syrian convent from the valuable and vital role played by Fr. Chavara and his confreres as well as from the fact that Fr. Leopold was appealing for alms from the Syrian parishes.
7. Also the observation of the Apostolic Delegate in No. 8 is objective.
8. Msgr. Mellano and other Latin proponents find objection to the statement of Msgr. Aiuti that the Latins had then the two grand convents. According to them, the convent at Verapoly had not yet then completely constructed and furnished.⁵⁶ Also they hold that the so called convent at Ernakulam belonged to CSST sisters. Msgr. Aiuti’s statement may be thus understood. He seems to say that the Latin sisters (not necessarily TOCD Latin sisters) had a convent at Ernakulam.

⁵⁵ For details see *WFF* Chapter IV, Chart No. 4.4. ‘Details of Members from 1866 to 1890.’

⁵⁶ Thus Msgr. Mellano says: “now then also I have got into debt, I have to absolutely finish at least the necessary part for the Latin nuns and the orphanage”. For further details see *WFF*, No. 5.3.3.2. Sr. Suci supports his position.

9. In point 13, the Apostolic Delegate holds that the Latin sisters who leave Koonammavu should be allowed to take with them their patrimony. However, the patrimony of the deceased one should belong to the Koonammavu convent. No canonist can find fault with the position of Msgr. Aiuti.

The suggestions proposed by the Apostolic Delegate to the Holy See, although some of them were based on inaccurate facts – it is natural that such errors would occur in such studies by foreigners who were not familiar with local language, traditions and who had no direct contact with the concerned parties – are balanced, reasonable and justifiable. Hence, no lovers of truth can subscribe to the following claim of Sr. Suzy: “It is strange that the Apostolic delegate considered these baseless claims in making their decision regarding the jurisdiction of the convent and by rejecting the reliable report of the Archbishop.”⁵⁷

5.2.2.10. The Report and Suggestions of Consultant of the Propaganda Fide Rev. Fr. Gabriele Guarcino

Fr. Gabriele Guarcino the consultant of the Propaganda Fide was entrusted by the Congregation to study all the pertinent documents concerning this issue. He submitted to the Holy See the following observations on 7th of January 1890.⁵⁸

⁵⁷ *SGME*, 347.

⁵⁸ Sr. Suzy holds that the report of Fr. Guarcino was submitted on March 1890 (*SGME*, 294). But the concerned document gives the date as 7th January 1890.

5.2.2.10.1. The Original Document

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p style="text-align: center;">Numero 1</p> <p>Relazione e Voto del Molto Rev. P. Gabriele da Guarcino Cappuccino Consultore della S. Cong. di Propaganda sulla vertenza tra Monsig. Mellano Arcivescovo di Verapoli e Monsig. Medlycott Vescovo di Trichur circa la giurisdizione sul convento delle Terziarie Carmelitane sito in Cunemao. Eminentissimi Padri,</p> <p>In seguito del consiglio delle EE. VV., e del consenso degli Arcivescovi e Vescoovi dell'India centrale e meridionale adunati nel Sinodo di Bangalore, Sua Santità Papa Leone XIII nella sua sapienza con Breve <i>Quod iam pridem</i> in data 20 Maggio 1887 si compiaceva di dividere la vasta regione del Malabar per i Cattolici di Rito Siro-Malabarico in due Vicariati; e stabiliva, che i limiti territoriali di questi due Vicariati fossero i confini del fiume Alavay, che ha capo presso la città di Maleater percorre e tramezza la regione Malabarica, e vá a finire al mare vicino alla città di Cochin. L'uno alla parte settentrionale di detto fiume con l'ordinaria residenza del Vicario Apostolico nella città di Trichur; l'altro alla parte meridionale colla residenza del Vicario Apostolico nella città di Cottayam; e da queste due città,</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">Number 1</p> <p>Report and vote of Very Rev. Fr. Gabriele Guarcino Cappucine Consulter of the Sacred Cong. of the Propagation on the verdict between Msgr. Mellano, Archbishop of Verapoly and Msgr. Medlycott bishop of Trichur about the jurisdiction over the convent of Third order of Carmelites situated at Koonammavu.</p> <p>Very Eminent Fathers,</p> <p>In following the advice of your Eminence, and of the consensus of the Archbishops and bishops of central and southern India gathered in the Synod of Bangalore, His Holiness Pope Leo XIII, in his wisdom, with Brief <i>Quod iam pridem</i> given on 20th May 1887, is pleased to divide the vast region of Malabar for the Catholics of Syro-Malabar Rite into two Vicariates; and established that the territorial limits of these two Vicariates would be the boundaries of River Aluva, which has its head near the town of Malayatoor along and its dividing wall would be the Malabar region, and ends up at the seaside near the city of Cochin. The one at the northern part of said river with the ordinary residence of the Vicar Apostolic in the city of Trichur.</p> |

i due Vicariati prendono la loro denominazione. Mediante questa divisione quelli Cattolici vennero staccati dall'amministrazione e regime dell'Archidiocesi latina di Verapoly retta e governata attualmente dall'Arcivescovo Monsig. Mellano. Il Monastero delle Suore Terziarie Carmelitane già fondato in Cunemao, e che forma l'oggetto della presente questione, è nel territorio del Vicariato di Trichur. E poichè Monsignor Lavigne Vicario Apostolico di Cottayam voleva esercitare una certa giurisdizione su quelle Suore, il prelodato Arcivescovo ne faceva reclamo a questa S. Congregazione, affermando che quel convento era soggetto alla giurisdizione di lui, perchè venne dal suo antecessore Monsig. Bernardino fondato per le Suore e Postulanti di Rito latino (Alleg. A). I due Vicarii Apostolici di rito Siro – Malabarico affermano il contrario, dicendo che il convento venne fabbricato dai Religiosi Soriani Terziarii Carmelitani con denaro raccolto nelle Chiese di rito Siriaco per le Suore e Postulanti Soriane.

In vista di tali pretensioni questo Sacro Consesso commise a Monsig. Delegato nelle Indie Orientali D. Andrea Aiuti di conciliare tale vertenza tra i detti Prelati. Egli si diede moto per

The other to the southern part would be with the residence of the Apostolic vicar in the city of Kottayam. From these two cities, the two Vicariates take their name. Through this Division those Catholics were detached from the Administration and the regime of the Latin Archdiocese of Verapoly, led and governed at present by Archbishop Msgr. Mellano.

The Carmelite convent of the Tertiary sisters founded already in Koonammavu and which forms the subject of the present question, is in the territory of the Vicariate of Trichur. And as Msgr. Lavigne Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam wanted to exercise a certain jurisdiction on those sisters, the above said Archbishop Mellano did claim to this Sacred Congregation, affirming that the convent was subjected to his jurisdiction, since it was founded by his predecessor Msgr. Bernardine for the sisters and postulants of the Latin Rite (Attached Doc. A). The two Apostolic Vicars of Syro–Malabar Rite argue just opposite, saying that the convent was constructed by Men TOCD with the money collected in the churches of Syrian Rite for the Syrian Sisters and Postulants.

In view of these arguments, this sacred Forum committed to the

riuscire all'intento; ma indarno, ed eccone le parole; "mi diressi pertanto a Monsignor Mellano, ai due Vicarii Apostolici, e feci sapere che chiunque credesse di aver un interesse nella Questione potrebbe indirizzarsi a questa Delegazione Apostolica esponendo e documentando possibilmente le ragioni, che fosse per produrre a suo favore. Ebbi speranza per un istante, che la questione potesse venir composta *de bono et aequo* qui stesso; ma tosto dovetti per suadermi che ciò era assolutamente impossibile. Le due parti si trovano in campi diametralmente opposti e talmente situate che non mi è stato possibile di ravvicinarle; e quindi obbedendo assai di buon grado agli ordini dell'Eminenza Vostra spedisco alla medesima qui uniti tut i documenti, che mi venne fatto di raccogliere in proposito unitamente al mio debole parere, affinché l'Eminenza Vostra nella sua somma sapienza e nota esperienza delle cose possa tutto esaminare ecc."

Per formarsi un esatto concetto della questione credo indispensabile notare, che nell'anno 1865, o a quella volta, quattro Donne di rito latino ottennero dal Padre Ceriaco da S. Elia primo Priore Generale del Terzo Ordine dei Carmelitani di vestire l'abito del

Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Andrea Aiuti to reconcile this dispute between the two Prelates. He gave momentum to succeed the intent; but in vain, and here are the words: "I said to Msgr. Mellano and to the two Apostolic Vicars and made them to understand that anyone who believed to have an interest in the question would address to this Apostolic Delegation exposing and documenting possibly the reasons that each one has in one's own favour. He had hope for a moment, that the issue could be solved for good and in an equitable manner (*de bono et aequo*) here itself. But soon I had to realize that this was absolutely impossible. The two parties find themselves in diametrically opposed camps and so it was not possible for me to approach them; and therefore very willingly of the orders of your Eminence, I send enclosing along with all the documents that I could collect uniting along with my own humble opinion so that your Eminence in your wisdom and experience of the things would be able to examine everything etc."

To form an exact idea of the question I think it is essential to note, that in the year 1865, or at that time, four women of Latin Rite obtained from Fr.

medesimo Ordine: quindi previo il consenso e le opportune facoltà dell' Ordinario in allora Monsignor Arcivesco Bernardino, si raccolsero insieme nella casa di Suor Elisabetta, una delle medesime quattro Postulanti, vivendo religiosamente come in un Convento; ma non in qualità di professe; poichè non venne a loro data la Regola del detto Terzo Ordine, se non nel Marzo dell'anno 1867 (Alleg. F). A queste quattro Suore si unì un'altra giovane Soriana per nome Suor Chiara, ed abitarono in quella casa per lo spazio di mesi 15. In questo frattempo, cioè nel 1866 (Alleg. D), fabbricavasi il nuovo Convento presso Cunemao, e come tosto potè abitarci, lasciarono la detta casa, e si trasferirono in quello. Ivi ricevuta e professata la Regola incominciarono a ricevere le Postulanti indistintamente tanto quelle di rito latino, quanto quelle di rito Siro-Malabarico, di modo che ora si contano sette Suore di rito latino, e diciannove di rito soriano, ventisette Educande di rito Soriano, ed una di rito latino (Alleg. F).

Per ciò che riguarda la fondazione del convento in discorso, ed il denaro con cui venne fabbricato, l'egregio Monsignor Mellano Arcivescovo di Verapoly nella

Kuriakose Elias, the first Prior General of the Third Order Carmelites of wearing the habit of the same order: so after obtaining consent and appropriate faculty of the then ordinary Msgr. Bernardine, they gathered together in the House of Sr. Elizabeth, one of the four Postulants, living religiously as in a convent; but not in quality of professed sisters; but the Rule of the third order was given to them only in March of the year 1867 (Attached Document F). To these four sisters joined another young Syrian by name Sr. Clara and lived in that house for 15 months. In the meantime, i.e. in 1866 (Attached Document D), constructed the new convent at Koonammavu and they could soon leave that house, and moved into the new one. There they received the rule and made profession and started to receive the postulants indistinctively from those of the Latin Rite, as those Syro-Malabar Rite, in a way that now there are seven sisters of Latin Rite, and nineteen from Syrian Rite, 27 Syrian Boarders, and one from Latin Rite (Attached Document F). Regarding the foundation of the convent in discussion, and the money with which it was constructed, Msgr. Mellano the Archbishop of Verapoly in his

sua lettera 15 Marzo 1889 (Alleg. D) scrive: “Il Padre Leopoldo, Missionario Apostolico, per ordine del mio predecessore Monsig. Bernardino di f.m.nell’anno 1866, avendo quattro postulanti Latine, cioè 1^a Suor Elisabetta, 2^a Suor Anna, 3^a Suor Teresa, 4^a una conversa pure latina fece fabbricare una casa nel palmaro della detta suora Elisabetta, e così fondò il monastero di Cunemao. – non tardò molto ad aggiungervi una Soriana, chiamata Suor Chiara, ora Superiora nel nuovo convento di Muttoli – nella detta casa essendo Priore Suor Elisabetta sopra detta e tutt’ora vivente, vi abitarono per 15 mesi, e vivevano col prodotto dei loro beni, ch’erano più di quattro mila rupie, ed un soccorso mensile che loro dava il mio predecessore Monsig. Bernardino. – la detta Suor Chiara Soriana, non potè aver di dote che cento rupie (100). – Il padre Leopoldo frattando fece fabbricare il presente Monastero con denaro somministratogli da Monsig. Bernardino, e con elemosine, che ebbe da diverse parti. Si sa con certezza, che un latino chiamato Lazzaro in una sol volta ha dato trenta (lire) sterline in oro. Il luogo, dove questo Monastero fu fabbricato consisteva in tre piccoli palmari di Latini, cioè Vattaparambil

letter of 15th March 1889 (Attached Document D) writes: “Fr. Leopold, the Missionary Apostolic, by the order of my predecessor Msgr. Bernardine in the year 1866 taking four Latin Postulants; that is 1. Sr. Elizabeth, 2. Sr. Anna, 3. Sr. Thresia, 4. a convert who is also Latin, constructed a house in *palmero* of Sr. Elizabeth and thus founded the convent at Koonammavu. Not much later added to them a Syrian called Sr. Clara, who is now the superior in the new convent of Mutholy – in the said house, being prioress the above mentioned Sr. Elizabeth who is still alive, they lived for 15 months and lived with their own goods which worth of more than Rs. 4000/- and a monthly help which is given to them my predecessor, Msgr. Bernardine. The above mentioned Syrian Sr. Clara could not have patrimony of Rs. 100/- Meanwhile Fr. Leopold constructed the present convent with the money given by Msgr. Bernardine and with the alms from different parts. It is known with surety that one from Latin Rite called Lazar once alone gave 30 (lire) sterline in gold. The place where this convent was fabricated consisted three small lands belonged to the Latins, that is Vattaparambil

Cacchi, Vattaparambil Cunha Varido nipote di Cacchi, ed un certo Cioladembil Cunhu Varido, nepote di Cachi, ed un certo Cioladeu, i quali a modicissimo prezzo li cedetero colla casa, che vi avevano, per tale oggetto” – Monsignor Vicario Apostolico di Trichur nella sua lett. 27 Gen. 1889 (Alleg. B) dice: “il presente convento fu fabbricato dal Priore Soriano del Convento di Cunemao con denaro raccolto dalle Chiese e dalle congregazioni Soriane....”.

In un'altra sua lettera in data 12 Apr. 1889 (Alleg. C) si esprime in questi termini: “i Terziarii Soriani di Cunemao diedero alle primitive Religiose tre pezzi di terreno del valore di 22,948 puttons equivalenti a Rp. 1,195; che questi tre pezzi furono uniti in uno solo, e che vi fu fabbricato sopra il Monastero. Susseguentemente fu anche dato alle religiose un quarto pezzo di terreno, appartenente ai Terziarii, del valore di 2000 puttons. Le dotti recate dalle religiose ammontarono a 25000 puttons, ossia a 1,302 Rp. La quel somma fu pagata ai Terziarii, e cosi le religiose ebbero in proprietà quei terreni. Gli originali di questo documenti furono stesi dal Missionario P. Leopoldo dell'ordine Carmelitano”. – Lo stesso Monsignor Vicario Ap. Di

Cachi, Vattaparambil Kunju Varid, and a certain Cioladembil Kunju Varid, nephew of Cacchi and a certain Cioladeu, of which in moderate prize the small house which they had for the same purpose.” —Vicar Apostolic of Trichur in his letter on 27 January 1889 (Attached Document B) says: “the present convent was fabricated by the Syrian Prior of the monastery at Koonammau with the money collected from Syrian churches and people and built on a land that belonged to the Syrian men religious.”

In another letter dated 12th April 1889 (Attached Document C) he expresses in these terms: “the men TOCD of Koonammavu had given to the primitive women religious three pieces of land worth of 22,948 puthen which is equivalent to Rs. 1,195/-; these three pieces were put together as one and on that constructed the convent. Consecutively, a fourth piece of land belonged to men TOCD was also given to the women religious worth of 2000 puthen. The patrimonies of the sisters were that of 25000 puthen equal to Rs. 1302/-. That full amount was paid to the Tertiary fathers and thus the sisters possessed those lands. The originals of these documents were same that of

Trichur, e Monsignor Vicario Apostolico di Cottayam per confermare che detto Monastero fu fabbricato coll'elemosine raccolte nelle Chiese Soriane allegano una lettera circolare del Padre Leopoldo Delegato Apostolico di tutti i conventi del Terzo Ordine Carmelitano nel Malabar, nella quale si leggono le seguenti parole: *...interdum etiam aedificium monasterii monialium, quae redoleant ut lilia odorifera virginitatis hoc ipso tempore Rmii D. Archiepiscopi incoeptum, ut vos nostis, iam pervenit usque ad tectum ex eleemosynis Ecclesiarum, Sacerdotum et fidelium ritus Syriaci.* L'Arcivescovo però nella sua lettera in data 2 Apr. 1889 (Alleg. D) afferma non aver mai udito una sola parola dell'esistenza di questa lettera. Quindi così si esprime: "Posto anche che sia vera detta lettera, non vedo ragione alcuna, che possa avere qualche peso nella questione di quel convento, e primieramente perchè un Superiore Ecclesiastico chiede ai suoi sudditi elemosine ed aiuti per le istituzioni che vuol fare, e mai si è udito, che quelli che danno qualche elemosina per tale oggetto, abbiano poi a pretendere parte o tutto di quella Istituzione, anche dato che quelli, che concorrono siano di altro rito, a meno che detta

the missionary Fr. Leopold of Carmelite Order." – The same Vicar Apostolic of Trichur and that of Kottayam in order to confirm that this convent was constructed with the money collected from the Syrian churches attach a circular letter of Fr. Leopold the Apostolic Delegate of all convents of third order Carmelites in the Malabar, in which can be read the following words: "...at the time of our father this Archbishop itself, started the work of the convent in order to spread the fragrance of virginity, the most dearest flower to the Lord. As you know, it was built till the roof by the alms of the churches, clergy and faithful of the Syrian Rite." The Archbishop, Mellano however, in his letter given on 2nd April 1889 (Attached Document D) stated that he had never heard a single word of the existence of this letter. Therefore, thus he expressed: "Supposing that the letter were true, I do not see any reason for giving any weight about the question of the convent, primarily because an ecclesiastical superior could ask his subjects the alms and helps for the institutions that he wishes to erect. However it is never heard that those who had given alms for such a project could claim for a portion or

Istituzione non sia in *limine foundationis* interamente consecrata ed addetta esclusiva a quel rito”.

I prelodati Vicarii Apostolici Soriani fanno considerare ancora, che le doti portate al convento dalle quattro Suore latine formano complessivamente la somma di Rupie 2,788; quelle delle 18 Suore di rito Soriano la somma complessiva di Rupie 11,296, a cui aggiungendo Rupie 2,250 date allo stesso Monastero da una Vedova Soriana, sommano Rup.13,566.

Adiacenti a questo Convento esistono la scuola esterne, ed un grande Orfanotrofio per le Zitelle convertite, o comprate dal gentilesimo, ambedue fatti fabbricare dal zelantissimo Arcivescovo Mellano con denaro datogli a tale scopo da una Signora Italiana; ed ancora questi due stabili sono compresi nella medesima questione.

Il nominato Monsignor Delegato Apostolico nelle Indie Orientali con la relazione di quanto riguarda la questione in discorso non lascia di esprimere il suo parere nei seguenti termini: “Dissi, che se si volesse dire che quel monastero fu qualche cosa, bisognerebbe piuttosto dire che fu Soriano fin dal momento della sua fondazione. Infatti il medesimo fu fabbricato sotto gli auspicii del P. Leopoldo,

whole ownership of that institution, even if they belong to a different Rite. Not least to say that such an institution may in its foundation entirely consecrated and given exclusively to that Rite.”

The above said Syrian Apostolic Vicars considered again, that the patrimonies brought to the convent by the four Latin Sisters form altogether the sum of rupees 2,788; that of the 18 Sisters of the Syrian Rite had the overall sum of rupees, 11,296 to this also added Rs. 2,250/- given to the convent, by a Syrian widow, thus total sum of Rs. 13,566/-.

Adjacent to this convent there exist an external school and a large Orphanage for converted ones, or for those who are brought from the Gentiles. Both these were constructed by the zealous Archbishop Mellano by the money given by an Italian Lady for the same and yet these two buildings are included in the same issue.

The appointed Apostolic Delegate for the East Indies with the report regarding the issue in discussion left it with his opinion in the following terms: “If you wish to say, that convent was belonging to a Rite, it would be said that it was Syrian right from the moment of its foundation. In

Superiore Delegato pei Conventi dei Terziarii, aiutato dal P. Curyacos Elias, Superiore anch'esso dei Terziarii, da varii membri della sua Congregazione, della quale alcuni ecclesiastici raccolsero denaro principalmente tra le chiese e Congregazioni Soriane; e ciò fecero in sequito a lettera sia del P. Leopoldo medesimo, sia dello stesso Padre Curyacos Elias. Oltre di che, abbiamo che il P. Leopoldo stesso facendo appello alle Chiese e Congregazioni Soriane a mezzo della nota lettera Allegato B'''' diceva chiaramente, che domandava aiuto per terminare la costruzione di quell'edificio, che era stato cominciato e tirato innanzi fino a quel punto coll'aiuto di questo doveva per esser condotto a termine''.

Ond'è che io penserei che la via più semplice per risolvere la questione sarebbe quella di prescindere fino ad un certo punto da quel, che si dice e si suppone da ambe le parti intorno alla prima origine e fondazione di quel convento, e di riguardare il medesimo piuttosto tale quale ci si presenta dopo aver ricevuto la sua forma ultima per la Regola datagli da Monsig. Arcivescovo di Verapoli il 19 Marzo 1867. Ora da quell'epoca in qua esso ci si presenta come un istituto misto di Religiose Latine e Soriane con un numero

fact, it was built under the guidance of Fr. Leopold, delegate superior for the monasteries of Tertiary, helped by Fr. Kuriakose Elias, also the superior of the Tertiaries, by different members of his congregation, of which some ecclesiastical authorities collected money principally among the Syrian churches and congregations; and for which prepared letters both by Fr. Leopold and by Fr. Kuriakose Elias. Furthermore, we have the same Fr. Leopold making appeal to Syrian Churches and congregations through the above said letter (Attached document B''') saying clearly that he had asked help for finishing the construction of that building which was being started and till that time had taken their help, had to be finished.''

So that I think the way more simple for resolving the question would be that setting aside to certain point, what is said and supposed by both the parties about the origin and foundation of that convent and to look at the same under which, it is presented after having received its final form for the *Regola* given by the Archbishop of Verapoly, 19th March 1867. From that epoch onwards, it is presented as a mixed institute of Latin and

preponderante di Soriane; e di più vediamo ch'esso esiste sopra un terreno, che è libera proprietà delle Religiose Soriane e si mantiene nella massima parte coi frutti dei beni dotati di queste. E vediamo altresì, che il medesimo fu edificato con denaro dei Soriani; come chiaramente dice il P. Leopoldo in quella sua lettera. E perciò sembra che con tutta verità si possa dire, ch'esso almeno da quell'epoca in quà ci si presenta come, se non del tutto Soriano, almeno assai preponderantemente tale, per modo che si potrebbe asserire che non le Soriane siano state fino ad ora ospiti delle Latine, ma che invece queste lo furono delle Soriane. E quindi, siccome dopo l'erezione dei Vicariati Soriani devesi dare a quell'istituto un carattere decisamente soriano o decisamente latino, e siccome il numero delle Religiose latine è minimo comparativamente a quello delle Soriane, e prendendo pure in considerazione tante altre ragioni estrinseche, le quali militano a favore dei Soriani, converrebbe forse dichiararlo Soriano.

Tanto più che dopo tutto i Latini hanno per le Religiose native del loro rito altri due grandi Conventi, uno in Verapoli, che chiamano catecumenato, e

Syrian religious with a predominant number of Syrians, and in more, we can see that it was existing on a land, which was the free property of the Syrian religious and maintained its major part with the fruit of the patrimony of them. We can also see that it was built with the money of the Syrians, as clearly stated by Fr. Leopold in his letter. Therefore, it seems that with all truth you can say that it is at least from that epoch in which it is presented as, even though not all of Syrian's, at least predominantly was of them, in a way you can assert that the Syrians till this time were not being there as guests of the Latins but the latter were of the Syrians. And therefore, since after the erection of the Syrian vicariates that institute must be given a nature decisively Syrian or decisively Latin, and since the number of the Latin Religious is comparatively minimum to that of Syrians and taking also in consideration many other extrinsic reasons, which are also in favour of the Syrians, it can perhaps declare as of Syrian.

More than that, after all, the Latins have for the native religious of their Rite, other two grand convents, one in Verapoly, which they call catecumenate and the other in

l'altro in Ernakulam, mentre i soriani finora non hanno per le Religiose del loro rito, se non un convento ben piccolo in Muttoli luogo solitario, remoto e cattivo, che si trova nel Vicariato di Kottayam, e che io stesso vidi testè all'occasione della mia visita nel Malabar. Se non si lasciasse loro il Monastero di cunemao, crederebero probabilmente di aver ragione di dire, che Verapoli non ha fatto nulla per le loro Religiose, e che si è servito di tutti i denari e le collette fatte per monasteri a favore delle Religiose di rito Latino. I due Vicarii Apostolici in varie occasioni mi hanno fatto intendere più o meno chiaramente, che se quel monastero venisse, malgrado tutti i reclami dei Soriani, aggiudicato ai Latini, quelli sarebbero oltremodo malcontenti. Ed ultimamente sia a voce, che in iscritto mi hanno assicurato che tante il Clero Regolare, che quello Secolare, come pure i semplici laici soriani sarebbero oltremodo addolorati, se dopo aver perduto due grandi edificii, come sono quello del Seminario di Puthenpally e quello del Convento dei Terziarii di Cunemao avessero, a perdere anche quello, che sta in questione; e perciò pregano instantemente che, quando anche le ragioni per aggiudicare ai

Ernakulum, while the Syrians till now have none for the religious of their Rite, except a small one in Mutholy a solitary, remote and not good place which is seen in the Vicariate of Kottayam, and I myself have seen that at the occasion of my visit in Malabar. If you do not leave them the convent at Koonammavu, I believe, probably they have the reason of saying that Verapoly has done nothing for their religious and that they have served all the money and the collections did for the convent in favour of the religious of Latin Rite. The two Apostolic vicars in different occasions have made me understand more or less clearly, that if that convent comes in spite of all reclaims of the Syrians, judged to the Latins that will be in other way discontent. And finally both in voice and in written form they have assured me that the clergy both religious and that of secular as well as the lay Syrians would be other way in distress, if after having lost two grand buildings, as that of the Seminary at Puthenpally and that of the Tertiary at Koonammavu, to lose also this one which is in question. Therefore, they request insistently that although the reasons for judging the institute to the Syrians in words would

Soriani l'Istituto in parola fossero per essere riputate insufficienti, la S. Sede voglia fare ogni sforzo per vedere di aggiudicarlo ai Soriani.

L'Istituto, aggiudicato che fosse ai Soriani, dovrebbe naturalmente rimanere sotto la giurisdizione del Vicariato Apostolico nel quale si trova, cioè sotto la giurisdizione di Mons. Medlycott; però dovrebbe servire ai due Vicariati, come casa di Noviziato e come luogo centrale per l'educazione delle ragazze Soriane; e, ad evitare qualsiasi possibilità di eventuale differenza d'opinioni tra i due Vicarii Apostolici, sarebbe forse bene di far menzione di questo punto nella decisione della S. Sede, quante volte questa fosse per esser nel senso indicato.

Per quel che concerne la scuola, (che a quanto io sappia non è che un gran camerone nell'entrata della clausura), e l'orfanotrofio, che sono annessi al monastero converrebbe probabilmente che seguissero la giurisdizione del convento.

Così pure le Suore Latine, le quali desiderassero di rimanere in quel monastero, potrebbero forse in via d'eccezione esservi lasciate come pure sembra si dovrebbe permettere di portare seco la loro dote a quelle, le quali desiderassero di passare nel monastero di Ernakulam; e se si credesse opportuno Latine,

be insufficient, the holy see must be done each effort for judging it to the Syrians.

The institute being judged to the Syrians, must be remain naturally under the jurisdiction of the vicar apostolic in which it is situated, that is under the jurisdiction of Msgr. Medlycott; but must serve for the two vicariates, as house of Novitiate and as central place for the education of the Syrian girls; and to avoid any possibility of eventual difference of opinions between the two Apostolic Vicars, it would be good to make mention of this point in the decision of the Holy See, how many times this was for being in indicated sense.

For that which concerns the school (as I know it is not a grand *camerone* in the entrance of the cloister), and the orphanage they are annexed to the convent and probably may follow the jurisdiction of the convent.

Thus also the Latin sisters, who wish to remain in that convent, could be perhaps in way of exception can be left there and those who wish to go to the convent at Ernakulam must be allowed to take their patrimony; and the patrimony of the sister who died there, must remain to that institute and it is same with the patrimony of those Latin

che fossero per avventura già morte in quel monastero, dovesse rimanere all'Istituto medesimo e che la stessa sorte dovrebbe avere la dote di quelle Suore Latine, le quali volessero continuare in quel convento.

Avverto che il Nidhiry, quando parla della dote portata dalla Suora Anna al monastero, lo fa secondo il valore assoluto della stima a cui si riferisce il documento, e che invece Monsig. Medlycott, quando parla della medesima dote, la considera secondo il suo valor nominale, cioè secondo quel valore, che essa ebbe dopo che i terreni, sui quali era fondata, erano stati migliorati”.

Esposto in tutta la sua integrità lo stato della presente questione, prima di umiliare alle EE. VV. Il mio subordinato parere ricercatomi dall'Illmo e Rmo Monsiig. Segretario per commissione di Sua Eminenza il Sig. Cardinal Prefetto, stimo necessario fare considerare, che non sono le Suore Terziarie, che si contendono tra loro il dominio del Monastero in parola, neppure accennano a malcontento o discordia, nè a volontà di separarsi tra loro: poichè niuna petizione, e niuno reclamo delle dette Suore si ha su di ciò; che anzi Monsignor Arcivescovo di Verapoly assicura (Alleg. D) che dopo la decisione di questa vertenza possono elleno restare

sisters who wish to continue in that convent.

Nidhiry, when speaks of the patrimony brought by Sr. Anna to the convent, does it according to the absolute value of estimate he refers in the document and where as Msgr. Medlycott when he speaks of the same, he considers it according to its nominal value, that is according to that value which it has after making the land on which it was founded, improved”.

Exposed in all its integrity the state of this issue, before presenting to your Eminence, my humble opinion which is asked me by Msgr. Secretary for the commission of your Eminence Cardinal Prefect, I need to consider, that it is not the Tertiary sisters who compete for dominance of their convent in words; they do not even hint at discontent or dissension, nor at will to separate between them. No petition, no claim have made by these sisters on this issue; As Msgr. Mellano, the Archbishop of Verapoly ensures (Attached Document D) that after the decision of this dispute, they can remain as before. To decide the question that arose between the three Prelates on the convent and those sisters it is out of the purpose to pay attention to the money which

come prima. Per decidere adunque la questione insorta tra i lodati tre Prelati del Malabar è fuori di proposito far attenzione alle somme, che le suore tanto Latine che Soriane portarono come dote al Convento.

L'oggetto principale della presente questione è la giurisdizione, che i tre zelantissimi nominati Prelati si contendono su quel Convento, e su quelle Suore. Dico principale, perchè Eglino per provare doversi aggiudicare all'uno, piuttosto che all'altro, la predetta giurisdizione adducono il diritto di proprietà per averlo fondato. È necessario adunque qui esaminare a chi di loro per diritto di fondazione appartiene la proprietà di quel Monastero: che se per questo titolo a niuno dei medesimi appartiene; fa dopo esaminare se in *lumine foundationis* del medesimo Monastero sia stata posta la condizione, che dovesse servire esclusivamente per uno dei detti due riti; ovvero che dovesse essere sempre soggetto alla giurisdizione dell'Arcivescovo di Verapoly. Se poi niuno a di queste condizioni venne fatta, si dovrà in tal caso procedere a decidere la presente questione col diritto comune.

Per conoscere quindi se nel detto Breve *Quod iampridem*, con cui venne fatta la divisione di quella regione e l'erezione dei due

the sisters both Latin and Syrians have brought as dowry to the convent.

The main object of the present question is the jurisdiction that the three named Prelates demand on that convent, and on those Sisters. It is the issue of jurisdiction that decides the right of the ownership of the convent. Therefore it is necessary to examine to whom among them by the right of foundation pertains the ownership of the convent. By this title the ownership pertains to none of them. One has to examine in the light of the foundation of the convent, whether it is posited as a condition that it should exclusively serve one of the two Rites. Of course the convent was subjected to the jurisdiction of the Archbishop of Verapoly. If none of the conditions were made, then one has to proceed to decide the present question under the common Law.

To know then, if in the Brief *Quod iampridem*, with which the division of that region and the erection of two Vicariates were made, has some dispositions, what exception of the dispositions of the common law, I put before your very Eminence, the operative part of that in brief. Here is the text: "Therefore by the Motu Proprio

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Vicariati, fosse qualche disposizione, quale eccezione delle disposizioni del diritto comune, pongo sotto gli occhi dell'EE.VV. la parte dispositiva del medesimo Breve. Eccone le testuali parole: <i>“Itaque motu proprio, alque ex certa scientia et matura deliberatione Nostris, praesentium vi mandamus, ut peracta rituali separatione catholicorum Syro-Malabarensium a latinis, duo pro illis constituentur Vicariatus Apostolici committendi Episcopis Latinis, qui sibi assumant Vicarium Generalem Syro-Malabarensis privilegio condecorandum exercendi proprio ritu pontificalia, et confirmationis sacramentum, chrismate tamen ab Episcopo consecrato, conferendi; nec non alios quatuor viros ecclesiasticos eiusdem gentis et ritus elegant, quorum consilio in omnibus ecclesiasticis negotiis utantur. Insuper praecipimus ut praedictorum Vicariatuum Apostolicorum territorialis divisione fiat per naturales limites fluminis – Alavay – quod ab urbe – Maleatar – Malabaricam regionem intersecat, usque ad mare prope urbem – Cochin – ita ut primus Vicariatus sit septentrionalis cum ordinaria residentia Apostolici Vicarii in urbe – Trichoor – unde appellationem sumet; alter sit meridionalis cum ordinaria</i></p> | <p>and from the concrete and certain knowledge and our mature deliberation and by the force of the things Presented we decree that having completed the separation of the Syrians from the Latins according to the Rite, two vicariates are constituted for the Syrians that are to be entrusted to the Latin Bishop. And they shall take a Vicar General from the Syrians with the privilege of exercising the pontifical of the Syrian Rite of confirmation, for the ordination of a priest consecrated bishop is needed. Besides four ecclesiastical persons of the Syrian Rite are to be elected whose advice in the administration of the ecclesiastical matters is necessary. Besides we decree that the boundaries of the aforesaid vicariates are natural boundaries. One is river Alway which crosses the Malayattoor town till the sea near the Cochin so that the Vicariate shall be of the northern region with the residence of the Apostolic Vicar in Trichur from which it shall take its name. The second shall be the southern. The residence of the Vicar Apostolic shall be in the town of Kottayam from which it takes its title. Nothing shall contradict this letter. It shall be firm, valid and effective in all</p> |
|--|--|

residentia proprii Vicarii Apostolici in urbe – Cottayam – a qua nomen accipiet. Decernentes praesentes Litteras firmas validas et efficaces semper existere et fore, suosque plenarios et integros effectus sortiri et obtinere, ac illis ad quos spectat, et pro tempore quomodolibet spectabit, in omnibus et per omnia plenissime suffragari, et irritum esse et inane si secus super his a quoquam, quavis auctoritate, scienter vel ignoranter, contigerit attentari. Non obstantibus Constitutionibus etc.” Ognuno vede che in questo Breve non si fa riserva, ed eccezione alcuna; per cui quella divisione ed erezione dei due Vicariati devono sottostare alle regole del diritto comune; consequentemente con le stesse regole si devono definire le questioni che ora insorgono in quella regione. Premesse queste, a mio avviso, necessarie osservazioni, dico:

§.1

A niuno dei tre nominati Prelati appartiene per diritto di fondazione la proprietà e dominio del Monastero in questione. Non vi ha dubbio, che un Prelato ritiene la proprietà o dominio di un luogo Pio per diritto di fondazione, quando Egli con peculio della sua mensa, o con peculio suo particolare erige dalle

its dealings etc.” Everyone sees that in this Brief, it is not made any reservation and exception; for which that division and erection of two Vicariates must submit to the rules of the common law; Accordingly with the same rules one must define the issues that now arises in that region. These being allowed, let me say the necessary observations in my perception.

§.1

None of the three nominated Prelates hold for the right of foundation, the property and dominion of the convent in question. There is no doubt that one prelate retains ownership or domain of the Pious place for right of Foundation, none has with his savings for mess or with proper savings established or erected foundation for the same pious place: rather, when he with the peculiarity of his mess, or with the peculiarity of his particular erect from the foundation of the same pious place: it is right when the Pious place founded by one or more particular persons with proper peculiarity, these give him the same properties, now Msgr. Mellano the Archbishop of Verapoly not founded the convent in discourse with proper peculiarity; so too, he in his documents does not mention

fondamenta il medesimo luogo pio: ovvero quando il luogo Pio fondato da una o più persone particolari con proprio peculio, queste gliene cedono la medesima proprietà, ora Monsignor Mellano Arcivescovo di Verapoly non fondò il convento in discorso con proprio peculio; poichè Egli nei suoi documenti non ne fa parola alcuna. Neppure lo fondò il suo Antecessore Monsignor Bernardino con peculio proprio o della mensa: poichè quantunque l'egregio Arcivescovo Mellano nella sua lettera (Alleg. D) affermi: "il Padre Leopoldo frattanto fece fabbricare il presente Monastero con denaro somministratogli da Monsignor Bernardino" non pertanto non lo prova con alcun documento. Egli è vero che nell'altra sua lettera (Alleg. D) scrive: "Trovo pure nel libro dei conti del mio predecessore Monsignor Bernardino queste precise parole: Al P. Leopoldo per Cunemao e Monastero date Rupie 500, e nello stesso anno 1867 al convento delle nostre Terziarie in Cunemao Rup. 61". Ma si deve riflettere che nell'anno 1867, quando l'Arcivescovo diede al padre Leopoldo le dette 561 Rupie, la fabbrica di quel Monastero era già arrivata al tetto, come si legge nella lettera circolare dello stesso Padre Leopoldo Delegato

any word about it. Even it was not founded by his Predecessor Msgr. Bernardine with proper peculiarity or of the mess. However, Archbishop Mellano in his letter (Attached Document D) says: "Meanwhile Fr. Leopold constructed the present convent with the money given by Msgr. Bernardine," however does not prove with any document. It is true that in his another letter (Attached Document D) he writes: "I find it also in the book of accounts of my predecessor Msgr. Bernardine these precise words: to Fr. Leopold for Koonammavu and monastery (convent?) is given Rs. 500/-, and that same year 1867 to the convent of our Tertiary in Koonammavu Rs. 61/-." But one must reflect that in the year 1867, when the Archbishop gave to Fr. Leopold the said amount Rs. 561/-, the construction of that convent had already arrived to the roof, as one reads in the circular letter of Fr. Leopold the apostolic delegate of all convents of the Tertiary Carmelites in Malabar; Here are the words: *Ut vos nostis aedificium monasterii iam pervenit usque ad elemosynis Ecclesiarum, ex tectum sacerdotum, et fidelium riitus Syriaci* (Attached Document B). One can still reflect again

Apostolico di tutti i Conventi dei Terziarri Carmelitani nel Malabar; eccone le parole: “Ut vos nostis aedificium monasterii iam pervenit usque ad tectum ex elemosynis Ecclesiarum, sacerdotum, et fidelium riitus Syriaci” (Alleg. B). Si rifletta ancora che le cinquecento Rupie furono date da Monsignor Bernardino al P. Leopoldo PER CUNEMAO E MONASTERO; ciò fa credere che questa somma sia stata divisa parte per Cunemao, e parte pel monastero. Non si può dire pertanto che quel Monastero sia stato fondato col denaro somministrato da Monsignor Bernardino.

Inoltre concesso pure, che Monsignor Bernardino abbia dato l'intera somma di Rup. 561 per la fabbrica del Monastero in questione; Egli dunque avrebbe dato circa la nona parte del valore di quel fabbricato: perchè lo stesso Arcivescovo Mellano nella sua lettera in data 2 Aprile 1889 (Alleg. D) scrive: “Nel libro dei conti di detto Monastero di Cunemao, scritto sotto l'ispirazione del P. Leopoldo, trovasi scritto così. “Questo Monastero costò Rupie 4500, elemosine dei fedeli in generale, tanto Latini che Soriani, non nominando però la somma ricevuta dal detto mio predecessore”.

Niuno al certo potrà dire, che sia padrone di tutto il Monastero

that the five hundred Rupees was given by Msgr. Bernadine to Fr. Leopold for KOONAMMAVU AND MONASTERY; It makes to believe that this sum was divided and part of it to Koonammavu and part for the monastery (convent). It cannot be said therefore that the monastery (convent) was founded with money given by Msgr. Bernadine.

Also if it is agreed that Msgr. Bernadine has given the entire sum of Rs. 561/- for the construction of the convent; he would have given about 1/9th of the value of that construction: because the same Archbishop Mellano in his letter of 2nd April 1889 (Attached Document D) writes: “in the accounts book of the above said convent of Koonammavu, under the inspiration of Fr. Leopold thus has been written: ‘this convent did cost Rs/ 4500, alms of the faithful in general, more Latins than that of Syrians, however, without naming the sum received from my predecessor.”

No one can with certainty say that those who have administered 1/9th of the construction of the convent as the patron of the whole convent; but you can rightly say that they have contributed along with others to the

colui, che ha somministrato la sola nona parte per la fabbrica del medesimo Monastero: Ma si può lero dire giustamente, che costui abbia contribuito unitamente agli altri alla fabbrica in parola. Quindi a Monsig. Bernardino si può, si deve applicare la massima che insegna lo stesso prelodato Arcivescovo Mellano, il quale nella su indicata lettera (Alleg. D) così la discorre: “mai si è udito, che quelli che danno qualche elemosina per tale oggetto, abbiamo poi a pretendere parte o tutto di quella Istituzione, anche dato che quelli, che concorrono siano di altro rito, a meno che detta Istituzione non sia in *limine foundationis* interamente consecrata ed addetta esclusiva a quel rito. Questo principio mi pare debba ammettersi come certissimo. Posto ciò la lettera del P. Leopoldo a nulla serve per la presente questione, anche dato che sia vera l’espressione della stessa, ciò che potrà meglio giudicarsi da quanto dirò più sotto. Secondo il principio posto ne segue necessariamente, che i Conventi, specialmente quello di Mannanam, benchè fabricati con elemosine pure raccolte dai Padri Latini e Soriani, come tutto il Malabar conosce, non hanno mai pensato a chieder parte di quello. Così per tutti gli altri, specialmente pel Carmelo,

construction literally. Therefore to Msgr. Bernardine they can and they must apply, the maximum that said by the same above mentioned Archbishop Mellano, about which in the above indicated letter (Attached document D) thus he examines: “never he has heard that those who give some alms for an institute, have claim to take part or whole of that institution, also it is given by those who belong to other Rite, unless the said institute belongs entirely to other Rite in *limine foundationis* entirely consecrated and exclusively offered to that Rite. It seems to me that this principle must put with certainty. That placed letter of Fr. Leopold serves for nothing for the present question; even if the given expressions are true, that can be judged better what I say below. According to the placed principle, it does not follow necessarily that the convents, especially that of Mannanam, though constructed also with alms collected from Latin and Syrian Fathers as the whole Malabar knows, they never thought of asking part of that. So for all others, especially for Carmel, convent and church, Ambazhakkattu, Arnatucare and seminaries, from Verapoli has given abundantly and you demand nothing.” Being truly so, each

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Convento e Chiesa, Ambalacatto, Arnatucaré e Seminari, da Verapoli si è somministrato abbondantemente, e nulla si domanda.” Essendo veramente così, ognuno si avvisa potersi giuridicamente concludere, che se Monsig. Bernardino contribuì ancora esso con l’oblazione di Rupie 561 per fabbricare il Monastero in parola, non per questo aveva il diritto di ripetere in tutto, ad in parte quel Monastero; per conseguenza neppure Monsig. Mellano successore di lui ha diritto di ripetere in tutto od in parte il detto Monastero.</p> <p>A questo ottimo Prelato neppure appartiene la proprietà e dominio dell’Orfanotrofio e scuola adiacenti al detto Monastero. Imperocchè Egli nella sua lettera in data 24 Novembre 1888 (Alleg. A) dice: “a questo Monastero è pure unita la fiorente scuola esterna e l’Orfanatrfio FATTO CON DANARO A ME DATO da una Signora d’Italia a QUESTO FINE, CIOÈ PER SALVARE LE ZITELLE DAL GENTILESIMO ED EDUCARLE, e già molte furono educate e maritate; ed ora ve ne esistono (56) cinquantasei, già battezzate”. Si rifletta bene: la Signora Italiana diede a Monsignor Mellano il denaro, non già affinché l’erogasse come</p> | <p>one will be able to legally conclude that if Msgr. Bernardine contributed Rs. 561/- to construct the convent literally (with the oblation), for that he had no right to demand part or whole of that convent; consequently Msgr. Mellano, his successor also has no right to claim the whole or part of the said convent.</p> <p>To this great Prelate even belongs the property and domain of the orphanage and school adjacent to the said convent. In his letter dated 24 November 1888 (Attached Document A) he says: “to this convent is united an external school and the orphanage WHICH IS BUILT BY THE MONEY GIVEN TO ME BY AN ITALIAN LADY WITH THE SAME INTENTION; THAT IS TO SAVE THE CHILDREN FROM THE PAGANS AND TO EDUCATE THEM; and many have been already educated and married; and now exist 56, already baptized.” It reflects well that the Italian lady gave money to Msgr. Mellano, not for distributing as he would have liked, but for that determined purpose, i.e. to build the Orphanage FOR SAVING THE SPINSTERS FROM THE GENTILES AND EDUCATING THEM etc. The zealous Archbishop precisely</p> |
|--|--|

gli avrebbe piaciuto, ma per quel determinato scopo, di erigere cioè quell'Orfanotrofio PER SALVARE LE ZITELLE DAL GENTILESIMO ED EDUCARLE ecc.

Il zelantissimo Arcivescovo eseguì puntualmente la volontà di quella Donna, come agnun vede. Ma potrà dirsi forse, che il nominato Arcivescovo sia divenuto padrone di quel denaro, per conseguenza padrone di quell'Orfanotrofio per ciò stesso, perchè eseguì la volontà della prefata Donna? Nò al certo. Neppure può dirsi, che la detta donna resterebbe defraudata della sua intenzione se la giurisdizione di quell'Orfanotrofio passasse ad altro Prelato; perchè niuna condizione Ella fece a questo riguardo. Neppure viene alterato minimamente lo scopo che Ella si prefisse; essendo le medesime Suore le Maestre e le Direttrici dell'Orfanotrofio e Scuola; essendo ancora le zitelle di quelle stesse parti, che vengono salvate dal Gentilissimo, ed educate ed istruite. Niuno pertanto ignora che in tali fondazioni, quando non si fa alcuna riscondizione, si attende solamente allo scopo inteso dal fondatore, ed alle persone in favore delle quali viene fatta la fondazione.

2^o. Neppure col peculio particolare dei due Vicarii

performed the will of that lady, as everyone sees. But can you say perhaps that the Archbishop has become master of that money, therefore master of that Orphanage for the very reason that he executed the will of that woman? Certainly No. Neither can be said, that the woman would be deprived of her intention if the jurisdiction of the Orphanage passes to another Prelate; because no condition she did to this regard. Not even be altered minimally the purpose that she preferred; being the same sisters the teachers and directresses of the orphanage and school; being again the spinsters of those same parts, who are saved from the gentiles, and educated and instructed. Therefore, no one ignores that in these foundations, when one does not make any reconsideration; one expects only the purpose intended by the founder, and persons in whose favour being done the Foundation.

2^o. Not even with any special particularity the two Apostolic Vicars were founded the same convent; as there not yet existed the two Vicariates, and the two Prelates have never stated this. They say that it was founded by Fr. Kuriakose of St. Elias, the first Prior General of the Tertiary Carmelites assisted by the other Tertiary religious

Apostolici venne fondato il medesimo Monastero; poichè non ancora esistevano i due Vicariati, nè i due Prelati hanno mai ciò affermato. Dicono bensì che quello venne fondato dai P. Ceriaco da S. Elia primo Priore Generale dei Terziari Carmelitani coadiuvato d'altri Religiosi Terziarii segnatamente dal P. Leopoldo con denaro raccolto nelle Chiese e Congregazioni Soriane; ma questo non li suffraga punto per arrogarsene la proprietà, come vedremo nel §III.

3^o Finalmente nei documenti adottati dall'Arcivescovo Mellano, e dai due Vicarii Apostolici non si legge che tutti coloro, che in *limine foundationis* contribuirono con oblazioni ed elemosine alla fondazione del Monastero, abbiano fatto parola, o dimostrato in altra maniera che la proprietà di quello fosse devoluta all' Arcivescovo di Verapoly, o ad altro Prelato.

Resta dunque a conchiudersi che a niuno dei tre nominati Prelati appartiene per diritto di fondazione la proprietà e dominio del monastero in questione.

§ II

Il Monastero, di cui si parla, non fu eretto esclusivamente per le Suore di un rito; nè Monsig. Bernardino in *limine foundationis* pose alcuna condizione in suo favore; conseguentemente per

particularly by Fr. Leopold with money collected from the churches and Syrian congregations; but this is not a support point for taking the property as their own, as we shall see in section III.

3^o Finally in documents given by Archbishop Mellano, and the two Apostolic Vicars, one does not read that all those who *limine foundationis* contributed with donations and alms to the foundation of the convent, had done literally or showed in other way that the ownership of that may be given to the Archbishop of Verapoly, or to the other Prelate.

It remains therefore to conclude that to none of the three appointed Prelates belong according to the Law of Foundation the ownership and dominion of the convent in question.

§ II

The convent mentioned was not built solely for the sisters of a Rite; Neither Msgr. Bernardine in *limine foundationis* put some conditions in his favour; Consequently for this title, to none of the three appointed Prelates belong the jurisdiction of the same convent.

1^o It was not built exclusively for the sisters and postulants of the Latin Rite, as it is clearly shown by the letter of Archbishop Mellano given in

questo titolo a niuno dei tre nominati Prelati appartiene la giurisdizione sul medesimo Monastero.

1^o non venne eretto esclusivamente per le Suore e Postulanti di rito latino, come chiaramente si deduce dalla lettera di Monsignor Mellano in data 24 Novembre 1888 (Alleg. A). Si notino le parole. Egli scrive: “Questo Monastero, vicino a Cunemao, fu fondato da quattro Native, due delle quali furono le prime Superiore, ed una chiamata Suor Teresa di Gegù, per la sua capacità rieletta più volte, e da esse fondato nella propria casa cedendo anche il terreno contiguo, ma dopo fu riedificato nelle vicinanze di questo primo, come luogo più conveniente.

Per dar luogo anche alle giovani di rito Soriano, che avessero la vocazione di consacrarsi a Dio in tale stato, furono e dal mio Antecessore e da me pure ricevute delle Soriane e così formarono un solo corpo ed un solo Monastero”. Il Monastero riedificato è quello, di cui si questiona. Questo, come ne assicura l'accennato degnissimo Prelato, fu edificato PER DAR LUOGO ANCHE ALLE GIOVANI DI RITO SORIANO, CHE AVESSERO LA VOCAZIONE DI CONSACRARSÌ A DIO IN TALE STATO. Dunque è chiaro

24th November 1888 (Attached Document A). Note the words.

He writes: “This convent nearby Koonammavu has founded by 4 natives, two among them were the first superiors; and one called Sr. Theresa of Jesus, for her capacity was re-elected many times and by themselves founded the proper house in their own land but little later it was re-built nearby the first one as a more convenient place.

To give place also for the young ones in Syrian Rite, to lead a consecrated life in this state, my predecessor and I received the Syrians and thus being formed as a single body and one monastery.” The rebuilt convent is that which is here in question. This as ensured by the most Rev. Prelate, was built FOR GIVING PLACE ALSO TO THE YOUNGSTERS OF THE SYRIAN RITE, TO LEAD A CONSECRATED LIFE IN THIS STATE. Therefore it is clear that the convent in discussion was built not only for the youngsters in Latin Rite, but also to receive the Syrian girls, who would have the vocation to embrace that Institute. And one cannot doubt: because the same Msgr. Mellano says (Attached Document D) that Archbishop Bernardine his predecessor was

che il Monastero in discorso non fu edificato solamente per le giovani di rito Latino, ma ancora per ricevere le giovani Soriane, che avrebbero avuto vocazione di abbracciare quell'Istituto.

E non può dubitarsene: perchè lo stesso Monsignor Mellano dice (Alleg. D) che monsignor Bernardio suo antecessore fece fabbricare questo Monastero. Ed Egli stesso ricevè le Soriane "furono e dal mio Antecessore. E da me ricevute". Ora è massima dei legisperiti *Observantia proxima fundationi, et maxime si ex facto ipsius fundatoris oriatur, illius voluntatem optime declarat, Sac. Romana Rota decis. 166 n. 43 par. 8 recen.e decis 365 n. 5 par. 17, Mantic. De coniect. Lib. 3 tit. 1 n. 7.* Dunque era volontà di Monsignor Bernardino, che il detto Monastero venisse eretto ancora per le giovani Soriane.

Viene ciò confermato dalle seguenti parole "COSI FORMARONO UN SOLO CORPO". Ma chi non sa, che i monasteri, che si erigono con l'elemosine ed oblazioni dei fedeli, come questo di cui si parla, vengono eretti non per le persone in particolare, ma per il corpo morale; e per conseguenza appartengono all'intero corpo morale, e non già all'individuo? Se dunque le Soriane formarono un solo corpo con le Suore Latine, ne segue che il

built this convent. And he himself received the Syrians "my predecessor and I received the Syrians." Now it is maximum of the *legisperiti Observantia proxima fundationi, et maxime si ex facto ipsius fundatoris oriatur, illius voluntatem optime declarat, Sac. Romana Rota decis. 166 n. 43 par. 8 recen.e decis 365 n. 5 par. 17, Mantic. De coniect. Lib. 3 tit. 1 n. 7.* So it was the will of Archbishop Bernardine, that the said convent was built also for the young Syrians.

This is confirmed by the following words, "THUS FORMED ONLY ONE BODY." But who does not know that the convents, which are built with the alms and donations of the faithful, as the case of this one, are built not for persons in particular, but for the moral body; and therefore belong to the entire moral body and not to the individual? If, however, the Syrians formed one body with the Latin nuns, it follows that the convent was built also for them.

It is true that the same Archbishop in his other letter dated 2nd April 1889 (Attached Document D) attempted to correct this just inference by saying: "they have then also put the young Syrians, it is not an accidental thing which in no

Monastero venne eretto ancora per esse loro.

Vero è, che il prefato Arcivescovo nell'altra sua lettera 2 Aprile 1889 (Alleg. D) tentò di prevenire questa giusta illazione con dire: "Che siano poscia ammesse anche delle giovani Soriane, non è che una cosa accidentale, che in nulla muta la natura primitiva dell'Istituto, tanto più che non si servono, che della lingua malabarica in tutto". Io però con pace dell'eccellentissimo Prelato mi permetto di soggiungere, che per il caso nostro l'ammissione delle giovani Soriane sarebbe stata cosa accidentale, se le dette giovani Soriane, coll'entrare e vestire l'abito di quelle Suore Terziare fossero passate al rito Latino; ma non già rimanendo nel rito siriano, come le suore latine nel rito nel rito Soriano, come le suore latine nel rito Latino, e formarono ad un tempo un solo corpo mediate una vita commune religiosa, e mediante unità di lingua nell'ufficio, nelle orazioni, nella lettura; ed in ogni altra cosa.

"Voluntas factis potius, quam verbis comprobatur seu declaratur" come comunemente insegnano i dottori; de Luca lib. 12 par. 2 de Benef. disc. 86 n. 7. Quel Monastero adunque non venne eretto solamente per le giovani Latini, ma indistintamente ancora per le

way changes the primitive nature of the Institute, especially since they do not serve, that the language of Malabar in everything". However, with peace of the most excellent Prelate I might add, that for our case the admission of the young Syrians would have been an accidental thing, if the said young Syrians with entering and putting on the habit of the Tertiary sisters were passed to Latin Rite; but (not) already remained in the Syrian Rite, as the Latin sisters in the Latin Rite, and formed at the same time only one body through a common religious life, and through the unity of language in office, in prayers, in reading; and in every other things. This unity of language and the life reveal to us that the foundation of this convent cannot proposes to this or that Rite; but uniquely to form a family of Tertiary Carmelite religious united with the bond of a *Regola*, of a style of life, of a language in the cult of Holy God and in every other things: *"Voluntas potius quam, factis verbis comprobatur seu declaratur"* as commonly teach doctors; de Luca lib. 12 par. 2 de Bene. disc. 86 n. 7. That convent however was not built solely for young Latins, but without any distinction for the young of other Rite, which

giovani di altro rito, che avessero voluto abbracciare quell'istituto.

Maggiormente si manifesta non poter essere altrimenti, se si considera, che Suor Chiara Soriana venne da Monsignor Bernardino ricevuta ed annoverata tra le quattro Suore Latine, quando queste abitavano nella casa di Suor Elisabetta, in cui dimorarono 15 mesi; e frattanto si fabbricava il Monastero in parola. Ecco a questo proposito come si esprime lo stesso Arcivescovo Mellano nella sua Lettera 15 Marzo 1889 (Alleg. D): "Il P. Leopoldo, Missionario Apostolico, per ordine del mio predecessore Monsig. Bernardino di f.m. nell'anno 1866 avendo quattro postulanti Latine, ... fece fabbricare una casa nel palmaro della Suora Elisabetta, e così fondò il Monastero di Cunemao.

Non tardò molto ad aggiungersi una Soriana, chiamata Suor Chiara, ora Superiora nel nuovo Convento di Muttoli.

Nella detta casa, essendo Priora Suor Elisabetta sopra detta e tutt'ora vivente, vi abitarono per 15 mesi... Il Padre Leopoldo FRATTANTO (cioè nell' anno 1867) FECE FABBRICARE IL PRESENTE MONASTERO".

Questo adunque come si fabbricava per quelle quattro Suore Latine, così fabbricavasi

wanted to embrace that institute.

Mainly it is manifested, it cannot be otherwise, if one considers that the Syrian Sr. Clara comes by Msgr. Bernardine and received and numbered among the four Latin Sisters when they lived in the house of Sr. Elizabeth, where they dwelt for 15 months; and meanwhile the convent was being built literally. To this the same Archbishop Mellano in his letter of 15 March 1889 (Attached Document D), thus expressed: "Fr. Leopold, the Missionary Apostolic, by the order of my predecessor Msgr. Bernardine in the year 1866 taking four Latin Postulants....constructed a house in palmaro of Sr. Elizabeth and thus founded the convent at Koonammavu.

Not much later added to them a Syrian called Sr. Clara, who is now the superior in the new convent of Mutholy.

In the said house, being prioress the above mentioned Sr. Elizabeth who is still alive, they lived for 15 months ... MEANWHILE FR. LEOPOLD (that is in the year 1867) CONSTRUCTED THE PRESENT CONVENT"

This then, as it is built for that four Latin sisters, in the same way it is also built for the Syrian Sr. Clara; you went in

ancora per Suor Chiara Soriana; vi andò difatto con le altre quattro: quindi vennero ricevute delle altre Soriane. Il che chiaramente manifesta, che non si escludevano le giovani di rito Soriano, e per conseguenza quel Monastero non veniva fabbricato per le sole giovani di rito Latino. Da ultimo non costa affatto, anzi neppure si fa parola nei presentati documenti che monsignor Bernardino in *limine foundationis* abbia posto condizione o riserva di sorta in suo favore. Dunque al degnissimo Arcivescovo Mellano per questo titolo non appartiene alcuna giurisdizione sul Monastero e sulle Suore in parola.

2^o Neppure può affermarsi che il Monastero in questione sia stato fabbricato esclusivamente per le giovani Soriane. Le ragioni, che i due Vicarii Apostolici, ed i Soriani adducono in contrario, sono: 1^o perchè il Monastero fu fondato dal P. Priore Soriano Generale dei Terziarii Carmelitani coadiuvato d'altri Religiosi della medesima Congregazione, i quali certamente non avrebbero preso tale impegno, se il Monastero non doveva servire per le sole giovani Soriane. 2^o perchè il medesimo Monastero fu fondato sul terreno dei Soriani, e questo nel Malabar rivela che il fine di questa fondazione fu per

fact to the other four: there you are received by other Syrians also. This clearly shows that they were not excluding the young Syrians, and consequently that convent was not built only for the youngsters of the Latin Rite.

Finally, it does not cost anything, but there is no word in the documents presented that Msgr. Bernardine in *limine foundationis* has placed condition or reservation whatsoever in his favour. Therefore to the most Rev. Archbishop Mellano for this title does not belong any jurisdiction over the convent and the Sisters literally.

2^o Neither can be affirmed that the convent in question has been built exclusively for the young Syrians. The reasons that the two Apostolic Vicars and the Syrians give in contrary are: 1^o because the convent was founded by Fr. Prior General of the Tertiary Carmelites with the help of others from the same Religious Congregation, who certainly would not have taken this commitment, if the convent was not to serve only for the young Syrians. 2^o because the same convent was founded on the land of Syrians, and this in Malabar reveals that the purpose of this Foundation was to form a religious family of Carmelites sisters in Syro

formare una famiglia religiosa di suore Terziarie Carmelitane di rito Siro Malabarico. 3^o perchè venne fabbricato con elemosine raccolte nelle Chiese Soriane, e con contribuzioni dei Preti e secolari Soriani; il che manifesta, Eglino dicono, che quel Monastero non poteva essere fabbricato ad altro scopo, se non per farvi un Istituto di Monache di rito Soriano. Ma tutte queste ragioni non valgono a distruggere il fatto incontrabile, che cioè le prime quattro Postulanti, che entrarono nel detto Monastero e professarono la Regola del Terzo Ordine Carmelitano, furono native di rito Latino, cioè Suor Elisabetta, Suor Anna, Suor Teresa, ed una Conversa (Alleg. D): per collocarvi queste quattro e la Suora Chiara Soriana si fabbricò quel Monastero, come si disse. Se fosse vero che quel Monastero fu fabbricato per le sole Postulanti di rito Soriano, certamente non sarebbero state ammesse le Suore di rito latino, le quali in qualità di Superiore per più anni ressero il medesimo Monastero. A fronte del fatto sparisce ogni presunzione, ogni deduzione, ed ogni congettura in contrario. Impertanto cade quì a proposito ciò che dice De Luca *lib. 4 de Emphyteusi P. 2 disc. 2 n. 3*: “Unde per ora peritorum forensium volitare solet

Malabar Rite. 3^o because it is built with alms collected from the Syrian Churches, and with the contributions of priests and secular Syrians; which reveals, they say, that the convent could not have been built for other purpose, than to make an institute for the sisters of Syrian Rite. But all these reasons do not apply to destroy the fact found, that is, the first four postulants, who entered the convent and professed the *Regola* of the Third Order Carmelites, were natives of the Latin Rite, i.e. Sister Elizabeth, sister Anna, sister Theresa, and a Convert (lay sister) (Attached Document D): to place these four and Sr. Clara the Syrian, that convent was made, as it is said. If it were true that the convent was made only for the Postulants of the Syrian Rite, certainly there would not have been accepted the sisters of the Latin Rite, who in quality of the superior governed the same convent for more years. In front of this fact disappears every presumption, every deduction and every speculation in contrary. However falls here the proposal that said that De Luca *lib. 4 de Emphyteusi p. 2 disc. 2 No. 3: Unde peritorum forensium now volitare dicterium solet, maioris ponderis ad unam unciam facti them valoris, quam centum*

dictarium, maioris ponderis ac valoris esse unam unciam facti, quam centum libras iuris”.

Mi sembra adunque di poter giustamente concludere che neppure ai due Vicarii Apostolici Soriani per questo titolo appartiene la giurisdizione sul detto Monastero.

§. III

La proprietà e dominio del Monastero in questione per diritto comune appartiene all'intera comunità religiosa delle Suore Terziarie Carmelitane, che vi abitano.

È abbastanza noto quanto nel corpo del diritto canonico, *Cap. Exiit III de Verb. Signific. In 6^o, e Cap. Ad conditorum dscanonum III. Extruvag. Ioannis XXII de Verb. Signific.*, si dispone su i beni mobili ed immobili, come monasteri ed altri luoghi pii eretti o comprati con oblazioni ed elemosine dei fedeli. Questo si può restringere nei seguenti termini: La proprietà di un Monastero fabbricato o comprato con le elemosine, oblazioni, donazioni fatte da diversi fedeli senza alcuna riserva, appartiene a quella religiosa comunità, per cui viene fabbricato o comprato: che se la comunità religiosa per qualche speciale obbligazione non può possedere, ne ritiene il solo uso; è la proprietà e dominio passa alla Sede Apostolica. Ecco come si

pound iuris.

It seems to me therefore to conclude that even to the two Syrian Apostolic Vicars for this title not belong to the jurisdiction over the said convent.

§. III

The property and domain of the convent in question for the common law belongs to the entire religious community of the Carmelite sisters living there. It is well noted when in the body of Canon law, *Cap. Exiit III de Verb. Signific. In 6^o, and Cap. Ad canonum conditorum III. Extruvag. Ioannis XXII de Verb. Signific.*, it is said on the movable and immovable goods, such as convents and other pious places built or bought with donations and alms of the faithful. This can be put in the following terms: the property of a convent built or bought with alms, offerings, donations made from different faithful without any reservations, belongs to that religious community, to which it is built or bought: that if the religious community for some special bond can not possess, it considers only use; is the property and dominion pass to the Apostolic See. Here is how he expresses himself Pope Nicholas III in saying: *Ad haec cum fratres ipsi nihil sibi in speciali acquirere vel eorem*

esprime Papa Nicolò III nel detto capo: “*Ad haec cum fratres ipsi nihil sibi in speciali acquirere vel eorum ordini possint etiam in communi, et cum aliquid propter Deum ipsi offertur, conceditur, vel donatur, ea (si secus non exprimat) offerentis, concedentis, vel donantis, verisimiliter credatur intentio ut rem huiusmodi oblatam, concessam, vel donatam perfecte concedat, donec auferat, a se abdicet, ac in alios transferre cupiat propter Deum, nec sit persona, in quam loco Dei congruentis huiusmodi rei dominium transferat, quam Sedes praefata vel persona Romani Pontificis Christi vicarii, qui pater est omnium, et fratrum Minorum nihilominus specialis. Ne talium rerum, sub incerto videatur esse dominium: cum patri filius suo modo servus domino, et Monachus Monasterio res sibi oblatas, concessas vel donatas acquirant, omnium utensilium et librorum, ac eorum mobilium praesentium et futurorum: quae et quorum usumfructum, scilicet ordinibus vel fratribus ipsis, licet habere proprietatem et dominium (quod et fe re Innoc. Papa IV praedecessor noster fecisse dignoscitur) in nos et Romanam Ecclesiam plene et libre pertinere hac praesenti constitutione in perpetuum validura sancimus. Praeterea*

ordini possint etiam in communi, et cum aliquid propter Deum ipsi offertur, conceditur, vel donatur, ea (si secus non exprimat) offerentis, concedentis, vel donantis, verisimiliter credatur intentio ut rem huiusmodi oblatam, concessam, vel donatam perfecte concedat, donec auferat, a se abdicet, ac in alios transferre cupiat propter Deum, nec sit persona, in quam loco Dei congruentis huiusmodi rei dominium transferat, quam Sedes praefata vel persona Romani Pontificis Christi vicarii, qui pater est omnium, et fratrum Minorum nihilominus specialis. Ne talium rerum, sub incerto videatur esse dominium: cum patri filius suo modo servus domino, et Monachus Monasterio res sibi oblatas, concessas vel donatas acquirant, omnium utensilium et librorum, ac eorum mobilium praesentium et futurorum: quae et quorum usumfructum, scilicet ordinibus vel fratribus ipsis, licet habere proprietatem et dominium (quod et fe re Innoc. Papa IV praedecessor noster fecisse dignoscitur) in nos et Romanam Ecclesiam plene et libre pertinere hac praesenti constitutione in perpetuum validura sancimus. Praeterea loca empta de eleemosynis diversis, et oblata seu concessa fratribus sub

loca empta de eleemosynis diversis, et oblata seu concessa fratribus sub quacumque forma verborum a diversis seu pro indiviso possidentibus, seu certas partes in ipsis locus habentibus, a quibus ipsi possidentes pro indiviso seu certas partes habentes nihil sibi in oblatione seu concessione huiusmodi reservarint: similiter et in ius et dominium ac proprietatem nostram et Ecclesiae praedictae eadem auctoritate suscipimus.” Il medesimo confermò Papa Giovanni XXII nel citato Capo III.

Così disponevano relativamente ai Frati Minori di S. Francesco i Sommi Pontefici, perchè in forza della professata Regola non potendo Egli possedere Conventi ed altri oggetti fabbricati o comprati con elemosine dei fedeli, questi non rimanessero senza padrone: *Ne talium rerum sub incerto rideatur esse dominium.* Ed è ben giusto; perchè coloro, che fecero tali elemosine ed oblazioni, si spogliarono del diritto di proprietà su quel denaro: *Ea offerentis, concedentis vel donantis verisimiliter credatur intentio ut rem huiusmodi oblatam, concessam vel donatam PERFECTE CONCEDAT, A SE ABDICET, AC IN ALIOS TRANSFERRE CUIAT*

quacumque forma verborum a diversis seu pro indiviso possidentibus, seu certas partes in ipsis locus habentibus, a quibus ipsi possidentes pro indiviso seu certas partes habentes nihil sibi in oblatione seu concessione huiusmodi reservarint: similiter et in ius et dominium ac proprietatem nostram et Ecclesiae praedictae eadem auctoritate suscipimus. The same is confirmed by Pope John XXII in the already mentioned chapter III.

Thus the popes displayed relatively to the Friars Minor of St. Francis, because by virtue of the professed Rule they cannot behold their own the Convents and other things built or bought with alms of the faithful, these do not remain without master: *talium rideatur rerum sub incerto rideatur esse dominium.* And it is right; because those who made these alms and donations are stripped of the right to property on that money: *Ea offerentis, concedentis vel donantis verisimiliter credatur intentio ut rem huiusmodi oblatam, concessam vel donatam PERFECTE CONCEDAT, A SE ABDICET, AC IN ALIOS TRANSFERRE CUIAT PROPTER DEUM.*

Then the property and domain are not moved and the serve the

PROPTER DEUM. Non si trasferisce poi la proprietà e dominio servano il dominio: *Nihil sibi in oblatione seu concessione huiusmodi reservaverint.*

Ora il monastero in questione venne fabbricato per via di collette, offerte ed elemosine fatte nelle Chiese, e lo attesta il P. Leopoldo con la citata sua lettera (Alleg. B): *Aedificium Monasterii monialium ... ut vos nostis, iam pervenit usque ad tectum ex eleemosynis Ecclesiarum, Sacerdotum et fidelium ritus Syriaci.* È confermata questa lettera dal Vicario Apostolico di Trichur (Alleg. B), e dal Vicario Apostolico di Cottayam (Alleg. F): e quantunque l'Arcivescovo Mellano affermi che il medesimo Monastero sia stato fabbricato col denaro somministrato dal suo Antecessore, e non vuole far conto della lettera del mentovato Padre Leopoldo; non pertanto di poi viene a confessare che il detto Monastero sia stato fabbricato con le offerte e contribuzioni di molti altri. Ecco le testuali parole della sua lettera in data 2 Aprile 1889 (Alleg. D): "E come non sarà questa lettera un esagerazione, quando tutti sanno che mandò persone per raccogliere denari dai Latini, e si sa pure che i Latini erano più generosi dei Soriani? Ed infatti

domain: *Nihil sibi in oblatione seu concessione huiusmodi reservaverint.*

Now the convent in question was built by way of alms and offerings collectively made in churches, and certify Fr. Leopold with his letter cited above (Attached Document B): *Aedificium Monasterii monialium ... ut vos nostis, iam pervenit usque ad tectum ex eleemosynis Ecclesiarum, Sacerdotum et fidelium ritus Syriaci.*, This letter is confirmed by the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur (Attached Document B), and by the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam (Attached Document F): and however, Archbishop Mellano claims that the said convent was built with money given by his Predecessor, and does not want to count the letter sent by Father Leopold; therefore not then comes to confess that the said convent has been built with the offerings and contributions of many others. Here are the given words in his letter of 2nd April 1889 (Attached Document D): "and how will this letter not an exaggeration, when everyone knows that persons were sent to collect money from the Latins, and you know as well that the Latins were more generous than the Syrians? And indeed from investigations made in

dalle investigazioni in qualche modo fatte, consta che i Latini diedero più di Rupie mille, 1000. Oltre le 30 Lire sterline date di un certo Larzzaro, ne ho trovati vari altri, che diedero ciascuno 190 Rp e che tutt'ora vivono e possono attestarlo, oltre di tanto altri che diedero somme minori, e tutto questo prova la suddetta esagerazione.”

A noi non importa se in parte, od in tutto l'elemosine siano state raccolte nelle Chiese dei Soriani o dei Latini; e se i contribuenti e benefattori siano stati Soriani ovvero Latini; ci basta solo sapere che il Monastero in discorso fu fabbricato in forza di collette, di contribuzioni, di offerte e di elemosine: ciò che niuno dei tre Prelati mette in dubbio.

Ora l'intera Comunità religiosa delle predette Suore Terziarie Carmelitane è capace di possedere; dunque essa ha il diritto di proprietà sul Monastero in discorso.

Difatti non si legge nei documenti che coloro, i quali contribuirono con elemosine ed offerte ancora vistose all'erezione di questo Monastero, e della Scuola ed Orfanotrofio adiacenti, siansi riservata la proprietà dei medesimi. Si legge piuttosto il contrario nella lettera di Monsignor Mellano (Alleg. D). Questo degnissimo Prelato

some way consist that the Latins gave more than Rupees thousand (1000). And without that the 30 pounds (lire) sterling given by one called Lazar, I found several others that gave each Rs 190 and who still live and can attest it, in addition to all others who gave smaller amounts and all this evidence the aforementioned exaggeration.”

To us no matter whether in part or in whole the alms have been collected in churches of Syrians or Latins; and if the contributors and benefactors have been Syrians or Latins; we just know that the convent in discussion was fabricated by collections, contributions, offerings and alms: none of the three prelates doubt it. Now the entire religious community of the said sisters of the Third Order of Carmelites is capable of possessing; Therefore it has the right of ownership of the property of the convent in discussion.

In fact one does not read in the documents that those who contributed with alms and offerings yet showy at the erection of this convent, and the school and orphanage adjacent to it, by my wishes, reserved the ownership of the same. One reads just opposite of it in the letter of Archbishop Mellano (Attached Document D). This

scrive: “Penso poi non essere necessario far osservare all’Eccellenza Vostra, che non sono certamente quelle piu persone, che hanno date elemosine per questa pia istituzione, che la ridomandano, e non potrebbero ridomandarla, perchè data elemosina è del Signore, ma sono unicamente alcuni dei Terzarii, che da anni non si occupano di altro, e sarebbe ormai tempo, che lasciassero di perturbare il Malabar, che già lo è bastantemente, ed attendessero alla loro vocazione”.

Resta dunque abbastanza provato che la proprietà e dominio di quel Monastero per diritto comune appartiene all’intera comunità religiosa delle Suore Terziarie Carmelitane. Dico intera comunità, composta cioè delle Suore di rito Latino e delle Suore di rito Siro-Malabarico.

§. IV

Per diritto comune appartiene al Vicario Apostolico di Trichur la giurisdizione canonica sopra il Monastero in questione, e sopra quella intera Comunità religiosa.

Sotto il titolo *De religiosis domibus ut Episcopo sint subiectae* del Diritto canonico, si dispone che i Monasteri e luoghi pii sono soggetti alla giurisdizione di quel Prelato od Ordinario nel di cui territorio

most Rev. Prelate writes: “I think it is not necessary then to make observance to your Excellency that it is not certainly those few persons who have given alms for this pious institution, who reclaim that, and they would not demand that, because the given alms is of the Lord, but only some of the Tertiaries, who for years did not occupy with anything else than left to disturb the Malabar, which is already so enough, and awaiting to their vocation.” It remains therefore enough evidence that the property and domain of that convent for common law belongs to the entire religious community of the Tertiary Carmelite sisters. I say the entire religious community, composed that of the sisters of Latin Rite and the sisters of Syro Malabar Rite.

§. IV

For common law, the canonical jurisdiction over the convent in question and the entire religious community belong to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.

Under the title *De religiosis domibus ut sint Episcopo subiectae* of the Canon law, it provides that convents and pious places are subjected to the jurisdiction of that Prelate or Ordinary in whose territory they exist, if for privilege they are not exempted; and if they

esistono, se per privilegio non sono esenti; e se sono esenti, l'Ordinario ne ha giurisdizione delegata dalla Santa Sede a norma dei sacri canoni. Piacemi qui riferire il Cap. III del detto titolo: *De xenodochiis, et aliis similibus locis, per sollicitudinem Episcoporum, in quorum dioecesi existunt, ad easdem utilitates, quibus constituta sunt ordinentur.* La Glossa in questo capo dopo aver detto: *Episcopum de iure communi iurisdictionem habere in monasteriis Dioecesis suae* spiega le parole in *quorum dioecesi* del medesimo riferito Capo, e dice: *Hic manifeste patet quod Monasteria et alia loca religiosa pertinent ad Episcopum loci de iure communi. Cognovimus quod Monasteria servorum Dei, vel foeminarum pro suo quisque libitu, et diversarum causarum executione perturbet: quod omnino non grate suscipimus. Tuamque ex hoc experientiam commonemus, ut nequaquam hoc usurpari denuo accepta nostra auctoritate permittas: Sed Episcopo loci illius, sub cuius moderamine degunt, curae sit causas eorum, utilitatesque disponere.*

Pellizzario uno dei più accreditati autori sopra questa materia nel Cap. 10 de Gubernatione Monialium quoad Ordinarium n. 1 insegna: "*Quod*

are exempted, the ordinary has the delegated by the Holy See in accordance with the Holy canons. With pleasure here report the Chapter III of said title: *De xenodochiis, et aliis similibus locis, per sollicitudinem Episcoporum, in quorum dioecesi existunt, ad easdem utilitates, quibus constituta sunt ordinentur.*

The Gloss in this chapter after says: *Episcopum de iure communi iurisdictionem habere in monasteriis Dioecesis suae* explains the words in *quorum dioecesi* of the same referred Head, and says: *Hic manifeste patet quod Monasteria et alia loca religiosa pertinent ad Episcopum loci de iure communi. Cognovimus quod Monasteria servorum Dei, vel foeminarum pro suo quisque libitu, et diversarum causarum executione perturbet: quod omnino non grate suscipimus. Tuamque ex hoc experientiam commonemus, ut nequaquam hoc usurpari denuo accepta nostra auctoritate permittas: Sed Episcopo loci illius, sub cuius moderamine degunt, curae sit causas eorum, utilitatesque disponere.*

One of the most important authors on this subject in Chapter 10 of *Gubernatione Monialium quoad Ordinarium n. 1* teaches: "*Quod cum omnes personae Religiosae, seclusis*

cum omnes personae Religiosae, seclusis peculiaribus privilegiis de iure communi debeant esse sub cura ae potestate Episcopi in cuiusterritorio degunt iuxta C. Contra morem d. 100 ubi dicitur omnes Ecclesias et loca sacra in unaquaque Dioecesi constituta esse Episcopo Talis Dioecesis subiecta.” Credo pertanto superfluo riferire qui altre autorità, essendo questa una massima presso tutti indubitata.

Ora il Monastero, di cui si parla, esiste nel Territorio del Vicariato di Trichur; e nel riferito Breve, con cui Sua Santità divise quella Malabarica regione, ed eresse i due Vicariati, non venne fatta alcuna riserva od eccezione relativamente a questo Monastero, come fu osservato di sopra: ne segue adunque che per diritto comune appartiene al Vicario Apostolico di Trichur la giurisdizione canonica sul detto Monastero, e sulla intera Comunità religiosa composta di Suore di rito Latino, e di rito Siro-Malabarico.

Conclusionione

Considerato quanto fu esposto nella premessa relazione e nelle preliminari osservazioni; più ancora considerato quanto nei quattro antecedenti paragrafi fu provato, sono di avviso;

Che se l'Istituto delle Suore in parola è puramente Diocesano, come apparisce, la piena

peculiaribus privilegiis de iure communi debeant esse sub cura ae potestate Episcopi in cuiusterritorio degunt iuxta C. Contra morem d. 100 ubi dicitur omnes Ecclesias et loca sacra in unaquaque Dioecesi constituta esse Episcopo Talis Dioecesis subiecta.” I therefore believe superfluous to report other authority here, being this an undoubted maximum at all. Now the convent spoken here, exists in the territory of the Vicariate of Trichur; and in the referred Brief, with which his Holiness divided that Malabar region and erected the two Vicariates, was not made any reservations or exceptions in respect of this convent, as was noted above: it follows then that for common law the canonical jurisdiction over the said convent and the entire religious Community composed of sisters of Latin Rite, and of Syro-Malabar Rite belongs to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.

Conclusion

Considering that was expressed in the relational premise and in the preliminary observations; more again considering how much in the 4 antecedents paragraphs were proved, my opinions are:

That if the institute of the sisters in word is purely diocesan, as appear, the full jurisdiction on that monastery,

giurisdizione su quel Monastero, Scuola ed Orphanotrofio adiacenti, e sull'intera comunità religiosa delle medesime suore appartiene al solo Monsignor Medlycott Vicario Apostolico di Trichur, nel di cui Vicariato esiste il detto Monastero. Dico piena; perchè se l'Istituto non fosse puramente Diocesano ma dipendente immediatamente dalla S. Sede, allora il prelodato Monsignor Medlycott sull' detto Monastero e comunità religiosa avrebbe solamente la giurisdizione di Delegato Apostolico a tenore dei sacri canoni.

Nihil innovandum in ordine all'ammissione delle Postulanti di maniera, che possono essere ricevute indistintamente quelle di rito Soriano e quelle di rito Latino; poichè quel Monastero appartiene all'intera comunità religiosa ossia alle suore di ambedue i riti, conseguentemente il medesimo monastero non si dichiara Soriano, neppure Latino: nihil innovandum in ordine alla lingua, proseguendo a dire l'ufficio, Orazioni e lettura ed ogni altra cosa come hanno finora praticato: nihil innovandum in ordine ai regolamenti spettanti l'organizzazione della comunità religiosa, della Scuola e dell'Orfanotrofia.

Che se il Vicario Apostolico di

the school and orphanage adjacent and the entire religious community of the same sisters belongs to only Msgr. Medlycott the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur in whose Vicariate exists the above said monastery. I say, fully; because if the institute is not fully diocesan, but immediate dependent of the Holy See, then the above said Msgr. Medlycott has only the jurisdiction of the apostolic delegate on the said convent and religious community by the sacred canons.

There should not have any change in the order of the admission of the postulants that they have to be received indistinctly that of Syrian Rite and of Latin Rite; since that convent belongs to the entire religious community, that is to the sisters of both the Rites; consequently that convents not to be declared as Syrian or Latin; there should also not have any change in the order of the language followed for the divine office, prayers and reading and all other things how they have practiced till now; there should not be any change in the regular organization of the religious community, the school and of the Orphanage.

That if the Vicar Apostolic of Kottayam and other prelates

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>Cottayam ed altri Prelati vogliano alcune delle dette Suore per aprire e fondare un'altra casa nel loro Vicariato o Diocesi, le domandino al Vicario Apostolico di Trichur; e se vi condisce, le suore, uscite che saranno dal Vicariato di Trichur, resteranno indipendenti da questo, e passeranno sotto la giurisdizione di quel Prelato, nel di cui territorio aprono e fondano la loro casa.</p> <p>Questo, Eminentissimi Padri, sopra tale vertenza è il mio parere, che umilmente sottometto al sapientissimo giudizio vostro, e di buon grado ne farò ancora io quel conto, che ne saprà fare l'impareggiabile Sapienza Vostra.</p> <p>Prostrato con la più profonda venerazione a baciare la loro sacra porpora, Convento della Sma Concezione 7th Gennaio 1890 Fr. Gabriele da Guarcino Cappuccino Consultore</p> | <p>want some of those sisters to open and found another house in their vicariate or diocese, they have to ask the vicar apostolic of Trichur; if they are indulgent, they can exit from the vicariate of Trichur, remain independent from that and will pass under the jurisdiction of that prelate, in whose territory they start and found their house.</p> <p>Most Eminent fathers, about the above mentioned verdict, this is my opinion, that I humbly submit for your wisest judgment and of good part I will do again that count that you will do with your incomparable wisdom.</p> <p>Prostrate with more profound veneration to embrace your sacred porpora, Convent of the Holy Conception 7th January 1890 Fr. Gabriele Guarcino Cappuccin, Consultant</p> |
|---|---|

5.2.2.10.2. Main Points

1. Fr. Guarciano first refers to the Brief *Quod iam pridem* of His Holiness Pope Leo XIII, given on 20th May 1887. In it the Pope divided the vast region of Malabar for the Catholics of Syro-Malabar Rite into two Vicariates that of Trichur and Kottayam. Through this division those Catholics were separated from the administration and the regime of the Latin

Archdiocese of Verapoly, led and governed at present by Archbishop Msgr. Mellano.

2. The Carmelite convent of the Tertiary sisters founded already in Koonammavu is in the territory of the Vicariate of Trichur.
3. Archbishop Mellano claims that the convent was subjected to his jurisdiction, since it was founded by his predecessor Msgr. Bernardine for the sisters and postulants of the Latin Rite.
4. The two Apostolic Vicars of Syro Malabar Rite Msgr. Medlycott and Msgr. Lavigne argue just opposite, saying that the convent was constructed by the Syrian TOCD men religious with the money collected from the churches of Syrian Rite for the Syrian sisters and postulants.
5. The Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of Faith entrusted to the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Andrea Aiuti the job to reconcile the dispute between the Latin and Syrian Prelates. Unfortunately his efforts were in vein. He says "... I had hope for a moment that the issue could be solved for good and in an equitable manner (*de bono et aequo*) here itself. But soon I had to realize that this was absolutely impossible...."
6. To provide an exact idea of the issue Fr. Guarciano refers to the original happenings of 1865. In 1865 or at that time, four women of Latin Rite obtained from Fr. Kuriakose of Elias the first Prior General of the Third Order Carmelites the habit, after obtaining consent of the then Ordinary Msgr. Bernardine, they gathered together in the House of Sr. Eliswa, one of the four postulants and lived religiously as in a convent; but not according to the canonical status of

professed sisters; but the Rule of the Third Order was given to them only in March of the year 1867.

7. A fourth member Sr. Clara of the Syrian Rite joined to these sisters and lived in the convent for 15 months.
8. In 1866 constructed the new convent at Koonammavu and they could soon moved into the new one. There they received the rule and made profession and started to receive the postulants indistinctively of Latin and Syro-Malabar Rites. In 1890 at the time of division there were seven sisters of Latin Rite and nineteen from Syrian Rite, 27 Syrian children in *Educandath* and one from Latin Rite.
9. Then Fr. Guarcino quotes the main arguments of the letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 15th March 1889.⁵⁹
10. Fr. Guarcino also quotes the letters of the vicar apostolic of Trichur dated both on 27th January and 12th April 1889 as well as the pertinent parts of the (circular) letter of Fr. Leopold requesting financial help for the construction of the convent from the Syrian churches – which was quoted by both Msgr. Medlycott and Msgr. Levigne.⁶⁰
11. Then he quotes the letter of Archbishop Mellano dated on 2nd April 1889 by which Msgr. Mellano⁶¹ denies both the existence of the circular letter of Fr. Leopold and the claim of ownership of the convent by those who had given alms for its construction.

⁵⁹ See above No. 5.2.2.5. ‘Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 15th March 1889.’

⁶⁰ For the pertinent parts of the letter, see above FN 4.

⁶¹ See above No. 5.2.2.6. ‘Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 2nd April 1889.’

12. Next he turns to the views of the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti who says that if anyone who wants to claim that convent belonged to a Rite, then it would be said that it was Syrian Rite from the moment of its foundation due to the help given by Fr. Chavara and the other Men TOCD and contributions made from the Syrian churches. Then he quotes the main part of the report of the Apostolic Delegate submitted to the Cardinal Prefect of the Propaganda Fide on 30th August 1889.⁶²
13. Fr. Guarcino claims that he has exposed in its total genuineness the case of the present question. He holds that it is not the Tertiary sisters who had contented for the dominion of the convent. They had not spoken at all about it, not even given a hint of discontent or dissension, nor expressed their willingness to be separated among themselves. They had not submitted any petition or any claim on this issue.
14. The question that the three prelates raise cannot be decided by paying attention to the amount of money, which the sisters both Latin and Syrian have brought as dowry to the convent.
15. Koonammavu convent was under the Ecclesiastical unit of Verapoly. Still at the foundation of the convent, no explicit or implicit condition was set that it should belong either to the Latin or Syrian Rite. Hence, the present issue of ownership of the convent has to be decided under the common Law.
16. Then he quotes the Brief *Quod iam pridem*, of Pope Leo XIII with which the division took place. Fr. Guarcino states that the Vatican document does not

⁶² See above No. 5.2.2.9. 'Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti.'

make any reservation and exception; for which that division and erection of two Vicariates must submit to the rules of the common law; accordingly with the same rules one must define the issues that now arise in that region.

17. Fr. Guarcino points out four main arguments:
 - a. The right of foundation, the ownership and dominion of the convent in question do not belong to none of the above mentioned three Prelates. No Prelate has erected the foundation of the convent with savings for his mess or from his own private savings. Msgr. Mellano the Archbishop of Verapoly has not founded the convent with his savings. Also his predecessor Msgr. Bernardine has not spent his savings for mess or other own savings for the erection of the convent. So too Msgr. Medlycott and Msgr. Levigne cannot claim to spend their savings for the convent.
 - b. Secondly, Fr. Guarcino studies the arguments of both Msgr. Mellano and Msgr. Medlycott who had claimed that the convent was established for the girls of their own Rite alone. The consultant of the Propaganda Fide finds that the arguments of both parties are not valid. He further points out that neither Msgr. Bernardine who was the Archbishop of that time has put any conditions concerning the Rite issue.
 - c. Fr. Guarcino quotes from Canon Law, the documents of Nicholas II and Pope John XXII and explicates that the property and domain of the convent in question for the common law

belongs to the entire religious community of the Carmelite sisters living there; the entire religious community composed that of the sisters of Latin Rite and the sisters of Syro Malabar Rite. It is well noted when in the body of Canon law, *Cap. Exiit III de Verb. Signific. In 6^o*, and *Cap. Ad canonum conditorum III. Extruvag. Ioannis XXII de Verb. Signific.*

- d. For common law, the canonical jurisdiction over the convent in question and the entire religious community belong to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur since under the title *De religiosis domibus ut sint Episcopo subiectae* of the Canon law, it provides that convents and pious places are subjected to the jurisdiction of that Prelate or Ordinary in whose territory they exist, if for privilege they are not exempted; and if they are exempted, the ordinary has the delegated power by the Holy See in accordance with the Holy canons.
18. As a conclusion, Fr. Guarcino adduces three main points.
- i. If the convent is a diocesan one, its full jurisdiction along with the school and adjacent orphanage and the entire religious community belongs to Msgr. Medlycott the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, since the convent exists in the vicariate of Trichur. If it is not fully a diocesan community, then Msgr. Medlycott can be involved in the affairs of the religious community as the local hierarch according to the canonical norms.

- ii. If the convent comes under the jurisdiction of Trichur Vicariate, there should not have any change in the present arrangements:
 - a. The postulants should be received from both Syrian and Latin Rites. The convent cannot be called either Syrian or Latin.
 - b. The regulations concerning the divine office, community prayers, reading and all other things had to be maintained.
 - c. No new regulations are to be made concerning rules of the religious community, the school and the orphanage.
- iii. If the other prelates want the sisters to start convents in their territories, they can take them only with the permission of the vicar apostolic of Trichur. Once the sisters pass to other vicariates, they are no more under the jurisdiction of Msgr. Medlycott.

5.2.2.10.3. Comments

1. In general, the arguments brought out by Fr. Guarcino are canonical and objective. He in the light of the Canon Law and the documents of the Popes has argued that Koonammavu convent belongs to the jurisdiction of the apostolic Vicar of Trichur. He rightly points out that this fact does not make the convent a religious institute of Syrians. Hence, the candidates are to be received from both Rites. No changes should be brought out concerning liturgical prayers, readings and regulations of the religious

community, school and the orphanage. This is indeed an impartial and wise proposal.⁶³

2. Fr. Guarcino has made an elaborate, concise and precise study of the documents both ecclesiastical and canonical. One may wonder how he could do it within a short time.⁶⁴ For this, he needs our whole hearted commendation.
3. We can point out some minor errors in some of his statements, which may be due to the documents which he had received for his study.
 - According to Fr. Guarcino in 1865 or at that time, four women of Latin Rite obtained from Fr. Kuriakose of Elias the habit. This is an incorrect

⁶³Unfortunately, Sr. Sucey finds fault with the observations and conclusions of Fr. Guarcino. "Fr. Gabriele studied the written communications regarding the issue of the jurisdiction of the convent within a short time" (*SGME*, 294). Fr. Guarcino "submitted his conclusion to the Propaganda Fide, which was in favour of the Syro-Malabar Rite" (*SGME*, 294). "It is pitiful to say that he did not assure the credibility of the reports which he received" (*SGME*, 294). She also said that his statement that the convent was situated in the Vicariate of Trichur is completely false (*SGME*, 309). "Fr. Guarcino was influenced by Msgr. Aiuti's position in making the final decision. The consultant made every effort to lessen the importance of the jurisdiction of Archbishop Mellano over the convent" (*SGME*, 311). A genuine Catholic cannot subscribe to the position and statements of Sr. Sucey who labels every study, which does not support her position as biased and false even if they were the declarations of the Holy See. Just to give an example of her twisting statement we quote merely a text: "The letter of Archbishop Mellano was quoted only to prove that his predecessor, Archbishop Bernardine, accepted candidates of the Syrian Rite also" (*SGME*, 310). The truth is that Fr. Guarcino has quoted three letters of Msgr. Mellano. The first letter cited three times and the second and third letters were quoted 13 times. Thus nobody can objectively hold that Fr. Guarcino had shown partiality in not giving due importance to the correspondence of the Archbishop of Verapoly. This becomes more clear when we compare his citation of the letters of Msgr. Medlycott. Only two of his letters are quoted that of January 1889 [4 times] and of 12th April 1889 [only once].

⁶⁴ This short time was a negative point for Sr. Sucey. Cf. *SGME*, 294.

statement. First of all, it was not in 1865 but in 1866 that the four women⁶⁵ obtained the scapular not the habit as Guarcino says. Secondly, it was not Fr. Chavara but Fr. Leopold, as the Provincial Delegate who had invested the scapular on the candidates in the presence of Fr. Chavara. Thirdly, in March 1867 when they entered into the newly built convent, they received only the ‘Testament’ from Fr. Leopold and not the Rule of the Third Order. According to *CKC* the Rule was given to them at their entry into the *panambumadam*. And the final form of the Rule they got only in 1875.⁶⁶

- As far as another statement of Fr. Guarcino – the first 4 members lived in the *Panambumadam* for 15 months – is concerned, *CKC* I makes it clear that they entered in the *Panambumadam* on 13th February 1866 and their entry into the new convent was on 27th March 1867.⁶⁷
- Again Fr. Guarcino said that in 1890 at the time of division there were seven sisters of Latin Rite and nineteen from Syrian Rite, 27 Syrian children in *Educandath* and one from Latin Rite. But *CKC* II, 144 makes it clear that there were only three finally professed sisters, two *puthukannyastrikal* (juniors), one helper and one boarding girl from the Latin side. Thus all together there were only seven. As far as the Syrian members are concerned, *Vajrajubilee Smarakam of*

⁶⁵ Among the four women, three were from Latin Rite and one from Syrian Rite; the fourth one in the statement of Fr. Guarcino was merely a helper. See above No. 5.2.2.1. ‘Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 28th November 1888.’

⁶⁶ See *CKC* I, 5 and *CKC* II, 98.

⁶⁷ *CKC* I, 56.

Koonammavu convent gives a list of the sisters who lived there from 1866 to 1943, pages 298-310. Among these the first 30 sisters made their profession before 1890, because from *CKC II*, 146, it is clear that the 31st one entered the convent only in November 1890 after the division of the convent. Among these 30 sisters five sisters went to Verapoly, two were left the convent⁶⁸ and one was called for the eternal reward.⁶⁹ Thus, the number of the rest of the sisters was 22. Therefore, certainly we can say that there were at least 20 sisters who belonged to the Syrian Rite.⁷⁰ As far as the number of the Syrian girls in the boarding is concerned *CKC II*, on page 146, under the date 24th November 1890, we see a list of 23 girls who were studying in the boarding expressed their desire to join the convent and vote was cast for the same.

- Fr. Guarcino also says that the sisters never expressed their willingness to be separated among themselves. They had not submitted any petition or any claim on this issue. At the time of Fr. Guarcino's report, it was true. However, later the sisters had written letters to the Ecclesiastical authorities as the present chapter testifies.

5.2.2.11. The Decision of the Propaganda Fide

After examining the suggestions of both the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti and the consultant Fr. Gabriele

⁶⁸ *CKC I*, 205-206.

⁶⁹ *CKC II*, 29-30.

⁷⁰ See also the chart of the members given in *WFF*, Chapter IV, No. 4.4. 'Details of the Members.'

Guarcino, the Propaganda Fide has taken the decision regarding the convent at Koonammavu on 18th April 1890. Informing the decision (to Msgr. Mellano) the Prefect of the Propaganda Fide Card. Giovanni Simeoni thus wrote.⁷¹

5.2.2.11.1. The Letter of Card. Giovanni Simeoni dated 18th April 1890

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>Monsignor Leonardo Mellano Arcivescovo di Verapoly 18 Aprile 1890 Eccellenza Revma, Porto a conoscenza della Signoria Vostra Illustrissima, quanto ho appreso. Nell ‘adunanza generale del 24 marzo scorso, gli Eminentissimi miei colleghi, chiamati a dare il loro giudizio sulla questione circa la giurisdizione sul Monastero delle Religiose Terziarie che si trova in Cunemao, hanno deciso che la giurisdizione sul nominato monastero delle Religiose Terziarie che si trova in Cunemao, sulle scuole annesse e sull ‘Orfanotrofio, appartiene al Vicario Apostolico di Trichur. Inoltre hanno pure stabilito che non si faccia in esso alcuna innovazione sia in ordine all ‘ammissione delle postulanti di entrambi i riti, sia alla lingua</p> | <p>Rome 1890 April 18 Your majesty, Hereby I inform you, what I have known. In order to decide, under whose authority the Koonammavu convent of the Third Order sisters should come, the general body meeting of my co-workers was held on March 24 and they have decided that the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur will have authority over the convent and over the school and orphanage attached to it. Besides that they have also decided that no change should be made either in receiving candidates from both the Rites or in the language in which the office, prayers, reading etc. are carried out or in the existing</p> |

⁷¹CKC II, 143-144 provides an account of this decision of the Holy See to hand over the Koonammavu convent to the Syrians. At the end of it, the chronicler reminds the sisters that they are indebted to Fr. Chavara who had built the convent mainly with the alms (an amount of Rs. 8000/-) collected from the Syrian churches.

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>finore usata nell 'ufficio, nelle orazioni, nella lettura, ecc., sia in ordine ai regolamenti che riguardano l 'organizzazione. Della Comunità religiosa, con annesse, sia le scuole che lo Orfanotrofio.</p> <p>Che se alcune delle Suore del citato monastero, con il permesso del Vicario Apostolico di Trichur lasciassero il Monastero e passassero a formare un 'altra casa sotto altro Vicariato o Diocesi, questo sar'preso in esame nel caso particolare. Queste decisioni della Sacra Congregazione furono poi approvate dal S. Padre nell 'udienza del 14 corrente.</p> <p>Non dubito assolutamente che la Signoria Vostra Illustrissima, per il grande ossequio che ha sempre mostrato verso questa Sacra Congregazione, voglia attenersi fedelmente a questi decreti . ecc.</p> <p>Nota Bene : Una copia di questa lettera fu inviata a Monsignor Adolfo Medlycott, Vescovo di riconia e Vicario Apostolico di Trichur.</p> <p>Cardinale Giovanni Simeoni, Prefetto della Sacra Congregazione di Propaganda Arcivescovo Damiatta Ignasio, Secretario</p> | <p>systems of the running of the school and orphanage attached to it. If any sister of that convent leaves the convent with the permission of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur and goes to any other vicariate or diocese to open new houses, special measures of action to be adopted for it, will be decided upon, then. On the fourteenth day of this month, the most Holy Father has approved the decisions of the Sacred Congregation, signed and passed it.</p> <p>As it is the usual practice, I do know, you will obey and carry out the orders of the Sacred Congregation without any objection. I also pray that God grant you long life and all your good wishes.</p> <p>NB: A copy of this letter was sent to Msgr. Medlycott the bishop of Triconia and the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur</p> <p>Yours faithfully, Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni, Prefect. Archbishop Damiatta Ignasio, Secretary</p> |
|--|---|

5.2.2.11.2. Main Points

1. On 24th March 1890, the general body of the Sacred Congregation for Propaganda Fide decided that the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur will have the authority over

the convent and over the school and orphanage attached to it.

2. No changes should be introduced in the present arrangement concerning the reception of candidates from both the Syrian and Latin Rites, in the use of language of the canonical office, prayers and reading as well as in the existing system of running of the school and orphanage attached to it.
3. If any sister of Koonammavu convent leaves the convent with the permission of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur and goes to any other vicariate or diocese to open new houses, special measures of action are to be adopted for it, which will be decided then.
4. On 14th April 1890, the most Holy Father has approved the decision of the Sacred Congregation, signed and confirmed it.
5. At the end, the Prefect of the Propaganda Fide expresses his certainty that the Vicar Apostolic will obey and carry out the orders of the Sacred Congregation, as it is the usual practice.

5.2.2.11.3. Comments

Nobody can find fault with the decision of the Congregation of Propaganda Fide. They have taken into account all the prevailing situation and had come to a practical solution, which was the best in that context. It has to be noted that the Holy See did not give the ownership of the Koonammavu convent to the Syrians. The religious community can have the members belong to both Syrian and Latin Rites. The Holy See gave the jurisdiction of Koonammavu community to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur Msgr. Medlycott in whose territory it belonged after establishing the two Syrian Vicariates. Further, it is worthy to

observe that the decision of Propaganda Fide was not influenced by the suggestion of Msgr. Aiuti in favour of the Syrians, who had opined that Koonammavu convent should be given to the Syrian sisters in the case of making the division in the light of Latin and Syrian Rites. Rather, the Congregation was accepting the report of Fr. Gabriele Guarcino the consultant submitted on 7th January 1890.⁷²

5.2.2.12. A Concluding Remark

There exists a lot of confusion and misunderstandings⁷³ on the decision of the Propaganda Fide. Many have the impression that the Holy See had sided with the Syrians and took a decision in their favour, disregarding the right claims of the Latins, by entrusting Koonammavu convent to the Syrians. Such allegations and controversies do not have any historical basis. Congregation for Propaganda Fide had made a practical and reasonable decision taking into account the prevailing antagonistic circumstances without assigning the Koonammavu convent to any party. Indeed, it had defended the right of the Latin sisters who were the inmates of the Koonammavu convent by asking that both Latin and Syrian candidates should be accepted to the community and the existing system concerning canonical office, prayers and readings to be retained as well as the existing system of running the school and orphanage. Actually, the erection of two Syrian vicariates had paved the way for looking at things from the perspective of Rites. Gradually it caused to develop friction and rivalries in the Kerala Church. The echo of it would have influenced even the

⁷²Thus the statement of Sr. Suci that “the final decision was made in the light of the letter of the apostolic delegate to the prefect of the Propaganda Fide in which he had suggested a decision in favour of the Syro Malabar Christians” (*SGME*, 295), does not have any historical validity.

⁷³ For example, *CKC II*, 143.

Koonammavu community of the sisters. Sr. Suicy who puts the garb of a historian conveniently ignores this fundamental issue and has made wild accusations against the Holy See authorities who had appointed Msgr. Aiuti the Apostolic Delegate to study the issues. Was not Sr. Suicy purposely misinterpreting the historical documents by reading into it the Rite motivation? An objective and authentic historian will disregard her twisted arguments and allegations.

5.3. The Aftermath of the Decision of the Propaganda Fide

5.3.1. Information of the Decision to the Sisters at Koonammavu by Msgr. Medlycott on 21st May 1890

Msgr. Medlycott wrote a letter to the sisters on 21st May 1890 informing them the decision of the Holy See concerning the ownership of the convent.⁷⁴

5.3.1.1. Original Letter

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>നാം തൃശൂർ വി. അപ്പ. അഡോൾഫസ് മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ട്, ത്രിക്കോമ്യായായുടെ മെത്രാൻ, കുനമ്മാവു കന്യാസ്ത്രീമഠത്തിലെ നമ്മുടെ പ്രിയമകൾ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിക്ക് ആശീർവാദം.</p> <p>നിങ്ങൾ വളരെ ആഗ്രഹത്തോടുകൂടി പാർത്തിരുന്ന നിങ്ങളുടെ ഈ ആശ്രമത്തെപ്പറ്റിയുള്ള പരി. സിംഹാസനത്തിന്റെ തീരുമാനത്തിനടുത്ത കല്പന നാം കൈപ്പറ്റിയിരിക്കുന്നു.</p> <p>ഈ സംഗതി തീരുമാനിക്കപ്പെട്ടു. പ്രോപ്പഗാതതിരുസംഘത്തിലെ ഉന്നതകർദ്ദിനാളന്മാരുടെ സഭയിൽ ചെയ്ത വിധിയാൽ കുനമ്മാവിലുള്ള മൂന്നാംസഭ ക</p> | <p>I, Adolf Medlycot, the bishop of Tricomea and the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, bless you my daughter, the superior of the convent of Koonammavu.</p> <p>I have received the decree of the Holy See about their decision regarding your convent, for which you were very anxiously waiting.</p> <p>This has been decided. The eminent Cardinals of the Sacred Congregation have decided that the convent of</p> |

⁷⁴ CKC II, 141 mentions about this letter.

ന്യാസ്ത്രീകളുടെ ആശ്രമവും അതിനോട് ചേർന്നിരിക്കുന്ന സ്കൂളുകളും അനാഥശാലയും തൃശൂർ വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കാരുടെ ജ്ഞാനാധികാരത്തിൽ ഉൾപ്പെട്ടതായി തീരുമാനിക്കപ്പെട്ടിരിക്കുന്നു.

ശുദ്ധചൊല്ലുവിളിയുടെ തികവാലെ നിങ്ങളോടു ഞാൻ പ്രമാണിക്കുന്നതെന്തെന്നാൽ, ആശ്രമത്തിന്റെയും സ്കൂളിന്റേയും അനാഥശാലയുടെയും നടത്തിപ്പിലും ഭരിപ്പിലും റെഗുലുകളിലും യാതൊരുവക പകർച്ചയും ചെയ്തുകൂടാ. പിന്നെയോ സകലവും കീഴിൽ നടന്നിരുന്ന പ്രകാരംതന്നെ നടത്തുകയും വേണം. വിശേഷിച്ച് ആ സഭയിൽ ഉൾപ്പെട്ട കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ സഭയിൽ ചേരുവാൻ അപേക്ഷിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നവർ, സ്കൂളിലെ കുട്ടികൾ മുതലായ സകലരോടും റീത്തിന്റെ വേർതിരിവു കൂടാതെ ഏകപക്ഷത്തോടും ദയയോടും കൂടെ ഒരു റീത്തുകാരുടെ നേരെ മറ്റു റീത്തുകാരേക്കാൾ അധികം താല്പര്യം കാണിക്കാതെയും ഒരുപോലെ സകലരോടും പെരുമാറിക്കൊള്ളണമെന്നു നാം ആഗ്രഹിക്കുകയും പ്രമാണിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യുന്നു.

പിന്നെയും നിങ്ങളുടെ ആശ്രമത്തിൽ ഏതാനും നാളായി ഒരു കലക്കത്തിനു ഹേതുവെന്ന പോലെ നിന്നിരുന്ന സംഗതിക്ക് പൂർണ്ണമായ തീരുമാനം വരുത്തിത്തന്നുളിയതിനെക്കുറിച്ച് സർവ്വശക്തനായ ദൈവത്തിന് സ്തോത്രം ചെയ്ത് ശുദ്ധകുർബ്ബാനയുടെ വാഴ്വ് സഹിതം മൂന്നുദിവസത്തെ വണക്കം സഭക്കാരെല്ലാവരും കൂടിക്കഴിക്കുകയും വേണം.

ഈ ജ്ഞാനാധികാരത്തിന്റെ ഈ പകർച്ച മുഖാന്തിരം യാതൊരു പകർച്ചയും എടക്കേടും വരാതിരിപ്പാനായി നിങ്ങളുടെ സഭയിലെ കുമ്പസാരക്കാരാരായിരുന്നാലും അതതുസമയം പ്രത്യേകിച്ചുള്ളവരായിരുന്നാലും

Koonammavu of the Third Order sisters and the school and the orphanage attached to it, is under the canonical jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.

What I command you under holy obedience is this, in the running, government and *Regola* of the convent, school and the orphanage attached to it, you are not to make any change. But everything should be run as it was before. I desire and command you that your dealing, specially, towards the sisters of that order, towards those who request to join the convent, towards the children of the school and such others, should be without discrimination of Rites, with one and the same love, with compassion, without showing any preference for one Rite and behaving in the same manner towards all.

Then, since you have received a final solution for the problem, which appeared to be a cause of disturbances in your convent for quite sometimes, you must thank God Almighty, and all the sisters together must express your devotion and gratitude in benediction for three days.

I hereby approve and confirm the authority already obtained by ordinary or extra ordinary confessors of your convent, so

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>അവർക്ക് സിദ്ധിച്ചിരിക്കുന്ന അനുവാദങ്ങളെ നാം അംഗീകരിക്കുകയും ഉറപ്പിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യുന്നു. ഇത് തൃശൂരിൽ നിന്നും, ത്രിക്കോമിയായുടെ മെത്രാനും, തൃശൂർ വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കയുമായ അഡോൾഫസ് മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ട് മെത്രാൻ 1890 ഇടവം 21</p> | <p>that no change or difficulty may occur because of the change of the canonical jurisdiction. From Trichur Bishop Adolf Medlycott, Bishop of Tricomea and Vicar Apostolic of Trichur 1890 May 21</p> |
|--|---|

5.3.1.2.Main Points

- The Cardinals of the Sacred Congregation of the Propaganda Fide have decided in their meeting that the convent of Koonammavu of the Tertiary sisters and the school and the orphanage attached to it, is under the canonical jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.
- The sisters should not make any change neither in the running and government nor in the *Regola* of the convent and the school and orphanage attached to it; instead, everything should be run as it was before.
- The bishop requested and commanded the sisters that their dealings especially towards the other Rite sisters, towards those who request to join into the convent and to the children of the school should be without any discrimination of Rites but with same love and compassion. They should not show any preference, for the Syrian Rite than the Latin Rite, but behave in the same manner towards all.
- The sisters had to thank God Almighty for providing a final solution to the problem that was vexing the sisters for sometimes. They have to praise and adore the Almighty God for three days with the exposition of the Blessed Sacrament.

- Msgr. Medlycott approved and confirmed the already obtained authority of the confessor, both ordinary and extraordinary of the convent in order not to have any difficulty because of the change of the canonical jurisdiction of the convent.

5.3.1.3. Comments

- The letter gives an impression that Msgr. Medlycott had taken every step to avoid any problem which may arise due to the change of jurisdiction.
- The change of jurisdiction was the decision of the Holy See.
- Only the canonical jurisdiction of the convent is changed, nothing else.
- In the letter, it is specially mentioned that due to this change of canonical jurisdiction, there should not have any change in the functioning of the convent or the attached school and orphanage.
- He advised the sisters to consider each other and even the children in both school and orphanage without any discrimination on the basis of Rite.
- It can be specially noted the clause that the Prelate approved and confirmed the existing confessors of the convent in whatever Rite they belonged.

5.3.2. Reactions of the Latin People after the Decision of the Propaganda Fide

This section starts with the first hand experience of the sisters of the Koonammavu convent about the violent agitation and difficulties they had to suffer from the Latin laity. Then the mother Superior informed the matter to the

Archbishop⁷⁵ and his reply to the mother superior is given below. Followed by that there comes the letter of the Vicar of Parur Syrian parish to the mother superior of the convent. Finally, we allude to the letter of Fr. Philip who was entrusted by Msgr. Mellano to bring the situation of tension under control, reported his own version of the prevailing situation to the apostolic delegate Andrea Aiuti.

5.3.2.1. The Account of CKC II, 143-144

5.3.2.1.1. Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ഇപ്രകാരം സുറിയാനിക്കാരായ നമുക്ക് ഈ മഠം റോമയിൽ നിന്നു വിധിച്ചുണ്ടായ വിവരം കുന്നമ്മാവു ലത്തീൻകാരായ ജനങ്ങൾ അറിഞ്ഞപ്പോൾ ജനങ്ങൾ വലുതായ ബഹളങ്ങൾ ഉണ്ടാക്കാൻ തുടങ്ങി. എങ്ങിനെയെന്നാൽ മഠത്തിന്റെ പടിവാതുകളിലും മറ്റു ചുറ്റുപാടുകളിലും ജനങ്ങൾ കൂട്ടം കൂടി മതിൽക്കെട്ടിനുള്ളിൽ കടന്നു ഓരോ ശല്യങ്ങൾ ഉണ്ടാക്കുന്നതിനു മതിലിന്മേൽ കയറുകയും പടിവാതിലുകൾ തല്ലിപ്പൊളിക്കുകയും ജനലകളിൽക്കൂടെ സഹോദരികളെയും കുട്ടികളെയും ഭയവിഹലരാക്കിത്തീർക്കത്തക്ക വിധത്തിൽ ഓരോതരം ഗോഷ്ടികളെ കാണിക്കുകയും മഠത്തിൽ നിന്നു യാതൊരു വിവരവും പുറമേ അറിയിക്കുന്നതിനോ, പുറമേനിന്ന് ഞങ്ങളുടെ ആളുകളിൽ നിന്ന് വല്ല ആനുകൂല്യങ്ങൾ ലഭിക്കുന്നതിനോ ഇടയാകാത്ത വിധത്തിൽ കാവൽ കിടക്കുകയും മഠത്തിലേയ്ക്കു വരുന്നവരെ ഉപ</p> | <p>When the Latin people of Koonammavu came to know that Rome had judged the convent in favour of us Syrians, they began to make great agitations and disturbances. People came and crowded at the gate and the surroundings. They also jumped over the walls into the convent in groups and began to disturb us and cause troubles of various kinds. They kept walking on the walls. They broke open the door of the gate-house. Through the windows they frightened the sisters and scared the children showing ridiculous gestures. They stood on guard so that no information could go out from the convent. They also prevented our people from coming in, so as not to get any help from them. They hurt all those who came to the convent. They snatched and</p> |

⁷⁵ The copy of the letter written by the superior to Msgr. Mellano is not available.

ദ്രവിക്കയും കൊണ്ടു വന്നിരുന്ന സാമാനങ്ങൾ പിടിച്ച് പരിച്ച് എടുക്കയും നാനാവിധത്തിൽ കഴിയുന്നത്ര ഞെരുക്കങ്ങൾ ചെയ്കയും ചെയ്തിരുന്നു. ഇങ്ങനെയുള്ള ഉപദ്രവങ്ങൾ അഞ്ചെട്ട ദിവസത്തേക്ക് നീളിച്ചിരുന്നു. ഈ സംഭവങ്ങളെല്ലാം അടുത്ത ബംഗ്ലാവിൽ കണ്ടും കേട്ടുമിരുന്ന അച്ചന്മാർ വ്യസനിക്കുകയും അവർക്കു മറുപടിയേൽക്കുവരുന്നതിനോ രണ്ടുമൂന്നു ദിവസം കുർബാന ചൊല്ലുന്നതിനോ സാധിച്ചിരുന്നില്ല. എങ്കിലും അവർ ഈ ഉപദ്രവനിവാരണത്തിനുവേണ്ട ശ്രമങ്ങൾ ചെയ്തു കൊണ്ടിരിക്കുകയായിരുന്നു. പുന്നോളി ഇട്ടപ്പ എസ്തപ്പാനോസ് എന്നയാൾ അയാളുടെ സഹോദരികളെ കാണാനായി യാദൃശ്ചികമായി അവിടെ വരികയും ചെയ്തപ്പോൾ ടി. ജനങ്ങൾ അയാളെ അകത്തേക്കു കടത്താതിരിപ്പാൻ തക്കവണ്ണം തടയുകയും ബഹളങ്ങൾ ഒപ്പിക്കുകയും ചെയ്തതിനാൽ മടങ്ങിപ്പോയി. തളിയത്തു യൗസേപ്പു മുതലായവരോട് അറിയിച്ച അവരുമായി വീണ്ടും ഉച്ചകഴിഞ്ഞു മറുപടിയെടുക്കുവന്നു. മുൻപോൽ ജനങ്ങൾ തടസ്സമുണ്ടാക്കി എങ്കിലും കൂട്ടാക്കാതെ സാധ്യവും ബലവും പ്രയോഗിച്ച് പടിക്കുളളിൽ കടന്ന് തന്റെ സഹോദരികളേയും കണ്ടു സംസാരിച്ച് ഉടനെ വിവരം വീട്ടിൽ ചെന്ന് അറിയിച്ചു. അറിഞ്ഞ ഉടനെ എല്ലാവർക്കും വ്യസനമായി. എന്നാൽ മറിയം ത്രേസ്യമ്മയുടെ അപ്പൻ വരാൻ സുഖമില്ലാത്തതിനാൽ അഞ്ചു ഉറപ്പികയും കൊടുത്ത് ഒരാളെ ഉടനെ കുന്നമ്മാവിൽ അച്ചന്മാരുടെ പക്കൽ കൊടുത്തു ചിലവാടിന് കമ്പി അയയ്ക്കുന്ന

took away by force from them all the things they brought with them. They oppressed us in all possible ways as much they could. This they continued for about five to eight days. The fathers who were residing in the bungalow were seeing and hearing all that happened. They were very sad but totally helpless. They could not come to the convent. They could not even come to the convent to offer Holy Mass for two-three days. But they were taking steps to put an end to this oppression. One day Esthapanus Ittoop Poonoly happened to come here to pay a visit to his sisters. Then the people prevented him from getting in and ran riot at him. So he went back and informed people like Ouseph Thaliath. He came back with some other people to the gate of the convent. The protesters stopped them as in the morning. But they without paying heed to the rioters using their skill and strength forced themselves through the gate and visited his sisters. Soon after it, he returned home and informed the people there. On hearing this, all of them became anxious. Since Mariam Thresia's father was ill and unable to come, he sent a sum of Five Rupees, through a messenger to the priests at Koonammavu asking them to telegram to the Delegate. Thus the Reverend Fathers sent a

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>തിന് ഏൽപിക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു. ഇപ്രകാരം ബ. അച്ചന്മാർ ദല ഗാർ അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കായ്ക്കു കമ്പി അടിക്കുകയും തൃശൂർ മെത്രാനച്ചനും പല മാനുവൽക്കും കത്തുകൾ അയച്ചു വിവരം അറിയിക്കുകയും പറവൂരിൽ നിന്ന് പോലീസ് ഇൻസ്പെക്ടറേയും കോൺസ്റ്റബിൾമാരേയും വരുത്തുകയും ചെയ്തെങ്കിലും ബഹളത്തിനു കുറവുണ്ടായില്ല. കടശി സഹിക്കവയാതെ ആയപ്പോൾ നടക്കുന്ന സംഗതികൾ ഒക്കെയും മഞ്ഞുമേൽ താമസിച്ചിരുന്ന വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചനെ അറിയിച്ചു. ഉടനെ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചൻ തന്നെ കുന്നമ്മാവു പള്ളിയുടെ വികാരി ബ. പാതിരി അച്ചനു കൽപ്പന അയയ്ക്കുകയും മഠത്തിൽ ജനങ്ങൾ ലഹള നടത്തുന്നതായാൽ അവരെ കഠിനമായി ശിക്ഷിക്കുമെന്ന് കൽപ്പിക്കുകയും ചെയ്ത വിവരം പരസ്യപ്പെടുത്തിയതിനോടെ ലഹള അമർന്നു.</p> | <p>telegram to the Delegate Apostolic. They also sent letters to the Bishop of Trichur and to other respectable people informing them of the matter. Even though the inspector of Police and constables were brought from Parur, the riot continued in the same manner. In the end when they could no longer stand it, they informed the Archbishop of Varapuzha who was then residing at Manjummel. Immediately the Archbishop sent an order to the vicar of Koonammavu church (a diocesan priest) and commanded him to give serious punishment to those who caused disturbances in the convent. When this order was published, the riot subsided.</p> |
|--|---|

5.3.2.1.2. Main Points

- Riots and disturbances from the Latin laity increased.
- They prevented everyone from entering the convent, even the Fathers to say Holy Mass.
- It was the relatives of the Syrian sisters who had to use force in order to enter the convent and found out the existing miserable situation. They themselves gave money to the Tertiary fathers to send telegram to the Apostolic Delegate and informed the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur Msgr. Medlycott and brought police from Parur.
- Still there was not so much change in the situation. Only at this juncture the mother superior was forced to inform

Archbishop Mellano⁷⁶ who was then staying at Manjummel.

5.3.2.1.3. Comments

We will give our comments of this text of *CKC* when we discuss the letter of Fr. Philip to Msgr. Aiuti.

5.3.2.2. Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Superior of the Convent dated June 6th 1890

From the content of the letter, it is clear that it is a reply to the letter of the superior of the convent at Koonammavu dated 4th June. The mother seems to have notified Msgr. Mellano the threats, which the sisters had to encounter from the Latin laity. In reply to that letter, Msgr. Mellano thus wrote:

5.3.2.2.1. Original Letter

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>നാം പ്രെ. ലെയോനാർദ്ദിന്റെ ഒരു സാം ജൂയിസ് വരാപ്പുഴ രൂപതയുടെ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താ. കൂനമ്മാവ് കന്യാകാശമത്തിൽ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി വന്ദ്യ ഈശോയുടെ കത്രീനാമ്മയ്ക്ക്</p> <p>ഈ മാസം 4-നു നിങ്ങൾ എഴുതിയ യച്ച അപേക്ഷ കിട്ടി വായിച്ചറിഞ്ഞു. അതിൽ പറയുന്നതു പോലെ ആ ദിക്കിലുള്ള ആളുകൾ ആ മാത്തിനു സമീപമുള്ള വഴിയിൽ രാത്രി സമയം കൂടി അട്ടഹസിക്കുകയും മറ്റും ചെയ്ത വിവരം ഇതിനുമുമ്പിൽ നമുക്ക് അറിവു കിട്ടിയ ഉടനെ അങ്ങനെയുള്ള ക്രമക്കേടുകൾ ചെയ്തു കൂടായെന്ന് വേണ്ടപോലെ ജനങ്ങളെ തെരിയപ്പെടുത്തുവാൻ നമ്മുടെ വികാരി ജനറാൾ പെ.ബ. പീലിപ്പോസ് ഒരു സാം ജൂസെ</p> | <p>I, Leonardo Mellano of St. Louis, the Archbishop of Verapoly to the Superior of the convent at Koonammavu Sr. Catherine of Jesus,</p> <p>On 4th of this month, I received your letter and I read and came to know the things. As you have mentioned in that, the people of that side getting together at night in the way near to that convent and did shouting and other things; when I came to know these things, soon I have sent an order to my Vicar General Fr. Philip of St. Joseph saying to</p> |

⁷⁶ The text does not make explicit who did it.

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>മുപ്പച്ചൻ പാദ്രിക്കു കൽപന അയച്ചിട്ടുണ്ട്. ആ ദെഹം ഇക്കാര്യത്തിൽ തക്കപോലെ വിചാരിക്കുമെന്ന് നാം വിശ്വസിക്കുന്നു. അപേക്ഷപ്രകാരം നമ്മുടെ ആശീർവാദം തന്നിരിക്കുന്നു.</p> <p>ഇത് മഞ്ഞുമേൽ നിന്നും 1890 മിഥുനമാസം 6-ന്.</p> | <p>hold back the people from doing such things. I believe that he will take care of this thing well. As you have requested I give you my blessing.</p> <p>From Manjummel</p> <p>6th June 1890</p> |
|---|--|

5.3.2.2.2. Main points

- Msgr. Mellano says that he had already come to know about the violent reactions of the Latins.
- Immediately he had sent an order to his Vicar General Fr. Philip to desist from creating such disorders.
- Archbishop believes that Fr. Philip would take the necessary steps.

5.3.2.2.3. Comments

- This basic question may linger in the mind of the historians, why did not Archbishop Mellano immediately publish the whole document of the decision of the Holy See in Koonammavu and Verapoly parishes as soon as he got the Roman order on 18th April 1890? If he would have done so, most of the misunderstanding of the people would have been solved and they would not have had recourse to violent methods of agitation, since the document would have shown that no injustice was committed to the Latin sisters of the Koonammavu convent. Only the jurisdiction of the religious house was handed over to Msgr. Medlycott, who was appointed as the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur in 1887, to whose administrative

territory the Koonammavu convent belonged.⁷⁷ If the Latin laity would have been intimated the whole truth they would not have had resorted to violent and aggressive protest. Fr. Philip in his letter to Msgr. Aiuti the Apostolic Delegate dated 29th June 1890 mentions that once the order of Rome was published in the Koonammavu parish on 7th June 1890⁷⁸ the laity discontinued their agitation.

- The fact that the Latin laity continued their agitation even after the orders of the Archbishop may imply that either Fr. Philip had not taken any action or the people were disobeying him.
- Was the Latin clergy tacitly taking side with their laity? Was not Msgr. Mellano trying to wash his hands by providing the excuse that he had entrusted his Vicar General to create order and peace?

5.3.2.3. Letter of Fr. Hillarius the Syrian Vicar of Parur to the Sisters at Koonammavu convent dated 11th June 1890

Even though Msgr. Mellano wrote to the sisters on 6th of July 1890 informing them that he had entrusted Fr. Philip his Vicar General to stop the people from creating disturbances, no change had occurred in the situation. It seems that the sisters had approached Msgr. Medlycott with their grievance and the Vicar Apostolic entrusted the Vicar of the

⁷⁷ It is interesting to note that the Koonammavu monastery of the TOCD fathers in which all the members were Syrians was entrusted to the Latins in 1888, an year after the two Syrian Vicariates were erected, namely in 1887! Then no violent protests by Syrians are recorded in the historical documents, as had happened in the case of Koonammavu convent.

⁷⁸That is about one and half months after the reception of the decision of Rome!

nearby Syrian parish to take the necessary steps. The parish priest thus wrote to the sisters:

5.3.2.3.1. Original Letter

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>മിശിഹായിൽ സ്നേഹിക്കപ്പെട്ട എന്റെ സഹോദരിമാരേ, നിങ്ങൾ യാതൊന്നും ഭയപ്പെടേണ്ട. ലഹളകളും മറ്റും ഇതുവരെയുള്ളതിൽ അധികം ഉണ്ടായേക്കും എന്നാലും നിങ്ങൾ ഒന്നിനും ഭയപ്പെടുകയും വ്യസനിക്കുകയും വേണ്ട. ഒക്കെയും കുറേ ദിവസം കഴിഞ്ഞു തീരും. ഇന്നുമുതൽ കുർബാന മുടക്കുമെന്ന് ജനങ്ങൾ പറയുന്നുണ്ട്. ഒരു സമയം മുടങ്ങുമായിരിക്കും. അതുകൊണ്ടും വ്യസനിക്കേണ്ട. ദൈവം എല്ലാം നേരെയൊക്കും. സർക്കാരു നീതിയായിട്ടു ചെയ്യും. പുതുശ്ശേരി പൈതങ്ങൾ മൂന്നും അവിടെ പാർക്കട്ടെ. വാതിലുകൾ നല്ലവണ്ണം പൂട്ടിയും തുറക്കാതെയും മറ്റും സൂക്ഷിക്കണം. പുറമേ കേൾക്കുന്നതുകൊണ്ട് ഒന്നും ഭയപ്പെടേണ്ട. ഇവിടെ പോലീസു ശിപായികൾ കാവലുണ്ടാകും. ഒരു വക ഉപദ്രവവും നിങ്ങൾക്കുണ്ടാകയില്ല. ദൈവത്തോട് അപേക്ഷിക്ക മാത്രമാകുന്നു നിങ്ങൾ ചെയ്യേണ്ടത്. വേണ്ടതെല്ലാം ഞാൻ ചെയ്യുന്നതാണ്. ഒന്നും പേടിക്കേണ്ട. ഭയപ്പെടേണ്ട. ഈ ആൾ വരും 5 ഇടങ്ങഴി അരിയും അതിനു വേണ്ട മറ്റുവല്ല കറി സാമാനങ്ങളും കൊടുത്തയയ്ക്കണം. പ്രയാസമാണെങ്കിൽ വേണ്ട. ഇപ്പോൾ നിങ്ങൾ ഒരുത്തർക്കും എഴുത്തുകുത്തുകളും ചെയ്യേണ്ട. വേണ്ടത് അറിയിക്കാം എഴുത്തുകിട്ടിയവിവരത്തിന് മുദ്രപൊട്ടിയോ എന്നു മറുപടി അയയ്ക്കണം. എന്ന് സഹോദരൻ ടി.സി. ഹില്ലാരിയോസ് കത്തനാർ പറവൂർ വികാരി</p> | <p>My dear sisters in Jesus Christ, Do not be afraid of anything. Aggressions, oppositions etc. may occur more than what we had until now. Still you do not be afraid and worried. After some days, all these will end. People are saying that from today onwards they will not allow to celebrate Holy Mass there in the convent. That also may happen. Do not be worried. God will make everything all right. Government will do the things in a just way. Let the three Puthussery children stay there. Be careful to lock the doors well and not to open them. Do not be afraid of what is hearing from outside. Police personnel will be there to guard you. There will not be any harm on you. The only thing you need to do is to pray to God. The rest I will do. Do not be frightened or afraid. If it is possible, send with this person 5 measure (<i>edangazhy</i>) rice and the vegetable that is needed. Now, there is no need of writing to anyone else. I will inform you what is needed. When you get this letter, please check the seal of the letter whether it is opened</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>1890 മിഥുനം 11-ന് എന്റെ സഹോദരിമാരേ ഒന്നും ഭയപ്പെടേണ്ട. ഒന്നും സാരമില്ല.</p> | <p>or not and inform me that in your reply. Brother Fr. T.C. Hillarius Vicar, Parur 11th June 1890 My dear sisters don't be afraid,</p> |
|--|--|

5.3.2.3.2. Main Points

- Fr. Hillarius consoles the sisters not to be afraid of anything. Even if the situation may grow worse, it will come to a happy end.
- Although the Latin laity has threatened to disallow the celebration of the daily Mass in the convent, God will interfere and everything will be settled and the government also will provide justice.
- Meanwhile the sisters should be careful to lock the doors and not to open them.
- The police personnel will be guarding the convent. What the sisters had to do is to pray. He will do whatever is necessary.
- The sisters should not write letters to the outsiders; he requests them to inform him whether they received this letter and pay attention that whether the seal of this letter was broken.

5.3.2.3.3. Comments

- From the letter of the parish priest of Parur, one gets the impression that the situation in Koonammavu was grave and tensed after the order of Rome regarding the change of the jurisdiction of the convent.
- A question may come to an impartial mind whether Msgr. Mellano or his Vicar General had tried their best to convince the people of the total content of the Roman

decision. Most probably, the Latin laity had not become aware of the full decision, which allowed the Latin sisters to stay at Koonammavu with equal rights and privileges which they were previously enjoyed.

- If the local Latin laity would have realized this truth they would have ceased to make any further agitations, and the history of women TOCD would have remained the same as it was in its foundation and early stages.

5.3.2.4. Letter of Fr. Philip the Vicar General of Msgr. Mellano dated 29th June 1890

Fr. Philip, the Vicar General of Msgr. Mellano sent this report to the Apostolic Delegate, Andrea Aiuti on 29th June 1890. Here by Fr. Philip informs the Apostolic Delegate the matters that took place in Koonammavu when the people came to know the decision of Rome regarding the convent at Koonammavu.

5.3.2.4.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>A sua Eccellenza Rev. Mons. Aiuti Arcivescovo di Aerida e Vicario Apostolico per le Indie Orientali</p> <p>Varapoly 29 Giugno 1890</p> <p>Eccellenza Reverendissima</p> <p>Quantunque non chiamato in causa, perchè non richiesto da Vostra Eccellenza, nonostante tutto ritengo opportuno di darle una breve notizia, ma che corrisponde a verità dei disordini che, all inizio di questo mese, ebbero luogo presso il monastero di Cunemao. Trovandomi in quel luogo, Monsignor Leonardo mi mandò il decreto della S.</p> | <p>To your very Rev. Excellency Msgr. Aiuti, Archbishop of Acrida and Apostolic Vicar for Oriental India,</p> <p>Verapoly 29th June 1890</p> <p>Very Rev. Excellency,</p> <p>Although not in the case as I was not requested by your Excellency, nevertheless I think it would be better if I gave you news in brief but true, about some disorders occurred at Koonammavu convent at the beginning of this month. While I was in that place, Msgr. Leonardo sent me the decree of the S. Congregation about the</p> |

Congregazione circa la giurisdizione di quel monastero ecc. Dopo averlo letto, mi uniformai interamente alla Volontà di Dio ed ho tenuto la notizia segreta, per non creare malcontento tra la popolazione. Ma dopo pochi giorni la cosa si è propagate ed io subito ho fatto chiamare alcuni delle principali a famiglie e li esortai a sottomettersi in tutto e per tutto la Volontà del Papa, e che se avevano delle ragioni, potevano esporle a chi aveva responsabilità, e questo non era un peccato, ma il creare dei disordini era un'offesa a Dio ed era un attirarsi sopra se stessi la sua maledizione; essi adducevano molte cose in favore della loro causa, aggiungendo che eravamo noi i colpevoli non avendo esposto come si doveva le loro ragioni a Roma e minacciavano sia me che altri Missionari.

Dopo di questo, per tre giorni ci furono grida sulla strada pubblica nelle vicinanze del monastero. Appena lo seppi, scrissi a Mons. Arcivescovo il quale, dopo poche ore, mi spedì un suo ordine da far conoscere alla popolazione. La radunai e lessi l'ordine di Monsignore e, per quanto era in mio potere li esortai alla quiete; essi mi promisero che sarebbero stati quieti. A questo punto la Superiore del monastero, mi scrisse chiedendomi di far

jurisdiction of the convent etc. Once I read it, I confirmed entirely to God's will and kept the news secret to avoid discontent among the people. But after few days the news spread and immediately I called some of the most prominent families and encouraged them to submit in everything to the will of the Holy Father; if they had some grievance they could go and complain to the people in charge as this was not a sin but to create disorders was in offence to God and would attract His curse, they presented many things in favour of their cause, adding that it was our fault, as we did not explain properly their grievance to Rome, and were threatening me and the other missionaries. After this, they shouted for three days on the road near the convent. As soon as I heard about it, I wrote to the Archbishop, who after few hours sent me his order to make the people understand the things. I assembled them and read out to them the order of Monsignor and I urged them as much as I could to behave quietly; they promised me they would. At this point, the mother superior of the convent, wrote asking me to appeal to the Government. I replied that for this she should go to other

ricorso al governo. Le risposi che per questo si dirigesse ad altri; la esortai e lusingai a non fare questo passo, e che credesse a me che sono vecchio e non a giovani Terziarii, che un poco di pazienza e prudenza tutto sarebbe finito. Ma non voleva attenersi al mio consiglio; passati due giorni, alcuni Terziarii, assieme al Vicario della chiesa di Parur, vennero con l'ispettore di polizia e molti Scipai. Subito si sparse la voce che il Vicario Apostolico di Trichur veniva con la forza armata a prendere possesso del Monastero. Subito si radunò una gran folla di popolo, e non permisero alla gente della polizia di entrare nel piazzale del Monastero, dicendo che essi avevano fatto appello a Roma, e questa è stata la causa per cui il padre Alberto non potè per due giorni andare al Monastero per celebrarvi la Messa.

Mons. Arcivescovo scrisse una lettera esortando il popolo a cessare da tale violenza, per cui il popolo ed i Scipai sgombrarono il luogo, ed il giorno seguente, che era domenica, fece pubblicare nella chiesa, come a Verapoly che a Cunemao il decreto della S. Congregazione ed ora tutto è in pace. Pregai la Superiora del Monastero che in mio nome scrivesse al vicario apostolico di Trichur, perchè differisse di qualche tempo la sua venuta;

people; I begged her not to follow that road but to listen to me that I am an old man not a young Tertiary, that with a bit of patience and prudence everything would end okay. However, she would not listen to my advice; after two days some Tertiaries, together with the Vicar of Parur Church came with the police inspector and many police (*sipayies*). Immediately a rumour spread that Ap. Vicar of Trichur had come with the armed men to take possession of the convent. At once a great number of people assembled and they would not allow the police to enter in the Convent square, saying that they had appealed to Rome, and that is why Fr. Alberto could not go to the Convent to celebrate Mass for two days.

The Archbishop wrote a letter advising the people to stop such violence, after which the people and the police cleared the place and following day being a Sunday, he issued in the Churches of Verapoly and Koonammavu the decree of the Congregation, and now there is peace everywhere. I asked the mother superior of the convent to write on my behalf, to the Apostolic Vicar of Trichur, to postpone for a little while his visit here. She made me reply that she wanted to see, if the

essa mi fece rispondere che voleva vedere se il nominato Monsignore avesse forza sufficiente per prendere possesso del monastero.

Alcune imprudenze commesse, l'antipatia che da qualche tempo inquina le acque tra Latini e Soriani e soprattutto la mancanza di timore i Dio, sono state le cause principali di tutti i disordini; inoltre una monache di quell monastero mi disse che alcune monache andavano dicendo che Mons. Arcivescovo ed io, eravamo gli autori di questi disordini ed un'altra pure mi disse che essa sapeva (il che è semplice calunnia) che il tale Padre latino aveva somministrato denaro per questo, con tante altre cattiverie; il risposi che non eravamo venuti nel Malabar per dannarci.

Con tutto il cuore le chiedo la sua Pastorale Benedizione mentre ho l'onore di sottoscrivermi

Di Sua Eccellenza
Reverendissima
Umilissimo Servitore e Suddito
F. Filippo di S. Giuseppe
Carmelitano Scalzo

elected Monsignor had enough strength to take possession of the convent.

The main causes of all the disorders were some carelessness, the bad feelings which have polluted the water of Latins and Syrians for sometimes, and most of all, the lack of the fear of God. Furthermore, a nun of that convent told me that some nuns were spreading the rumours that it was due to Archbishop and me that the troubles started; and another nun was also saying that she knew (an absolute lie) of a certain Latin father who had given money for this reason, and many other nasty rumours. I replied that we had not come to Malabar to make us rich.

With all my heart, I beg for your pastoral blessing while I have the honour to sign myself as the humblest servant and subject of your Reverent Excellency.

Fr. Philip of St. Joseph
Disalced Carmelite

5.3.2.4.2. Main Points

- Even though the Apostolic Delegate had not asked Fr. Philip a report of the aftermath of division, it seems that he out of his own initiative wrote this letter.

- First of all, he confesses that he accepts the Sacred Congregation's decision to hand over the convent to the jurisdiction of the Syrian hierarch as God's will.
- Although such a decision was kept secret⁷⁹ the people came to know of it.
- Immediately the Latin laity became agitated and Fr. Philip called some of the prominent families and told them to submit to the will of God.
- Although they could inform their complaints to the legitimate ecclesiastical authorities, it is an offence to God to create disorders.
- The people presented many things in favour of their cause and accused the Latin hierarchy who has not explained things properly to Rome. Because of this, they were threatening Fr. Philip and other missionaries. They uninterruptedly screamed and shouted near the convent for three days.
- Fr. Philip informed Msgr. Mellano about their agitation. Msgr. Mellano sent his order, which he read out to the people, advising them to keep quiet which they obeyed.
- But the mother superior of the convent wanted him to get the police protection, which he refused by saying that she could approach someone else for that.
- At the same time, he asked her to listen to him, an old man who is not a young Tertiary and to show a bit of patience and prudence. But she was not willing to follow his advice. After few days, some Syrian fathers together with the Syrian Vicar of Parur church came with police inspector and his band.

⁷⁹ The question here is, why did it keep as secret?

- Then a rumour was spread out that Msgr. Medlycott had come with armed men to take possession of the convent. A good number of parishners assembled and hindered the police to enter into the convent square saying that they had appealed to Rome.
- Then Msgr. Mellano wrote a letter advising the people to desist from violence. Accordingly, the people and the police left the place.
- Next Sunday Msgr. Mellano published the decree of the decision of the Sacred Congregation in the churches of Verapoly and Koonammavu. At this the peace was restored.
- Then Fr. Philip accuses the mother superior of the convent that she was not willing to obey his advice to ask Msgr. Medlycott to postpone his visit for little while. She replied that she wanted to see whether the nominated Syrian hierarch had enough strength to take possession of the convent.
- Fr. Philip concludes that the main cause for these disorders were the acts of imprudence committed, because of which the atmosphere of co-existence between Latins and Syrians was polluted. He finds above all that there lacked the fear of God which brought out all these disorders.
- One of the sisters of the convent had told him that some sisters were spreading the news that the Archbishop Mellano and Fr. Philip were the real agents behind such disorders; and another nun even told him that she knew (an absolute lie) of a certain Latin priest who had

supplied money for it and for other wicked things.⁸⁰ At these, Fr. Philip replied that the missionaries had come to Malabar not to make them rich.

5.3.2.4.3. Comments

- A reading of this letter seems to provide an impression that the main motive behind approaching the Apostolic Delegate was not to provide an objective information, otherwise Fr. Philip would not have given much stress to the so called role played by Sr. Catherine whom he accuses of lack of patience and prudence as well as arrogance. The accusation of lack of patience is refuted in the above mentioned *CKC* account where the sisters' decision to inform the Archbishop was made after many days of patient enduring of the threats and insults. Does not his reference of himself as an old man and not a young Syrian Tertiary sarcastic?
- Also, Fr. Philip seems to forget that the stress and anxiety experienced by the mother superior, as the inmates of the convent were very much frightened at the continuous day and night screams and shouts of the mob just outside the convent as to affect the serenity of their minds. The earlier cited text *CKC* II, 143-144 gives a detailed account of the tensed situation that prevailed nearby the convent. Could a superior who loves the sisters remain silent at such a wretched situation, when they were deprived of the essential things for sustenance both material and spiritual for 5 to 8 days?⁸¹

⁸⁰It seems that Fr. Philip was meaning that the money was provided to the Latin missionaries in order to support the agitation of the people.

⁸¹ cf. *CKC* II, 143.

- The response of Fr. Philip at the request of the mother superior to appeal to the government⁸² does not seem to be proper to the Christian values of charity and biblical vision of standing with the oppressed people. He said to her that for this she should turn to somebody else and not to him.
- From his letter, it becomes clear that the Vicar General maintained contact with the Latin sisters. The first of the cited two informants was beyond doubt a Latin sister. She informed him that some sisters in the convent were spreading rumours that the Archbishop and Fr. Philip were agents behind all the troubles.⁸³ Another informant who claimed to know a Latin father who had bribed the missionaries to stand for the cause of the Latin sisters was more nefarious. Her motive seems to be to turn the Latin authorities against the Syrians.
- Taking into consideration all these facts, it is not easy to accept the conclusion of Fr. Philip that the main cause for the disorders was the acts of imprudence and lack of fear of God. He purposefully seems to omit whom he was accusing, Latin or Syrian?⁸⁴

⁸²In the account of *CKC II*, 144 the initiative to call the police came not from sisters but from the relatives and the Tertiary fathers!

⁸³ Does not this mean that even the Latin sisters were influenced by the Latin factor that was the motive behind the outside agitations? Hence, it is unjust to accuse the Syrian sisters alone who were vitiating the harmonious atmosphere of the convent.

⁸⁴The response of mother Catherine at the request of Fr. Philip to make postpone the visit of Msgr. Medlycott [if one believes the words of Fr. Philip], cannot be laudable. Perhaps she, seeing the sufferings of the inmates had come to a stage where she had lost her whole patience and tolerance. As it is clear from the table of election, after her profession mother Catherine was continuously being elected either as superior or as assistant superior. If she was so intolerant and impatient how could the

5.3.3. Regarding the Transfer of Latin Sisters to Verapoly

5.3.3.1. Letter of Latin Sisters to Fr. Philip dated on 7th June 1890

We do not have the original Malayalam version of the letter written by the Latin sisters of the community to Fr. Philip the Vicar General of Msgr. Mellano on 7th June 1890. Its Italian version was sent to Rome by Msgr. Mellano on 15th June 1890. We give below the Italian version and its English translation.

5.3.3.1.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>Versione Italiana della lettera collettiva delle Monache Latine presenti nel monastero di S. Teresa in Cunemnavuo, scritta al padre Filippo Vicario generale</p> <p style="text-align: right;">J.M.J.</p> <p>Dal Monastero di Cunemao 7 Gigno 1890</p> <p>Reverendissimo Padre Pregandola di accogliere I nostri saluti filiali, esponiamo quanto segue:</p> <p>1) A causa della divisione avvenuta tra noi latine e quelle di altro rito, sono ormai due o tre anni che viviamo in modo triste e doloroso. Avendo noi sopportato i sarcasmi e le opera contrarie all' unione, fatte a alcune di esse, anche la nostra mente e il nostro corpo si sono</p> | <p>Italian version of the collective letter of the sisters who are present in the convent of St. Teresa in Koonammavu written to Fr. Philip, the Vicar General</p> <p style="text-align: center;">J.M.J.</p> <p>From the Convent of Koonammavu, 7th June 1890</p> <p>Very Rev. Father,</p> <p>Requesting you to accept our filial greetings, we express the following:</p> <p>1) Due to the division that happened between us Latins and that of the other Rite, we almost two or three years live in sadness and grief. We were bearing the sarcasms and works against the unity, made by some of the sisters; also our mind and body are weakened. We request to be freed from</p> |

sisters elect her consecutively? For election details, see *WFF*, Chapter IV, No. 4.3.3.3. 'Sr. Catherine of Jesus.'

indeboliti. Noi preghiamo di essere liberate da tale situazione.

2) Facendo la confessione dai Terziari Conventuali, non abbiamo la libertà necessaria. Da quando il Rev. P. Alberto cominciò a confessare in questo luogo, ha fatto sorgere la divisione, ed allontanò tutte le sorelle soriane dal P. Missionario (P. Filippo Vic. Generale) e lui solo le confessa. Generalmente spende nel confessionale moltissimo tempo per ciascuna di loro, e le altre stanno ad aspettare, per cui sono pochissime quelle che partecipano alla vita commune. Dopo la confessione stanno a parlare e commentare le cose ascoltate nel confessionale; non ossevano il silenzio, la solitudine e il ritiro richiesto dalla regola. Il Monastero è pieno di ciò che avviene fuori e per tutto questo noi non ci troviamo a nostro agio a confessarci da questi padre Terziari.

3) I nostril parenti ed amici provano grande dispiacere per il fatto che noi abitiamo in questo monastero.

4) Il Rev. Mons. Arcivescovo di Verapoly ha fabricato un Monastero per noi, per cui la preghiamo di darci il permesso di uscire da qui. Chiedendo la sua Apostolica e paterna benedizione, ci sottoscriviamo

such a situation.

2) We do not have freedom necessary for making confession to the Tertiary fathers. When Fr. Albert [Tertiary] began to hear confession in this place, he has caused to create the division and all the Syrian sisters had distanced themselves from the missionary father (Fr. Philip, the Vicar General) and made their confession only to Fr. Albert. Each Syrian sister usually spent more time at the confessional and others had to wait; very few of them participated in the common life. After the confession, they keep on talking and commenting what they have heard at the confessional; they do not observe the silence, the solitude and the withdrawal to the rooms as mentioned in the *Regola*. The convent is full of what comes from outside and because of all these, we do not feel comfortable to make our confession to these Tertiary fathers.

3) Our relatives and friends are very much displeased at the facts which prevail in this convent.

4) The very Rev. Archbishop of Verapoly has built a convent for us, therefore, we request you to give us the permission of leaving from this convent.

Asking your apostolic and

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>Sue Serve e Figlie Suor Elisabetta di S. Maria Suor Teresa di Gesu Suor Anastasia di S. Giuseppe Suor Angela di S. Teresa Suor Beatrice di Gesu Suor Elisabetta Suor Maria Copia della lettera collettiva delle Monache Latine del Monastero in Cunemao: versione fedele + Fr. Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Arcivescovo di Verapoly Magnamey 15 Giugno 1890</p> | <p>paternal blessing we the undersigned, Your servants and daughters, Sr. Elizabeth of Holy Mary Sr. Teresa of Jesus Sr. Anastasia of St. Joseph Sr. Angela of St. Teresa Sr. Beatrice of Jesus Sr. Elizabeth (Lay sister) Sr. Maria (Lay sister) Copy of the collective letter of the Latin sisters of the convent in Koonammavu: faithful version + Fr. Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Archbishop of Verapoly Manjummel 15th June 1890</p> |
|---|--|

5.3.3.1.2. Main Points

- Due to the division that happened between the Latins and the Syrians, the Latin sisters almost two or three years live in sadness and grief. They were bearing the sarcasms and works against the unity, made by some of the (Syrian) sisters and their mind and body are weakened. They request to be get freed from such a situation.
- They do not have necessary freedom for making their confession to the Tertiary fathers. When Fr. Albert [Tertiary] began to hear confession, he has caused to create the division and all the Syrian sisters had distanced themselves from Fr. Philip, the Vicar General and made their confession only to Fr. Albert. The Syrian sisters spent more time at the confessional, very few participated in the common life, do not observe the silence, solitude and the withdrawal to the rooms as mentioned in the *Regola*. The convent is full of what

comes from outside and because of all these, the Latin sisters do not feel comfortable to make their confession to the Tertiary fathers.

- The relatives and friends of the Latin sisters are very much displeased at the facts which prevailed in the convent.
- Msgr. Mellano has built a convent for them therefore, they request Fr. Philip to give them permission of leaving from the convent at Koonammavu.

5.3.3.1.3. Comments

- It seems strange that none of the above mentioned letters⁸⁵ refer to the dissensions and sarcastic conversations that prevailed in the community of the religious, the proponents of which were Syrian sisters. Even Fr. Philip in his letter to the Apostolic Delegate in which he finds fault with the behaviour of mother Catherine does not speak about such tensions. Also Msgr. Mellano who was a well known antagonist of the Syrians fails to bring up such an accusation.
- One cannot *a priori* reject the possibility of discords after the erection of Syrian Vicariates on 20th May 1887. Also, the Tertiary fathers may have contributed their part in posturing such sentiments. Still the letter of the Latin sisters to Fr. Philip which was immediately sent by Msgr. Mellano to Rome,⁸⁶ seems to contain exaggerations which are meant to present the Syrian sisters in negative light, as if all of them were breaking rules of silence, solitude and community life. One may

⁸⁵ Letter of Mellano dated 6th June 1890, Fr. Hilarius dated 11th June 1890 and that of Fr. Philip dated 29th June 1890.

⁸⁶ It seems that Msgr. Mellano was acting here as if he were looking for a chance to accuse the Syrians.

admit the possibility that some of them would have sometimes behaved such a way. In the letter the Latin sisters speak of their relatives and friends who became antagonistic to the Syrian sisters. How could they know such things unless some of the Latin sisters would not have told them? This means that the Latin sisters cannot claim themselves as totally innocent and simply the victims of the mental persecution of the Syrian members.⁸⁷

- At the end of the letter, they request Fr. Philip to give them permission to leave from the convent of Koonammavu to that of Verapoly. This is indeed a farfetched and disproportionate request. It is very strange that they failed to mention any of the disturbances created by the Latin Laity in the surroundings of the convent. Is not the letter presented one-sided story? Perhaps some Latin fathers would have prompted them to write or even would have dictated the words of the letter. Of course, this is a mere conjuncture about which we do not have direct evidence. The paradox is that Latin sisters themselves write to Fr. Philip, the Vicar General and their confessor that the Syrian sisters are reluctant to make their confession with him and the Latin sisters do not have the freedom to make confession with the Tertiary fathers.⁸⁸

⁸⁷ It is worthy to make a comparison between their behaviour to those of the Syrian sisters' who did not inform their relatives of the agony they were facing. It was when by chance one of them came to see his sisters to Koonammavu that he became aware of the critical situation. See *CKC II*, 144.

⁸⁸ Sr. Suzy in her dissertation presents such allegation under the subtitle "the Founding Members under house Arrest" (*SGME*, 298-299). "The founding members became prisoners in the convent which they had founded and constructed." This statement is intended to portray the

5.3.3.2. Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Prefect of the Propaganda Fide Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni dated 14th June 1890

This letter is a delayed reply of Msgr. Mellano to the Prefect of Propaganda Fide. As mentioned above on 18th April 1890 Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni sent a letter to Msgr. Mellano informing the Prelate the decision of the Holy See entrusting the jurisdiction of the convent at Koonammavu to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. Two months later on 14th June the Archbishop sends the reply mentioning also the reason for his delay as the high fever and fatigue. Here is the original version of the letter. The copy of this letter has sent to the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Aiuti.

5.3.3.2.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| Eminenza Reverendissima, Ho tardato a comunicare di aver ricevuto la lettera di Vostra Eminenza N. 1515/85 in cui mi annuncia la decisione di sua Eminenza circa la giurisdizione sul monastero delle nostre Terziarie, vicino alla chiesa di Cunemao e dentro i limiti della Diocesi di | Very Rev. Eminence, I was late to communicate that I have received the letter of your Eminence No. 1515/85 in which you announced to me the decision of your Eminence about the jurisdiction of the convent of our Tertiary sisters, near the church of Koonammavu and within the |

monstrosity of the behaviour of the Syrian sisters. For this, she was depending upon the writings of Bro. Leopold and Sr. Prescilla [for the objective historical non-validity of both these sources see *AUSW* 61-62 and *WFF*, Chapter I, FN, 40]. She even blames mother Catherine for not allowing to make any contact with outsiders. How could then their relatives and friends come to know the so-called unbearable life situation in the convent? Even Sr. Sucey holds that the Syrian sisters were trying their best to oust the Latin sisters from the Koonammavu convent. The Letter of the Latin sisters which puts the Syrian sisters in bad light does not dare to bring such a wicked accusation!.

Verapoly. Tale ritardo è dovuto ad una forte febbre e ad una grande debolezza che ancora non è finita.

Penso non vi sia bisogno di manifestare a Vostra Eminenza la sorpresa e il grandissimo dispiacere che tale decisione ha causato a tutta l'Archidiocesi. Simili cose, non è facile che si comprendano da coloro a cui simili istituzioni non costarono nulla, ma a coloro che sudarono molto, e con sommo disinteresse fabbricarono in tanti anni, per il bene di tutti i cristiani, tanto da invecchiare prima del tempo, e viviamo ancora tutti (tranne Mons. Bernardino di felice memoria) è oltremodo doloroso vedersi all'improvviso spogliare di opere così grandiose.

Speravo, Eminenza, che almeno al termine della decisione ci fosse qualche aggiunta, cioè che almeno il denaro che ultimamente avevo speso per la costruzione dell'Orfanotrofio unito al monastero per accogliere in modo particolare, ma le bambine pagane e per la nuova scuola esterna ecc. Mi fosse rimborsato, ma nulla fu preso in considerazione. In quanto all'Orfanotrofio, ho avuto il denaro da una pia signora, per mezzo di un Religioso che sta in Italia a motivo del favore che godeva presso quella

limit of the diocese of Verapoly. That delay was occurred due to a high fever and fatigue which is not yet finished.

I think, there is no need of expressing to your Eminence the shock and the great displeasure that decision has caused in the whole Archdiocese. To those who had not pain anything for such institution cannot understand such things but to those who have sweated blood and with much selflessly constructed in these years for the good of all Christians, as to have become old before time, and all of them live now (except Msgr. Bernardine of happy memory) is extremely painful to see the unexpected tearing of such grand works.

Your Eminence I had hoped that while informing us the decision there would have been some notes about the money that were spent ultimately for the construction of the orphanage attached to the convent to accommodate particularly the gentile children and for the new external school etc. That would have been reimbursed me; but nothing was taken in consideration. I have had the money for the orphanage from a pious lady through a religious who was in Italy with following intentions:

signora. L'ha ottenuto per inviario a me per fabbricare un Ospedale che servisse tutte le caste, volento essa assolutamente che così fosse impiegato. Feci poi in modo che quella signora acconsentisse a costruire anche un Orfanotrofio e benchè ora non trovi nessun documento circa la sua approvazione, credo però che l'abbia dato, col patto che si facesse pure un Ospedale, come io stesso ho notato nel mio libro particolare quando ho ricevuto tale offerta. Ed ora anche con l'aiuto dei fedeli pagani e maomettani ho fatto costruire un grande ospedale e non sono pochi i pagani che muoino col Battesimo, ma mi mancano i mezzi per mantenervi molti poveri. Quando poi mi accorsi che a Cunemao, per l'aria malsana e l'acqua inquinata, come dissero i medici, le povere orfane si ammalavano e morivano (di 100 ne erano morte 28 e tutte della stessa malattia: eruzioni cutanee e gonfiezza in tutto il corpo), allora, per toglierle di la, avevo cominciato a far costruire a Verapoly un monastero e un orfanotrofio per trasferirle appena fosse terminato e per far questo ho usato in parte il denaro di quella signora. Ma all'improvviso sono stato

She had sent it to me to construct a hospital, which serves all castes, willed thus absolutely for such an intention. I made according to that lady's approval to construct also an orphanage. But now I could not find any document about such a consent. I believe therefore that she had given the money with the condition of making a hospital, as I have noted in my diary when I received that amount. And now also with the help of gentile Christians and Muslims I made to construct a grand hospital and there were very few pagans who die without baptism. But I had no means to sustain many poor people.

When I agree that at Koonammavu, for the unhealthy air and polluted water as the doctors say, the poor orphans become sick and die (among the hundred 28 have been died and all of them with the same sickness: skin eruption and swelling in the whole body), then to take them away from there I have started to construct at Verapoly a convent and an orphanage; for transferring them soon it would terminate and for doing this I have used in part the money of that Lady. But all of a sudden everything has been taken away, thus I am not able to finish the construction which I

spogliato di tuto, così da non poter terminare di costruire quanto avevo iniziato.

Anche la Pia Opera della Propagazione della Fede, non so per quale motivo, mi ha ridotto gli aiuti al minimi termini, solo 4000 franchi per cui non posso provvedere ai bisogni più urgenti della Missione, come ad Orfanotrofi, catecumenati, chiese, ecc. e le rendite della Missione appena bastano per le spese ordinarie della casa di Verapoly. Ora poi, anche contraendo debiti, devo assolutamente terminare almeno la parte necessaria per le Monache Latine e l'Orfanotrofo, e devo far notare a Vostra Eminenza che le Monache Latine, tra le quali le prime due fondatrici (la 3^o è morta) cominciarono il Monastero di Cunemao nella propria casa e nel proprio palmeto, e furono le uniche Superiori per molti anni. Da due anni in qua soffrono come martiri, ed ora, essendo loro impossibile continuare a vivere in quel luogo, mi pregarono di chiamarle al più presto a Verapoly, come Vostra Eminenza potrà vedere nella lettera unita alla presente. Vostra Eminenza non può immaginare, nè io lo posso spiegare in poche parole, lo spavento che da due anni ha invaso le povere Monache

have had initiated.

Also the Pious Operation of the Propagation of Faith, I do not know in which motive, has reduced the helps which were given to me to the minimum terms, only 4000 franc with which I cannot provide to the more urgent needs of the mission, as to the orphanage, catechumenates, church etc. and the income of the mission hardly enough for the ordinary expenses of the house of Verapoly. Now then also I have got into debt, I have to absolutely finish at least the necessary part for the Latin nuns and the orphanage and I must note to your Eminence that the Latin nuns among whom the first two foundresses (the third one is died) have started that convent at Koonammavu in their proper house and in their proper land, and they were the unique superiors for many years. From two years they suffer here as martyrs, and now it is being impossible for them to continue to live in that place, they request to me to call them as early as possible to Verapoly, as your Eminence can see in their letter attached to the present one. Your Eminence cannot imagine, and also I cannot explain in few words, the fear that invading that poor Syrians (Latins?) nuns from two years,

Soriane*, specialmente dopo che alcuni Terziari Soriani hanno avuto accesso a quel luogo.

Prego per tanto Vostra Eminenza a dare il necessario permesso e l'ordine, in modo che passano le monache latine uscire da quell'ergastolo e venire a fondare a Verapoly, come già erano destinate da 5 anni, quando cominciarono quelle costruzioni che faccio completare per il minimo indispensabile, come sopra ho detto, anche per le orfane.

Credo sia pure necessarie far sapere a Vostra Eminenza che con mio grande dolore sono venuto ora a conoscenza, che i Latini, tutti uniti, vanno dicendo che io non ho fatto conoscere a Vostra Eminenza tutte le ragioni che hanno i Latini su quel Monastero, avendo essi lasciato il palmeto, dove avevano e loro case, per fabbricarvi un monastero e che mai ebbero intenzione di spogliarsene per i Soriani. Sono quindi molto adirati e sento dire che si sono opposti anche alla forza pubblica dicendo che essi hanno fatto appello. Con tutto ciò, dopo un mio ordine, dato al mio Vicario Generale che so trovava a Cunemao e che lo spiegò loro e li esortò alla quiete ed alla pace, infine si quietarono.

Ma venuta la notizia che il

especially after some Syrian Tertiary have had access to that place.

I request your Eminence above all, to give the necessary permission and order in way that the Latin nuns can be exited from that prison and come to found at Verapoly, as they were already destined from 5 years, when started that constructions that I make to complete for minimum inevitable as I said above, also for the orphans. I believe this also necessary to bring to the attention of your Eminence that with my deep sorrow, I have come now to understand that the Latins, all united go on telling that I have not made understand to your Eminence all the reasons that the Latins have on the convent, they have given away their land which they had and their house to construct a convent and they never had the intention of taking of the Syrians. Therefore, they are very much agitated and I feel to say that they are opposed also to the public force saying that they have made appeal. With all these, after an order of mine, given by my Vicar General who was there at Koonammavu and he explained them and exhorted them to be calm and peace and at the end they became quite. But came the notice that the

Vicario Apostolico di Trichur veniva a prendere possesso di tutti i beni e le costruzioni, si adirarono moltissimo ed io mi trovo coi miei Missionari tra l'incudine e il martello (è un modo di dire per indicare due pericoli gravissimi tra cui uno si trova senza poterne uscire) essendo i Latini coalizzati, e temo qualche rivoluzione generale di tutta l'Archidiocesi anche contro di me.

Ugualmente, per fare tutto ciò che è in mio potere ho deciso di far pubblicare domani, domenica, alla messa parrocchiale, l'ordine di Sua Eminenza, ricordando con forza a tutti il dovere di ubbidire e lasciare le vie peccaminose e gravi della violenza, potendo, se hanno ragione, prendere le vie pacifiche di far presente la situazione a chi di dovere. Non so quale sarà l'effecto, perchè sembrano diventati matti, tale è il loro modo di parlare e aggire.

Si tratta qui di un monastero fabbricato dai Latini ed in un luogo che appartiene al Latini, benchè abbiano accolto Novizie di Rito Soriano, vicino alla chiesa di Cunemao, e dentro i limiti della diocesi di Verapoly; e nello stesso ordine di Vostra Eminenza non viene indicata alcuna ragione perchè debba considerarsi

Vicar Apostolic of Trichur has come to take the possession of all goods and buildings, there turned many and I have found myself along with my missionaries in between the anvil and hammer (it is a mode of saying for indicating two grave dangers among which one finds himself without able to come out), being the Latins united and I fear of some general revolution in the Archdiocese and also against me.

In the same way, to do everything that is of my power, I have decided to publish tomorrow, Sunday, at the Parish Mass, the order of your Eminence, reminding them with whole strength the right of obedience and to leave away the sinful way and severe of violence and power, even though they have reasons, to take the peaceful way of making present the situation to whom it would be. I do not know which will be the effect, because it seems that they have become mad, that is their way of speaking and acting.

Here there is a convent constructed by the Latins and in a place, which belongs to the Latins, near to the church of Koonammavu and under the limit of the diocese of Verapoly; but they have accepted the novices of the

come appartenente ai Soriani, nè si può dedurre, come ho dimostrato abbastanza nella lettera che ho scritto a Vostra Eminenza il 29 Maggio 1889. Non si tratta solo dei Latini di verapoly, ma di tutti in generale che sono mal disposti verso questo ordine, ed anche gli stessi pagani, da come ho sentito da uno di loro molto in gamba, e Dio non voglia che non si aumenti questa cattiva impressione nella mente di questi fedeli, e ciò sarebbe causa di molti peccati, nè io vedo altro rimedio, fuorchè, se forse possibile, di giungere ad un'altra decisione, essendo questo l'unico mezzo, a quanto pare di ovviare ai mali futuri. Si faccia però ciò che si crede meglio, essendo io sempre, da parte mia, disposto ad obbedire a quanto Vostra Eminenza ordinerà

Porgendo doverosi ossequi, mi dichiaro,

Con la massima venerazione
Di Vostra Eminenza
Illustrissima
Umilissimo Servo
+Fr. Leonardo Mellano O.C.D.
Arcivescovo di Verapoly
Magnamey 14 Giugno 1890
*il testo dice "Soriane" ma probabilmente si tratta delle "Latine" di cui sta parlando)

Syrian Rite. And in the same order of your Eminence does not come indicated any reasons why it has to be considered as belonging to the Syrians, you cannot deduce, as I have demonstrated quite well in the letter that I have written to your Eminence on 29th May 1889. It is not only concerned with the Latins of Verapoly, but of all in general who are *mal disposti* towards this order, and also the same gentiles, as I have heard one of them is much strong, and God does not want that one does not augment this bad impression in the mind of that faithful, and that will be the cause of more sins; I am not seeing any other remedy, perhaps if it is possible to add to another decision, being this the unique means, by which can be avoided the future evils. You can do what you believe as better, I being always from my part available to obey what your Eminence will order.

Offering my homage, I plead with the utmost veneration Of Your Humble Servant
+ Fr. Leonardo Mellano O.C.D.
Archbishop of Verapoly
Manjummel 14 June 1890

5.3.3.2.2. Main Points

- First of all, Msgr. Mellano asserts that for those who have sweated blood to construct the convent for the good of all Christians and become old before time, and still live now (except Msgr. Bernardine of happy memory), it is extremely painful to see the unexpected tearing of that grand work.
- Then he says once again about the construction of the orphanage by the money paid by an Italian woman for the building of a hospital.
- Next Msgr. Mellano speaks about the plan he had to shift both the convent and orphanage to Verapoly because of the unhealthy conditions of the locality of Koonammavu. He had almost finished the building using part of the money given by the Lady. But unexpectedly he was deprived of everything and hence could not finish the construction.
- Msgr. Mellano points out that Propaganda Fide had reduced the funds of the Verapoly Archdiocese; hence, he could not meet the most urgent needs of the mission.
- Fr. Philip at the instruction of Msgr. Mellano had pacified the Latin laity but at the rumour that the Syrian Vicar Apostolic of Trichur had come to take possession of all goods and buildings of Koonammavu convent, the laity began to conduct violent agitation.
- The Prelate expresses his intention to publish in the church the order of the Propaganda Fide which was issued on 18th April 1890, giving the jurisdiction of the convent at Koonammavu to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, the very next day, that is Sunday 15th June 1890. Then he adds that he has doubt about the

reactions of the people who have already become out of their mind.

- Even getting into debt, he has to finish the construction of the convent of the Latin sisters who are undergoing the sufferings of martyrs for two years and it had become impossible for them to live in Koonammavu convent. Therefore, the sisters requested him to bring them to Verapoly.
- Again, he argues that the convent is constructed by the Latins in a place which belongs to the Latins, near to the church of Koonammavu, and under the limit of the diocese of Verapoly. But they have accepted the novices of the Syrian Rite. The Prelate finds fault with the Holy See and says that, in its order it did not indicate any reasons why it has to be considered as belonging to the Syrians.

5.3.3.2.3. Comments

- It is for the first time that we hear that the benefactor had given the money for the purpose of constructing a hospital for both Christians and non-Christians. The vicar apostolic in his letter dated 28th November 1888 mentioned only the orphanage and school. Now he claims that he had constructed the orphanage (with the consent of the benefactress) as well as a hospital. According to the sources available to us, there was no hospital at any time (even now) in Koonammavu. At Manjummel, they started a dispensary in 1874, which was developed into a hospital in 1888 – both of them during the administration of Msgr. Mellano. Perhaps he may be referring to such an institution in his letter to the Prefect of the Propaganda Fide on 14th June 1890.

- Msgr. Mellano laments that the Roman decision mentions nothing about reimbursing that money to him. We cannot understand the reason for such a claim, since the money was not given to him for his personal use.
- While depicting the sufferings of the Latin sisters which he calls 'martyrdom' (!) Msgr. Mellano says that the convent at Koonammavu was built at the property of the two early Latin sisters. This seems to be intended to create a wrong impression in Rome. Actually only *panambumadam* was built at their property and the present convent at Koonammavu has nothing to do with their patrimony.
- According to Archbishop Mellano, the reason for the violent agitation of the Latin laity was the rumour that the Syrian Vicar Apostolic of Trichur had come to take possession of Koonammavu convent. The following question may arise in the minds of a reader, who has spread out such rumours? Of course, the Syrians will not do it. Then it would have come from the Latins who wanted to infuriate the ordinary laity as to have recourse to aggressive protests.
- We cannot understand how the decision of Rome to entrust the Koonammavu convent to Syrian jurisdiction, affected his construction of the convent at Verapoly.

5.3.3.3. Letter of Msgr. Andrea Aiuti to the Prefect, Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni dated 30th June 1890

The Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Andrea Aiuti sent a letter to the Prefect of the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of Faith, Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni dated 30th June 1890 in which he subscribes to the demand of Msgr. Mellano and the Latin sisters to take the Latin sisters of the Koonammavu convent to the new building at Verapoly.

5.3.3.3.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>A Sua Eminenza Revma. Sig. Card. Giovanni Simeoni Prefetto della S. Congregazione di Propaganda Fide, Roma N.1947</p> <p>Ootacamund 30 Giugno 1890</p> <p>Oggetto: Ricevimento del dispaccio N. 1514/89/7 Che portava la soluzione della S. Congregazione sulla questione concernente La giurisdizione del Monastero delle Religiose native (cioè indigene) che Si trova a Cunemao.</p> <p>Eminenza Reverendissima</p> <p>Ho l'onore e il dovere di informare l'Eminenza Vostra Reverendissima, che mi è pervenuto regolarmente, a suo tempo il veneratissimo dispaccio N. 1514/89/7 del 18 n.d. che aveva unite le due lettere con cui si comunicavano a Monsignor Mellano ed a Monsignor Vicario Apostolico di Trichur le soluzioni della S. Congregazione sulla questione riguardante la giurisdizione sul monastero delle Religiose Terziarie native che si trova a Cunemao e che subito ho trasmesso ai rispettivi destinatari (dopo averne presa una copia per l'archivio di questa Delegazione Apostolica) ambedue questi documenti.</p> <p>Secondo quanto era stato previsto quelle decisioni non</p> | <p>To his very Rev. Eminence Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni Prefect of the Sacred Congregation of Propagation of Faith, Rome N.1947</p> <p>Ootacamund 30th June 1890</p> <p>Subject: Receiving of the dispatch N. 1514/89/ which has brought the solution of the S. Congregation on the question concerning the jurisdiction of the convent of the native religious (that is the indigenous) that finds at Koonammavu.</p> <p>V. Rev. Eminence,</p> <p>I have the honour and the right of informing your very Rev. Eminence that to me is reached in its time the venerated dispatch N. 1514/89/7 of 18 n.d. to which have been attached the two letters which I have to hand over to Msgr. Mellano and to Msgr. Vicar Apostolic of Trichur about the solutions of the S. Congregation on the question of the jurisdiction on the convent of the native religious of the Third Order which is found at Koonammavu. Soon I have transmitted to the respective destinations (after taking a copy for the archive of this apostolic delegation) both of these documents.</p> <p>Secondly, as it is presupposed,</p> |

piacquero ad alcuni ecclesiastici e a pochi laici di Verapoly, che, essendo persone influenti, riuscirono ad eccitare e mantenere per qualche giorno malcontento ed agitazione tra il popolo. Secondo le notizie che mi sono giunte ultimamente però, quel primo impeto di passione è caduto, sia perchè il tempo l'ha raffreddato, sia soprattutto perchè le menzogne, che si erano fatte circolare da quegli ecclesiastici e laici, dicendo che Monsignor Arcivescovo e i suoi Missionari europei si opponevano alla decisione della S. Congregazione in quest'affare, si sono poi rivelate false per la pubblicazione in tutte le Chiese dell'Archidiocesi di una dichiarazione fatta per scritto di quel Venerando Prelato, che la quale si annunciava ai fedeli tali soluzioni e si raccomandava loro il dovere di sottomettersi ad esse ed eseguire puntualmente tali disposizioni. Monsignor Mellano mi ha mandato copia della lettera che poco fa ha indirizzato a Vostra Eminenza in risposta al N.1514/85, con cui Vostra Eminenza gli faceva conoscere le stesse soluzioni, e mi ha pure fatto tenere una copia della lettera che le religiose latine presenti nel Monastero di Cunemao hanno pure inviato a

some of the Church personnel as well as few laity of Verapoly did not like those decisions; being influential people, they were able to exercise and keep up for some days malpractices and agitations among the people. According to the news that I had received ultimately, however, that first impetus of feeling is reduced, because of both the time had made it cold and above all because the lie that was made to circulate by those church personnel and the laity saying that Archbishop and his European missionaries were opposing to the decisions of the Sacred Congregation in this affair, they were then revealed as false by the publication in all the churches of the Archdiocese by a written declaration of that venerable prelate, in which he asked the people that it was their duty to submit to those decisions and to follow strictly such directions.

Msgr. Mellano had sent me the copy of the letter which has addressed to your Eminence in response to N. 1514/85, by which your eminence tried to make him understand the same solutions and I also got a copy of the letter that the Latin sisters who are present in the convent of Koonammavu had also sent to your Eminence, asking the permission of

Vostra Eminenza, chiedendo il permesso di trasferirsi nel Monastero che per loro ha preparato a Verapoly Mons. Arcivescovo.

Quel buon Prelato è molto addolorato per la perdita di quel monastero; e ciò si comprende bene, riflettendo alla somma povertà a cui si trova ora ridotta la sua Diocesi, oltretutto anche perchè la Propagazione della Fede gli ha ridotto l'allocatione annua a soli quattromila franchi; ma che fare? E qui voglia l' 'Eminenza Vostra permettermi di riflettere, che se la Propagazione della Fede continuerà a diminuire ancora nella stessa proporzione le allocationi annue alle vari Diocesi dell' India ed ai due Vicariati per i Soriani, arriverà presto a cassare le une e gli altri assolutamente dai ruoli (è di difficile comprensione, ma credo significhi: arriverà presto a cancellare sia le Diocesi che i Vicariati perchè gli aiuti inviati non sono in grado di sostenerli). Così per es. l'Archidiocesi di Colombo non riceve ormai più di quattromila franchi, così pure quattromila franchi riceve quella di Verapoly e i Vicariati Apostolici di Trichur e Cottayam ne ricevono solo 6.000; questo, nelle condizioni attuali di quelle cristianità non è sufficiente per i bisogni più

transferring to the convent which the Archbishop had prepared for them at Verapoly.

That good Prelate is much grieved for the lost of that convent; and that he comprehends well, reflecting to the total poverty in which now his diocese is fallen, above all also because of the Congregation of the Propagation of Faith has reduced him the annual allocation to only 4000 franc; but what to do? And here your Eminence allow me to reflect, that if the Congregation of the Propagation of Faith would continue to diminish again in the same proportion the annual allocations to different dioceses of India and to the two Vicariates for the Syrians, it would reach soon to stop the one or the other absolutely from the roles (it is difficult to comprehend, but I believe that it is significant: soon would arrive to cancel both the dioceses and the Vicariates since the help that has been sent is not in state of sustaining them). Thus for example, the Archdiocese of Colombo is not receiving any more of 4000 franc, like that 4000 franc receives that of Verapoly and the apostolic vicars of Trichur and Kottayam receive only 6000; this in the actual conditions of that Christianity

urgenti; e così avviene per altre Diocesi i cui Prelati di tanto in tanto si lamentano.

Dopo questa digressione, dirò che, a parte il giudizio superiore di Vostra Eminenza, sembrerebbe assai opportuno accordare alle Religiose latine, che si trovano ora a Cunemao, il permesso che implorano, autorizzando Mons.

Arcivescovo a chiamarle nel monastero che tiene per loro preparato a Verapoly; esso è grande edificio già completato per metà e che, grazie ad aggiunte non troppo considerevoli nè troppo dispendiose, può dare comodamente alloggio non solo a quelle 7 Religiose, ma ad un numero di esse molto maggiore. In tal modo si garantirebbe l'esecuzione completa delle soluzioni della S. Congregazione, e si ristabilirebbe la pace e la tranquillità necessaria negli spiriti delle Religiose di entrambi i riti.

Infatti, abbandonando le Religiose latine il convento di Cunemao, i loro parenti, amici a protettori finirebbero col far cessare ogni opposizione alle soluzioni della S. Congregazione, vedendo che, se quelle Religiose hanno perduto quel Convento, ne hanno tuttavia acquistato un altro che può ben essere paragonato con

is not sufficient for the more urgent needs; and thus come to other dioceses in which the prelates lament more and more.

After this digression, I will say that, at part the superior judgment of your Eminence will feel very opportune to concede to the Latin religious who are now at Koonammavu, the permission that they implore, authorizing the Archbishop to call them to the convent which is prepared for them at Verapoly; that is a big edifice half of which has been already completed and thanks to add that neither considerably more nor much expensive, but can give accommodation not only that 7 religious, but to a number more than that. In that way you will guarantee the complete execution of the solutions of the Sacred Congregation and you will reinstate the necessary peace and tranquility in the spirit of the religious of both the Rites.

In fact, leaving the Latin sisters in the convent at Koonammavu, their relatives, friends and the protectors will cease each opposition at the solutions of the Sacred Congregation, seeing that even though those religious have lost that convent, later they have attained above all another big and more convenient etc. (you can note that this second convent is

quello in grandezza, comodità, ecc. (Si noti che questo secondo Convento è completamente vuoto ed è sempre stato disabitato dal compimento delle sua costruzione). Poi certo che, avvenuta la separazione, le latine e le soriane non avranno più occasione di litigarsi a vicenda come avviene ora, tanto più spesso di prima in quanto dopo la separazione dei due riti, soprattutto i Latini sono assai esaltati contro i soriani. Ma Vostra Eminenza saprà ben dare a questo proposito gli ordini che saranno più utili e vantaggiosi per il bene di quelle popolazioni ed in particolare di quelle Religiose.

Intanto, rispondendo a ripetute lettere di Mons. Medlycott, ho cercato di inculcargli, con molta attenzione, che abbia pazienza ancora qualche settimana. Se egli si recasse ora di persona a prendere possesso di quel convento, potrebbe verificarsi un'opposizione sgradevole da parte di quei cristiani Latini che si mostrano più fanatici; per questo gli ho consigliato che per ora non vada là e che se vorrà prendere possesso del convento e degli edifici annessi, si debba mettere d'accordo con Mons. Mellano e quindi mandi a Cunemao un suo rappresentante legale che direttamente da Mons. Arcivescovo o da un suo

completely empty and is always being uninhabited from the termination of its construction). Then certainly if that separation takes place, both the Latins and the Syrians would not have any occasion for fighting each other as it is now, much more space than before; since after the separation of the two Rites, the Latins are very much exalted against the Syrians. But your Eminence will understand well to give this purpose the orders will be more useful and advantageous for the good of that population and in particular of that religious.

Meanwhile, responding to the repeated letter of Msgr. Medlycott, I sought of inculcating him with much attention, that to have patience again for some weeks. If he has recourse now personally to take possession of that convent, he will verify a disagreeable opposition from the part of the Latin Christians who show themselves as more fanatic; for this I have advised him for now do not go there and that if he wishes to take the possession of the convent and of the attached buildings, he has to put agreement with Msgr. Mellano and therefore send to Koonammavu one of his legal representatives who directly from the Archbishop or one of

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>delegato venga messo in possesso del convento e degli edifici annessi.</p> <p>Se la decisione della S. Congregazione fosse stata a favore dei Latini, ne sarebbero rimasti urtati i siriani, e le conseguenze di un tale disgusto avrebbero potuto essere pericolose, al contrario l'opposizione dei Latini finirà tra poco tempo e le conseguenze non saranno di nessun pericolo.</p> <p>Intanto rimango sempre in attesa dei veneratissimi ordini che Vostra Eminenza desiderasse farmi avere sui vari punti di questo problema particolare. Approfitto ben volentieri di questo felice incontro per rinnovare a Vostra Eminenza l'espressione ossequiosa del mio profondo rispetto e della devota venerazione con cui, chinato umilmente al bacio della S. Porpora, ho il grandissimo amore di professarmi</p> <p>Dell'Eminenza Vostra Reverendissima Umilissimo, Devotissimo, Ossequiosissimo Servo +Andrea Arcivescovo di Acrida Dele. Apo. nelle Indie Orientali</p> | <p>his delegates takes possession of the convent and the attached buildings.</p> <p>If the decision of the Sacred congregation is being made in favour of the Latins, the Syrians should have remained collide and the consequence of that disgust will be more dangerous; at the contrary the opposition of the Latins will finish within a short time and the consequence will not be any dangerous.</p> <p>I remain always in expectation of the venerable order of your Eminence desiring to enable me to have the various points of this particular problem. Profiting well voluntarily of this happy encounter for renewing to your eminence the obsequious expression of my profound respect and of the devout veneration with which I humbly bend over at the kissing of the Sacred <i>porpora</i>, I have the greatest love of professing me,</p> <p>of your Very Rev. Eminence Humblest, devotionist, obsequious Servant +Andrea Archbishop of Acrida Apostolic Delegate in the Oriental India.</p> |
|---|---|

5.3.3.3.2. Main Points

- The Apostolic Delegate informs the prefect of the S. Congregation of Propagation of Faith that he had received on time both the letter addressed to him and

the attached two letters, which had to send to both Archbishop Mellano as well as the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. These letters contained the solutions that the Sacred Congregation has taken concerning the problem of the jurisdiction of the convent at Koonammavu.

- Some of the Church personnel as well as few laity of Verapoly were not ready to accept that decision. Being influential people, they could make the people excited and being discontent, they continued the agitations.
- Now Msgr. Aiuti came to know that reaction had died out due to the prolonged time element and above all because of the lie which was being circulated by those church personnel and laity saying that Msgr. Mellano and his European Missionaries were opposing the decision of the Sacred Congregation which was proved as false by the publication of a written declaration in all the churches of the Archdiocese of Verapoly.
- Both Msgr. Mellano and the Latin sisters were asking the permission of transferring to the convent which had prepared for them at Verapoly.
- Msgr. Mellano grieved much for the lost of the convent at Koonammavu.
- The Apostolic Delegate reflects on the matter of reduction. If the Propaganda Fide continue to diminish again the subsidy to different dioceses of India as well as to the two vicariates of the Syrians, one or the other vicariates would soon cease to function. The given subsidy of the 4000 francs to Verapoly Archdiocese and 6000 francs for the vicariates of Trichur and Kottayam would not be sufficient to meet their urgent needs, taking into consideration the situation of Christianity in Kerala.

- Although Msgr. Mellano has complained that he has to stop the construction of the incomplete Verapoly convent,⁸⁹ the Apostolic Delegate finds that even if the whole work has not being fully completed and the other works are not very expensive, it is a big building which can accommodate not only 7 sisters but a big number. Hence it is very opportune to give permission to the Latin sisters to shift their abode to Verapoly. This will help to re-establish peace and tranquility necessary for the religious spirit among the sisters of both Latin and Syrians.
- If the Latin sisters leave the convent at Koonammavu, their relatives, friends and other protesters will stop the opposition to the solution of the Sacred Congregation. They will feel that even though their religious have lost the convent at Koonammavu, they have obtained another one, which is greater than the first one. The second convent is completely empty and is always being uninhabited from the termination (?) of its construction.
- Also if that separation takes place, both the Latins and the Syrians would not have any occasion for fighting each other as it is now. The Latins are very much exalted against the Syrians. With this purpose the orders will be more useful and advantageous for the good of that population and in particular of that religious.
- Msgr. Medlycott repeatedly asks the Apostolic Delegate to grand the necessary permission to take possession of the convent. But Msgr. Aiuti convinced him to show more patience to some more weeks. If he has recourse

⁸⁹According to Sr. Suci Msgr. Mellano has constructed a house for the orphans and not a convent (*SGME*, 300). Her claim does not have any foundation. Even Msgr. Mellano does not subscrib to it.

now personally to take possession of that convent, he had to meet an unpleasant opposition from the part of the Latin Christians who show themselves as more fanatic. If he wishes to take the possession of the convent and of the attached buildings, he has to, first of all, make an agreement with Msgr. Mellano and then send one of his legal representatives to Koonammavu who approved by Archbishop Mellano or one of his Delegates to take possession of the convent and the attached buildings.

- If the decision of the Sacred Congregation would have been made in favour of the Latins, the Syrians should have remained collide and the consequence of that disgust would be more dangerous. Whereas, the opposition of the Latins will finish within a short span of time and the consequence will not be any dangerous.

5.3.3.3. Comments

- Msgr. Mellano and Fr. Philip mention that the decree of Rome was read out in the parish churches of Verapoly and Koonammavu.⁹⁰ According to Msgr. Aiuti however, it was read out in all churches of the Archdiocese of Verapoly.
- According to Msgr. Aiuti the present building at Verapoly has all the essential facilities for the sisters. Hence, taking into consideration the elements of peace and tranquility necessary for the religious life, it is better to shift them to Verapoly. This is a very reasonable position. Although Msgr. Mellano had

⁹⁰ See above No. 5.3.2.4. 'Letter of Fr. Philip the Vicar General to Msgr. Mellano on 29th June 1890' and No. 5.3.3.2. 'Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Prefect of the Propagation of Faith, Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni on 14th June 1890.'

demanded for such a transfer, when the Latin sisters have left the Koonammavu convent he did not immediately accommodate them at Verapoly, rather they had to spend 51 days at the house of CSST sisters at Ernakulam. This was interpreted at that time as the Syrian sisters had forcefully ousted them who had no place then to leave. About such a twisting of truth see our comments in the following pages.

- The argument of Msgr. Aiuti that if the Latin sisters should leave Koonammavu for the more spacious and big convent at Verapoly, they will feel not humiliation but exaltation and their relatives and friends will stop their agitations since their dear ones have obtained a more comfortable and convenient abode than the Syrian sisters who had to live in an unhealthy situation.⁹¹ This claim is only an *argumentum ad hominem*.
- It seems that the Apostolic Delegate sides more with the Latin sisters than siding with both. And he makes some conclusions from his own imaginations: if the convent would have been left with the Latins, the Syrians would have made more protests.

5.3.3.4. Letter of the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti to the Prefect of the Sacred Congregation of the Propagation of Faith dated on 6th July 1890

In this letter, Msgr. Aiuti subscribes to the petition of the Latin sisters who wanted to leave Koonammavu convent as well as to the request of Msgr. Mellano to the Holy See for

⁹¹ See the words of Msgr. Mellano in his letter to the Prefect of the Congregation of Propagation of Faith, Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni on 14th June 1890.'

allowing that sisters to leave for Verapoly.⁹² Among these three letters, the first one has been quoted above.⁹³

5.3.3.4.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>A Sua Eminenza Reverendissima Sig. Cardinale Giovanni Simeoni Prefetto della Congregazione di Propaganda, Roma Ootacamuni li 6 luglio 1890 N. 1964</p> <p>Oggetto: Ancora sulle risoluzioni della S. Congregazione circa la questione riguardante la giurisdizione nel Monastero delle Religiose Terziarie che si trova in Cunemao.</p> <p>Eminenza Reverendissima</p> <p>Facendo seguito al mio precedente rispettoso rapporto sulle cose concernenti il Monastero delle Religiose Terziarie latine che si trova in Cunemao, ritengo necessario porre davanti agli occhi di Vostra Eminenza Reverendissima, come Allegato A, una lettera che mi ha scritta di recente il Molto Reverendo Padre Filippo,</p> | <p>To His Very Rev. Eminence, Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni, Prefect of the Congregation of Propaganda Fide, Rome Ootacamund 6th July 1890 N. 1964</p> <p>Subject: Again on the resolutions of the S. Congregation about the question regarding the jurisdiction of the convent of the Tertiary religious find in Koonammavu.</p> <p>Rev. Eminence,</p> <p>Following to my earlier respectful relation on the things concerned the convent of the Latin Tertiary religious who are found in Koonammavu, I think it is necessary to bring to your Eminence that as Attached document A, a letter that has written to me recently by very Rev. Fr. Philip, the Vicar General of Msgr. Mellano, the Archbishop of Verapoly, perfect and venerable religious and exemplary missionary. By this</p> |

⁹²Msgr. Aiuti attaches three documents along with this letter, namely the letter of Fr. Philip, the Vicar General of Msgr. Mellano [Attached Document A], the letter of some of the influential priests of Verapoly (Attached Document B) and a copy of the letter by which they ask a response [Attached document C].

⁹³See No. 5.3.2.4. 'Letter of Fr. Philip the Vicar General of Msgr. Mellano dated 29th June 1890.'

Vicario Generale di Mons. Arcivescovo di Verapoli, ottimo e venerando Religioso, e Missionario esemplare. Da questo documento si rileva come la decisione della S. Congregazione relativa alla giurisdizione su quell convento, poichè ad alcuni non è piaciuta, vi furono dei tumulti intorno allo stesso convento per alcuni giorni, cioè fino a che, come dice quell buon Religioso : “Mons. Arcivescovo non ebbe scritta una lettera esortando il popolo a cessare da tali violenze... e non ebbe fatto pubblicare il giorno seguente, che era Domenica nelle Chiese sia di Verapoli che di Cunemao il Decreto della S. Congregazione”.

Ora però tutto è in pace e l'impeto primitivo della violenza è caduto. Quando le Religiose Terziarie Latine avranno lasciato per sempre quell Monastero e si saranno recate a quello che ha preparato per loro Mons. Arcivescovo di Verapoli, tutto terminerà in pace. Quindi, secondo il mio debole parere, si dovrebbe concedere alle 7 Religiose Latine la grazia che implorano e che chiede anche Mons. Mellano, cioè che possano abbandonare quel Monastero e recarsi a fondare una nuova casa a Verapoli.

document he points out how the decision of the Sacred Congregation related to the verdict on that convent, since to some it is not pleased; and there were turmoil around the same convent for some days; that is, until as says that good religious: “the Archbishop wrote a letter exhorting the people to stop that violence...and made publish the decree of the Sacred Congregation the following day, which was Sunday, in the churches of both Verapoly and Koonammavu.”

Now everything is in peace and the first impetus of violence is no more. When the Latin sisters would be left that convent forever and will go to that which Msgr. Archbishop of Verapoly has prepared for them, Now everything is in peace and the first impetus of the violence is no more. When the Latin sisters will be left that convent forever and will go to that which of Msgr. Archbishop of Verapoly has prepared for them, everything will terminate in peace. Therefore, according to my humble opinion, your Eminence must give to that seven Latin religious the grace which they implore and that is asked also by Msgr. Mellano; that is they can abandon that convent and can go to found a new house at Verapoly.

Being so the things, I turned to

Stando così le cose, sono tornato a raccomandare a Mons. Vicario Apostolico di Trichur, di non voler recarsi ora a prendere possesso di quell monastero e delle costruzioni annesse, ma di voler ancora aspettare. Eminenza alla domanda suddetta, fatta dalle sette Religiose e raccomandata da Mons. Mellano e da me. Non dubito che quell buon Prelato farà in questo modo. E questa l 'unica via per ottenere la piena esecuzione del Decreto della Sacra Congregazione nel modo pacifico.

Per informazione di Vostra Eminenza, unisco come Allegato B, una lettera di vari Sacerdoti dei più influenti dell' Archidiocesi di Verapoli i quali chiedevano una revisione della decisione della S.Congregazione, ed accludo pure una copia, come Allegato C, della lettera con cui diedi risposta a tale richiesta da parte loro.

Dopo questo rimango in attesa delle decisioni che piacerà a Vostra Eminenza farmi avere su questo argomento particolare.

Con i sentimenti del più profondo ossequio, ho l 'onore grande di chinarmi al bacio della S. Porpora e di salutarla con la più grande venerazione
Dell' Eminenza Vostra

recommend to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur that he does not go now to take possession of that convent and the buildings attached to it, but to wait again. Your Eminence, to the above said request that was made by the seven Latin sisters recommended by Msgr. Mellano and by me. I have no doubt that, that good Prelate will do in this way. Moreover, this is the unique way for obtaining the full execution of the Decree of the Sacred Congregation in a peaceful way.

For the information of your Eminence, I unite as Attached Document B, a letter of some (*vari*) of the more influenced priests of the Archdiocese of Verapoly, in which they ask a revision of the decision of the Sacred Congregation and enclose also a copy as Attached document C, of the letter with which gives reply to that request from their part.

After this, I remain in expecting the decisions that please your Eminence to have me on this argument particularly.

With most profound obsequiousness, I have the great honour of bowing to kiss your Sacred *porpora* and of greeting you with great veneration,
of your very Rev. Eminence' humblest, devotionist and submissive Servant

+ Andrea, Archbishop of Acrida

| | |
|--|---|
| Reverendissima Umilissimo, Devotissimo e Ossequiosissimo Servo + Andrea Arcivescovo di Acrida Delegato Apostolico nelle Indie Orientali | Apostolic Delegate in Oriental India |
|--|---|

5.3.3.4.2. Main Points

- Apostolic Delegate officially informs the Propaganda Fide, that the decision of the Sacred Congregation regarding the verdict on the convent at Koonammavu displeased some people and there were turmoil around the convent for some days. As proof, he quotes from the letter of Fr. Philip. As says by Fr. Philip, “the Archbishop wrote a letter exhorting the people to stop that violence...and made publish the decree of the Sacred Congregation the following day, which was Sunday, in the churches of both Verapoly and Koonammavu.”
- Now, everything is in peace and the first impetus of violence is no more. However, according to the Apostolic Delegate only when the Latin sisters will go to Verapoly leaving the Koonammavu convent, everything will terminate in peace. Therefore, he requests the prefect to allow the seven Latin religious the grace which they implore: to abandon Koonammavu convent and go to start a new house at Verapoly. The same demand was asked also by Msgr. Mellano.
- In the letter Msgr. Aiuti informs the Holy See that he had recommended to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, to wait for some more time to take possession of the convent and the buildings attached to it. The seven Latin sisters, recommended by Msgr. Mellano, made the same request. The Apostolic Delegate is confident

enough that the good Prelate will subscribe to his request. Only this way, the full execution of the Decree of the Sacred Congregation can be realized in a peaceful way.

- Some priests of the Archdiocese of Verapoly asked a revision of the decision of the Sacred Congregation about giving the jurisdiction of the Koonammavu convent to the Syrian Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, Msgr. Medlycott and a copy of their letter is given as Attached document. Unfortunately we do not have got this petition of the some of the Latin priests.

5.3.3.4.3. Comments

- Regarding the letter of Fr. Philip, we have commented already.
- The number of the Latin sisters has to be made more precise. There were only 3 professed sisters, 2 juniors, a lay sister and a boarding girl.⁹⁴
- As we have already pointed out the decision of the Propaganda Fide did not ask to the Latin sisters to leave the Koonammavu convent. They were allowed to continue to stay there and the all facilities which make their stay more agreeable were given from Rome. However, it was the decision from the part of the Latin sisters to leave the convent.⁹⁵
- The position of the Latin priests who continued to protest and were not ready to obey the decision of Rome draws special attention. Was it proper for them as the

⁹⁴ CKC II, 144.

⁹⁵See our comments on their letter in No 5.3.3.1.3.

priests of the Church to stand against the decision of the Holy See?

5.3.3.5. Letter of Fr. John Menacherry to the sisters of the Koonammavu Convent on 30th August 1890

The Latin sisters wrote to the Holy See asking permission to go to Verapoly (July 7th). The prefect of the Sacred Congregation of the Propaganda Fide granted the permission and the secretary of Msgr. Medlycott, Fr. John Menacherry informs that to the sisters (Syrian) of Koonammavu convent.

5.3.3.5.1. Original Letter

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p> തൃശൂർ നിന്നും 30-8-1890 മിശിഹായിൽ ഏ. പ്രി. സഹോദരികളേ, ലത്തീൻകാരായ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ മഠം വിട്ടുപോകുന്നതിന് അവർക്കനുവദിക്കണമെന്ന് സങ്കടം ബോധിപ്പിച്ച പ്രകാരം വരാപ്പുഴയ്ക്കുപോകുന്നതിന് കർദ്ദിനാളിന്റെ അനുവാദം അവർക്കുണ്ടായിരിക്കുന്നു. അവരെ അവിടെ നിന്നും കൊണ്ടുപോകുന്ന കാര്യം വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാനച്ചനെയാണ് ഏൽപ്പിച്ച അധികാരപ്പെടുത്തിയിരിക്കുന്നത്. ഇപ്പോൾത്തന്നെ അടിയന്തിരമായി എഴുത്തയച്ചു വിവരം അറിയിക്കുന്നതു വിവേകം അനുവദിക്കുന്നിടത്തോളം നിങ്ങളുടെ സംരക്ഷണയ്ക്കാവശ്യപ്പെട്ടതു നോക്കുന്നതിനും കൊവേന്തയിൽ അനീതിയായ കരേറ്റം ഒന്നും അതായത് വിരോധികൾ കയറാതിരിക്കുന്നതിനുള്ള മാർഗ്ഗങ്ങളെ നോക്കി ഒരുങ്ങിയിരിക്കുന്നതിനുമാണ്. ഇക്കാര്യത്തിൽ നിങ്ങൾക്കു നല്ല ഉറപ്പും സ്ഥിരതയും ഉണ്ടാകുവാനാവശ്യം. അല്ലാത്തപക്ഷം നിങ്ങളോടു വാശി നിന്ദയും ആക്ഷേപവും തന്നെയല്ല, ദേഹോപദ്രവവും കൂടെ ചെയ്യാൻ </p> | <p> From Trichur 30-8-1890 Most loving sisters in Jesus Christ, The Cardinal has given the permission, which is requested by the Latin sisters to leave Koonammavu convent and to go to Verapoly. The authority to bring them from there (Koonammavu) is entrusted to the Archbishop of Verapoly. It is informing you through the letter in advance only because as far as prudence permits to take the necessary precautions for your own safety and to get prepared, not to allow any adversaries to enter into the convent. In this matter, you need to have firmness and constancy. If not so, people will not only reproach and ill-treat you but also assault you. Here it is conversant that their </p> |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>സംഗതിയാവും. അവരുടെ പുറപ്പാട് ഉടൻ ഉണ്ടാകുമെന്നാണ് ഇവിടെ അറിഞ്ഞിരിക്കുന്നത്. ഇതിനെപ്പറ്റി യുള്ളു വർത്തമാനമെല്ലാം ഇവിടെ ആൾ വശം അറിയിക്കണമെന്നാ ഗ്രഹിക്കുന്നു. പിന്നാലെ സാരമായി സംഭവിക്കുന്നതെല്ലാം ഉടനടുൻ അറിയിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യുമല്ലോ. ഇനിക്കു നല്ല സുഖമില്ലാത്തതിനെ കുറിച്ചു ഇനിക്കുവേണ്ടി അപേക്ഷിക്കുമാറാകണമെന്ന് അപേക്ഷിക്കുന്നു. ഇത് തൃശൂർ വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കായുടെ സെക്രട്ടറി ബ. യോഹന്നാൻ കത്തനാർ.</p> | <p>departure will take place soon. We hope that you would inform us everything related to this by someone, even the simple things. Since I am not keeping well, please pray for me. From Trichur Rev. Fr. John The Secretary of the Vicar Apostolic</p> |
|--|---|

5.3.3.5.2. Main Points

- The Holy See gave the permission, which had been requested by the Latin sisters to leave Koonammavu convent for Verapoly.
- Msgr. Mellano was entrusted with the job to take the sisters from Koonammavu.
- Fr. John Menachery the Secretary of Msgr. Medlycott informs the sisters (Syrian) that he is informing them in advance as a precaution for the safety of the sisters, since there existed the possibility that the trouble makers may try to enter the convent and disturb the peace and even may ill treat and assault the sisters. The sisters need to maintain firmness and fortitude.
- The secretary asks the sisters that they have to report even the minute happenings in the convent immediately to Msgr. Medlycott.

5.3.3.5.3. Comments

- This letter by the secretary who would have been instructed to do so by Msgr. Medlycott, was a very prudent and practical step taking into consideration all the possible repercussions and even unsavory incidents.

5.3.3.6. Contract Made by Msgr. Mellano and Msgr. Medlycott dated 15th September 1890

After getting the permission from Rome for the transfer of the Latin sisters to Verapoly, Msgr. Mellano the Latin Archbishop and Msgr. Medlycott, the Ordinary for Syrians gave form to this contract regarding the departure of the Latin sisters from Koonammavu and the related matters on 15th September 1890. Here is the original document.

5.3.3.6.1. Original Document

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>Dietro istruzione ricevute da Sua Eccellenza Reverendissima Mons. Aiuti, Delegato Apostolico, noi conveniamo nei seguenti punti riguardo al trasferimento delle Suore di rito latino dal Convento delle Terziarie che trova a Cunemao</p> <p>1. Mons. Vicario Apostolico di Trichur permette volentieri che le religiose latine, partendo dal Convento, portino con loro gli abiti, I letti, e le cose che tengono in stanza per uso personale.</p> <p>2. Il Vicario Apostolico interpreta l'ultima clausola del Decreto della S. sede del 24 Marzo 1890 che dice: "che se alcuna delle Suore di quell monastero col permesso del Vicario Apostolico di Trichur lasciasse il monastero e passasse a formare altra casa sotto altro Vicariato o Diocesi, sara provveduto nei casi particolari" nell senso che limiti il mio potere in quanto alla dote. Il Vicario Apostolico pero si dichiara pronto</p> | <p>Regarding the transfer of the sisters of the Latin Rite, from the convent of the sisters of the Third Order according to the advice of the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Aiuti.</p> <p>1. The Vicar Apostolic of Trichur whole-heartedly allows the Latin sisters who are leaving this convent to take their religious clothes, cots and other things that are kept for their personal use in their rooms.</p> <p>2. As the Decree of March 24, 1890 says that, if any sister of that convent, with the permission of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, leaves that convent, to go to other vicariates or dioceses to open new convents they will decide the measure to be adapted. The Vicar Apostolic feels that as far as their patrimony is concerned, it is beyond his authority. However, he says he is ready to accept the</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>ad accettare qualunque decisione che la S. Sede dara in proposito.</p> <p>3. Ci si accorda, tra I due Prelati: Mons. Arcivescovo di Verapoly e il nominato Vicario Apostolico, che senza ulterior ritardi si transferiscano le suore latine di cui si parla dal convent di cunemao in modo tale che la clausura non sia interotta.</p> <p>(sottoscritti)</p> <p>+ Fra Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Arcivescovo di Verapoly + Adolfo Medlycott Vescovo di Tricomica e Vicario Apostolico di Trichur Magnamey 15 Settembre 1890 Concorda con l'originale (firmato) + Fra Leonardo Mallano O.C.D. Arcivescovo di Verapoly</p> | <p>words of the Holy See whatever it may be.</p> <p>3. The Archbishop of Verapoly and the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, agree to allow the Latin sisters of Koonammavu convent to leave the convent, in a manner, which will in no way be a hindrance to their life of enclosure, without delay.</p> <p>Arch Bishop of Varapuzha + Leonard Mellano Bishop of Tricomea and Vicar Apostolic of Trichur Adolf Medlycott Manjummel, 1890 September 15.</p> <p>(Signed) + Fr. Leonardo Mellano OCD Archbishop of Verapoly</p> |
|---|--|

5.3.3.6.2. Main Points

- The Vicar Apostolic of Trichur whole-heartedly allows the Latin sisters who are leaving the convent at Koonammavu to take their religious clothes, cots and other things that are kept for their personal use in their rooms.
- As the Decree of 24th March, 1890 says that, if any sister of that convent, with the permission of the Vicar Apostolic of Trissur, leaves that convent, to go to other vicariates or dioceses to open new convents, the measures to be followed will be decided then. Concerning the issue of the patrimony of the Latin sisters, it is beyond the authority of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur to take the decision. However, Msgr.

Medlycott conveys his willingness to accept whatever decision the Holy See takes.

- Both prelates the Archbishop of Verapoly and the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, agree to allow the Latin sisters of Koonammavu convent to leave the convent, without interrupting their enclosure life.

5.3.3.6.3. Comments

- It is only in the last clause of the contract that the name of Msgr. Mellano appears. The first two clauses speak of only the authority of Msgr. Medlycott. The reason may be that the said issues are concerned only about him, since Koonammavu convent belongs to his jurisdiction.
- It is commendable the position of Msgr. Medlycott concerning the patrimony of the Latin sisters. He expresses his willingness to accept whatever decision the Holy See may take on that matter.
- The most important point is that both prelates give most importance to the fact that the departure of the Latin sisters from Koonammavu may not in any way interrupt their enclosure life.

5.3.3.7. Canonical Approval for Manjummel Contract by the Apostolic Delegate on 20th September 1890

5.3.3.7.1. Original Document

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| Riconosciamo, approviamo ed accogliamo come definitiva con l' Autorita Apostolica di cui siamo insigniti, questa Convenzione fatta tra R.P.D. Leonardo mellano, Arcivescovo | We recognize, approve and accept as definitive with the Apostolic authority which is conferred on us, this agreement made between R.P.D. Leonardo Mellano, Archbishop of |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>di verapoly, e il R.P.D. Adolfo Edvino Medlycott, vescovo di Triconia e Vicario Apostolico di Trichur; ed inoltre, avendo considerate, secondo la legge, e sotto ogni aspetto tutte le circostanze delle cose, concediamo che le Religiose latine di cui si è parlato possano uscire da quel convento e si trasferiscano al convento di Verapoly; inoltre possano ed è conveniente che portino con loro le rispettive doti, osservando tuttavia questa condizione essenziale, che cioè che ciascuna dote sia costituita soltanto da quei beni che siano stati riconosciuti nel vero e proprio senso della parola come beni dotali di ciascuna religiosa, di comune accordo, da parte dei due Illustrissimi prelati già nominati. Non vi è stato nulla in contrario a quanto è stato stabilito.</p> <p>Dato ad Ootacamund nella sede della Delegazione Apostolica il 20 Settembre 1890</p> <p>+Andrea Arcivescovo di Acrida Delegato Apostolico nelle Indie Orientali.</p> | <p>Verapoly, and R.P.D. Adolfo Edvino Medlycott, Bishop of Triconia and Vicar Apostolic of Trichur; and also, taken into account, the legal points, and under every aspect all circumstances of things, we grant that the Latin religious about whom it is said that they can depart from that convent and move to the convent of Verapoly. Also they can and it is proper that they can take with them their dowries, however observing this essential condition, that is to say that each dowry constitute only those goods which are recognized in its true and proper sense of the word as dowry of each religious of common approval from the part of both already nominated Prelates.</p> <p>There stands nothing which is contrary to what is now fixed.</p> <p>Given from Ootacamund at the Seat of the Apostolic Delegation</p> <p>On 20th September 1890</p> <p>+ Andrea Aiuti Archbishop of Acrida Apostolic Delegate in the Oriental India.</p> |
|--|--|

5.3.3.7.2. Main Points

- The letter uses the formal and authoritative style in declaring important issues from Rome. Thus Msgr. Aiuti uses the first person plural 'we' which gives a solemn and absolute sense to the declaration.

- Msgr. Aiuti canonically declares as approved the contract made by Msgr. Mellano and Msgr. Medlycott.
- The sisters can take with them their dowries, the word being taken in its true and proper sense as agreed by both bishops.

5.3.3.7.3. Comments

- It is proper that the declaration of the approval of the Manjummel contract uses canonical language.
- It is very cautious in defining what is meant by the term dowry, which the declaration wants to be understood in its strict sense.
- Both Prelates have to agree to it.
- It is very commendable that the declaration takes an impartial and objective position. It prudently foresees the eventual possible misinterpretations of the term dowry which each party may conveniently make for their own advantages.

5.3.3.8.The Departure of the Latin Sisters

Concerning the departure of the Latin sisters, we have texts from *CKC* and from the Holy See. We start with *CKC*.

5.3.3.8.1. Description in *CKC* II

On page 144 of *CKC* II, there is a short description of the departure of the Latin sisters from the Koonammavu convent. We give below the original text and its translation.

5.3.3.8.1.1. Original document

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| ... ലത്തീൻ റീത്തുകാരായ കന്യാ സ്ത്രീകളെ വിട്ടുകൊടുക്കണമെന്ന് വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചൻ ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടതിനാൽ ഉടൻതന്നെ അവരെ വിട്ടുകൊള്ളണമെന്നു |the Archbishop of Varapuzha requested that the Latin sisters of the convent be given to him. So the Bishop of |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>ത്യശൂർ മെത്രാനച്ചൻ കൽപ്പിച്ച പ്രകാരം സഹോദരികളായ വൈപ്പിശ്ശേരി ഏലീശാമ്മ, ടി. ത്രേസ്യമ്മ, പുപ്പന സ. അനസ്താസ്യ, പുതൂക്കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളായ പത്തിച്ചാല ആഞ്ചല, പഴമ്പള്ളി സ. ബീയാട്രീസ്, തുണസഹോദരിയായ ഏലീശാ, ബോർഡിംഗു കൂട്ടിയായ വൈപ്പിശ്ശേരി മറിയം ഇങ്ങനെ ഏഴുപേരെ ഏലീശാമ്മയുടെ സഹോദരനായ ബ. ജൂയീസ് അച്ചനും മറ്റൊരു പാതിരിയച്ചനും കൂടി ഇവിടെ വന്നു കൊണ്ടു പോയി (CKC II,144)</p> | <p>Trichur immediately sent an order to relieve the sisters. Accordingly, Rev. Fr. Louis, the brother of mother Eliswa Vaipissery and another diocesan priest came together here and took seven sisters with them. They were mother Vaipissery Eliswa, mother Vaipissery Thresia, Sister Anasthasia Pooppana, juniors Angela Pathichala and Beatrice Pazhampally, Lay sister Eliswa and boarder Mariam Vaipissery.</p> |
|--|--|

5.3.3.8.1.2. Main Points

- The departure of the Latin sisters was due to the demand of Msgr. Mellano
- The group consisted of two juniors, a lay sister and a boarder.
- Fr. Louis, the brother of mother Eliswa and Sr. Thresia along with another priest came to take them from the convent at Koonammavu to Verapoly.

5.3.3.8.1.3. Comments

- The Chronicles clearly says that the Latin sisters have left Koonammavu since Msgr. Mellano asked for that.
- If Fr. Louis and another priest came and took those sisters from Koonammavu convent in accordance with the agreement of Manjummel which had the approval of Rome, what is the meaning of the phrase of Sr. Sucey in *SGME*, 302: “the removal of the sisters of Latin Rite from St. Teresa’s convent.”

5.3.3.8.2. Letter of the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti to Cardinal Prefect Simeoni of the Propaganda Fide dated on 21st September 1890

The Apostolic Delegate gives a summary of what all things had happened after the verdict of the Holy See, giving the jurisdiction of the convent at Koonammavu to Msgr. Medlycott the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. Here is the original Italian version with its English translation.

5.3.3.8.2.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ASua Eccellenza Rev.ma Sig. Cardinale Giovanni Simeoni Prefetto della S. Congregazione di Propaganda, Roma, Ootocamudi 21 Settembre 1890 N.2139</p> <p>Oggetto: Ancora sull 'affare concernente il Convento delle Religiose native che si trova a Cunemao e quasi completa composizione della situazione, avvenuta in modo positivo.</p> <p>Eminenza Reverendissima, A continuazione di quanto ho avuto l'onore di far conoscere a Vostra Eminenza Rev.ma col mio primo rapporto N.2077 del 31 Agosto scorso, ritengo opportuno informarla delle ulteriori pratiche svolte per eseguire le Sue richieste, espressi nel suo dispaccio del 2 Agosto sull affare concernente il convento delle Religiose native che si trova a Cumenao, e dell'esito favorevole che le mie premure e fatiche hanno</p> | <p>To His Excellency Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni Prefect of the S. Congregation of the Propaganda, Rome Ootocamud, 21st September 1890 No. 2139</p> <p>Subject: Once again, on the affair concerning the convent of native religious, which is located at Koonammavu and almost completed the settlement of the situation, which had happened in a positive way.</p> <p>Very Rev. Eminence, At the continuation of what I have had the honour to present to Your Eminence with my first report No. 2077 dated 31st of last August, I should inform you of further practical things that undertook to execute his (your) requests, expressed in his (your) dispatch of 2nd August on the affair concerning the convent of native religious which is located at Koonammavu, and the</p> |

finalmente conseguito.

Il 1° del mese corrente tronai (?) a fare nuove pressioni presso Mons. Vicario Apostolico di Trichur, facendogli comprendere come importava grandemente che non si tardasse di più ad eseguire la conosciuta decisione della Sacra Congregazione per quanto riguarda quel convent, interessandolo ancora una volta perchè si mettesse d'accordo con Mons. Mellano ad utilizzare tutte le precauzioni che la prudenza e la saggezza consigliano in simili circostanze per poter prendere possesso di quel convento personalmente o forse meglio, per il momento, a mezzo di un suo delegato o rappresentante, e esprimendogli la fiducia che tutto si sarebbe concluso bene e sarebbe terminato in pace e tranquillità.

Il giorno successivo, mi rivolsi nuovamente a Monsignor Arcivescovo di Verapoly, lodando la sua perfetta sottomissione alle decisioni della Sacra Congregazione e la premura con cui si impegnava a farle rispettare pienamente dal suo clero e dal suo popolo, e la promessa che mi aveva fatto, di fare, da parte sua, tutto il possibile perchè le cose terminassero bene e venissero sistemate ad ogni costo secondo gli ordini della S. Sede. Lo esortai a continuare nella sua opera con la maggior energia

favorable outcome that my thoughtfulness and fatigue have finally achieved.

The first of the current month I began to make new pressures at the vicar apostolic of Trichur, making him understand how mattered greatly that no more to be late to execute the known decision of the Sacred Congregation regarding that convent, making him interested once more because if he puts agreement with Msgr. Mellano to use all precautions that the prudence and wisdom give in such circumstances to take possession of that convent personally or may be better, for now, by his delegate or representative, and expressing confidence that everything would be concluded well and would be completed in peace and tranquility.

The next day, I turned again to the Archbishop of Verapoly, praising his perfect submission to the decisions of the Sacred Congregation and the eagerness with which he pledged to make it respected fully by his clergy, and his people, and the promise that he made to me, to do from his part all that is possible to make the things end well and come systematic at every cost according to the orders of the Holy See. I urged him to continue in his work with much

possibile ed a farsi consigliare dalla sua esperienza, saggezza e prudenza per preparare bene tutto e prendere le necessarie ed opportune disposizioni per quell'affare, richiamando la sua attenzione su due persone di gran pregio, cioè sul suo Vicario Generale, il molto Rev. Padre Filippo e su Monsignor Marcellino Berardi, suo Coadiutore, che godono influenza e rispetto presso il popolo, in modo che egli potrebbe servirsene utilmente in tale difficoltà.

Con un'altra lettera della stessa data, 2 corrente, ho scritto direttamente a questi due egregi Religiosi informandoli che alcuni giorni prima avevo già scritto a Monsignor Mellano, Arcivescovo di Verapoly e al clero e al popolo di quell'Archidiocesi che avevano chiesto alla S. Sede che l'affare del convento di Cunemao fosse nuovamente trattato, facendo conoscere la risposta definitiva di Vostra Eminenza, a nome anche della Congregazione, la quale non torna sulle sue decisioni. Davo poi espressioni di fiducia che tutto stesse per andare bene e che ogni cosa stesse per terminare in pace; aggiungevo che però intanto credevo opportuno interessare entrambi loro a far anch'essi tutto il possibile per questo risultato e così offrire un valido

energy possible and to get counsel from his experience, wisdom and prudence to prepare everything well and to take the necessary and appropriate measures for that affair, recalling his attention to two people of great value, namely on his vicar general, the very Rev. Father Philip and Bishop Marcellinus Berardi, his coadjutor, who enjoy respect and influence from the people, in a way that he would be made use of their services usefully at this difficulty.

With another letter of the same date, 2nd of this month, I wrote directly to these two religious informing them that few days before I had already written to Msgr. Mellano, Archbishop of Verapoly and to the clergy and to the people of that Archdiocese who had asked the Holy See that the affair of the convent of Koonammavu should be considered again, making known the definitive response of your Eminence, also on behalf of the Congregation, which will not turn back on its decisions. I had then the expressions of trust that all is going well and everything is going to end in peace. But added that yet I thought appropriate to make both of them interested in doing everything that is possible for this result and thus

aiuto al venerando Monsignor Arcivescovo di Verapoly, che si stava già impegnando molto per conseguire tale scopo, e li invitavo ad assistere Monsignor Mellano perchè l'arrivo delle suore latine a Verapoly si effettuasse senza difficoltà e si trasformasse quasi in un trionfo per i Latini. Ambedue mi fecero subito capire di essere pronti a fare tutto quello che domandavo loro.

Monsignor Medlycott e Monsignor Mellano tornarono ed assicurarono che avrebbero fatto il possibile nel senso da me indicato, anzi il secondo rifletteva: "Si sta mettendo in ordine il luogo, cioè il convento in Verapoly, e prima di chiamare le Monache Latine perchè venissero ad abitarvi, considerando l'agitazione del popolo, ecc. credo sia utile far prima una pubblicazione nella Cattedrale di Verapoly ed un'altra nella chiesa di Cunemao per far conoscere l'ordine della S.Sede, non solo affinché venga da tutti conosciuto, ma anche vi si sottomettano, perchè i malcontenti per l'appello che hanno fatto (ma che è stato respinto) possono provocare molti mali, e dopo di questo, secondo l'opportunità, le Monache Latine saranno chiamate a Verapoly. Prego Vostra Eccellenza di dare gli ordini necessari perchè esse

to offer a valuable help to the venerable Monsignor, the Archbishop of Verapoly, who had already committed himself in doing a lot in order to achieve that objective. And I urged them to assist Msgr. Mellano since the arrival of the Latin sisters in Verapoly has to be effected without difficulty and it may transform as a triumph for the Latins. Both of them immediately made me understand of their readiness to do whatever is asked to them.

Msgr. Medlycott and Msgr. Mellano turned and assured that they would do everything possible in the sense indicated by myself. And indeed the second one reflected: "they are putting in order the place, i.e. the convent in Verapoly, and before calling the Latin nuns, I think it is useful to make an announcement - why they were to be, considering the people's agitation, etc. - in the Cathedral of Verapoly and another one in the church of Koonammavu to make known the order of the Holy See, not only for being known by all, but also they submit to you; since the malcontents for the appeal that they did (but that was rejected) can provoke many evils. And after that, according to the opportunity, the Latin nuns will be called to Verapoly. I beg your

possano portare con loro quanto è loro necessario, come letti, ecc. Con la loro dote, altrimenti non potrebbero vivere, nè io mi troverei in grado di mantenerle a spese della Missione, se non con difficoltà”. Gli risposi che si mettesse d’accordo con Monsignor Vicario Apostolico di Trichur per quanto concerne le cose di cui quelle religiose hanno bisogno e che vorrebbero trasportare con loro, la dote, ecc. e che poi mi riservavo di esaminare e di approvare il progetto che avessero fatto di comune accordo. In seguito Monsignor Mellano mi fece avere una copia dell ‘accordo che dopo la mia risposta era stato fatto tra lui e Monsignor Vicario Apostolico di Trichur, e di cui presento in appendice un esemplare a Vostra Eminenza, insieme al rescritto con cui lo stesso venne approvato da me in virtù delle facoltà che Vostra Eminenza mi aveva con bontà conferito di concludere tale cosa nel modo che credessi più opportuno per evitare altri disturbi. L’egregio Prelato, mi accompagna quell documento con il seguente scritto: “...Monsignor Medlycott ha fretta nello steso tempo di trasferirle. Per accontentarlo, devo acconsentire anche se il luogo non è ancora ultimato; per quanto invece riguarda l ‘affare della dote (benchè abbia

Excellency to give necessary orders because they can bring with them, what is necessary as cots etc., with their dowry, otherwise they cannot live, or I would not be able to keep them at the expense of the mission, except with difficulty.” I responded that he should make agreement with the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur regarding the things needed by that religious and those things which they would like to carry with them, the patrimony, etc. and then they have reserved me to examine and to approve the draft that they had made by mutual agreement. Following that, Msgr. Mellano sent me a copy of the agreement that had been made between him and Msgr. Medlycott after my reply. And here I present that agreement in the Appendix as an example to your Eminence, together with the letter by which the same was approved by me under the faculty that Your Eminence I had kindly given to conclude this thing the way I believed more appropriate to prevent further disturbances. That Prelate sent me that document with the following writing: “...Msgr. Medlycott is in hurry at the same time to transfer them. To satisfy him, I have to agree even if the site is not yet completed; as regarding the

tutta la buona volontà di cederla) dubitando di avere lui il potere di decidere, prega l' 'Eccellenza Vostra di preparare al più presto il necessario Decreto che riguardi anche la loro dote, cioè le loro proprietà, ecc. poichè sono persuaso che Vostra Eccellenza ha tutta l'autorità necessaria circa quest 'affare. Come spero di trasferire le Monache dal convento di Cunemao questa settimana, così prego Vostra Eccellenza di mandare il suo ordine senza ritardo, altrimenti non so come mantenerle e provvedere loro. Con questa speranza aspetto da Vostra Eccellenza una risposta, così sarà tolto ogni dubbio”.

Mi è sembrata giusta la domanda di quell Prelato e il concederla mi è pure sembrata una cosa molto vantaggiosa per tranquillizzare l' 'animo di quell Prelato, le monache latine, ed i loro amici del Clero e del popolo e facilitare l' 'effettuazione della presa di possesso del monastero da parte di Monsignor Medlycott e il trasferimento delle stesse religiose a Verapoly, e così scrissi:

“Concediamo che le religiose latine che escono da quell convento, per trasferirsi nel monastero di Verapoly, possano, anzi è utile che prendano con loro le rispettive doti, osservando tuttavia questa

dowry affair (though I have all the goodwill of giving up them) doubting that of having him the power of deciding, request to your Eminence to prepare as soon as possible the necessary Decree regarding also of their dowry; that is their property, etc. I am convinced that your Excellency has all the necessary authority about this affair. As I hope to transfer the nuns from the convent of Koonammavu this week, so I beg your Excellency to send the order without delay, otherwise I do not know how to keep them and provide for them. With this hope I expect from your Excellency a reply, thus will remove each doubt.”

The demand of that prelate seemed to me right and to grant that is also seemed to me something very beneficial to pacify the soul of that Prelate, the Latin nuns, and their friends of the clergy and of the people and facilitate the execution of the taking possession of the convent from the part of Msgr. Medlycott and the transferring of the religious themselves to Verapoly and thus I wrote:

“We concede that the Latin religious who go out from that convent, to move to the convent of Verapoly, can, indeed it is useful to take with them their dowries, observing above all this *sine qua non*

condizione sine qua non (essenziale) che cioè ciascuna dote sia costituita soltanto da quei beni, che dai medesimi illustrissimi Prelati, di comune accordo siano stati riconosciuti nel vero e proprio senso della parola, come beni di ciascuna Religiosa”.

Dopo tutto questo fu effettuata con tutta pace e tranquillità la presa di Possesso del convento da parte di Mons. Medlycott e l'uscita della Suore latine da esso, senza che si verificasse il più piccolo disordine da parte del popolo. Il Clero, obbediente alle esortazioni di Mons. Arcivescovo ed a quelle di questa Delegazione Apostolica, si è astenuto dall'invitare i laici al malcontento e alla resistenza; così è avvenuto che tutto si è svolto tranquillamente. Ora tutto è quieto e in pace e penso di avere motivazioni valide da pensare che così continuerà ad essere in futuro.

Il popolo ed il Clero hanno visto dopo tutto, che le Religiose latine, se hanno perduto il convento di Cunemavu, hanno però ricevuto in cambio un magnifico Convento a Verapoly, ed hanno portato con loro le rispettive doti, e ciò ha contribuito moltissimo a calmare gli animi e a far proseguire tutto nel modo più soddisfacente.

Mons. Marcellino, dandomi poco fa queste buone notizie,

essential condition that is, for each one dowry constituted only of those goods, which by the same illustrious Prelates by mutual agreement have been recognized in the real and proper sense of the word as the goods of each religious.”

After all this was effected with peace and tranquility can be taken the possession of the convent by Msgr. Medlycott and the exit of the Latin Sisters from that, without occurring any smallest disorder by the people. The clergy, obedient to the exhortations of Msgr. Archbishop and those of this Apostolic Delegation refrained from 'inviting the laity to discontent and resistance; Thus it is happened that everything was done in tranquility. Now everything is quiet and peaceful and I think I have valid reasons to think that it will continue to be so in the future.

The people and the clergy have seen after all, that the Latin religious if they have lost the convent of Koonammavu, however, have received in return a magnificent convent at Verapoly, and brought with them their dowries, and this contributed greatly to calm the souls and to continue all in the way more satisfying.

Msgr. Marceline, giving me little before this good news, thus, he has expressed it: “after

così si esprimeva: “Dopo che nel cuore ho tanto sofferto per le cose di Cunemao, finalmente tutto termina in pace. Mons. Medlycott prese possesso ed è ritornato varie volte, e le Monache latine sono uscite senza il più piccolo disordine e per il momento sono state trasferite nel convento di Ernakulam, da dove verranno quanto prima trasferite a quello di Verapoly. Mons. Medlycott credo che orasia contento. Deo Gratias.”

La stessa buona notizia mi ha fatto avere Mons. Medlycott, assicurandomi anch'egli che la presa di possesso del Convento da parte sua, e l'uscita delle Religiose latine da esso è avvenuta senza alcun disordine.

Dopo di questo nutro la fiducia che il mio operato in tutto questo affare meriterà di incontrare il prezioso beneplacito di Vostra Eminenza, ed intanto con il più profondo ossequio e con la più devota venerazione ho la gioia di dichiararmi

Dell' E. V. Rev.ma Umilissimo,
Devotissimo, ossequiosissimo
Servo

+ Andrea Arcivescovo di Acrida
Delegato Apostolico delle
Indie Orientali

I really suffered in the heart for the things of Koonammavu, finally everything ends peacefully. Msgr. Medlycott took the possession and came back several times, and the Latin nuns are departed without any slight disorder and for the moment they are transferred to the convent of Ernakulam, from where they will be transferred as soon as possible to that of Verapoly. I believe that now Msgr. Medlycott is also happy. *Deo Gratias.*”

The same good news made me to have by Msgr. Medlycott, assuring me also that he has taken possession of the convent from his part, and the exit of the Latin religious from that, is occurred without any disorder.

After this I have confidence that my actions in this whole deal will merit to meet the precious blessing of Your eminence, and meanwhile, with the deepest respect and more devout reverence I have the joy of clearing me,

of Your most Reverend Eminence Humblest, Devoted, obsequious Servant

+ Andrea Archbishop of Acrida
Apostolic delegate of the East
Indies

5.3.3.8.2.2. Main Points

- The Apostolic Delegate says that he with his hard work and thoughtfulness had completed the settlement of the situation.
- He informed Msgr. Medlycott that it is time to execute the decision of the Holy See about taking over the administration of the Koonammavu convent either personally or better by his delegate or representative.
- Msgr. Aiuti praised Msgr. Mellano for his perfect submission to the decisions of the Holy See and who had promised that he would do his best to make his clergy and people to obey the decision of the Holy See. The Apostolic Delegate asked the Prelate to continue his efforts in an energetic way, making use of his experience, wisdom and prudence. Also Msgr. Aiuti advised Msgr. Mellano to make use of the services of his Vicar General, Fr. Philip and Bishop Marceline Berardi, his coadjutor, who enjoy respect and influence from the people, at this difficult moment.
- Apostolic Delegate also approached Fr. Philip and Msgr. Berardi to make known the definitive response of the Holy See that it will not turn back on its decision undertaken about the jurisdiction of the Koonammavu convent. The Apostolic Delegate expresses his hope and trust that everything will end in a peaceful way. He had asked both of them to render every possible help to Msgr. Mellano who is working hard to achieve this objective. He also urged them to assist Msgr. Mellano in order that the arrival of the Latin sisters in Verapoly is effected without any difficulty and it may transform as a triumph for the Latins. Both of them immediately expressed their readiness to do whatever is asked of them.

- Both Msgr. Medlycott and Msgr. Mellano assured that they would do everything possible to fulfill the request made by Msgr. Aiuti.
- Msgr. Mellano thinks thus: the convent at Verapoly has to be put in order, before the sisters come and occupy it; Considering the agitation of the people it will be useful to make publish the order of the Holy See in the cathedral of Verapoly and the church at Koonammavu so that it could be known to all and that the discontent people at the rejection of their petition should submit to the verdict of the Holy See without making any trouble.
- He requested the Apostolic Delegate to give necessary orders so that the Latin sisters can take with them, everything that they need for their future life, such as cots, their dowry etc., otherwise it will be difficult for him to maintain them at the expense of the mission.
- To this request Msgr. Aiuti responded that Msgr. Mellano should make agreement with the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur regarding the things needed by the Latin sisters and the things that they could take with them such as dowry etc. To this request, both Prelates asked Msgr. Aiuti to study and approve the draft of the contract they had made.
- Accordingly, the Apostolic Delegate approved the draft according to the authority given to him by the Holy See.
- Msgr. Mellano had informed him that Msgr. Medlycott is in a hurry to transfer the Latin sisters to Verapoly. In order to satisfy him, he had given his consent even though the convent is not yet ready for the habitation of the sisters. The Archbishop of Verapoly requests Msgr. Aiuti to send immediately the decree about the dowry affair, since he had to transfer the Latin sisters that week

itself. Unless that decree is not dispatched immediately, he may find it difficult how to maintain the sisters and provide for them.

- Msgr. Aiuti thinks that the demand of Msgr. Mellano is right and granting that, is very beneficial to pacify the soul of that Prelate, the Latin nuns, and their friends of the clergy and of the people. Also, it will facilitate the execution of the taking possession of the convent from the part of Msgr. Medlycott and the transferring of the religious to Verapoly. Accordingly, the Apostolic Delegate gave the order that the Latin sisters can take with them their dowries, however, observing the essential condition that the term dowry has to be taken in its true and proper sense and with the approval of both the prelates.
- Putting into practice all these precautions and requests the Latin sisters departed from the Koonammavu convent without slightest resistance and agitation of the people, and Msgr. Medlycott could take possession of the convent. Now everything is quiet and peaceful and the Apostolic Delegate thinks that it will continue to be so in the future.
- Msgr. Aiuti believes that the Latin people and clergy are satisfied now since their sisters, although have lost the convent of Koonammavu, in its place they have now got a grand convent at Verapoly, and with the returned dowries they could live a quiet and peaceful life. He hopes that there will be no more troubles and agitations in Koonammavu.
- The Apostolic Delegate informs the Cardinal that he received the letter from Msgr. Marceline saying: “although I had to suffer in the beginning about the situation in Koonammavu, now everything has ended

peacefully. Msgr. Medlycott took the possession of the convent and visited Koonammavu for several times; the Latin sisters departed without any discontent; for the moment, they are transferred to the convent of Ernakulam, from where they will be taken to Verapoly as early as possible. I think that the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur is also happy. *Deo Gratias.*”

- The Apostolic Delegate also informs the Cardinal that Msgr. Medlycott has informed him that he had taken possession of the convent and the Latin sisters had departed without any discontent.
- Concluding the letter Msgr. Aiuti expresses his confidence that his actions in the whole deal will merit to meet the precious blessing of his Eminence, the Cardinal Prefect of the Propaganda Fide.

5.3.3.8.2.3. Comments

- The Letter gives the whole picture of what had happened until that moment in summary form.
- The Apostolic Delegate gives an account of the happenings seemingly not taking any side.
- According to Msgr. Aiuti both the Latin and Syrian Prelates as well as the Latin clergy and people agreed and appreciated the peaceful atmosphere that reigned at Koonammavu when the Latin sisters departed and Msgr. Medlycott took possession of the convent.⁹⁶

⁹⁶This fact seems to have been conveniently forgotten and purposefully neglected in the Latin writings and audio visual shows in which the departure of the Latin sisters is depicted as an unjust ejection and cruel denying of their basic rights and they had nowhere to go. See for farther details and comments the subsequent sections and the conclusion of this chapter.

5.3.3.8.3. Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti dated 29th September 1890

This letter is both a reply to the inquiry of Msgr. Aiuti as well as an account of the settlement of the issue of the Latin sisters.

5.3.3.8.3.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>Monsignor Andrea Aiuti, Arcivescovo di Acrida e Delegato Apostolico nell'India, Ootacamund Trichur 29 Settembre 1890 Eccellenza Reverendissima Dichiaro di aver ricevuto in modo regolare i suoi dispacci N. 2161, 2136, 2138 e spero che tutto ciò che riguarda le doti delle religiose latina sarà sistemato secondo equità ed il decreto di Vostra Eccellenza Reverendissima, intanto aspetto l'iniziativa di monsignor Arcivescovo di Verapoly. Annuncio in via ufficiale che 1^o il Settembre corrente, ho preso possesto del Convento delle Suore Terziarie a Cunemao per mezzo del mio vicario Generale; il molto Rev. P. Bonifacio, Carmelitano, ha representato in quel'atto Mons. Arcivescovo. La mattina del 16 corrente, ho celebrato la S. Messa nella cappella del Convento. Le suore latine, sette di numero, dietro</p> | <p>Msgr. Andrea Aiuti, Archbishop of Acrida and Apostolic Delegate in India Trichur 29 September 1890 Very Rev. Excellency, I received your letters No. 2161, 2136, 2138 timely and I hope that everything concerning the dowries of the Latin religious will be settled according to the justice and in conformity with the decree of your Eminence, meantime I am waiting for the opinion of the Archbishop of Verapoly. I announce officially that on the 1st of this September I took charge of the convent of the Tertiary nuns at Koonammavu through my Vicar General; very Rev. Fr. Boniface, the Carmelite, has represented the Archbishop in that act. On the 16th morning, I celebrated the Holy Mass in the chapel of the convent. The Latin sisters, seven in number, after an arrangement done by Msgr. Marcelline</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>arrangiamento fatto con Mons. Marcellino Berardi, vescovo coadiutore di Verapoly, furono trasferite dal convento la mattina del 17 corrente, senza alcun malinteso, ed a motivo delle precauzioni date da me in modo dettagliato nella visita fatta antecedentemente, non vi è stata alcuna violazione della clausura, o altro inconveniente. Le suore latine si sono separate dalle suoriane con segni di benevolenza vicendevole. Il dopo pranzo dello stesso giorno, rivisitai una seconda volta il convento e trovai ogni cosa in perfetta pace. Ho ritenuto opportuno, in lettera separata, indicare alcune circostanze connesse con questa cessione, per informazione della S. Sede. Gradisca di accettare l'ossequio del mio sincero attaccamento e venerazione e sono felice di dichiararmi di vostra Eccellenza Reverendissima Umilissimo Servo +A. E. Medlycott Vescovo di Triconia e Vic. Apostolico di Trichur</p> | <p>Berardi, the coadjutor Bishop of Verapoly, were transferred from the convent on the 17th morning, without any misunderstanding and because of the precautions given by me in all details during my previous visit, there was no violation of the cloister or other inconvenience. The Latin sisters were separated from the Syrians with signs of mutual benevolence. On the same day after lunch, I visited the convent for a second time and I found everything in perfect peace. I found it good, in a separate letter to indicate the situation connected with such a cessation for the information of the Holy See. Accept my sincere respect and reverence and I am happy to declare myself a very humble servant of your very Rev. Excellency + A.E. Medlycott Bishop of Triconia and Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.</p> |
|---|--|

5.3.3.8.3.2. Main Points

- Concerning the issue of dowries of the Latin sisters Msgr. Medlycott informs Msgr. Aiuti his firm hope that everything will be settled according to justice and in conformity with the decree of the Holy See; he is waiting for the reply of the Archbishop of Verapoly.

- The bishop of Trichur, intimates Msgr. Aiuti that he officially took charge of the convent of the Tertiary nuns at Koonammavu on 1st of September through his Vicar General; very Rev. Fr. Boniface, the Carmelite, has represented the Archbishop. On 16th morning, September 1890 the bishop celebrated the Holy Mass in the chapel of the Koonammavu convent.
- The Latin sisters, seven in number, after an arrangement done by Msgr. Marcelline Berardi, the coadjutor Bishop of Verapoly, were transferred from the Koonammavu convent on the 17th morning, without any misunderstanding. And due to the precautions given by him in all details during his previous visit, there was no violation of the cloister or other inconvenience.
- The Latin sisters were separated from the Syrians with signs of mutual benevolence.
- On the same day after lunch, Msgr. Medlycott visited the convent for a second time and he found everything in perfect peace.
- Msgr. Medlycott is planning to inform the Holy See these facts in a separate letter.

5.3.3.8.3.3. Comments

- In this letter, the Prelate of the Syrians expresses his willingness to settle the issue of the dowries of the Latin sisters with full justice and in conformity with the Decree of the Holy See. He also confirms that there reigned peace and benevolence at the scene of departure of the Latin sisters from Koonammavu convent.

5.3.4. Disappearing of the Children from the Orphanage

After the departure of the Latin sisters from Koonammavu convent, the first unexpected 'event' was the

disappearance of the children from the orphanage. Both Latins and Syrians are having different versions about this event.

5.3.4.1. Observations in CKC II

5.3.4.1.1. Original Document

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളെ വിട്ടശേഷം മഠത്തിന്റെ അനാഥശാലയിൽ സംരക്ഷിക്കപ്പെട്ടു പോരുന്ന അനാഥക്കുട്ടികളെ സൂക്ഷിച്ചു കൊള്ളണമെന്നും മറ്റും ഉണ്ടായ എ. പെ. ബ. തൃശൂർ മെത്രാന്മാരുടെ കൽപന അനുസരിച്ച് ഞങ്ങൾ അവരെ വളർത്തി സൂക്ഷിച്ചു താമസിപ്പിച്ചു കൊണ്ടുവരികയിൽ മേൽപ്പറഞ്ഞ ജനങ്ങളുടെയും മറ്റും പ്രേരണയാൽ 80-ൽ പരം സ്ത്രീകളും കുട്ടികളുമായിട്ട് ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നവരുടെ മേൽനോട്ടത്തിന് ഏൽപ്പിക്കപ്പെട്ടിരുന്ന സഹോദരികൾ ഉച്ചഭക്ഷണത്തിനു പോയിരിക്കുന്ന അവസരം നോക്കി തെക്കെ മതിൽക്കെട്ടിന്റെ പുറത്തുള്ള വേലി പൊളിച്ച് ഒളിവാലെ വന്ന് മേൽപ്പറഞ്ഞ സ്ത്രീകളെയും കുട്ടികളെയും കാൽമണിക്കുറിനുള്ളിൽ പുറത്തിറക്കി കുനമോവ് പള്ളി സ്കൂളിൽ കൊണ്ടു പോയാക്കി. ഭക്ഷണം കഴിഞ്ഞ് ഞങ്ങൾ വന്നപ്പോൾ ഒരുത്തരേയും സ്ഥലത്തു കാണാൻകയാൽ നാലു വശത്തും അന്വേഷിച്ച് തിരക്കിയപ്പോൾ പള്ളി സ്കൂളിൽ ഉള്ളതായി അറിവുകിട്ടി.</p> <p>ഇവരാൽ ഉപേക്ഷിക്കപ്പെട്ട പൊട്ടും വ്രണവുമായി മരണാവസ്ഥയിൽ കിടന്നിരുന്ന ഒരു കുട്ടിയെ ആണ് ബാക്കി ശേഷിച്ചു കിട്ടിയത്. ഈ കുട്ടി രോഗചികിത്സയ്ക്കുവേണ്ടി മരിച്ചു. അന്ന് ഈ മഠത്തിന്റെ</p> | <p>After the departure of the sisters, the most reverend Bishop of Trichur had commanded us to be very cautious about the orphan children who were in the orphanage. So we were diligently taking care of the children. There were more than eighty of them including women and children. One day at the instigation of the above mentioned people, at noon taking advantage of the time when the sisters who were in charge of the children went to the convent for lunch, they broke open the fence outside the compound wall on the south, and coming stealthily forced all the above mentioned women and children to come out and they took them to the parish school. All this happened within fifteen minutes. When we came back after having our food we were shocked to see that no one was there. We searched and enquired everywhere and finally came to know that they were in the parish school.</p> <p>The only one left behind was a child who was full of sores and wounds and was on her death bed. The child died after a week. Reverend Fr. Albertus who was the chaplain of the convent then had the coffin carried to the church at</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>കപ്പോനായിരുന്ന ബ. അൽബർത്തോസ് അച്ചൻ മരിച്ച കുട്ടിയുടെ ശവം പുത്തൻപള്ളിയിൽ കൊണ്ടു പോയി അടക്കുന്നതിനു ശവം എടുപ്പിച്ചുകൊണ്ട് കുന്നമ്മാവു പള്ളിപ്പടിക്ക് സമീപം ചെന്നപ്പോൾ ബഹളക്കാരായ മുൻ പറഞ്ഞ ജനങ്ങൾ കവർ പിടിച്ചു വയ്ക്കുകയും ബ. അച്ചനെ കൈയ്യേറ്റം ചെയ്യുന്നതിന് ഒരുങ്ങുകയും ചെയ്യുകയാൽ അച്ചൻ വ്യസനിച്ച് മഠത്തിൽ വന്നിരുന്ന് വിവരം പുത്തൻപള്ളി വികാരിയച്ചനേയും തളിയത്ത് വർക്കി, മുലൻ അനോണി, എന്നിവരെ അറിയിച്ചു. അവർ മറ്റുപലരേയും കൂട്ടിക്കൊണ്ടുവന്ന് ബഹളം അമർത്തി ശവം എടുത്തു പുത്തൻപള്ളിയിൽ കൊണ്ടു പോയി അടക്കുന്നതിനു ശ്രമിച്ചെങ്കിലും പടു മുട്ടന്മാരായ ആ ജനങ്ങളെ സമ്മതിപ്പിക്കാഞ്ഞതിനാൽ അവർ മടങ്ങിപ്പോവുകയും മറ്റവർ വരാപ്പുഴ സെമിത്തേരിയിൽ കൊണ്ടുപോയി അടക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു (CKC II,144-145)</p> | <p>Puthenpally, to have the child buried there. But when the funeral party reached near the gate of the Koonammavu church the riotous people snatched the coffin from them by force and prepared to beat the priest. So the frightened priest came to the convent and from there informed the parish priest of Puthenpally and also the people like Varkey Thaliath and Antony Moolan. They came accompanied by a gang of people and tried to pacify the rioters and to take the body to the church at puthenpally for burial. But the people there were so wicked and obstinate that they could not be brought round in any way. So they finally gave up and went back leaving the coffin with them. The other party took the body to the cemetery of the church at Varapuzha and buried the child.</p> |
|--|--|

5.3.4.1.2. Main Points

- Msgr. Medlycott had advised the sisters to pay close attention to the children who were in the orphanage and the sisters were acting accordingly.
- Some at the instigation of the people stealthily came and took the children with the women and brought them to the parish school at Koonammavu. All these happened within 15 minutes.
- Sisters soon got the information that they are at the parish school.

- The left out sick child did not survive more than one week.⁹⁷ While the chaplain of the convent Fr. Albertos was taking the dead body to be buried in Puthenpally church, the *cover* (which was carrying the coffin) was taken by force by the above-mentioned instigators. The attempt of the parish priest of Puthenpally and others to get the dead body back from those violent men did not succeed. The wicked folk buried the body at the cemetery of Verapoly.

5.3.4.1.3. Comments

- It seems that Msgr. Medlycott could foresee some troubles from the Latin people. That was why he asked the sisters to safeguard the children.
- What the instigators did was not only unchristian but also very monstrous inhuman act.⁹⁸

5.3.4.2. First two Letters of Msgr. Mellano to Msgr. Aiuti Regarding the Children of Orphanage

From the Latin side there are few letters of Msgr. Mellano to the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti regarding the children of Orphanage.⁹⁹ Among those letters, the first two are cited below.

⁹⁷This does not mean that there were no other girls in the orphanage who had not joined in the flight. Probably the orphans who were Syrians had remained in the orphanage. Both Msgr. Mellano and Sr. Catherine in their letters mention that 10 children were there left then. See below No. 5.3.4.2.1. 'Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Apostolic Delegate on 27th September 1890 and No. 5.3.5.7. 'Letter of Sr. Catherine to Msgr. Medlycott, January 1891.'

⁹⁸Sr. Suzy adduces some points from CMI Mutholy *Nalagamam*. Her interpretations seem to be very farfetched ones.

⁹⁹ All together four letters are available under this title. Two of them are quoted now and the other two will be cited after the reply of the Apostolic delegate.

5.3.4.2.1. First Letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 27th September 1890

In this letter, Msgr. Mellano writes to the Apostolic Delegate that 41 orphans who went from Koonammavu have reached at Verapoly and asks Msgr. Aiuti, what to do with them.

5.3.4.2.1.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>A Sua Ecc.za Rev.ma Monsignor Andrea Aiuti Arcivescovo e delegato Apo</p> <p>Magnamey 27 Settembre 1890 Eccellenza Reverendissima</p> <p>Dopo che Monsignor Medlycott aveva preso possesso del Monastero di Cunamao, e fatto tutto ciò che credeva opportune, speravo che fossero finiti i dispiaceri e le sofferenze provati da tanto tempo a motivo di quell luogo, ma all ‘ improvviso sono venuto a conoscenza che Sabato scorso le orfane, in numero di quarantuno, fuggirono dall ‘Orfanotrofio, e forse solo 10 continuarono a rimanere l dentro, e le 41 si rifugiarono nella nostra Chiesa di Cunamao. Sperando che lo scandalo terminasse, tardai fino ad ora a informare Vostra Eccellenza, ma non c ‘stata alcun modo per convincerle a ritornare. In quella Chiesa ci sono due preti assistenti i quali cercarono di consigliare loro di tornare nel loro Orfanotrofio, ma poichè tutto ciò si è rivelato inutile, ne</p> | <p>To His Very Rev. Excellency Msgr. Andrea Aiuti Archbishop and Apostolic Delegate</p> <p>Manjummel, September 27th 1890</p> <p>Very Rev. Excellency, After Msgr. Medlycott took charge of the Convent of Koonammavu and having done all that he believed as good, I hoped that the sorrows and sufferings would be over; but suddenly I came to know that last Saturday 41 orphans ran away from the orphanage and perhaps only 10 continued to remain there and the 41 who had run away took refuge in our church of Koonammavu. Hoping that the scandal may finish soon, I became late in informing your Eminence. But I could not succeed in any way persuading them to go back. In that church, there are two assistant priests who are trying to persuade them to go back to their orphanage; since they did</p> |

scrissero a Mons. Marcellino, mio Coadiutore, il quale con severe parole mostro quanto male avessero fatto, ed invitava quei due preti perchè tornassero immediatamente all'Orfanotrofio, e ne avvisassero subito le monache con il loro Confessore, ma ebbero risposta che senza il permesso di Mons. Medlycott non le avrebbero accolte, e le Orfane, vistesi rifiutate, uscirono dalla Chiesa per andare in una casa che so trova nelle vicinanze, dove abita una vedova, e vi rimangono tuttora, e sono mantenute, per quanto ho sentito, con l'elemosina di alcuni Cristiani.

Il mio Vicario Generale, padre Filippo, che per malattia era stata ad Alwaye ora stava meglio, ma all'udire questo fatto ne provò tanto dispiacere che si ammalò di nuovo e scrisse lettere di fuoco a Cunamao. Tutto però è stato inutile e le Orfane rispondono che non si sentono più di tornare all'Orfanotrofio, per i motivi che esprimono due sono i seguenti:

1^o che quando le Monache Latine sono uscite da quell'Orfanotrofio, le Orfane volevano, e chiesero con le lacrime il permesso di poterle vedere e salutare, specialmente quella che le aveva educate, come loro maestra per molti anni e quantunque piangendo supplicassero la Superiora di permettere loro questa cosa, e piangendo

not succeed, they wrote to Msgr. Marceline, my Coadjutor, who with strong words pointed out the wrong they did, and asked the two priests to go to the orphanage to inform the nuns and their confessor. But they got a negative response that without the permission of Msgr. Medlycott they would not accept them and the orphans having been rejected, left the church to go to a nearby house where a widow is living, and are still there; they are sustained by the alms of some Christians. My vicar General Fr. Philip, due to his sickness was in Alwaye but now had recovered but after hearing this felt so bad and again fell ill and wrote very strong letters to Koonammavu. Everything was useless and the orphans do not feel to go back to the orphanage due to the following two reasons:

When the Latin Sisters left the Convent the orphans wished and asked crying the permission to meet and greet them, especially the one who was their mistress for many years. Though they cryingly begged the superior to allow them and even cried out aloud as to could be heard outside, the permission not only was denied, but they were locked in a room as they were for

gridarono in modo da essere sentite anche fuori, non solo ciò non fu loro permesso, ma furono ancora di più chiude in una stanza, come lo erano già da tempo.

2^o Che quantunque fossero battezzate dal Padre Filippo e per molti anni si fossero confessate da lui, in questi ultimi mesi ciò fu loro impedito; quannunque più volte avessero chiesto con insistenza di confessarsi dal Padre Filippo o da qualche altro Padre della Chiesa di Cunamao, non lo poterono ottenere. Non volendo perÒ esse assolutamente andarsi a confessare dal già ricordato Padre Alberto, rimasero senza confessione per tutto questo tempo.

Dalle informazioni avute da persone imparziali, sono venuto a conoscere one le cause da esse portate per fuggire dall 'Orfanotrofio sono vere, pur troppo, anzi si dice, con ragioni ancora più gravi, che io ora tralascio. Devo inoltre fare osservare che, come erano custodite di giorno e di notte, non potevano essere incitate a fuggire dal consiglio di altri se non della Monache. Ho cercato di sapere la verita, ma nessuno può provare la verità di questa cosa.

Per non essere proliisso, dico in breve che queste Orfane sono obstinate a non voler rientrare nell 'Orfanotrofio, si trovane in una casa piccola e poverissima,

some time.

Even though, all of them were baptized by Fr. Philip and he had been their confessor for many years, they were obstructed to do so during these last months. Even though, they insistently requested to make their confession to Fr. Philip or any other priests (Latin) of the church of Koonammavu, they were not allowed. They did not want to go at all and confess to the above mentioned Fr. Albert. Thus, they had to live without making confession during these whole time. I have obtained these informations from impartial persons. I came to know the reasons to flee from the orphanage were true. There are also other grievous reasons, which I omit now.

I must also mention that they were guarded day and night; they could not be instigated to flee by the counsel of others than the sisters. I tried to find out the truth, but nobody can prove the truth of this fact.

For not to be lengthy I say in a summary form that these orphans are determined not to go back to the Orphanage. Now they find themselves in a small and very poor house, with great danger especially for their soul. I ask your Excellency to let me know as

con perieolo grande, soprattutto per la loro anima, prego quindi Vostra Eccellenza di farmi sapere al più presto quale strada dovo seguire per liberare quelle incaute da tanti pericoli, che già ci costarono tante fatiche per liberarle dal paganesimo e che ora davano frutti di grande consolazione.

Mi permetta pure l' 'Eccellenza Vostra di aggiungere due parole circa il decreto che riguarda la dote delle Monache Latine, o il loro patrimonio. Non so come saranno interpretate certe espressioni; ora le Monache Latine sono in Ernacullum, non essendo ancora ultimato il Monastero di Verapoli, ma ciò avverrà in breve tempo, ma tutti i document che appartengono loro, tutta la loro roba, insomma tutto quanto possiedono sta nelle mani delle Monache Soriane.

Ricordo solo a Vostra Eccellenza che fra le suore uscite ci sono due fondatrici del Monastero di Cunamao, la 3 o, diglia di una delle due, è morta. Esse hanno i loro beniche hanno sempre fruttato molto di più di quanto esse avevano bisogno e molte delle loro case ancora esistono.

La 4 o Monaca fu una Soriana, è vero, ma già il Monastero era costruito, ed essa di dote portò solo 100 Ruppie. Questa breve nota dà alla mente aperta di Vostra Eccellenza il filo per tirare le necessarie conseguenze,

early as possible what way I had to follow to liberate these unwary children from such dangers, for whom we have taken very much pain to liberate them from paganism and now they are producing fruits of great consolation.

Your Excellency permits me to add few words about the decree on the dowry of the Latin sisters and their Patrimony.

I do not know how certain expression will be interpreted; now the Latin sisters are in Ernakulam, because the Convent of Verapoly is not yet been finished, which will take place in a short time. But all the documents pertaining to them, all their cloths, in short whatever they had are in the hands of the Syrian sisters.

I would like only to remind to your Excellency that among the sisters who left, there are two foundresses of the koonammavu convent. The third one, daughter of one of the two is dead. They had their own properties, which fetched them more they needed, many of their houses still exist.

It is true that the fourth one was a Syrian. But the convent was already built up and she brought only a dowry of 100 rupees.

This short note given to the

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>ed io non lascerò di ricorrere alla Sua bontà e giustizia in caso di bisogno, poichè non mi è possibile, nella situazione attuale mantenere le Monache, avendo tanti altri bisogni a cui provvedere e per i quali già mancano i mezzi necessary.</p> <p>Prego infine Vostra Eccellenza di gradire i miei rispetti, mentre con la più alta stima e venerazione ho l'onore di professarmi</p> <p>Di Vostra Eccellenza Reverendissima Umilissimo Servitore + Fra Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Arcivescovo di Verapoly</p> | <p>open mind of your Excellency the thread to draw the necessary conclusions, and I do not want to resort to your bounty and justice in the case of this need, because it is not possible to me in the actual situation to maintain the sisters since I have to take care some other needs for which I lack necessary means.</p> <p>I ask finally, to your excellence to accept my wishes at the same time with the highest esteem and veneration I have the honour to profess myself.</p> <p>Your humble servant , +Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Archbishop of Verapoly</p> |
|--|---|

5.3.4.2.1.2. Main Points

- Msgr. Mellano thought that after taking charge by Msgr. Medlycott, all the sufferings and sorrows would be over.
- Now Msgr. Mellano came to know that 41 orphans had fled the orphanage.
- Hoping that the scandal will be finishing soon, he did not immediately inform the Holy See about it.
- He could not persuade the runaway children to return to the orphanage. Also the attempts of the two assistant priests did not meet with success and the attempt of the Coadjutor of Msgr. Mellano also failed.
- Even though Msgr. Marceline through assistant priests approached the Syrian sisters to take back the children

they denied it saying without the permission of Msgr. Medlycott they could not accept them.

- According to Msgr. Mellano there are two reasons for the flight of the girls from the orphanage:
 - o When the Latin Sisters left the convent, the orphans wished and asked crying the permission to meet and greet them, especially the one who was their mistress for *many years*. The permission not only was denied, but they were locked in a room.
 - o Fr. Philip had baptized all of them and he had been their confessor for many years. They were obstructed to confess to him during these last months even though, they insistently requested for either Fr. Philip or any other priests (Latin) of the Church of Koonammavu. They did not want to go at all and confess to Fr. Albertos. Thus, they had to live without making confession.

Then he adds that he obtained these informations from impartial persons and he came to know the reasons for the orphans to flee from the orphanage were true. There are also other grievous reasons, which he does not want to say.

- According to the prelate since the children were guarded day and night, they could not be instigated to flee by the counsel of others than the sisters. He tried to find out the truth, but nobody could be able to prove the truth of it.
- Those orphans are determined not to go back to the orphanage and they are in a small and very poor house, with great danger especially for their soul. Therefore, he asks the Apostolic Delegate what he should do to liberate those unwary children from such dangers.

- Concerning the dowry of the Latin sisters Msgr. Mellano informs the Apostolic Delegate that he does not know how to interpret certain expressions in the decree. Now the Latin sisters are staying in Ernakulam since the convent of Verapoly is not yet finished, which will be ready in a short time.
- All the documents pertaining to the Latin sisters, all their cloths, in short whatever they have, are in the hands of the Syrian sisters. He wants to remind Msgr. Aiuti that among those sisters who left Koonammavu, there are two foundresses of that convent. The third one, the daughter of one of the two is dead. They have their own goods, which fetched them more than they needed; many of their houses still exist.
- The fourth one was Syrian. But the convent was already built up (when she entered) and she brought only a dowry of 100 rupees.

5.3.4.2.1.3. Comments

- Concerning the inmates who fled the orphanage, the following facts are noteworthy. While Msgr. Mellano restricts the number who escaped from the orphanage to 41 girls, *CKC II*, 144 puts it as about 80 orphans and women. The assertion of Msgr. Mellano that the Latin sister was in charge of the orphans *per molti anni* (for many years) cannot be taken at its face value. *Vajrajubilee Smarakam*¹⁰⁰ thus states: “In 1890 there were about 85 orphans here. The sisters who took care of them were Sr. Anna of Vaikom, Sr. Thresia Kathrina Thoppil of Changanassery, Sr. Anna Manadan of Chakkarakkadavu and Sr. Anastasia Pooppanna of

¹⁰⁰75th year Jubilee *Souvenir* of Koonammavu convent.

Karuthedathu.”¹⁰¹ This last mentioned Sr. Anastasia is of Latin Rite who had left Koonammavu convent for Verapoly.¹⁰² According to *CKC II*, the vestition of Sr. Anastasia was in 1883 and her profession in 1886.¹⁰³ If so, she was in Koonammavu only for four years after her profession. Thus the statement of Msgr. Mellano that she was in charge of the orphans for *molti anni* is wrong. Besides she was one of the four sisters, the others being Syrians who were in charge of the orphanage for 13 and 15 years.¹⁰⁴ These being the facts, we can see that Sr. Anastasia was the youngest of the group; hence, she may be assisting the other elder sisters. Thus the children could not have been so affected by the departure of the junior member of the team (who had been with them at most for 4 years) as to induce them to leave the orphanage.

- It is not easy to understand how the change of the confessor would have motivated the children to flee from the orphanage. We do not have any other documents to prove that the children were not allowed to approach Fr. Philip for confession. At that time, sisters were free to go to confession either to Fr. Philip or to Fr. Albertos the new chaplain. In such a context, it is not reasonable to believe that only the children were prohibited to approach Fr. Philip. Of course we can understand the natural sentiments and affection of the girls for Fr. Philip who had baptized many of them. Still we do not forget that Fr. Philip did not leave the place

¹⁰¹ *Vajrajubilee Smarakam*, 51.

¹⁰² *CKC II*, 144.

¹⁰³ *CKC II*, 123 & 129.

¹⁰⁴ *CKC II*, 98, 139. The name of the other sister is not given in

together with the sisters, even though the contact of the girls with their spiritual father would have been restricted.¹⁰⁵ If the orphans were strictly guarded and did not have had any contact with the outsiders, the question will arise in the mind of unbiased reader. If somebody would have instigated the girls to flee from the convent it would have been the Latin sisters.

In the *Vajrajubillee Smarakam* in the chapter on Orphanage (9th chapter) the following details are given:¹⁰⁶

There would have been about 85 inmates. The names of the four sisters who were in charge of the orphanage are given in detail. They took care of both the bodily and the spiritual affairs of the girls. Also they taught the children language, Arithmetics, needle work and cooking. The author of the book quotes a letter written by the Syrian sisters to Msgr. Medlycott on 26th September 1890 (that is 3 or 4 days after the escape of the children).¹⁰⁷ Sr. Anastasia used to stealthily send many letters to outside as well as things like rice, cloths and letters through the helpers of the orphanage to the outside people. It is heard that even on the day of departure from the convent that Sr.

¹⁰⁵ *Vajrajubillee Smarakam*, 50-51. For the complete quotation and text see below No. 5.3.4.2.2.3. 'Comments.'

¹⁰⁶ The author claims that she had got those information from the inmates of the orphanage which she had written down. She also gives the names of these first hand witnesses together with their testimonies. "This chapter can be concluded by noting down some witnesses which this writer him/herself inquired and found out directly." See, *Vajrajubillee Smarakam*, 61. We give here in summarized form (since the author has given a very detailed account) of the more pertinent texts.

¹⁰⁷ Thus the letter is contemporary to the events and has more historical validity than other sources.

Anastasia gave a letter in the hands of one of the helpers to be given to the people. In the letter sisters state that the rumour created about persecution of the inmates and because of that the girls escaped from the orphanage, created for the following motive: they wanted to grab the properties of the orphanage for Verapoly convent.¹⁰⁸ Now it is heard that the Latin sisters as well as the people had written many complaints to the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Aiuti. Even some of the girls themselves had told to the Syrian sisters that Sr. Anasthasia had tried to impress upon the mind of the girls the following points: if they continue to stay at Koonammavu the Syrian sisters would put them to do the works proper to slaves; if the girls come to Verapoly they would be accepted there; if they do not come to Verapoly, the curse and discontent of the Almighty Lord as well as of Mooppachan (Fr. Philip); and the distress of their mistress will fall upon them. The girls should go to confession only to Fr. Philip; Msgr. Marceline had sent a letter to Fr. Albertos that the possessions of the orphanage belonged to Archbishop Mellano.¹⁰⁹ If the

¹⁰⁸ലത്തീൻകാരത്തി സഹോദരി നടത്തിയിരുന്ന നാളുകളിൽ പലേ എഴുത്തുകൾ ഒളിവാലെ പുറത്തോട്ട് അയയ്ക്കുക മാത്രമല്ല അരി, തുണി മുതലായി പല സാമാനങ്ങളേയും എഴുത്തുകളേയും വേലക്കാരന്മാർ വഴിയായി ഈ ജനങ്ങൾ കൈവശപ്പെടുത്തി എന്നു കേൾക്കുന്നതല്ലാതെ ചിലതൊക്കെയും സൂക്ഷ്മമായി അറിയുകയും ചെയ്യുന്നു. ഇവർ ഇറങ്ങിയ ദിവസം ഒരേഴുത്തു വേലക്കാരി വരും കൊടുത്താണ് ഇറക്കിയതെന്നും കേൾക്കുന്നു. ഇവരെ തെരുക്കിയെന്നും തെരുക്കത്തക്കുറിച്ച് ഇറങ്ങിയെന്നും പറഞ്ഞുണ്ടാക്കുന്നത് ഈ അനാഥശാലയുടെ വസ്തുക്കൾ വരാപ്പുഴയ്ക്ക് പിടിക്കുന്നതിനു വേണ്ടിയാണ്: *Vajrajubilee Smarakam*, 53.

¹⁰⁹ശാലക്കാർ (അനാഥർ) ഇവിടെ നിന്നാൽ ഞങ്ങൾ അടിമവേല എടുപ്പിച്ചു തെരുക്കുമെന്നും, ആയതിനാൽ അവരും വരാപ്പുഴ ചെന്നാൽ കൈക്കൊള്ളാമെന്നും, അവരും വരാപ്പുഴ ചെല്ലുകയില്ലെങ്കിൽ തമ്പുരാന്റെയും മൂപ്പച്ചന്റെയും ശാപവും സന്തോഷക്കേടും, ഗുരുത്തിയമ്മയുടെ ദുഃഖവും, അവരുടെ മേൽ ഉണ്ടാകുമെന്നും മൂപ്പച്ചനോടു കുമ്പസാരിച്ചാൽ മതിയെന്നും ആ സഹോദരി പറഞ്ഞിരിക്കുന്ന പ്രകാരം ചില കൊച്ചുങ്ങൾ ഞങ്ങളോടുതന്നെ പറ

readers give any historical value to this contemporary document, it will provide them clarification on many of the things, which had happened then. The one who instigated the outsiders to come and forcefully take the girls outside was Sr. Anastasia. The same sister asked the orphans not to go to confession to anybody else but only to Fr. Philip. She also threatened under the eventual curse of God as well as Fr. Philip unless they come to Verapoly. Also the poor orphans were got frightened that those who remain in Koonammavu will force to do the works of slaves. These may be the reasons why the girls had fled the orphanage, although *CKC II*, 144 attributes it to the work of outsiders.¹¹⁰

- On the refusal of the Syrian sisters to take back the children *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* says: “After they went out from here, they are staying in house nearby Koonammavu. In between these, the fathers in Koonammavu church, written to us two times to receive the orphans here. We replied that we are willing to receive them if they apologise for the misdeed of them.¹¹¹ If this version is taken in its face value, it

ഞ്ഞു. ഇതിനെപ്പറ്റി മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചന്റും പല എഴുത്തുകൾ റോമായ്ക്കോ നീലഗിരിക്കോ എഴുതിയിട്ടുണ്ടെന്നും കേൾക്കുന്നതല്ലാതെ, അനാഥശാലയെന്ന് ഒരു പേരല്ലാതെ അതിന്റെ സ്വത്തുക്കളൊക്കെയും മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചന്റുള്ളതാകുന്നുവെന്നും മർസ്സലീനോസ് മെത്രാൻ ബ. കപ്പോനച്ചന് എഴുതിയിരിക്കുന്നു. *Vajrajubilee Smarakam*, 53-54.

¹¹⁰ We will comment later when we study the other three letters of Msgr. Mellano on the point raised in the letter concerning the rumours spread out about the so-called persecution of the orphans.

¹¹¹ അനാഥശാലക്കാര് ഇവിടെ നിന്നു പോയതിന്റെ ശേഷം കുനമ്മാവുവിൽ അടുക്കെ ഒരു വീട്ടിൽ താമസിച്ചു വരുന്നു. ഇതിന്നിടയിൽ കുനമ്മാവു പള്ളിയിലിരിക്കുന്ന പാദ്രിയച്ചന്, ശാലക്കാരെ ഇവിടെ കൈക്കൊള്ളുന്നതിന് രണ്ടു പ്രാവശ്യം എഴുതി കൊടുത്തയയ്ക്കുകയും അവരെ കൈക്കൊള്ളുന്നതിന് ഞങ്ങൾക്കു മനസ്സു കേടില്ല. അവർ ചെയ്ത കുറ്റത്തിന് പൊറുതി അപേ

refutes the argument of Msgr. Mellano. The sisters were most willing to take back the children who ran away, if they should ask pardon for their behaviour. However, it was the children who did not want to return to the orphanage, perhaps they were afraid of the curse, which will fall upon them, if they would have come back and stayed at Koonammavu.

- The statement of Msgr. Mellano that the instigators would have been the sisters may be correct. Unfortunately it was the Latin sisters especially Sr. Anastasia who was the main culprit.
- The repeated argument of the issue of the dowry and the properties of the Latin sisters which we had already discussed and found erroneous, does not deserve further comment.
- On the accusation of the Archbishop that the documents and the belongings of the Latin sisters were in the hands of the Syrian sisters, see the statement of Msgr. Aiuti: “*Dopo tutto questo fu effettuata (namely taking dowry and their belongings) con tutta pace e tranquillita la presa di Possesso del convento da parte di Mons. Medlycott e l ‘uscita della Suore latine da esso, senza che si verificasse il più piccolo disordine da parte del popolo*”.¹¹² The fact being so, how can Msgr. Mellano make such an accusation?
- The statement of Msgr. Mellano *ma già il Monastero era costruito*, seems to purposefully create confusion in the minds of the readers. Instead of clearly saying that it

ക്ഷിപ്രാൽ കൈക്കൊണ്ടു കൊള്ളാമെന്നും മറുപടി എഴുതി. *Vajrajubilee Smarakam*, page 52.

¹¹² See for details, above No.5.3.3.8.2. ‘Letter of Msgr. Aiuti to the Prefect dated 21st September, 1890.

was the *panambumadam* which was constructed then, he uses the unclear expression (“*ma già il Monastero era costruito*”), in order to create in the mind of the reader the impression that the new convent was already built. Since *panambumadam* had no essential facilities both Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara were worried how to get money to build a new convent.

5.3.4.2.2. Second Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Apostolic Delegate Andrea Aiuti dated 9th October 1890

5.3.4.2.2.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>A Sua Ecc. Rev.ma Mons. Andrea Aiuti Arci. e Delegato Apostolico Magney 9 Ottobre 1890 Eccellenza Reverendissima Ho ricevuto la lettera di vostra Eccellenza del 2 corrente, N. 2161 e devodire che mi è stato motive di grande dolore il vedere come Vostra Eccellenza abbia cosi’ facilmente creduto a quanto le veniva riferito da altri, in opposione a ciò che le avevo scritto in modo cosi’ rigoroso (cioè portando le prove di cio che dicevo). Ho fatto perciò fare un esame al mio Coadiutore, che spedisco unita a questa, da uni Vostra Eccellenza può conoscere meglio la verità. Vedo che pesa da qualche anno, sopra la testa dei carmelitani, il tremendo peso della alunne (parola illeggibile, ho pensato che si tratti delle orfane, ed il peso è tremendo per lo scandalo</p> | <p>To His Very Rev. Excellency Msgr. Andrea Aiuti Archbishop and Apostolic Delegate Manjummel 9th October 1890 Rev. Excellency, I received the letter of your Excellency dated 2nd of this month (No. 2161) and I must say that I was in great pain to see how your Excellency has so easily believed when it came to be reported by others, in opposite to what I had written in a strict way (i.e. bringing the evidence of what I was saying). I did so in the light of the investigation made by my coadjutor. I send it along with this, so that your Excellency can know the real facts. I could see that from some years afterwards, the tremendous weight of the students will be hanging on the head of the Carmelites. (According to me the reference is to the bad</p> |

dato dalla loro fuga), e ciò che è peggio, non crede nulla di ciò che essi dicono; ed invece alcune persone, senza essere coinvolte in ciò che succede, e Dio non voglia sia causato da loro, appena aprono bocca, buttano la croce addosso a me e ai miei preti, e tutto si crede di quello che dicono su questa situazione ben triste, per non dire insopportabile e che mette me nelle circostanze più dure (cioè nelle situazioni più penose). Non avevo quindi altro mezzo che pregare Vostra Eccellenza, a fare, nel caso in questione (cioè in tutto ciò che è successo) appena sia arrivato da queste parti, un esame formale facendo giurare di dire tutta la verità soprattutto a quelli che accusano falsamente i miei due preti assistenti della chiesa di Cunemao, come se ciò fosse accaduto per loro istigazione, mentre non ebbero mai occasione di converare con le orfane, e dopo aver conosciuta la verità punier i delinquent secondo giustizia. Guai se quei due preti assistenti venissero puniti per un tale motivo; Dio solo sa l'impressione che causerebbe nella gente e le conseguenze che ne deriverebbero, essendo essi del tutto innocenti. In quanto alle giovani orfane, abbiamo fatto il possibile, ripeto, perchè ritornassero all'

treatment of the orphans and the tremendous scandal made by their flight), and what is worse is that, one does not believe anything that they say; and some people, without being involved in what is happened, and they do not want to be accused by God, when they just open the mouth, throw the cross upon me and my priests, and everything you believe what they say about this very sad situation; not to say unbearable and that puts me in the toughest circumstances (i.e. the most painful situations). I have no other way than to request your Excellency, to come and investigate the case in question (i.e. all that is happened); Please make a formal examination under swearing an oath to tell the whole truth, especially those who falsely accuse my two assistant priests of the Church of Koonammavu, as if things had happened at their instigation, while they never had chance to hold conversation with the orphans, after knowing the truth you have to punish the culprits according to justice. Woe if these two assistant priests are punished on account of this motive! God only knows the impression that would cause in the people, and the consequences that would arise, since they are totally innocents.

orfanotrofio, ma è stato impossibile poter ottenechè questa cosa; esse infatti sono state troppo maltrattate dalle monache, e specialmente il volerle obbligare a fare la loro confessione da Padre Alberto, e proibire loro di andare, come al solito da Padre Filippo o da qualche altro padre nel confessionale della Chiesa di Cunemao, non solo è contrario alle leggi ecclesiastiche, ma è una tirannia tale che non conosco esempio (altrettanto grave). Pertanto l' avversione che hanno verso quelle monache di Cunemao è così grande che non può essere superata, non resta altra via che di abbandonarle, ma questo non si può in coscienza, perchè sarebbe la stessa cosa che sarebbe quasi certa; si deve quindi assolutamente pensare di provvedere al maggior bene delle loro anime, cosa che già è stata fatta nell' accogliere le nell' orfanotrofio, e sono certo che Lei prendere i provvedimenti necessary a questo scopo.

Si sa pure che Monsignor Medlycott ordinò alla Superiora di accoglierle di nuovo, ma la superiora aveva intenzione di accogliere solo le piccole e non le grandi, e ciò si sa, non allo stesso modo di coloro che informano l' Eccellenza Vostra, ma con certezza, per lettera dal suo confessore.

Since we have done the possible for the young orphans, I repeat, they had to be returned to the orphanage. But this is made impossible since they indeed have been ill-treated by the nuns, and especially they will be forced to go to confession to Fr. Alberto, and not to Fr. Philip or to some other fathers in the confessional in the Church of Koonammavu. It is not only contrary to ecclesiastical law, but it is a tyranny of which I do not know any other instance (equally serious). Therefore the aversion they have towards those nuns of Koonammavu is so much that it cannot be overcome; there is no other way than to abandon them, but this cannot be done in conscience, because the truth is very clear and almost certain. You must therefore absolutely think of providing the greater good for their soul, the thing that is already being made in accepting them in the orphanage and I am sure that you will take the necessary measures for this purpose.

You know also that Msgr. Medlycott ordered to the superior to accept them again, but the superior intended to accept only the little and not the grown up ones. As you know, it is not to the same things of some who inform your Excellency. It is with certainty

| | |
|--|---|
| La prego infine di gradire I miei rispetti mentre con la più alta stima e venerazione ho l'onore di dichiararmi Dell' Eccellenza Vostra Reverendissima Umilissimo servo Fra Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Arcivescovo di Verapoly | that I inform you by the letter of the confessor. I request you at the end, to accept by respect while with highest esteem and veneration, I have the honour of declaring Of Your most Reverend Excellency's humble servant + Leonardo Mellano O.C.D Archbishop of Verapoly |
|--|---|

5.3.4.2.2.2. Main Points

- Msgr. Mellano expresses his discontent since he thinks that the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Aiuti easily believed what others said than his words.
- According to Msgr. Mellano, what he said is right, since he did it in the light of the investigation made by his coadjutor Msgr. Berardi.
- Msgr. Mellano accuses the Syrian Carmelites that in future the weight of their crime done to the orphans will hang on the head of them. It is they who were not involved in the events, put the blame on Msgr. Mellano for whatever had happened. It is sad that Msgr. Aiuti is inclined to believe such people.
- Msgr. Mellano requests the Apostolic Delegate to come and investigate the case in question by putting the persons under oath to tell the real facts. He should be prepared to punish the real culprits who falsely put blame on the two assistant priests of the Koonammavu church. According to Msgr. Mellano these two assistant priests never had any chance to hold conversation with the orphans.
- According to the Archbishop of Verapoly the orphans have to be returned to Koonammavu convent. But it has

become practically impossible since they were ill treated by the sisters and had denied the freedom for them to go to confession to Fr. Philip or any other priests except Fr. Albertos. This is indeed the violation of the canonical law of the Church. Msgr. Mellano says that he had not encountered such a case of tyranny in his life.

- Since the orphans had such an aversion towards the sisters, so that their returning to the convent has become impractical. Could these girls be abandoned? This cannot be done in good conscience since the truth is on their side. Therefore the aversion they have towards those nuns of Koonammavu is so much that it cannot be overcome; there is no other way than to abandon them, but this cannot be done in conscience, because the truth is very clear and almost certain.
- As conclusion, Msgr. Mellano asks Msgr. Aiuti to think absolutely only about providing the greater good of the souls of these poor orphan girls.
- In his letter, the Archbishop of Verapoly makes a subtle point against the position of the Syrian sisters. Although Msgr. Medlycott had ordered the mother superior to accept the runaway orphans, she is willing to accept only the little ones and not the grownups.
- Lastly, Msgr. Mellano asserts that whatever he had said is done in the light of the letter of the confessor.

5.3.4.2.2.3. Comments

- Msgr. Mellano repeatedly and in a subtle way tries to impose on Msgr. Aiuti, his own arguments most of which we have proved were not objective but

fabricated.¹¹³ He finds fault with the position of the Apostolic Delegate, who according to him, is siding with the other party. He even indirectly intimidates Msgr. Aiuti of the possible divine displeasure if he continues to side with the opponents against the so called genuine truths.

- One factor which is mentioned in the *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* should not be forgotten when one speaks about the flight of the orphan girls from the convent. The *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* thus states about the religion and denomination of the inmates:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>“അനാഥമന്ദിരത്തിൽ ജാതിമത ഭേദം കൂടാതെ ഏതു പ്രായത്തിലുള്ളവരെയും സ്വീകരിച്ചിരുന്നതിനാൽ ഒൻപതു കൊല്ലത്തിനിടയിൽ 113 അനാഥരെ ഈ മന്ദിരത്തിൽ സംരക്ഷിച്ചു പോന്നിരുന്നതായി കണക്കുകളിൽ കാണുന്നു. ഇവരുടെ ജാതിയിലുള്ള ഒരു പട്ടിക രസാവഹമായിരിക്കുമെന്നു കരുതുന്നു. ബ്രാഹ്മണർ 2, പുത്തൻകുറ്റുകാർ 2, നമ്പൂതിരിമാർ 2, ഈഴവർ 46, വാലന്മാർ 10, പറയർ 3, പുലയർ 20, അരയൻ 1, ശുഭ്രർ 6, കണക്കൻ 7, കറുപ്പൻ 2, കൊല്ലൻ 1, പാണ്ടിപ്പിള്ള 1, കത്തോലിക്കർ 10, ഇങ്ങനെ നാനാജാതി മതസ്ഥരുടെ ഒരു സങ്കേതമായിരുന്നു പ്രസ്തുത മന്ദിരം. ഇക്കാലത്തിനിടയിൽ അനാഥമന്ദിരത്തിൽ നിന്ന് 8</p> | <p>The accounts illustrate that there were 113 orphans who were protected in the orphanage in a period of nine years as they were received there irrespective of age, religion and caste. A table according to the caste seems to be interesting. Brahmins 2, Puthenkootukar 2, Namboodiris 2, Ezhavas 46, Valas 10, Parayas 3, Pulayas 20, Arayas 1, Shudras 6, Kanakkan 1, Karuppas 2, Kollan 1, Pandippilla 1, Catholics 10. Likewise, it was an abode for many from different caste and creed.¹¹⁴ According to the</p> |

¹¹³ See for example the first letter of Msgr. Mellano dated 27th September 1890.

¹¹⁴ Dictionary thus puts the meaning for these different classes of people according to caste and creed: *Shudra* – the low caste, *Kanakkan* – Expert carpenter (or accountant), *Karuppan* – A black coloured person; *Kollan* – Black smith; *Pandippilla* – Thamilians; Catholics. This is indeed

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>പേരെ വൈവാഹിക ജീവിതത്തിൽ പ്രവേശിപ്പിച്ച് വിട്ടതായും, 20 പേർ ജ്ഞാനസ്നാനം സ്വീകരിച്ച് മരിച്ചതായും 52 പേർ ജ്ഞാനസ്നാനം സ്വീകരിച്ച് മന്ദിരത്തിൽ ജീവിച്ചിരുന്നതായും രജിസ്റ്ററിൽ കാണുന്നുണ്ട്. ആകയാൽ 1890 ൽ 85 ൽ കുറയാതെ അനാഥർ അവിടെ ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നിരിക്കണം (വജ്രജൂബിലി സ്മാരകം, 50-51).</p> | <p>register, during these period, from the orphanage eight were got married, twenty were died after receiving baptism, fifty two were lived there after receiving baptism. Therefore in 1890, there should be around eighty five orphans should have been living in the orphanage.</p> |
|---|--|

This account gives an accurate version of the inmates of the orphanage. According to Msgr. Mellano only the Latin girls had fled the convent on the issue of confession. Now this question may naturally come to our mind. What had happened to the majority of other girls? It is not very reasonable to imagine that those who had converted to Christianity were tempted to flee on the issue of the Rite.

- We did not get till now any clear documents which refer to the involvement of the two assistant parish priests of the Koonammavu Church in the revolt of the orphan girls. In the *Brief History of Varapuzha Convent* page 16, three names of the assistant parish priests are mentioned, namely Rev. Fr. Manuel de Costa; Fr. Joseph de Paulo; Fr. Dominic de Ephes. Even if the two assistant parish priests had not held direct conversations with the girls, it is very natural to surmise that they would have been actively involved in the affair through the letters and informations given by Sr. Anasthasia.¹¹⁵

a modern vision of the ideology of Christ who had entrusted his disciples to preach to every human being his gospel of love.

¹¹⁵ See above our comments on the first letter of Msgr. Mellano in No. 5.3.4.2.3.

- As we have already said that it is not easy to hold that the poor and ignorant orphan girls were very particular to make their confession only to Fr. Philip. It is possible that the Latin sisters especially Sr. Anasthasia would have tried to create such an attitude in them.
- In No. 5.3.4.2.1.3. we have held that there was no contemporary document to prove that the girls were ill treated by the Syrian sisters.
- The reason why the girls who had fled away did not want to return and stay at Koonammavu, may be as stated above that Sr. Anasthasia and the other Latin sisters would have frightened them that God's curse will fall upon them.
- We do not get any document in which the adamant attitude of the mother superior in refusing to re-admit the grown up girls irrespective of the order of Msgr. Medlycott. The *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* refers to a letter written by the Syrian sisters of Koonammavu convent to Msgr. Medlycott. This letter referred in the *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* makes clear that the sisters were most willing to take the girls back provided they confess their guilt and ask pardon for it as seen earlier. Nobody can find fault with such a condition.

5.3.4.3. Reply of Msgr. Aiuti to Msgr. Mellano Regarding the Orphans dated on 17th October 1890

Msgr. Aiuti wrote this letter from Ambazhakkattu monastery on 17th October 1890. In this, he allows Msgr. Mellano to receive the orphans who had fled away from the orphanage.

5.3.4.3.1. Original document

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>A Sua Ecce. Rev.ma Mons. L. Mellano Arcivescovo di Verapoly Dal Convento di Ampolacatti 17th Ottobre 1890 Eccellenza Reverendissima, Ho ricevuto la sua preggiatissima lettera del 9 corrente. Tutto visto e considerato, concedo a Vostra Eccellenza Reverendissima la facoltà di ricoverare, se verrà e fin quando la S. Sede non disponga diversamente, in uno dei suoi monasteri di donne, le 41 infelici ragazze fuggitive dal Monastero di Cunemao. Faccio per altro presente a Vostra Eccellenza che la concessione di questa facoltà da parte mia, non implica alcuna modificazione delle disposizioni adottate dalla S. Sede circa la giurisdizione sul convento, delle Religiose Terziarie che si trova a Cunemao. In quelle disposizioni si è deciso che la giurisdizione di quel monastero, sulle scuole annesse sull'Orfanotrofio, appartiene al Vicario Apostolico di Trichur. Al monastero, alle scuole annesse ed all'Orfanotrofio, vanno perciò uniti i beni che ciascuno di questi istituti possiede, e questi beni appartengono anch'essi alla giurisdizione del Vicario</p> | <p>To His Excellency Msgr. L. Mellano, Archbishop of Verapoly From the monastery of Ambazhakkattu 17th October 1890 Very Rev. Excellency, I received your esteemed letter of 9th of this month. I have seen and considered everything and give to your Excellency the faculty, to accept, if the Holy See agrees and until it decides in a different way, in one of your convents the 41 unhappy girls who left the convent of Koonammavu. I also inform your Excellency that the granting of this permission does not imply any change in the decision taken by the Holy See about the jurisdiction on the convent of the Tertiary in Koonammavu. In that order it was decided that the jurisdiction of that convent, on the school attached to it and the orphanage belongs to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. To the convent, to the school annexed and to the orphanage go the properties that each of these institutes possesses and these properties belong to the jurisdiction of the Apostolic Vicar of Trichur. The Sacred Congregation has already said as I have</p> |

Apostolico di Trichur. La S. Congregazione ha già detto, come ho comunicato altra volta a vostra Eminenza, che non torna sulle sue decisioni.

Sono sicuro che Vostra Eccellenza farà da parte sua tutto il possibile, come l'ha fatto finora, sempre con esito positivo, affinché si stabilisca sempre meglio la pace e la concordia degli animi nel popolo e si consolidi l'armonia tra le due giurisdizioni e per questo si provveda alla salute delle anime e si promuova la maggior gloria di Dio sempre più efficacemente.

Intanto ho il piacere di rinnovare a Vostra Eccellenza l'espressione sincera del mio profondo rispetto e dell'alta considerazione con cui ho l'onore di dichiararmi.

Di Vostra Eccellenza
Reverendissima

Sottoscritto
+Andrea Arcivescovo di Acrida
Delegato Apostolico nelle India Orientali

P.S.

Prego vostra Exellenza Reverendissima di dare al clero ed al popolo gli ordini opportuni affinché le cose concernenti il convento di Cunemao si mettano sulla via più pacifica del modo. Un ordine di Vostra Eccellenza avrà più effetto e sarà mille volte più efficace di 100 Sipai che il Governo potrebbe inviare contro quei malvagi, che disturbano di

communicated to you before, it would not change its decisions.

I am sure that your Excellency will do from your part all the possible as you have done it until now, always with positive result, you always established the peace and goodwill in the souls of the people and to consolidate the harmony among the two jurisdictions, and for this you look to the good of the souls and to do the greater glory of God always more efficaciously.

Above all, I am happy to renew to your Excellency, the sincere expression of my deep respect and the great consideration with which I have the honour to declare myself.

of your Rev. Excellency
+ Andrea Aiuti, Archbishop of Acrida

Apostolic Delegate in the East Indies

P.S.

I request your Rev. Excellency to give to the clergy and to the people the necessary orders until the things regarding the Convent of Koonammavu be settled in the most peaceful way. An order of your Excellency will have more effect and will be 1000 times valid of 100 police personnels, which the Government may send to stop those wicked men who disturb the nuns during the night and steal their fruit

| | |
|---|--|
| notte le monache e rubano loro i frutti dei campi. Raccomando la cosa caldamente a Vostra Eccellenza Reverendissima (Sottoscritto) | from the field. I warmly recommend the matter to your Rev. Excellency (Undersigned) |
|---|--|

5.3.4.3.2. Main Points

- Msgr. Aiuti gives permission to Msgr. Mellano to accept the orphans in one of his convents, till the Holy See decides in a different way.
- However, the Apostolic Delegate added that the giving of this permission does not imply any change in the decision taken by the Holy See about the jurisdiction of the Koonammavu convent, the school and orphanage attached to it and the properties that each of these institutes possess. All of these belong to the jurisdiction of the Apostolic Vicar of Trichur.
- Msgr. Aiuti once again highlights that the Sacred Congregation would not change its decision.
- Before concluding the letter Msgr. Aiuti praises Msgr. Mellano saying that he was doing his best to establish the peace and harmony among the people of two Rites and to consolidate harmony among the two jurisdictions for the good of the souls.
- As *post scriptum*, the Apostolic Delegate appreciates the power of the Prelate saying that his order has more effect than that of police personnels to stop the wicked people who disturb the sisters at night and steal their properties.

5.3.4.3.3. Comments

- Msgr. Aiuti uses his diplomatic style to appease the ill tempered mind of Msgr. Mellano. Although the Archbishop of Verapoly had not asked for permission to accept the orphan girls, the Apostolic Delegate gives him permission to do so in one of the Latin convents.
- Still Msgr. Aiuti stands firm in defending the decision of the Holy See about the jurisdiction of the convent, the School, the Orphanage and the properties, which was given to Msgr. Medlycott of Trichur.
- This letter shows how the Apostolic Delegate encountered the tense situation in a diplomatic way, showering praises and at the same time not withdrawing the decisions already taken by the Holy See.

5.3.4.4. Third Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Apostolic Delegate dated 18th October 1890 expressing the desire to accept the Orphans

The next day itself, Msgr. Mellano gave reply to the Apostolic Delegate.

5.3.4.4.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>Magnamey 18 ottobre 1890 Eccellenza Reverendissima Mi sono giunte in questo momento le sue due pregiatissime lettere del 12 corrente, e sono molto contento che Vostra Eccellenza abbia deciso di giungere qui verso le 10 del mattino del 23, giovedì' venture, e secondo il suo desiderio, la barca arrivera le sera del 22 corrente. Riguardo poi alle 41 ragazze, di cui mi scrive Vostra</p> | <p>Manjummel 18th October, 1890 Rev. Excellency, Two of your esteemed letters of 12th of this month reached me in this moment and I am very glad that Your Excellency has decided to come here at 10 o'clock in the morning of the coming 23rd Thursday. According to your wish the boat will arrive there the evening of 22nd. With regard to</p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>Excellenza, io non ho difficoltà di accoglierle nel Monastero di Verapoly, che si era cominciato a costruire anche per questo fine, tenendo presente l'aria malsana di cunemao, nè io averi altri mezzi per poterle mantenere, al di fuori delle rendite del nominato Orfanotrofio, il cui capitale appartiene a Verapoly, e non ad altri, secondi quanto ho dimostrato finì alla evidenza al cardinale Prefetto, nè posso capire con quale ragione possa Verapoly esserne private, ma di ciò parlerò a voce con Vostra Eccellenza e le darò tutte le spiegazioni necessarie.</p> <p>Pregandola infine di gradire i miei rispetti, con tutta venerazione mi dichiaro</p> <p>Di Vostra Eccellenza Reverendissima Umilissimo Servo + Fra Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Arcivescovo di verapoly</p> | <p>the 41 girls, of whom your Eminence has written to me, I have no difficulty to accept them in the convent of Verapoly, which was started to construct also for this purpose, taking in to consideration the present unhealthy atmosphere of Koonammavu. I do not have any means to maintain them outside of the said orphanage. Its capital belongs to Verapoly, and not to others. When I have shown means at the evidence to the Prefect Cardinal, I cannot understand with which reason Verapoly can be deprived (of money), but what I will speak in union with the voice of your Excellency and I will give you all the necessary explanations. Requesting you to accept my respects, with all veneration I remain,</p> <p>Your Humble Servant + Fr. Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Archbishop of Verapoly</p> |
|---|---|

5.3.4.4.2. Main Points

- Msgr. Mellano says that he has no difficulty to accept the orphans in the convent of Verapoly, which was started to construct also for this purpose, taking into consideration the present unhealthy atmosphere of Koonammavu.
- While agreeing to admit the girls at Verapoly the Archbishop in a subtle way speaks whether the money of the Archdiocese should be spent for the girls. We do

not know what he implied by using the words: “*il cui capitale appartiene a Verapoly, e non ad altri.*” (Its capital belongs to Verapoly, and not to others).

5.3.4.4.3. Comments

- In this letter, Msgr. Mellano changes his previous threatening tone and appears as an obedient servant of the Holy See.
- Still he subtly brings into attention about the question of the money which has to be spent to maintain the orphans belongs to the Archdiocese and asks a question whether the Archdiocese should be deprived of its resources for the sake of the girls. The implied idea is that he was doing a charitable deed for which he was not under direct obligation, there by hinting that the Syrian Carmelites sisters of Koonammavu were responsible for the present tragic situation.
- How do we understand the expression: “*il cui capitale appartiene a Verapoly, e non ad altri*”? Does it refer to that the capital used for the construction and maintenance of the orphanage belongs to the Archdiocese? If so, Msgr. Mellano seems to claim that the orphanage with all its assets belongs to the Archdiocese of Verapoly. Then according to him it is wrong if the Archdiocese is deprived of its rights for the ownership, which includes all the assets and income.

5.3.4.5. Fourth Letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Apostolic Delegate dated 24th of October 1890

5.3.4.5.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| Magnamey 24 ottobre 1890 Eccellenza Reverendissima Come nella lettera di vostra | Manjummel October 24, 1890 Most Rev. Excellency, As in your Excellency's letter |

Excellenza del 12 corrente N. 2175, parlando del Catecumenato di Cunemao dice, che allo stesso vanno uniti, come al monastero, i. beni che ciascuno di quegli istituti possiede, e che questi beni appartengono anch'essi alla giurisdizione del Vicario Apostolico di Trichur. Tale frase, se da parte mia fosse passata sotto silenzio, potrebbe essere causa di spicacevoli conseguenze. Per ovviare ad esse, mi sento obbligato a dichiarare che tale Orfanotrofio non fu fondato da alcuna persona, e che nessuno ha dato per esso una dote di qualsiasi genere, ne' in beni, nè in denaro. L' Orfanotrofio lo feci costruire io di mia disposizione. Essendo così, è chiaro che, passando ad altra giurisdizione l'edificio, non deve passare con esso la borsa che io tengo con me, perchè non mi è stata data per tale scopo. E vero che una signora italiana alle preghiere e alle insistenze del Rev. Padre Gerardo di S. Giuseppe, nostro religioso, amato e molto stimato da quella signora, entrò nell'idea di far costruire nella Missione dei Carmelitani Scalzi di Verapoly un grande ospedale, per tutte le caste, dando possibilita' di convertite I malati pagani. Dopo aver consegnato al Padre sopra ricordato il denaro per quello scopo, egli ne

of 12th of this month No. 2175, speaking of the catechumenate of Koonammavu says that to the same should be united, as to the convent, the property that each of these institutions possess and that these properties belong to the jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. If I allow this phrase to pass without making any comment, It could have become the cause of unpleasant consequences. To ward off the consequence, I feel obliged to state that this Orphanage was founded by no one, and no one has given to it any kind of donation, neither in goods, nor in money. I constructed the orphanage at my provision. Being so, it is clear that, passing the building to another jurisdiction, should not pass with it the donation that I keep with me, because it was not given to me for that purpose. It is true that an Italian lady at the prayer and insistence of Fr. Gerard of St. Joseph, one of the members of our OCD religious community, who was loved and highly respected by that Lady, wished to build in the Discalced Carmelite Mission of Verapoly a big hospital, for all castes, giving possibility to convert the sick pagans. After giving it for that purpose to the above-mentioned Father, he

inform i Superiori di Roma, dipende intanto il denaro presso il suo Provinciale, ed avuto da Roma i necessari permessi, me lo inviò. Io poi, per ottenere la conversione di molte piccolo anime, quando ancora non esisteva i ospendale, fece costruire in Cunemao che mi costò molte Rupie.

La donatrice, udito il nome di Orfanotrofio, andò su tutte le furie (cioe si arrabiò moltissimo) e non in un' occasione soltanto, ma più volte, come risulta tale lettere di Padre Gerardo, il quale mi scrisse di cominciare al più presto i Ospedale, mentre scrive alla donatrice che la costruzione dell' Ospedale procede alacremente.

Tutta la storia, dettagliata, sincera e veridicale del progetto dell' Ospedale volute dalla donatrice, con le lettere del padre Gerardo segnate (A e B) e il risenetimento quando si parlava di Orfanotrofio, con estratti di lettere dello stesso Padre, segnati (C e D) le inviai a Sua Eminenza il Cardinal Prefetto con una lettera del 26 giugno di quest' anno.

Da questa semplice storia Vostra Eccellenza vede che non vi fu fondatore o fondatrice dell Orfanotrofio di Cunemao, che nessuno l' ha dotato, nè poteva dotarlo, poichè chi mi diede l'offerta, nemmeno voleva

informed his superiors in Rome, and with their permission entrusted the money to me. I then, to obtain the conversion of many little souls, even though the hospital did not yet exist, constructed the orphanage in Koonammavu, which cost me many Rupees.

The donor, hearing the term orphanage, fell into a rage and not only once, but many times, as seen in that letter of Fr. Gerard, in which he wrote to me to start as early as possible the hospital, while writing to the donor that the hospital construction is proceeding quickly.

The whole detailed story, honest and true of the project of the hospital willed by the donor, with the letters of Fr. Gerard signed (A and B) and the resentment when she spoke of the orphanage, with extracts of letter of the same Father, signed (C and D), they were sent to his Eminence the Cardinal Prefect with a letter dated of 26th June this year.

From this simple story, Your Excellency can see that there was no founder or foundress of the Koonammavu orphanage, for which nobody had donated nor could donate because the money was given to me and nobody wanted to hear the name (of the donor).

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>udirne il nome. Spero quindi che Vostra Eccellenza farà il caso dovuto delle dicerie di quelli che parlano ignorando le verità e se vi sono dei Vescovi, non sanno ciò che, essi stessi ingannati, dicono. L'unico che il padre merita di essere creduto sono io con il mio Coadiutore e dal di dentro le cose. Se qualcuno avesse fondato e dotato quell' Orfanotrofio, mi guardereri bene di sottarne un quattrino, sapendo che allora la dote dovrebbe seguire la volontà di chi l'ha dotata, ma la borsa del Vescovo che fabbrica non deve seguire l' edificio. Pregando infine Vostra Eccellenza di gradire i miei rispetti, Con tutta la stima e la venerazione mi dichiaro Di Vostra eccellenza Reverendissima Umilissimo Servo + Fra Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Arcivescovo di Verapoly</p> | <p>Therefore, I hope that your Excellency will do what is needed, concerning those rumours of those who speak ignoring the truth and even if they are bishops, they do not know what they speak, often deceived. I am the unique one who is worthy to be believed; I along with my coadjutor and those who know the things. If anyone would have founded and donated for the Orphanage, I would take guard off myself to <i>sottarne un quattrino</i> (an expression which we could not understand) knowing that then the dowry should follow the will of those who has given that, but the money of the bishop who constructs should not follow the building. Begging finally to Your Excellency to accept my respects, with all respect and veneration I make it clear The humble Servant of Your Excellency + Leonardo Mellano O.C.D. Archbishop of Verapoly</p> |
|---|---|

5.3.4.5.2. Main Points

- Msgr. Mellano questions the statement of the Apostolic Delegate that the orphanage and its property belong to the convent of Koonammavu and they come under the jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. He does

not want to be silent since it would result to have great consequences.

- Once more, he repeats the story of the Italian benefactress who wanted to construct a hospital and not an orphanage. He had constructed the orphanage with her money and also with his own resources. Nobody had given any donation. Therefore, if the orphanage passes to another jurisdiction, the donation must remain with him.
- Msgr. Mellano claims that he is the unique one whom the Apostolic Delegate should believe. Many are spreading rumours without knowing the real fact. Even the bishops are ignorant about the truth.
- Lastly the Archbishop of Verapoly seems to say that if anyone else would have established and donated for the orphanage, he would have guarded himself in not spending any money. One has to accomplish the will of the donor.

5.3.4.5.3. Comments

- Msgr. Mellano again brings back his own version of the construction of the orphanage, hoping that he could by such a tactic, change the mind of the Apostolic Delegate. Here he focuses his argument on the intention of the Italian donor, purposefully omitting that the benefactress had lately allowed the construction of the orphanage, together with the hospital.¹¹⁶

¹¹⁶ For example see above the letter of Msgr. Mellano to the Cardinal No. 5.3.3.2.

- It is wrong from the part of Msgr. Mellano to claim that the money passed to him by Fr. Gerard¹¹⁷ with the consent of his provincial, belonged to him as his own. At the most, he could claim that the donation was handed over to the Archdiocese in order to be spent for the construction of the orphanage and hospital.
- We cannot understand his argument that when the jurisdiction of the Koonammavu convent and the orphanage passed to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, the donation should remain with him. The case of jurisdiction does not appear at all here; the donor had not given the money to the Latin Archdiocese, focusing on the basis of Rite.
- We do not think that the claim of Msgr. Mellano that he is the unique one worthy of belief and trust needs any further comment. We have already shown that his letters contained a lot of inaccuracies, half truths and sometimes mere fabrications. In the issues in which two parties hold opposite and contrary positions and the Archbishop being the leader of one party, how could he claim for the uniqueness of truth and objectivity? Our study has showed that most of the positions of Msgr. Mellano were not true. He holds both bishops (Medlycott and Lavigne) as well as the Apostolic Delegate ignorant of the real facts and they were fallen in the net of the slanderers.

5.3.4.6. Letter of the Apostolic Delegate to the Prefect of the Propaganda Fide Cardinal Simeoni dated 30th October 1890

¹¹⁷ One should not forget that it was not to Msgr. Mellano that the Italian lady has sent the money; it was because of the effort of Missionary Gerard that the donor had sent the money.

Msgr. Andrea Aiuti informs the Cardinal Prefect of the Propaganda Fide his own conclusions and deductions with the appropriate documents concerning the flight of the children from the orphanage at Koonammavu in connection with the departure of the Latin sisters, as well as the demand of Msgr. Mellano for the money given to the orphanage by an Italian donor.

5.3.4.6.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>A Sua Emi. Reverendissima Mons. Card. Giovanni Simeoni Prefetto della S. Congregazione di Propaganda, Roma Dal Convento di Mannanam 30th Ottobre 1890 N. 2200 Oggetto Cose relative al Monastero delle Religiose native che si trova a Cunemao. Domanda di indicazioni su due punti. Eminenza Reverendissima Faccendo seguito al mio rispettoso rapporto del 21 Settembre scorso, segnato col N. 2139, ritengo necessario di mettere prima di tutto sotto gli occhi di vostra Eminenza Reverendissima la lettera con cui Mons. Vicario Apostolico di Trichur, in data del 29 Settembre mi annunciava in via ufficiale di aver preso possesso del convento delle religiose Terziarie native di rito Soriano, che si trova in Cunemao; mi assicurava che tutto ciò che riguarda le doti delle Religiose Latine sarà sistemato secondo</p> | <p>To His V. Rev. Eminence Msgr. Cardinal Giovanni Simeoni Prefect of the Sacred Congregation of the Propaganda Fide, Rome From the monastery of Mannanam 30th October 1890 No. 2200 Object: Things related to the convent of the native religious, which is situated at Koonammavu, can be summarized into two points. V. Rev. Eminence, Following to my respectful rapport of last 21st September, marked with No. 2139, first, I must put under the eyes of your V. Eminence the letter of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, on 29th September with which he announced that officially he had taken the possession of the convent of the Native Tertiary Religious of Syrian Rite which is found in Koonammavu. He assured me that everything related to the dowry of the</p> |

guistisia e secondo il decreto emanato in proposito da questa delegazione Apostolica e mi faceva sapere che tutto era stato fatto senza inconvenienti e che alla Sua partenza da Cunamao, ogni cosa si trovava in completa pace (Allegato A).

Qualche giorno più tardi però, mi giunsero due lettere: una di Mons. Mellano e l'altra di Mons. Medlycott che mi davano notizia del fatto, che dopo il cambio di giurisdizione del Monastero, la maggior parte delle ragazze dell'Orfanotrofio annesso al Monastero era uscita e si era andata a rifugiare prima nella chiesa parrocchiale di cunamao, da cui una parte si era poi trasferita presso una vedova di quel luogo, e un'altra parte era andata a stare presso parenti o amici (Allegati B, C). Monsignor Mellano assicurava che le ragioni per cui quelle ragazze si decisero ad abbandonare l'orfanotrofio dopo la partenza delle religiose latine si riducono tutte all'eccessiva durezza con cui vennero trattate dalle Religiose Soriane prima e durante il tempo dal cambiamento di giurisdizioni.

Monsignor Medlycott invece, fondato sulle informazioni della Superiora affermava che ciò avvenne perchè sia il padre Filippo, Vicario Generale di Monsignor

Latin sisters will be arranged in accordance with justice and proposed by this Apostolic Delegation and made me to know that everything was being done without any inconvenience and at their departure from Koonammavu everything was in complete peace (Attached Document A).

However, few days later, arrived to me two letters: one that of Msgr. Mellano and the other of Msgr. Medlycott which gave me information of the fact, that after the change of jurisdiction of the convent, most of the girls from the orphanage adjacent to the convent were went out and had run away first to the parish Church of Koonammavu, from there a part was then transferred to a widow of that place, and another part had gone to stay with relatives or friends (Attached Document B, C). Msgr. Mellano assured that the reason why those girls decided to leave the orphanage after the departure of the Latin religious degrades all the excessive harshness with which the Syrian Religious treated them before and during the time of the change of the jurisdiction. Bishop Medlycott instead, basing on the information of the Superior stated that this was because of both Fr. Philip, the Vicar

Mellano, sia una delle Suore Latine avevano consigliato le ragazze dell'Orfanotrofio a non rimanere dopo la partenza delle Suore latine; mi diceva pure che i due preti di Cunemao, il Vicario e il suo Assistente, avevano aiutato le ragazze a fuggire. Per chiarire unpo' meglio la cosa, scrissi a Monsignor Mellano, faccendogli capire che avevo appreso, con sommo dispacere quanto mi diceva sulla fuga delle 41 ragazze dell'orfanotrofio e sulla loro permanenza in una casa vicina e che le ragioni portate dalle ragazze non giustificavano assolutamente il loro operato, e che qualche Monaca Latina aveva Loro spianata la strada, e che respingevo ogni domanda che tendesse a giustificare in qualsiasi modo l'allontanamento delle stesse dall'orfanotrofio e ad appoggiare il loro trasferimento altrove.

L'egregio Prelato rispose alle mie poche righe con la lettera del 9 corrente che presento, qui unita a vostra Eminenza (Allegato D) insieme a quella di Monsignor Marcellino Berardi che era acclusa come prova della verità di quanto lui stesso diceva (Allegato E). In ambedue queste lettere si confermava che la durezza usate dalle Religiose Soriane

General of Msgr. Mellano and a Latin sister who had advised the girls of the orphanage not to remain there after the departure of the Latin sisters. I was told also that the two priests of Koonammavu, the vicar and his assistant, had helped the girls to flee. To make the things little more clearer, I wrote to Msgr. Mellano, to clarify better the things and making him to understand with great displeasure what was said to me about the flight of the 41 girls from the orphanage and their stay in a House nearby and the reasons given by the girls do not justify their action, and that some Latin sisters had showed the way and asked every question that tends to justify in any way the keeping away of the same from the orphanage and to support their transfer elsewhere.

The dear Prelate replied to my few lines with the letter of 9th of this month, which I present here, to your Eminence (Attached Document D), along with that of Bishop Marcelline Berardi who was included as evidence of the truth of what he himself has said (Attached Document E). In both of these letters it is confirmed that the hardness with which the Syrian sisters dealt with Orphans were constituted the proper

verso le Orfane costituivano proprio le ragioni per cui esse si persuasero ad abbandonare l'orfanotrofio; si dichiarava falsa l'informazione datami, secondo la quale qualche monaca latina avrebbero incitato le ragazze a qual passo ed avrebbero loro spinata la strada. Inoltre si sottolineava che non si sarebbe riusciti in nessun modo a convincere le ragazze a rientrare nell'orfanotrofio annesso al Monastero di Cunemao.

Rifletendo sul grave pericolo in cui, a motivo di quanto hanno fatto, si trovano quelle povere orfane, molte delle quali hanno 12, 14, 16 ed anche 20 anni di età, fin quando rimanessero così sbondate (abondate) e libere, telegrafai da Trichur a Monsignor Medlycott, dicendo che, tutto considerato credevo necessario autorizzare subito l'Arcivescovo di Verapoly, a riceverle quanto prima in uno dei suoi monasteri, e lo invitavo a dire la sua opinione. Ne ebbi risposta nei seguenti termini: "dopo fatto il male, si cerca di giustificarlo. Così l'incentivo cresce e col prendere le ragazze si pretenderà alienare i fondi dell'orfanotrofio che ci sono in nome di Monsignor Mellano".

Dopo di questo, facendo leva sul principio che: la salvazza delle anime è la legge suprema,

reasons why they were persuaded to leave the orphanage; he made clear that the information that given to me was false according to which some Latin sisters would have incited the girls to take that step and would have encouraged them in that way. He also underlined that he would not be able to convince the girls to re-enter the orphanage attached to the convent at Koonammavu.

Reflecting on the grave danger here, because of what they did, one finds those poor orphans, many of whom have 12, 14, 16 and 20 years old, till now remain so abandoned and free, I sent a telegram to Trichur to Msgr. Medlycott, saying that, all things considering everything I believe that it is necessary to authorize immediately the Archbishop of Verapoly, to receive them as soon as possible in one of his convents, and I invited him to express his opinion. He replied in following terms: "after doing the evil, one tries to justify himself. Thus the responsibility (incentive) grows and with taking the girls one will pretend himself as alienating the funds of the orphanage which is in the name of Msgr. Mellano".

After this, relying on the principle that: the salvation of souls is the Supreme Law, I

passai ad attuare il disegno proposto in modo però che la mia disposizione non dovesse in nessun modo sembrare di voler prevenire le disposizioni che Vostra Eminenza desiderasse in futuro mandarmi su questo fatto particolare. Dopo questo scrissi a Monsignor Mellano la lettera di cui unisco copia in appendice (Allegato F.) concedendo a quel Prelato, a motivo delle circostanze, la facoltà di accogliere, se in uno dei suoi monasteri di donne le 41 ragazze fuggitive dall'orfanotrofio. Ad ogni modo gli ho fatto presente che, questa facoltà da parte mia non implica alcuna modificazione delle disposizioni adottate dalla S. Sede circa la giurisdizione sul Monastero delle Religiose Terziarie che si trova in Cunemao, sottolineando anche che al Monastero, alle scuole annesse ed all'orfanotrofio, saranno uniti i beni che ciascuno di questi Istituti possiede e che questi beni appartengono anch'essi alla giurisdizione del Vicario Apostolico di Trichur e la risposta di Monsignor Arcivescovo è stata nei precisi termini che seguono, come Vostra Eminenza potrà rilevare dalla lettera di quel Prelato, che unisco in appendice nel suo originale (Allegato G):

passed to actualize the proposed plan in a way that my instruction should not seem in no way prevent the instruction which Your Eminence in future would have desired to send me in this particular fact. After this, I wrote a letter to Msgr. Mellano, the letter which is given in the appendix (Attached Document F) allowing, that Prelate, because of the circumstances, the right to receive in one of the convents, the 41 girls who fled from the orphanage. In any case, I made it clear that this right from my part does not imply any modification of the provisions adopted by the Holy See, concerning the jurisdiction over the convent of the Tertiary sisters situated in Koonammavu. I also emphasized that the school and orphanage attached to the convent along with all the properties united to these institutes, belong to the jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. The response of the Archbishop was in precise terms and Your Eminence can understand it from his letter itself which is given in the appendix in its original form (Attached Document G): "With regard to the 41 girls, of whom your Eminence has written to me, I have no difficulty to accept

“Riguardo poi alla ragazze di cui mi scrive Vostra Eccellenza non ho difficoltà di accoglierle nel Monastero di Verapoly, che si era cominciato a costruire anche per questo fine, a motivo della malaria di Cunemao, nè avrei altri mezzi per poterle mantenere se non la rendita dell’Orfanotrofio, il cui capitale appartiene a Verapoly, e non ad altri, secondo quanto ho dimostrato fino all’evidenza al Cardinale prefetto, nè posso capire con quale motivo Verapoly ne possa essere privata, ma di ciò parlerò a voce con Vostra Eccellenza e le darò tutte le spiegazioni necessarie.”

Pochi giorni dopo sono andato a Verapoly, ma mi accorsi che Mons. Mellano non aveva ancora fatto nulla per mettere al sicuro le orfane fuggitive e avendogli chiesto il motivo mi dichiarò che non si era deciso ad accoglierle in uno dei suoi monasteri, perchè non aveva altri mezzi per mantenerle se non quelli di cui finora si era servito, che sono gli interessi di una certa somma di denaro che è nelle sue mani e che non sapeva se poteva continuare a spendere per mantenere quelle orfane.

Fino a questo momento non nega di avere una somma destinata al mantenimento dell’orfanotrofio, però dopo

them in the convent of Verapoly, which was started to construct also for this purpose, taking into consideration the present unhealthy atmosphere of Koonammavu. I do not have any means to maintain them but the income of the orphanage, which pertain to Verapoly and not to others. According to what I had demonstrated the proof to Cardinal Prefect. I cannot understand with which reason Verapoly can be deprived (of money), but what I speak about it in union (voice) with your Excellency and I will give you all the necessary explanations.”

A few days later, I went to Verapoly, but I noticed that Msgr. Mellano had not yet done anything to protect the girls who ran away. When I asked the motive, he made it clear that he had not decided to accept them in one of his convents, because he had no other means to maintain them except those that had served so far, that is the interests of a certain sum of money, which was in his hands. Moreover, he did not know if he could continue to spend it for keeping those orphans.

Until now, he does not deny of having a sum for the maintenance of the orphanage. But after reflecting more on the things and after having

aver maggiormente riflettuto sulla cosa e dopo aver consultati i suoi missionari in modo più preciso, è venuto un giorno a parlarmi su quell'argomento e mi dichiarò che non credeva assolutamente che la somma, con i cui interessi aveva finora mantenuto l'orfanotrofio del monastero di Cunemao, debba passare al Vicario Apostolico di Trichur insieme allo stesso Orfanotrofio e il motivo è che tale somma gli era stata data da una signora italiana, perchè venisse costruito con essa un ospedale per tutte le caste, ma poichè non era stato possibile fare ciò, tale somma venne da lui destinata a servire come fondo per il mantenimento di un orfanotrofio e precisamente di quello di cui si parla. Aggiungeva inoltre che essendo la somma sempre rimasta presso di lui e non essendo stata mai dichiarata legalmente come fondo o dote dello stesso Orfanotrofio, non essendo legata ad esso in modo inscindibile come conseguenza passando l'edificio dell'orfanotrofio al Vicario Apostolico di Trichur, non deve insieme passare anche quella somma. Lo pregai di scrivermi una lettera, in cui venissero esposte in modo piuttosto ampio tali ragioni e gli dissi che avrei posto la cosa alla suprema

consulted with his missionaries more precisely, one day he came to talk to me on that issue. And he made it clear that he did not believe absolutely that the sum, of which interest he had till now maintained the orphanage of the convent at Koonammavu, must pass to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur along with that orphanage. The reason is that, an Italian woman gave that amount to him, in order to construct with that a hospital for all the castes. However, it was not possible to do that, and that amount which came to him was destined to serve as source for the maintenance of an orphanage and precisely of which we speak here now.

He also added that the amount always being remained with him and never had been cleared legally as source or asset of the same Orphanage; it is not being tied to the orphanage as inseparable, consequently, passing the building of the orphanage to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, should not pass together also that amount. I requested to him to write a letter expressing well the reasons and I would post it for your Eminence' supreme consideration.

Having then asked me what should be done of those poor girls, whether receive them in

considerazione di Vostra Eminenza.

Avendomi quindi chiesto che cosa dunque dovesse fare di quelle povere ragazze, e se ricevendoli in uno dei suoi monasteri potrebbe o no mantenerle con di interessi di quella somma, lo autorizzai nuovamente a riceverle, fin quando la S. Sede non disporrà in modo diverso, in uno dei suoi monasteri, e gli dichiarai che fino a quando non sarebbe venuta una risposta da Vostra Eminenza, egli potrà servirsi degli interessi di quella somma per mantenerle; mi promise che così sarebbe avvenuto.

Fino ad ora tutti dicevano o credevano che l'orfanotrofio di Cunemao avesse dei fondi, e lo stesso Monsignor Arcivescovo così la pensava, come si rileva dalla sua lettera del 18 corrente (Allagato H). Ma ora l'aspetto della questione, su questa punto è cambiato, se si ammettono le riflessioni di Mons. Mellano.

Questo buon Prelato dice di aver esposto a Vostra Eminenza in modo completo lo stato della questione nella sua lettera del 26 giugno scorso e di aver dato le prove di come quella somma appartiene a lui e non deve passare all'orfanotrofio.

Se Vostra Eminenza avesse la bontà di chiamarmi a dare il mio debole parere su questo affare, direi che, stando così le

one of his convents or not to maintain them with interest of that amount, I authorized him newly to receive them in one of his convents, until the Holy See will not arrange in a different manner. And I made it clear to him that until a response should come from Your Eminence, he can make use of the interest of that amount to maintain them. He promised me that, it will be done accordingly.

Until now, everyone said or believed that the orphanage of Koonammavu had funds. And the same Archbishop also thought such a way as he has pointed out in his letter of 18th of this month (Attached Document H). But now, the appearance of the matter on this point is changed, if one admits the reflections of Msgr. Mellano.

This good Prelate says that he exposed to Your Eminence in a comprehensive manner the state of this issue in his letter of last 26th June and have given evidence of how that amount belongs to him and should not pass to the orphanage.

If Your Eminence has the kindness to call me to give my weak opinion on this deal, I would say that, being thus the things, I would consider it appropriate that you agree to the Archbishop of Verapoly

cose riterrei opportuno che si desse ragione a Mons. Arcivescovo di Verapoly e permettere che egli tenga quella somma con sè e se ne possa servire per un Orfanotrofio nella sua Arcidiocesi. Egli, secondo le indicazioni della donatrice, avrebbe dovuto servirsene per costruire un ospedale, ma ora già esiste un bellissimo ospedale presso la sua residenza di Magnamey, e quindi la costruzione di un nuovo ospedale sarebbe oltretutto, superflua. Potrebbe dunque continuare a servirsene allo stesso scopo per cui se ne è servito fino ad ora, ciò è per l'orfanotrofio, che egli chiama anche con il nome di 'Catecumenato', perchè molte di quelle ragazze sono state convertite dal paganesimo e li accolto ed educate. In Verapoly ed in Ernakulam l'Arcidiocesi possiede ancora due grandi locali, ed in uno di essi si può aprire un Orfanotrofio.

A tutto questo si aggiunge anche la ragione che così si avrebbe pure il vantaggio che sarebbe in qualche modo lenito il gravissimo dolore che Mons. Arcivescovo, i suoi Missionari e la popolazione latina di Cunemao hanno avuto per la perdita di quel Monastero, con annesse scuole ed Orfanotrofio. Come l'Eminenza Vostra ben conosce, la popolazione di

and allow him to take that amount with him and if they could serve it for an orphanage in his Archdiocese. He, according to the indications of the donor, would have used it to construct a hospital, but now already there exists a beautiful hospital at his residence of Manjummel. Therefore, the construction of a new hospital would be above all unnecessary.

It may continue to use for the same purpose for which it has served until now; that is for the orphanage, which he calls also with the name 'Catechumenate,' since many of those girls were converted from paganism and were accepted and educated. In Verapoly and Ernakulam the Archdiocese still owns two large locations, and in one of them he can open an orphanage.

To all this can also add the reason that thus it would have also the advantage that would in somehow relieve the severe pain that the Archbishop, his missionaries and the Latin population of Koonammavu have had due to the loss of that convent, with the attached school and orphanage.

As Your eminence knows well, the population of Koonammavu has accepted the decision of the Sacred Congregation

Cunemao ha accettato la decisione della S. Congregazione relativa alla giurisdizione di quel monastero assai malvolentieri. C'era da temere gravi disordini se non si fosse permesso alle suore latine di uscire da quel monastero e non si fosse loro accordato il permesso di prendere le loro doti, ma dopo aver concesse queste...(Pare manchi qualche parte)...dal quel monastero, in qualunque modo, di notte e di giorno. Si ha ragione di sperare che in seguito ad una tale pubblicazione, avrenno fine anche questi piccoli disturbi. Durante la mia breve dimora presso Mons. Arcivescovo, sono andato a Cunemao e li ho visitato la Chiesa Parrocchiale e da là mi sono recato al Monastero. Il ricevimento che mi fatto dai fedeli di Cunemao fu solennissimo e quasi tutta la Parrocchia, circa 6000 persone, era presente in quel'occasione. Lessero un bel saluto nel quale, con delicatezza fecero allusioni al trasferimento del monastero di quel luogo alla giurisdizione del Vicari Apostolico di Trichur, e con delicatezza anche maggiore mi chiesero di esaminare nuovamente il caso. Ma come già ad essi che dieci giorni prima erano venuti da me in Magmamey ed a voce mi avevano detto le stesse cose e come già allora aveva risposto,

concerning the jurisdiction of that convent unwillingly. There was reason to fear serious disorders if you had not allowed the Latin sisters to exit from that convent and had not granted them permission to take their dowries, but having granted these ...(Seems to be lacking some part) ... from that convent, in whatever way, day and night. One has reason to hope that following to such a publication, there can be at the end also these small disturbances.

During my short stay at the Archbishop, I went to Kunammavu and there I visited the Parish Church and from there I went to the convent. The reception that made to me by the faithful of Koonammavu was most solemn and almost the entire parish, about 6000 people, was present in that occasion. In the greetings with delicacy, they made allusions to the transfer of the convent of that place to the jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, and with even more gently requested me to re-examine the case. But as they have already came to me at Manjummel ten days before and verbally they have informed me the same matter, and then as I have responded them, I said that the demand of a new examination (of the decision) was not in any

dissi che la domanda di un nuovo esame non era in alcun modo ammissibile, poichè la S. Sede aveva già preso la sua decisione. Racomandai invece a loro l'obidienza ai Decreti della S. Congregazine e lodavo il loro sentimento di devozione al S. Padre e al loro Venerando Arcivescovo; così nella mia risposta nulla dissi su quei due punti, ma mi sono limitato a lodare ancora una volta i loro sentimenti di devozione e di attaccamento al S. Padre ed all'Arcivescovo e ad esortarli a rimanere sempre fedeli a quei sentimenti.

Circa le 41 ragazze fuggitive, sarei del parere che si dovesse dire a Mons. Mellano che le può accogliere per sempre in uno dei suoi manasteri. Ma anche su di ciò rimanga in attesa delle gradite indicazioni che l'Eminenza Vostra avrà il piacere di farmi avere.

Intanto, chinato con riverenza al bacio della S. Porpora, altro per ora non mi resta che il grandissimo onore di professarmi, con i sentimenti del più profondo ossequio e della più devota venerazione, dell'eminenza Vostra Reverendissima

Umilissimo, Devotissimo,
Ossequiosissimo Servo
+Andrea Arcivescovo di Acrida
Delegato Apostolico delle Indie Orientali.

way admittable, since the Holy See has already taken its decision. Instead I

recommended them obedience to the Decrees of the Sacred Congregation and I praised their feeling of devotion to the Holy Father and to their Venerable Archbishop.

Thus in my response I said nothing about those two points, but I limited myself to praise once again their sentiments of devotion and attachment to the Holy Father and to the Archbishop and to encourage them to remain always faithful to those sentiments.

About the 41 fled away girls, my opinion would be that you should say to Msgr. Mellano that he can accept them forever in one of his convents. But also to wait for the suggestions which your Eminence will be pleased to have been done.

Above all, bowing with reverence to kiss the *S. Porpora* (the purple Robe), more for now I just have the great honor of professing me, with sentiments of more profound esteem and of the most devout veneration, of Your Most Reverend Eminence

Most Humble, Most devout, most obsequious Servant
+ Andrea Archbishop of Acrida
Apostolic Delegate of the East Indies.

5.3.4.6.2. Main Points

- First, the Apostolic Delegate repeats the information that he got from the letter of Msgr. Medlycott dated 29th September 1890 that the Vicar Apostolic had taken possession of the convent at Koonammavu in accordance with the decision of Rome and the Latin sisters in a peaceful atmosphere left the convent and their dowry issue would be settled according to justice.
- The Apostolic Delegate informs the Cardinal Prefect of Propaganda Fide that he got letters from both Msgr. Mellano and Msgr. Medlycott saying that after the departure of the Latin sisters the girls of the orphanage at Koonammavu ran away from there first to the parish church, from there some were transferred to a widow of that place, and another group had gone to stay with relatives or friends.
- Msgr. Aiuti says that according to Archbishop Mellano the reason for the flight of the girls was the excessive harshness with which the Syrian sisters treated them before and during the time of the change of the jurisdiction.
- Whereas Msgr. Medlycott argues that the girls fled from the orphanage according to the instruction of Fr. Philip, the Vicar General of Msgr. Mellano and a Latin sister. They advised the girls not to remain there after the departure of the Latin sisters. He was also told that two priests of Koonammavu, the vicar and his assistant, had helped the girls to flee.
- Msgr. Aiuti then wrote to Msgr. Mellano telling him that he is very much displeased about this occurrence. He said in the letter that the reasons given by the girls do not justify their action. So too some of the Latin

sisters had helped every possible way the girls to flee from the orphanage promising them that they will be given asylum elsewhere.

- In his reply, Msgr. Mellano said that the information that some of the Latin sisters would have incited the girls to take that step and would have encouraged them in that way was false and the real reason was the harshness of the Syrian sisters. He also confessed that he could not convince the girls to re-enter the orphanage at Koonammavu.
- Reflecting over the grave danger of the girls, the Apostolic Delegate telegrammed to Msgr. Medlycott asking his opinion in entrusting Msgr. Mellano to accept those girls in one of his convents in Verapoly. To this, Msgr. Medlycott replied that it was Msgr. Mellano who had done the evil and now he tries to justify himself. Thus, he has the responsibility to take the girls. It is wrong to hold that by doing so he will be alienating the funds of Verapoly.
- However, relying on the principle that the salvation of souls is the Supreme Law, Apostolic Delegate wrote a letter to Msgr. Mellano, allowing him to accept the 41 girls who had fled from the orphanage because of the circumstances. Nevertheless, Msgr. Aiuti made it clear that this permission did not imply any modification of the provisions adopted by the Holy See, concerning the jurisdiction over the convent and the school and orphanage attached to it along with all the properties united to these institutes. All these belong to the jurisdiction of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.
- Msgr. Mellano replied that he has no difficulty to accept the girls in the convent of Verapoly, which was started to construct also for this purpose, taking into

consideration the unhealthy atmosphere of Koonammavu. However, he added that he had to be given the income of the orphanage of Koonammavu since its capital belongs to the Archdiocese of Verapoly and not to others and he could not understand what will be the reason for depriving Verapoly of the money it deserves.

- A few days later, when the Apostolic Delegate went to Verapoly, he could see that Msgr. Mellano had not yet done anything to protect the girls who had run away. When it brought to his attention, the prelate said that he had not decided to accept them since he had no other means to maintain them except the interest of the sum of money, which was in his hands. Moreover, he did not know if he could continue to spend it for those orphans.
- The Prelate did not deny that he possessed a certain amount of money for the maintenance of the orphans. Nevertheless, after reflecting more on the things and after having consulted with his missionaries, one day he came to the Apostolic Delegate and said that he did not believe absolutely that the sum, through the interest of which he had till now maintained the orphanage, must pass to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur along with that orphanage. The reason is that, an Italian woman gave that amount to him, in order to construct a hospital for all the castes. However, it was not possible at that time, and that amount which came to him was destined to serve as source for the maintenance of an orphanage.
- He also added that the amount always being remained with him and never had been cleared legally as source or asset of the same orphanage; it is not being tied to the orphanage as inseparable, consequently, passing the

orphanage to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, the amount also need not to be passed to him.

- The Apostolic Delegate requested to Msgr. Mellano to write a letter clarifying the reasons for the supreme consideration of the Cardinal Prefect of the Propaganda Fide. Msgr. Aiuti then authorized him once again to receive the girls, until the Holy See order differently. The Apostolic Delegate also said to the Prelate to make use of the interest of that amount to maintain the orphans until a response comes from the Propaganda Fide. He agreed to do so.
- Msgr. Aiuti then writes to the Cardinal that until now, everyone said or believed that the orphanage of Koonammavu had funds. Formerly the Archbishop of Verapoly also spoke in such a way. Now he had changed his position. The capital given by the Italian lady is still with him, and he has no obligation to hand it over to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.
- After exposing all the history, the Apostolic Delegate submits to the Cardinal of the Propaganda Fide his own humble suggestions concerning the issue of donation and the future of the runaway girls from the orphanage:
 - o Concerning the donation:
 - o According to him, it is appropriate to allow the Archbishop of Verapoly to take that amount if it could serve for an orphanage in Verapoly.
 - o He would have used the money to construct a hospital as the donor had willed. Now there already exists a beautiful hospital at his residence of Manjummel, hence the construction of a new hospital is

unnecessary. Therefore, the money could be used for the orphanage.

- The Archdiocese of Verapoly still owns two large locations in Verapoly and Ernakulam and in one of them, Msgr. Mellano can open an orphanage.
- This would have also the advantage of reducing the pain that had borne the Archbishop, his missionaries and the Latin population of Koonammavu had due to the loss of that convent along with school and orphanage.
- Concerning the girls:
 - Msgr. Aiuti requests the Cardinal Prefect to demand Msgr. Mellano to accept permanently the 41 fled away girls, until the Cardinal makes a definitive decision.
- Msgr. Aiuti also informs the Cardinal about the request of the Latin people to re-examine the decision over the convent. He told them that the re-consideration of the decision of Vatican was not in any way admissible, since the Holy See has already taken its decision. He recommended the people to obey the Decrees of the Sacred Congregation.

5.3.4.6.3. Comments

- Msgr. Aiuti submits a summary of the events that happened concerning the issue of the jurisdiction, the flight of the orphan girls and about the question of rehabilitating them as well as the controversy concerning the expenses and donation.

- Some pertinent points that draw our special attention are the following:
 - He informs the Cardinal of the Propaganda Fide that Msgr. Mellano, although expressed his willingness to take up the girls, did not do accordingly.
 - The given details of Msgr. Aiuti about the repeated changing of the opinions of Msgr. Mellano and his reiteratively bringing out the issues of donation and capital show the crafty character of the Archbishop Mellano.
 - He tries his best to change the attitudes of the Apostolic Delegate and Rome in his favour.
 - This is explicit in his shift of position about donation.
- We would like to make the following comments concerning the suggestions of Msgr. Aiuti submitted to the Cardinal Prefect:
 - The suggestion of the Apostolic Delegate to hand over the amount to Msgr. Mellano was based on the claim of the Archbishop, the veracity of which may be called into question. It seems that Msgr. Aiuti blindly believed the claim of Msgr. Mellano. Still he puts a clause. The money is to be used only for the purpose of building an orphanage in Verapoly.
 - It seems that the Apostolic Delegate had made this suggestion in order to reduce the tensions and oppositions of the Latin Archbishop, missionaries and population of Koonammavu at the verdict of Rome on the ownership of Koonammavu convent and its allied institutions.

Indeed, it was a diplomatic approach and not a suggestion based on objective facts.¹¹⁸

- The suggestion of Msgr. Aiuti concerning the runaway girls was indeed appropriate. He knew that Msgr. Mellano may not listen to his request; hence, he pleads with the Cardinal to compel the Archbishop of Verapoly to accept the girls permanently.
- It is commendable that the Apostolic Delegate stood firm to uphold the verdict of Vatican concerning the division and jurisdiction of Koonammavu convent and its attached institutions.

5.3.4.7. Reply of Cardinal Simeoni through his Secretary to the Apostolic Delegate dated November 26, 1890

In this reply, the Cardinal deals with three issues. The first one is related to the request of two Jacobites priests. Since it does not concern us, we have omitted it from our discussion. In the second part of the letter Cardinal prefect refers to the flight of the girls from the orphanage and agrees to the suggestions made by Msgr. Aiuti. Since the Cardinal expresses his concern for the health of Msgr. Aiuti and hope that he could recover completely when he hear that the Holy See support his suggestion. This part is also omitted.

¹¹⁸ If Msgr. Aiuti had taken this stand on the money in favour of Msgr. Mellano how can then Sr. Sucey make the following ‘sarcastic’ comment: “Apostolic Delegate, Archbishop Aiuti reported to Cardinal Simeoni in a sarcastic manner that Archbishop Mellano was very afflicted at loosing the monastery and at the reduction of his diocese and the decrease of the allowance for his diocese from the society of the Propagation of Faith, in France” (*SGME*, 304).

5.3.4.7.1. Original Letter

| Italian Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>A Sua Eccellenza Reverendissima Monsignor Andrea Aiuti Arcivescovo di Acrida e Delegato Apostolico delle Indie Orientali</p> <p style="text-align: center;">26 Novembre 1890</p> <p>... Ha prodotta in me una penosa impressione la notizia datami da vostra Signoria, nella Sua lettera del 31 Ottobre scorso, N. 2200, sulla fuga delle orfanelle dall' orfanotrofio di Cunamao. Mentre ero soddisfatto per quello che, pochi giorni prima la Signoria Vostra mi aveva scritto sulla positiva e definitiva composizione di quella questione, mi ha molto soppresso era tristato questo triste incidente. Ritengo opportuno che, per il momento, le cose restino come Vostra Signoria le ha sistemate, cioè le orfanelle siano ricoverate da Monsignor Mellano in uno dei suoi monasteri e per mantenerle adoperi gli interessi dell'orfanotrofio. In seguito si vedrà se questa decisione provvisoria potrà trasformarsi in definitiva....</p> <p>Protocollo 1777</p> <p>Segretaria Orientale della S. Cong. Della Propagazione della Fede</p> | <p>To His V. Rev. Excellency Msgr. Andrea Aiuti Archbishop of Acrida and Apostolic Delegate of Orient India</p> <p style="text-align: center;">November 26, 1890</p> <p>...The information that you have given me through your letter dated last October 31, about the flight of the girls from the Orphanage of Koonammavu brought in me a grave impression. While I was satisfied with what you had written to me few days before, on the positive and definitive composition of that question, this tensed incident has surprised and saddened me very much. I retain as opportune that for the present moment let the things be as you have arranged them, namely the orphans be sheltered by Msgr. Mellano in one of his convents and to maintain them he can make use of the interest of the orphanage. Later we will see whether this provisional could be transformed into definite one...</p> <p>Protocol 1777</p> <p>Oriental Secretary of the Sacred Congregation of Propagation of Faith</p> |

5.3.4.7.2. Main Points

- Cardinal expresses his surprise and sorrow at the event of the flight of the girls from the Orphanage.
- He gives his consent to the suggestion of Msgr. Aiuti that Msgr. Mellano should protect the girls and maintain them by using the interest of the Orphanage.

5.3.4.7.3. Comments

The decision taken by the Cardinal Prefect of the Propaganda Fide was very appropriate. It discloses his paternal concern for the welfare of the orphan girls.

5.3.5. Dispute over the Properties (Especially over the dowry of Sr. Anna)

The departure of the Latin sisters on 17th September 1890, has not brought the issues of properties and dowries to definite end. Indeed, it remained a burning topic among the Latin and Syrian sisters. The denial of the dowry of the deceased Sr. Anna was the main bone of contention. The Latin sisters wanted to come to Koonammavu to check all the pertinent documents concerning their dowry. To this the Syrian sisters objected. Sr. Catherine the superior informed Msgr. Medlycott, their opposition in a letter.¹¹⁹

5.3.5.1. Letter of Sr. Catherine to Msgr. Medlycott

It is not easy to decide its chronological order among other documents concerning the dispute over the properties. We will give in the comment our arguments for giving it before other letters dated 5th, 20th and 31st of December 1890 and 2nd, 3rd, 20th and 26th of January 1891.

¹¹⁹ The date is not seen in the copy of the letter which is available for us.

5.3.5.1.1. Original Letter

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>എ.പെ.പെ.ബ.ഞങ്ങളുടെ പിതാവേ,</p> <p>ലത്തീൻ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളുടെ പത്രമോനി വസ്തുക്കളുടെ കാര്യം തീർക്കുന്നതിനും എ.പെ.പെ.ബ.വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാനച്ചന്റെ പേർക്കുള്ള ആൾ അച്ചന്മാർ പാർത്തിരുന്ന ബംഗ്ലാവിൽ വന്നിരുന്നു. എ.പെ.ബ. ദലഗാത്തച്ചനും ബ. കപ്പോനച്ചനും കൂടി തീർക്കണമെന്നാണല്ലോ പിതാവു ഞങ്ങളോടുകൽപിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നത്.</p> <p>എന്നാൽ വരാപ്പുഴ മഠത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി അവരുടെ പത്രമേനി വസ്തുക്കളുടെ കാര്യംകൊണ്ട് ആവശ്യവും ഉപകാരവുമായ വിവരങ്ങളെ ഇവിടെയുള്ള പുസ്തകങ്ങളിൽ നിന്ന് എടുക്കുന്നതിന് വരാപ്പുഴ മഠത്തിൽനിന്ന് കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ ഇവിടെ വരുന്നതിന് ചോദിക്കുന്നു. എന്നാൽ ഇപ്പോൾ ഈ ജനങ്ങളുടെ കലാപങ്ങൾ ഒരുപ്രകാരം അടങ്ങിയിരിക്കുന്നു. എന്നാൽ ഇപ്പോൾ അവർ വരുകയെന്നയാൽ ഇനിയുള്ള ജനങ്ങൾ അലോഹ്യങ്ങൾ ഉണ്ടാക്കുന്നതിനും ആ സ. ഓരോരോ വസ്തുക്കൾ ചോദിക്കും. അവർ ചോദിക്കുന്നതു കൊടുക്കുകയില്ലായെങ്കിൽ രസക്കേടിനും വഴക്കുകൾക്കും ഇടയാകും. ആ സ. ഇവിടെ വന്നു നോക്കിയാലും അവർക്ക് വസ്തുക്കളുടെ വിവരണങ്ങൾ കിട്ടുന്നതല്ല വഴക്കിന് മാത്രമേ ഉപകരിക്കൂ. പിതാവ് കൽപിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നതൊക്കെയും അവർക്ക് ഞങ്ങൾ കൊടുക്കയും ചെയ്യും.</p> <p>ആകയാൽ മേൽ കാണിച്ചിരിക്കുന്ന അലോഹ്യങ്ങളെപ്പറ്റി ഈ കാര്യങ്ങൾക്കായി അവർ ഇവിടെ വരുന്നതിന് പിതാവ് അനുവദിച്ചാൽ ഞങ്ങൾ വളരെ സങ്കടമുള്ള</p> | <p>Our most Rev. Father,</p> <p>For settling the issues regarding the patrimonial properties of the Latin sisters, the representative of the Archbishop of Verapoly had come to the bungalow where the fathers are residing. You have been told us to settle it through the most Rev. Fr. Delegate and Rev. Fr. Chaplain.</p> <p>But the superior of the convent of Verapoly is asking us to come here for taking the required and necessary information regarding their patrimonial properties from the books here. But now, the riots of the people almost ceased. If they are coming now, again the disturbances may arise. That sisters may ask some things. If they are not given the things which were asked, it may cause dislikes and quarrels. If those sisters might come here and check, they would not get the details of the properties. It may lead only for the quarrels. We will give them what all the things you have commanded us to give them.</p> <p>Because of the above said reasons, if Father may give permission to them to come here, we will be very much sad.</p> <p>For the information regarding this, their letter is enclosed and</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>വരാൻ. ഇതിന്റെ വിവരത്തിനായി അവരുടെ എഴുത്ത് ഇതിൽ അടക്കം ചെയ്തു കൊടുത്തയയ്ക്കുന്നു. 9-ാം തീയതി പിതാവിനായി തപാൽമാർഗ്ഗം ഒരഴുത്ത് ഞങ്ങൾ അയച്ചത് കിട്ടിയോ ഇല്ലയോ എന്ന് സംശയിക്കുന്നു. ആ എഴുത്ത് കിട്ടിയിട്ടുണ്ടെങ്കിൽ അതിന്റെ മറുപടിയും ഇതോടെ അയപ്പാറാകണമേ. ഇൗശോ. കത്രീനാ മാഞ്ഞൂരാൻ.</p> | <p>sending to you. We are doubting whether you have received the letter we sent to you on 9th by post. If you received that letter, please send us the reply of that also along with this. Sr. Kathrina of Jesus. Manjooran</p> |
|---|--|

5.3.5.1.2. Main Points

- Sr. Catherine informs Msgr. Medlycott that a person sent by Msgr. Mellano has come to the bungalow where the priests stay.
- She reminds the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur, his order that the issue of Patrimony should be decided between the Provincial Delegate and Fr. Chaplain.
- The sisters from Verapoly convent ask for permission to come to Koonammavu to check the account books concerning the properties related to the patrimony.
- Sr. Catherine adduces her arguments for not allowing the Latin sisters to come over to Koonammavu.
 - o Their coming will re-enkindle the disturbances among the Latin laity which had fortunately subsided now.
 - o There is possibility that the Latin sisters will demand this and that things and if the Syrian sisters do not give them such things, it will engender displeasure and quarrel.

- Even if, they come here and check the records they will not get proper information concerning the properties. It will also pave the way for the clashes.
- Also the superior says that the sisters will be obliged to give the Latin sisters whatever his Excellency commands them to give.
- On account of such eventualities Sr. superior tells Msgr. Medlycott that they will be very sad if he allows the Latin sisters to come over to the convent.

5.3.5.1.3. Comments

- In this letter Sr. Catherine very clearly stands against the coming of the Latin sisters to Koonammavu. Hence, it is logical to conclude that her letter was written down before Msgr. Medlycott wrote to the Archbishop of Verapoly on 2nd January 1891. Now the problem is about the coming of the priest sent by Msgr. Mellano to check the accounts concerning the property. In the letter dated 2nd January 1891 the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur had requested to Msgr. Mellano to send his representative to be present when the accounts concerning the properties are checked in the presence of the Latin sisters. How could the representative of Msgr. Mellano come over to Koonammavu to check the accounts alone? Probably it seems that the Archbishop of Verapoly had sent in his own initiative a person earlier before Msgr. Medlycott had made that request on 2nd January 1891. In her letter Sr. Catherine reminded the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur his former order that the issue of patrimony should be decided between the Provincial Delegate and Fr. Chaplain. Her words imply that what had happened now was against his own order.

- We cannot *a priori* deny the arguments of mother superior against the coming of the Latin sisters to Koonammavu. However, her position seems to be too much negative and onesided.
- Her assertion that even if the Latin sisters check the accounts they will not get proper information concerning the properties, seems to be an *argumentum ad hominem*. Also the fear that Msgr. Medlycott will in his generosity concede to the demands of the Latin sisters. Things had happened as Sr. Catherine had feared.

5.3.5.2. Letter of Latin Sisters to Msgr. Medlycott dated on 5th December, 1890 Requesting Permission to Examine Account Book

5.3.5.2.1. Original Letter

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>വരാപ്പുഴ വി. യൗസേപ്പിതാവിന്റെ കന്യാകാമാത്തിൽ നിന്ന് 1890 ഡിസംബർ 5 എ.പെ.പെ.ബ. ഞങ്ങളുടെ പിതാവേ, വിശേഷ ദൈവാനുഗ്രഹത്താൽ ഈ മലയാളത്തിൽ ക.നി.മു. സ. കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളുടെ സഭ കുന്നമ്മാവുകൽ ആദ്യമായി സ്ഥാപിപ്പാനും ഭാഗ്യം ലഭിച്ചവരായ ഞങ്ങൾ വിശുദ്ധ സിംഹാസനത്തിന്റെ വിധി എന്ന ഏക ന്യായത്തെക്കുറിച്ച് ആ സ്ഥലം വിട്ട് അന്യരെപ്പോലെ കഴിച്ചിരിന്നു വേണ്ട യാതൊരു വസ്തു കൂടാതെയും പുറപ്പെട്ട ശേഷം ഞങ്ങളുടെ പത്രമോനിയെങ്കിലും വേഗം കിട്ടുന്നതിന് അപേക്ഷിച്ചാറെ, അതിനും തടസ്സമായി പല ന്യായങ്ങളും ഉപായക്കണക്കുകളും കുന്നമ്മാവു മഠത്തിലെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി എ.പെ.ബ.ദലഗാത്തപ്പസ്തോലിക്കാ അവാർകൾക്ക് എഴുതി അയച്ചതിന്റെ പകർപ്പ് അവിടന്ന് ഞങ്ങൾക്ക് അയ</p> | <p>St. Joseph Convent Varapuzha 1890 December 5 Our Most Reverend Father, By the special grace of God we received the good fortune to establish the convent of Carmelite Tertiaries in Koonammavu, though we had to leave that place as strangers because of the judgment from the Holy See. But now, when we are requested to get at least our patrimony back to us, the superior of Koonammavu convent wrote many excuses and justification to the most Reverend Apostolic Delegate</p> |

ചുരു കൈപ്പറ്റി. എന്നാൽ കാര്യ
 ത്തിന്റെ സത്യവും സൂക്ഷ്മവുമായ
 വിവരത്തോടു കൂടി ഇതിനു
 വേണ്ടുന്ന മറുപടി എഴുതുന്നതിന്
 ആദ്യമായി പനമ്പി മഠം മുതൽ
 ഇതു വരെയുള്ള കണക്കു പുസ്തക
 ങ്ങളും നാളാഗമ പുസ്തകങ്ങളും
 കിട്ടിയേ മതിയാവൂ. നാൾ വഴിപ്പട്ടിക
 കണക്കു പുസ്തകവും മാസപ്പടി
 കണക്കു പുസ്തകവും പാട്ടപ്പിരിവും
 എടുക്കുന്നത് പൈതങ്ങളുടെ
 ചിലവു വക വരുന്നതിന്റെയും
 വിവര ക്രാസ്. ഇത്രയുംമാണ് ഓർമ്മ
 യിൽ തോന്നുന്നത്. ഇതു കൂടാതെ
 ഉണ്ടെങ്കിൽ അതും കിട്ടിയേ മതിയാ
 വൂ. എ.പെ.പെ.ബ. പിതാവു തന്നെ
 ബോധിപ്പിച്ച് ഈ പുസ്തകങ്ങൾ
 ഞങ്ങൾക്കു തരുവിപ്പാറാകണമെന്ന്
 അപേക്ഷിക്കുന്നു. ഇവ കിട്ടിയ
 ശേഷം പാടുപോലെ വേഗത്തിൽ
 ഇതിനാവശ്യമായ മറുപടി അയ
 പ്താൻ ഞങ്ങൾ ആസ്ഥമായിരിക്കു
 ന്നു. ഇതു കൂടാതെയും ഞങ്ങൾ
 കാത്തുവന്നിരുന്ന ന്യായപ്രമാണവും
 ക്രമവും എന്ന രണ്ടു പുസ്തക
 ങ്ങളും ഞങ്ങൾക്കില്ലായ്കയാൽ
 അവയും സഭയുടെ ആദ്യം മുതലു
 ഉള്ള നാളാഗമം ഞങ്ങളെ സംബന്ധി
 ച്ചുള്ളതാകയാൽ അവയുടെ
 പകർപ്പും നിത്യമായി തരത്തക്ക
 വണ്ണം പിതാവു കല്പിക്കണമെന്നും
 പ്രത്യേകമായി അപേക്ഷിക്കുന്നു.

ശ്ലീഹായ്ക്കും പിതാവിനുമടുത്ത
 അങ്ങേ ആശീർവാദം അപേക്ഷിച്ചു
 കൊണ്ട്

അങ്ങേ കീഴ്വ: ചിറ്റ: ആ.
 ക.ദി.മു.സ. ഈശോയുടെ ഭ്രതസ്യാ

and we received a copy of
 that letter from him. We need
 to give a reply with real and
 precise details of the matters.
 For that we need to access the
 account books of the convent
 from the beginning in
 bamboo mat convent and
 Chronicles. Also we should
 get the Ledger book, monthly
 account book, collection of
 lease and the account book of
 the boarding. Only these
 things are in our minds now.
 If there is any other besides
 these, we should get that also.
 We request your grace to
 inform about these and let us
 have the access of them.
 Once we received them we
 are bound to send you a reply
 as soon as possible. Also we
 request to obtain a copy of
 our constitution and
 directives since we do not
 have the possession of them.
 We also would like to get the
 copy of our first Chronicles
 permanently as it is about us.
 Beseeching for your Blessing
 as Bishop and Father,
 The one who wish to serve
 you under obedience,
 Thresia of Jesus TOCD.

5.3.5.2.2. Main Points

- Sr. Thresia the Superior of the Verapoly convent claims that they were the blessed ones by God to establish the religious convent for women in Koonammavu.

- Obeying only the decision of the Holy See, they had to leave Koonammavu without having any resources for their maintenance.
- When they had asked that at least their patrimony should be given immediately to them, the mother superior of Koonammavu tried to obstruct it by forwarding different arguments and fabricated accounts to the Apostolic Delegate.
- Now Msgr. Medlycott has sent a copy of it to them.
- In order to give a proper reply with true and concise details they need to have access to the account books, Chronicles, daily log books, ledgers and the books that have recorded income from the lease and the accounts of the income and expenditure of the *Educandath* from the initial stages of *panambumadam* till now.
- The Sr. superior of Verapoly requests Msgr. Medlycott to arrange that such books may available to them, so that they could give the reply at the earliest.
- Sr. Thresia also asks the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur that they may get a copy of the *Regola* and Regulations as well as the transcription of the Chronicles of the Convent from its very beginning.

5.3.5.2.3. Comments

- This letter was written after two and half months subsequent to the Latin sisters had left the Koonammavu convent on 17th September 1890.¹²⁰ In this letter, the sisters bring out the issue of their patrimony. One has to remember that the money concerning the orphanage was already definitively

¹²⁰ The letter was written on 5th December 1890.

solved on 26th November, 1890. Now the Latin sisters come out with the issue of patrimony!

- Some of the terms and claims of Sr. superior of Verapoly have no historical proofs.
 - o Sr. Thresia seems to claim that the first convent was established by them (*അവർ*)

impression that the Syrian sisters were not given the patrimony to the Latin sisters.

- Unfortunately, we could not trace out the letter of mother Catherine which according to Sr. Thresia contained ‘many excuses and justification.’ Hence, we do not comment on that point.
- It is difficult to believe that the Latin sisters were not allowed to take the copies of *Regola* and Regulations which they were diligently obeying, with them when they departed to Verapoly.

5.3.5.3. First Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to the Superior of Koonammavu Convent dated on December 20, 1890

Msgr. Medlycott took initiative to settle the issue on patrimony. Three of his letters written to the sisters of the Koonammavu convent have come to possession. The first letter is his response to the above quoted letter of Latin sisters asking permission to check the account books and other documents.

5.3.5.3.1. Original Document

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>ത്രിക്കോമിയായുടെ മെത്രാൻ തൃശൂർ വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്ക യുമായ നാം അഡോൾഫസ് മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ടുമെത്രാൻ</p> <p>മിശിഹായുടെ പ്രിയപ്പെട്ട മകളായ ഈശോയുടെ കത്രീന കുനമ്മാവു ങ്കൽ കന്യാസ്ത്രീമാത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിക്ക് ആശീർവാദം.</p> <p>എന്നാൽ ലത്തീൻകാരത്തികളായ സഹോദരികളുടെ പത്രമോനി സംബന്ധിച്ചു തങ്ങളുടെ വിവരപ്പട്ടികയ്ക്കും മറുപടിക്കുമായി അവരുടെ എഴുത്തും നാം കൈപ്പറ്റി. ആയതിന്റെ ഒരു പ്രതി നാം</p> | <p>Bishop Adolf Medlycott, The Bishop of Tricomea and Vicar Apostolic of Trichur</p> <p>Blessings to my dear daughter in Jesus, the superior of Koonammavu Convent.</p> <p>I have received a letter from the Latin sisters regarding the matters related to their patrimony, for a reply and a table of information. I have enclosed a copy of that in it. In</p> |

ഇതിൽ അടക്കം ചെയ്തിരിക്കുന്നു. അതിൽ മഠത്തിന്റെ കണക്കു പുസ്തകങ്ങൾ പരിശോധിച്ചു അവരുടെ പത്രമോനി വക നിശ്ചയപ്പെടുത്തുന്നതിന് അനുവാദം അപേക്ഷിക്കുന്നു. അവർ ഏകദേശം പത്തു പുസ്തകങ്ങളെ തിരിച്ചു പറഞ്ഞിരിക്കുന്നു. ആകയാൽ മേൽപ്പറഞ്ഞ പുസ്തകങ്ങളിൽ ഏതേതു പുസ്തകങ്ങളിലാണ് അവരുടെ പത്രമോനിക്കണക്കുകൾ ഉള്ളതെന്നും താങ്കൾ ബോധിപ്പിച്ചു കണക്കുകളുടെ വ്യവസ്ഥയ്ക്കുവേണ്ടി അവർക്കു സമ്മതം വരുവാൻ ന്യായമായി വേറെ വല്ല പുസ്തകങ്ങളും പരിശോധിക്കുന്നതിന് അവർക്ക് അനുവദിച്ചുവെന്നുണ്ടോയെന്നും ബോധിപ്പിക്കേണ്ടിയിരിക്കുന്നു.

ഈ പുസ്തകങ്ങൾ അവരുടെ കൈയിൽ കൊടുക്കാനല്ല നമ്മുടെ നിയോഗം. പിന്നെയോ കുറേ മുൻ നിങ്ങളുടെ മഠത്തിനു പുറത്തു സന്യാസികൾ താമസിച്ചിരുന്ന വീട്ടിൽ വച്ച് നിങ്ങളുടെ കുമ്പസാരക്കാരന്റെ കൈവഴിയായി പരിശോധിക്കുന്നതിന് അനുവദിച്ചുവാനാണ് നാം നിശ്ചയിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നത്. ഈ അപേക്ഷയിൽ അനാഥശാലയുടെ പുസ്തകങ്ങൾ അടങ്ങുന്നില്ല.

ഗോവയ്ക്കുള്ള നമ്മുടെ തിരുയാത്രയിൽ ആ പുണ്യവാളന്റെ തിരുശരീരത്തിൻ പക്കൽ വച്ചു നിങ്ങളുടെ കൂട്ടത്തെക്കുറിച്ചു നമസ്കരിക്കുന്നതിന് നാം ഉപേക്ഷ വരുത്തിയിട്ടില്ല. ആ തിരുശരീരത്തെ തൊടുവിച്ച കൊന്തകളും കാശുരുപങ്ങളും നാം കൊടുത്തയ്ക്കുന്നു.

എന്ന്, തൃശൂർ നമ്മുടെ അരമനയിൽ നിന്നും

1890 ധനുവം 20-ന്

മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ട് വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കാ, തൃശൂർ

that they are requesting for the permission to check the account books of the convent and settle the matters of patrimony. So you have to inform me that in what all the books contain the accounts of patrimony in the books enlisted above. For the proper agreement of them if they need to check any other books, you should inform me about that.

I do not intend to give the books in their hands. Rather, in the house outside of your convent, where the monks lived earlier, they can check them through the hands of the confessor. I have decided to give permission only for this. This request does not include the accounts of the orphanage.

During my pilgrimage to Goa, I did not fail to pray for your community near the sacred relic of the saint (Francis Xavier). I send to you the medals and rosaries which were touched on that Holy Body.

From,

The Bishop's House of Trichur

December 20, 1890

Medlycott,

Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.

5.3.5.3.2. Main Points

- The Vicar Apostolic informs Sr. Catherine that he had counted the documents asked by the Latin sisters (10 books).
- The Vicar Apostolic gives instruction to the sister superior that she has to find out in which books there are accounts of the patrimonies of the Latin sisters and even to look at other books in which such informations are included and to inform him the result of her findings.
- He makes clear that such books are not to be given directly to the hands of the Latin sisters. They can go through them in the presence of the confessor in the building where the men religious were formerly staying.
- Bishop explicitly said that the books related to the orphanage should not to be included in the list of the books.

5.3.5.3.3. Comments

- In the instructions given by Msgr. Medlycott, one can see his prudence as well as his subtle perception of the delicate issue of the controversy.

5.3.5.4. Second Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to Sr. Catherine the superior of Koonammavu Convent dated December 31, 1890

In this letter, the Vicar Apostolic informs the Sr. superior mainly two things. He is sending a copy of her letter to Msgr. Mellano; He allows a representative of the Archbishop of Verapoly to be present when the documents pertaining to the patrimony of the Latin sisters are examined.

5.3.5.4.1. Original Letter

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>ത്രിക്കോമിയായുടെ മെത്രാൻ തൃശൂർ വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കായ നാം അഡോൾഫ് മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ടു മെത്രാൻ</p> <p>കുനമ്മാവു കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മഠത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തിയായ മിശിഹായിൽ ന. പ്രിയപ്പെട്ട മകൾ ഈശോയുടെ കത്രീനായ്ക്ക് ആശീർവ്വാദം.</p> <p>എന്നാൽ തങ്ങളുടെ എഴുത്തിന്റെ ഒരു പ്രതി വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചന്റെ അറിവിനു വേണ്ടി അദ്ദേഹത്തിനു നാം കൊടുത്തയയ്ക്കുന്നതു കൂടാതെ അദ്ദേഹത്താൽ ക്രമമായി അധികാരപ്പെടുത്തി വിടപ്പെട്ട ആളുകളിൽ അദ്ദേഹത്തിനു പകരം അയയ്ക്കുന്ന ആളുടെ പരിശോധനയ്ക്കായി ബ. കപ്പോനച്ചന്റെ സൂക്ഷ്മത്തിൽ കീഴ്മഠത്തിനരികെയുള്ള ബംഗ്ലാവിൽ വച്ച് ലത്തീൻകാരായ സഹോദരികളുടെ പത്രമേനി വക കണക്കുകൾ അടങ്ങിയിരിക്കുന്നവയായ ആവശ്യമുള്ള അല്ലെങ്കിൽ ഉപകാരമുള്ള സകല പുസ്തകങ്ങളും തുറക്കപ്പെടുന്നതാണെന്നും അദ്ദേഹത്താൽ നിയമിക്കപ്പെടുന്ന ആൾ കപ്പോനച്ചനുമായി കാര്യം പറയുന്നതിനു നിയമിക്കണമെന്നും നാം അറിയിക്കുന്നതാകുന്നു. മറ്റു വല്ല സംഗതികളും ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നാൽ ആയതും ഞങ്ങൾ അറിയിക്കേണ്ടിയിരിക്കുന്നു. പിന്നെയും കണക്കുകൾ പരിശോധന കഴിച്ചു കാര്യം തീരുന്നതിനു വേണ്ട സഹായങ്ങളും കൂടെ ചെയ്തു കൊടുക്കേണ്ടതാകുന്നു. എന്നാൽ കാര്യങ്ങൾ തീർന്ന ഉടനെ ടി. വസ്തുക്കൾ സംബന്ധിച്ചു നിങ്ങളുടെ മഠത്തിനു വരുവാനുള്ളതു മടക്കിത്തരുമ്പോൾ ഒട്ടും താമസമെന്യേ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താ അവർകളുടെ പേർക്ക് വനിരിക്കുന്ന ആളുടെ പേരിൽ ആവശ്യമായ ആധാരങ്ങളും മറ്റും കൊടുത്ത ഇപ്രകാരം താങ്കൾ ചെയ്തു എന്നതിന് ക്രമമായി സാക്ഷികരിക്കപ്പെട്ട</p> | <p>Bishop Adolf Medlycott, the Bishop of Tricomea and Vicar Apostolic of Trichur</p> <p>Blessings to my dear daughter in Jesus, the superior of Koonammavu Convent.</p> <p>I will send a copy of your letter to the Archbishop of Verapoly for his information. I will also send words to him that the person who has given authority by the Archbishop or his representative will be able to examine all the books which hold the accounts of patrimony and other useful books. I will inform that his representative should be appointed to communicate with the Chaplain. If any other matters are there, you should inform those also. Give all the help to finish the checking of the accounts and close the matter. When it is over and you are given back the share regarding those properties, without any delay give to the representative of Archbishop all the bond deeds and obtain a receipt, which will testify that you are given them all.</p> <p>I demand you to finish this dispute without any delay.</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>ഒരു രസീതു വാങ്ങിക്കൊള്ളുകയും വേണം.</p> <p>ഈ തർക്കം താമസം കൂടാതെ തീർക്കുന്നതിന് നാം ആവശ്യപ്പെടുന്നു.</p> <p>എന്ന് തൃശൂർ അരമനയിൽ നിന്നും 1890 ധനു 31-ന്</p> <p>ഇതിൽ പറയും പ്രകാരം ചെയ്യാൻ വേണ്ടി ഇതിന്റെ ഒരു പ്രതി ചാപ്ലീനു കൊടുക്കണം.</p> <p>മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ടു മെത്രാനച്ചൻ.</p> | <p>From, Bishop's House of Trichur, 1890 December 31. Bishop Medlycott For doing the things as per the letter give a copy of this to the Chaplain. Bishop Medlycott.</p> |
|--|--|

5.3.5.4.2. Main Points

- The Vicar Apostolic Msgr. Medlycott informs the superior of the convent that he is giving the copy of her letter to the Archbishop of Verapoly for information.
- He informs the Archbishop of Verapoly that he can appoint his nominee who can be present when the accounts are checked at the bungalow. Hence, he has to appoint his representative.
- Msgr. Medlycott asks Sr. Catherine to render all the necessary helps and make available the pertinent books for the scrutiny.
- After the completion of the scrutiny, Sr. Catherine has to do the following things.
 - o When the Latin sisters give back what they were owing to the Syrian sisters¹²⁴ she can hand over to the Latin representative the pertinent deeds and get a receipt from him.

¹²⁴Probably Msgr. Medlycott was referring to the amount of money which the Syrian sisters were paying on account of the debts on the property of Sr. Anna.

- Finally, he demands that all the disputes on the issue of patrimony should be solved without any delay.
- Msgr. Medlycott asks Sr. Catherine to give a copy of this letter to their chaplain.

5.3.5.4.3. Comments

- An impartial reader may feel admiration for the transparency, sense of justice and openness showed by Msgr. Medlycott. He generously allows a representative of Msgr. Mellano to be present during the time of scrutiny. He asked mother Catherine to make available all the pertinent documents in which there may be references to the issue of patrimony of the Latin sisters. He requests her to hand over the deeds on the patrimony (of Sr. Anna) to the Delegate of the Archbishop of Verapoly. At the same time, he was concerned about the expenses, which the Syrian sisters had incurred in paying the debts related to the dowry of Sr. Anna and makes provision that the Latin sisters pay back that amount to the convent of Koonammavu.

5.3.5.5. Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to Archbishop Mellano dated 2nd January 1891

In this letter Msgr. Medlycott agrees to the request of the Latin sisters to verify the accounts regarding the patrimony sent by the superior of Koonammavu convent.¹²⁵

5.3.5.5.1. Original Document

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| 1891 ജനുവരി 2 കുനമ്മാവു മഠത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി പത്രമേന്തി സംബന്ധിച്ചയച്ച കണക്കു കൾ ശരിയാണോ എന്നു പരിശോധി | 1891 January 2 I give consent for your request to verify the accounts |

¹²⁵We could not trace out the original copy of the letter. We cite the letter from the *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* 105-106.

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>ക്കുന്നതിന് അപേക്ഷിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നതുവദിക്കുന്നു. സഹോദരി അന്നായുടെ പത്രമേനി സംബന്ധിച്ചു മാത്രമല്ലാ തർക്കമുള്ളത്. മറ്റുള്ളവരുടെതിൽ നിന്നു പിരിയേണ്ട കുടിശ്ശിക സംബന്ധിച്ചു മാത്രമേ തർക്കമുള്ളൂ. ലത്തീൻ സഹോദരികൾ അന്നാമശാലയുടെ കണക്കുകളും കൂടെ ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടിട്ടുണ്ട്. അത് അവരെ സംബന്ധിക്കുന്നതല്ലാത്തതിനാൽ അവരെ കാണിക്കുന്നതല്ല. തർക്കം തീരുമാനിക്കുന്നതിനാവശ്യമായ കണക്കുപുസ്തകങ്ങൾ, പരിശോധനയ്ക്കായി മം കപ്പോന്റെ സൂക്ഷത്തിൽ മറഞ്ഞിട്ടു സമീപമുള്ള ബംഗ്ലാവിൽ ലഭിക്കുന്നതാണ്. എന്നാൽ അദ്ദേഹത്തിന്റെ സൂക്ഷത്തിൽ നിന്നു കൊണ്ടു പോകുന്നതിനോ മാറ്റുന്നതിനോ അനുവദിക്കുന്നതല്ല. കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളുടെ പേർക്കു കണക്കു ശരിയാണോ എന്നു പരിശോധിക്കുന്നതിന് തിരുമേനി ആരെയെങ്കിലും നിയമിക്കണമെന്നാഗ്രഹിക്കുന്നു. ഞാൻ നൽകിയിരിക്കുന്ന നിർദ്ദേശങ്ങളിൽ നിന്നും, പത്രമേനി സംബന്ധിച്ച കണക്കുകൾ അന്നാവശ്യമായി ഇനിയും മെത്രാന്മാരോടു ചോദിക്കാതെ തീരുമാനിക്കാമെന്നതു വ്യക്തമാണല്ലോ.</p> | <p>given by the Superior of the Koonammavu convent. There are doubts only regarding the patrimony of Sr. Anna. For others the uncertainty is about the arrears from the tenants. The Latin sisters are requested to show them the accounts of the orphanage also. As it is not regarding them, I am not allowing them to check it. For settling the disputes, the account books are available in the bungalow near to the convent under the patronage of the chaplain. But it is not allowed to take them from there. You should appoint somebody to check the accounts for the sisters. I presume that from the instructions it is clear that the accounts regarding the patrimony can be settled without any further discussions with the bishops.</p> |
|--|--|

5.3.5.2. Main Points

- Msgr. Medlycott gives his consent to the request of the Latin sisters to verify the accounts sent by the superior of Koonammavu convent on certain conditions.
- According to him the dispute is only about the patrimony of Sr. Anna as well as the arrears from the tenants. The Vicar Apostolic of Trichur does not allow the request of the Latin sisters to examine the account book pertaining to the orphanage.
- Msgr. Medlycott informs the Archbishop that the above mentioned account books will be available in the

bungalow near to the convent under the patronage of the chaplain. But they cannot be taken out from there.

- The Vicar Apostolic requests Msgr. Mellano to appoint somebody to be present when the Latin sisters check the accounts.
- Msgr. Medlycott hopes that the above mentioned permissions from him will definitely settle the issue concerning the accounts and end the recourse to the Ecclesiastical authorities for interfering in that matter.

5.3.5.5.3. Comments

- This letter also discloses the open-mindedness of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur concerning the issues raised by the Latin sisters on patrimony and other matters. He allows the Latin sisters to go to Koonammavu and check the account books regarding the patrimony of Sr. Anna and the arrears from the tenants.
- The steps taken by him that the account books can be checked in the bungalow near the Koonammavu convent in the presence of the Chaplain as well as the representative of Msgr. Mellano are very prudent and pragmatic. This is especially clear in his instructions that the documents cannot be taken outside. Also as an able administrator he refuses the Latin sisters to get access to the account books of the orphanage. Msgr. Medlycott knew well that the issue was definitively decided and settled by the Apostolic Delegate in his correspondence with Msgr. Mellano. Further opening up of the matter by the Latin sisters will bring out unnecessary and unchristian claims and counter claims which will disturb the religious peace and decorum that are expected from the consecrated persons.

5.3.5.6.Third Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to the Superior of Koonammavu Convent dated 3rd January 1891

In this letter, Msgr. Medlycott takes a more precautionary step.

5.3.5.6.1. Original Letter

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>തൃശൂർനിന്നും, 1891 മകരം 3-ന് കുനമ്മാവു കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മഠത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി ഈശോയുടെ കത്രിനായ്ക്ക്</p> <p>ബ. പറവൂർ വികാരിയുടെ സഹായം വെച്ചു താങ്കൾക്ക് നാം അയച്ച കത്തിനനുബന്ധമായി നിങ്ങളുടെ കണക്കുകൾ പരിശോധിക്കുന്ന സമയം കണക്കുകളുടെ നിശ്ചയം ഇല്ലാതെ താങ്കളുടെ വിവരണത്തിനു വിപരീതമായി എന്തെങ്കിലും സംഭവിക്കാതെ ഇരിക്കേണ്ടതിലേയ്ക്ക് എ.പെ.ബ.ദെലഗാത്തച്ചനോ, അമ്പഴക്കാട്ടു കൊവേന്തയുടെ പ്രിയോരച്ചനോ കുനമ്മാവുകൽ വരുന്നതിന് അപേക്ഷിക്കണമെന്നു കൂടി നിങ്ങളോടുപദേശിക്കുന്നതു കൊള്ളാമെന്നു നാം കരുതുന്നു. ഈ മുൻ കരുതൽ ചെയ്യുന്നതിന് അമാന്തിക്കരുത്. വാഴ്വു തന്നു നിറുത്തുന്നു. മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ടുമെത്രാൻ</p> | <p>From Trichur 1891 January 3.</p> <p>To the superior of the Koonammavu convent Catherine of Jesus,</p> <p>I would like to advise you to request to Most Rev. Fr. Delegate or the Prior of Ambazhakkattu monastery to come to the convent. It is for the letter I send to you as an appendix to the help of the Vicar of Parur, when the checking of your accounts progressing, there won't be anything happened against your narration. Do not make any delay to act according to this advice. I remain with giving you my blessing.</p> <p>Bishop Medlycott.</p> |

5.3.5.6.2. Main Points

- The Vicar Apostolic takes every precautionary step so that no unpleasant and unjust things may happen during the scrutiny. He asks the mother superior to request the provincial delegate and the prior of the Ambazhakkattu

monastery¹²⁶ to be present during the scrutiny. She should not make any delay to take this precautionary step.

5.3.5.6.3. Comments

- Msgr. Medlycott was very meticulous in conducting the scrutiny impartially and fairly. For this, he gives attention to very possible and eventual mis-happening.
- It is very prudent from his part in not directly asking the Provincial Delegate and the prior of Ambazhakkattu monastery to get involved. This he does through the agency of Sr. Catherine.

5.3.5.7. Letter of Sr. Catherine, the Superior of the Convent to Msgr. Medlycott, written in January 1891¹²⁷

The superior of Koonammavu convent expresses her willingness to comply with the arrangement made by Msgr. Medlycott for the settlement of the issue of patrimony.

5.3.5.7.1. Original Document

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>കുനമ്മാവ് ഭദ്രസഭാ പുണ്യവാളത്തിയുടെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മഠത്തിൽ നിന്നും 1891 -ാം കാലം മകരം എ. ഐ. ഐ. ബ. ഞ. പിതാവേ, ലത്തീൻ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളുടെ പത്രമോനി വസ്തുക്കളുടെ കണക്കു തീർത്തുകൊടുക്കുന്ന കാര്യത്തെ</p> | <p>From the Convent of St. Tresa's, Koonammavu, January 1891 Our Most Rev. Father, We have received the letter from you about the matter of settling the accounts of</p> |

¹²⁶The Malayalam text at its face value may be understood as ‘either or’ clause. But it is more relevant for the context to interpret it as ‘and and’ clause. This become more clear from the next letter of mother Catherine to Msgr. Medlycott.

¹²⁷ No date is given. But it is clear from the content that the letter was written after January 3.

പ്പറ്റി ധനു 31-ാം തീയതി അയച്ച കൽപന കിട്ടി. വിവരം അറിഞ്ഞു. ആ കൽപനയുടെ താൽപര്യം പോലെ നടത്തുന്നതിന് ബ. കപ്പോ നച്ചനും ഞങ്ങളും ആസ്ഥമായിരിക്കുന്നു.

ടി. കൽപനയ്ക്ക് അനുബന്ധമായി മകരം 3-ാം തീയതി എഴുതി അയച്ച എഴുത്ത് ഇന്നു പകൽ 12 മണിക്ക് കിട്ടി. പിതാവിന്റെ ഉപദേശം പോലെ എ.പെ.പെ.ബ.ദെലഗാത്ത് അച്ചനെയെങ്കിലും പെ.ബ.പ്രിയോർ ച്ചനെയെങ്കിലും അപേക്ഷിച്ചു വരുത്താം. ദെലഗാത്തച്ചൻ ഇപ്പോൾ കുന്നമ്മാവ് ബംഗ്ളാവിൽ താമസിക്കുന്നുണ്ട്. എന്നാൽ ഈ അച്ചന്മാരെ ഏർപ്പെടുത്തിയതുകൊണ്ട് ഞങ്ങൾക്കും വലിയ ആശ്വാസവും ഉറപ്പുമായി.

2. മാത്തിന്റെ സമീപം ഒരു പുരയിടം വാങ്ങിക്കുന്നതിന് പിതാവ് മുൻ അനുവദിച്ചത് അതിന്റെ വില കുറേ കുട്ടിപ്പറയുന്നതിനാലും മറ്റും തീർച്ചപ്പെടുത്തി വാങ്ങിച്ചില്ല. എന്നാൽ ഇപ്പോൾ കുറച്ചുകൂടെ ദൂരെ നല്ലതായിട്ട് ഒരു പുരയിടം കൈവശപ്പെട്ട് വന്നിരിക്കയാൽ ആയത് വാങ്ങിപ്പാൻ അനുവദിക്കണമേ.

3. ശാലക്കാർ 10 പേരോളം ഒളിച്ച് പോകാതെ ഇവിടെ നിൽക്കുന്നവർക്ക് ചെലവിന് നെല്ലും പണവും തീർന്നിരിക്കുന്നു. തൽ കാലം ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടിരിക്കുന്നത് മാത്തിൽ നിന്നാണ് അവർക്ക് കൊടുത്തുവരുന്നത്. എന്നുതന്നെയല്ല, ഇവരിൽ മൂന്നുനാലു പേർ കെട്ടിക്കാൻ പ്രായമായി നിൽക്കുന്നു. എന്നാൽ കെട്ടിച്ചുവിടുന്ന ഓരോരുത്തർക്കും ഉടുതുണികളും മറ്റും കൂടാതെ 200 രൂപയോളം കൊടുത്തുകൊണ്ടാണ് മുപ്പച്ചൻ വിട്ടിരിക്കുന്നത്. ഈ വക ചെലവുകൾക്ക് എന്തു ചെയ്യേണ്ടു. ഇവരെ അയച്ച് വിവാഹം കഴിപ്പിക്കുന്നതിന് അനുവദിപ്പാറാകണമേ. പിതാവിന് പ്രയാസം കൂടാതെ ഞങ്ങളുടെ എഴുത്ത് വായിച്ചറിയുന്നതിനായി ഞങ്ങളുടെ കപ്പോനച്ച

patrimonial properties on 31st December.

Our chaplain as well as we are ready to accomplish the things as per the command. We also received today at 12 o'clock, the letter sent to us on 3rd January. According to your advice, we may request to most Rev. Fr. Delegate or Rev. Fr. Prior to come here. Fr. Delegate is now staying at Koonammavu bungalow. We feel great relief and strength now as these fathers are entrusted.

2. We did not buy the plot near to the convent even though we got the permission from you earlier, because they are rendering a huge prize. But now another plot is available better than the previous one. So please give us permission to buy that one.

3. The rice and money for the sustenance of the remaining 10 orphans are finished. Their needs are meeting from the convent now. Besides that, some of them are now reached at the marriageable age. So far Mooppachan gave all of them who got married and left from here clothings and around Rs. 200/- Now what we need to do for these type of expenses? Please give permission to send them

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>നെക്കൊണ്ട് ലത്തീനിൽ ആക്കി കൊടുത്തയയ്ക്കുന്നു. പിതാവിന്റെ ശരീര സൗഖ്യത്തിനും അങ്ങുന്ന് ആഗ്രഹിക്കുന്ന എല്ലാ കാര്യങ്ങളുടെ ശുഭ വർദ്ധനയ്ക്കായും അയോഗ്യമക്കളായിരിക്കുന്ന ഞങ്ങളുടെ പാവപ്പെട്ട നമസ്കാരങ്ങളിൽ എല്ലായ്പോഴും അപേക്ഷിച്ചു വരുന്നു. ഇനി ഏറ്റം താൽപര്യമായി അപേക്ഷിക്കയും ചെയ്യാം. ലത്തീൻ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ ചോദിക്കുന്ന മാന്ത്രിന്റെ ന്യായപ്രമാണവും ക്രമപുസ്തകവും ഓരോ പകർപ്പ് എടുപ്പിച്ച് അവർക്കു കൊടുത്തു. ഈശോയുടെ കത്രിനാ, മാഞ്ഞുരാൻ</p> | <p>away in marriage. We have translated this letter to Latin by our Fr. Chaplain for you to read it easily. We always pray for all your intentions and for your good health in all our humble prayers. We promise our prayers in future also. As per the request of the Latin sisters, we gave them a copy of our <i>Regola</i> and Order of Regulations. Catherine of Jesus, Manjooran.</p> |
|---|--|

5.3.5.7.2. Main Points

- The sisters express their readiness to do what is asked for, from them. The superior informs Msgr. Medlycott that the Provincial Delegate (Fr. Philip) presently is at Koonammavu.
- Sr. Catherine intimates the Vicar Apostolic that she had taken copies of the *Regola* and the Order of Regulations and given to the Latin sisters.
- The financial difficulties that the sisters had to encounter are also mentioned in the letter. They are supporting 10 girls from their own resources. Another problem mentioned in the letter is that 3 or 4 girls have attained the marriageable age. Fr. Philip had used to give everyone at the time of marriage all the necessary dresses as well as Rs. 200/- Now the sisters do not know where to find funds to give the dress and dowry. Sr. Catherine concludes this issue by asking Msgr. Medlycott to give permission for conducting the marriage of these girls.

- Other points mentioned in the letter are not concerned with the issue of patrimony and hence we omit them.

5.3.5.7.3. Comments

- This letter from the Syrian sisters of Koonammavu convent attests that they were very happy to comply with the suggestions of Msgr. Medlycott in the hope that the burning issues concerning the patrimony of the Latin sisters will be settled once forever.
- The superior has done a very wise act by giving immediately the copies of the *Regola* and the Order of Regulations although she had to hand over such documents when the Latin sisters come for checking the account books.
- The letter speaks of the financial difficulties which the sisters had to face in maintaining 10 orphan girls. They do not have the income from the paddy field and had to sustain the girls out of the money from the convent. Another burning issue is how to find money for conducting the marriage of 3-4 girls. Sr. Catherine smartly asks the permission of Msgr. Medlycott to conduct the marriages, without directly appealing for his financial help.

5.3.5.8. Letters of Msgr. Medlycott (dated 20th January 1891) and Sr. Catherine, the Superior of the Convent (dated 26th January 1891)

We find certain anomaly in the chronological order of the letters. The letter of Msgr. Medlycott gives precise order on the issues adduced by Sr. Superior in her letter dated 26th January 1891. Hence the logic demands that we cite first Sr. Catherine and then the Letter of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.

5.3.5.8.1. Original Document I – Letter of Sr. Catherine

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>കുനമ്മാവ് ത്രേസയാ പുണ്യവാളത്തിയുടെ കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മഠത്തിൽ നിന്നും</p> <p>1891 മകരം 26-ന്</p> <p>എ. പെ. ബ. ഞങ്ങളുടെ പിതാവേ, ലത്തീൻ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ അവരുടെ വസ്തുക്കളുടെ കണക്കുകൾ നോക്കി വിവരപ്പെടുത്തുന്നതിനായിരിക്കുമല്ലോ അവർ ഇവിടെ വരുന്നതിന് പിതാവ് അവർക്ക് അനുവദിച്ചത്. എന്നാൽ ഞങ്ങളുടെ കഴിഞ്ഞ എഴുത്തിൽ പിതാവിനെ ബോധിപ്പിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നതുപോലെ അവർ ഇവിടെ വന്നിട്ട് അവരുടെ വസ്തുക്കളുടെ വിവരങ്ങൾ എടുത്തു പോകുന്നതിനല്ല നോക്കുന്നത്. പിന്നെയോ മഠത്തിന്റെ കണക്കുപുസ്തകങ്ങളെല്ലാം പരിശോധിച്ച് ഇവിടത്തെ സാമാനങ്ങളുടെ തുകകളും കാലം ചെയ്ത വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചന്റേ ഇപ്പോഴത്തെ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചന്റേ മറ്റും മഠത്തിനു പൊതുവായിട്ടു തന്നിരിക്കുന്നതും ഇവിടെ ചെലവായി പോയിരിക്കുന്നതുമായ പണത്തുകകളും മറ്റു വരവു ചെലവുകളും കണക്കുപുസ്തകങ്ങളിൽ നിന്ന് പകർത്തി എടുത്തു വ്യഥാ താമസത്തിനിടവരുത്തുന്നു. അവരുടെ കണക്കുകളെ വിവരപ്പെടുത്തുന്നതിനാണെങ്കിൽ മഠത്തിന്റെ ആദ്യകണക്കുപുസ്തകങ്ങളും അവരുടെ ആധാരങ്ങളും മതിയായിരിക്കുന്നു. എന്നാൽ അവർ അവരുടെ കണക്കുകളെ നോക്കിയിരുന്നെങ്കിൽ ആയത് എടുക്കുന്നതിന് മൂന്നു നാലു ദിവസം വേണ്ടുവോളം മതിയായിരുന്നു. ഈ താമസം വീണ്ടും വീണ്ടും അവരുടെ പാദ്രി അച്ചന്മാരോട് ആലോചിച്ച് ഉപായമായി ഓരോരോ കണക്കുകളെ ചേർത്ത് എ. പെ. ബ. ദെലഗാത്ത് അപ്പ</p> | <p>St. Tresa's Convent Koonammavu 1891 January 26</p> <p>Our most Rev. Father,</p> <p>You might have allowed the Latin sisters to come here for checking and verifying the accounts regarding their properties. But, as we have mentioned in our last letter, when they came here, they are not trying to collect the details of their properties. Instead, while examining the account books of the convent, they are taking the details of the amounts of the things in the convent and simply wasting their time by copying from the account books the details of the amounts donated to the convent by the previous and present Archbishops of Verapoly, which were spent here and other payment and receipt details from the account books. If they need to collect their accounts, they need only the first account books of the convent and their deed bonds, the checking of which might have finished within three or four days. By this delay, they consulted with their Fathers and cunningly including one or other accounts and informed all those to the Apostolic</p> |

സ്തോലിക്കായെ അവർ ബോധിപ്പിച്ച് ഈ കാര്യങ്ങളുടെ വിവരം അറിഞ്ഞിട്ടില്ലാത്ത അദ്ദേഹം വഴിയായി ഇവിടത്തെ സാമാനങ്ങളേയും മറ്റും കൊണ്ടു പോകുന്നതിന് പ്രമാണം വരുത്തിക്കുന്നതിനും വേണ്ടിയായിരിക്കണം.

ഇതുതന്നെയല്ല ഇവരെ ഇവിടെ കൊണ്ടുവന്ന മഞ്ഞുമേൽ കൊവേനക്കാരനായ ബ. ജൂയിസ് പാട്രിയച്ചൻ കുന്നമ്മാവിൽ താമസിച്ചുകൊണ്ട് പലപ്രാവശ്യം മാത്തിന്റെ സംസാര മുറിയിൽ വന്ന് ഈ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ രണ്ടുപേരോടും സംസാരിക്കുകയും മറ്റു പല പാട്രിമാരേയും പുറമേയുള്ള അവരുടെ സംബന്ധികളേയും മറ്റും സംസാരമുറിയിൽ വരുത്തി ഈ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകളെ കാണിക്കുകയും ദിവസത്തിൽ പല എഴുത്തുകളെ അങ്ങോട്ടുമിങ്ങോട്ടും വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാനച്ചനും പീലിപ്പോസ് മുപ്പച്ചനും പാട്രിമാർക്കും കൊടുത്തയയ്ക്കുകയും വാങ്ങിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യുകയാൽ ഞങ്ങൾക്ക് അനാവശ്യബുദ്ധിമുട്ടിനും കലക്കത്തിനും ക്രമങ്ങളുടെ അഴിവിനും ഇടയായിരിക്കുന്നു. പിതാവ് ഇവിടെ വന്നപ്പോൾ ഞങ്ങളോടു കൽപിച്ച പ്രകാരം ഇപ്പോൾ സമാധാനത്തോടെ റെഗുല സൂക്ഷമായി കാത്തുവരികയിൽ വീണ്ടും അവർ ഈ കലക്കത്തിനിടയാക്കുന്നു. ആകയാൽ ഇനിയെങ്കിലും വേഗത്തിൽ അവരുടെ കണക്കുകൾ തീർത്തുപോകുന്നതിന് കൽപിക്കണമേ.

പിതാവ് ഇവിടെ വന്നപ്പോൾ പറഞ്ഞതുപോലെ മരിച്ചുപോയ ലത്തീൻ സഹോദരിയുടെ അവകാശ വസ്തുക്കൾ അവർക്കുകൊടുക്കുന്നതിന് വരാപ്പുഴ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചൻ മുട്ടിക്കുന്നു. ആകയാൽ അവരുടെ വക മൂന്നായി ഭാഗം ചെയ്ത് രണ്ടു പങ്ക് അവർക്കു കൊടുക്കണമെന്നും മരിച്ചുപോയ ആളിന്റെത് അവർക്കു

Delegate. It may be through the Apostolic Delegate who do not know the details of these matters, getting the legal document for taking the possessions from here.

Not only that, Rev. Fr. Louis of Manjummel monastery who brought them here, staying in the Koonammavu monastery used to come here very often to talk to these two sisters. He used to bring other priests [*padirimar*] and the relatives of these sisters to the parlour. Because of their sending and receiving letters many times a day to the Archbishop of Verapoly, to Rev. Philip Mooppachan and to other priests caused unnecessary difficulties, disturbance and disorder in the observance of the rules. We were observing the *Regola* and were living peacefully as the instructions given by you when you came here. But now their arrival has caused disturbance once again. Therefore, kindly tell them to conclude their checking of the accounts and leave the place.

As per your order we need not give the deceased person's patrimony to them. But now, the Archbishop of Verapoly is forcing us to give back the patrimonial goods of the Latin sister [*Sr. Anna*] who died. Therefore dividing their due amount into three and if the

കൊടുക്കാനാവശ്യമില്ല എന്നും പിതാവു കൽപിച്ചപ്പോൾ രണ്ടു പങ്കു നീക്കി ഞങ്ങൾക്കു വീട്ടേണ്ടുന്ന കടവും തീർത്താൽ പിന്നെ അൽപമേ ഉണ്ടാകയുള്ളൂ എന്നു ഞാൻ വിചാരിച്ചു അവരുടെ മേലുള്ള ഉപവിയെക്കുറിച്ചും ഈ ജനങ്ങളുടെ അലോഹ്യം ഞങ്ങളുടെ മേലുണ്ടാകാതിരിപ്പാൻ വേണ്ടിയും ഞങ്ങൾക്കു വീടേണ്ടതു വീട്ടിട്ടു ശേഷമുള്ളതു കൊടുത്തു കൊള്ളാം എന്നു പിതാവിനോടു ഞാൻ പറഞ്ഞുപോയി. ആയത് അപ്പോൾ സഹോദരികളോടു ചോദിക്കാതെയാണ് ഉണർത്തിച്ചത്. എന്നാൽ ഇപ്പോൾ ലത്തീൻകാരുടെ ന്യായമറ്റു ഈ പിടുത്തങ്ങൾ കണ്ടിട്ടു ആ വാക്കുകൊണ്ട് എനിക്കു മനസ്താപത്തിനിടയായിരിക്കുന്നു. ആ ലത്തീൻ സഹോദരി ഇവിടെ മരിക്കയും അവരുടെ വസ്തുക്കൾ ഈ മഠത്തിനു യാതൊരു ചോദ്യവുമില്ലാത്ത വിധത്തിൽ തീരു തരികയും ചെയ്കയാൽ തിരികെക്കൊടുപ്പാൻ ന്യായമില്ലാതെയിരിക്കാതെ അനുഗ്രഹം വിചാരിച്ചുകൊടുക്കാമെന്നു വച്ചപ്പോൾ ഇനിയും അലോഹ്യങ്ങളുണ്ടാക്കുവാനാരംഭിക്കുന്നതും ആകയാൽ ഇപ്പോഴുള്ള ആ രണ്ടു സഹോദരികളുടെ മരണം വരേയും രണ്ടു പേർക്കും ചെലവിനുള്ള വക അവരുടെ വസ്തുക്കളിൽ നിന്നുള്ള ഉഭയം കൊണ്ടു ഞങ്ങൾ കൊടുത്തുകൊണ്ടു വസ്തു കൈവിട്ടുകൊടുപ്പാതിരിക്കാൻ തോന്നുന്നു. ആയതല്ലായെങ്കിൽ അവരടങ്ങുന്നതല്ല. ആകയാൽ എന്തു ചെയ്യേണ്ടു. ന്യായം പോലെ കടം തീർക്കുന്നതിന് അവർ സമ്മതിക്കാത്ത പക്ഷം വസ്തു കൈവിട്ടു കൊടുപ്പാൻ പിതാവു കൽപിക്കരുതേ.

ഈ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾ വരാപ്പുഴ പോയി വീണ്ടും തിരികെ വന്നു കണക്കുകളും മറ്റും മുഴുവൻ തീർത്തുകൊള്ളാം എന്നൊരു

2/3 [two third] is given to them after paying back their debt to us then I thought it will be a small amount. Thinking that this amount will be small and out of charity towards them and above all, not to have further disturbance from these people I happened to tell you that we will pay the rest of the amount after deducting their debt. But I told you so without consulting the sisters [community]. Now seeing the unreasonable demands of the Latin sisters I regret of those words. When the Latin sister died here [in 1871] and her properties were registered in the name of the convent without any questions, there was no reason for giving them back [to the Latin sisters]. When I thought of giving the property to them out of charity towards the Latin sisters they create disturbances. Therefore, I think of giving the money for the sustenance of the two Latin sisters till their death from the income of their property without annihilating the land. Otherwise they will not be satisfied. What else can be done? If they are not ready to pay the debt to us reasonably please do not hand over the property [land] to them.

We feel that these sisters are thinking now to go back to Verapoly and finish the

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>ഭാവം അവരുടെ വാക്കുകളിൽ നിന്നും ഞങ്ങൾക്കു തിരിയുന്നു. എന്നാൽ ഇപ്പോൾ തന്നെ അധിക താമസം കൂടാതെ കണക്കുകൾ നോക്കി പോകുന്നതിനല്ലാതെ ഇനി രണ്ടാമതും ഇവിടെ വരുന്നതിന് ഒരു പ്രകാരവും അനുവദിക്കരുത്. അനുവദിച്ചാൽ അതു വലിയ ബിംബിഷ്ടത്തിനും കലക്കത്തിനും ഞങ്ങൾക്ക് ഇടയായിത്തീരും.</p> <p>അവർ മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചന്മാരും പീലിപ്പോസ് മുപ്പച്ചന്മാരും തന്ന ദാനങ്ങളുടെ തുക കൂട്ടുന്നെങ്കിൽ അതിനെക്കായിൽ ഇരട്ടി ദാനങ്ങളും ധർമ്മത്തുകകളും സുറിയാനിക്കാരിൽ നിന്നും ഉണ്ടായിരിക്കുകയും ഇതു പാടുകാരുടെയും ചിലവായിപ്പോയിരിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യുന്നതെല്ലാം മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താച്ചന്മാരും മുപ്പച്ചന്മാരും തന്ന ദാനപ്പണങ്ങൾ ഏറിയ പങ്കും വരാപ്പുഴ മാത്തിന്റെ അമ്മ മുൻ ഇവിടെ വെച്ച് ആറേഴു വർഷം ദീനമായിരിക്കുന്നപ്പോൾ ചെയ്ത സാമാന്യമല്ലാത്ത ചികിത്സകൾക്കും ചെലവുകൾക്കും വേണ്ടിയല്ലാതെ ആയതു ഞങ്ങൾക്കായി ചെലവാക്കിയിട്ടില്ല. എന്ന് ക.ദി.മു.സ. സ. ഈശോയുടെ കത്രീന.</p> | <p>accounts after coming back again. Let them complete the checking of the accounts now itself without much delay and please do not allow them to come back here again to check the accounts. If they are allowed it will create much disturbance and disorder.</p> <p>If they calculate the amount of the gifts given by Philipose Mooppachan and the Archbishop, I am sure that the gifts and donations from the Syrians are double than that of the Latins. All these are spent on those days. Much of those amount was spent on special treatment and other expenses for the mother of Verapoly convent [Sr. Theresa] when she fell sick for six or seven years while she was here. It was not spent for anyone of us. Sr. Catherine of Jesus TOCD.</p> |
|--|---|

5.3.5.8.1.1. Main Points

- Sr. Catherine brings into notice of Msgr. Medlycott that the Latin sisters are not obeying the mandate given to them by him to restrict themselves to check the prescribed documents¹²⁸ and they are freely getting involved in checking all the account books of the convent and by copying them and prolonging their stay at the convent. They would have finished their work within three or four days if they had been obeying

¹²⁸ See above No. 5.3.5.5. 'Letter of Msgr. Medlycott to Msgr. Mellano dated 2nd January 1891.'

strictly the mandate given to them. Even the Latin sisters are consulting the Latin missionaries and craftily adding more things to the accounts and accordingly informing the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Aiuti who does not have the first hand knowledge of the affairs.

- Another malpractice was the behaviour of Fr. Louis, the representative (?) of Msgr. Mellano. He frequently visits the parlour of the convent and speaks to the two Latin sisters and brings other Latin priests and their relatives there. Further he every day sends many letters to the Archbishop of Verapoly, Fr. Philip the Vicar General and other priests and receives letters from them. This creates much disturbances, disorders, difficulties and uneasiness and laxity in the convent.
- The sisters were living till now in peace strictly obeying the *regola*. But the coming of the two Latin sisters has brought agitation and disorder in the community. Hence Sr. Catherine requests Msgr. Medlycott to immediately send the Latin sisters after clearing their accounts.
- Msgr. Mellano is compelling them to give the share of the deceased Sr. Anna. Mother superior reminds the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur of his instruction to divide the portion of the Latin sisters into three and to give them two shares, excluding the dowry of the deceased Sr. Anna. Thinking that if the debts which the Latin sisters own to the Koonammavu convent are solved, they would get only very little, Sr. Catherine had then told the bishop that taking into account the virtue of charity and the possible displeasure which the people would feel, she was willing to hand over them everything what may remain after the debts are cleared. Unfortunately she had given such a promise without consulting other sisters. Now the mother superior feels

sorry about such a promise as she notices the unruly behaviour of the two sisters. She thinks that there is no justice in giving back the properties of the deceased, since she had given the complete rights of it to the convent; as a concession she had formerly thought to give it back, but now she does not feel to do so. Further she is tempted not to give up the properties as such rather only wants to meet the expenses of both of them till their death from the income getting from their properties. Mother Catherine requests Msgr. Medlycott not to compel her to give up the properties if the Latin sisters are unwilling to pay the debts.

- The mother superior requests the bishop not to allow the Latin sisters to come for a second time to verify the accounts since now itself they have taken more days than needed and if they come again that will create more disturbances in the convent.
- If the Latin sisters insist on calculating the amount given by the Archbishops of Verapoly and other missionaries, the amount donated by the Syrians comes more than that. Moreover, the amount spent for 6-7 years for the extraordinary treatment and expenses of the mother of Verapoly convent (Sr. Thresia), while she was sick is much more than the money which they claim to have received from the Archbishops and the missionaries.

5.3.5.8.1.2. Comments

If we take the words of Sr. Catherine at its face value, the two Latin sisters were infringing the mandate strictly given to them. Their prolonged days at Koonammavu seem to justify such an accusation. According to the complaint of the mother superior even Fr. Louis was using his stay to create further troubles which had created disturbance in the

community of the sisters. This would have affected her tolerance and give and take attitude. She seems to have been tempted to take an unyielding position.

5.3.5.8.2. Original Document II – Letter of Msgr. Medlycott

It is more appropriate to read the letter of Msgr. Medlycott as a response to the complaints of the mother superior of the Koonammavu convent.

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ത്രിക്കോമിയായുടെ മെത്രാൻ തൃശൂർ വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കായുമാകുന്ന നാം അഡോൾഫ് മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ടുമെത്രാൻ.</p> <p>കുനമ്മാവു കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മാത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി നമ്മുടെ പ്രിയപ്പെട്ട മകളായ ഈശോയുടെ കത്രീനായ്ക്ക് ആശീർവാദം.</p> <p>താങ്കളുടെ എഴുത്തുകൾ കൈപ്പറ്റി. കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മാത്തിൽ ജനങ്ങൾ പ്രവേശിക്കുന്നതിന് ഒരു പൊതു അനുവാദം ഞാൻ കൊടുത്തില്ലെന്നു താങ്കളെ അറിയിച്ചു കൊള്ളുന്നു. ലത്തീൻകാർ കന്യാസ്ത്രീകൾക്കു കണക്കുകൾ നോക്കുന്നതിനു സഹായിപ്പാൻ ബ. ജൂയിസ് പാദ്രിക്കു നാം എ.പെ.പെ.ബ.മെത്രാപ്പോലീത്താന്റെ എഴുത്താലുള്ള അനുമതി ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നാൽ നിങ്ങളുടെ കപ്പോനച്ചൻ ഒരുമിച്ച് അദ്ദേഹം വരുന്നതിന് അനുവദിക്കാവുന്നതാണ്.</p> <p>നമ്മുടെ എഴുത്തുകളിൽ നാം എഴുതിയിരിക്കുന്നതു പോലെ ലത്തീൻ സഹോദരിമാർ തങ്ങളുടെ പത്രമോനി വക കണക്കുകളെ പരിശോധിക്കുന്നതിന് വരുവാൻ വേണ്ടിയല്ലാതെ മറ്റൊന്നിനും അവർക്കു അനുവദിക്കപ്പെട്ടിട്ടില്ല. ആകയാൽ അവരുടെ പത്രമോനി വക കണക്കുകൾ അടങ്ങിയിരിക്കുന്ന പുസ്തകങ്ങളല്ലാതെ വേറെ ഒന്നും അവരെ കാണിക്കുന്നതിനാവശ്യമില്ല. അവർ താങ്കളുമായി ഒരുമിച്ചു</p> | <p>Bishop Adolf Medlycott, the Bishop of Tricomea and Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.</p> <p>Blessings to my dear daughter in Jesus, the Superior of Koonammavu Convent.</p> <p>I have received your letters. I notify to you that I did not give any common permission for the people to enter into the convent. If Fr. Louis has the written permission from the Archbishop to help the sisters to check the accounts, allow him to come with your Chaplain.</p> <p>As I have written in my letters that Latin sisters have permission only to come for checking the accounts. So you want to show them only the books which would have the accounts related to their patrimony. When they are not settle the things along with you, the problems are</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>കാര്യം തീർച്ചപ്പെടുത്താത്തപക്ഷം തർക്കം തീരുന്നതല്ല. വരാപ്പുഴ മിസ്സത്തിൽ നിന്ന് കൊടുത്തിരിക്കുന്ന യാതൊരു ദാനത്തിലും അവർക്കു യാതൊരു കാര്യവുമില്ല.</p> <p>അവർ ഇപ്പോൾ പല ദിവസം മഠത്തിൽ താമസിക്കുന്നതിനാൽ ഒന്നോ രണ്ടോ ദിവസത്തിനകം തങ്ങളുടെ കാര്യം തീർത്തു പോകണമെന്ന് താങ്കൾ അറിയിക്കണം എന്നു താങ്കളോടു നാം ആവശ്യപ്പെടുന്നു. ഇനി അവർ പോയി രണ്ടാം പ്രാവശ്യം വരുന്നതിനു നാം അനുവദിക്കുന്നതല്ല. അതേന്ത്യ, ആയതനാ വശ്യവും നല്ല ക്രമനടപ്പിനു ദുഷ്യകരവുമാകുന്നു.</p> <p>ഈ നമ്മുടെ കൽപന അവരെ വായിച്ചു കേൾപ്പിക്കുകയും ഈ ഉപദേശങ്ങൾ കാത്തു പ്രവർത്തിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യുക.</p> <p>എന്ന്</p> <p>ത്യശൂർ നമ്മുടെ അരമനയിൽനിന്നും 1891 മകരം 20-ാം തിയതി</p> <p>മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ട് , വികാരി അപ്പസ്തോലിക്കാ, ത്യശൂർ.</p> | <p>not going to over. They have no part in the contributions given from the vicariate of Varapuzha.</p> <p>As they are staying in the convent now, remind them to finish the work and leave within two or three days. I won't allow them to come again after they go from here. Because, it is an unnecessary practice and not good for an orderly life.</p> <p>Read this command of me for them and act according to these advices.</p> <p>From, The Archbishop's House, 20th January, 1891 Medlycott, the Vicar Apostolic</p> |
|---|--|

5.3.5.8.2.1. Main Points

- Bishop Medlycott informs the superior of Koonammavu convent that he had not given any common permission for the people to enter into the convent. If Fr. Louis has the written permission from the Archbishop of Verapoly to help the Latin sisters to check the accounts, he can do so in the company of Fr. Chaplain.
- He makes clear that the Latin sisters have permission only to check out the account books concerning their patrimony. Thus Sr. Catherine needs to show them only such account books.
- The Latin sisters should not get involved in the affairs of the donations of the Verapoly Archdiocese.

- He demands the superior to remind the Latin sisters who had come over to Koonammavu that they had to finish their work and leave within two or three days, and they will not get permission to come again to Koonammavu. Sr. Catherine has to read out to the Latin sisters this order of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.

5.3.5.8.2.2. Comments

Nobody can find fault with this kind of response of Msgr. Medlycott. He is benevolent and at the same time strict. He stands firm in the matter of discipline.

5.3.5.9. The CKC Account dated On 22nd January, 1891 on the Stay of Latin Sisters at Koonammavu (CKC II, 147)

We have a very brief mention in CKC about the stay of the two Latin sisters in the convent at Koonammavu to examine the account books on properties and dowries.

5.3.5.9.1. Original Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| 1891-ാം കാലം മകരം 22-ന് വരാപ്പുഴ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി സ. ത്രേസ്യായും ടി. കുട്ടുകാരത്തിയായ സ. ബയത്രിസും അവരുടെ വസ്തുക്കളുടെ കണക്കു പരിശോധിക്കുന്നതിനായി ഇവിടെ വന്നു. ടി. മാസം 31-ന് ടി. സഹോദരികൾ ഇവിടെ നിന്നു പോയി. | 22 nd January 1891 Sr. Thresia, the mother superior of Verapoly and Sr. Beatrice the companion came here to examine the accounts of their properties and went back on 31 st of this month. |

5.3.5.9.2. Comments

The Latin sisters spent nine days at Koonammavu convent. According to the letter of Sr. Catherine to Medlycott,¹²⁹ they would have fulfilled the mandate given to them within three or four days. We could surmise that they

¹²⁹ See above No. 5.3.5.8.1. ‘Original Document 1 – Letter of Sr. Catherine.’

could not prolong their stay at Koonammavu on account of the order of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur.¹³⁰

5.3.5.10. The Order of Msgr. Medlycott over the issue of Patrimony dated 18th October, 1891

Vajrajubilee Smarakam page 9 mentions that the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur was entrusted to take the final decision on the issue of properties. The text of this order is taken from the *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* which seemingly by mistake printed the year 1898 instead of 1891. It has got a prefix: a copy of the order is given below (കുറവ്)

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>തിന് ആസ്ഥമായിരിക്കുന്നു. വസ്തു മം വകയാകുന്നു.</p> <p>നിലങ്ങൾ</p> <p>(1) മടപ്പാട് നിലം (2) മുട്ടുകുറു നിലം (3) തിമപ്പൻ പറമ്പിലേ നിലം (4) കപ്പിത്താൻ പറമ്പിലേ നിലം (5) പുതുവൽ നിലത്തിനു കരം പണം പതിനേഴേ അരയ്ക്കാൽ (6) ആനച്ചാലിനു കരം പണം ഒന്നേ കാലേമാഹാണി</p> <p>പാട്ടക്കുടിശ്ശിഖയുടെ പട്ടിക.</p> <p>വാകയിൽ ആഗസ്തി 3 പറ, 87-ാം കാലത്തിൽ 20, 88-ാം കാലത്തിൽ 11. 89-ാം കാലത്തിൽ 20. ആകെ നെല്ല് പറ 71-ൽ 14 പറ നെല്ല് എളവു ചെയ്തു എന്ന് കണക്കിൽ കാണാത്തതിനാൽ സമ്മതമില്ല.</p> <p>പണം വക.</p> <p>(1) പാടത്തു പറമ്പിൽ ഐപ്പ് 33രൂ. 10പു. 7 പണം. (2) വാകയിൽ ആഗസ്തി 9 രൂ. 6 പുത്തൻ 7പണം. (3) വാകയിൽ തൊമ്മൻ വറിയത് 23 രൂ. 6പു. 7പണം. (4) തേങ്ങാപ്പുരയ്ക്കൽ പാപ്പു. 19 രൂ. 2പു. 4പണം. (5) കറുത്ത വറിയത് 10രൂ. 16പു. 2പണം. (6) വടക്കൻ കൊച്ചവുസ്സേ 5രൂ. 14 പുത്തൻ 4 പണം. ആകെ 101 രൂപ, 17 പുത്തൻ 1 പണം.</p> <p>സാമാനങ്ങൾ മുൻ കൊണ്ടു പോകാത്തതിനാൽ കൊടുപ്പാനുള്ളത്.</p> <p>(1) പത്താഴം (2) 40 പറ കൊള്ളുവാൻ തക്ക പത്താഴം (3) ചെറിയ ഉരുളി (4) ചെറിയ തുടൽ വിളക്ക് (5) ചെറിയ ഭരണി (6) കാൽപ്പെട്ടി</p> <p>കൊണ്ടു പോയ സാമാനങ്ങൾ</p> <p>(1) കട്ടിൽ 6. (2) മേശ 3. (3)</p> | <p>Anna. The property belongs to the convent.</p> <p>Paddy Fields</p> <p>(1) <i>Madappadu Nilam</i> (2) <i>Muttukooru Nilam</i> (3) <i>Thimappan Parambile Nilam</i> (4) <i>Kappithan Parambile Nilam</i> (5) <i>the debt on puthuval Nilam Panam Pathinezhe Arayckal</i> (6) <i>Duty on Anachal Panam Onne kale Mahani</i></p> <p>Table of lease arrears</p> <p>Vakayil Augusthy 3 <i>parra</i>, 20 in the year 87, 11in the year 88, 20 in the year 89. Total Paddy (rice), the accounts did not show the details of discount of 14 <i>parra</i> in the year 71. So it is not acceptable.</p> <p>As Money</p> <p>(1) Padathuparambil Augusthy Rs. 33/-, 10 puthen, 7 <i>panam</i>¹³² (2) Vakayil Augusthy Rs. 9/-, puthen, 7 <i>panam</i>. (3) Vakayil Thomman Variathu Rs. 23/-, 6 Puthen, 7 <i>panam</i> (4) Thengapurackal Pappu Rs. 19/-, 2 puthen and 4 <i>panam</i> (5) Karutha Variath Rs. 10/-, 16 Puthen and 2 <i>panam</i>. (6) Vadakkan Kochose Rs. 5/-, 14 puthen, 4 <i>panam</i>, total Rs. 101/-, 17 puthen, 1 <i>Panam</i>.</p> <p>The things which have to be given as they are not taken earlier:</p> <p>(1) Corn loft (2) Corn loft which will contain 40 <i>Parra</i>'s.(3) Small</p> |
|--|---|

¹³² A silver coin which was in circulation at that time.

ചെറിയ വെട് 5. (4) പെട്ടി 2. (5) ഓട്ടുവിളക്ക് 3. (6) കോളമ്പി 3. (7) കിണ്ണൻ 1. (8) ഇഗ്നാസിയോസ് പുണ്യവാളന്റെ ധ്യാനപുസ്തകം പുതുകുന്യാസ്ത്രീവക 1.

മേൽപ്പറഞ്ഞ വസ്തുക്കളെ വിട്ടുകൊടുക്കുന്നതിനുമുമ്പ് ആലപ്പാടൻ വാവയോടു വാങ്ങിച്ചനിലം പറ 6, വാകയിൽ ആഗസ്തിക്ക് നിലം പറ 20, പാട്ടത്തിനു കൊടുത്തിരിക്കുന്ന ഈ നിലം മം വകയായകൊണ്ടും മഠത്തിന്റെ വകയായി അന്നായുടെ പേരിൽ വാങ്ങിച്ചിരിക്കുകൊണ്ടും പേരിൽ ഒഴുമുറി ചെയ്തു കൊടുക്കേണ്ടതാണ്.

കുന്നമ്മാവു കന്യാസ്ത്രീ മഠത്തിലെ സഹോദരികൾ നമ്മുടെ കൽപ്പനപ്രകാരം ലത്തീൽ സഹോദരികൾക്കു വിട്ടുകൊടുപ്പാനുള്ളതായി മഠത്തിലുള്ള സാമാനങ്ങളുടെയും വസ്തുക്കളുടെയും സൂക്ഷ്മുള്ള പട്ടിക ഇതത്രേ ആകുന്നു. ഇതല്ലാതെ വിട്ടുകൊടുക്കുന്നതിനു മറ്റൊന്നുമില്ല. ഇതുകൊണ്ടു കാര്യങ്ങളെല്ലാം അവസാനിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യും. കൈമാറ്റം ഉടനേതന്നെ ചെയ്യേണ്ടതാണ്. കുടിയ്ക്കിയുള്ളത് ഒന്നുകിൽ റൊക്കം കൊടുക്കുകയോ അല്ലാത്ത പക്ഷം സുറിയാനി സഹോദരികൾക്കായി കച്ചീട്ടെഴുതി കൊടുക്കുകയോ വേണം. ഒടുവിൽ പറഞ്ഞിരിക്കുന്ന ആധാരം മാറി എഴുതിക്കൊടുക്കയും വേണം.

ഇത് 1891-ാം കാലം തുലാം 18^{ന്} ബി. മെഡ്ലിക്കോട്ട് (ഒപ്പ്) ജോൺ മേനാച്ചേരി, സെക്രട്ടറി, (ഒപ്പ്).
(വജ്രജുമ്പിലി സ്മാരകം പേജ് 111-112)

Uruli (Vase made of bell-metal). (4) small chain latern (5) small jar (6) wooden box

The things taken earlier:-

(1) cots 6 (2) small table 3 (3) small bench 5. (4) Box 2. (5) Bronze latern 3. (6) Spittunes 3. (7) Plate 1. (8). Retreat book of St. Ignatious, the property of novice 1.

Before giving these things, the paddy field of 6 *parra's* bought from Alappadan Vava and the 20 *parra's* of field which is leased to Vakayil Augusthy belonged to the convent even though they were bought in the name of Sr. Anna. These two fields have to be rewritten in the name of the convent.

The list of the properties which have to be given to the Latin sisters according to the command of me, by the sisters of Koonammavu convent are only these. Besides these there is nothing remaining. By this, the matters will be settled. The transaction should be done immediately. Arrears should be given soon or give a written document (*kacheettu*) to them. The last mentioned deed document should be written accordingly and handed over.

18th October, 1891
Bishop Medlycott (sd/-)
John Menachery, Secretary (sd/-)

5.3.5.10.1. Main Points

- Msgr. Medlycott gives the list of 8 items which the Latin sisters had already given when they left Koonammavu for Verapoly.
- Then the Order gives the list of land and paddy fields which are given to the convent as the patrimony of Sr. Anna and they have now to give back in the light of the final settlement.
 - o Five lands are listed and as far as the fourth one *Veliathuparambu* is concerned it is said that it was mortgaged for 800 puthen when it was given to the convent and the convent had paid that debt; therefore the land belongs to the convent and 800 puthen will be given to the Latin sisters.

Six paddy fields were there as the patrimony of Sr. Anna which are to be given back.

- Also they are to be given the lease arrears of 57 *parra* paddy (although the total is 71 *parra*, 14 *parra* has not been seen in the account as discount. Therefore that is not to be considered.) and Rs. 101/-, 17 *Puthen*, 1 *Panam*.
- As well as six items (which they had not taken with them when they left Koonammavu).
- These are the only things which have to be given to the Latin sisters by the Syrians, nothing else. By this all disputes should be settled.
- The Latin sisters have to rewrite the deed document concerning the two paddy fields of 26 *parra*, which were bought for the convent in the name of Sr. Anna,

and give their ownership to the convent of Koonammavu.

- Msgr. Medlycott also insisted that the transaction should be done immediately and the arrears should be given as early as possible either as Rupees or give a written document (*kacheettu*).
- The verdict is signed by both the Vicar Apostolic and his secretary Fr. John Menacherry.

5.3.5.10.2. Comments

- Objective historians will evaluate the order of the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur as impartial, which obliges both parties to give back things, deeds and money. Even the *Souvenir of the Golden Jubilee of the Varapuzha convent* designates the order of Msgr. Medlycott as a just order (*നീതിപരം*) and says: “by this just order the Latin sisters got their share which they had to from the Koonammavu convent. Thus they could overcome their difficulties to some extent.” (

).¹³³ Even Sr. Sucey who usually finds fault with the decisions and orders taken by the Ecclesiastical authorities in favour of the Syrian sisters, thus writes: “in the course of time the material lost was compensated.”¹³⁴

- The fact that Msgr. Medlycott mentions the list of 8 items which the Latin sisters have taken with them when they left Koonammavu invalidates the statement

¹³³ *Souvenir of the golden Jubilee of the Varapuzha convent*, 32.

¹³⁴ *SGME*, 368.

of Sr. Suicy that they were left with nothing as well as the general impression that have been circulated among the Latins.

5.3.5.10.3. *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* Regarding the Settlement of the Issue of Patrimony

Vajrajubilee Smarakam thus speaks of the final settlement of the issue on patrimony:

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|--|
| <p>ഇപ്രകാരം സഹോദരി അന്നയുടെ അവകാശമായി മഠത്തിലേയ്ക്കു കൊണ്ടു വന്നതും, തീരാധാര പ്രകാരവും, കടങ്ങൾ വീട്ടിയും, സുറിയാനി സഹോദരികളുടെ പത്രിമോനിയായിപ്പകർന്നും, മഠത്തിന്റേതായിത്തീർന്നതുമായ വസ്തുക്കളും നിലങ്ങളും, മുന്യു കൊണ്ടുപോകാതെ ശേഷിച്ചിരുന്ന സകല സാമാനങ്ങളും വിധി അനുസരിച്ചു സസന്തോഷം വിട്ടുകൊടുത്തു ലത്തീൻ സഹോദരികളെ തൃപ്തരാക്കി (വജ്രജൂബിലി സ്മാരകം പേജ് 111).</p> | <p>Likewise, the plots and fields obtained as the patrimony of Sr. Anna by the deed document and by the clearing of debts, which became the patrimony of Syrian sisters and became the property of the convent, and all other things were given to the Latin sisters as per the verdict and made them satisfied.</p> |

These words from the *Vajrajubilee Smarakam* confirm that the Syrian sisters handed order everything according to the order of Msgr. Medlycott to the Latin sisters and made the Latin sisters happy.

5.4. Concluding Remarks

As we have noted down in No. 5.1. the division of the Vicariate would have flared up the anti-temperaments of both the Latin and the Syrian groups. Hence, we cannot deny that it would have explicitly or implicitly played a part in the issue of the Koonammavu convent, which was entrusted to the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. Thus the arguments of both the

parties cannot be taken as true in its face value. Still one can note that Msgr. Mellano played a prominent part in trying to influence the Vatican authorities into his side. He took leadership and seems to have used the God given ingenuity to misrepresent the facts and truths.

When one compares the letters and correspondences of the Latin and Syrian sisters, it becomes clear that they contain truths, half truths and fabrications. Errors are not lacking even in the letters of the Apostolic Delegate Msgr. Aiuti and Msgr. Medlycott, the Vicar Apostolic of Trichur. Concerning Msgr. Mellano, one will be tempted to say that he was purposely trying to distort and misrepresent the events in favour of the Latin party. Evaluating the whole claims and counter claims, allegations and insistence to check the records and account books, one may wonder whether the real motive behind them was to get the possession of the properties of Sr. Anna and the moneys invested by the Ecclesiastical authorities of Verapoly. Also the impression that the instigated flight of the orphan girls from Koonammavu was brought out for the purpose of getting possession of the assets and interests of the orphanage cannot be categorically rejected.¹³⁵ All will agree that the final

¹³⁵ “Accounts show that for the orphanage about 841 measures of paddy fields were allotted in the areas such as Kunnukara, Elookara, Valluvalli, Kottuvalli, Thathappalli, Karumallor, Neerkode and Choornikara and for ten years the fruits of these lands were received by the orphanage of Koonammavu convent. Besides these, detailed accounts are available to prove that about Rs. 15200/- were given for interest to Thaliyam, Kattiparambi, Vithayathi, Bavuchetty and Parayi and Rs. 912/- were received each year as interest by the orphanage” (അനാഥ മന്ദിരത്തിനായി 841 പറയ്ക്ക് നിലം പുരയിടങ്ങൾ കുന്നുകര, ഏലൂക്കര, വള്ളുവള്ളി, കോട്ടുവള്ളി, തത്തപ്പള്ളി, കരുമാലൂർ, നീർക്കോട്, ചൂർണ്ണിക്കര എന്നീ പ്രദേശങ്ങളിലായി പിടിച്ചിട്ടിരുന്നതായും ഇവയിൽ നിന്നുള്ള ആദായം കുന്നമ്മാവു മഠത്തിന്റെ അനാഥശാല ഏകദേശം 10 കൊല്ലത്തോളം അനുഭവിച്ചു വന്നിരുന്നതായും കണക്കുകൾ തെളിയിക്കുന്നു. കൂടാതെയും 15200 രൂപാ തളിയം, കാട്ടിപ്പുറമ്പി, വിയത്ത, ബാവച്ചെട്ടി, പാറായി, എന്നിവർക്കായി പലിശയ്ക്കു കൊടുത്തിരുന്നതായും ആണ്ടുതോറും 912 രൂപാ പലിശ അനാഥശാലയ്ക്കു

verdict taken by Msgr. Medlycott was equitable, which helped to solve the issue definitively.

ലഭിച്ചിരുന്നതായും വിശദമായ കണക്കുകൾ ഉണ്ട്: *Vajra Jubilee Smarakam*, 59). “The reality was that Fr. Philip was handling all the assets and possessions of the orphanage” (അനാഥശാല വക സ്വത്തുക്കൾ മുഴുവൻ പീലിപ്പോസ് മിഷനറി മഠത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠനെന്ന നിലയിൽ സ്വയം കൈകാര്യം ചെയ്ത് അനാഥശാലയുടെ ചെലവ് നടത്തുകയാണ് ചെയ്തിരുന്നത്) (*Vajra Jubilee Smarakam*, 58). Anyhow, either Koonammavu convent or its allied institutions had not got even an insignificant portion of the capital nor a single *paisa*, after wards, though the Holy See has ordered in favour of Koonammavu Convent (*Vajra Jubilee Smarakam*, 59-60).

GENERAL CONCLUSION

By the Providence of God, Fr. Chavara, Fr. Leopold, mother Eliswa and Sr. Anna and Msgr. Bernardine played their specific roles for the beginning of the first indigenous Congregation for women. Fr. Chavara had a great longing for starting monasteries and convents even before his ordination in 1829. He could fulfill half of his dream while he started the monastery at Mannanam along with other two *Malpans* in 1831. Thereafter, his search was for the realization of a convent for women. The opportune time came when Fr. Leopold Beccaro reached Kerala and took charge of Koonammavu parish. The widow Eliswa and her daughter Anna approached Fr. Leopold and expressed their desire for leading a chaste life. Fr. Leopold discerned their vocation and consulted this matter with Fr. Chavara, the first indigenous religious priest. When the Archbishop Bernardine Baccinelli was informed about it, he readily agreed and gave the *Regola*. Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara took the effort to construct the bamboo mat convent on the property of Sr. Anna. Thus came into existence the seed of the first indigenous religious community for women in the humble *panambumadam* on 13th February 1866.

The *Panambumadam* did not have enough facilities for the stay of the sisters. And the money for their sustenance was a great problem. Further one has to be prepared for accepting new candidates who will be soon joining the community. At this juncture Fr. Chavara according to *CMM* thus made a prophetic utterance: “Now on God will provide. That is the hope. But spontaneously acclaimed that before the time to change this bamboo mat and palm leaves, God will

provide a new strong convent....”¹ In *CKC* the chronicler Anna has thus recorded: “Our superiors very Rev. Fr. Delegate and Priorachan said as words of good wishes that ‘God will give a strongly built convent before it is time to re-thatch and renew the bamboo mat and palm leaves.’ We too heard these words....”² We can see the providential hand of God in the words of Fr. Chavara and Fr. Leopold. A new convent was built within eight months as it is attested in the manuscript *Stapakapithakkanmar* written by Fr. Porukkara: “As a miracle within a period of 8 months by collecting around 8000 Rupees as donation, constructed the convent and the things needed for it and made them live there.”³

The land for the new convent was bought from the Koonammavu monastery and two nearby plots which belong to others. Alms were collected by the efforts of Frs. Leopold, Chavara and TOCD fathers. Fr. Chavara played a prominent role in collecting the *Pidiary*. Donations mainly from Syrian parishes were solicited and got. The merciful God came to the assistance of ‘those destitute who had not with them a single *paisa*’ (ഒരു കാര്യമില്ലാതെ അഗതികളായ) so that they could collect Rs. 8000/- without much labour. Both the fathers and sisters found the providential hand of God during the whole process of construction of the convent.⁴

Canonical vestition and blessing of the new convent were conducted on 27th March, 1867. Both Frs. Leopold and

¹*CMM* II, 77 [127]).

²*CKC* I, 45-46.

³*Stapakapithakkanmar* (Mal.), 35.

⁴The phrase ‘the providential hand of God’ is repeated. See for example *CMM* II, 75-76 [126], 91 [136] and in *CKC* I, 6-7, 47-48.

Chavara taught the sisters the minute details of religious lifestyle. The profession of the first members took place on 16th July, 1868. Frs. Chavara and Leopold, Archbishop Bernardine and Sr. Anna the chronicler on behalf of the sisters raised their hearts to the Almighty and merciful Lord with love and gratitude.

The contemporary texts illumine us concerning the foundational spirit and inspiration of the new religious community as well as the lifestyle of the early members. The first indigenous religious community for women had a twofold orientation both vertical and horizontal. The focus was on the first. The initiators of the community wanted to make the convent an abode of virtues (*punnyasanketham*). For achieving this goal the two comrades, Fr. Leopold and Fr. Chavara tried to give formation to the sisters on religious life. Both of them served as spiritual guides and procurators of temporalities. They insisted on renouncing the worldly outlook and to embrace contemplative lifestyle, by cultivating in them love for the Holy family and saints and practising evangelical virtues and vows.

The following aspects individually infused by Frs. Leopold and Chavara need to be stressed. Fr. Leopold served as a father/mother to the community. This spiritual guide inculcated communion and communication with God by encouraging the sisters to cultivate love for Jesus the Spouse, by forming them as beings of trust as well as of gratitude and cheerfulness. He taught them how to live a vowed life, how to grow in silence and solitude, how to practice humility and fidelity, how to cultivate renunciation and penance. Fr. Leopold also took care that the sisters grow in mutual

communion and communication, as well as how to become evangelizers. This spiritual guide infused in the first community these charisms not only by words but by his own example.

We have more texts which speak how Fr. Chavara acted as a formator of this religious community. His paternal/maternal figure irradiates in his letters written to the sisters. They give concrete testimony to his affection towards the sisters. He addressed the sisters 'beloved children', 'my children' and 'dear daughters.' In the letters he appeared as the father who was concerned with the spiritual welfare of the daughters who integrated the spiritual with the material, who kept constant contact with them and who shared the minute details about the health of the Archbishop as well as of his own. *CKC* gives more intimate details of the behaviour of this spiritual guide. He was very particular to combine both terrestrial and celestial dimensions of affection. His affection for the sisters was more manifested during his illness. He gave more importance to form them as spousal beings of Christ and beings of contemplation.⁵ He insisted that they should live as integrated and integral beings, liturgical beings, beings of trust and vowed beings, practicing *agathithuam* (poverty), *manavattithuam* (chastity) and *cholvily* (obedience). This spiritual guide did not restrict his formation in making the sisters to live in communion and communication with God. He also wanted them to inculcate communion and communication with the fellow beings, especially ecclesial beings and altruistic beings. The chronicler has given a beautiful portrait of Fr. Chavara as witnessing figure. Sr.

⁵ *Kathukal*, VII/2, VII/6, VII/8, VII/12.

Anna's words at the last illness and death of Fr. Chavara are so touching and sublime. She exhorts the sisters to imitate this blessed father. At his death although the sisters were very sad, they consoled themselves by saying that he would be a very alert and powerful mediator of their cause and he would help and do much more good for them than he was capable of doing when he was alive.

Concerning the role of the first four members of the TOCD Congregation for women our study does not take into account the secondary literatures. We depended mainly the contemporary document *CKC* and *CMM*. In them mother Eliswa is depicted as the first appointed superior, treasurer and a person without much health. Also her designation of the sisters as poor and beggars⁶ is worthy of mention. It seems that the early members had imbibed the ideal of the life and teachings of Christ the paradigm and model of the authentic *Agathy*, which was inculcated in them by Fr. Chavara and Fr. Leopold. Unfortunately, most of the so-called writings attributed to mother Eliswa do not belong to her.

Sr. Anna the daughter of mother Eliswa was intelligent. The portrait we could draw from *CKC* is that she had attained spiritual and religious maturity at the early stages of her convent life. She excelled herself in the virtue of humility. Some of her expressions and aspirations are recorded in *CKC*. Her heart seems to have been overflowing with admiration, gratitude, praise to the boundless love and generosity of the Lord Almighty, as well as the sentiments of the human unworthiness. Sr. Anna was very careful to follow the community exercises even when she was very sick. Once

⁶*CKC* I, 15.

she expressed to Fr. Leopold her readiness to die and get buried immediately. She looked at everything from a divine and heavenly perspective. Her intimate union with Christ helped her to develop the altruistic dimension of religious life. Her love of Christ has found concrete expressions in the love of the community. In the Chronicles she addresses the future generation to imbibe the spiritual outlook to which she gives articulations in the chronicles. We think that Sr. Anna's style of life and conversations, her intimate love for Christ and her sublime love for the other members of the community would have helped to evolve the life of the first members.

Sr. Thresia from the early stage of her life cultivated a spousal love for Christ. In addition, she could slowly overcome her earthly attachment to her mother. Her honesty and sincerity demand special mention. This religious was gifted with the discernment of the spirit. God had given her the charism of leadership. Further, she could shower on the members of the community maternal affection. These qualities of commitment, obedience, humility, affectionate heart and prayer would have been the elements that contributed for the formation of the lifestyle of the new community.

Sr. Clara was gifted with religious dedication, readiness to commit herself to the divine will, religious maturity, promptness to respond to the needs, leadership qualities to guide the young. She was very much devoted to St. Joseph the patron of Carmelites. All these facts would have influenced in the evolution of the lifestyle of the first community.

To conclude Fr. Chavara seems to have contributed more for the formation and evolution of the lifestyle of the early members.

In the light of the Ecclesial documents, it is clear that Fr. Chavara deserves more the title of founder than Fr. Leopold and mother Eliswa. Fr. Leopold himself says that Fr. Chavara has founded with much fatigue the convent of the nuns (*fondato con somme fatigue in monastero delle monache*). Also Fr. Porukkara acknowledges this fact. His holiness John Paul II has declared that Fr. Chavara with the help of Fr. Leopold founded the first indigenous Congregation for women in Kerala.

As far as the division of women TOCD is concerned, a study of all the pertinent texts available to us has been done. The division of the community of the sisters was the consequence of the division of the Vicariate into Latin and Syrian jurisdictions. The letters and correspondences of Latin and Syrian sisters were affected by it. Finally, Msgr. Medlycott who was entrusted to solve the issue definitively seems to have brought out clear cut and equitable decisions which were especially welcomed by the Latin community.

At the conclusion of this study, we raise our hearts to the Lord Almighty in prayer that the recent unchristian developments cease once and for all and both CMC and CTC Congregations toil for the Glory of God with one heart and soul.

EPILOGUE

RECORDS OF CORDIAL CONTACTS

EP.0. Introduction

The historical records concerning the relationship between the sisters of the Latin and Syrian Congregations after the division do not end with a negative note. They maintained friendly relationship. We have five documents which narrates the cordial contact between them.

EP.1. The Chronicles of Mutholy Convent

The document tells us that the sisters of Verapoly invited the Syrian sisters who were going to Mutholy on 9th December, 1895 to Verapoly convent. They were affectionately received by the sisters of Verapoly, their chaplain Fr. Philip and Bishop Marceline.

EP. I.I. The Original Text

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>മുപ്പതു വർഷത്തിലധികം മാതൃ ഭവത്തിൽ വസിച്ച ശേഷം പിരിഞ്ഞുപോയ വരാപ്പുഴ മഠത്തിന്റെ ശ്രേഷ്ഠത്തി ബ. ത്രേസ്യമ്മ വൈപ്പിശ്ശേരി, മറ്റു സഹോദരിമാർ, കുന്നമ്മാവു മഠത്തിന്റെ മുൻ കപ്പോനും വരാപ്പുഴ മഠത്തിന്റെ അപ്പോഴത്തെ കപ്പോനുമായ പീലിപ്പോസ് മിഷനറി, അഭിവന്ദ്യ മർസീനോസ് മെത്രാൻ (സുറിയാനിക്കാരുടെ മുൻ മെത്രാൻ) എന്നിവർ അവരെ വരാപ്പുഴ മഠത്തിലേയ്ക്കു ക്ഷണിച്ചിരുന്നതു കൂടാതെ അന്നു വൈകുന്നേരം ആറു മണിക്ക് അവരുടെ വരവു പ്രതീക്ഷിച്ച് വള്ളക്കടവിൽ നിന്നിരുന്നു എന്നത് പ്രത്യേകം സ്മരിക്കേണ്ട വസ്തുതയാണ്. ഈ സമയം കൊണ്ട് അവിടെ വന്നെത്തിയ നമ്മുടെ സഹോദരിമാരുടെ വള്ളം കടവിൽ അടുപ്പിക്കുകയും, സന്തോഷഭരിതരായ</p> | <p>After residing thirty years in Koonammavu convent, the sisters who left from here, mother Thresia Vypissery, the Superior of Varapuzha convent, other sisters, Fr. Philip, the former Chaplain of Koonammavu convent and the present Chaplain of Varapuzha Convent as well as Bishop Marceline (former Bishop of the Syrians) were invited them to Varapuzha convent and waited in the harbor expecting their arrival at six o'clock in the evening. By this time, the boat of our sisters arrived there and the happy Latin sisters took them</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>ലത്തീൻ സഹോദരിമാർ നമ്മുടെ സഹോദരിമാരെ മഠത്തിലേയ്ക്കു കൂട്ടിക്കൊണ്ടു പോയി വിഭവ സമൃദ്ധമായ സൽക്കാരം നൽകി. അന്നു രാത്രി അവർ അവിടെ ചെലവഴിച്ചു. അടുത്ത ദിവസം രാവിലെ മെത്രാനച്ചൻ മഠത്തിൽ ദിവ്യബലി യർപ്പിച്ചു. അഭിവന്ദ്യ മർസീനോസ് മെത്രാനച്ചനും പീലിപ്പോസ് മിഷനറിയും യാത്രയിൽ ബന്ധുമിത്രാദികൾക്കു നൽകുന്നതിന് വെന്തിങ്ങ, രൂപങ്ങൾ മുതലായ ഭക്തിക്കടുത്ത സാധനങ്ങൾ അവർക്കു സമ്മാനിച്ചു യാത്ര പറഞ്ഞു പിരിഞ്ഞു. യാത്രാമധ്യേ ഉപയോഗിക്കുന്നതിന് പലഹാരങ്ങളും മറ്റു ഭക്ഷണ സാധനങ്ങളും തയ്യാറാക്കിക്കൊണ്ടു വന്നു ലത്തീൻ സഹോദരിമാർ വള്ളത്തിൽ കയറി. വേർപാടിലുള്ള ദുഃഖത്തോടെ യാത്ര പറഞ്ഞു മടങ്ങിപ്പോയി (മുത്തോലി ൧൦൦ നാളാഗമം).</p> | <p>to their convent and arranged a banquet for them. They spent that night there. The next day, Bishop Marceline offered the Holy mass in the convent. Both bishop Marceline and Fr. Philip gifted them with many pious articles to give for their relatives and friends and bid them farewell. The Latin sisters prepared and gave for them different eatables and snacks and accompanied them to the boat for the journey. They returned to the convent by expressing the sorrow of the departure.</p> |
|--|--|

EP. I.2. Comments

The fact that this is the narration of the Syrian sisters adds to the importance and genuineness of the events. The Latin sisters were very happy at meeting their former colleagues; they were eagerly waiting for them at the harbor for the arrival of the boat and joyfully took them to the convent and gave a sumptuous treat. Next day Bishop Marceline offered the holy Mass; he as well as Fr. Philip gave the Syrian sisters pious articles to be given to their relatives. Also the Latin sisters provided them the edibles for the rest of the journey. They sadly bid them farewell.

EP. 2. Letters at the Death of Sr. Thresia on 26th January, 1902

Given below are the four reply letters sent to mother Eliswa, when she informed the Syrian sisters of the convents of Vaikom, Mutholy, Changanassery and Arakkuzha about the sickness and death of Sr. Thresia. Srs Clara, Agnes, Thresia Catherine and Margret were colleagues of mother Eliswa and Sr. Thresia at the Koonammavu convent. These sisters expressed their great grief and that they were unable to come over to Verapoly and console mother Eliswa.

EP.2.1. The Letter of Sr. Clara at the Sickness and Death of Sr. Thresia in 1902

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>സ. ത്രേസ്യോ പനമ്പു മഠത്തിൽ കൂടിയ നാൾ മുതൽക്ക് എളിമയും ചൊല്ലുവിളിയും കൂടപ്പിറപ്പു സ്നേഹവും തലവന്മാർക്കും തങ്ങളുടെ കൂടപ്പിറപ്പുകൾക്കും കീഴ്വഴക്കം സൂക്ഷത്തോടെ കാത്തുവന്നു. ചെയ്യുന്ന പ്രവൃത്തികളൊക്കെയും സൂക്ഷത്തോടും ബുദ്ധിയോടും കൂടെയും ചെയ്തു വന്നിരുന്നു. മഠത്തിൽ കൂടിയ ഉടനെ ഒരു ദീനം വന്നു. അത് എത്രയും ക്ഷമയോടും കൂടി സഹിച്ചുവന്നു. കുറേക്കാലം മഠത്തിൽ വന്നു കുറേക്കാലം കഴിഞ്ഞപ്പോൾ വാതത്തിന്റെ ദീനം പിടിച്ചു കിടപ്പിലായി. കൈകാൽ അനക്കാൻ പാടില്ലായ്കയും ദീനം വളരെ വർദ്ധിച്ച അഞ്ചുവർഷം കിടന്നകിടപ്പിൽ തന്നെ കിടക്കയും തങ്ങൾക്കാവശ്യകൂട്ടങ്ങൾ ഒന്നും ചെയ്യാൻ വശമില്ലാതെ അനുഭവിച്ചു. വരികയിൽ അതൊക്കെയും ദൈവ തിരുമനസ്സിനു കീഴ്വഴങ്ങി സങ്കടങ്ങളൊക്കെയും ക്ഷമയോടുകൂടെ സഹിക്കയും ചെയ്തു. അഞ്ചു വർഷം കഴിഞ്ഞപ്പോൾ ഒരു ദിവസം ഞാൻ കൂടപ്പിറപ്പിനോട് യൗസേപ്പു പിതാവിനോട് അപേക്ഷിക്കാൻ പറഞ്ഞു. ഞാൻ</p> | <p>Sr. Thresia, since she first joined in the bamboo-mat convent onwards practiced humility, obedience and fraternal love. She was keen in obeying the superiors as well as the sisters. Soon after joining the convent, she became sick. But she suffered it with great patience. Several years after coming in the Koonammavu convent, She got the sickness of Arthritis and became bed ridden. She was then not even able to move her limbs and do the necessary personal things. She remained in this state for five years. But suffered all of these difficulties with great patience as the will of God. After five years, one day I took her to the hall. Tying a rope, I told her to come by</p> |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>ചാലേൽ കൊണ്ടുചെന്ന് ഒരു കയറു കെട്ടിയും വച്ച് വാ കൂപ്പിറപ്പേയനുസേപ്പിതാവു നടത്തുമെന്നു പറഞ്ഞു ഞാൻ കൈക്കു പിടിച്ചു. സംശയിക്കാതെ നട; പതുക്കെ പ്പതുക്കെ കാൽ വച്ചു നടക്കാൻ പറഞ്ഞു. ചാലയിൽ കൊണ്ടു ചെന്ന് കയറേൽ പിടിച്ചു മൂന്നാലു പ്രാവശ്യം നടന്നു. മുറിയിലോട്ടു വരുന്ന നേരത്ത് നല്ലവണ്ണം നടക്കാറായി. ദീനമായി കിടക്കുന്നതിനു മുമ്പേ രണ്ടു പ്രാവശ്യവും പിന്നെ പലതവണയും ശ്രേഷ്ടത്തം ഭരിച്ചു. ആയത് ലെയോപ്പോൾദ് മൂപ്പച്ചന്റെ ഗുണദോഷപ്രകാരം ആയതൊക്കെയും ക്രമത്തോടു കൂടെ അന്വേഷിച്ചു നടത്തുകയും ചെയ്തു. തമ്പുരാനെ പ്രസാദിപ്പിക്കാനുള്ള ആശ്രഹത്തോടെ ചെയ്തു കൊണ്ടു വന്നു. രണ്ടു മൂന്നു സഹോദരികൾ മുത്തോലിക്കു പോകാൻ നേരത്ത് ഞങ്ങളെ പിടിച്ചു തഴുകുകയും കണ്ണുനീരോടു കൂടെ മുത്തുകയും ചെയ്തു. ഏതൊരു സഹോദരിക്കും എന്തും ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടാൽ അവരുടെ ആവശ്യം പോലെ എല്ലാ കൂട്ടവും കൊടുക്കയും ദീനക്കാരെ മഹാ താൽപര്യത്തോടുകൂടെ വിചാരിക്കയും ചെയ്തു വന്നിരുന്നു.</p> | <p>assuring her that St. Joseph will help her to walk. 'Walk without doubt, slowly fixing your feet.' She walked three or four times in the hall by holding the rope. When coming to the room, her walking became easier. Before the sickness she became the superior for two times and after the sickness some more times. All these she accomplished well according to the instruction of Fr. Leopold. She was eager to do God's will in all of her duties. When two or three sisters were going to Mutholy convent, she embraced them with tears. She was always ready to provide the needs of the sisters and shows great concern towards the sick people (Ref. <i>Varappuzha Kannyakamadam</i> Page 66-67).</p> |
|---|--|

EP.2.2. The Letter of Sr. Agnes at the Sickness and Death of Sr. Thresia in 1902

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|--|---|
| <p>കുനമ്മാവ് മാത്തിന്റെ സ്ഥാപനക്കാരത്തിയായ ത്രേസ്യമ്മയുടെ കൂട്ടത്തിൽ ഇരുപത്തിയൊന്നു വർഷത്തോളം ഞാൻ താമസിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ട്. ഈ ആണ്ടുകളിൽ പ്രിയ അമ്മയും സഹോദരിയുമായ ഇവരിൽ കുറ്റമെന്നു പറയപ്പെടത്തക്കതായി യാതൊന്നും ഞാൻ കണ്ടിട്ടില്ലെന്നു തന്നെയല്ല, ശുദ്ധ ത്രേസ്യാ പുണ്യവാളത്തിയുടെ മാതൃക പോലെ കൂടെ</p> | <p>I lived with mother Thresia the foundress of Koonammavu convent, for around twenty one years. During these days in her who was the mother and sister, I did not see any faults. She set herself as an example of love towards the sisters, love of</p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>പ്പിറപ്പുസ്നേഹം, ദൈവസ്നേഹം, ക്രമചട്ടങ്ങളുടെ കാർപ്പ, ധ്യാനം എന്നിവയിൽ വചനത്താലും പ്രവർത്തിയാലും കാട്ടിപ്പിറപ്പിച്ചിരുന്നു. എല്ലാവർക്കും വളരെ എളിമയോടും ദയയോടും കൂടി ശുശ്രൂഷ ചെയ്തിരുന്നു. രാവ്യം പകലും മടുപ്പില്ലാതെ തന്റെ സഹോദരികൾക്കു ശുശ്രൂഷാസഹായം ചെയ്ത് എല്ലാവരെയും സഹായിച്ചിരുന്നു. ഒരുത്തർക്കും ഒരുവക സങ്കടവും വരുത്തിയിട്ടില്ല. പ്രായശ്ചിത്തം ചെയ്യുന്നതിനും തന്നത്താൻ അമർത്തുന്നതിനും എപ്പോഴും താൽപര്യപ്പെട്ടിരുന്നു. പുറമേയുള്ള ഭാഷയിൽ കൂടെ നല്ല അടക്കവും ക്രമവും കണ്ണടക്കവും കൊണ്ട് കാണുന്നവരെക്കൂടെ പുണ്യത്തിനു വലിച്ചിരുന്നു. ഇനിക്കും ഈ അമ്മയോടുള്ള പെരുമാറ്റം കൊണ്ട് പുണ്യത്തിന് വളരെ സഹായം കിട്ടിയിട്ടുണ്ട്.</p> <p>പ്രിയ ഏലീശാമ്മേ, ഭ്രേസ്യാമ്മയുടെ കാര്യത്തെപ്പറ്റി ഇതിലധികം എഴുതാമായിരുന്നു. ഇപ്പോഴത്തെ എന്റെ മനോവിഷമത്താലത്രേ ചുരുങ്ങിപ്പോയത്.</p> <p>അയോഗ്യ സഹോദരി ഈശോയുടെ ആഗ്രസ്.</p> | <p>God, keeping of the rules and regulations, meditation etc. in words and deeds. She served everyone with great humility and mercy. She helped and served her sisters without any tiredness in day and night. She did not given any type of sorrows to anyone. She was always eager to do penance and practice self discipline. Because of her example of discipline, order and eye control others also attracted to practice virtues. I also received help from this mother for virtues.</p> <p>Dear mother Eliswa, I could have written more about mother Thresia. Due to my sorrow only now it is limited.</p> <p>Unworthy servant, Agnes of Jesus.</p> |
|---|---|

EP.2.3. The Letter of Sr. Thresia Catherine from Changanassery to Mother Eliswa at the Sickness and Death of Sr. Thresia in 1902

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|--|
| <p>ചങ്ങനാശ്ശേരി മഠത്തിൽ നിന്നും 1902 മകരം 30-ന്.</p> <p>ഏറ്റവും പ്രിയപ്പെട്ട ഏലീശാമ്മേ, അയച്ച എഴുത്ത് ഇന്നലെ കിട്ടി. വളരെ വ്യസനത്തോടു കൂടെ വായിച്ചു വിവരം അറിഞ്ഞു. അമ്മയ്ക്കു വേണ്ടി അപേക്ഷിക്കണമെന്ന് അറിയിക്കണമെന്നില്ലല്ലോ. അമ്മയ്ക്കുവേണ്ടി ഞങ്ങളെല്ലാവരും എദുക്കന്താത്</p> | <p>From Changanassery convent, 30th January, 1902.</p> <p>Dearest Mother Eliswa,</p> <p>Received your letter yesterday. With great sorrow read it and knew the news. It is not necessary to request to pray for mother. For mother we and the</p> |

വൈതങ്ങളും കുർബാന, കുർബാനകൈക്കൊള്ളുവാൻ, മറ്റു പുണ്യപ്രവൃത്തികളും ചെയ്തു കാഴ്ചവയ്ക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു വരുന്നു. അമ്മയ്ക്കുവേണ്ടി സ്വയം വര പീഠത്തിന്മേൽ കുർബാന ചൊല്ലിക്കയും ചെയ്തു. വെസപർക്കാനക്കാരുടെ വണക്ക മാസം ഞങ്ങൾ എത്തിച്ചുവരുന്നു. ഏറിയ നാളായി അമ്മയായി രുന്നുകൊണ്ട് ബുദ്ധിമുട്ടി അനേകം നന്മകൾ കൈക്കൊണ്ട എനിക്ക് അമ്മയെ ഈ ലോകത്തിൽ കാണാൻ പാടില്ലല്ലോ എന്ന് ഓർക്കുമ്പോൾ ഉള്ള വ്യസനം എഴുത്താലെ അറിയിപ്പാൻ പാടില്ല. ഞങ്ങൾ ഒരിക്കൽ കുന്നമ്മാവുകൽ വന്നപ്പോൾ അവിടെ വന്ന് കണ്ടുപോരുന്നതിന് വളരെ ആഗ്രഹിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ടായിരുന്നു. അവിടെത്തെ അനുവാദം ഇല്ലാത്തതിനാൽ. വളരെ സങ്കടത്തോടെയാണ് പിരിഞ്ഞത്. ആ സങ്കടം ഇതുവരെ തീർന്നിട്ടില്ല. ഇത്ര വേഗം അമ്മ മരിച്ചുപോകുമെന്നുള്ള വിചാരം ഇല്ലായിരുന്നു. അവിടെ വന്ന് അമ്മയ്ക്ക് മക്കൾക്കടുത്ത ഒരു ശുശ്രൂഷയെ ക്കിലും ചെയ്യുന്നതിന് ഇട കിട്ടാത്തതിന്മേലും കൂറേ വ്യസനമുണ്ട്. മരിച്ച അമ്മയ്ക്ക് ഈ ലോകത്തിലെ സങ്കടങ്ങൾ അവസാനിച്ചു നിത്യഭാഗ്യം പ്രാപിച്ചു വെന്നോർക്കുമ്പോൾ സന്തോഷിപ്പാനുണ്ട്. ഈ സങ്കടങ്ങളെല്ലാം ഏലീശാമ്മതന്നെ കണ്ട് അനുഭവിക്കുന്നതിനാലും ഞങ്ങൾ വളരെ വ്യസനിക്കുന്നു. ഈ സങ്കടത്തിൽ അവിടെ വന്ന് അമ്മയെ ഒന്ന് ആശ്വസിപ്പിച്ചാൻ പാടില്ലാത്തതിനാലും അത്യന്തം വ്യസനിക്കുന്നു. ഏലീശാമ്മയും സ. അനത്താസിയ, സ. ബെയത്രീസ് എല്ലാവർക്കും ദൈവതിരുമനസ്സിനു നല്ല കീഴ്വഴക്കവും ക്ഷമയും തരുന്നതിനായി അപേക്ഷിച്ചു വരുന്നു. അമ്മയുടെ ദീനവിവരത്തിനു ഇങ്ങോട്ടെഴുതിയ

boarding children are offering holy mass, receiving Holy communion and doing other virtuous deeds for this intention. For Mother, Holy mass was said on the table of 'Choice Marriage.' We are reciting the monthly devotion of the souls of purgatory. I cannot express the sorrow through the letter that I am not able to see this mother in this world who went through many difficulties as mother for long period.

Once when we came to Koonammavu, we wished very much to come there and see you. Since we did not have the permission of there. With very much sorrow only we departed from there and that sorrow did not deprived us till this day.

We never had the thought that mother would die so soon. We greatly regret that we did not get a chance to come over there and to do the service to the mother as children. Since for the mother who died the sorrow of this world is finished and attained eternal bliss we feel happy too.

We feel sad because all these sorrows are suffered by mother Eliswa alone. Also we regret for our inability to come there and console you.

We pray for mother Eliswa, Sr. Anasthasia and Sr. Beatrice for getting the submission to the

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>തിന് മറുപടിയായി അപേക്ഷിക്കുന്നുണ്ടെന്നും പിന്നീടത്തെ ദീനസ്ഥിതി എങ്ങനെയുണ്ടെന്ന് അറിയിക്കണമെന്നും എഴുതിയിട്ടുണ്ടായിരുന്നു. ആയതിന് ഒരു മറുപടിയും കിട്ടാത്തതുകൊണ്ട് ദീനം കുറഞ്ഞെന്നാണു വിചാരിച്ചിരുന്നത്. എഴുത്ത് അവിടെ കിട്ടാഞ്ഞിട്ടാണോ? അമ്മയുടെ ദീനവും മരണവും ശേഷക്രിയകളൊക്കെയും വിവരമായിട്ട് അറിയുന്നതിന് ആഗ്രഹിക്കുന്നു. അമ്മയുടെ എഴുത്തോ, അമ്മ പെരുമാറിയ ഒരു രൂപമോ കിട്ടുന്നതിന് വളരെ ആഗ്രഹിക്കുന്നു. ബ. ജൂയിസച്ചനെ ഞാൻ പെരുത്തു ചോദിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു എന്നും എനിക്കു വേണ്ടി അപേക്ഷിക്കണമെന്നും പറയണമേ.</p> <p>ശേഷം പിന്നീട് എന്നു വച്ചു നിർത്തുന്നു.</p> <p>അ. ശു. ക.ദി.മു.സ. സ. ത്രേസ്യാ കത്രീന.</p> | <p>will of God and patience. We replied for the letter we received informing us about the sickness of mother Thresia and in that we had requested to convey us the further state of the sickness. Since we did not get any reply, we thought that she might have been cured. Did you not receive the letter?</p> <p>We wish to know the details of mother's sickness, death and funeral. Also we would like to get a letter or a picture which were used by mother. Please tell to Fr. Louis that I asked much and please request him to pray for me. The remaining will be in later.</p> <p>Unworthy servant</p> <p>Sr. Thresia Catherine TOCD</p> |
|---|---|

EP.2.4. The Letter of Sr. Margarita from Arakkuzha to Mother Eliswa at the Sickness and Death of Sr. Thresia in 1902

| Malayalam Version | English Translation |
|---|---|
| <p>ആരക്കുഴ മാത്തിൽനിന്നും 1902 മകരം 31^{ആം} തിയതി. ഏറ്റവും പ്രിയ ബ. വന്ദ്യ ഏലീശാമ്മേ, നമ്മുടെ ബ. അമ്മയുടെ വേർപിരിവിന്റെ സംഗതിയെപ്പറ്റി അയച്ച എഴുത്ത് ഇവിടെ കിട്ടി. വളരെ ദുഃഖത്തോടുകൂടെ വായിക്കുകയും മറ്റുവരോട് അറിയിക്കുകയും ചെയ്തു. എന്റെ അമ്മേ, നമ്മുടെ അമ്മയുടെ വേർപിരിവിനാലുള്ള ക്ലേശത്തെക്കായിലും വ്യാകുല മാതാവിനെപ്പോലെ തനിജീവിതമായി കഴിക്കുന്ന തങ്ങളുടെ ക്ലേശിക്കപ്പെട്ട ജീവിതത്തെ ഓർത്തും</p> | <p>From, Arakuzha convent, 31st January 1902.</p> <p>Most dear and respected mother Eliswa,</p> <p>I received the letter which telling us about the departure of mother. With great sorrow I read it and told others about that. My mother, I feel more sorrow about you who are living a lonely and difficult life than the departure of our mother.]</p> |

അത്യന്തം ക്ലേശിക്കുന്നു. എന്റെ അമ്മേ, നമ്മുടെ ബ. അമ്മ ഇത്ര വേഗത്തിൽ നമ്മെ വിട്ടുപിരിയുമെന്ന് ഒരുകാരും വിചാരിച്ചിട്ടില്ലായിരുന്നു. എന്നെക്കിലും അവിടെ വന്നു വാഴ്ത്തപ്പെട്ട നിങ്ങളിരുവരെയും കാണണമെന്നായിരുന്നു എന്റെ ആഗ്രഹം. ഇതിനായിട്ടു വഴി നോക്കിയിരിക്കുകയായിരുന്നു. ഇനി എന്തിനേറെ പറയുന്നു? എല്ലാം ദൈവതീരുമനസ്സെന്നു വിചാരിക്കുന്നു. നമുക്കുവേണ്ടി മധ്യസ്ഥയായിട്ടു മുൻ പോയിരിക്കുന്ന തിനാൽ സന്തോഷിക്കാനേ ഉള്ളൂ. ഈ അമ്മയുടെ ആത്മാവിനു വേണ്ടി എഴുത്തു വന്നപ്പോൾ തുടങ്ങി അപേക്ഷിക്കുകയും അപേക്ഷിപ്പിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യുന്നതല്ലാതെ നമ്മുടെ ന്യായപ്രമാണത്തിൽ കൽപിക്കപ്പെട്ടിരിക്കുന്ന ശുദ്ധകുർബാന കൈക്കൊള്ളുവാൻ, കുർബാന, പ്രാർത്ഥന മുതലായത് കാഴ്ചവെച്ചു വരുന്നു. പ്രിയ അമ്മേ, ദീനം കൂടിയ ദിവസങ്ങളിൽ എനിക്ക് ഒരഴുത്തയച്ചിരുന്നെങ്കിൽ ഞാനും കൂടെ ഒരഴുത്തയച്ചുകൊണ്ടെങ്കിലും കടശ്ശിയിലത്തെ ആശീർവാദം വാങ്ങിച്ചേനെ. ഒന്നിനും ഭാഗ്യമില്ലാതെ പോയി. ഇനി അമ്മയെക്കിലും അധികമായിട്ടു ദുഃഖിക്കാതെ സന്തോഷമായിരിക്കണമെന്നു ഞാൻ ആഗ്രഹിക്കുന്നു. അമ്മയുടെ ആശ്വാസത്തിനായിട്ടു ഞാൻ അപേക്ഷിക്കുകയും അപേക്ഷിപ്പിക്കുകയും ചെയ്യുന്നതാണ്. നിങ്ങൾ രണ്ടുപേരും എനിക്കു ചെയ്തിരിക്കുന്ന മനോഹരങ്ങളെ ഞാൻ മറക്കുന്നതല്ല. ആയതിനാൽ നന്ദി അൽപമെങ്കിലും കാണിക്കുന്നതിനു വശമില്ലാത്തതിനാൽ എന്റെ പാവപ്പെട്ട നമസ്കാരങ്ങളിൽ അപേക്ഷിച്ചു കൊണ്ടെങ്കിലും എന്റെ നന്ദി കാണിക്കുന്നതിന് താൽപര്യപ്പെട്ടു വരുന്നു. ശേഷമൊക്കെയും പിന്നാലെ. എന്നു വെച്ചുകൊണ്ട് അയോഗ്യ ശുശ്രൂഷി ക.ദി.മു.സ. ഈശോയുടെ മർഗ്ഗരീത്ത.

My mother, I never thought that our respected mother would depart from us so quickly. I wished to come there and see both of you and was looking eagerly for that. I think that all these are the will of God. We can be happy by thinking that she has gone ahead of us as our mediator. We are praying for the departed soul of our mother from the day onwards we received the letter. Besides praying and making others pray for her we are offering our Holy Mass, Holy Communion and other prayers for this intention.

Dear mother during the days when the sickness increased if you had send a letter to me, I would have received her blessing at least by sending a letter. But did not become lucky enough to do that. We will pray and make others pray for your consolation. I never forget the great goodness both of you had done for me. Even though I am not able to show my thankfulness properly, I will pray and make others pray to show my gratitude. Thinking that the remaining will be in later,

The unworthy servant,
Margarita of Jesus, TOCD.

EP.2.5. Comments

One should not forget that Sr. Thresia was one of the two sisters who had come from Koonammavu to check the accounts and created lot of troubles for the Syrian sisters. But in these letters she is presented as an ideal and saintly sister. This shows that the Syrian sisters had forgotten the past in a Christian way. They sincerely consoled mother Eliswa at the demise of Sr. Thresia.

If we take the words of the chronicles and the four letters at the face value, we may conclude that the sisters of both Congregations had re-established Christian friendship and religious fellowship.¹

EP.3. Conclusion

It seems that the TOCD women Congregation, which was divided in 1890 into two separate religious communities, had got over the natural alienations and antagonistic sentiments, and had found out their original feelings of oneness and intimacy. In God's providence both Congregations (which later had come to be known CMC & CTC) flourished and developed their own special charisms and apostolate. The words of St. Paul was thus fulfilled, "we know that all things work together for good for those who love God, who are called according to his purpose" (Rom. 8: 28).

¹The cordial contacts did not finish by the death of Sr. Thresia or mother Eliswa. When CMC started the common juniorate in Aluva, for eleven years (from 1970 to 1981), 286 CTC sisters did their juniorate course in CMC Generalate. If so, how can one justify the statement of Sr. Suci: "After the division there was no cooperation or contact between the members of these two branches. As a result the Congregation of Mother of Carmel kept aside the history of the first 24 years of the Congregation for women as a hidden prologue" (*SGME*, 369)?

BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. MANUSCRIPTS

1. Archives of CMC Generalate, Aluva (ACMCG)

Diary of Fr. Leopold Beccaro OCD, Vol. I; Vol. II
and Vol. III (copy).

Letter of Msgr. Bernardine Baccinelli to the *Superiors
of Men and Women OCD* in Rome, 1860, 29th
June (copy).

Letters Related to the Division of Women TOCD in
1890 (copy).

*Manuscript of Bro. Leopold, Rev. Sr. Thresia
Vaippisseryude Charithram (History of Rev.
Sr. Thresia Vaippissery)* (copy).

Manuscript of Various Virtues and practices existed in
Koonammvu Convent (for the use of Sr. Mary
Agnes).

Nalagamangal (Chronicles) of Mutholy Convent.

Relazione Del Vicariato Apostolico di Verapoli
Redata li 20 Febbraro 1867, da Mons.
Bernardino Baccinelli Archivescovo di
Farsaglia e Vicario Apostolico di Verapoli in
risposta al Questionario (1) inviatogli dalla
Propaganda (Risposte ai Quesiti riguardanti lo
stato della Cristianità di Rito Siro-Malabarico,
esistente nel Vicariato Apostolico di Verapoli,
nelle Indie Orientali (copy).

2. Archives of CMC Vimala Province, Ernakulam (AVP)

Beccaro Leopold, *Kramapusthakam*, 1875, July 16
(Manuscript).

Kanakkupusthakam [Mal.] Vol. I: Expenses and
Incomes (1866-1868).

Kanakkupusthakam [Mal.] Vol. II, Accounts of Patrimonies and Expenses and Incomes (1868-1871).

Nalagamangal, Koonammavu Madam [Mal.] (Chronicles of Koonammavu Convent) Vol. I.

Nalagamangal, Koonammavu Madam [Mal.] (Chronicles of Koonammavu Convent) Vol. II.

3. Archives of St. Joseph's Monastery Mannanam (ASJM)

Alochanapusthakam (Book of Consultations and other Special Events, Mannanam Monastery) 1864-1871.

Diary of Parappuram Varkey, Koonammavu (1857-1888?).

Letter of Fr. Leopold to Muttuchira and Kaduthuruthy Parishes (1867).

Nalagamangal (Chronicles) of Mannanam Monastery, Vol. I (1831?-1855).

Nalagamangal (Chronicles) of Mannanam Monastery, Vol. II [1855-1870).

4. Archives of St. Teresa's Convent Koonammavu (ASCK)

Beccaro Leopold, *Sannyasa Muzhuvan dhyanam* (*The Annual Retreat of Religious*) or 10 day's Retreat [Mal.].

Vajrajubilee Smarakam, Vishudha Thresiyude Kannyakamadam, Koonammavu (1866, 67. 68 – 1943).

5. Archivio della Congregazione per le Chiese Orientale (ACCO)

Ponente (A. 1890, No. 1), Relazione con sommario circa la giurisdizione sul monastero della Suore Terziarie carmelitane sito in Cunemavo, Marzo, 1890.

II. Printed Sources

- Beccaro Leopold, *Short Biography of Chavara*, 1871, reprinted in *Compunction of the Soul* (Mannanam, Postulator, 1959).
- Benicasia CMC (ed.), *Letters of Fr. Leopold*, Mount Carmel Generalate Aluva, 1987.
- Chavarayachante Kathukal* (Mal.), Chavara Central Secretariat, Chavara Hills, Kakkanad, 2011 (reprint).
- Moozhoor Z.M. (ed.), *Chavarayachante Sampoorna Kruthikal Vol.II:Atmanuthapam (Compunction of the Soul)*, Mannanam, 1981 (reprint).
- ID., *Chavarayachante Sampoorna Kruthikal Vol. IV: Dhyanasallapangal (Colloquies)*, Mannanam, 1981.
- Porukkara Kuriakose Elisha, “Biography of Fr. Kuriakose the founder and First Prior of TOCD” in *Malayalathile Ka. Dhi. Mu. Sabhayude Sthapakapithakkanmar* (Mal.), Mannanam, 1905.

III. Secondary Works

- Gracious CTC (ed.), *Mother Eliswa A Woman of Faith, Hope and Love*, Teresian Carmel Publications, Edappally, 2006.
- ID, *Mother Eliswa foundress and Mystic*, Teresian Carmel Publications, Edappally, 2000.
- ID, *Mother Eliswa Person, Vision and Spirituality, The Foundress of CTC*, Teresian Carmel Publications, Edappally, 2004.
- ID, *Saga of the Foundation of CTC*, Teresian Carmel Publications, Kennedimuku, 2005.

- John of Cross, *Ascent of Mount Carmel*, Kieran Kavanaugh (trans.) (Paulist Press), Kochumuttom and Jossy, *Dream fulfilled*, Delhi, 2005.
- Maniakunnel Sunny, *An Ideal Missionary*, Carmel International Publishing House, Trivandrum, 2005.
- Memorial of 150th Anniversary of Koonammavu Parish*, 1987.
- Mundaden A.M., *Blessed Kuriakose Elias Chavara*, Bangalore, Dharmaram Publications, 2008.
- Prescilla Mary, *C.T.C. Sabhayude Sthapana Charithram*, St. Joseph's Vidyabahvan Edappally, 2004.
- ID, *Daivadasi Mother Eliswa Vakayil* (Mal.), Teresian Carmel Publications, Edappally, 2008.
- ID, *Kusumavallarikal*, Vimala Social Centre Press, Kakkanadu, 2000.
- ID, *Mother Eliswa* (Mal.), I.S. Press, Cochin, 1990.
- ID, *Prabodhanangal*, Teresian Carmel Publications, Kochi, 2006.
- Pulcheria CTC, *Teresian Carmelitha Sabha Innuvare*, (Mal.), St. Joseph's Vidyabhavan Edappally, 1999.
- Rexia, *Yesuve ni matram mathi* [Mal.] (*Jesus You alone Suffice*), Edappilly, 2008.
- Sophy Rose CMC, *Dharsanam Punnyadharsanam* [Mal.], Beth Rauma Publication, Kakkanadu, 2013.
- The Collected Works of St. Teresa of Avila*, Vol. I, *Autobiography*, Carmel International Publishing House, Trivandrum, 2001.
- The Collected Works of St. Teresa of Avila*, Vol.II, *Interior Castle*, Carmel International Publishing House, Trivandrum, 2001.

Varapuzha Kannyakamadom Oru Charithra
Samgraham, Suwarna Jubilee, Varapuzha,
1940.

IV. Church Documents

Evangelica Testificatio, Apostolic
Exhortation of Pope Paul VI, 1971, Pauline
Publications.

Instrumentum Laboris (Working Document for the
Synod on Consecrated Life, 1994).

Lumen Gentium (Vat. II, Constitution on the Church)

Mutuae Relationes (Mutual Relations between bishops
and Religious 1978).

Sacrosantum Concilium (Vat. II, Constitution on
Divine Liturgy).